State of Maine Master Score Sheet

RFP# 202411204 Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis, and Recommendations Deloitte **Gallagher Benefit Bidder Name: ATZ Solutions** Consulting **Mercer US LLC** Services LLP **Proposed Cost:** \$1,941,000 \$896,102 \$114,500 \$224,500 **Points Scoring Sections** 100 100 100 100 Available Section I: Preliminary Information Pass/Fail Pass Pass Pass Pass Section II: Organization 35 34 13 27 6 Qualifications and Experience Section III: Proposed Services 40 8 38 10 25 Section IV: Cost Proposal 25 1.47 3.19 25 12.75 TOTAL 75.19 100 15.47 <u>48</u> 64.75 **Bidder Name:** Segal **Proposed Cost:** \$695,000 **Points Scoring Sections** 100 **Available** Section I: Preliminary Information Pass/Fail Pass Section II: Organization 35 18 Qualifications and Experience Section III: Proposed Services 24 40 Section IV: Cost Proposal 25 4.12 **TOTAL** 100 46.12

Award Justification Statement RFP# 202411204 Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations

I. Summary

The State of Maine is seeking proposals for a comprehensive classification review, analysis, and recommendations of the executive branch employees to serve as the foundation for the 10-year review of the classification plan as required by statute. The state is seeking proposals to identify strengths and weaknesses of the current classification system, review current positions performing similar levels of work, and provide recommendations as to changes and/or improvements to the classification system. Five Bidders responded to the RFP:

ATZ Solutions
Deloitte Consulting LLP
Gallagher Benefit Services
Mercer US LLC
The Segal Company

II. Evaluation Process

The RFP Coordinator and Facilitator put together packets from the bidders which were sent to the five evaluation team members in alphabetical order for review. Each team member reviewed the proposal from each bidder, in alphabetical order, and provided individual notes to the coordinator. The team then met together to score each proposal in alphabetical order. A team consensus was reached as to each score for each proposal.

The evaluation team was comprised of the Director of Compliance, a Senior Labor Relations Specialist, a Policy Development Specialist, a Lead Human Resources Analyst, and a Director of Communications. The qualifications of this team consist of years of experience in compensation and classification matters, a thorough understanding of the classification system, and work with outside vendors on other legislatively mandated projects. This team is comprised of individuals who work within the states classification system on a daily basis.

III. Qualifications & Experience

Previous projects that involved streamlining classifications.

- Understanding and acknowledging the state's commitment to maintain the current hay methodology.
- Provided a clear description of how classification levels build and should be built upon.
- Provide a classification title glossary and classification structure design workshops.

IV. Proposed Services

- Provided a comprehensive explanation of deliverables and a detailed implementation plan.
- Provided information on designing workshops and helping with change management.
- Provided the steps of services to be completed and the order in which they will be completed in.
- Clearly explained how they will identify strengths and weaknesses of the current classification system and detailed how they will do that, as well as confirming the review of necessary documents.

V. Cost Proposal

 The selected bidder has the second highest cost proposal and provided a detailed budget narrative.

VI. Conclusion

Out of 100 points, the Evaluation Team awarded Deloitte Consulting LLP a score of 75.19. The selected bidder provided in depth descriptions of past projects they had completed that directly related to the state's requirements for this project. The past projects spoke about skills and qualifications of the team, how a strategy was implemented, how the project was carried out, and the recommendations provided. The overview of the organization clearly outlined 30 years of experience in classification consulting services and outlined their previous work with the State of Maine. Under proposed services, this bidder clearly outlined their approach which included methodologies and resources that would be utilized. The bidder broke out the services in phases, addressing each one of the state's requirements, and how each phase will be completed. In addition, the phases had a clear expected delivery date that aligned with the state's deadline for the overall project.



STATE OF MAINE DEPARTMENT OF ADMINISTRATIVE AND FINANCIAL SERVICES

Kirsten Figueroa Commissioner

April 3, 2025

ATZ Solution LLC Mdnurun Nabi 301 S McDowell Street, Suite 125-2206 Charlotte, NC 28204

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202411204, Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations

Dear Mdnurun Nabi:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Administrative and Financial Services for Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

Deloitte Consulting LLP

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Page 1 of 3 rev. 8/26/24

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Kelsie Lee

Kelsie M. Lee

Director of Compliance

State of Maine Bureau of Human Resources

Phone: (207) 215-5555 | **TTY:** 711 Maine Relay

#4 SHS | 4th Floor, Burton M. Cross Building | Augusta, Maine 04333-0004

Page 2 of 3 rev. 8/26/24

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).

Page 3 of 3 rev. 8/26/24



STATE OF MAINE DEPARTMENT OF Administrative and Financial Services

Kirsten Figueroa Commissioner

April 3, 2025

Deloitte Consulting LLP Maniraja Murahari 115 Federal Street, Winthrop Center Boston, MA 02110

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202411204, Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations.

Dear Devon Lane:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Administrative and Financial Services for Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis, and Recommendations. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

Deloitte Consulting, LLP

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Page 1 of 3 rev. 8/26/24

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Kelsie Lee

Kelsie M. Lee

Director of Compliance

State of Maine Bureau of Human Resources

Phone: (207) 215-5555 | **TTY:** 711 Maine Relay

#4 SHS | 4th Floor, Burton M. Cross Building | Augusta, Maine 04333-0004

Page 2 of 3 rev. 8/26/24

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).

Page 3 of 3 rev. 8/26/24



STATE OF MAINE DEPARTMENT OF ADMINISTRATIVE AND FINANCIAL SERVICES

Kirsten Figueroa Commissioner

April 3, 2025

Gallagher Benefit Services Inc. Erik Smetana 2850 Golf Road Rolling Meadows, IL 60008

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202411204, Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations

Dear Erik Smetana:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Administrative and Financial Services for Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

Deloitte Consulting LLP

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

Page 1 of 3 rev. 8/26/24

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Kelsie Lee

Kelsie M. Lee

Director of Compliance

State of Maine Bureau of Human Resources

Phone: (207) 215-5555 | **TTY:** 711 Maine Relay

#4 SHS | 4th Floor, Burton M. Cross Building | Augusta, Maine 04333-0004

Page 2 of 3 rev. 8/26/24

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).

Page 3 of 3 rev. 8/26/24



STATE OF MAINE DEPARTMENT OF ADMINISTRATIVE AND FINANCIAL SERVICES

Kirsten Figueroa Commissioner

April 3, 2025

Mercer US LLC Lia Santos 1166 6th Avenue New York, NY 10036

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202411204, Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations

Dear Lia Santos:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Administrative and Financial Services for Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

Deloitte Consulting LLP

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

Page 1 of 3 rev. 8/26/24

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Kelsie Lee

Kelsie M. Lee

Director of Compliance

State of Maine Bureau of Human Resources

Phone: (207) 215-5555 | **TTY:** 711 Maine Relay

#4 SHS | 4th Floor, Burton M. Cross Building | Augusta, Maine 04333-0004

Page 2 of 3 rev. 8/26/24

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).

Page 3 of 3 rev. 8/26/24



STATE OF MAINE DEPARTMENT OF ADMINISTRATIVE AND FINANCIAL SERVICES

Kirsten Figueroa Commissioner

April 3, 2025

The Segal Company
David Blumenstein
333 West 34th Street, 3rd Floor
New York, NY 10001-2402

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202411204, Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations

Dear Thomas L. Cox:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Administrative and Financial Services for Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

Deloitte Consulting LLP

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Page 1 of 3 rev. 8/26/24

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Kelsie Lee

Kelsie M. Lee

Director of Compliance

State of Maine Bureau of Human Resources

Phone: (207) 215-5555 | **TTY:** 711 Maine Relay

#4 SHS | 4th Floor, Burton M. Cross Building | Augusta, Maine 04333-0004

Page 2 of 3 rev. 8/26/24

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).

Page 3 of 3 rev. 8/26/24

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations

BIDDER: ATZ Solutions **DATE:** February 14, 2025

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

Name of RFP Coordinator: Kelsie Lee

Names of Evaluators: Kelsie Lee, Sharon Huntley, Scott Helmke, Sophia Spiller, Lucas Sieb

Pass/Fail Criteria	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	Yes	
Scoring Sections	Points Available	Points Awarded
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	6
Section III. Proposed Services	40	8
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	1.47
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>15.47</u>

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations

BIDDER: ATZ Solutions **DATE:** February 14, 2025

OVERVIEW OF SECTION I Preliminary Information

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

Provided all the necessary information.

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations

BIDDER: ATZ Solutions **DATE:** February 14, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION IIOrganization Qualifications and Experience

	<u>Points</u> <u>Available</u>	<u>Points</u> <u>Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	6

Evaluation Team Comments:

I. Overview of the Organization

- -Has experience with data analysis but is of sales trends rather than text-based classification systems.
- +Previous work with government entities.
- -Past projects are not classification related.
- -Technical language without explanation left reviewers unclear if their systems are compatible with those of the State.
- -Stated that recommendations would align with hay but did not explain how.
- -Heavy emphasis on technology

Subcontractors

-Referenced subcontractors but did not affirmatively state whether they would be used or not.

Org Chart

-Did not provide an org chart but did provide a list of roles

Litigation

-Not provided

Financial Viability

-Not provided

Certificate of Insurance

+Provided

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations

BIDDER: ATZ Solutions **DATE:** February 14, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION III Proposed Services

	<u>Points</u> <u>Available</u>	Points Awarded
Section III. Proposed Services	40	8

Evaluation Team Comments:

- -Appeared to just be requirements from the RFP reworded and reformatted.
- -Not clear what their plan of action would be.
- -Highly technical, not clear how their system would talk to ours.
- -Using AI is a concern; the State of Maine is only just starting to use AI and it's not something we asked for. Unsure if their use of AI will be approved by Maine IT in accordance with the Maine IT GenAI policy.
- -Does not explain how they will review and analyze the Segal report.
- -The desired outcomes are not really clear.
- -Did not provide details on development and implementation of phases, which month they will be completed in, and who would complete them.

