

State of Maine
Master Score Sheet

RFP# 202505065					
Consulting Services for Central Maine Power Rate Case, Revenue Requirements					
Bidder Name:		Larkin & Associates PLLC	London Economics International LLC	Quantiv Regulatory Advisors LLC	
Proposed Cost:		\$100,000	\$316,875	\$239/Hour	
Scoring Sections	Points Available				
Section I: Preliminary Information	N/A				
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	40	40	35	30	
Section III: Proposed Services	30	25	25	20	
Section IV: Cost Proposal	30	30	9.5	0*	
TOTAL	<u>100</u>	<u>95</u>	<u>69.5</u>	<u>50</u>	

* - This bidder's Cost Proposal only provided an hourly rate for consulting work with no total estimated price provided. Based upon advice from the Procurement Planning Manager at DAFS, we have awarded this bidder a score of zero for its cost proposal. However, we also analyzed the hourly rate proposal using the estimated hours for the project included in the two competing bids. Applying this bidder's hourly rate to the estimated hours provided by the competing bidders yields an anticipated cost proposal of between \$130,000 and \$215,000, which would result in a score for the Cost Proposal of between 14 and 23 and an overall score for the bid of 64 to 73.

Award Justification Statement
RFP# 202505065

Consulting Services for Central Maine Power Rate Case, Revenue Requirements

I. Summary

The Office of the Public Advocate (Office) issued the RFP in order to obtain consulting services to assist with a regulatory proceeding at the Public Utilities Commission (PUC) related to an electric distribution rate case. These services include, but are not limited to, providing advice, and assisting in litigation in proceedings on Central Maine Power Company's anticipated request for an increase to its rates. As described in the Request for Proposals (RFP) document, the RFP sought services with respect to the issue of Revenue Requirements.

Because the staff of the Office of the Public Advocate is composed primarily of attorneys, we rely on a consultant to provide expert advice and testimony on electric utility matters, including revenue requirements. This advice and testimony are critical to allowing the Office to effectively represent ratepayer interests in proceedings before the PUC.

The Office is awarding the contract for an Electric Rate Case Consultant for Revenue Requirement.

II. Evaluation Process

The evaluation process consisted of initial, individual reviews by the three review team members, and then participated in an MS Teams meeting to develop a team consensus to score Sections I & II and that the Cost score was calculated by a predetermined formula. The Team members were: (1) Andrew Landry, Deputy Public Advocate, with significant experience in drafting RFPs and evaluating responses in connection with obtaining services for a state agency; (2) Brian T. Marshall, Senior Counsel, who has extensive experience with energy law and related issue; and (3) Susan Chamberlin, Senior Counsel, who also has extensive experience with energy law and related issues.

III. Qualifications & Experience

The key factors that resulted in our selection are:

- Strong history of extensive experience across many states on electric utility rate issues and for consumer advocates.
- Experience with the Office and at the Maine PUC.
- Has an excellent resume and education, good expert witness experience and has credibility as an expert with Maine PUC staff.

- Specific relevant experience with revenue requirement on electric utility cases in recent project and cases including testimony.
- A large and experienced organization to support the principal consultants. providing the services.

IV. Proposed Services

Key factors concerning proposed services were:

- Excellent, detailed list of services.
- List of revenue requirement issues showing strong and relevant knowledge of services needed.
- Good communication, sufficient staff and appropriate number of hours dedicated.
- Indicates knowledge of Maine procedure.
- Examples or history of good collaboration and communication.

V. Cost Proposal

The selected bidder was the low cost bidder. In addition, based on other recent RFPs conducted by the Office for similar services, the proposed price was competitive and reasonable.

VI. Conclusion

The winning bidder was chosen based on a strong history of knowledge and relevant experience of analyzing revenue requirement issues at state public utility commissions on behalf of public or consumer advocates. The winning bidder also had recent relevant experience with Maine specific issues, an organization of sufficient size and experience to provide the required services, and a competitive cost proposal.



