

State of Maine
Master Score Sheet

RFP# 202407135					
Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site					
Bidder Name:		Harrison Kilpatrick	Haley Ward	Colliers Engineering & Design Inc	
Proposed Cost:		\$16,750.00	\$76,000	\$46,500	
Scoring Sections	Points Available				
Section I: Preliminary Information	Pass/Fail	Pass	Pass	Pass	
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	25	21	25	22	
Section III: Proposed Services	25	23	25	23	
Section IV: Cost Proposal	50	50	11	18	
TOTAL	<u>100</u>	<u>94</u>	<u>61</u>	<u>63</u>	
Bidder Name:					
Proposed Cost:					
Scoring Sections	Points Available				
Section I: Preliminary Information					
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience					
Section III: Proposed Services					
Section IV: Cost Proposal					
TOTAL	<u>100</u>				

Award Justification Statement
RFP# 202407135
Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

I. Summary

Through RFP#202407135 Survey/Mark Property Lines located at the Caswell Training Site In Caswell Maine, three (3) bidders responded: Haley Ward Inc, Harrison Kilpatrick and Colliers Engineering and Design, Inc. Through the RFP evaluation process Harrison Kilpatrick was the highest overall scoring bidder and therefore determined to provide the best value to the State of Maine.

II. Evaluation Process

The RFP process with team consensus scoring was used by an evaluation team. The team was comprised by State employees who were a cross section of qualifications and expertise. The consensus method was used for the Organization, Qualification and Experience as well as the Proposed Services sections, taking into consideration that the blaze marking, and installation of the corner markers all have a limited numbers of way to be completed. The Cost proposal was evaluated by formula, as mentioned in the RFP.

III. Qualifications & Experience

- Provided copy of License Number PLS2650
- They have been working on many road, land, logging and Solar project surveys.
- Harrison Kilpatrick is familiar with this specific site as they were working with the original vendor surveying the site prior to purchase.

IV. Proposed Services

- Lines will be marked using the Commonly used Painting and Blazing System, outlined in The Forestry Rules of Maine. 2017. Published by Maine Department of Agriculture, Conservation & Forestry, Maine Forest Service.
- All activities will be well documented on a plan of survey o be produced for the landowner at no additional charge. It is important for posterity's sake that the work exists in an official document.
- Corners will be set using calculated coordinates based on Boundary determination will be made using all available record documents, including deeds, record plans, and field notes from original lotting.
- They will contact all adjacent landowners for to notify them of an ongoing boundary survey per Maine Statute Title 32, §18231. The letter will also request permission from these landowners to mark trees on their side of the property boundary. If permission is not given there is a plan for proceeding.

V. Cost Proposal

VI. Vendor Name	Proposed Cost	Points (available 50)
Harrison Kilpatrick	\$16,750.00	50
Colliers Engineering & Design Inc	\$46,500.00	18
Haley Ward, Inc	\$76,000.00	11

VI. Conclusion

Out of 100 possible points, Harrison Kilpatrick scored 94, which was the highest point total awarded by the Evaluation Team. The strengths of Harrison Kilpatrick's proposal include a detailed schedule referencing pertinent survey coordinates and procedures, and a competitive cost proposal. The Evaluation Team determined the proposal submitted by Harrison Kilpatrick; Inc represents the best value to the State of Maine.



**STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE, VETERANS & EMERGENCY
MANAGEMENT – Military Bureau**

**Janet T. Mills
Governor**

**Diane L. Dunn
Brigadier General
Commissioner**

AWARD NOTIFICATION LETTER

17 September 2024

Harrison Kilpatrick
108 Cedar Street
Presque Isle, ME 04769

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202407135
Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

Dear Harrison Kilpatrick:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Defense, Veterans and Emergency Management- Military Bureau for Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Harrison Kilpatrick

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "T. Schaub", is displayed within a light blue rectangular box.