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations

BIDDER: ATZ Solutions **DATE:** February 14, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION IV Cost Proposal

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	د	Cost Proposal Being Scored	х	Score Weight	II	Score
\$114,500.00	3	\$1,941,000.00	x	25 points	II	1.47

Evaluation Team Comments:

Most expensive

RFP #: RFP 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations

BIDDER: Deloitte Consulting Services

DATE: February 14, 2025

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

Name of RFP Coordinator: Kelsie M. Lee

Names of Evaluators: Kelsie Lee, Sophia Spiller, Lucas Sieb, Scott Helmke, Sharon Huntley

Pass/Fail Criteria	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	Yes	
Scoring Sections	Points Available	Points Awarded
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	34
Section III. Proposed Services	40	38
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	3.19
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>75.19</u>

RFP #: RFP 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations

BIDDER: Deloitte Consulting Services

DATE: February 14, 2025

OVERVIEW OF SECTION I Preliminary Information

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

Provided everything requested

RFP #: RFP 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations

BIDDER: Deloitte Consulting LLP

DATE: February 14, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION IIOrganization Qualifications and Experience

	<u>Points</u> <u>Available</u>	<u>Points</u> <u>Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	34

Evaluation Team Comments:

I. Overview of the Organization

- +Has worked with the State of Maine for more than 40 years.
- +Has been providing classification services for 30 years
- +Previous projects were streamlining classifications.
- +They understand that stakeholder buy in is a challenge and plan to assist the state with it.
- +They understand that we are committed to staying with Hay and workday.
- +Love the idea of classification structure design workshops.
- +A classification title glossary is something we have been discussing.
- +Provided a clear description of how classification levels are built and should be built upon.
- +The three projects were spot on-including the classification element.
- +Great understanding of complex systems.
- +Extremely detailed

Subcontractors

+Not planning to use subcontractors

Org Chart

-Did not provide an org chart but did provide a list

Litigation

-Unclear to what extent they are involved in litigation

Financial Statement

- +Stature of company suggests financial viability
- -no profit/loss statement

Insurance

+Certificate of Insurances provided

RFP #: RFP 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations

BIDDER: Deloitte Consulting LLP

DATE: February 14, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION III Proposed Services

	Points Available	Points Awarded
Section III. Proposed Services	40	38

Evaluation Team Comments:

- +Comprehensive explanation of deliverables.
- +Design workshops seem really helpful, gaps analysis.
- +Time spent on understanding the states system.
- +Career tracks are something we are looking for.
- +Help with change management.
- +Seems like they will provide the steps of the services in the order of the services.
- -Did not provide how they will go about completing each step.
- +Will identify strengths and weaknesses and clearly explained how they will do that.
- +Will review Segal report.
- -Unclear who will be involved in what phase.
- +Detailed implementation plan.

RFP #: RFP 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations

BIDDER: Deloitte Consulting LLP

DATE: February 14, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION IV Cost Proposal

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	ه	Cost Proposal Being Scored	х	Score Weight	II	Score
\$114,500.00	2	\$896,102.00	x	25 points	II	3.19

Evaluation Team Comments:

Second most expensive bid.

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations)

BIDDER: Gallagher Benefit Services

DATE: February 14, 2025

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Department of Administrative Services

Name of RFP Coordinator: Kelsie Lee

Names of Evaluators: Kelsie Lee, Sophia Spiller, Sharon Huntley, Lucas Sieb, Scott Helmke

Pass/Fail Criteria	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	Yes	
Scoring Sections	<u>Points</u> <u>Available</u>	Points Awarded
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	13
Section III. Proposed Services	40	10
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	25
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>48</u>

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations)

BIDDER: Gallagher Benefit Services

DATE: February 14, 2025

OVERVIEW OF SECTION I Preliminary Information

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

Provided everything requested

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations)

BIDDER: Gallagher Benefit Services

DATE: February 14, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION IIOrganization Qualifications and Experience

	<u>Points</u> <u>Available</u>	<u>Points</u> <u>Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	13

Evaluation Team Comments:

I. Overview of the Organization

- -Provided almost no information on previous projects; only one project mentioned classification at all.
- -Didn't provide what was requested regarding brief descriptions of previous projects.
- -Very little elaboration to help us understand their skills and qualifications to do the job.
- +One previous statewide review project.
- +Description of work plan.

Subcontractors

+Not planning to use subcontractors

Organizational Chart

- -Limited and does not describe who would be assigned to our project.
- -Lots of experience with Employee and Labor Relations and Recruitment but not so much on the classification side. Unclear if they have any experience in classification review.

Litigation

-Unclear whether there is ongoing/previous litigation involving bidder.

Financial

+Financial statement provided, and bidder appears viable.

Insurance

+Certification provided

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations)

BIDDER: Gallagher Benefit Services

DATE: February 14, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION III Proposed Services

	<u>Points</u> <u>Available</u>	<u>Points</u> <u>Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	40	10

Evaluation Team Comments:

- -Not clear what they will provide and how it will be accomplished.
- -It seems they have a concern about delivery time and that causes reviewers' concern.
- -Continued mention of "fair pay" is not applicable to scope of requested review.
- -No mention of reviewing Segal report.
- -The deliverables and timeline overlap which is concerning; there are no dates included.
- -Phase #2 is the entire time.
- -Unclear what resources they will use to deliver and no mention of who would be responsible for which element of the project.
- -Proposal appears to be focused on determining if individual employees are properly qualified which is outside the scope of the requested review.
- No mention of review of current structure.
- -No mention of review of admin unit study.
- -No mention of consideration of career ladders when performing analysis or making recommendations.
- +Addresses titling conventions and plans to provide recommendations on how to maintain recommended changes going forward.
- -No mention of IT compliance.
- -Interviewing 12,000 employees will be very time-consuming and is beyond the scope of the requested review.

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations)

BIDDER: Gallagher Benefit Services

DATE: February 14, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION IV Cost Proposal

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	ه	Cost Proposal Being Scored	Х	Score Weight	=	Score
\$114,500.00	3	\$114,500.00	x	25 points	=	25

Evaluation Team Comments:

Cheapest bid.

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER: Mercer US LLC **DATE:** February 14, 2025

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

Name of RFP Coordinator: Kelsie Lee

Names of Evaluators: Kelsie Lee, Sophia Spiller, Lucas Sieb, Scott Helmke, Sharon Huntley

Pass/Fail Criteria	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	Yes	
Scoring Sections	Points Available	Points Awarded
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	27
Section III. Proposed Services	40	25
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	12.75
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	64.75

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER: Mercer US LLC **DATE:** February 14, 2025

OVERVIEW OF SECTION I Preliminary Information

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

Provided everything requested

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER: Mercer US LLC **DATE:** February 14, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION IIOrganization Qualifications and Experience

	<u>Points</u> <u>Available</u>	<u>Points</u> <u>Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	27

Evaluation Team Comments:

I. Overview of the Organization

- +Has some experience in job classification systems work.
- -Previous project descriptions are brief and focused on job classification comparison to external market rather than internal consolidation to streamline a classification.
- +Vendor may understand the Segal recommendations more than others due to employment of former Segal employee.
- +Experience performing statewide classification reviews.

Organizational Chart

- +Extensive description on each person.
- +Each team member had an abundant amount of experience.

Litigation

-Unclear whether there is current or previous litigation involving this bidder.

Financial

+Financial statement is provided, and bidder appears viable.

Certificate of Insurances

+Provided

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER: Mercer US LLC **DATE:** February 14, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION III Proposed Services

	Points Available	Points Awarded
Section III. Proposed Services	40	25

Evaluation Team Comments:

- +Mercer has a comprehensive job library and partners with industry-leading skills databases.
- -Concern that they may have a one-size-fits-all system and whether their recommendation will be flexible based on our Hay system and upcoming Workday implementation.
- -The proposed five phases of the project lack additional detail.
- -The proposed services are a copy/paste of the RFP.
- +Identified who would be assigned to which phase and included a start and end date.
- -The end date of July is very concerning and not realistic given our team's projected bandwidth.

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER: Mercer US LLC **DATE:** February 14, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION IV Cost Proposal

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	د	Cost Proposal Being Scored	Х	Score Weight	II	Score
\$114,500.00	3	\$224,500	x	25 points	II	12.75

Evaluation Team Comments:

Second cheapest bid

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations

BIDDER: Segal

DATE: February 14, 2025

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

Name of RFP Coordinator: Kelsie Lee

Names of Evaluators: Kelsie Lee, Sophia Spiller, Lucas Sieb, Scott Helmke, Sharon Huntley

Pass/Fail Criteria	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	Yes	
Scoring Sections	Points Available	Points Awarded
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	18
Section III. Proposed Services	40	24
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	4.12
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>46.12</u>

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations

BIDDER: Segal

DATE: February 14, 2025

OVERVIEW OF SECTION I Preliminary Information

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

Provided everything required

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations

BIDDER: Segal

DATE: February 14, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION IIOrganization Qualifications and Experience

	<u>Points</u> <u>Available</u>	<u>Points</u> <u>Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	18

Evaluation Team Comments:

I. Overview of the Organization

- -The job evaluation recommendation recommends a point factor system and the State is committed to the Hay methodology.
- -Two of the three projects are compensation driven, and did not include classification.
- +Has conducted classification reviews previously.
- -Reviewing solely an entity's classification system appears to be a small part of what they offer for services. Did not describe their classification analysis experience well.

Subcontractors

+Does not plan to use subcontractors.

Organization Chart

+Clear organizational chart-professional backgrounds included.

Litigation

+Litigation information provided.

Financial

+Financial statement provided and appears viable.

Insurance

+Certification of insurance provided.

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations

BIDDER: Segal

DATE: February 14, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION III Proposed Services

	Points Available	<u>Points</u> <u>Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	40	24

Evaluation Team Comments:

- -Didn't provide timelines and who will be doing what but mentions developing timeline with management.
- +Provided several bullets about what they think they will recommend.
- +Acknowledged that there was room for improvement in the last study.
- -Unclear what methods and resources will be used for their recommendation.
- +Talked about working with Workday.
- -Does not explain how they will work with the Hay methodology.
- -Did not reference IT policy compliance.