**STATE OF MAINE
OFFICE OF THE PUBLIC ADVOCATE**

**Janet T. Mills
Governor**

**Heather Sanborn
Public Advocate**

AWARD NOTIFICATION LETTER

July 15, 2025

Sent via email: tmlarkinassociates@gmail.com

Tina Miller, Consultant
Larkin & Associates PLLC
15728 Farmington Road
Livonia, MI 48154

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202505065,
Consulting Services for Central Maine Power Rate Case, Revenue Requirements

Dear Tina:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Office of the Public Advocate for Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate. The Office has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Office is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Larkin & Associates PLLC

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Office will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Office and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Office is executed. The Office further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'HS', followed by a horizontal line.

Heather Sanborn
Public Advocate
SHS #112
Augusta, ME 04333-0112

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



**STATE OF MAINE
OFFICE OF THE PUBLIC ADVOCATE**

**Janet T. Mills
Governor**

**Heather Sanborn
Public Advocate**

AWARD NOTIFICATION LETTER

July 15, 2025

Sent via email: Cherrylin@londoneconomics.com

Cherrylin Trinidad
London Economics International LLC
717 Atlantic Avenue
Suite 1A
Boston, MA 02111

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202505065,
Consulting Services for Central Maine Power Rate Case, Revenue Requirements

Dear Cherrylin:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Office of the Public Advocate for Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate. The Office has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Office is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Larkin & Associates PLLC

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Office will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Office and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Office is executed. The Office further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'HS', followed by a horizontal line.

Heather Sanborn
Public Advocate
SHS #112
Augusta, ME 04333-0112

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



**STATE OF MAINE
OFFICE OF THE PUBLIC ADVOCATE**

**Janet T. Mills
Governor**

**Heather Sanborn
Public Advocate**

AWARD NOTIFICATION LETTER

July 15, 2025

Sent via email: jason@quantivra.com

Jason Hails
Quantiv Regulatory Advisors, LLC
925 Wappoo Rd, Suite A
Charleston, SC 29407

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202505065,
Consulting Services for Central Maine Power Rate Case, Revenue Requirements

Dear Jason:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Office of the Public Advocate for Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate. The Office has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Office is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Larkin & Associates PLLC

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Office will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Office and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Office is executed. The Office further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'HS', followed by a horizontal line.

Heather Sanborn
Public Advocate
SHS #112
Augusta, ME 04333-0112

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #:202505065

RFP TITLE: CONSULTING SERVICES FOR CENTRAL MAINE POWER RATE CASE, REVENUE REQUIREMENTS

BIDDER: Larkin & Associates PLLC

DATE: June 10, 2025

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Office of the Public Advocate

Name of RFP Coordinator: Andrew Landry

Names of Evaluators: Susan W. Chamberlin, Andrew Landry, Brian Marshall,

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	N/A	N/A
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	40	40
Section III. Proposed Services	30	25
Section IV. Cost Proposal	30	30
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>95</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #:202505065

RFP TITLE: CONSULTING SERVICES FOR CENTRAL MAINE POWER RATE CASE, REVENUE REQUIREMENTS

BIDDER: Larkin & Associates PLLC

DATE: June 10, 2025

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

N/A

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #:202505065

RFP TITLE: CONSULTING SERVICES FOR CENTRAL MAINE POWER RATE CASE, REVENUE REQUIREMENTS

BIDDER: Larkin & Associates PLLC

DATE: June 10, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	40	40

Evaluation Team Comments:

- I. Overview of the Organization
 - Strong recommendation from Massachusetts AG
 - Positive experience with them on recent Maine OPA project
 - Extremely responsive on recent Maine OPA project
 - Extremely experienced in New England and on electric rate cases
 - National leader in providing rate case consulting services to consumer advocates
 - Qualified CPAs as expert witness, with admin support
 -
- II. Subcontractors
 - NA
- III. Organizational Chart
 - Large organization with lots of depth
- IV. Litigation
 - Satisfactory
- V. Financial Viability
 - Satisfactory
- VI. Certificate of Insurances
 - Provided

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #:202505065

RFP TITLE: CONSULTING SERVICES FOR CENTRAL MAINE POWER RATE CASE, REVENUE REQUIREMENTS

BIDDER: Larkin & Associates PLLC

DATE: June 10, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	30	25

Evaluation Team Comments:

