State of Maine Master Score Sheet

RFP# 202504057							
Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate							
Bidder Name:		Exeter Associates, Inc. (GA1) (GA1)		London Economics International LLC (GA1)	Quantiv Regulatory Advisors LLC (GA1)		
Р	roposed Cost:	\$39,475	\$85,000	\$318,375	\$239/Hour Rate		
Scoring Sections	Points Available						
Section I: Preliminary Information	N/A						
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	40	25	38	40	14		
Section III: Proposed Services	30	22	29	20	18		
Section IV: Cost Proposal	30	30	13.93	3.72	0		
TOTAL	<u>100</u>	77	80.93	<u>63.72</u>	<u>32</u>		
	Bidder Name:	Current Energy Group LLC (GA2)	Exeter Associates, Inc. (GA2)	Maverick Energy Advisors LLC (GA2)	SAGE Management Consultants LLC (GA2)		
Р	roposed Cost:	\$197,491.50	\$23,000.00	\$225,000	\$108,800		
Scoring Sections	Points Available						
Section I: Preliminary Information	N/A						
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	40	38	20	3	18		
Section III: Proposed Services	30	30	3	15	10		
Section IV: Cost Proposal	30	3.49	30	3.07	6.34		
TOTAL	<u>100</u>	<u>71.49</u>	<u>53</u>	<u>21.07</u>	<u>34.34</u> REV 4/4/2023		

Award Justification Statement RFP# 202504057 Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate

I. Summary

This RFP contains two general service areas (GSAs). In GSA1, the Office of the Public Advocate (OPA) seeks support in Gas Local Distribution Company (LDC) Rate Cases before the Maine Public Utilities Commission (PUC). Gas LDC rate cases are infrequent but involve a prolonged litigation schedule of up to twelve months or longer. In GSA2, the OPA seeks support in Cost of Gas (COG) proceedings and proceedings related to approval of gas transportation agreements before the PUC, as well as proceedings before the PUC and FERC (Federal Energy Regulatory Commission) concerning both questions of gas transportation, gas pricing and gas policy.

II. Evaluation Process

The evaluation process occurred in two steps, where the first step was the three individual reviewers reviewing all of the filings provided with each proposal and taking notice on the organization's qualifications and experience, and proposed services. In the second step, the reviewers met as a team to create consensus evaluations of each proposal, and to create a consensus score for each scoring section: the organization's qualifications and experience, the proposed services, and the proposal's cost. Each of the team members have multiple years of experience in the utilities field and with proceedings before the PUC which cover the key qualifications and expertise sought from the proposals.

III. Qualifications & Experience

The winning bidder for GSA1, Larkin & Associates, had the following key factors that resulted in this bidder receiving the highest score:

- This an accounting-forward organization, that is an "lens" for evaluating revenue requirement.
- Larkin has experience with public utilities and consumer interest groups.
- Larkin has significant experience with utility rate cases in many states.
- Larkin is familiar with Maine and the PUC.

The winning bidder for GSA2, Current Energy Group (CEG), had the following key factors that resulted in this bidder receiving the highest score:

- CEG supplied a thoughtful and well-written proposal.
- The people who would provide the service are really qualified with experience that is on-point for the services sought by the OPA.
- The company's focus is on consumer advocacy and has worked on low-income issues, which fits with the mission of the OPA.

IV. Proposed Services

The winning bidder for GSA1, Larkin & Associates, had the following key factors that resulted in this bidder receiving the highest score:

- Larkin provided a good list of the potential things they will look for in reviewing a case, showing an understanding of what the OPA needs.
- The areas of service to be provided align well with the needs of the OPA.
- Larkin provided the right level of detail on how the proposed services would be performed.

The winning bidder for GSA2, Current Energy Group (CEG), had the following key factors that resulted in this bidder receiving the highest score:

- CEG provided a clear response to describe how it would provide the services that are requested in the RFP.
- The company views the tasks to be performed through a consumer advocateoriented lens.

V. Cost Proposal

For GSA1, the total costs submitted from the bidders ranged from approximately \$34,500 to over \$300,000. One bidder did not provide the proper cost information and received a score of 0 for that category. Larkin, the winning bidder was not the lowest cost bidder, but scored better in all the other categories.

For GSA2, the total costs submitted from the bidders ranged from \$23,000 to over \$200,000. Current Energy, the winning bidder, was not the lowest cost bidder, but scored better in all the other categories.

VI. Conclusion

For GSA1, Larkin is an accounting-forward organization that is a good fit for the OPA. Larkin has experience with public utilities and consumer interest groups, and Larkin is familiar with Maine and the PUC. Larkin provided the right level of detail on how the proposed services would be performed and demonstrated an understanding for what the OPA needs. The cost of this bidder seems appropriate for the work that needs to be performed.

For GSA2, Current Energy has experience that is on-point for the services sought by the OPA, and the company's focus is on consumer advocacy and has worked on low-income issues, which fits with the mission of the OPA. Current Energy provided a clear service plan to be performed through a consumer advocate-oriented lens. The cost of this bidder seems appropriate for the work that needs to be performed.



STATE OF MAINE OFFICE OF THE PUBLIC ADVOCATE

Janet T. Mills Governor Heather Sanborn Public Advocate

AWARD NOTIFICATION LETTER

June 27, 2025

Via email:jmierzwa@exeterassociates.com Jerome D. Mierzwa, Vice President Exeter Associates, Inc. 10480 Little Patuxent Parkway Suite 300 Columbia, MD 21044

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Awards under RFP #202504057, Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate

Dear Jerome:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Office of the Public Advocate for Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate. The Office has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Office is hereby announcing its conditional contract awards to the following bidders:

- Larkin & Associates PLLC (General Service Area 1)
- Current Energy Group LLC (General Service Area 2

The bidders listed above received the evaluation team's highest rankings. The Office will be contacting the aforementioned bidders soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Office and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Office is executed. The Office further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Heather Sanborn Public Advocate SHS #112 Augusta, ME 04333-0112

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE OFFICE OF THE PUBLIC ADVOCATE

Janet T. Mills Governor Heather Sanborn Public Advocate

AWARD NOTIFICATION LETTER

June 27, 2025

<u>Via email: tmlarkinassociates@gmail.com</u> Tina Miller, Consultant Larkin & Associates, PLLC 15728 Farmington Road Livonia, MI 48154

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Awards under RFP #202504057, Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate

Dear Tina:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Office of the Public Advocate for Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate. The Office has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Office is hereby announcing its conditional contract awards to the following bidders:

- Larkin & Associates PLLC (General Service Area 1)
- Current Energy Group LLC (General Service Area 2

The bidders listed above received the evaluation team's highest rankings. The Office will be contacting the aforementioned bidders soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Office and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Office is executed. The Office further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Heather Sanborn Public Advocate SHS #112 Augusta, ME 04333-0112

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE OFFICE OF THE PUBLIC ADVOCATE

Janet T. Mills Governor Heather Sanborn Public Advocate

AWARD NOTIFICATION LETTER

June 27, 2025

Via email: Cherrylin@londoneconomics.com Cherrylin Trinidad London Economics International, LLC 717 Atlantic Avenue, Suite 1A Boston, MA 02111

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Awards under RFP #202504057, Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate

Dear Cherrylin:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Office of the Public Advocate for Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate. The Office has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Office is hereby announcing its conditional contract awards to the following bidders:

- Larkin & Associates PLLC (General Service Area 1)
- Current Energy Group LLC (General Service Area 2