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations

BIDDER: Segal

DATE: February 14, 2025

EVALUATION OF SECTION IV Cost Proposal

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	ه	Cost Proposal Being Scored	Х	Score Weight	=	Score
\$114,500.00	3	\$695,000	x	25 points	=	4.12

Evaluation Team Comments:

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: ATZ Solutions

DATE: 2/11/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Kelsie M. Lee

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - +has done government work
 - -the work examples are not similar to what we are looking for.
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - +No mention of subcontractors
 - 3. Organizational Chart
 - -org chart lacks detail of how many of each classification will be used.
 - 4. Etc.
- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - +The bidder seems to understand the expectation and the expectations are laid out succinctly.
 - -Not clear if the technology tools they plan to use will speak to our systems
 - 2. Implementation Work Plan
 - +Detailed schedule

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: ATZ Solutions **DATE:** February 13, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sharon Huntley

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Preliminary Information

1. Proposal Cover Page

2. Responsible Bidder Certification

Both Submitted

Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of the Organization

ATZ Solution LLC is a dynamic and innovative small business specializing in Data Analysis, Data Science, Machine Learning, and Artificial Intelligence.

Project 1.- dynamic website and database

Project 2 – backend web development and data engineering

Project 3 – data analysis

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: ATZ Solutions **DATE:** February 13, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sharon Huntley

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

Heavy technology experience using machine learning and AI – unsure how will translate to classification system. None of their three listed projects included any classification work.

2. Subcontractors

- Not listed.

3. Organizational Chart

Non-specific team and rolls listed

4. Litigation

Not answered.

5. Financial Viability

Not provided.

6. Certificate of Insurance

+ included

Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided – Scope of Services

Their scope of services/work included detailed information on proposed technology systems architecture, and technology details specifically mentioning machine learning. Mentions seamless integration with Workday HRMS and existing databases, not Hay system specifically – although later they say that recommendations would align with Hay system. Concern with MainelT compliance.

A. Current System Review:

They expressed understanding of this requirement but provided no other details

B. Classification Review:

- No real specifics for this section. In particular there was no mention of their understanding of challenges of the complexities of state govt. positions and different salary schedules and job responsibilities. Concern that too much simplification to make all fit into machine learning structure.

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: ATZ Solutions **DATE:** February 13, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sharon Huntley

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

C. IT Policies:

 Concern technology methodology including machine learning and AI will conflict with MaineIT and Workday PRISM and Hay

2. Implementation - Work Plan

+ Provided phases and timelines though broken to five broad (-) categories

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: ATZ Solutions **DATE:** February 11-12, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Scott Helmke

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Overview of the Organization

- Present, does have the qualifications to perform data analysis but doesn't have any specific experience with classification systems. Previous projects included construction of websites and databases, and the analysis of sales data. Again, no documented experience with classification systems

Subcontractors

- Their use is contemplated in the bid form but they are not listed

Organizational Chart

- Not in chart form, but team and roles are listed

Litigation

- Not listed but also not disclaimed

Financial Viability

- Not present

Certificate of Insurance

+ Present

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: ATZ Solutions **DATE:** February 11-12, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Scott Helmke

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

A. Current System Review:

- Light on detail. Much of the proposal is just the four above bullets parroted back. For example, it mentions reviewing the Segal report but doesn't provide any information about what it plans to do with that review. Compare its recommendations to those this bidder comes up with? Identify deficiencies in process or methodology and use those to better this review?
- No mention of comparable employers

B. Classification Review:

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: ATZ Solutions **DATE:** February 11-12, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Scott Helmke

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

- Does not address B(1)(ii)
- B(2), no discussion of the bidder's knowledge of current market demands or best practices.
- B(3), no discussion of evaluation of current methodology
- B(4), no mention of review of Admin unit study
- B(5), no mention of review taking into account dissimilar salary schedules

Produce one or more reports addressing the above objectives (A-B)

+ The report will include the report itself, as well as visualizations, training materials, and a roadmap with timelines and costs.

IT Policies

- The bidder asserts it will follow Maine IT policies, but I am concerned that the heavy reliance on machine learning may cause delays while compliance with Maine IT's Generative AI policy is reviewed. The project team does appear to include analysts who will provide a level of human review as required by Maine IT, but compliance with other requirements of the policy is unclear. While the Maine IT GenAI policy was not specifically listed in the RFP, compliance with all Maine IT policies is required.

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: ATZ Solutions **DATE**: February 11, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sophia E. Spiller

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

- 1. Proposal Cover Page included
- 2. Responsible Bidder Certification
 - Included
 - (+) Confirmed no fraud, criminal offenses, no charges by a government entity, no terminated or defaulted government transactions, not on foreign adversary list, list of prohibited companies, and does not obtain or purchase any information on list of prohibited technologies according to Maine OIT.
- 3. Overview of Organization Qualifications and Experience Form
 - (-) Leverages AI technologies. This is not something the State of Maine currently supports.
 - (+) Specializes in data analysis.
 - (+) Has worked with previous government agencies.
- 4. Past Projects Qualifications and Experience Form
 - Project 1 Hexaware Technologies. Developed a website for a centralized database. (-) No mention of work with classification systems.
 - Project 2 Fox Pro Technologies. Built a data warehouse to support data processing and storage. The work enhanced data accessibility. (-) No mention of work with classification systems.
 - Project 3 Johnson & Johnson. Executed data analysis for sales report generation to enable better decision making and operational efficiency. (-) No mention of work with classification systems.

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: ATZ Solutions **DATE:** February 11, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sophia E. Spiller

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

- (+) All three projects did involve data analysis with a goal to streamline operations.
- 5. Certificate of Liability
 - (+) The vendor included their certificate of liability.
- II. Project Overview
 - 1. Key Objectives
 - (+) Clearly outlined and summarized the key objectives for this project.
 - 2. Scope of Work
 - Current System Review: (+) clearly summarized the requirement of analyzing the existing classification system, reviewing the Segal Consulting Report from 2020, and assessing the integration with the Workday HRMS.
 - Classification Review and Recommendations: (+) clearly summarized using data-driven techniques (which the vendor has experience in from projects listed above) to make recommendations on classifications, analyze career ladders, ensure the recommendations align with hay methodology, and review positions for inequities. (-) The vendor did not mention experience in reviewing classification systems in previous work.
 - Deliverables: (+) Will write a comprehensive report summarizing methodologies, findings and recommendations. Will crosswalk documents mapping current classifications to proposed classifications (+). Described implementation recommendations with timeline, costs, and impacts (+). Executive summaries for all reports exceeding 25 pages.
 - Stakeholder Engagement: (+) will collaborate with labormanagement committee through monthly meetings and work sessions. (+) Will conduct a minimum of 3 final presentations summarizing recommendations.
 - IT Compliance: (+) Will adhere to the State's IT policies and utilize state-provisioned devices and secure VPNs for project-related activities.
 - *(-) Did not explain in detail how the scope of work will accomplish individual tasks and how the outcome of services will be achieved.
 - 3. Proposed Technology for Project
 - Machine Learning Frameworks: (+) described two frameworks to develop classification models. Not familiar with either framework.

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: ATZ Solutions **DATE**: February 11, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sophia E. Spiller

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

Described one framework for data processing and analysis. Not familiar with this framework.

- Data management: MySQL for data storage and Azure or AWS for cloud infrastructure. (-) Did not discuss how these will relate to the project/what phase of the project.
- Integration: APIs for integration with workday and existing databases. (+) API's allow systems to communicate with each other
- Security: (+) Will implement encryption protocols to adhere to figurations.
- * (-) Did not explain in detail how these proposed technologies will accomplish tasks.
- * (+) Provided with a technology framework flowchart.
- 4. Proposed System Architecture
 - Data Flow: (+) provided where classification data will be inputted, how it will be processed, and where it will be outputted. (-) Did not provide enough detail on how these data flow processes will work in relation to desired outcomes.
 - Scalability: (+) provided what infrastructure will be used to support the analysis and large data sets. (-) Did not explain how the infrastructure will work in relation to desired outcomes.
 - Security: (+) will provide end-to-end encryption and compliance with State IT policies.
 - * (-) Provided a proposed system architecture flowchart, but did not explain in detail the processes the flow chart represents.
- 5. Implementation Work Plan. Development Phases & Timelines
 - Phases & Milestones: provided phases of completion in order with duration and key milestones for that period. (-) Did not provide in detail which program development and implementation tasks will be completed, which month they will be completed, and who will be responsible for them.
- 6. SDLC Life Cycle Model Explanation
 - Explained how the project will follow Agile SLDC (-) (did not provide acronym for what this stands for).
 - (-) Provided the framework for progress and stakeholder collaboration, but did not define who would be responsible for what, or when these framework phases would be taking place.
- 7. Project Team & Roles

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: ATZ Solutions **DATE**: February 11, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sophia E. Spiller

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

• (-) Described the different roles expected of this project, but did not identify who would be responsible for what role and when they would be responsible for their tasks.

8. Deliverables

• (-) Described the reports, dashboards that will be utilized for stakeholders, training materials, and implementation plan, but did not explain who is delivering these things and at what point in the project they would be delivered.

9. Quality Assurance & Testing

• (-) Described accuracy testing, accessibility, and security, bit did not explain who is responsible for quality assurance and testing and when it relates to the project timeline.

10. Training and Documentation

- (-) Described two training sessions on tool usage and compliance, but not who would provide the training, who would be given the training, and when the training would be given.
- (-) Described providing user guides for systems management, but not who would provide the user guides, when they would be provided, and what they would be used for in relation to the project.
- (-) Described providing technical documentation to include deployment workflows and troubleshooting guidelines, but did not explain what these would be needed for, if there's particular training for them and who would provide it, and when it would be provided.

11. Post-Launch Support & Maintenance

- (-) Described initial support is two months of issue resolution and adjustments, but did not explain what this includes specifically and who would be providing the support.
- (-) Described providing ongoing maintenance such as quarterly updates and model retraining, but did not explain who would be providing this and what the updates were to and what the model retraining entails.
- (-) Described a feedback loop for continuous improvement based on user input, but did not explain how this would function.

12. Terms and Assumptions

- (-) Gave the contract duration period, but again did not provide specifics as to the timeline chart, who is responsible for what, and which month tasks will be completed in.
- (-) Described an assumption of timely access to data and resources provided by the state, but did not provide detailed information on

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: ATZ Solutions **DATE:** February 11, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sophia E. Spiller

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

when in the project data will need to be accessed and the length of time it would take.

• (-) Described change management and that scopes would be changed via formal requests, but did not describe who can make these requests and how, and what the requests should look like.

