

Category	No Action Alternative	Replacement Alternative - multiple box culverts with tide gates	Replacement Alternative - multiple box culverts with a system that retains existing water elevations upstream of the dyke	Replacement Alternative - bridge or multiple open box culverts
Purpose and Need	Does not meet P+N	Meets P+N	Meets P+N	Meets P+N
Public Involvement	Does not meet P+N	Public comments from 12/16/2009 meeting indicate the public, businesses and representatives would be in favor of this alternative	Public comments from 12/16/2009 meeting indicate the public, businesses and representatives would be in favor of this alternative	Public comments from 12/16/2009 meeting indicate the public, businesses and representatives would not be in favor of this alternative
Property (residential/business) Impacts	Does not meet P+N	Normal High Water elevation above the dyke would be slightly lower due to new, tighter gates.	Normal High Water elevation above the dyke would remain at a similar elevation as it exists today. No property, business impacts.	Normal High water elevations above the dyke would rise to elevation 7.0+/- . This alternative would flood approximately 408 acres and impact 49 property owners and businesses (including existing wells/septic systems and landfill).
Endangered and Threatened Species	Does not meet P+N	Adverse effect (Atlantic salmon, Atlantic/shortnose sturgeon)	Adverse effect (Atlantic salmon, Atlantic/shortnose sturgeon)	Adverse effect (Atlantic salmon, Atlantic/shortnose sturgeon)
Fish and Wildlife Coordination Act	Does not meet P+N	Would not restore passage/marsh	Would not restore passage/marsh	Would restore passage/marsh
Essential Fish Habitat	Does not meet P+N	Adverse effect	Adverse effect	Adverse effect (construction only)
Hazardous Materials Management	Does not meet P+N	No effect	No effect	Potential effect to listed DEP brownfield site, landfill, Town Water treatment facility, public well, and septic from flooding.
Historic Resources	Does not meet P+N	No effect	No effect	Adverse effect to National Register eligible race track
Section 4(f) Resources	Does not meet P+N	No Use	No Use	Potential Use of National Register eligible race track
Safe Drinking Water	Does not meet P+N	Project area is not over a sole source aquifer and would not effect public drinking water systems.	Project area is not over a sole source aquifer and would not effect public drinking water systems.	Project area is not over a sole source aquifer, but would impact at least one business water supply.
Floodplains	Does not meet P+N	No Impacts.	No Impacts.	Adverse impact on the upstream floodplain (approximate 7 ft rise) and the downstream floodplain of the Machias River.
Cost	Does not meet P+N	2,400,000	2,400,000	4,500,000 to 24,000,000 (700' bridge)