The bidders listed above received the evaluation team's highest rankings. The Office will be contacting the aforementioned bidders soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Office and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Office is executed. The Office further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Heather Sanborn Public Advocate SHS #112 Augusta, ME 04333-0112

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE OFFICE OF THE PUBLIC ADVOCATE

Janet T. Mills Governor Heather Sanborn Public Advocate

AWARD NOTIFICATION LETTER

June 27, 2025

Via email: jason@quantivra.com Jason Hails Quantiv Regulatory Advisors, LLC 925 Wappoo Rd, Suite A Charleston, SC 29407

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Awards under RFP #202504057, Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate

Dear Jason:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Office of the Public Advocate for Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate. The Office has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Office is hereby announcing its conditional contract awards to the following bidders:

- Larkin & Associates PLLC (General Service Area 1)
- Current Energy Group LLC (General Service Area 2

The bidders listed above received the evaluation team's highest rankings. The Office will be contacting the aforementioned bidders soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Office and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Office is executed. The Office further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Heather Sanborn Public Advocate SHS #112 Augusta, ME 04333-0112

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE OFFICE OF THE PUBLIC ADVOCATE

Janet T. Mills Governor Heather Sanborn Public Advocate

AWARD NOTIFICATION LETTER

June 27, 2025

Via email: bcebulko@currentenergy.group Brad Cebulko Current Energy Group LLC 2900 E Broadway Blvd Suite 100 #780 Tucson, AZ 85716

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Awards under RFP #202504057, Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate

Dear Brad:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Office of the Public Advocate for Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate. The Office has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Office is hereby announcing its conditional contract awards to the following bidders:

- Larkin & Associates PLLC (General Service Area 1)
- Current Energy Group LLC (General Service Area 2)

The bidders listed above received the evaluation team's highest rankings. The Office will be contacting the aforementioned bidders soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Office and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Office is executed. The Office further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Heather Sanborn Public Advocate SHS #112 Augusta, ME 04333-0112

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE OFFICE OF THE PUBLIC ADVOCATE

Janet T. Mills Governor Heather Sanborn Public Advocate

AWARD NOTIFICATION LETTER

June 27, 2025

<u>Via email: dshipley@maverickenergyadvisors.com</u> David Shipley, Partner Maverick Energy Advisors LLC 430 E. Main Street Jefferson, NC 28640

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Awards under RFP #202504057, Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate

Dear David:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Office of the Public Advocate for Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate. The Office has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Office is hereby announcing its conditional contract awards to the following bidders:

- Larkin & Associates PLLC (General Service Area 1)
- Current Energy Group LLC (General Service Area 2

The bidders listed above received the evaluation team's highest rankings. The Office will be contacting the aforementioned bidders soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Office and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Office is executed. The Office further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Heather Sanborn Public Advocate SHS #112 Augusta, ME 04333-0112

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE OFFICE OF THE PUBLIC ADVOCATE

Janet T. Mills Governor Heather Sanborn Public Advocate

AWARD NOTIFICATION LETTER

June 27, 2025

<u>Via email: rosenkoetter@sageconsultants.org</u> Robert L. Rosenkoetter SAGE Management Consultants, LLC 10085 Buice Road Johns Creek, GA 30022

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Awards under RFP #202504057, Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate

Dear Robert:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Office of the Public Advocate for Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate. The Office has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Office is hereby announcing its conditional contract awards to the following bidders:

- Larkin & Associations PLLC (General Service Area 1)
- Current Energy Group LLC (General Service Area 2

The bidders listed above received the evaluation team's highest rankings. The Office will be contacting the aforementioned bidders soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Office and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Office is executed. The Office further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Heather Sanborn Public Advocate SHS #112 Augusta, ME 04333-0112

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: Exeter Associates, Inc. (General Service Area 1) DATE: June 20, 2025

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Office of the Public Advocate **Name of RFP Coordinator:** Kristina R. Winther **Names of Evaluators**: Kristina R. Winther, Richard P. Hevey, Heather Sanborn

Pass/Fail Criteria	Pass	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	N/A	N/A
Scoring Sections	<u>Points</u> <u>Available</u>	<u>Points</u> <u>Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	40	25
Section III. Proposed Services	30	22
Section IV. Cost Proposal	30	30
Total Points	<u>100</u>	<u>77</u>

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: Exeter Associates, Inc. (General Service Area 1) DATE: June 20, 2025

OVERVIEW OF SECTION I Preliminary Information

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

There is no evaluation of Preliminary Information.

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: Exeter Associates, Inc. (General Service Area 1) DATE: June 20, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION II Organization Qualifications and Experience

	<u>Points</u> <u>Available</u>	Points Awarded
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	40	25

Evaluation Team Comments:

- Exeter provides expert testimony and other litigation support in utility regulatory proceedings, and other areas, and has done so for the OPA.
- Exeter has a strong reputation.
- Exeter is an experienced, stable company that has been in business for over 40 years.
- The Maine Public Utilities Commission (PUC) is familiar with the consultants from this organization. There is value in having different experts providing different expertise and information to the OPA.
- This supports the credibility of the OPA as seeking input from a broad set of sources.
- The proposal includes resume information for two personnel that would be working on the topic of Revenue Requirements.
- The RFP requires consulting support in more areas than just Revenue Requirements.
- The OPA would potentially need to seek consulting support outside what is proposed in this proposal.
- This could affect the ability to deliver timely filings, where issues are interrelated.
- This could affect the ability of the OPA to participate in proceedings in a timely fashion.
- Where not all of the topics in the RFP are covered by the proposed services, there is concern that the cost proposal underestimates how much it will cost the OPA to actually contract for the services that the OPA requires.
- While Exeter always gets work completed in a professional manner by the required filing date, work could be performed in a manner that allows the office greater time to review documents before they need to be filed with the Maine PUC.

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: Exeter Associates, Inc. (General Service Area 1) DATE: June 20, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION III Proposed Services

	<u>Points</u> Available	<u>Points</u> <u>Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	30	22

Evaluation Team Comments:

- Exeter is familiar with the Maine Public Utilities Commission and work flow.
- However, the proposal covers only one of the subject areas in the RFP.
- The services proposed are focused on that one subject area.
- As such, the OPA would need to have separate contracts to fill those gaps.
- This would take extra time to set up.
- This would require costs that the OPA cannot estimate, which impacts the OPA's ability to proactively budget for consulting work.
- There are short descriptions of the company's approach to steps in the proposed work.
- There is not an overall plan for how the consultant would engage in all of the topics requests in the RFP.
- The cost proposal is an underestimate of how much it will actually cost the OPA to get the support it is requesting in this RFP.

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: Exeter Associates, Inc. (General Service Area 1) DATE: June 20, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION IV Cost Proposal

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	د	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
39,475	c	39,475	x	30 points	=	30

Evaluation Team Comments:

Score is based on using the consensus scoring formula per best practices provided by the Office of State Procurement Services.

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: Larkin & Associates PLLC (General Service Area 1) DATE: June 20, 2025

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Office of the Public Advocate **Name of RFP Coordinator:** Kristina R. Winther **Names of Evaluators**: Kristina R. Winther, Richard P. Hevey, Heather Sanborn

Pass/Fail Criteria	Pass	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	N/A	N/A
Scoring Sections	<u>Points</u> <u>Available</u>	<u>Points</u> <u>Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	40	38
Section III. Proposed Services	30	29
Section IV. Cost Proposal	30	13.93
Total Points	<u>100</u>	<u>80.93</u>

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: Larkin & Associates PLLC (General Service Area 1) DATE: June 20, 2025

OVERVIEW OF SECTION I Preliminary Information

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

• Preliminary Information not part of the evaluation.

