



---

TEAM REPORT OF FINDINGS FOR THE  
MAINE STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

---

**Bates College**

Program Approval Visit for Educator Preparation Program  
April 26-30, 2021 (Virtual)  
Lewiston, Maine

**Program Review Team:**

Thomas Edwards (Chair), Thomas College  
Cynthia Dean, University of Maine at Augusta  
Jayne Pelletier, University of New England  
Laura Sweet, Bowdoin College

**Non-Voting Participants:**

Peter Geiger, State Board of Education  
Jason C. Libby, Maine Department of Education

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	Introduction	3
II.	Summary of the Unit's Conceptual Framework	4
III.	Summary of the Team's Findings for Each Standard	6
	Standard 1	6
	Standard 2	8
	Standard 3	9
	Standard 4	10
	Standard 5	11
	Standard 6	12
IV.	Recommendation to State Board of Education	13
V.	List of Individuals Interviewed and Sources of Evidence	14

## **I. Introduction:**

From April 26-30, 2021, a program review team, representing four Maine institutions with teacher preparation programs, and accompanied by observers from the State Board and the Maine Department of Education, visited Bates College for the purposes of reviewing the following teacher preparation programs:

- Secondary English, Math, Life Sciences, Physical Sciences, Social Studies, Art
- K-12 World Languages

Due to COVID-19 restrictions, the Team's visit was virtual, consisting of online interviews and supported by access to an online workroom prepared by the College containing information and artifacts to support Bates's application for renewal of its state certification.

During the virtual visit, the team was able to meet with program faculty, staff, students and alumni, as well as supervisors for clinical sites for field placements. This report is based on the findings of the team drawn from the results of those interviews and the supporting documentation prepared by the College and represents the team's assessment of the program's alignment with the Standards of the Maine State Board of Education.

## **II. Summary of the Unit's Conceptual Framework**

*The conceptual framework(s) establishes the shared vision for a unit's efforts in preparing educators to work effectively in P-12 schools. It provides direction for programs, courses, teaching, candidate performance, scholarship, service, and unit accountability. The conceptual framework(s) is knowledge-based, articulated, shared, coherent, consistent with the unit and/or institutional mission, and continuously evaluated. The conceptual framework(s) provides the bases that describe the unit's intellectual philosophy, which distinguishes graduates of one unit from those of another.*

### **Findings**

Bates' teacher preparation program is built on the College's historical foundation of "a college for preachers and teachers." Students pursuing teacher certification complete the requirements for their declared major in the liberal arts and combine that preparation with coursework designed to meet the requirements for a minor in teacher certification in their chosen discipline, including student teaching and the teaching of exceptional students. Students pursuing Educational Studies rather than certification complete the equivalent of seven courses. The program also serves a large number of students in Education courses that are cross listed in other disciplines such as Sociology and Psychology (330 in 2018-19 and 250 in 2019-20), offering students the opportunity to study education from a liberal arts perspective.

Students at Bates generally complete a combination of a major plus a minor, a second major, or a General Education Concentration (GEC), and beginning in 2023, students will complete a major plus one, as well as meet requirements for "modes of inquiry" which include Education courses. Education courses and faculty are therefore closely integrated with the overall shape and tenor of a Bates education.

The current Bates mission statement dates from 2010, and the Conceptual Framework from 2007. The mission statement confirms the College's dedication to the "emancipating potential of the liberal arts," and its commitment to the "transformative power of our differences, cultivating intellectual discovery and informed civic action."

The Conceptual Framework states that the Education program "seeks to foster the democratic possibilities of schooling" and to foster an environment for students and faculty to "analyze the complex dynamics between the purposes of products of schooling, and the social structures and cultural processes that comprise the broader context for education."

The Unit identifies that they wish to develop in their students the qualities of critical action and civic responsibility, reflection and engagement, imagination and a passion for learning, and a commitment to social justice. They identify that their Framework extends beyond public schooling to be inclusive of the broad context of education, and that reflective practice is a critical component of their work.

In both the College's mission and the Department's Conceptual Framework, one finds an orientation toward social engagement which is reflected in the design and delivery of the College's program and its preparation of its students. Faculty in the program and education courses in the curriculum are closely integrated within the larger context of the College.