- Procedural tasks were consistent with RFP.
- Description of issues that they would review and how they would go about reviewing them inspired confidence that they had a well thought out plan of attack.
- They will conduct a technical analysis of the utility's Application, pre-filed testimony and exhibits as well as publicly available information, and engage in discovery to identify, understand and evaluate these issues in this proceeding.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #:202505065

RFP TITLE: CONSULTING SERVICES FOR CENTRAL MAINE POWER RATE CASE, REVENUE REQUIREMENTS

BIDDER: Larkin & Associates PLLC

DATE: June 10, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
\$100,000	,	\$100,000	x	30 points	=	30

Evaluation Team Comments:

NA

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #:202505065

RFP TITLE: CONSULTING SERVICES FOR CENTRAL MAINE POWER RATE CASE, REVENUE REQUIREMENTS

BIDDER: London Economics International LLC

DATE: June 10, 2025

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Office of the Public Advocate

Name of RFP Coordinator: Andrew Landry

Names of Evaluators: Susan W. Chamberlin, Andrew Landry, Brian Marshall,

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	N/A	N/A
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	40	35
Section III. Proposed Services	30	25
Section IV. Cost Proposal	30	9.5
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>69.5</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #:202505065

RFP TITLE: CONSULTING SERVICES FOR CENTRAL MAINE POWER RATE CASE, REVENUE REQUIREMENTS

BIDDER: London Economics International LLC

DATE: June 10, 2025

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

N/A

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #:202505065

RFP TITLE: CONSULTING SERVICES FOR CENTRAL MAINE POWER RATE CASE, REVENUE REQUIREMENTS

BIDDER: London Economics International LLC

DATE: June 10, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	40	35

Evaluation Team Comments:

- I. Overview of the Organization
 - LEI is a large corporation with extensive experience in utility regulatory proceedings
 - Limited electric rate case expertise
 - Have the necessary expertise
 - Clearly reviewed previous CMP rate case
 - Prior work for PUC on multiyear rate plan, however, may create conflict
 - Proposal covers rate design and performance based rates, which was beyond the scope of the services requested in the RFP
 - Do work for utilities, which may limit aggressiveness of advocacy
 - Based in Boston
 - Worked for Maine PUC, other utility commissions across the country and in Canada, and utilities
 - Conveys knowledge of recent CMP rate case
- II. Subcontractors
 - NA
- III. Organizational Chart
 - Large organization
- IV. Litigation
 - Satisfactory
- V. Financial Viability
 - Satisfactory
- VI. Certificate of Insurances
 - Provided

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #:202505065

RFP TITLE: CONSULTING SERVICES FOR CENTRAL MAINE POWER RATE CASE, REVENUE REQUIREMENTS

BIDDER: London Economics International LLC

DATE: June 10, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	30	25

Evaluation Team Comments:

- Description of proposed service was somewhat vague.
- Propose including a large number of team members, the rationale for which is not clear.
- Detailed proposal to develop “workstreams.”
- Proposals to address performance based rates and rate design that were outside the scope of the request.
- A lot of ideas, but lack a clear vision.
- Proposal includes infrastructure investment programs and transmission, distribution and generation infrastructure expansion or retirement plans; and technological advancements and innovation in electricity or energy transition, which could be helpful.
- LEI will conduct a detailed review of all filed testimonies from utilities and intervenors. This review focuses on identifying inconsistencies, gaps in evidence, unsupported assumptions, and arguments that conflict with regulatory precedent or economic logic.
- This is a reasonable and expected step in ratecase analysis.
- LEI will assist in discovery, technical sessions, hearing preparation as is an expected part of ratecase work plan.
- LEI did work for the PUC in reviewing the benefits of a multiyear rate plan for CMP. This gives LEI relevant experience with CMP. However, it could raise the appearance of a conflict as it is a recent engagement with the PUC on a closely related matter.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #:202505065

RFP TITLE: CONSULTING SERVICES FOR CENTRAL MAINE POWER RATE CASE, REVENUE REQUIREMENTS

BIDDER: London Economics International LLC

DATE: June 10, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
\$100,000	,	\$316,875	x	30 points	=	9.5