Tanya L Schaub
Contract/Grant Specialist

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



**STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE, VETERANS & EMERGENCY
MANAGEMENT – Military Bureau**

**Janet T. Mills
Governor**

**Diane L. Dunn
Brigadier General
Commissioner**

AWARD NOTIFICATION LETTER

17 September 2024

Haley Ward, Inc
Nathan Rice, PLS
One Merchant Plaza, Suite 701
Bangor, ME 04401

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202407135
Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

Dear Nathan Rice, PLS:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Defense, Veterans and Emergency Management- Military Bureau for Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Harrison Kilpatrick

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'T. Schaub', is displayed within a light blue rectangular box.

Tanya L Schaub
Contract/Grant Specialist

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



**STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE, VETERANS & EMERGENCY
MANAGEMENT – Military Bureau**

**Janet T. Mills
Governor**

**Diane L. Dunn
Brigadier General
Commissioner**

AWARD NOTIFICATION LETTER

17 September 2024

Colliers Engineering & Design, Inc
Sean Pierce, PLS – Principal Associate
101 Crawfords Corner Road, Suite 3400
Holmdel, New Jersey 07733

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202407135
Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

Dear Sean Pierce, PLS:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Defense, Veterans and Emergency Management- Military Bureau for Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Harrison Kilpatrick

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "T. Schaub", is displayed within a light blue rectangular box.

Tanya L Schaub
Contract/Grant Specialist

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202407135

RFP TITLE: Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

BIDDER: Harrison Kilpatrick

DATE: 9 September 2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Defense, Veterans and Emergency Management – Military Bureau

Name of RFP Coordinator: Tanya L Schaub

Names of Evaluators: Kyle Savage, Tim Bickford, Eric Wightman

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)		
<ul style="list-style-type: none">Copy of or proof of licensure as a State of Maine Licensed Land Surveyor.	X	
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	25	21
Section III. Proposed Services	25	23
Section IV. Cost Proposal	50	50
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>94</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202407135

RFP TITLE: Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

BIDDER: Harrison Kilpatrick

DATE: 9 September 2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

Section I – Preliminary Information (no points yes/no qualification only)

A. Proposal Cover Page

B. Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification

C. Eligibility Requirements

- Copy of or proof of licensure as a State of Maine Licensed Land Surveyor.

Comments:

- Provided needed documentation

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202407135

RFP TITLE: Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

BIDDER: Harrison Kilpatrick

DATE: 9 September 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	25	21

Evaluation Team Comments:

Section II - Organization Qualifications and Experience (25 points)

1. Overview of the Organization

- Bidders must include three examples of projects which demonstrate their experience and expertise in performing these services as well as highlighting the Bidder's stated qualifications and skills.

2. Subcontractors

3. Organizational Chart

4. Litigation

5. Certificate of Insurance

Comments:

- In the qualification – nothing towards this job, but it is addressed in the proposal. Just very cut/dry here.
- COI – yes
- Nothing mentioned about litigation
- Not intending to use subs "Dad will assist"
- Robert Kilpatrick is the forester who is currently overseeing the timber sales
- This surveyor did work with the original surveyor "Blackstone" on the survey

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202407135

RFP TITLE: Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

BIDDER: Harrison Kilpatrick

DATE: 9 September 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	25	23

Evaluation Team Comments:

Section III – Proposed Services (25 points)

1. Services to be Provided

- Discuss the Scope of Services referenced above in Part II of the RFP and what the Bidder will offer.

2. Implementation - Work Plan

- Provide a realistic work plan for the implementation of the program through the first contract period.

Comments:

- Services to be provided are well detailed, such as rebar being used for tying in cornerstones etc.
- Work plan not “titled” but seems to be part of the description. Wasn’t broken out but if you read down through you could see that there is a plan of days to days.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202407135

RFP TITLE: Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

BIDDER: Harrison Kilpatrick

DATE: 9 September 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
\$16,750.00	,	\$16,750.00	x	50 points	=	50

Evaluation Team Comments:

- No additional comments

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202407135

RFP TITLE: Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

BIDDER: Colliers Engineering & Design, Inc

DATE: 9 September 2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Defense, Veterans and Emergency Management – Military Bureau

Name of RFP Coordinator: Tanya L Schaub

Names of Evaluators: Kyle Savage, Tim Bickford, Eric Wightman

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)		
<ul style="list-style-type: none">Copy of or proof of licensure as a State of Maine Licensed Land Surveyor.	X	
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	25	22
Section III. Proposed Services	25	23
Section IV. Cost Proposal	50	18
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>63</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202407135

RFP TITLE: Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

BIDDER: Colliers Engineering & Design, Inc

DATE: 9 September 2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

- **Section I – Preliminary Information (no points yes/no qualification only)**
- **Proposal Cover Page**
- **Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification**
- **Eligibility Requirements**
 - Copy of or proof of licensure as a State of Maine Licensed Land Surveyor.