Education courses require 30-hour field work components for students, ensuring that their classroom preparation finds applications in the broader community. Students complete a Context essay that situates their fieldwork in a broader academic and social context, and a “Curriculum Essay” on their specific discipline/content area.

The Conceptual Framework serves as an effective organizing principle for the Bates program, and its interdisciplinary tenets serve to inform the unit and its practices. Students, faculty and staff are conversant with the philosophy of the framework, and it serves as an effective organizing bridge between the program and the mission of the College.

### III. Summary of Findings for Each Standard

#### **Standard One: Initial Teacher Candidate Performance**

*Candidates preparing to work in schools as teachers or other professional school personnel know and demonstrate the content, pedagogical, and professional knowledge, skills, and abilities necessary to help all students learn. Assessments indicate that candidates meet professional, state, and institutional standards.*

#### **Findings**

The unit offers a minor in secondary education in the subject areas of English Language Arts, foreign languages, mathematics, life science, physical science, and social studies. The minor is declared in March of the sophomore year. Admission requires an essay and a meeting with an education faculty member. The minor consists of seven courses, three of which are taken prior to the senior year. There are 30-hour field experiences associated with the EDU courses taken prior to the senior year. The Harvard Center is instrumental in making these placements at appropriate schools or after school programs. In ED 362 Basic Issues in Special Education, students are often placed at the Farwell School where they work with students with disabilities. Senior year is a year-long internship with four additional courses. In the fall semester, students are in the field for one block a day teaching at least one class. In the winter semester, student teachers are in the school all day. The total of the fall and winter classroom hours comprise the equivalent of a 15-week student teaching experience with a minimum of 450 hours accumulated across all 4 years of placement opportunities. The senior sequence is typically team taught by two faculty who also share in supervision of students including observation and mentoring. Students are expected to pass the Praxis Core by the end of the fall semester of senior year.

Reflection and civic responsibility are at the heart of the teacher education program. Students accumulate at least 90 hours of work in the community as part of their early education courses and then at least an additional 360 hours of student teaching during their senior year. Students also complete a capstone project in their senior year associated with their major, which may involve working with and in the community. The small cohort of student teachers lends itself to a collaborative, reflective community of practice.

Student teaching portfolios and interviews with cooperating teachers indicate a strong knowledge of both content and pedagogy. They indicate student teachers bring a fresh perspective and new ideas to the school. Student teachers are particularly skilled at modifying curricula to meet the needs of hybrid learning and teaching during the pandemic. The cooperating teachers also note that the student teachers are adept at using technological tools to augment their teaching strategies, to conduct class meetings in fully virtual modalities as well as hybrid models, and to communicate with students and families.

Sample curriculum units indicate teacher candidates understand instructional design, authentic assessment, and the importance of relationship building in order to foster a safe and respectful learning environment. Cooperating teachers confirm student teachers' understanding of the importance of teacher-student relationships, noting they connect well with students and encourage and support the students to feel good about their work. Current student teachers report because of pandemic restrictions they struggle with providing authentic community-based

activities, but they have been able to implement activities within students' bubbles of contacts. For example, in a lesson on Lewis and Clark, the student teacher took students into the woods near the school for plant identification and map making.

Students have opportunities for enrichment and professional development. Some students have published in the *Journal of Maine Education*. To meet the needs of partner schools during the pandemic, Bates students and area teachers have collaborated to create multiple resources for teachers that are available through Bates Connect, the online database for these resources. The annual Education Symposium and the Mount David Summit give education students the opportunity to showcase their work.

Education students may also work as writing tutors in ARC (Academic Resource Commons), a relatively new (2016) contemporary learning center that brought together the prior tutoring programs into one entity. Tutors are robustly prepared through an education course: EDUC 221 Theory and Practice of Writing and Tutoring.

The Education Department successfully addressed a recommendation from the 2015 report that the unit work more closely with candidates to increase the quality of their portfolios:

- Portfolios are now electronic and constructed in Google Docs.
- The unit provided exemplars of rationales students are required to write for each standard to improve the description and reflection.
- The unit increased the number of artifacts required for each standard to three from the previous two.

This Standard is ***MET***.