Evaluation Team Comments:

N/A

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #:202505065

RFP TITLE: CONSULTING SERVICES FOR CENTRAL MAINE POWER RATE CASE, REVENUE REQUIREMENTS

BIDDER: Quantiv Regulatory Advisors LLC

DATE: June 10, 2025

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Office of the Public Advocate

Name of RFP Coordinator: Andrew Landry

Names of Evaluators: Susan W. Chamberlin, Andrew Landry, Brian Marshall,

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	N/A	N/A
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	40	30
Section III. Proposed Services	30	20
Section IV. Cost Proposal	30	0
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>50</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #:202505065

RFP TITLE: CONSULTING SERVICES FOR CENTRAL MAINE POWER RATE CASE, REVENUE REQUIREMENTS

BIDDER: Quantiv Regulatory Advisors LLC

DATE: June 10, 2025

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

N/A

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #:202505065

RFP TITLE: CONSULTING SERVICES FOR CENTRAL MAINE POWER RATE CASE, REVENUE REQUIREMENTS

BIDDER: Quantiv Regulatory Advisors LLC

DATE: June 10, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	40	30

Evaluation Team Comments:

- I. Overview of the Organization
 - Size of the organization is unclear. May only be two people
 - Limited other experience in the US (most experience is in Canada including experience with Enmax, owner of Versant Power)
 - Has sufficient technical expertise to provide requested services
 - Lack electric experience. Most experience is in gas and water cases
 - Significant experience with regulatory commissions in Canada
 - Worked for Pennsylvania Office of Small Business Advocate
 -
- II. Subcontractors
 - One, providing support services only
- III. Organizational Chart
 - Appears to be a small organization.
- IV. Litigation
 - Satisfactory
- V. Financial Viability
 - Satisfactory
- VI. Certificate of Insurances
 - Provided

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #:202505065

RFP TITLE: CONSULTING SERVICES FOR CENTRAL MAINE POWER RATE CASE, REVENUE REQUIREMENTS

BIDDER: Quantiv Regulatory Advisors LLC

DATE: June 10, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	30	20

Evaluation Team Comments:

- Description of services was conceptual and vague rather than specific.
- Did not identify specific issues that they would intend to review.
- Proposal did flag affiliate charges as a key issue, which is likely to be a significant issue in the case.
- Identified variance analysis, which may be an issue of interest.
- Emphasis on cost allocation in proposal.
- Conveys knowledge of rate case process and issues involved.
- Mentions SharePoint site for sharing information.
- States that their typical engagement includes the same activities outlined by the Office in the RFP.
- For revenue requirement, they propose to focus on CMP's current operating environment and strategy and evaluate the need for expenses and the relative economy and operating environment, including variance analysis. A variance analysis is a unique approach that would provide a different perspective on prudence evaluation.
- They anticipate a collaborative approach with Office staff and other Consultants to ensure that they leverage prior knowledge and experience.
- Unique approach could expand our approach to rate case proceeding analysis.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #:202505065

RFP TITLE: CONSULTING SERVICES FOR CENTRAL MAINE POWER RATE CASE, REVENUE REQUIREMENTS

BIDDER: Quantiv Regulatory Advisors LLC

DATE: June 10, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
\$100,000	,	NA	x	30 points	=	0

Evaluation Team Comments:

This bidder's Cost Proposal only provided an hourly rate for consulting work with no total estimated price provided. Based upon advice from the Procurement Planning Manager at DAFS, we have awarded this bidder a score of zero its cost proposal. However, we also analyzed the hourly rate proposal using the estimated hours for the project included in the two competing bids. Applying this bidder's hourly rate to the estimated hours provided by the competing bidders yields an anticipated cost proposal of between \$130,000 and \$215,000, which would result in a score for the Cost Proposal of between 14 and 23 and an overall score for the bid of 64 to 73.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202505065

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services for Central Maine Power Rate Case, Revenue Requirements

BIDDER NAME: Larkin & Associates PLLC

DATE: June 25, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Susan W. Chamberlin

