

**State of Maine
Master Score Sheet**

Bidder Name:		Lepton Actuarial & Consulting, LLC	Milliman	Deloitte Consulting, LLC
Proposed Cost:		\$324,000	\$248,000	\$436,500
Scoring Sections	Points Available			
Section I: Preliminary Information	Pass/Fail	Fail	Pass	Pass
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	45	XX	35	43
Section III: Proposed Services	30	XX	23	30
Section IV: Cost Proposal	25	XX	25	14.2
TOTAL	<u>100</u>	<u>XX</u>	<u>83</u>	<u>87.2</u>

Award Justification Statement
RFP# 202402054 Actuarial Services - IBNP

I. Summary

The Financial Reporting & Analysis Division within the Office of the State Controller requires a GASB compliant estimated IBNP calculation in regards to healthcare coverage provided by the State's MaineCare program to meet all ACFR reporting requirements.

II. Evaluation Process

- Key Evaluation Team Members consisted of Sandra Royce, Director of Financial Reporting & Analysis, Brad Rodrigue, Financial Management Coordinator and Stacey Thomas, Financial Management Coordinator within the Financial Reporting & Analysis Division. All key evaluation members are involved in the preparation of the Annual Comprehensive Financial Report (ACFR) and are versed in the GASB Standard requirements regarding the IBNP calculations.

- Proposals were evaluated based on level of experience with State governments as well as calculating IBNP reserves related to Medicaid programs. The Team placed emphasis on experience with a state's Medicaid program because of the program's complexity.

- Emphasis was also placed on the level of detail and thoroughness of the proposal to the deliverable requirements in the RFP.

Qualifications & Experience

- Deloitte has extensive experience working with states and a state's Medicaid program.
- Three of Deloitte's submitted projects, not including its work with the State of Maine, calculated IBNR reserves. Two of those projects were estimating IBNR reserves for state governments, New York and Georgia.

III. Proposed Services

- Deloitte's proposal was thorough and detailed in its responses, meeting all the deliverable requirements of the RFP.

- Specifically stated that it will provide a Public Statement of Actuarial Opinion in accordance with the Qualification Standards of the American Academy of Actuaries.
- Provided excellent detail of work plan by task, timeframe and staff level as well as a breakdown of individual positions who will be working on engagement.

IV. Cost Proposal

- Deloitte – Total Contract = \$436,500
 - Initial Period (years 1-3) = \$71,000 per year
 - Renewal Period (years 4-6) = \$74,500 per year
- Milliman – Total Contract = \$248,000
 - Initial Period (years 1-3) = \$43,000, \$37,000, \$39,000, respectively
 - Renewal Period (years 4-6) = \$41,000, \$43,000, \$45,000, respectively

V. Conclusion

- Deloitte has extensive experience with estimating IBNR reserve for a state's Medicaid program.
- Specifically addressed that Deloitte would be providing a Public Statement of Actuarial Opinion in accordance with the Qualification Standards of the American Academy of Actuaries, which is one of the key components of the requested deliverables.
- The proposal was thorough and detailed in its responses meeting all the deliverable requirements of the RFP.
- Due to the current working relationship with the State of Maine, the Team believes Deloitte can handle tasks efficiently with no transition time and has substantial historical information to evaluate the current IBNP estimates.



STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF ADMINISTRATON
AND FINANCIAL SERVICES

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Kirsten LC Figueroa
Commissioner

May 28, 2024

Steven N. Wander, Principal
Deloitte Consulting LLP
50 South Sixth Street,
Suite 2800
Minneapolis, MN 55402

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402054
Actuarial Services - IBNP

Dear Mr. Wander:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Administrative and Financial Services for Actuarial Services - IBNP. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Deloitte Consulting LLP

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Sandra Royce".

Sandra Royce, CPA
Department of Administrative and Financial Services,
Office of the State Controller
14 State House Station
Augusta, ME 04330

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF ADMINISTRATOR
AND FINANCIAL SERVICES

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Kirsten LC Figueroa
Commissioner

May 28, 2024

George Omondi, Principal
Lepton Actuarial & Consulting, LLC
515 Madison Ave
8th Floor
New York, NY 10022

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402054
Actuarial Services - IBNP

Dear Mr. Omandi:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Administrative and Financial Services for Actuarial Services - IBNP. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Deloitte Consulting LLP

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Sandra Royce".