**Standard Two: Assessment System and Unit Evaluation**

*The unit has an assessment system that collects and analyzes data on the qualifications of applicants, the performance of candidates and graduates, and on unit operations to evaluate and improve the unit and its programs.*

**Findings**

The Teacher Education Program at Bates College engages in processes which inform continuous quality improvement. The Unit collects sufficient data from courses, field placement assessments, reflective essays, and log sheets to monitor student progress. There is a low faculty-to-student ratio which allows ample formative assessment to be provided to students.

The Unit solicits feedback from mentor teachers and surveys students prior to and periodically after graduation. The Unit routinely analyzes data from these surveys for strengths and challenges. There is a comprehensive assessment process in place for cooperating teachers which includes specific details of the student teaching experience. Planning sessions are recorded and include more explicit information on log sheets as a result of recommendations made during the 2015 visit.

A robust portfolio process is in place with increased focus on the quantity and quality of artifacts and accompanying rationales. Feedback on portfolio creation between faculty and students is a two-way process. Students are incentivized to complete course evaluations in a timely fashion increasing the response rate to the institutional evaluation system.

There is a well-defined process for the evaluation and development of full-time faculty. However, the process for the evaluation and development of contingent faculty is informal at present which allows for inconsistent feedback and mentoring. The College has identified this as an area of focus in the near future.

This Standard is ***MET***.



**Standard Three: Field Experiences and Clinical Practice**

*The unit and its school partners design, implement, and evaluate field experiences and clinical practice so that teacher candidates and other school personnel develop and demonstrate the knowledge and skills necessary to help all students learn.*

**Findings**

The Unit has a robust system of field and clinical placements for students, requiring 30 hours for each Education course, and at least 90 hours of field experience prior to student teaching in their senior year. Interviews with students indicated strong satisfaction with this requirement and the opportunities to gain invaluable field experience early in their programs. Many students exceed the minimum requirements and build on field experiences to develop research projects or take other action to continue supporting schools. The field placement associated with ED 362 Basic Issues in Special Education was specifically mentioned in interviews with students as being especially impactful and highly valuable.

The Education faculty collaborate closely with the Harward Center, which has a staff member dedicated to securing placements for students in Education courses prior to senior student teaching. Placements are carefully coordinated to meet the needs of community partners and the Unit. The Harward Center reported placing between 130-150 students in local schools each semester and noted there is more demand from schools than there is supply of students. The Education Department is responsible for coordinating and directly supervising senior student teacher placements.

Students and cooperating teachers report that they are well supported by the Education Department with clear lines of communication and a system of observation and assessment. During interviews they described strong, collaborative partnerships and open, ongoing communication with faculty. Cooperating teachers and school administrators are very satisfied with the level of students' preparation and professionalism, the clear expectations set by the Unit, and the level of supervision by Unit faculty. Evidence shows frequent opportunities for students to reflect upon their practice and self-assess their performance in field experiences. The Unit also has a highly structured process of documenting field experiences and evaluating students in the field in collaboration with local school partners.

In response to the pandemic, the creation of the online portal "Bates Connect" provides important resources for both Bates students and faculty and area schools, underscoring the ties between the College and the community. Local teachers were surveyed to determine what content would be most useful to them, and the Harward Center has received very positive feedback about the resources available.

**Commendation**

The Unit faculty and colleagues in the Harward Center are commended for the high impact practices and close community engagement that characterize the Education program.

This Standard is ***MET***.

## **Standard Four: Diversity**

*The unit designs, implements, and evaluates curriculum and experiences for candidates to acquire and apply the knowledge and skills necessary to help all students learn. These experiences include working with diverse higher education and school faculty, diverse candidates, and diverse students in P-12 schools.*

### **Findings**

The Unit's commitment to diversity and social justice is deeply rooted in the mission of the college to "engage in the transformative power of our differences." This commitment is evident in the effort to recruit a diverse student body, faculty, and staff. The Vice President for Equity and Inclusion provides leadership for diversity and equity initiatives on campus with the support of the staff in the Office of Equity and Inclusion.

The library houses a diverse book collection and has access to a grant funded Diverse Bookfinder tool utilized by students of the teacher education program and members of the community. Opportunities such as workshops, presentations and other occasions for community engagement bring awareness of and exposure to underrepresented populations.