13. Additional Comments

• (-) Vendor did not provide financial viability for the last 3 tax years.

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: ATZ Solutions

DATE: 2/11/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Lucas Sieb

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

- 1. Overview of Organization
 - Vendor has experience working with government
 - Government entities mentioned are single agencies rather than entire States
 - Mentions utilizing AI in its analysis; Wonder if this would conflict w/ OIT's AI policies? Would like to know how this is implementing in their review process?
 - Certificate of liability insurance
- 2. Projects
 - Focus of these projects was very IT heavy
 - Projects had emphasis on streamlining and efficiency
- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - + Proposed changes to consider internal consistency within classification system
 - + Emphasis on routing out redundancies within classifications
 - + Will review 2020 Segal data in conjunction with our subsequent classification system updates
 - - Emphasis on Workday integration
 - + Ensure that changes are consistent with Hay framework

RFP#: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: ATZ Solutions

DATE: 2/11/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Lucas Sieb

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

- + Review for classification system for inequities
- + Review and determine structure of career ladders
- + Review for modifications, deletions, and combinations of classes
- + Provide crosswalk documents and detailed reports outlining actions to be taken
- Possible solutions being focused on rely on technology upgrades/integration rather than actual changes to the classification system; Would need more clarification on how these technology systems pertain to systemic changes within the total classification system?
- 2. Implementation Work Plan
 - - 6 week period for interviewing stakeholders within the total 34 week timeline; Would be helpful to better understand which and how many stakeholders the vendor would plan to interview?
 - - Wondering how modifications/creations of new classes will be performed if the vendor will be comparing to Hay after completing the work (page 12)?
 - Deliverables are largely based on implementing new technology platforms
 - + Very involved in assisting with implementation of new systems
 - + Will work collaboratively with labor management committee to confirm if proposed changes address stakeholder interests
 - + Provides user guides and reference materials
 - - Need a lot more information about how these data systems referenced will be involved in generating the proposals for changes to the classification system?

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Deloitte Consulting LLP

DATE: February 11, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Kelsie M. Lee

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - +New England based
 - +states they have worked with the State of Maine
 - +Project work is government based and the work done for NM is similar.
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - +clarified that they will not use subcontractors.
 - •
 - •
 - 3. Organizational Chart
 - +Nicely done org chart
 - +The project team has decades of HR and comp and class experience.
 - 4. Etc.
- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - +They understand that stakeholder buy in is a challenge and plan to assist the state with it.
 - +They understand that we are committed to staying with Hay.
 - +Love the idea of classification structure design workshops.

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Deloitte Consulting LLP

DATE: February 11, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Kelsie M. Lee

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

- +A classification title glossary is something we have been discussing.
- +provided a clear description of how classification levels build and should be built upon.
- 2. Implementation Work Plan
 - +Looks fine

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Deloite Consulting LLP

DATE: February 13, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sharon Huntley

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Preliminary Information

1. Proposal Cover Page

2. Responsible Bidder Certification

Yes, both.

Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of the Organization

- + compensation and classification services for over 30 years
- + understands state government and complex systems associated with state govt.
- + talks of extensive Maine experience
- + all projects outlined had direct correlation to our classification needs

2. Subcontractors

No subcontractors used

3. Organizational Chart

+ organization chart includes descriptions of talent and their background specific to human resources, talent management, compensation and classification

4. Litigation

(-) no details of any specific litigation "occasionally, though rarely involved"

5. Financial Viability

+ Not provided specific balance sheet or profit/loss but does disclose 2023 revenues

6. Certificate of Insurance

States attached sample certificate provided. Yes?

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Deloite Consulting LLP

DATE: February 13, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sharon Huntley

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided – Scope of Services

- + did homework specific to State of Maine progress to date
- + have comprehensive Labor Market Intelligence system which looks at competitiveness, recruitment and retention, emerging skills and diversity
 - + extensive analysis of Maine job description analysis

A. Current System Review:

- + to conduct comprehensive review and evaluation
- + analyse job function families, and career tracks, classification "leveling" and classification title naming conventions

B. Classification Review:

- + conduct classification structure design workshops
- + strength and gap analysis
- + comprehensive framework focused on understanding an organization's current state and strategic vision for its talent programs
- + will develop one Leveling Guide for each career track
- + clarified able to work within Hay and Workday. "We understand that the State uses the Hay Job Evaluation method to assess individual positions relative to one another throughout the State and Deloitte confirms any recommended updates to the classification system will not conflict with the existing Hay Job Evaluation method. Additionally, we confirm that any of our recommendations will align with the State's ongoing Workday implementation."
- + confirmed deliverables

Deloitte will prepare a final report summarizing our project analyses, methodologies, assumptions, results, and recommendations that includes: • Summary of all individual deliverables highlighted in previous sections, • Commentary on how classification updates address challenges specific to the State • Options for consideration that will enable the State to make future classification adjustments based on appropriate market conditions, • Rationale for each option and the possible downstream impacts of each option for consideration, and • A roadmap for implementing the updated classification system and governance guidelines.

C. IT Policies:

+ will comply with MaineIT policies

2. Implementation - Work Plan

+ Provided detailed implementation plan

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Deloite Consulting LLP

DATE: 2/11/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Scott Helmke

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Overview of the Organization

- + Has internal classification, compensation, and practices data
- + Experience working with the classification systems of public sector entities, including working with career ladders and tiers of classifications
- + Experience conducting a recent statewide classification survey involving over 1,200 classifications

Subcontractors

Confirms subcontractors will not be used

Organizational Chart

- Present, but has brief resumes as opposed to job descriptions

Litigation

- Does not disclose but does address it

Financial Viability

- Not provided as required but is addressed

Certificate of Insurance

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Deloite Consulting LLP

DATE: 2/11/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Scott Helmke

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

- Asserts it has insurance, bid states there is an attached sample certificate but there is not

100

A. Current System Review:

- + Will assess all classifications and classification system. Will consider how we currently use job families, functions, levels, and naming conventions
- + Will visualize current structure and career paths
- + Will evaluate recommendations based on prior experience and Maine labor marketspecific factors
- + Recommendations to systems and practices will combine bidder's knowledge with Maine's strategic vision
- + Specific portions of classification systems and processes that will be reviewed are listed, and recommendations will identify potential impacts
- + Will make system-level recommendations such as naming conventions
- + Will work with stakeholders to understand current system

B. Classification Review:

- + Comprehensive description of what recommendations will include: formal title glossary, identified career tracks, standards for career levels, and job functions themselves
- + Specifically mentions bidder will review and consider Segal report when determining strategy
- + Will review and consider Admin study
- + Detailed review of where promotions, demotions, and transfers take place will be considered when making recommendations to career paths and overall processes

Produce one or more reports addressing the above objectives (A-B)

+ Report will include rationale and roadmap

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Deloite Consulting LLP

DATE: 2/11/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Scott Helmke

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

+ Draft report will be reviewed with stakeholders

+ Will include guide to applying recommendations (e.g. job title standards and classification leveling) going forward

IT Policies

+ Acknowledges and can comply with IT policies

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Deloite Consulting LLP

DATE: February 11, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sophia E. Spiller

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Proposal Cover Page

- Included. Proposal and pricing structure firm for a period of 180 days from date and time of bid opening.
- (-) Unclear is this means the State can negotiate this within this timeframe.
- II. Responsible Bidder Certification
 - Included.
 - (+) Confirmed no fraud, criminal offenses, no charges by a government entity, no terminated or defaulted government transactions, not on foreign adversary list, list of prohibited companies, and does not obtain or purchase any information on list of prohibited technologies according to Maine OIT.
- III. Overview of Organization
 - (+) Has been providing compensation and classification consulting services for over 30 years.
 - (+) This vendor has worked with the State of Maine previously.
 - (+) Experience serving public sector organizations and state personnel departments.
 - 2. Description of 3 Past Projects
 - Project One: Commonwealth of Virginia DMV Job Architecture and Salary Analysis.
 - 1. (+) Conducted comprehensive analysis of job roles, and the analysis identified key areas of improvement.

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Deloite Consulting LLP

DATE: February 11, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sophia E. Spiller

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

- 2. (+) Introduced skills-based pay practices that rewarded employees for their expertise and contributions.
- Project Two: State of New Mexico
 - 1. (+) Conducted a comprehensive review of the State's HR and employee classification operations, policies, processes, and structures over an 8-month period.
 - 2. (+) Conducted in-depth review of job families, occupational groups, and classification administration policies.
 - 3. (+) Recommendations included identifying where the state could consolidate duplicative classifications and build others out
 - 4. (-) Recommended the state develop a new compensation philosophy. Unclear if they have worked with the hay methodology.
- Project Three: Cook County, IL Compensation Benchmarking and Salary Structure Analysis
 - 1. (+) Streamlined job description creation.
 - 2. (-) Developed pay grade recommendations, unclear what methodology was utilized to come to this conclusion.
- IV. Subcontractors
 - Vendor will not be utilizing subcontractors for this project.
- V. Organizational Chart
 - (+) Provided organizational chart with individuals name, title, contact information, and their background/experience.
- VI. Litigation
- (-) Occasionally involved in litigation with clients pertaining to their consulting services. Unclear how often and to what extent.
- (-) Did not clarify if there is current litigation in which they are named and did not provide a list of cases closed within the past 5 years. Unclear if that is applicable as it was not disclosed if there is current or previous litigation.
- VII. Financial Viability
 - (+) Provided the fiscal year 2023 revenues for member firms and their affiliates.
 - (-) Did not provide balance sheets and/or income statements.
 - (-) Did not provide the above information for the past 3 tax years.
- VIII. Certificate of Insurance
 - (+) Maintains insurances required by federal, state, or local statutes including workers comp and employer's liability coverage.

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Deloite Consulting LLP

DATE: February 11, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sophia E. Spiller

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

• (-) Did not provide certificate of insurance on standard ACORD form. Stated there was an attached sample certificate, unclear where this is.