Comments:

- Provided license
- Submitted Cover Page and Debarment/Non-Collusion etc.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202407135

RFP TITLE: Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

BIDDER: Colliers Engineering & Design, Inc

DATE: 9 September 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	25	22

Evaluation Team Comments:

Section II - Organization Qualifications and Experience (25 points)

1. Overview of the Organization

- Bidders must include three examples of projects which demonstrate their experience and expertise in performing these services as well as highlighting the Bidder's stated qualifications and skills.

2. Subcontractors

3. Organizational Chart

4. Litigation

5. Certificate of Insurance

Comments:

- No litigation listed
- Impressive list of what they can do technology wise
- General org chart – whole group, not specific to the jobs
- List whole firm but not who would be working specifically on the project
- No subs indicated, would do inhouse
- COI provided

Overall General Comments:

Could do the job, though not spelled out all the specifics.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202407135

RFP TITLE: Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

BIDDER: Colliers Engineering & Design, Inc

DATE: 9 September 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	25	23

Evaluation Team Comments:

Section III – Proposed Services (25 points)

1. Services to be Provided

- Discuss the Scope of Services referenced above in Part II of the RFP and what the Bidder will offer.

2. Implementation - Work Plan

- Provide a realistic work plan for the implementation of the program through the first contract period.

Comments:

- Scope provided meets the required RFP
- They note that they will provide the data electronically, but in a format we don't use.
 - Note: We didn't specify or even ask for the electronic data in the RFP.
- No specific work plan was provided, just generalization, you can "imply" read into what is there
- No specific details on how they would replace/install the corner stones

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202407135

RFP TITLE: Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

BIDDER: Colliers Engineering & Design, Inc

DATE: 9 September 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
\$16,750.00	,	\$46,500.00	x	50 points	=	63

Evaluation Team Comments:

- They are definitely high in pricing.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202407135

RFP TITLE: Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

BIDDER: Haley Ward, Inc

DATE: 9 September 2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Defense, Veterans and Emergency Management – Military Bureau

Name of RFP Coordinator: Tanya L Schaub

Names of Evaluators: Kyle Savage, Tim Bickford, Eric Wightman

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)		
<ul style="list-style-type: none">Copy of or proof of licensure as a State of Maine Licensed Land Surveyor.	X	
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	25	25
Section III. Proposed Services	25	25
Section IV. Cost Proposal	50	11
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>61</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202407135

RFP TITLE: Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

BIDDER: Haley Ward, Inc

DATE: 9 September 2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

Section I – Preliminary Information (no points yes/no qualification only)

A. Proposal Cover Page

B. Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification

C. Eligibility Requirements

- Copy of or proof of licensure as a State of Maine Licensed Land Surveyor.

Comments:

- Provided required information
- Provided copy of license

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202407135

RFP TITLE: Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

BIDDER: Haley Ward, Inc

DATE: 9 September 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	25	25

Evaluation Team Comments:

- **Section II - Organization Qualifications and Experience (25 points)**
- **Overview of the Organization**
 - Bidders must include three examples of projects which demonstrate their experience and expertise in performing these services as well as highlighting the Bidder's stated qualifications and skills.
- **Subcontractors**
- **Organizational Chart**
- **Litigation**
- **Certificate of Insurance**

Comments:

- They didn't specify the technology they would use, just what they have done
- COI Provided
- No subs to be used
- No current or pending, there is details on the one case in the last 5 years
- General overall organization unsure if they intend to use all of them, for a shorter period in the field or not.
- Good examples provided

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202407135

RFP TITLE: Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

BIDDER: Haley Ward, Inc

DATE: 9 September 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	25	25

Evaluation Team Comments:

Section III – Proposed Services (25 points)

1. Services to be Provided

- Discuss the Scope of Services referenced above in Part II of the RFP and what the Bidder will offer.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- Provide a realistic work plan for the implementation of the program through the first contract period.