Student teachers are assessed on culturally responsive teaching and differentiation included in their coursework. Student engagement in the community is evident through a variety of off-campus, social services organizations and activity within area schools. In addition to placements in local schools, students are involved in a range of after-school, alternative environments, and community agencies.

Faculty members within the teacher education program regularly engage in scholarly research in culturally diverse areas and support diverse learners through varying forms of learning activities and assessment strategies. The Unit's interdisciplinary curriculum incorporates issues related to class, race, and equity.

Efforts to recruit diverse faculty have yielded gains. The college employs an Active and Inclusive Search Plan which informs the composition of committees, language in position descriptions, involvement of Office of Equity and Inclusion, and is supported through clear messaging from the Dean of Faculty.

This Standard is *MET*.

### **Standard Five: Faculty Qualifications, Performance, and Development**

*Faculty are qualified and model best professional practices in scholarship, service, and teaching, including the assessment of their own effectiveness as related to candidate performance; they also collaborate with colleagues in the disciplines and schools. The unit systematically evaluates faculty performance and facilitates professional development.*

#### **Findings**

The Unit has four dedicated and highly qualified faculty members including two tenure track and two permanent lecturers. Three faculty hold doctorates in their specialty areas and one holds both an M.S.Ed. and an MFA, a terminal degree in her field. Two faculty members have retained state teaching certification in their specialty areas. Each faculty member's unique areas of expertise strengthen the department's elective course offerings. It was evident from interviews that all faculty members draw on their broad teaching experiences to ground their instruction and bring relevance to their teacher education courses.

Interviews with faculty and school partners indicate a deep commitment to the Unit's mutually supportive partnerships with local schools. The faculty also collaborate widely across disciplines with other departments and centers on campus. Several Education courses are cross-listed or accepted as courses meeting major requirements in other departments, including African-American Studies, Psychology, Sociology, and Women and Gender Studies. The Education Department collaborates especially closely with the Harvard Center on community engaged learning and Education course field placements.

Faculty performance is evaluated each semester through an institutional teaching evaluation process. Faculty also frequently seek informal feedback through mid-course surveys in their own classes. During interviews, students shared specific examples of how faculty model best professional practices, and how they provide reflective, collaborative learning spaces where all student voices and perspectives are heard and valued.

The faculty are service-oriented and active in their research, publishing, and professional affiliations with local, state, and international organizations. Faculty members engage in scholarly activity through presentations at state and regional conferences, serving as editors and reviewers for professional publications, and the publication of books and peer-reviewed journal articles. Recent faculty awards include a Spencer Foundation large grant (2020), Ruth Landes Research Grant (2020), Bates College Phillips Fellowship (2018-2019) and numerous Harvard Center and Faculty Development Grants.

This Standard is *MET*.

### **Standard Six: Unit Governance and Resources**

*The unit has the leadership, authority, budget, personnel, facilities, and resources, including information technology resources, for the preparation of candidates to meet professional, state, and institutional standards.*

#### **Findings**

The Bates College Education Unit has the appropriate resources and authority to meet its mission to prepare students to meet the standards for teaching certification. These resources and authority rest within the broader context of the overall education mission at the College and allow the unit to make purposeful decisions to promote department innovation and improvement.

Unit Leadership and Authority: The Unit is part of the Division of Social Sciences whose Chair participates in the academic governance under the Dean of the Faculty. The Unit faculty collaborate with each other, and with faculty from other areas, on program design, delivery, and assessment.

Personnel: The Unit generally has two full-time tenure positions and two lecturer positions to support its programs. In addition to the four core Education faculty, the unit has also benefitted from adjunct faculty support, as well as grant-supported positions such as a Teacher in Residence in 2015-16 and a postdoctoral Fellow in 2016-17 and 2017-18.

Course loads for faculty are consistent with those of other departments, and the Chair receives either a course reduction or a stipend. The Unit shares an area coordinator with the Psychology Department who is responsible for the web site, events planning and administrative support. There is a stipend each year for the Director of Teacher Education who maintains records related to Praxis and Title II reporting. Faculty members have budgeted funds for professional development, conferences and travel, and the College provides financial support or access to grant funds to facilitate field trips, projects or speakers.