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 1. Overview of Organization
 - Has sufficient personnel to undertake the work
 - Has relevant experience in rate proceedings
 - Has worked in Maine
 2. Subcontractors
 3. Organizational Chart
- II. Proposed Services
 1. Services to be Provided
 - They will conduct a technical analysis of the utility's Application, pre-filed testimony and exhibits as well as publicly available information, and engage in discovery to identify, understand and evaluate these issues in this proceeding.
 2. Implementation – Work Plan
 - Proposed work plan meets expectation to review and analyze the utility rate proposal

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202505065

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services for Central Maine Power Rate Case, Revenue Requirements

BIDDER NAME: Larkin & Associates, PLLC

DATE: June 3, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Andrew Landry

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Over 50 years of experience in the field of utility revenue requirements.
- At least 7 professionals within the organization with the required experience (depth).
- Based in Michigan

2. Subcontractors

- None

3. Organizational Chart

- The chart provided shows three professionals and one administrative assistant assigned to the case.
- The written description of the organization identifies seven professionals in the organization, all with extensive experience in the field of utility revenue requirements.
- The list of representative engagements is extensive, with numerous appearances as expert witnesses in electric utility distribution rate cases, including in Massachusetts and Connecticut on behalf of the consumer advocates for those states.
- Larkin has recently provided services to the Department on a matter related to utility rates, although not a full distribution rate case.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Detailed list of services included in proposal.
- Identified with specificity the issues that would be investigated and approach to the investigation.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- The work plan covered all tasks requested in the RFP.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202505065

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services for Central Maine Power Rate Case, Revenue Requirements

BIDDER NAME: Larkin & Associates PLLC

DATE: July 7, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Marshall

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - Good experience in CT, Mass, and Maine
 - Qualified CPAs as expert witness, with admin support.
- II. Scope – appropriate for rate case, conveys familiarity with rate case issues
- III. Cost - \$100k seems reasonable for amount of effort involved

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202505065

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services for Central Maine Power Rate Case, Revenue Requirements

BIDDER NAME: London Economics International LLC

DATE: June 25, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Susan Chamberlin

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

- Overview of Organization
- LEI is a large corporation with extensive experience in utility rate cases
- Subcontractors
- Organizational Chart

II. Proposed Services

- Services to be Provided
 - Has deep experience in utility ratecase proceedings
 - Has sufficient resources to monitor federal and state legislation impacting electricity utilities; • market trends in electricity pricing, supply, and demand; • infrastructure investment programs and transmission, distribution and generation infrastructure expansion or retirement plans; and • technological advancements and innovation in electricity or energy transition.
- Implementation – Work Plan
 - LEI will conduct a detailed review of all filed testimonies from utilities and intervenors. This review focuses on identifying inconsistencies, gaps in evidence, unsupported assumptions, and arguments that conflict with regulatory precedent or economic logic.
 - This is a reasonable and expected step in ratecase analysis.
 - LEI will assist in discovery, technical sessions, hearing preparation as is an expected part of ratecase work plan.
 - LEI did work for the PUC in reviewing the benefits of a multiyear rate plan for CMP. This gives LEI relevant experience with CMP. However it could raise the appearance of a conflict as it is a recent engagement with the PUC on a closely related matter.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202505065

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services for Central Maine Power Rate Case, Revenue Requirements

BIDDER NAME: London Economics International LLC

DATE: June 3, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Andrew Landry

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Large organization with experience in numerous projected related to utility and energy economics.
- Based in Boston.
- Limited experience in revenue requirement proceedings.
- Identified revenue requirement proceedings in sample projects were limited to gas.
- Extensive experience regarding Performance Based Rates.
- Previous work for OPA on standard offer and net energy billing matters.

2. Subcontractors

- None

3. Organizational Chart

- Org chart shows 5 professionals proposed to be assigned to the matter.
- This provides depth, but individual have broad utility experience with limited experience regarding revenue requirements aside from performance based rates.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Proposed services vague.
- Appears to propose to work with Department to further develop this aspect.
- Includes Rate Design, which was not requested in the RFP.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- Extensive work plan describes in detail plans to develop and implement 5 “workstreams.”