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: Larkin & Associates PLLC (General Service Area 1) DATE: June 20, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION II Organization Qualifications and Experience

	<u>Points</u> <u>Available</u>	<u>Points</u> <u>Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	40	38

Evaluation Team Comments:

- This consultant is located in Livonia, Michigan.
- It is an accounting-forward organization vs. a consulting-forward organization.
- The company is comprised of certified public accountants and regulatory consultants.
- This accounting "lens" is appropriate for evaluating revenue requirement.
- Good for the OPA to have this lens.
- The consultant has experience with public utilities and consumer interest groups.
- In 1970, Mr. Larkin and others formed an accounting firm.
- Mr. Larkin has significant experience, including with rate cases.
- Has participated in 800 proceedings.
- Has worked in many states.
- Recently he worked with the OPA on a 2023 electric case.
- Very familiar with Maine and the Maine Public Utilities Commission.
- Not a "deep bench", but that is not unusual for this type of consulting provider.

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: Larkin & Associates PLLC (General Service Area 1) DATE: June 20, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION III Proposed Services

	<u>Points</u> <u>Available</u>	<u>Points</u> <u>Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	30	29

Evaluation Team Comments:

- The consultant provided a good list of the potential things they will look for in reviewing a case.
- Larkin presented an understanding of what the OPA needs.
- No subcontractors would be used.
- The consultant does not do ROE analysis, but the OPA has in-house capacity on this topic.
- The areas of service overall align well with the needs.
- Very relevant to the work.
- The right level of detail is presented in how the proposed services would be performed.

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: Larkin & Associates PLLC (General Service Area 1) DATE: June 20, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION IV Cost Proposal

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	د	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
39,475	c	85,000	x	30 points	I	13.93

Evaluation Team Comments:

Score is based on using the consensus scoring formula per best practices provided by the Office of State Procurement Services.

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: London Economics International LLC (General Service Area 1) DATE: June 20, 2025

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Office of the Public Advocate **Name of RFP Coordinator:** Kristina R. Winther **Names of Evaluators**: Kristina R. Winther, Richard P. Hevey, Heather Sanborn

Pass/Fail Criteria	Pass	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	N/A	N/A
Scoring Sections	<u>Points</u> <u>Available</u>	<u>Points</u> <u>Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	40	40
Section III. Proposed Services	30	20
Section IV. Cost Proposal	30	3.72
Total Points	<u>100</u>	<u>63.72</u>

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: London Economics International LLC (General Service Area 1) DATE: June 20, 2025

OVERVIEW OF SECTION I Preliminary Information

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

There is no evaluation of Preliminary Information.

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: London Economics International LLC (General Service Area 1) DATE: June 20, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION II Organization Qualifications and Experience

	<u>Points</u> <u>Available</u>	Points Awarded
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	40	40

- This is a Boston-based company, with projects worldwide.
- Highly regarded global firm.
- LEI has been involved in a variety of gas cases.
- The company does some quantitative modelling.
- LEI has done research on return on equity ROE, and they will do this for individual rate cases
 - They have an expert on capital structure and cost of capital
- LEI has expertise in gas distribution, asset valuation and price forecasting
- No subcontractors would be used.
- They have private sector and governmental clients.

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: London Economics International LLC (General Service Area 1) DATE: June 20, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION III Proposed Services

	<u>Points</u> <u>Available</u>	<u>Points</u> <u>Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	30	20

- LEI's specialization fits the subject matter of the RFP, where it is energy and infrastructure.
- However, LEI has much more of a consulting/policy approach.
- Focus is at a higher level than at the detail-oriented rate case level.
- More policy oriented rather than accounting which is needed for rate cases.
- Experience seems to be most focused on work for regulatory commissions and utilities and less on work with consumer advocates.
- For example, LEI proposes to continuously monitor gas markets at all levels.
- This is Seems less focused on the specific rate case review that will be our task.
- There is a mismatch between what LEI does in this area and what is needed in the RFP.
- The RFP is seeking a consultant more suited to work with a consumer advocate on the types of cases for which the RFP was developed.

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: London Economics International LLC (General Service Area 1) DATE: June 20, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION IV Cost Proposal

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	د	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
39,475	c	318,375	x	30 points	=	3.72

Evaluation Team Comments:

Score is based on using the consensus scoring formula per best practices provided by the Office of State Procurement Services.

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: Quantiv Regulatory Advisors LLC (General Service Area 1) DATE: June 20, 2025

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Office of the Public Advocate **Name of RFP Coordinator:** Kristina R. Winther **Names of Evaluators**: Kristina R. Winther, Richard P. Hevey, Heather Sanborn

Pass/Fail Criteria	Pass	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	N/A	N/A
Scoring Sections	<u>Points</u> <u>Available</u>	<u>Points</u> <u>Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	40	14
Section III. Proposed Services	30	18
Section IV. Cost Proposal	30	0
Total Points	<u>100</u>	<u>32</u>

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: Quantiv Regulatory Advisors LLC (General Service Area 1) DATE: June 20, 2025

OVERVIEW OF SECTION I Preliminary Information

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

There is no evaluation of Preliminary Information.

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: Quantiv Regulatory Advisors LLC (General Service Area 1) DATE: June 20, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION II Organization Qualifications and Experience

	<u>Points</u> <u>Available</u>	<u>Points</u> <u>Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	40	14

- Quantiv has a lack of qualifications in the United States.
- The experience seems very-Canada focused.
- The different systems could mean that the company's expertise is more limited in the United States.
- The company has 28 years of experience but there have been only 30 gas applications, so that gas is not a primary focus of the company.
- There would be a subcontracted Analyst who is not an employee of Quantiv (but has worked with them since 2011).
- It is not clear from the body of the proposal who the people are that would provide the service, but there are certain people listed on the cost proposal form.
- Quantiv could assist the OPA to think about issues such as system expansion vs efficiency vs electrification vs green energy.
- Quantiv has experience with "small" utilities such as the ones in Maine.
- The company does not have a very deep bench and seems to be mostly a two-person operation.
- It is difficult to evaluate whether proposed staff are appropriate for the scope of service sought by the OPA whether there is no work plan provided.

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: Quantiv Regulatory Advisors LLC (General Service Area 1) DATE: June 20, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION III Proposed Services

	<u>Points</u> <u>Available</u>	<u>Points</u> <u>Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	30	18

- Services to be provided by Quantiv appear to cover off the topics of the services required in the RFP.
- But, there is a lack of detail that makes it difficult to evaluate how the company proposes to provide those service.
- It also makes it difficult to evaluate whether the costs seem reasonable for the services that the OPA is seeking.
- The company does not propose using subcontractors.
- But there is discussion of the possibility, subject to pre-approval by the OPA.
- This creates uncertainty as to the costs.
- There are some questions as to whether proposed staff is appropriate for the scope of service sought by the OPA.

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: Quantiv Regulatory Advisors LLC (General Service Area 1) DATE: June 20, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION IV Cost Proposal

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	د	Cost Proposal Being Scored	х	Score Weight	=	Score
39,475	c	0	x	30 points	I	0

- Quantiv submitted hourly rates instead of a cost proposal for the total amount for the period of the initial contract.
- The OPA sought guidance from the Office of State Procurement Services on how to evaluate the proposal.
- The OPA chose to perform the review using one of the options offered by Office of State Procurement Services which was to assign a score of 0 to the cost proposal section, and then score the other sections as normal.