Unit Budget: The Unit reports that their Department has sufficient budgetary resources to meet their expenses, with the primary dedication of operational funding going to the support of the faculty. The Unit benefits from institutional support for teaching and research assistants and stipends are provided for mentor teachers.

Unit Facilities and Resources: The Unit benefits from support from the College's Information and Library Services in a manner commensurate with their needs for classroom technology, workstations that are updated on a regular schedule, as well as ample library resources and databases. The Unit has access to well-equipped classrooms with wireless technology, presentation equipment and Whiteboard technology, a Departmental/Professional library, and a computer lab and high-speed printing. The Unit reports that Information Technology staff are available for technology integration support and one-on-one training as well as workshops. The Library provides a dedicated webpage to Education resources and contact information for a library staff person for the program area. The program benefits from a close working relationship with the College's Harvard Center for Community Partnerships in identifying field placements and supporting student and faculty community engagement projects, and the Department's course offerings and faculty are well-integrated with campus operations overall.

This Standard is *MET*.

#### **IV. Recommendation to the State Board of Education**

Based on its review of the Bates College program the review team recommends that the following teacher preparation programs be approved for a five-year certification effective Fall 2020 through Fall 2025:

- Secondary English, Math, Life Sciences, Physical Sciences, Social Studies, Art
- K-12 World Languages

## V. List of Individuals Interviewed and Sources of Evidence

### List of Interviewees – By Category

#### **Current Education Faculty:**

Anita Charles: Sr. Lecturer; Director of Teacher Education  
 Bronwyn Sale: Lecturer: TE seminar faculty  
 Mara Ticken: Associate Professor; TE seminar faculty  
 Patti Buck: Associate Professor: ES faculty  
 Bill Wallace: Adjunct Lecturer, recent years

#### **College Administration and Programs:**

Clayton Spencer: College President  
 Malcolm Hill: Dean of Faculty  
 Josh McIntosh: Dean of Students  
 Geoff Swift: Vice President for Finance  
 Courtney Seymour: Library Services, Associate College Librarian  
 Dan Sanford: Director, Academic Resource Commons (ARC)  
 Darby Ray: Director, Harvard Center for Community Partnerships  
 Ellen Alcorn: Assistant Director, CEL Program, Harvard Center for Community Partnerships  
 Amy Douglass: Professor of Psychology, Social Sciences Division Chair

#### **Current Cooperating Teachers**

Isaiah Davis: Leavitt Area H.S. (Social Studies)  
 Derek Anderson: Oak Hill H.S. (Social Studies)

#### **Former Cooperating Teachers**

Ed Zuis: Oak Hill H.S. (Chemistry)  
 Marissa Moreau: Edward Little H.S. (Auburn) (Spanish)

#### **Local K-12 Administration**

Cari Medd: Principal, Poland Regional High School  
 Jake Langlais: Superintendent, Lewiston Public Schools and Former Principal, Lewiston High School

#### **Current Teacher Ed Candidates:**

Travis Palmer TE'21  
 Kali Brown TE'21

#### **Teacher Ed Alumni:**

Kylie Martin '19  
 Sunny Hong '16  
 Linda Herlihy '19  
 Kirsten Pelletier '20  
 Zack Anderson '19

## Sources of Evidence:

The review team was provided password-protected access to an online workroom organized by Standard. Artifacts listed below were accessed by the team prior to, during, and after their visit to campus. In addition, the Team accessed publicly available portions of the Bates College website ([www.bates.edu](http://www.bates.edu)).

## LIST OF ONLINE EXHIBITS BY STANDARD:

### **STANDARD 1:** Initial Teacher Candidate Performance

- 1-1. Information for Minor Advising
- 1-2. Education Department Program Information (website link)
- 1-3. "Social Studies" Subject Course Requirements for TE
- 1-4. TE Certification Minor Overview & Advising Sheet
- 1-5. Bates College Course Catalog -- Education
- 1-6. Application for ES Minor
- 1-7. Application for TE Minor
- 1-8. Roster of All Education Minors with Advisors
- 1-9. Education Symposium, most recent program
- 1-10. Sample Thesis: Signe Lynch '20  
Sample Thesis: Kirsten Pelletier (EXCERPT) '20
- 1-11. TE Student State Portfolio  
State Portfolio: Signe Lynch '20  
State Portfolio: Nicholas Holmes '20  
State Portfolio: Zachary Anderson '19  
State Portfolio: Kylie Martin '19
- 1-12. TE "Exemplar Units"  
Exemplar Unit: Brendan Donohue '20  
Exemplar Unit: Bailey Richins '19  
Exemplar Unit: Kylie Martin '19
- 1-13. ES Capstone project