Comments:

- Work plan well documented with tasks and dates
- Services to be provided also well documented
- Implementation of work plan chart was detailed and “excellent”

Overall, General Comments:

- Implementation proposed is realistic for scope of work
- Doing same kind of work currently at Woodville Training Site

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202407135

RFP TITLE: Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

BIDDER: Haley Ward, Inc

DATE: 9 September 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
\$16,750.00	,	\$76,000.00	x	50 points	=	11

Evaluation Team Comments:

- That is substantially higher price than the other 2 vendors

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202407135

RFP TITLE: Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

BIDDER NAME: Harrison Kilpatrick, Land Surveyor

DATE: 9/9/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Timothy Bickford

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: State of Maine Department of Defense, Veterans and
Emergency Management – Military Bureau

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Section I – Preliminary Information (no points yes/no qualification only)

- 1. Proposal Cover Page**
- 2. Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification**
- 3. Eligibility Requirements**
 - Copy of or proof of licensure as a State of Maine Licensed Land Surveyor.

Comments: Yes, licenses comply with contract requirements.

Section II - Organization Qualifications and Experience (25 points)

- 1. Overview of the Organization**
 - Bidders must include three examples of projects which demonstrate their experience and expertise in performing these services as well as highlighting the Bidder's stated qualifications and skills.
- 2. Subcontractors**
- 3. Organizational Chart**
- 4. Litigation**
- 5. Certificate of Insurance**

Comments:

Bidder did provide at least three examples of projects that are similar in scope to this RFP.

No subcontractors are indicated though the proposal did include the owner's father would assist.

No litigation indicated.

Section III – Proposed Services (25 points)

- 1. Services to be Provided**

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202407135

RFP TITLE: Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

BIDDER NAME: Harrison Kilpatrick, Land Surveyor

DATE: 9/9/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Timothy Bickford

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: State of Maine Department of Defense, Veterans and Emergency Management – Military Bureau

- Discuss the Scope of Services referenced above in Part II of the RFP and what the Bidder will offer.

2. Implementation - Work Plan

- Provide a realistic work plan for the implementation of the program through the first contract period.

Comments:

1 – The scope of services provided by the bidder meet the requirements of the RFP. Work plan was not a separate section but implied through the scope of services.

2 – Contract implementation proposed is realistic for the scope and work plan.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202407135

RFP TITLE: Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

BIDDER NAME: Harrison Kilpatrick, Land Surveyor

DATE: 9/9/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Kyle Savage

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: State of Maine Department of Defense, Veterans and
Emergency Management – Military Bureau

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Section I – Preliminary Information (no points yes/no qualification only)

1. **Proposal Cover Page** - [Supplied.](#)
2. **Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification** - [Supplied.](#)
3. **Eligibility Requirements** - [Supplied.](#)
 - Copy of or proof of licensure as a State of Maine Licensed Land Surveyor.

Comments: - [Qualifications and Experience Form – Lack of description of abilities and technology used. They do mention more details in Proposed Services Section.](#)

Section II - Organization Qualifications and Experience (25 points)

1. **Overview of the Organization**
 - Bidders must include three examples of projects which demonstrate their experience and expertise in performing these services as well as highlighting the Bidder's stated qualifications and skills. - [Not too detailed.](#)
2. **Subcontractors** - [No subcontractor needed.](#)
3. **Organizational Chart** - [Supplied.](#)
4. **Litigation** - [not included.](#)
5. **Certificate of Insurance** - [Supplied.](#)

Comments:

Section III – Proposed Services (25 points)

1. **Services to be Provided**
 - Discuss the Scope of Services referenced above in Part II of the RFP and what the Bidder will offer. - [Clearly described.](#)
2. **Implementation - Work Plan**
 - Provide a realistic work plan for the implementation of the program through the first contract period. - [No detailed work plan displayed in timeline chart. They note "Day 1" but no month or day is associated with it. – Basic Tentative Project Schedule provided.](#)

Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202407135

RFP TITLE: Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

BIDDER NAME: Harrison Kilpatrick, Land Surveyor

DATE: 9/9/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Eric Wightman

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: State of Maine Department of Defense, Veterans and
Emergency Management – Military Bureau

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Section I – Preliminary Information (no points yes/no qualification only)

- 1. Proposal Cover Page**
- 2. Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification**
- 3. Eligibility Requirements**
 - Copy of or proof of licensure as a State of Maine Licensed Land Surveyor.