IX. Proposed Services

- 1. *(+) Provided an 'Our Understanding' section outlining research completed on the framework and history for the State of Maine.
- 2. *(+) Provided a summary of their approach, which included information on their database which can calibrate the job classification system to labor market job titles, descriptions, and qualifications.
- 3. Services to be provided
 - Evaluate Classification System and Develop Recommendations:
 - 1. (+) Clearly explained how they will conduct their assessment, what it involves, who is involved, and will identify how each classification currently fits within the classification structure to visualize and identify desired career paths within the classification structure.
 - Identify Strengths and Weaknesses of the Current System
 - 1. (+) Identified previous work from the state to help enhance the classification system.
 - 2. (+) Clearly explained how they plan to gather information to evaluate the pros and cons.
 - Evaluate Classification System and Develop Recommendations
 - 1. (+) Discussed understanding current state and strategic vision.
 - 2. (+) Clearly explained what is involved in the framework, what the framework focuses on, and how it will accomplish what the framework focuses on by explaining how it will conduct key activities.
 - 3. (+) Explained how the state's input will be involved in the process.
 - 4. (+) Explained how the recommendations will help the state and how it will connect to the HRIS.
 - Review of the Draft Classification Report Prepared by Segal
 - 1. (+) Confirmed they will review this report along with any other documentation.
- 4. Current System Review Deliverables
 - (+) Provided a table outlining the proposed deliverables for the current system review phase, what the deliverable is and how it will be done and expected delivery date by month.
 - (-) Unclear in this table who will be involved in what phase.

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Deloite Consulting LLP

DATE: February 11, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sophia E. Spiller

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

5. Classification Review

- (+) Discussed what they will complete to standardize and enhance the state's classification system and how they will complete it.
- (+) Provided what their recommendations will include to improve efficiency.
- (-) Explained that classifications will be reviewed, and recommendations will be provided, but did not explain how the classifications will be reviewed.
- (+) Clearly described the plan for cross walking current classifications to revised classifications.
- (-) Provided information on how to develop governance guidelines for ongoing position evaluations, but there is no mention of maintaining the current hay methodology the state uses.
- (+) Confirmed review of the prior classification study and consider the prior study's findings.
- (-) Confirmed completion of data and policy analysis to understand where demotions, promotions, and transfers exist most frequently between the State's Administrative Services Salary Schedules and other MSEA Salary Schedules, but did not explain the execution and who would be involved in this.
- 6. Classification Review Deliverables
 - (+) Provided a table outlining the proposed deliverables for the classification review phase, what the deliverables are, how it will be done, and expected delivery date by month.
 - (-) Unclear in this table who will be involved in what phase.
- X. Implementation Work Plan
 - 1. (+) Provided a table outlining the program development and implementation task along with the time (in months) the task is expected to take place.
 - 2. (-) Did not explain the person and position responsible for each task.
- XI. Deliverables/Expectations
 - (+) Explained what documents will be reviewed and what reports will be written summarizing the analyses, methodologies, assumptions, results, and recommendations.
- XII. IT Policies
- (+) Acknowledged ability to comply with the State's IT policies
- XIII. General Contract Exceptions

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Deloite Consulting LLP

DATE: February 11, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sophia E. Spiller

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

• (-) Indicated the proposed terms should be modified or clarified for this engagement, unclear what that entails and how long that process will take.

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Deloitte Consulting LLP

DATE: 2/11/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Lucas Sieb

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - + Has specific experience in compensation/classification consultation
 - + Provide access to global job architecture survey and compensation policies and practices survey
 - + Has worked with SOM previously, specifically DHHS
 - + Utilizes Labor Market Intelligence (ULI) Database sourced from 30 billion records and 30,000 sources
 - ULI Data covers:
 - 1. Labor supply and demand
 - 2. Talent scalability/availability
 - 3. Job titles and requirements/skills data
 - 4. Organizational profiles
 - 5. Attrition and promotion rates
 - 6. Unemployment
 - 7. Business environments
 - + Pulls data from State level throughout industries to assist in developing job titles
 - 2. Projects
 - + Experience working with state level government on classification study
 - + State level experience is includes entire state government and single agency projects

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Deloitte Consulting LLP

DATE: 2/11/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Lucas Sieb

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

- + Mentions utilization of skills/competency based hiring and pay practices
- + Emphasis on modernization of classification practices
- + NM project is on the same scale as ME's; reviewing ~1200 classifications and 11,451 positions
- + Vendor has reviewed salary structures and transitioned other public entities to pay bands
- + Developed comprehensive framework for county classification structure including 13 job functions, 63 families, 4 job family profiles
- + Upgraded salary grades
- Listed projects do not involve rural governments that are necessarily directly comparable to Maine; this may call into question the vendor's experience w/ very specific classifications here
- + Will not be utilizing subcontractors

II. Proposed Services

- 1. Services to be Provided
 - +/- Collects data for job classification documentation from up to 15 stakeholders via interview; Who are typical stakeholders for this?
 - + Analysis of SOM's current use of job functions, job families, career tracks, levels, and classification naming conventions
 - + Frames classification modifications around State's strategic vision; How has this been done in past State level projects?
 - + Reviews organizational needs, system requirements, talent management needs, financial controls, and employee abilities/strengths
 - + Refining and establishing classification framework:
 - "Job functions and job families to establish consistency in how similar classifications are grouped for employee career pathing opportunities"
 - "Classification Leveling Guides that set consistent parameters around expectations for positional requirements in experience, supervisory requirements, complexity in job roles, impact of decisions, and educational requirements, and also make employee career paths more transparent due to increased employees' understanding of expectations at each level"

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Deloitte Consulting LLP

DATE: 2/11/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Lucas Sieb

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

- 3. "Classification Title Glossary that defines naming conventions and key words used in titles to align positions' expected roles and responsibilities to the wording reflected in their titles"
- + Group Jobs by:
 - 1. <u>Job function:</u> the highest organizing principle, reflecting a substantial, discrete business area
 - 2. <u>Job family:</u> a group of jobs within a discipline that require similar skills sets and competencies
- + Develop distinct career paths/tracks w/ clear progression
- + Create leveling guides and determine appropriate levels between career tracks
- + Create classification title glossary; denote specific types of work performed
- + Ensure changes reconcile with existing Hay methodology
- + Develop classification catalog and propose title changes according to market practices
- + Crosswalk classifications from old to new in collaboration w/ State leadership
 - 1. Map changes of employees and titles
 - 2. Vendor will identify people related risks due to crosswalking classifications
 - 3. Perform up to 20 validations to ensure proper fit of classification crosswalks
 - 4. Review and refine changes to classifications
- + Assist with development of governance documents and practices to sustain the classification system
- + Take into account findings from last Segal study
- + Review classifications for inequity and advise if any policies may be contributing to this
- 2. Implementation Work Plan
 - + Timeline for the entire review is organized and appears feasible;
 April 2025 to June 2026
 - Phase A to review current classification system and evaluate existing structural components; identify shortcomings and opportunities to enhance existing classifications; and review 2020 Segal report; April 2025 through July 2025
 - 2. Phase B to develop new structures, classifications, and control documents and review policies; July 2025 through June 2026

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Deloitte Consulting LLP

DATE: 2/11/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Lucas Sieb

- + Ending deliverables to include:
 - 1. Commentary on how classification updates address challenges specific to the State
 - 2. Options for consideration that will enable the State to make future classification adjustments based on appropriate market conditions
 - 3. Rationale for each option and the possible downstream impacts of each option for consideration
 - 4. A roadmap for implementing the updated classification system and governance guidelines

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Gallagher Benefit Services Inc.

DATE: February 11, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Kelsie M. Lee

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- 1. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - +25 years of experience with public sector and higher education consulting.
 - The description of the previous projects was requested to be brief, but I don't they even provided a description.
 - -Why are they still engaged in a 2017 project with Utah?
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - -No plans to use.
 - 3. Organizational Chart
 - -Lots of experience with Employee and Labor Relations and Recruitment but not so much on the classification side.
 - 4. Etc.
- **Proposed Services** 11.
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - +plans to use current job classification
 - +plans to use current job methodology but didn't mention hay.
 - -Deliverables are not clear.
 - +Training will be provided

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Gallagher Benefit Services Inc.

DATE: February 11, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Kelsie M. Lee

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

• -Necessary tools to maintain "the system". We are not looking for a new "system"

•

- 2. Implementation Work Plan
 - -no set timelines provided

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Gallagher Benefit Services Inc.

DATE: February 13, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sharon Huntley

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Preliminary Information

- 1. Proposal Cover Page
- 2. Responsible Bidder Certification
 - + yes to both

Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of the Organization

Project 1 state of RI classification and compensation study Project 2 – review of compensation and benefits levels- Utah Project 3 – state compensation program – South Dakota

- +/- one of the three projects includes classification, the other two are compensation based only
 - (-) describes themselves more as Human Resource compensation consultants
 - + works with/familiar with state government

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Gallagher Benefit Services Inc.

DATE: February 13, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sharon Huntley

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

2. Subcontractors

Will not use subcontractors

3. Organizational Chart

(-) provided limited org chart but only clear about one of the staff that will be working on the project. Brief resumes provided for other team members who *might* work on the project

4. Litigation

(-) may be involved in court actions at any given time

5. Financial Viability

+ provided annual revenue for 2024 and link to other more extensive financial reports

6. Certificate of Insurance

+ provided

Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided - Scope of Services

(-) they mention fair pay and pay equity in several places- which is not part of our scope.

A. Current System Review:

- (-) their methodology includes employee involvement, communication systems and cultural change
- (-) talk of concern with timeline upfront "Doing it right produces a better study outcome than trying to meet unrealistic deadlines"

B. Classification Review:

- (-) very brief three step process outlined: Job description review, internal equity and final report.
- (-) no mention of Hay or Workday integration

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Gallagher Benefit Services Inc.

DATE: February 13, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sharon Huntley

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

C. IT Policies:

(-) Compliance with MaineIT not mentioned

2. Implementation - Work Plan

(-) Workplan shows three phases but does not include any dates

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Gallagher Benefit Services Inc.

DATE: February 11, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Scott Helmke

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Overview of the Organization

- + Bidder's three examples of relevant projects include statewide classification reviews
- + Bidder has access to trade organizations for purposes of keeping abreast of trends and best practices

Subcontractors

Bidder will not use subcontractors

Organizational Chart

- Has organizational chart and resumes but not job description for position.

Litigation

- Does not disclose litigation

Financial Viability

+ Financially viable

Certificate of Insurance

+ Present

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Gallagher Benefit Services Inc.