Sandra Royce, CPA
Department of Administrative and Financial Services,
Office of the State Controller
14 State House Station
Augusta, ME 04330

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF ADMINISTRATON
AND FINANCIAL SERVICES

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Kirsten LC Figueroa
Commissioner

May 28, 2024

David Koenig, Principal
Michael Polakowski, Principal
Milliman, Inc
1301 Fifth Ave,
Suite 3800
Seattle, WA 98101

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402054
Actuarial Services - IBNP

Dear Mr. Koenig and Mr. Polakowski:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Administrative and Financial Services for Actuarial Services - IBNP. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Deloitte Consulting LLP

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Sandra Royce".

Sandra Royce, CPA
Department of Administrative and Financial Services,
Office of the State Controller
14 State House Station
Augusta, ME 04330

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402054
RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP
BIDDER: Deloitte Consulting, LLC
DATE: 05/02/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: DAFS – Office of the State Controller
Name of RFP Coordinator: Stacey Thomas
Names of Evaluators: Stacey Thomas, Sandra Royce, Brad Rodrigue

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)		
<i>The supervising actuary must meet the American Academy of Actuaries Qualification Standards and be a Fellow or an Associate of the Society of Actuaries or an Associate of the Society of Actuaries, etc.</i>	x	
<i>The Bidder must have direct experience providing IBNP actuarial valuation services for at least two (2) other state governments.</i>	x	
<i>The Bidder must have at least ten (10) years of experience providing services similar to those described in this RFP.</i>	x	
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	45	43
Section III. Proposed Services	30	30
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	14.2
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>87.2</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402054
RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP
BIDDER: Deloitte Consulting, LLC
DATE: 05/02/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

- I. *Preliminary Information*
 - A. *Proposal Cover Page*
 - *Provided and signed.*
 - B. *Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification*
 - *Provided and signed.*
 - C. *Eligibility Requirements*
 - *The supervising actuary must meet the American Academy of Actuaries Qualification Standards and be a Fellow or an Associate of the Society of Actuaries or an Associate of the Society of Actuaries, etc.*
 - a. *Steve Wander is a fellow of the Society of Actuaries and meets the American Academy of Actuaries Qualification Standards.*
 - *The Bidder must have direct experience providing IBNP actuarial valuation services for at least two (2) other state governments.*
 - a. *The bidder has provided justification of direct experience providing IBNP actuarial valuation services for at least two other state governments, which include the State of Maine, Georgia and New York.*
 - b. *Does not provide a description of the services provided within Section I. However, the Bidder does reference the description of the projects and contacts within Section II.*
 - c. *Based on experience with Maine, the Team believes they meet the direct experience requirements.*
 - *The Bidder must have at least ten (10) years of experience providing services similar to those described in this RFP.*
 - a. *Steve Wander has 30 years of experience as a health actuary. He has performed Medicaid capitation rate development in six states and policy and financial management consulting in 14 states, including the State of Maine.*

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402054
RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP
BIDDER: Deloitte Consulting, LLC
DATE: 05/02/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	45	43

Evaluation Team Comments:

II. Organization Qualifications and Experience

A. Overview of Organization

- *Proposal highlighted Deloitte’s working relationship with the State of Maine, including developing estimates of fiscal year end IBNP claims liabilities on an annual basis since 2005.*
- *Provided three other projects, not including the work performed for the State of Maine, that demonstrate their ability to perform the services requested in the RFP. These include the states of New York and Georgia, as well as the UnitedHealth Group.*
- *All three projects involved Deloitte calculating the IBNR estimates. Though the UnitedHealth Group engagement is not directly related to work performed for a State government, Deloitte does provide over 55 subsidiary legal entities within the UnitedHealth Group with IBNR liability estimates, many of which include Medicaid lines of business.*

B. Subcontractors

- *No plans to use a subcontractor.*

C. Organization Chart

- *Provided*
- *Available members for the project are provided and clear roles appear to be identified with respect to the proposed engagement.*

D. Litigation

- *Occasionally involved in disagreements over contract requirements and thus could be involved in litigation, but the bidder does not believe that it will affect their ability to serve the state in connection with the proposed engagement. The State of Maine has worked extensively with the Bidder in the past with no issues.*
- *A list of current litigation was not included as requested in the RFP.*

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402054

RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP

BIDDER: Deloitte Consulting, LLC

DATE: 05/02/2024

E. Financial Viability

- *Financial information provided.*
- *Deloitte LLP and it's subsidiaries had roughly \$32.7 billion in revenues in 2023.*