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: Current Energy Group LLC (General Service Area 2) DATE: June 20, 2025

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Office of the Public Advocate **Name of RFP Coordinator:** Kristina R. Winther **Names of Evaluators**: Kristina R. Winther, Richard P. Hevey, Heather Sanborn

Pass/Fail Criteria	Pass	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	N/A	N/A
Scoring Sections	<u>Points</u> <u>Available</u>	<u>Points</u> <u>Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	40	38
Section III. Proposed Services	30	30
Section IV. Cost Proposal	30	3.49
Total Points	<u>100</u>	<u>71.49</u>

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: Current Energy Group LLC (General Service Area 2) DATE: June 20, 2025

OVERVIEW OF SECTION I Preliminary Information

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

There is no evaluation of Preliminary Information.

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: Current Energy Group LLC (General Service Area 2) DATE: June 20, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION II Organization Qualifications and Experience

	<u>Points</u> <u>Available</u>	Points Awarded
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	40	38

- Current Energy filed a good proposal.
- It was thoughtful and well-written.
- The staff are really qualified to perform the services described in this RFP.
- Current Energy's experience is on-point for the services sought by the OPA.
- Current Energy has relevant experience with Minnesota.
- The company's focus is on consumer advocacy, which fits with the mission of the OPA.
- The company was recently formed in 2024, but the staff at the company clearly have experience relevant to the RFP.
- With its recent formation, it was not possible to easily locate examples of what this entity has done.
- The company has a sufficiently deep bench of staff to address the issues and perform the variety of tasks in this RFP.
- The Company has a consumer-oriented framing of the services it would provide.
- The company has worked on low-income issues.

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: Current Energy Group LLC (General Service Area 2) DATE: June 20, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION III Proposed Services

	<u>Points</u> <u>Available</u>	<u>Points</u> <u>Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	30	30

- The proposal described the company's approach and methodology.
- The company proposes to perform some services such as reviewing utility terms and conditions, which are not typically relevant to the types of work described in this RFP.
- Current Energy provided a clear response to describe what services it would provide that are requested in the RFP.
- The detail in the RFP provided good insight into what the company would do if selected.
- The company views the tasks to be performed through a consumer advocate-oriented lens.
- The pipeline replacement plans with the lens of consumer advocates and public interest groups.
- The company assumes there will be no travel during the initial period, which is unlikely to be accurate.

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: Current Energy Group LLC (General Service Area 2) DATE: June 20, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION IV Cost Proposal

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	د	Cost Proposal Being Scored	х	Score Weight	=	Score
23,000	c	197,491.50	x	30 points	=	3.49

Evaluation Team Comments:

Score is based on using the consensus scoring formula per best practices provided by the Office of State Procurement Services.

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: Exeter Associates, Inc. (General Service Area 2) DATE: June 20, 2025

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Office of the Public Advocate **Name of RFP Coordinator:** Kristina R. Winther **Names of Evaluators**: Kristina R. Winther, Richard P. Hevey, Heather Sanborn

Pass/Fail Criteria	Pass	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	N/A	N/A
Scoring Sections	<u>Points</u> <u>Available</u>	<u>Points</u> <u>Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	40	20
Section III. Proposed Services	30	3
Section IV. Cost Proposal	30	30
Total Points	<u>100</u>	<u>53</u>

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: Exeter Associates, Inc. (General Service Area 2) DATE: June 20, 2025

OVERVIEW OF SECTION I Preliminary Information

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

There is no evaluation of Preliminary Information.

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: Exeter Associates, Inc. (General Service Area 2) DATE: June 20, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION II Organization Qualifications and Experience

	<u>Points</u> <u>Available</u>	Points Awarded
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	40	20

- Exeter has extensive experience advocating for consumer advocates.
- This experience is related to cost of gas.
- The experience covers several states including Pennsylvania, Massachusetts, and others.
- The company has a lot of experience directly on point.
- Some of this experience has taken place at the Maine Public Utilities Commission.
- The company has expertise in gas issues in the northeast of the United States.
- This is important because of the unique interconnection relationships of the gas system in the northeast that impact the supply and transmission of gas in the northeast.
- The organization's bidding process did not convey the resource bandwidth that the company would have to perform the tasks of this RFP.
- The lack of bench could impact on the delivery of the services.

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: Exeter Associates, Inc. (General Service Area 2) DATE: June 20, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION III Proposed Services

	<u>Points</u> <u>Available</u>	<u>Points</u> <u>Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	30	3

- The number of hours of the proposed services was unrealistically low for the amount of services required.
- The proposed hours raise concern that the services performed would meet only the minimum of the tasks that the OPA anticipated will be required for this RFP.
- The hours would not be sufficient to make a deep dive in to the filings.
- The services proposed were unlikely to satisfy the tasks of the RFP.
- The proposed services were copied from the RFP.
- There were no services proposed related to FERC (Federal Energy Regulatory Commission).
- The proposal is not fully engaged with the tasks to be performed in terms of how the tasks would be performed.
- There was not a lot of detail on the services.
- There are no plans to address integrated resource plans (IRPs).

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: Exeter Associates, Inc. (General Service Area 2) DATE: June 20, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION IV Cost Proposal

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	د	Cost Proposal Being Scored	х	Score Weight	=	Score
23,000	c	23,000	x	30 points	=	30

Evaluation Team Comments:

Score is based on using the consensus scoring formula per best practices provided by the Office of State Procurement Services.

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: Maverick Energy Advisors LLC (General Service Area 2) DATE: June 20, 2025

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Office of the Public Advocate **Name of RFP Coordinator:** Kristina R. Winther **Names of Evaluators**: Kristina R. Winther, Richard P. Hevey, Heather Sanborn

Pass/Fail Criteria	Pass	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	N/A	N/A
Scoring Sections	<u>Points</u> <u>Available</u>	<u>Points</u> <u>Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	40	3
Section III. Proposed Services	30	15
Section IV. Cost Proposal	30	3.07
Total Points	<u>100</u>	<u>21.07</u>

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: Maverick Energy Advisors LLC (General Service Area 2) DATE: June 20, 2025

OVERVIEW OF SECTION I Preliminary Information

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

There is no evaluation of Preliminary Information.

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: Maverick Energy Advisors LLC (General Service Area 2) DATE: June 20, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION II Organization Qualifications and Experience

	<u>Points</u> <u>Available</u>	Points Awarded
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	40	3

- The company is very light on experience for consumer advocates.
- Maverick is familiar with Maine gas markets and the Maine Public Utilities Commission.
- The proposal is focused on one person providing the services.
- The focal consultant is a former gas president in the State and as such has considerable experience.
- The role of Continuum in the service to be provided is unclear.

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: Maverick Energy Advisors LLC (General Service Area 2) DATE: June 20, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION III Proposed Services

	<u>Points</u> <u>Available</u>	<u>Points</u> <u>Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	30	15

- There are somewhat confusing statements on how the support from Maverick will be applied under different scenarios.
- The services to be provided are cut and pasted from the RFP with very little detail provided.
- There is no detail on the approach that would be taken.
- The use of subcontractors in the services to be provided is vague.