### **STANDARD 2:** Assessment System and Unit Evaluation

- 2-1. State Review Summary of Recommendations 2015 Visit
- 2-2. Portfolio, Formative Checklist for completion
- 2-3. Sample Portfolio Checklist - Pelletier '20
- 2-4. Assessment Rubric: CoopTeachers, St Teachers, Bates Supervisors
- 2-5. Field Eval Form, for pre-practicum field placements
- 2-6. Observation Form used by Cooperating Teachers
- 2-7. Teacher Ed Alumni Survey
- 2-8. Educ Major Focus Group Report

- 2-9. Enrolled Students in ALL Education Courses Recent 2 Years
- 2-10. TE Placements last 5 years
- 2-11. Dept Annual Reports (2017 & 2018)
- 2-12. Community-Engaged Learning, Harvard Center Annual Report 2018-2019
- 2-13. Educ Symposium Program -- Most recent
- 2-14. Title II Report Summary

**STANDARD 3:** Field Experiences and Clinical Practice

- 3-1. Field Experience Guidelines for Host Teachers
- 3-2. Final Eval Rubric for Cooperating Teachers, STs, & College Supervisors
- 3-3. Observation Template for Coop Teachers, STs, & College Supervisors
- 3-4. Field Evaluation Form for Host Teachers (all early ed courses)
- 3-5. Field Experience Log Sheet (all educ courses)
- 3-6. Student Teaching Log Sheet
- 3-7. Student Teaching Planning Log Sheet (with CT)
- 3-8. School Context/Portrait Assignment TE Fall
- 3-9. JME Articles
  - Sarah Kornacki ES'14
  - Emma Katz TE'17
  - Emily Bass ES'21
- 3-10. Independent Study -- Emily Bass ES'21
- 3-11. Cooperating Teacher Handbook

**STANDARD 4:** Diversity

- 4-1. Faculty Inclusive Search Plan
- 4-2. Diversity & Inclusion Initiatives
- 4-3. MLK Day Program 2021
- 4-4. Office of Equity and Diversity link
- 4-5. OIE link
- 4-6. Accessible Education & Accommodations
- 4-7. Accessible Education Info for Faculty
- 4-8. BatesReach Student Support Network
- 4-9. Institutional Data re Diversity
- 4-10. Bates College Common Data 2019-2020
- 4-11. DOE, Lewiston ELL numbers
- 4-12. DOE, Lewiston Free/Reduced Lunch
- 4-13. Quick Facts, Census (2019), Lewiston, Maine

**STANDARD 5:** Faculty Qualifications, Performance, and Development



- 5-1. Bronwyn Sale CV
- 5-2. Patti Buck CV
- 5-3. Anita Charles CV
- 5-4. Mara Tieken CV
- 5-5. William Wallace CV
- 5-6. Weblink to “Faculty Profiles”
- 5-7. Bates News Article Anita Charles
- 5-8. Bates Articles on Mara Tieken
- 5-9. Articles on Bronwyn Sale

**STANDARD 6:** Unit Governance and Resources

- 6-1. Educ Department BUDGET  
FY 2019  
FY 2021
- 6-2. Sample Monthly Department Meeting Agenda
- 6-3. Faculty Commons - workshops/programs to support faculty PD in teaching & learning  
Faculty Commons for Learning and Teaching - web page  
Commons Calendar Sample Email
- 6-4. Faculty Handbook
- 6-5. Information and Library Services Organization Chart
- 6-6. Library Education Subject/Research Guide weblink
- 6-7. Library, Faculty Teaching Support
- 6-8. Library, Faculty Research Support
- 6-9. Harvard Center Annual Report (Features many of our ed students)