Comments:

-Meets all Components of Section 1.

Section II - Organization Qualifications and Experience (25 points)

- 1. Overview of the Organization**
 - Bidders must include three examples of projects which demonstrate their experience and expertise in performing these services as well as highlighting the Bidder's stated qualifications and skills.
- 2. Subcontractors**
- 3. Organizational Chart**
- 4. Litigation**
- 5. Certificate of Insurance**

Comments:

-The Bidder did not include Litigation.

Section III – Proposed Services (25 points)

- 1. Services to be Provided**
 - Discuss the Scope of Services referenced above in Part II of the RFP and what the Bidder will offer.
- 2. Implementation - Work Plan**
 - Provide a realistic work plan for the implementation of the program through the first contract period.

Comments:

-Services to be provided is well documented. The Work Plan was not title as such but was address in comments.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202407135

RFP TITLE: Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

BIDDER NAME: Haley Ward, Inc

DATE: 9/9/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Kyle Savage

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: State of Maine Department of Defense, Veterans and
Emergency Management – Military Bureau**

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Section I – Preliminary Information (no points yes/no qualification only)

1. **Proposal Cover Page** - [Supplied.](#)
2. **Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification** - [Supplied.](#)
3. **Eligibility Requirements** - [Supplied.](#)
 - Copy of or proof of licensure as a State of Maine Licensed Land Surveyor.

Comments: - [Qualifications and Experience Form – Lack of description of abilities and technology used.](#)

Section II - Organization Qualifications and Experience (25 points)

1. **Overview of the Organization**
 - Bidders must include three examples of projects which demonstrate their experience and expertise in performing these services as well as highlighting the Bidder's stated qualifications and skills.
2. **Subcontractors** - [No subcontractor needed.](#)
3. **Organizational Chart** – [Had a general organizational chart, but not specific to this project.](#)
4. **Litigation** – [No current or pending litigation. One case in the last five years – settled.](#)
5. **Certificate of Insurance** - [Supplied.](#)

Comments:

Section III – Proposed Services (25 points)

1. **Services to be Provided**
 - Discuss the Scope of Services referenced above in Part II of the RFP and what the Bidder will offer. - [Clearly described.](#)
2. **Implementation - Work Plan**
 - Provide a realistic work plan for the implementation of the program through the first contract period. - [Clearly described. Excellent detailed Implementation Work Plan.](#)

Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202407135

RFP TITLE: Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

BIDDER NAME: Haley Ward, Inc

DATE: 9/9/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Timothy Bickford

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: State of Maine Department of Defense, Veterans and
Emergency Management – Military Bureau

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Section I – Preliminary Information (no points yes/no qualification only)

- 1. Proposal Cover Page**
- 2. Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification**
- 3. Eligibility Requirements**
 - Copy of or proof of licensure as a State of Maine Licensed Land Surveyor.

Comments: Yes, licenses comply with contract requirements.

Section II - Organization Qualifications and Experience (25 points)

- 1. Overview of the Organization**
 - Bidders must include three examples of projects which demonstrate their experience and expertise in performing these services as well as highlighting the Bidder's stated qualifications and skills.
- 2. Subcontractors**
- 3. Organizational Chart**
- 4. Litigation**
- 5. Certificate of Insurance**

Comments:

Bidder did provide at least three examples of projects that are similar in scope to this RFP.

No subcontractors are indicated

No Litigation is indicated

Certificate of insurance provided

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202407135

RFP TITLE: Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

BIDDER NAME: Haley Ward, Inc

DATE: 9/9/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Timothy Bickford

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: State of Maine Department of Defense, Veterans and
Emergency Management – Military Bureau

Section III – Proposed Services (25 points)

1. Services to be Provided

- Discuss the Scope of Services referenced above in Part II of the RFP and what the Bidder will offer.