DATE: February 11, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Scott Helmke

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

A. Current System Review:

- Scope of job description review seems focused on ensuring employees are properly classified. Recommendations for job description content is stated to be limited to ensuring compliance with applicable laws and regulations
- Scope seems focused on ensuring accuracy of Hay scoring
- Little mention of review of current system structure
- Does not discuss review of Segal report

B. Classification Review:

- Does not discuss how analysis will be performed
- Little information about what factors will be considered outside of FLSA factors
 - -Excessive focus on individual position duties as opposed to review of classifications and classification system
- Does not specifically address career ladders
- + Does address titling conventions
- Does not address Admin unit study or transfers between dissimilar salary schedules
- Does address review of current practices but no specifics are given
- + Will provide information on maintaining recommended changes to the classification system

Produce one or more reports addressing the above objectives (A-B)

Will produce a report but contents are not specified

IT Policies

- Does not address compliance with Maine IT policies

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Gallagher Benefit Services Inc.

DATE: February 11, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sophia E. Spiller

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Proposal Cover Page

- Included
- II. Responsible Bidder Certification
 - Included
 - (+) Confirmed no fraud, criminal offenses, no charges by a government entity, no terminated or defaulted government transactions, not on foreign adversary list, list of prohibited companies, and does not obtain or purchase any information on list of prohibited technologies according to Maine OIT.
- III. Overview of Organization
 - 1. Qualifications and Experience
 - (+) Experience in job classification studies listed, but not in much detail.
 - (+) Consultants have various certifications from well-known sources.
 - (-) Spoke more to their work with compensation and consulting than classification studies and reviews.
 - Previous Proiects:
 - 1. Project One: State of Rhode Island
 - a. (+) Conducted a classification and compensation study of 9,000 employees.
 - b. (-) Unclear what their qualifications and skills were in this project.
 - 2. Project Two: State of Utah

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Gallagher Benefit Services Inc.

DATE: February 11, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sophia E. Spiller

- a. (-) Completed a compensation review, no information on a classification review, and unclear what their qualifications and skills were in this project.
- 3. Project Three: State of South Dakota
 - a. (-) Completed total compensation review of the state's compensation program, but not a classification review, and unclear what their qualifications and skills were in this project.
- IV. Subcontractors
 - Will not utilize subcontractors.
- V. Organizational Chart
 - (+) Provided organizational chart that included the State of Maine, outlined certifications of members on the team.
 - (+) Provided names, titles, and summary of experience for those in the organization.
- VI. Litigation
- (-) Unclear if currently involved in litigation. Provided website for material items noted in reports to the SEC.
- VII. Financial Viability
 - (-) Provided website to view past financial reports, but website was unavailable.
- VIII. Certificate of Insurance
 - (+) Provided certificate of insurance.
- IX. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - (+) Provided details of their CARE method and outlined the project approach process start to finish.
 - (+) Outlined the key considerations of the services.
 - (+) Discussed their three categories for their approach to the project. This outlined what they will be doing, what they state may have to provide, how the final format can be used in the HRIS system and provide training on proper procedures and methods to maintain what they recommend.
 - (+) Discussed maintaining the state's current job evaluation methodology.
 - (-) Unclear how each task will be accomplished.
- X. Implementation Work Plan
 - (+) Outlined the different project phases, what will be accomplished in those phases, and the months they will be accomplished in.

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Gallagher Benefit Services Inc.

DATE: February 11, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sophia E. Spiller

- (-) Some tasks explained who was responsible for what, but others are unclear as to who or what position will be responsible for what task.
- (+) The work plan described ongoing status meetings between the State team members and the vendor to explain the process, review progress and materials, address questions, and discuss the next steps.

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Gallagher Benefit Services Inc.

DATE: 2/11/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Lucas Sieb

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - + Experience working w/ public sector entities
 - Designing and implementing market-aligned pay structures
 - + Covered by liability insurance
 - + Staff for project mostly have 10+ years experience working in HR type fields related to compensation and classification
 - + Liability insurance
 - 2. Projects
 - + Experience working w/ New England State government on classification and compensation review
 - + RI study included 9000 positions which would be somewhat comparable to SOM's pending review involving over 11,000
 - + Emphasis on creating flexibility within the compensation system at Rhode Island
 - + Worked w/ State of South Dakota on compensation review so would have some experience working with classifications that may be unique to a rural state w/ some similarities to Maine
- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - +/- Review existing classification descriptions and revise classification structure; Will there be any consolidation of classifications considered?

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Gallagher Benefit Services Inc.

DATE: 2/11/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Lucas Sieb

- +/- Review existing classification descriptions w/ employees, management, and HR; How many individuals will be interviewed and what will the structure of the interviews look like?
- +/- Advise on content of existing job descriptions; What methodology and sources will be used for this?
- How will internal equity of classifications be confirmed? Will the vendor utilize their own evaluation method and will this fit with the existing Hay system utilized at the State?
- +/- Final report will outline process, methods, techniques, and findings of the study; What does this process look like?
- Provide findings in a format that can be used to update the State's HRIS system; Need additional clarification on what would be updated?
- + Provide support to train SOM staff on managing and maintaining the classification system
- 2. Implementation Work Plan
 - - Phase 1, Study Administration:
 - 1. Meet via phone/electronically to discuss project timeline
 - 2. Collect organization/classification information
 - 3. Review State's strengths, weaknesses
 - 4. Philosophy, and current supporting strategies
 - 5. Project timetable confirmed
 - 6. Employee orientation sessions conducted
 - 7. Virtual meetings as needed; in person meetings at additional charge
 - +/- Phase 2, Classification Study: Need more detail on how these determinations are made, what resources are applied to the review? How are new titles developed
 - 1. Conduct of meetings with HR/leadership/project team at critical intervals to discuss deliverables.
 - 2. Review of and analysis of job descriptions/documentation for all employees covered by the study.
 - 3. Conduct interviews with managers/supervisors (and with individual employees, as necessary) to verify/clarify job information.
 - 4. Analysis of existing classifications and recommendations on any changes to current classification plan.
 - 5. Review exempt and non-exempt classifications to ensure proper Fair Labor Standards Act (FLSA) status.

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Gallagher Benefit Services Inc.

DATE: 2/11/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Lucas Sieb

- 6. Recommendation of standard classification and titling conventions.
- 7. If applicable, allocate employees to an appropriate job class in the new classification structure.
- 8. Conduct a complete diagnostic review of the State's current practices to identify areas of concern.
- + Phase 3, Project Finalization, Draft, & Final Report: What tools does the vendor train staff on?
 - Consultant shall make presentations to the HR/leadership prior to completion and at the time of completion, at times and in a manner agreed upon with the State.
 - 2. Conduct of meetings with HR/leadership/project team at critical intervals to discuss deliverables.
 - 3. Draft and final report and presentations developed, and quality assurance reviews conducted.
 - 4. Training provided for staff including necessary tools to maintain the system.
- - Implementation procedures are vague overall

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Mercer US LLC

DATE: February 12, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Kelsie M. Lee

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

- 1. Overview of Organization
 - +Examples are all government related.
 - +Project advisor has been involved in major change initiatives and catalog architecture designs.
 - +Jack worked for Segal prior to 2021-he might understand the Segal recommendations more thoroughly.

•

- 2. Subcontractors
 - +None planned
- 3. Organizational Chart
 - +Looks impressive
- 4. Etc.
- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - +Mercer has a job library and partners with skill databases.
 - -The work plan seems very well thought out.
 - +Implementation plan is impressive.
 - +Thorough and interesting.
 - 2. Implementation Work Plan
 - +Well thought out, clear and easy to follow

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Mercer US LLC

DATE: February 13, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sharon Huntley

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Preliminary Information

1. Proposal Cover Page

2. Responsible Bidder Certification

+ yes both.

Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of the Organization

Project 1 – state of Colorado job classification system, compensation & benefits compared to the external market, calculated value of total remuneration Project 2 – state of South Carolina job classification system, compensation & benefits Project 3 – Nashville and Davidson county - job classification system, compensation &

benefits

+ Experience with states consulting with focus on job classification and compensation management.

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Mercer US LLC

DATE: February 13, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sharon Huntley

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

2. Subcontractors

Will not use subcontractors

3. Organizational Chart

+ Extensive information on team members

4. Litigation

(-) Does not address

5. Financial Viability

+ Provided appropriate information

6. Certificate of Insurance

+ provided

Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided - Scope of Services

A. Current System Review:

+/- Has proprietary job library and skills library – unsure if dovetails with Hay System

If can translate, could be valuable

The MJL is the most comprehensive job catalog in the US. It includes detailed descriptions of each Job Family, Sub-Family, Specialization, and Career Level.

We partner with industry-leading skill databases that constantly scan millions of online job profiles and descriptions to obtain key skills information.

B. Classification Review:

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Mercer US LLC

DATE: February 13, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sharon Huntley

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

- (-) unclear if their system be able to translate to those within our systems Hay and Workday
- (-) they outline five step process but provide few details including what they foresee for "ongoing administration maintenance and governance," and "communications and change management" things not spelled out in our project requirements

C. IT Policies:

(-) Does not provide any mention of compliance with MainelT

2. Implementation - Work Plan

+ Extensive and detailed Implementation and work plan provided

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Mercer US LLC

DATE: 2/12/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Scott Helmke

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Overview of the Organization

- + Has a focus on Job Classification
- + Has performed statewide classification system evaluations

Subcontractors

Will not use subcontractors

Organizational Chart

+ Org chart includes descriptions and resumes

Litigation

+ Listed as N/A

Financial Viability

+ Provided, appears viable

Certificate of Insurance

+ Provided

A. Current System Review:

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Mercer US LLC

DATE: 2/12/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Scott Helmke

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

- + Appears to have a well-ordered format for classification systems.
- Unclear if bidder will recommend a complete overhaul to fit with their format, or whether bidder can provide more tailored recommendations.
- States that these four things will be done but provides no detail as to scope. For example, bidder will review the Sega report but does not specify how they may use the information gained in the review.
- + Does appear to have access to large classification database so bidder is likely able to suggest best practices.

B. Classification Review:

- Bidder pasted the above language into their proposal with no additional explanation or detail.

Produce one or more reports addressing the above objectives (A-B)

- Bidder will produce a report but no information regarding methodologies is provided.

IT Policies

- Bidder does mention that data will be uploaded to Mercer's secure SharePoint site but no other mention of IT compliance.