F. Licensure/Certification

- *Screen shots of actuarial certification for the actuaries that are part of the engagement provided from the "Actuarial Directory".*

G. Certificate of Insurance

- *Provided – up to \$1 million in liability insurance per occurrence for both general and professional liability insurances.*

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402054
RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP
BIDDER: Deloitte Consulting, LLC
DATE: 05/02/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	30	30

Evaluation Team Comments:

III. Proposed Services

A. Services to be Provided.

- *Deloitte has a proprietary IBNR model that it uses in the development of the IBNP estimates.*
- *The model utilizes the Modified Completion Factor Method. This approach has been used by Deloitte since 2005 in calculating the States IBNP estimates. This approach is an industry accepted actuarial methodology for estimating IBNP. This approach estimates ultimate incurred claims based on historical paid claim completion patterns and is generally considered an actuarial best practice for IBNP development.*
- *Upon completion of the IBNP analysis, Deloitte will provide an Actuarial Memorandum, which will include a Public Statement of Actuarial Opinion in accordance with the Qualification Standard of the American Academy of Actuaries.*
- *It appears that all required elements of the RFP are included in the Actuarial Memorandum.*
- *After finalizing the Actuarial Memorandum, Deloitte will work with the State internal auditors as necessary (similar to what has been done in the past)*
- *Due to the current working relationship between the State and the bidder, the Team believes the bidder can handle tasks efficiently with no transition time and has substantial historical information to evaluate the current IBNP estimates.*

B. Implementation – Work Plan

- *Work plan provided in a timeline chart with proposed deadline for deliverables to be October 2024.*
- *Breakdown of the individual positions within Deloitte was provided.*
- *Excellent detailed work plan by task, timeframe, and staff level.*

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402054
RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP
BIDDER: Deloitte Consulting, LLC
DATE: 05/02/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
248,000	,	436,500	x	25 points	=	14.2

Evaluation Team Comments:

- *Cost proposal provided for all periods (initial and renewal periods)*
- *Initial periods: \$71,000 per year; Renewal periods: \$74,500 per year*
- *Does not appear to include any costs related to the preparation of this submission or the negotiation of contract with the State.*

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402054

RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP

BIDDER: Lepton Actuarial & Consulting, LLC

DATE: 05/01/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: DAFS – Office of the State Controller

Name of RFP Coordinator: Stacey Thomas

Names of Evaluators:

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)		
<i>The supervising actuary must meet the American Academy of Actuaries Qualification Standards and be a Fellow or an Associate of the Society of Actuaries or an Associate of the Society of Actuaries, etc.</i>	x	
<i>The Bidder must have direct experience providing IBNP actuarial valuation services for at least two (2) other state governments</i>		x
<i>The Bidder must have at least ten (10) years of experience providing services similar to those described in this RFP</i>	x	

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402054
RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP
BIDDER: Lepton Actuarial & Consulting, LLC
DATE: 05/01/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

Bidder does not have experience with at least two other states and therefore does not meet the eligibility requirements of the RFP and was not considered for contract award.

In Project 1, Chicago Public Schools appeared to be a local government rather than a state government.

In Project 2, the bidder does not appear to be a direct provider of the services (supporting the work of Wakely). Additionally, the project does not appear to be a state government.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402054
RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP
BIDDER: Milliman, Inc
DATE: 05/01/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: DAFS – Office of the State Controller
Name of RFP Coordinator: Stacey Thomas
Names of Evaluators: Stacey Thomas, Sandra Royce, Brad Rodrigue

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)		
<i>The supervising actuary must meet the American Academy of Actuaries Qualification Standards and be a Fellow or an Associate of the Society of Actuaries or an Associate of the Society of Actuaries, etc.</i>	x	
<i>The Bidder must have direct experience providing IBNP actuarial valuation services for at least two (2) other state governments</i>	x	
<i>The Bidder must have at least ten (10) years of experience providing services similar to those described in this RFP</i>	x	
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	45	35
Section III. Proposed Services	30	23
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	25
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>83</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402054
RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP
BIDDER: Milliman, Inc
DATE: 05/01/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