2. Implementation - Work Plan

- Provide a realistic work plan for the implementation of the program through the first contract period.

Comments:

1 – The scope of services provided by the bidder meet the requirements of the RFP. Very well detailed work plan.

2 – Contract implementation proposed is realistic for the scope and work plan.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202407135

RFP TITLE: Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

BIDDER NAME: Haley Ward, Inc

DATE: 9/9/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Eric Wightman

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: State of Maine Department of Defense, Veterans and
Emergency Management – Military Bureau

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Section I – Preliminary Information (no points yes/no qualification only)

- 1. Proposal Cover Page**
- 2. Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification**
- 3. Eligibility Requirements**
 - Copy of or proof of licensure as a State of Maine Licensed Land Surveyor.

Comments:

-Very thorough meets all Standards in Section I.

Section II - Organization Qualifications and Experience (25 points)

- 1. Overview of the Organization**
 - Bidders must include three examples of projects which demonstrate their experience and expertise in performing these services as well as highlighting the Bidder's stated qualifications and skills.
- 2. Subcontractors**
- 3. Organizational Chart**
- 4. Litigation**
- 5. Certificate of Insurance**

Comments:

-Very thorough meets all standards in Section II.

Section III – Proposed Services (25 points)

- 1. Services to be Provided**
 - Discuss the Scope of Services referenced above in Part II of the RFP and what the Bidder will offer.
- 2. Implementation - Work Plan**
 - Provide a realistic work plan for the implementation of the program through the first contract period.

Comments:

-Work Plan very well documented with Task and dates. Also, Services to be Provided was well documented.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202407135

RFP TITLE: Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

BIDDER NAME: Colliers Engineering & Design, Inc

DATE: 9/9/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Eric Wightman

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: State of Maine Department of Defense, Veterans and
Emergency Management – Military Bureau

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Section I – Preliminary Information (no points yes/no qualification only)

- 1. Proposal Cover Page**
- 2. Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification**
- 3. Eligibility Requirements**
 - Copy of or proof of licensure as a State of Maine Licensed Land Surveyor.

Comments:

-The Bidder met all the standards in Section 1.

Section II - Organization Qualifications and Experience (25 points)

- 1. Overview of the Organization**
 - Bidders must include three examples of projects which demonstrate their experience and expertise in performing these services as well as highlighting the Bidder's stated qualifications and skills.
- 2. Subcontractors**
- 3. Organizational Chart**
- 4. Litigation**
- 5. Certificate of Insurance**

Comments:

-The Bidder did not include Litigation, or Subcontractors.

Section III – Proposed Services (25 points)

- 1. Services to be Provided**
 - Discuss the Scope of Services referenced above in Part II of the RFP and what the Bidder will offer.
- 2. Implementation - Work Plan**
 - Provide a realistic work plan for the implementation of the program through the first contract period.

Comments:

-The Work Plan was very vague in the proposal. The Work Plan should be labeled as such.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202407135

RFP TITLE: Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

BIDDER NAME: Colliers Engineering & Design, Inc

DATE: 9/9/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Kyle Savage

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: State of Maine Department of Defense, Veterans and
Emergency Management – Military Bureau**

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Section I – Preliminary Information (no points yes/no qualification only)

1. **Proposal Cover Page** - [Supplied.](#)
2. **Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification** - [Supplied.](#)
3. **Eligibility Requirements** - [Supplied.](#)
 - Copy of or proof of licensure as a State of Maine Licensed Land Surveyor. - [Supplied.](#)

Comments: [- Qualifications and Experience Form – Very impressive with details and type of technology used.](#)

Section II - Organization Qualifications and Experience (25 points)

1. **Overview of the Organization** - [Clearly described.](#)
 - Bidders must include three examples of projects which demonstrate their experience and expertise in performing these services as well as highlighting the Bidder's stated qualifications and skills.
2. **Subcontractors** - [No subcontractor needed.](#)
3. **Organizational Chart** – [Had a general organizational chart, but not specific to this project.](#)
4. **Litigation** - [not included.](#)
5. **Certificate of Insurance** - [Supplied.](#)

Comments:

Section III – Proposed Services (25 points)