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Mercer US LLC

DATE: February 12, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sophia E. Spiller

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Proposal Cover Page

Included

- II. Responsible Bidder Certification
 - Included
 - (+) Confirmed no fraud, criminal offenses, no charges by a government entity, no terminated or defaulted government transactions, not on foreign adversary list, list of prohibited companies, and does not obtain or purchase any information on list of prohibited technologies according to Maine OIT.
- III. Organizational Qualifications and Experience
 - (+) Lead HR consultant with a focus on job classification and compensation management.
 - (+) Experience working with cities, counties, and other states.
 - (+) The State of Maine has previously worked with this vendor.
 - Past Three Projects:
 - 1. Project One: State of Colorado
 - a. (+) Did a review of their classification system and provided recommendations.
 - b. (-) Did not highlight their skills and qualifications for completing this project. Discussed design and management, but not how this was done.
 - 2. Project Two: State of South Carolina
 - a. (+) Did a review of their classification system and provided recommendations.

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Mercer US LLC

DATE: February 12, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sophia E. Spiller

- a. (-) Did not highlight their skills and qualifications that contributed to the project. Discussed design and management, but not how this was done.
- 2. Project three: Metropolitan Government of Nashville and Davidson County
 - a. (+) Did a review of their classification system and provided recommendations.
 - b. (-) Did not highlight their skills and qualifications that contributed to the project. Discussed design and management, change of communication and recommendations, but not how this was done.
- IV. Subcontractors
 - Will not use subcontractors.
- V. Organizational Chart
 - Provided organizational chart.
 - (+) Provided names and titles of individuals and their responsibilities.
 - (+) Each team member has experience with state governments.
- VI. Litigation
- Put down this section was non-applicable. It is unclear if this means they are not currently involved in litigation or have not been involved in litigation in the past 5 years.
- VII. Financial Viability
 - (+) Provided balance sheet of company financials from 2019 2023
- VIII. Certificate of Insurance
 - Provided certificate of insurance.
- IX. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - (+) Outlined five main areas of focus and confirmed meetings on the project with the state at least every other week. This included evaluating and measuring jobs, making recommendations on new classifications or consolidation of overlapping classifications, ongoing administration, maintenance, and governance, and communications and change management.
 - (+) Provided the resources that will be used for this process and described what the resources were. (Mercer's Job Library and Mercer's Skills Library).
 - (+) Provided an example of the resources to be used (visual) as well as an example of output from the databases utilized.
 - 2. Implementation Work Plan

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Mercer US LLC

DATE: February 12, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sophia E. Spiller

- (+) Provided a chart for the implementation of the work, the tsks associated with the time period, and the estimated month of work/completion for the task.
- (+) Provided which tasks they will complete, which tasks the state will complete, and which tasks both the state and vendor will be involved in.
- (+) Work plan was clearly broken out into phases.
- (+) Confirmed they will review required documents as part of the project, such as Segal's 2020 report.

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Mercer US LLC

DATE: 2/12/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Lucas Sieb

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

- 1. Overview of Organization
 - + Experience consulting for state, city, and county governments
 - + Staff member has previously directly worked on SOM classifications for a previous employer
 - + Will not utilize subcontractors
 - + Liability insurance
 - + Staff includes experience in job architecture and titling, pay compression, career frameworks, and integrating skills and competencies
 - + Several members of staff have 10-20 years of experience in compensation and classification work
- 2. Projects
 - + State level projects involved entire State's classifications
 - + CO and SC project involved review of classifications against external markets
 - - Projects focused more on compensation vs classification
 - +/- Curious what the design and management of pay structures refers to? Did this involve grouping classifications into pay schedules?
- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - + Clear project phases

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Mercer US LLC

DATE: 2/12/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Lucas Sieb

- + Meets w/ SOM's project team at least every other week
- + Mercer Job Library: comprehensive job catalog
 - 1. Descriptions of:
 - a. Job families
 - b. Sub-Families
 - c. Specialization
 - d. Career Level
- + Mercer Skills Library
 - 1. Sourced from millions of online job profiles/descriptions
 - 2. Specialized staff align skills w/ job library architecture
 - 3. Updated regularly
- + Provides detailed output with four components that can be used to develop classifications:
 - 1. Tasks
 - 2. Experience/responsibility level
 - 3. Possible titles
 - 4. Skills
- 2. Implementation Work Plan
 - Phase, Current System Review
 - 1. + Collects SOM class data and uploads to SharePoint
 - 2. + Review data and identify strengths and weaknesses
 - 3. + Make recommendations for changes based on best practices of comparable employers
 - 4. +/1 Review 2020 Segal Report and subsequent information
 - + Develop report and summarize findings w/ recommendations
 - 6. + Review w/ SOM for feedback
 - 7. +/- March 2025 through April 2025; wondering if this timeline is realistic for review of all 1100+ of our classifications?
 - Phase, Classification Review
 - 1. +/- Recommend new/revised classifications
 - 2. + Examine career ladders
 - 3. Evaluate and recommend efficiencies for evaluating/processing FJA reviews
 - + Review positions performing similar work and reduce/simplify classification number/structure where possible
 - Use complexity, responsibility, knowledge, and skills as metrics
 - 5. + Create crosswalk from current to revised classifications

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Mercer US LLC

DATE: 2/12/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Lucas Sieb

- 6. Recommend changes to SOM's process for evaluating positions to improve operations on an ongoing basis
- 7. + Review results of 2020 Segal Study relating to bargaining unit changes.
- 8. + Review classification system for inequities related to promotions, demotions, and transfers between MSEA/Admin salary schedules.
- 9. + Provide detailed report identifying deficiencies and make recommendations accordingly.
- 10. + Review w/ SOM project team and revise as needed.
- 11. + April 2025 through June 2025
- Phase, Communications & Change Management and Governance
 - 1. + Develop Change Strategy & Plan; Would like to know more about what this includes?
 - 2. + Develop guide on Governance & Maintenance of job classification system
 - a. Emphasis on external market alignment and internal equity
 - 3. + Provides workshops for both Change Strategy & Plan and Governance & Maintenance

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Segal **DATE:** April 12, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Kelsie M. Lee

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - -Different fonts seem unprofessional and messy.
 - +Extensive record of government work
 - +Proposed project manager is based in Maine
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - +No subcontractors
 - 3. Organizational Chart
 - -No description of the teams skills and abilities.
- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - +Certainly captures the requests of the RFP
 - -A bit repetitive
 - -The use of employee surveys is an incredible amount of work for BHR and has produces inaccurate results without the ability to audit. Also takes time away from employees and supervisors and was not well understood last time.
 - 2. Implementation Work Plan
 - +Well done

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Segal **DATE:** February 13, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sharon Huntley

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Preliminary Information

1. Proposal Cover Page

2. Responsible Bidder Certification

+ both provided

Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of the Organization

Project 1 – statewide salary survey

Project 2 – Conducted a comprehensive classification compensation study, agency-wide;

Project 3 - conducted a comprehensive statewide total compensation study for approximately 15,000 employees, analyzing 404 benchmark jobs. – state of Alaska

- + experience specifically with Maine State Govt. classifications
- + job classification analysis specifically one of their offerings
- +/- job evaluation system design and implementation Segal has a proprietary method (Segal Evaluator) using 8 specific factors unsure if integrates with Hay system and Workday. Valuable if yes, not useful if not.
- + two of the three projects are specifically compensation driven, the third includes both classification and compensation

2. Subcontractors

No subcontractors will be used

3. Organizational Chart

+ Clear organization chart with roles and responsibilities identified. Good background on each team member

4. Litigation

+ No current or closed litigation in last five years

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Segal **DATE:** February 13, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sharon Huntley

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

5. Financial Viability

+ Provided as password protected documents

6. Certificate of Insurance

+ provided

Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided - Scope of Services

A. Current System Review:

+ Reiterated all steps above – agree to deliver

B. Classification Review:

- + Reiterated all steps above agree to deliver
- + Agreed on all Deliverables and Expectations
- + spelled out three-step process with details: project initiation, classification analysis and presenting final results.
- + aware of sensitivity for interaction with labor management and BHR input
- + will discuss prior study to determined what worked well and improve what did not (acknowledgement for improvement)
- + desired future state and gap analysis
- +/- built a model to facilitate job classifications (is this the Segal Evaluator?) Talks about working with Workday implementation but not the Hay system.

"Segal has recent, applicable experience providing services similar to what the State has requested above, and we've built a model to facilitate the comparison and consolidation of job classifications."

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Segal **DATE:** February 13, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sharon Huntley

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

+/- Provided several bullets of what they anticipate they will recommend. Are they coming in with preconceived notion because of past process? Is that positive or negative?

C. IT Policies:

(-) No mention of MainelT compliance

2. Implementation - Work Plan

+ No specific timeline developed but mentioned developing of detailed timeline in the project initiation phase.

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Segal DATE: 2/12/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Scott Helmke

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Overview of the Organization

- + Experience with classification analysis
- + Experience with statewide classification reviews

Subcontractors

Will not use subcontractors

Organizational Chart

+ Provided Org chart with descriptions of roles and resumes

Litigation

+ None

Financial Viability

+ Provided

Certificate of Insurance

+ Provided

A. Current System Review:

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Segal DATE: 2/12/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Scott Helmke

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

- + Will perform 1-4
- + Will work with BHR/LMC to determine goals of review

B. Classification Review:

- + Will perform 1-5
- + Described what factors of classifications will be analyzed
- + Described the sorts of recommendations that will be made
- + Will work to tailor results to existing system, such as continuing to use current conventions for classification titles
- + Will tailor analysis and recommendations to stated needs, including priority
- + Can adjust recommendations based on BHR's desired scope

Produce one or more reports addressing the above objectives (A-B)

- + Will include goals, methodology, current and future themes, key findings, and overall recommendations
- + Will include implications of recommendations

IT Policies

- Does not reference IT policy compliance

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Segal **DATE:** February 12, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sophia E. Spiller

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Proposal Cover Page

Included

- II. Responsible Bidder Certification
 - Included
 - (+) Confirmed no fraud, criminal offenses, no charges by a government entity, no terminated or defaulted government transactions, not on foreign adversary list, list of prohibited companies, and does not obtain or purchase any information on list of prohibited technologies according to Maine OIT.
- III. Organizational Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of the Organization
 - The State has worked with this vendor before.
 - (+) Experience in job classification analyses, job evaluation system design and implementation, and experience in labor management facilitation.
 - (+) Job Classification Analysis description included evaluating and streamlining the classification structure.
 - (-) Job Evaluation and Design Implementation description does not relate to the state's current hay methodology.
 - 2. Three Previous Projects
 - Project One: State of Washington
 - 1. (-) Conducted a salary market assessment with benchmark job titles. This project did not detail any work with classification analyses.