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202505065

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services for Central Maine Power Rate Case, Revenue Requirements

BIDDER NAME: London Economics International LLC

DATE: July 7, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Marshall

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience – Substantial experience with utility rate/revenue requirement issues.
 1. Worked for Maine PUC, other utility commissions across the country and in Canada, and utilities.
 2. Conveys knowledge of recent CMP rate case

- II. Proposed Services
 1. Services to be Provided
 - Mentions rate design although that was excluded from RFP
 2. Implementation – Work Plan
 - Seeks to involve 5 different professionals

- III. Cost proposal is \$317k

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202505065

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services for Central Maine Power Rate Case, Revenue Requirements

BIDDER NAME: Quantiv Regulatory Advisors LLC

DATE: June 25, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Susan Chamberlin

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Experience in regulatory work in a variety of industries.
- Extensive work in Canada, including experience with Enmax, former owner of Versant utility

2. Subcontractors

3. Organizational Chart

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- States that their typical engagement includes the same activities outlined by the Office in the RFP.
- For revenue requirement they propose to focus on CMP's current operating environment and strategy and evaluate the need for expenses and the relative economy and efficiency that CMP applies to its mandate that are in the interest of Maine customers. Part of this will be conducting variance analysis against prior results and testing these variance against factors within the operating environment. A variance analysis is a unique approach that would provide a different perspective on prudence evaluation.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- They anticipate a collaborative approach with Office staff and other Consultants to ensure that they leverage prior knowledge and experience.
- Offers some unique approaches that would expand our approach to rate case proceeding analysis.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202505065

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services for Central Maine Power Rate Case, Revenue Requirements

BIDDER NAME: Quantiv Regulatory Advisors LLC

DATE: June 3, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Andrew Landry

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Appears to be limited to two professionals
- Representative projects are all in Canada
- Extensive experience in gas and water
- Only one representative case was electric distribution revenue requirements case
- Offices in Canada and Southeast US

2. Subcontractors

- One subcontractor proposed to help with analytical tasks
- Not in a lead role

3. Organizational Chart

- Org chart shows two internal professionals and one contractor
- Not clear if the organization has additional employees
- Potential lack of depth

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Proposed services are described in conceptual terms
- Description lacks specificity
- No significant detail regarding revenue requirement items to be targeted for review

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- Work plan is also conceptual rather than identifying specific details
- Emphasizes team approach

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202505065

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services for Central Maine Power Rate Case, Revenue Requirements

BIDDER NAME: Quantiv Regulatory Advisors LLC

DATE: July 7, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Marshall

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 1. Overview of Organization
 - Significant experience with regulatory commissions in Canada
 - Pennsylvania Office of Small Business Advocate
 - Limited other experience in the US

- II. Proposed Services
 1. Services to be Provided
 - Emphasis on cost allocation in proposal
 - Conveys knowledge of rate case process and issues involved

 2. Implementation – Work Plan
 - Two primary consultants with a contractor
 - Mentions SharePoint site for sharing information

- III. Cost - \$239/hour blended rate. No estimate provided for overall cost of case



STATE OF MAINE
OFFICE OF THE PUBLIC ADVOCATE

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Heather B. Sanborn
Public Advocate

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #:202505065

**RFP TITLE: Consulting Services for Central Maine Power Rate Case,
Revenue Requirements**

I, Susan W. Chamberlin, accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Office of the Public Advocate. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.


Signature

6-4-2025
Date



**STATE OF MAINE
OFFICE OF THE PUBLIC ADVOCATE**

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Heather B. Sanborn
Public Advocate

**AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #:202505065**

**RFP TITLE: Consulting Services for Central Maine Power Rate Case,
Revenue Requirements**

I, Andrew Landry accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Office of the Public Advocate. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.



Signature

6-4-2025

Date



STATE OF MAINE
OFFICE OF THE PUBLIC ADVOCATE

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Heather B. Sanborn
Public Advocate

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #:202505065

**RFP TITLE: Consulting Services for Central Maine Power Rate Case,
Revenue Requirements**

I, Brian Marshall, accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Office of the Public Advocate. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Brian Marshall', written over a horizontal line.
Signature

6-4-2025
Date