I. Preliminary Information

- *Proposal Cover Page*
 - *Provided and signed*
- *Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification*
- *Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification provided and signed*
- *Eligibility Requirements*
 - *The supervising actuary must meet the American Academy of Actuaries Qualification Standards and be a Fellow or an Associate of the Society of Actuaries or an Associate of the Society of Actuaries, etc.*
 - a. *Both David Koenig and Michael Polakowski are fellows of the Society of Actuaries and meet the American Academy of Actuaries Qualifications for issuing Statements of Actuarial Opinions*
 - *The Bidder must have direct experience providing IBNP actuarial valuation services for at least two (2) other state governments*
 - a. *The bidder has provided justification of direct experience providing IBNP actuarial valuation services for at least two other state governments, which include the State of Idaho, Department of Health and Welfare, as well as the State of Washington, Department of Social and Health Services*
- *The Bidder must have at least ten (10) years of experience providing services similar to those described in this RFP*

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402054

RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP

BIDDER: Milliman, Inc

DATE: 05/01/2024

- a. *The two supervising actuaries, David Koenig and Michael Polakowski have 14 years and 16 years respectively experience with IBNP analysis which includes experience related to Medicaid and Medicare.*

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402054
RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP
BIDDER: Milliman, Inc
DATE: 05/01/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	45	35

Evaluation Team Comments:

*I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
A. Overview of Organization*

- *Three projects presented. All seem to involve the required IBNP analysis including estimating the Incurred but not Paid (IBNP) liabilities, however the Washington project did not appear to be related to Medicaid program which the Team believes is a more complex program.*
- *Two projects appear to involve State level IBNP experience.*
- *One project involved providing a Statement of Actuarial Opinion for each health insurer under the parent company's (Centene) umbrella. This does not appear to be related to any State level project, but the project does demonstrate their experience and expertise in performing these services.*

B. Subcontractors

- *Not planning to use subcontractors.*

C. Organization Chart

- *Provided.*
- *Available members for the project are identified, though clear roles do not appear to be identified with respect to the proposed engagement.*

D. Litigation

- *The Seattle Health practice, the office involved in this engagement, has not been involved in any litigation related to the services contemplated in their proposal.*

E. Financial Viability

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402054
RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP
BIDDER: Milliman, Inc
DATE: 05/01/2024

- *Dunn & Bradstreet Information Report Snapshot provided.*
- *Per the report, appears to be Low-Moderate risk with overall assessment as “Stable Condition” and perceived sustainability of the company as “Likelihood of Continued Operations.”*

F. Licensure/Certification

- *Provided an IRS certification verifying that it is a US Corporation*
- *License information was provided (via print screen of Actuarial Directory) in the first section (Preliminary Information).*

G. Certificate of Insurance

- *Provided – up to \$1 million in liability insurance per occurrence for both general and professional liability insurances.*

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	30	23

Evaluation Team Comments:

I. Proposed Services

A. Services to be Provided

- *Milliman’s claim liability estimates are based on the actuarial completion factor method that develops monthly completion factors based on past claim payment patterns, paired with the projection method that estimates the total incurred amount based on historical claim costs and expected trends.*
- *Deliverables will be presented as a letter that will provide their best estimate reserve (mid-level reserve estimate), along with a low and high estimate. It doesn’t appear that the Bidder addressed all the requirements as stated in the RFP (i.e., summary table of Member Months data).*

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402054

RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP

BIDDER: Milliman, Inc

DATE: 05/01/2024

- *The bidder did not state that they would provide a Public Statement of Actuarial Opinion in accordance with the Qualification Standards of the American Academy of Actuaries.*

- B. Implementation – Work Plan*
 - *Work plan provided in a timeline chart with proposed deadline for deliverables to be October 2024.*
 - *No breakdown of individuals within Milliman that would be performing each tasks.*
 - *The Team believes that trying to get four years of data and recalculating prior years IBNP along with trying to provide current year data may cause issues with the scheduled delivery date.*

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	x	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
248,000	x	248,000	x	25 points	=	25

Evaluation Team Comments:

- *Cost proposal provided for all periods (initial and renewal periods)*
- *Initial periods: \$43,000; \$37,000; \$39,000; Renewal periods: \$41,000; \$43,000; \$45,000*
- *Does not appear to include any costs related to the preparation of this submission or the negotiation of contract with the State.*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402054

RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP

BIDDER NAME: Deloitte Consulting

DATE: 04/16/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brad Rodrigue

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DAFS – Office of the State Controller

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department’s RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Preliminary Information