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: Maverick Energy Advisors LLC (General Service Area 2) DATE: June 20, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION IV Cost Proposal

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	د	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
23,000	u	225,000	x	30 points	=	3.07

Evaluation Team Comments:

Score is based on using the consensus scoring formula per best practices provided by the Office of State Procurement Services.

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: SAGE Management Consultants LLC (General Service Area 2) DATE: June 20, 2025

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Office of the Public Advocate **Name of RFP Coordinator:** Kristina R. Winther **Names of Evaluators**: Kristina R. Winther, Richard P. Hevey, Heather Sanborn

Pass/Fail Criteria	Pass	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	N/A	N/A
Scoring Sections	<u>Points</u> <u>Available</u>	<u>Points</u> <u>Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	40	18
Section III. Proposed Services	30	10
Section IV. Cost Proposal	30	6.34
Total Points	<u>100</u>	<u>34.34</u>

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: SAGE Management Consultants LLC (General Service Area 2) DATE: June 20, 2025

OVERVIEW OF SECTION I Preliminary Information

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

There is no evaluation of Preliminary Information.

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: SAGE Management Consultants LLC (General Service Area 2) DATE: June 20, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION II Organization Qualifications and Experience

	<u>Points</u> <u>Available</u>	Points Awarded
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	40	18

- The company is more focused on utility audits and management consulting than the subjects of this RFP.
- The company performs management audits.
- There is less discussion about cost of gas/ prudency review, specifically in gas context.
- The company has represented clients in all sectors of the gas area.
- The company is based on the consortium model.
- There is concern that this model could be problematic for the rapid procedural scheduling that is sometimes applied to cases.
- There could be a delay in assembling contractors that would impact the ability to participate in a case.
- The company has limited consumer-advocate experience.
- Sage previously performed consulting work for the OPA, collecting information regarding low-income programs in other states.
- It appears there is only one Sage employee plus three consultants being presented to work on this RFP.
- Sage appears to have less experience in the gas context.

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: SAGE Management Consultants LLC (General Service Area 2) DATE: June 20, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION III Proposed Services

	<u>Points</u> <u>Available</u>	<u>Points</u> <u>Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	30	10

- The proposal was not a great fit for the services to be provided.
- The proposed services were cut and pasted from the RFP.
- Sage did break out the services with work tasks.
- Sage provided a nice chart of work to be provided.
- The reliance on subcontractors could affect the work provided.
- The reliance on subcontractors could affect the continuity of the material provided.

RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: NATURAL GAS CONSULTANT FOR THE MAINE PUBLIC ADVOCATE BIDDER: SAGE Management Consultants LLC (General Service Area 2) DATE: June 20, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION IV Cost Proposal

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	د	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
23,000	c	108,800	x	30 points	=	6.34

Evaluation Team Comments:

Score is based on using the consensus scoring formula per best practices provided by the Office of State Procurement Services.

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: Exeter Associates, Inc. (General Service Area 1) DATE: June 4, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Kristina R. Winther EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

Individual Evaluator Comments:

The general service area is Gas Local Distribution Company (LDC) Rate Cases before the PUC. The Services the OPA is seeking are:

- A. Revenue requirements and cost of service for gas LDCs.
- B. General gas utility operations and customer classes.
- C. Other issues that may arise related to natural gas policy.
- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - The business is located in Maryland.
 - Relevant to this RFP, Exeter provides expert testimony and other litigation support in utility regulatory proceedings, and many other areas.
 - Also potentially useful is that Exeter provides support services to its clients in proceedings before the Federal Energy Regulatory Commission (FERC).
 - The company has been in business 40 years.
 - The firm consists of six partners and 12 employees.
 - The proposal identifies 3 specific personnel that would work on OPA's cases.
 - Provided resumes for just two employees at Exeter.
 - Presumably these are the two staff members that would be providing service to the OPA, or primarily providing service.
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - The proposal states that none will be used.
 - 3. Organizational Chart
 - The firm consists of six partners and 12 employees.
 - Each engagement undertaken by Exeter becomes the direct responsibility of one of the principals who serves as the project manager.
 - 4. Exeter already works with the Maine OPA on rate cases in gas (BNG, Northern Utilities, Summit Natural Gas, and Maine Natural Gas) and water.
 - 5. The company has a long list of clients in many states, including other consumer advocate offices.
- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: Exeter Associates, Inc. (General Service Area 1) DATE: June 4, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Kristina R. Winther EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

- Exeter provides a list of the steps that it uses when approaching a rate case.
- Exeter states that the staff working on the project are always available by email and telephone to discuss and coordinate any matters related to the proceeding.
- 2. Implementation Work Plan
 - Exeter provided a list of common subjects and issues in rate cases.
 - For each subject, Exeter provided a detailed explanation about what the issue entails and the way that Exeter approaches the topic.
 - Exeter provided an 11-step process to describe the way it approaches a rate case.
 - As the RFP did not expect the bidders to work on a specific project, Exeter provided an estimate of how many hours it expects to work in total over the course of a year on natural gas rate cases.
 - The proposal shows only that Exeter would provide service on the "Revenue Requirements" portion of a rate case.
 - Exeter has not proposed to provide service for cost of service or general gas utility operations and other classes cost of service for gas LDCs.

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: Exeter Associates (General Area 1) DATE: June 5, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Richard P. Hevey EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - OPA has a great deal of experience with Exeter and the principals who be performing work if selected.
 - Exeter has a lot of experience before numerous regulatory commissions, with ongoing cases in Maine before the Maine PUC.
 - An experienced, stable company that has been in business for over 40 years.
 - Prior natural gas rate case experience, in Maine and elsewhere.
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - None proposed.
 - 3. Organizational Chart
 - Org chart provided not a very deep bench, but this has not been a problem in the past.
 - 4. Others
 - While Exeter always gets work completed in a professional manner by the required filing date, work could be performed in a manner that allows the office greater time to review documents before they need to be filed with the Maine PUC.
 - No conflicts regarding any utilities.
- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - Proposed services meet the requirements of the RFP.
 - Proven track record of being able to provide the proposed services.
 - 2. Implementation Work Plan
 - No specific work plan provided, but there is a description of Exeter's approach to rate proceedings.

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: Exeter Associates, Inc. (General Service Area 1) DATE: June 5, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Heather Sanborn EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - Strong reputation.
 - Worked with Maine OPA before and currently on water matters.
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - None.
 - 3. Organizational Chart
 - Provided. OPA is familiar with Mr. Morgan.
- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - Strong focus and attention to potential issues in a rate case that they anticipate looking at.
 - 2. Implementation Work Plan
 - Familiarity with Maine PUC and work flow.

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: Larkin & Associates PLLC (General Service Area 1) DATE: June 5, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Kristina R. Winther EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

Individual Evaluator Comments:

The general service area is Gas Local Distribution Company (LDC) Rate Cases before the PUC. The Services the OPA is seeking are:

- A. Revenue requirements and cost of service for gas LDCs.
- B. General gas utility operations and customer classes.
- C. Other issues that may arise related to natural gas policy.
- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - This consultant is located in Livonia, Michigan.
 - Certified public accountants and regulatory consultants.
 - Consultation areas: public utilities and consumer interest groups.
 - In 1970, Mr. Larkin and others formed an accounting firm.
 - Mr. Larkin does all the regulatory consulting work.
 - a. Has participated in 800 proceedings.
 - Primarily participates in rate cases.
 - analyzing utility applications/filings, including testimony, workpapers, discovery responses, commission orders and other relevant publicly available information.
 - preparing revenue requirement models and reflecting adjustments to the Company's proposed amounts.
 - a lot of experience in utility rate litigation in many states, including Maine.
 - Recently worked with Brian Marshall at OPA 2023 case on CMP.
 - Nothing about cost of service.
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - none
 - 3. Organizational Chart
 - CPA will do revenue requirement and be the expert witness.