1. **Services to be Provided**
 - Discuss the Scope of Services referenced above in Part II of the RFP and what the Bidder will offer. - [Clearly described.](#)
2. **Implementation - Work Plan**
 - Provide a realistic work plan for the implementation of the program through the first contract period. – [No detailed work plan displayed in timeline chart.](#) - [Basic Tentative Project Schedule provided.](#)

Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202407135

RFP TITLE: Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

BIDDER NAME: Colliers Engineering & Design, Inc

DATE: 9/9/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Timothy Bickford

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: State of Maine Department of Defense, Veterans and
Emergency Management – Military Bureau**

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Section I – Preliminary Information (no points yes/no qualification only)

- 1. Proposal Cover Page**
- 2. Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification**
- 3. Eligibility Requirements**
 - Copy of or proof of licensure as a State of Maine Licensed Land Surveyor.

Comments: Yes, licenses comply with contract requirements.

Section II - Organization Qualifications and Experience (25 points)

- 1. Overview of the Organization**
 - Bidders must include three examples of projects which demonstrate their experience and expertise in performing these services as well as highlighting the Bidder's stated qualifications and skills.
- 2. Subcontractors**
- 3. Organizational Chart**
- 4. Litigation**
- 5. Certificate of Insurance**

Comments: Bidder did provide at least three examples of projects that are similar in scope to this RFP.

No subcontractors are indicated

No Litigation is indicated

Certificate of insurance has been provided

Section III – Proposed Services (25 points)

- 1. Services to be Provided**
 - Discuss the Scope of Services referenced above in Part II of the RFP and what the Bidder will offer.
- 2. Implementation - Work Plan**

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202407135

RFP TITLE: Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

BIDDER NAME: Colliers Engineering & Design, Inc

DATE: 9/9/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Timothy Bickford

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: State of Maine Department of Defense, Veterans and
Emergency Management – Military Bureau

- Provide a realistic work plan for the implementation of the program through the first contract period.

Comments: 1 – The scope of services provided by the bidder meet the requirements of the RFP. The scope does mention providing digital data in a format that does not meet MEARNG CAD & GIS Data Standards, however this data is not requested in the RFP.

2 – Contract implementation proposed is realistic for the scope and work plan though the work plan was not a separate submission.



Janet T. Mills
Governor

**STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE, VETERANS & EMERGENCY
MANAGEMENT – Military Bureau**

Diane L. Dunn
Brigadier General
Commissioner

**AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: 202407135**

RFP TITLE: Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

**Bids Received From: Colliers Engineering & Design, Inc, Haley Ward, Inc & Harrison Kilpatrick,
Land Surveyor**

I, Kyle Savage, accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Defense, Veterans and Emergency Management – Military Bureau. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

SAVAGE.KYLE.EUGENE.1606452124

Digitally signed by SAVAGE.KYLE.EUGENE.1606452124
Date: 2024.09.03 10:54:23 -04'00'

Signature

Date



Janet T. Mills
Governor

STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE, VETERANS & EMERGENCY
MANAGEMENT – Military Bureau

Diane L. Dunn
Brigadier General
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT

RFP #: 202407135

RFP TITLE: Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

**Bids Received From: Colliers Engineering & Design, Inc, Haley Ward, Inc & Harrison Kilpatrick,
Land Surveyor**

I, Eric Wightman, accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Defense, Veterans and Emergency Management – Military Bureau. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

Signature

Date

4 September 2024



Janet T. Mills
Governor

**STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE, VETERANS & EMERGENCY
MANAGEMENT – Military Bureau**

Diane L. Dunn
Brigadier General
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT

RFP #: 202407135

RFP TITLE: Survey/Mark Property Lines Caswell Training Site

**Bids Received From: Colliers Engineering & Design, Inc, Haley Ward, Inc & Harrison Kilpatrick,
Land Surveyor**

I, Timothy Bickford, accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Defense, Veterans and Emergency Management – Military Bureau. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

**BICKFORD.TIMOTHY.A.1290
830423**

Digitally signed by
BICKFORD.TIMOTHY.A.1290830423
Date: 2024.09.03 10:32:00 -04'00'

Signature

Date