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Segal **DATE:** February 12, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sophia E. Spiller

- Project Two: Committee for Public Counsel Services
 - 1. (+) Conducted an agency wide classification study.

 Conducted both management and employee presentations to explain objectives and answer questions.
 - 2. (+) Developed customized job description questionnaire to distribute to employees to collect data & follow-up interviews to confirm validity of data collected.
 - 3. (-) No mention of how management was involved in the collection and evaluation process.
- Project Three: State of Alaska'
 - 1. (-) Conducted a compensation study, no mention of classification analyses.
 - 2. (+) The study was comprehensive and included 15,000 employees.
- IV. Subcontractors
 - Will not be working with a subcontractor.
- V. Organizational Chart
 - (+) Provided organizational chart that included names, their roles, and a description of their experience and responsibilities.
- VI. Litigation
- (+) No current or closed litigation in the past 5 years.
- VII. Financial Viability
 - Provided password protected documents for this information.
- VIII. Certificate of Insurance
 - Provided certificate of liability insurance.
- IX. Proposed Services
 - 1. (+) Provided information on their team working in public sector classification analyses and design.
 - 2. Services to be Provided
 - Current system review: (+) Described the steps to take to do a current system review. (-) Unclear what methods and resources will be used to accomplish these steps. (+) Confirmed review of previous report prepared in 2020.
 - Classification Review: (+) Described the steps to take as part of the classification review, which included reviewing results of prior classification study that resulted in changes to only MSEA's administrative bargaining units, and review of inequities related to promotions, demotions, or transfers between the administrative services salary schedule and other MSEA salary schedules. (-)

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Segal **DATE:** February 12, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sophia E. Spiller

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

Unclear what methods and resources will be used to accomplish these steps.

- Deliverables/Expectations: (+) Described the reports to be produced and what objectives they will address, confirmed recommendations would be accompanied by rationale, recommended timeframes for action, estimated cost/savings, and potential positive/negative consequences. (+) Confirmed ongoing work with the labor management committee. (-) Unclear what methods and resources will be used or needed for the deliverables and expectations.
- 3. Implementation Work Plan
 - Three steps
 - Step 1: Project Initiation
 - 1. Initial Strategy Session: (+) Discussed what the session will cover and who will be included. (-) Did not include month of completion or estimation for this phase.
 - 2. Conduct Stakeholder Interviews: (+) Discussed who will be involved in the interviews, the purpose of the interviews, and the goals. (-) Did not include month of completion of estimation for this phase.
 - Current State Assessment and Future Recommendations:

 (+) Discussed what the assessment will include. (-) Did not discuss who will be involved in what part of the assessment, and did not include month of completion or timeline estimation for these assessments.
 - Step 2: Classification Analysis
 - 1. Current System Review: (+) Discussed steps to take to complete the current system review. (-) Did not confirm who will be involved in the system review and who would be responsible for what step. (-) Did not include month of completion or estimated timeline.
 - 2. Classification Review: (+) Provided a detailed list of steps for the classification review and what is involved as part of that review. (+) briefly discussed some responsibilities the vendor will be responsible for. (-) Unclear what the state's involvement will be in this phase. (-) Did not include month of completion or timeline estimation for this phase.
 - Step 3: Present Final Results
 - 1. (+) Included who results will be presented to and what it will include. (-) Unclear what format this will be presented. (-) Did

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Segal **DATE:** February 12, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Sophia E. Spiller

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

not include month of completion or timeline estimation for

this phase.

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Segal DATE: 2/12/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Lucas Sieb

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Administrative and Financial Services

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - + Experience providing HR consulting for public sector
 - + Prior experience working with SOM on classification reviews
 - + Experience serving clients w/ collective bargaining
 - Segal Evaluator point-factor method
 - + Experience with cost modeling
 - + No subcontractors
 - + Staff has experience working with other Maine entities including public and private sector
 - + Liability Insurance
 - 2. Projects
 - + WA and AK compensation projects involved review of entire state governments
 - + WA project reviewed 1595 classifications and 48,357 employees
 - + WA project utilized data from 12 public sector peer employers to establish benchmark titles
 - Committee for Public Counsel Services (CPCS) project reviewed classifications for a single agency
 - + CPCS project provided presentations to employees and managers to explain objectives of the project
 - + CPCS project developed a customized survey and distributed to all employees to collect data

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Segal DATE: 2/12/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Lucas Sieb

- + CPCS project conducted interviews w/ employees obtain additional information
- CPCS project focus:
 - 1. + Identifying distinctions for job series
 - 2. + Updating position descriptions
 - 3. + Developing organized class structure
 - 4. + Ensuring internal equity
- + AK project involved review of statewide compensation structure
- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - Project Initiation
 - 1. + Initial series of strategy sessions and planning meetings w/ BHR and Labor Management Committee
 - a. Deliverable expectation document to detail:
 - i. Overall Strategy
 - ii. Data Sources
 - iii. Analysis Methodologies
 - iv. Content and Format of deliverables
 - 2. + Planning Meetings to tactically design project: How often would these occur?
 - a. Identify and analyze data needed to support the review
 - b. Clarify Segal's and the State's roles in each project phase
 - c. Establish a process for keeping BHR updated and informed for monthly stakeholder group meetings
 - d. Develop the timeline, including specific dates for interim and final work products
 - 3. + Conduct Stakeholder Interviews
 - a. Key Stakeholders:
 - i. Labor Management Committee
 - ii. MSEA Staff
 - iii. MSEA Executive Branch bargaining units
 - iv. Others as directed by BHR
 - b. Content:
 - i. Appropriateness of current class structure
 - ii. + How well defined are career ladders?
 - iii. + Opportunities to streamline or reduce number of unique classifications

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Segal DATE: 2/12/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Lucas Sieb

- 4. Current State Assessment and Future State Recommendations:
 - a. + High-level, strategic audit of the classification structure, system, processes, policies, etc.
 - b. +/- Consensus-building for the desired future state; Who would be involved in this consensus building?
 - c. + Assessment report
 - i. Interview themes
 - ii. Suggested principles and practices generally known to result in the most effective outcomes
 - d. + Gap analysis
 - e. + Review meetings with BHR and the Labor Management Committee
- Classification Analysis
 - 1. Current System Review
 - a. +/- Conduct a comprehensive review and evaluation of the current classification system; What does this review involve?
 - b. + Identify strengths and weaknesses of the current system; What metrics/resources are used to measure against our classifications to identify weaknesses?
 - c. This section rather vague and doesn't include detail on how the review will be executed or what sources will be utilized
 - 2. Classification Review
 - a. + Examination of career ladders
 - b. + Identify paths for technical and managerial growth
 - c. + Recommend new or updated classifications
 - d. Evaluate and recommend efficiencies for reviewing and processing FJA's
 - e. + Evaluate and make recommendations for potential impacts of classification modifications
 - f. + Review positions performing similar work to simplify and reduce specialization
 - i. Similar level of complexity
 - ii. Similar level of responsibility
 - iii. Similar knowledge/skills
 - g. + Crosswalk positions from current to revised classifications

RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendation

BIDDER NAME: Segal DATE: 2/12/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Lucas Sieb

- h. Recommend changes/additions to SOM's current methodology for ongoing evaluations; Curious if this is referring to revising our evaluation methodology?
- i. +/- Identify inequities related to promotions, demotions, or transfers between the Admin/MSEA salary schedules and make recommendations; What would be the basis for these decisions?
- j. + Consolidate classifications where there aren't meaningful/measurable differences
- k. + Develop new classifications to fill functional or career development gaps
- I. + Revise classifications reflecting different roles, responsibilities, or requirements learned from stakeholder interviews
- m. + Re-wording of titles, to fit with standard occupational nomenclature compared to counterparts in other organizations
- 2. Implementation Work Plan
 - + Segal's model will provide SOM the ability to prioritize its internal review following the analysis
 - + Segal's plan will customize the model to meet SOM's specific needs while employing their experience streamlining and improving job classification structures
 - + Model will take current bargaining unit into consideration and identify similarities and differences among bargaining units
 - Suggest an order of implementation/priority along with a rationale for the suggested change; This seems vague. I would like to know if there is a more organized/typical project implementation to gauge what the final and practical stage of this project could be expected to look like.
 - + Planning for Segal to present the final results to BHR and Labor Management Committee
 - 1. Study goals
 - 2. Methodology
 - 3. Future trends
 - 4. Key findings
 - 5. Recommendations and potential implications



Janet T. Mills Governor

Kirsten LC Figueroa Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations

I, <u>Kelsie Lee</u> accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Administrative and Financial Service, Bureau of Human Resources. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.



Governor

STATE OF MAINE DEPARTMENT OF ADMINISTRATIVE and FINANCIAL SERVICES, BUREAU of HUMAN RESOURCES

Kirsten LC Figueroa Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations

I, <u>Sharon Huntley</u> accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Administrative and Financial Service, Bureau of Human Resources. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

Signature

<u>2/14/25</u>



Kirsten LC Figueroa Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations

I, <u>Scott Helmke</u> accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Administrative and Financial Service, Bureau of Human Resources. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

Signed by:	Signed by:
Scott Helmke 727F0F323F594F5	Scott Helmke
Signature	Date



Janet T. Mills Governor

Kirsten LC Figueroa Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations

I, <u>Sophia Spiller</u> accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Administrative and Financial Service, Bureau of Human Resources. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

Soplia Spiller Signature	Date	
3000D1170D00 1 01	 Date	



Kirsten LC Figueroa Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT RFP #: 202411204

RFP TITLE: Comprehensive Classification Review, Analysis and Recommendations

I, <u>Lucas Sieb</u> accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Administrative and Financial Service, Bureau of Human Resources. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

Signature	Date	
Lucas Sich	2/5/2025	
Signed by:		