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: Larkin & Associates PLLC (General Service Area 1) DATE: June 5, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Kristina R. Winther EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

- Assisted by a:
 - a. project manager
 - b. regulatory consultant
 - c. administrative assistant
- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - Revenue requirement only.
 - no mention of ROE return on equity.
 - 2. Implementation Work Plan
 - 14-steps to go through each stage of the rate proceeding.
 - Broken down by major category:
 - a. Rate base
 - b. Operation and maintenance expenses
 - c. Below the line revenues and expenses
 - d. Income taxes

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: Larkin & Associates (General Area 1) DATE: June 5, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Richard P. Hevey EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - A firm of CPAs and regulatory consultants.
 - This firm dates back to the 1970s.
 - An experienced, stable company that regularly participates in rate cases (over 800 regulatory proceedings).
 - Consulting experience in many jurisdictions, including Maine (CMP storm cost issues), with gas experience in other New England states (such as CT and MA).
 - Experience as stated seems adequate for the services requested.
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - None proposed.
 - 3. Organizational Chart
 - Org chart provided not a very deep bench, but this is consistent with other consultants hired by the OPA for this type of work.
 - Descriptions of individuals other than those shown on the org chart are provided – not clear whether these individuals would be available to work on our cases.
 - 4. Others
 - Certificate of Insurance was provided.
- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - Proposed services meet the requirements of the RFP.
 - Very detailed description of the proposed process for analyzing utility rate case filings.
 - 2. Implementation Work Plan
 - No specific work plan provided but there is a very detailed description of methods and resources for processing a gas utility rate case.

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: Larkin & Associates PLLC (General Service Area 1) DATE: June 5, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Heather Sanborn EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - I like the focus on being accountants rather than consultants.
 - Extensive experience on the Consumer Advocate side.
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - N/A
 - 3. Organizational Chart
 - Familiarity with OPA and Maine PUC.
- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - Good list of potential things they will look for.
 - 2. Implementation Work Plan
 - Strong proposal with organized understanding of what we'll need.

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: London Economics International LLC (General Service Area 1) DATE: June 5, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Kristina R. Winther EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

Individual Evaluator Comments:

The general service area is Gas Local Distribution Company (LDC) Rate Cases before the PUC. The Services the OPA is seeking are:

- A. Revenue requirements and cost of service for gas LDCs.
- B. General gas utility operations and customer classes.
- C. Other issues that may arise related to natural gas policy.
- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - Boston based.
 - Specializes in energy and infrastructure.
 - Uses proprietary quantitative models.
 - Projects worldwide.
 - Also have knowledge in performance-based rate making.
 - Cost causation studies.
 - Has done research on return on equity ROE, and they will do this for individual rate cases.
 - Has been expert on capital structure and cost of capital.
 - Expertise in:
 - a. gas distribution
 - b. asset valuation and price forecasting
 - c. multi-year rate plans
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - None
 - 3. Organizational Chart
 - 4. Other
 - Has had private sector and governmental clients.
 - Involved in a variety of gas cases have been.
 - Comparative approach to different types of rate setting.
 - Costs and benefits of municipalization.

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: London Economics International LLC (General Service Area 1) DATE: June 5, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Kristina R. Winther EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

II. Proposed Services

- 1. Services to be Provided
 - They can do:
 - 1. Revenue requirement models
 - 2. Rate design
 - 3. Will do cost of service determination
 - They can help with both Maine PUC and FERC cases.
 - Can help with proceedings and settlement.
 - Will continuously monitor gas markets at all levels.
- 2. Implementation Work Plan
 - Kick off meeting.
 - Organize rate case into five key components, including policy engagement.
 - Provided detailed explanation of each step of the rate case
 - Will prepare summary memos in addition to the documents to be filed.
 - Will provide and assist with development of possible gas policy positions.

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: London Economics (General Area 1) DATE: June 5, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Richard P. Hevey EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - Highly regarded global firm with vast experience regulatory proceedings in the US and Canada, including many cases in Maine.
 - Has advised utilities and regulators.
 - Has in-depth modeling and analytical capabilities seems to be adept at developing revenue requirement models.
 - Widespread experience in rate design and cost allocation.
 - Knowledgeable in PBR and multi-year rate plans, which is a possibility for Maine's gas utilities.
 - Experience seems to be most focused on work for regulatory commissions and utilities and less on work with consumer advocates.
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - None proposed.
 - 3. Organizational Chart
 - Org chart provided not a very deep bench, but this is consistent with other consultants hired by the OPA for this type of work.
 - Experience of proposed staff seems appropriate for the scope of service sought by the OPA.
 - 4. Others
 - Headquarters in Boston, so travel to Maine should not be a major issue.
 - Some experience and capabilities described are not relevant to work needed (such as electricity price forecasting).
 - Certificate of Insurance was not provided (but proposal said it was included).

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: London Economics (General Area 1) DATE: June 5, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Richard P. Hevey EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

II. Proposed Services

- 1. Services to be Provided
 - Proposed services meet the requirements of the RFP.
 - Very detailed description of the proposed process for analyzing utility rate case filings.
- 2. Implementation Work Plan
 - Very detailed work plan provided.

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: London Economics International LLC (General Service Area 1) DATE: June 5, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Heather Sanborn EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - They have much more of a consulting/policy approach.
 - Seems less focused on the specific rate case review that will be our task.
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - N/A
 - 3. Organizational Chart
 - More policy folks rather than accountants.

II. Proposed Services

- 1. Services to be Provided
 - Just doesn't seem as grounded in the actual work we'll need them to assist with. They proposal is at 50,000 feet.
- 2. Implementation Work Plan
 - Consultancy rather than focused on rate case work.

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: Quantiv Regulatory Advisors LLC (General Service Area 1) DATE: June 5, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Kristina R. Winther EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

Individual Evaluator Comments:

The general service area is Gas Local Distribution Company (LDC) Rate Cases before the PUC. The Services the OPA is seeking are:

- A. Revenue requirements and cost of service for gas LDCs.
- B. General gas utility operations and customer classes.
- C. Other issues that may arise related to natural gas policy.
- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - The company is headquartered in Charleston, SC.
 - But most of their experience is in Canada.
 - The company does financial and operational analysis of gas/electric/water.
 - They have 28 years of experience.
 - But only 30 gas applications.
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - The Analyst is not an employee of Quantiv (but has worked with them since 2011).
 - 3. Organizational Chart
 - It is not clear but can see who will be working on the cases from the cost proposal form.
 - There is a "team list" that indicates there will be:
 - a. Two Partners of Quantiv.
 - b. One Analyst.
 - 4. Other
 - Can help the OPA to think about issues such as system expansion vs efficiency vs electrification vs green energy.

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: Quantiv Regulatory Advisors LLC (General Service Area 1) DATE: June 5, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Kristina R. Winther EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

- Experience with "small" utilities such as the ones in Maine.
- Will provide both:
 - a. Cost of service
 - b. Revenue requirements.
- Will prepare drafts in advance of due dates
- They do a back and forth between the Experts to challenge their own analysis.
- Have done:
 - a. Rate cases.
 - b. Acquisition cases.

II. Proposed Services

- 1. Services to be provided appear to cover different services than what was required in the RFP.
 - Cost of service.
 - Revenue requirements.
 - Quantiv says they have experience in rate of return applications (the OPA application did not request this).
- 2. They also keep informed about state, regional, and national gas markets.
- 3. Implementation Work Plan
 - Quantiv has provided hourly costs, so you can see who is performing the work.

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: Quantiv Regulatory Advisors, LLC (General Area 1) DATE: June 5, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Richard P. Hevey EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - Small company with small staff.
 - Has worked with applicants, commissions and intervenors in regulatory proceedings.
 - Has participated in over 30 gas cases over 28 years.
 - Specifically familiar with issues regarding smaller gas utilities.
 - Has worked with PA Office of Small Business Advocate as an expert witness.
 - Has some level of gas case experience.
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - None proposed, but there is discussion of the possibility, subject to pre-approval by the OPA.
 - 3. Organizational Chart
 - No Org chart provided, just a description of who will do the work, with attached CVs.
 - Not a very deep bench, seems to be mostly a two-person operation.
 - Questionable as of whether proposed staff is appropriate for the scope of service sought by the OPA.
 - 4. Others
 - Stated willingness to travel to Maine.
- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - Proposal is lacking detail, what was provided is a one-page list of activities and deliverables.
 - Though not very detailed, the list of activities and deliverables meets the basic requirements of the requested scope of services.

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: Quantiv Regulatory Advisors, LLC (General Area 1) DATE: June 5, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Richard P. Hevey EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

- 2. Implementation Work Plan
 - No work plan provided, but there is a brief discussion of the proposed approach for working.

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: Quantiv Regulatory Advisors LLC (General Service Area 1) DATE: June 5, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Heather Sanborn EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - Seems very Canada focused
 - Lacking American experience
 - Some experience with similar sized utilities
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - n/a
 - 3. Organizational Chart
- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - Doesn't seem very specific beyond repeating what's in the RFP.
 - 2. Implementation Work Plan
 - Not really much there.

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: Current Energy Group, LLC (General Service Area 2) DATE: June 20, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Kristina R. Winther EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - Headquarters are in Tucson, Arizona.
 - Incorporated in 2024, but the 5 founding partners have been working together longer than that.
 - Have provide service in 36 states.
 - Work in both gas and electric.
 - Capital investment prudency.
 - Natural gas policy.
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - None.
 - 3. Organizational Chart
 - 2 partners plus a consultant and an analyst.
 - 4. The project lead has experience in low-income ratepayer issues.
 - 5. Gas supply? Transportation? Contracting? Very little mentioned in these areas.
 - 6. Couldn't find any examples of testimony, maybe because such a new company.
 - 7. Project lead has written a paper on non-pipeline alternatives 2023.
- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - Will review procurement practices, transportation agreements, tariffs and terms & conditions.

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: Current Energy Group, LLC (General Service Area 2) DATE: June 20, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Kristina R. Winther EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

- Detailed description of cost of gas analysis.
- Consider many facts in review of decisions.
- Integrated electric and gas planning.
- Gas marketer evaluation.
- FERC policy.
- 2. Implementation Work Plan
 - General descriptions of the service issues/areas but nothing specific.

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: Current Energy Group, LLC (General Area 2) DATE: June 11, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Richard P. Hevey EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - Company formed in 2024 claim to have over 60 years of combined experience Staff of 17.
 - Natural gas policy is one of six pillars of their work.
 - Focus on consumer advocacy.
 - Cost of gas, trading, hedging, IRP, and merger case experience.
 - Focus on a wide variety of gas policy issues, which could be viewed as either positive or negative for the specific scope of work we are requesting.
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - None proposed.
 - 3. Organizational Chart
 - Org chart clear, showing a relatively deep bench.
 - Wide range of proposed staff with various areas of relevant expertise.
 - 4. Others
 - Headquarters in Arizona.
 - Certificate of Insurance provided.
- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - Proposed services meet the requirements of the RFP.
 - Very detailed description of the proposed process for analyzing utility cost of gas filings.
 - Approach and methodologies are detailed and well throught out.
 - Approach to federal work discussed.
 - Not all proposed work is relevant e,g, examination of utility terms and conditions.

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: Current Energy Group, LLC (General Area 2) DATE: June 11, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Richard P. Hevey EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

- 2. Implementation Work Plan
 - No specific work plan, but strong understanding of scope of required services through a description of proposed services, approaches and methodologies.

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: Current Energy Group, LLC (General Service Area 2) DATE: June 12, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Heather Sanborn EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - Work for MN Cub, Sierra Club, and Wester resources Advocate (NM) is described.
 - Successful cost of gas and prudency proceedings described.
 - Formally incorporated in 2024 but have been working together for "up to 10 years" (from Strategen).
 - Natural gas policy is one of six pillars.
 - Focus on consumer advocacy.
 - Notes a focus on credibility in front of commissions.
 - Strong focus on "gas transition" bios seem very progressive toward clean energy transition experience.
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - Not referenced
 - 3. Organizational Chart
 - provided
- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - Very detailed and thoughtful description of each item on our scope of work.
 - Consumer advocate oriented framing (not just a cut and paste job but well thought-out answers).
 - Lens described for evaluating pipeline replacement plans is attractive.
 - 2. Implementation Work Plan
 - None specifically given.

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: Exeter Associates, Inc. (General Service Area 2) DATE: June 20, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Kristina R. Winther EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - Headquarters in Maryland.
 - Policy, regulation, and business.
 - FERC and state commissions.
 - Began in 1981.
 - Gas supply and procurement policies.
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - None.
 - 3. Organizational Chart
 - Seven partners.
 - Thirteen employees.
 - J. Mierzwa, president, would be the individual assisting.
 - a. conducted purchased gas cost allocation and rate design analysis; and management audits and similar investigations of the natural gas supply and procurement policies and practices of interstate gas pipelines and local distribution companies (LDCs).
 - b. FERC.
 - c. Negotiate favorable natural gas contracts.
 - d. Prudence review.
 - e. Forecasting demand requirements.

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: Exeter Associates, Inc. (General Service Area 2) DATE: June 20, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Kristina R. Winther EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

- Mr. Larkin-Connolly regulatory economist, would assist
 - a. conducted annual reviews of purchased gas commodity adjustment filings of numerous gas companies, analyzed gas costs reconciliation charges, compared supply portfolio's to market prices, and evaluated gas procurement strategies.
 - b. director of utility regulation & litigation.
- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - Copied list in the RFP.
 - 2. Implementation Work Plan
 - Copied list in the RFP.

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: Exeter Associates, Inc. (General Area 2) DATE: June 11, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Richard P. Hevey EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - OPA has a great deal of experience with Exeter and the key principle who will be performing work if selected.
 - Exeter has a lot of experience before numerous regulatory commissions, with ongoing cases in Maine before the Maine PUC.
 - An experienced, stable company that has been in business over 40 years.
 - Purchased gas case experience, with ability to essentially audit gas purchase and procurement policies.
 - Assisted in numerous specific Annual Purchased Gas Proceeding for PA OCA, with similar experience in MA and DE.
 - FERC gas proceeding experience.
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - None expected to be used.
 - 3. Organizational Chart
 - Org chart provided not a deep bench, but this is standard for Exeter.
 - 4. Others
 - While Exeter always get work completed in a professional manner by the required filing date, work could be performed in a manner that allows the office greater time to review documents before they need to be filed with the Maine PUC.
 - No conflicts regarding any utilities.
 - Certificate of insurance provided.
- Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - Proposed services meet the requirements of the RFP, but appeared to be a simple recitation of the RFP requirements.
 - ٠

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: Exeter Associates, Inc. (General Area 2) DATE: June 11, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Richard P. Hevey EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

- Demonstrated understand of the gas industry in Maine the work that the OPA needs to accomplish.
- Very detailed description of the proposed services.
- No proposed services presented for FERC work.
- 2. Implementation Work Plan
 - No specific work plan, but strong understanding of scope of required services through a description of proposed services.

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: Exeter Associates, Inc. (General Service Area 2) DATE: June 20, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Heather Sanborn EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - Extensive experience advocating for PA, MA, DE consumer advocate on cost of gas.
 - Lots of experience directly on point.
 - Experience with MPUC.
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - N/A
 - 3. Organizational Chart
- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - Repeats our RFP without a lot of detail or color on the lens used to evaluate cost of gas and other issues. Not clear that they have a plan to address IRPs if those become part of the work flow.
 - Not as detailed or impressive as expected.
 - 2. Implementation Work Plan

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: Maverick Energy Advisors LLC (General Service Area 2) DATE: June 11, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Kristina R. Winther EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - Headquarters in North Carolina
 - Formed in 2024 by two energy executives
 - 60 years of experience
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - none
 - 3. Organizational Chart
 - Mr. Shipley is primary person providing support
 - Mr. Shipley has extensive regulatory and gas supply experience in Maine as President of Bangor Natural gas from 2007 to 2013.
 - b. Subcontractor for Continuum Capital.
 - running two natural gas utilities, building a gas engineering division for a top engineering firm and building construction divisions for two pipeline contracting companies.

II. Proposed Services

- 1. Services to be Provided
 - Copied service list from the RFP.
 - Then details providing of how the work would be performed.
- 2. Implementation Work Plan
 - Made "COG" list of steps.

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: Maverick Energy Advisors, LLC (General Area 2) DATE: June 11, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Richard P. Hevey EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - A relatively new company, formed in 2024 by 2 energy industry executives, but only discusses one of them.
 - Primary consultant is a former President of Bangor Natural Gas has specific experience in cost-of-gas issues before the MPUC.
 - Listed project experience is a little light on detail and very relevant to the work also deals with work done while working for another company no really the experience of Maverick.
 - Widespread experience in gas utility operations.
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - A little vague as to use of subcontractors notes that strategy is to combine efforts with select industry professional, then says they won't be used for cost-of-gas work.
 - 3. Organizational Chart
 - Org chart provided by unclear lists another company (Contunuum Capital), but doesn't discuss their role.
 - 4. Others
 - Headquarters in North Carolina.
 - Certificate of Insurance provided.
- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - Proposed services meet the requirements of the RFP, but were largely a restatement of the RFP requirements.
 - Very detailed description of the proposed process for analyzing utility rate case filings.
 - Strong understanding of what is required for cost-of-gas proceedings in Maine.
 - Plan presented for FERC work.

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: Maverick Energy Advisors, LLC (General Area 2) DATE: June 11, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Richard P. Hevey EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

- 2. Implementation Work Plan
 - No specific work plan, but strong understanding of scope of required services through a description of proposed services.

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: Maverick Energy Advisors LLC (General Service Area 2) DATE: June 20, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Heather Sanborn EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - Very light on experience for Consumer Advocates... experience is within a utility.
 - Familiar with MPUC worked for BNG.
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - Confusing statement about not using anyone to support his project
 - 3. Organizational Chart
 - Confusing I don't know who Continuum Capital is or why they are in the org chart.
- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - Repeats the RFP.
 - Little detail on approach.
 - 2. Implementation Work Plan
 - Submitted a list of steps to complete parts of the RFP.

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: SAGE Management Consultants LLC (General Service Area 2) DATE: June 11, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Kristina R. Winther EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - Headquarters in Georgia.
 - cost and management audits and the provision of utility regulatory and litigation support.
 - Worked with OPA on Central Maine Power and Emera Maine cases.
 - Experience with gas procurement activities.
 - a. Supply and capacity storage.
 - Management consulting experience.
 - Management audit.
 - Gas supply portfolio.
 - Potentially overqualified?
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - SAGE is a consortium model firm, like a large majority of the firms that consult on regulatory commission sponsored projects.
 - The consortium model consists of a core of key staff members supplemented by associated independent consultants and specialty firms.

II. Proposed Services

- 1. Services to be Provided
 - Copied list from RFP.
- 2. Implementation Work Plan
 - Gave very detailed step-by-step.

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: SAGE Management Consultants, LLC (General Area 2) DATE: June 11, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Richard P. Hevey EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - National management consulting firm focused on utility audits.
 - SAGE is a consortium model firm key staff members supplemented by independent consultants and specialty firms.
 - Broad scope of practice seem to represent all sectors.
 - Wide variety of services provided to many clients not focused on gas issues.
 - Projects listed focused on utility audit expertise, except ERAC work performed for OPA.
 - Natural gas policy is one of six pillars of their work.
 - Cost of gas, trading, hedging, IRP, and merger case experience.
 - Focus on a wide variety of gas policy issues, which could be viewed as either positive or negative for the specific scope of work we are requesting.
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - Wide use of subcontractors envisioned.
 - 3. Organizational Chart
 - Consulting team listed, org chart provided.
 - Subcontractor approach could provide additional resources if needed.
 - 4. Others
 - Headquarters in Georgia.
 - Certificate of Insurance provided.
- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - Proposed services meet the requirements of the RFP.
 - Project requirements from the RFP and associated work tasks identified.

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: SAGE Management Consultants, LLC (General Area 2) DATE: June 11, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Richard P. Hevey EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

- 2. Implementation Work Plan
 - No specific work plan, but work tasks were identified for each RFP requirement.

RFP #: 202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate BIDDER NAME: SAGE Management Consultants LLC (General Service Area 2) DATE: June 20, 2025 EVALUATOR NAME: Heather Sanborn EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Office of the Public Advocate

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - Strong experience in affiliate audits and management auditing.
 - Less discussion re cost of gas/ prudency review specifically in gas context.
 - Ms Bodamer has direct gas utility experience but not consumer advocate experience.
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - N/A
 - 3. Organizational Chart
- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - Generally copies over the RFP but with a clear assignment of work tasks to each requirement.
 - 2. Implementation Work Plan



Janet T. Mills Governor

STATE OF MAINE OFFICE OF THE PUBLIC ADVOCATE

Heather B. Sanborn Public Advocate

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate

I, Kristina R. Winther, accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Office of the Public Advocate. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disgualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

Signature

5-30-2025

Date



Janet T. Mills Governor

STATE OF MAINE OFFICE OF THE PUBLIC ADVOCATE

Heather B. Sanborn Public Advocate

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate

I, Richard P. Hevey, accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Office of the Public Advocate. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disgualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

Signature

5-30-2025

Date



Janet T. Mills Governor

STATE OF MAINE OFFICE OF THE PUBLIC ADVOCATE

Heather B. Sanborn Public Advocate

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT RFP #:202504057 RFP TITLE: Natural Gas Consultant for the Maine Public Advocate

I, Heather Sanborn, accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Office of the Public Advocate. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disgualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

5-30-2025

Date