1. Proposal Cover Page

- Provided and signed*

2. Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification

- Provided and signed*

3. Eligibility Requirements

- The supervising actuary must meet the American Academy of Actuaries Qualification Standards and be a Fellow or an Associate of the Society of Actuaries or an Associate of the Society of Actuaries, etc.*
 - a. Steve Wander is a fellow of the Society of Actuaries and meets the American Academy of Actuaries Qualification Standards*
- The Bidder must have direct experience providing IBNP actuarial valuation services for at least two (2) other state governments*
 - a. The bidder has provided justification of direct experience providing IBNP actuarial valuation services for at least two other state governments, which include the State of Maine, Georgia and New York*
 - b. Does not provide a description of the services provided, nor a contact for any of the clients*
 - c. Based on experience with Maine, however, I believe they meet the direct experience requirements*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402054

RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP

BIDDER NAME: Deloitte Consulting

DATE: 04/16/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brad Rodrigue

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DAFS – Office of the State Controller

- *The Bidder must have at least ten (10) years of experience providing services similar to those described in this RFP*
 - a. *Steve Wander has 30 years of experience as a health actuary. He has performed Medicaid capitation rate development in six states and policy and financial management consulting in 14 states, including the State of Maine.*

II. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- *Proposal highlighted Deloitte’s working relationship with the State of Maine, including developing estimates of fiscal year end IBNP claims liabilities on an annual basis since 2005*
- *Provide three other projects, not including the work performed for the State of Maine, that demonstrate their ability to perform the services requested in the RFP. These include the states of New York and Georgia, as well as the UnitedHealth Group.*
- *All three projects involved Deloitte calculating the IBNR estimates. Though the UnitedHealth Group engagement is not directly related to work performed for a State government, Deloitte does provide over 55 subsidiary legal entities within the UnitedHealth Group with IBNR liability estimates, many of which include Medicaid lines of business.*

2. Subcontractors

- *No plans to use a subcontractor*

3. Organization Chart

- *Provided*
- *Available members for the project are identified, clear roles appear to be identified with respect to the proposed engagement*

4. Litigation

- *Occasionally involved in disagreements over contract requirements and thus could be involved in litigation, but nothing that they feel would affect their ability to serve the state in connection with the proposed engagement.*

5. Financial Viability

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402054

RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP

BIDDER NAME: Deloitte Consulting

DATE: 04/16/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brad Rodrigue

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DAFS – Office of the State Controller

- *Financial information provided.*
- *Deloitte LLP and it's subsidiaries had roughly \$32.7 billion in revenues in 2023*

6. Licensure/Certification

- *Screen shots of actuarial certification for the actuaries that are part of the engagement provided from the "Actuarial Directory"*

7. Certificate of Insurance

- *Provided – up to \$1 million in liability insurance per occurrence*

III. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- *Deloitte has a proprietary IBNR model that it uses in the development of the IBNP estimates*
- *The model utilizes the Modified Completion Factor Method. This approach has been used by Deloitte since 2005 in calculating the States IBNP estimates. This approach is an industry accepted actuarial methodology for estimating IBNP. This approach estimates ultimate incurred claims based on historical paid claim completion patterns and is generally considered an actuarial best practice for IBNP development.*
- *Upon completion of the IBNP analysis, Deloitte will provide an Actuarial Memorandum, which will include a Public Statement of Actuarial Opinion in accordance with the Qualification Standard of the American Academy of Actuaries.*
- *After finalizing the Actuarial Memorandum, Deloitte will work with the State internal auditors as necessary (similar to what has been done in the past)*

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- *Work plan provided in a timeline chart with proposed deadline for deliverables to be October 2024*
- *They provided a breakdown of the individual positions within Deloitte that would be performing each tasks*

IV. Cost Proposal

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402054

RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP

BIDDER NAME: Deloitte Consulting

DATE: 04/16/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brad Rodrigue

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DAFS – Office of the State Controller

- *Cost proposal provided for all periods (initial and renewal periods)*
- *Initial periods: \$71,000 per year; Renewal periods: \$74,500 per year*
- *Does not appear to include any costs related to the preparation of this submission or the negotiation of contract with the State.*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402054

RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP

BIDDER NAME: Deloitte Consulting

DATE: 04/16/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sandra Royce

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DAFS – Office of the State Controller

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department’s RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Preliminary Information

1. Proposal Cover Page

- *Provided*

•

2. Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification

- *Provided*

•

3. Eligibility Requirements

- *Project 1 – State of New York meets requirements and provides excellent detail.*
- *Project 2 – State of Georgia meets requirements and provides excellent detail.*

II. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- *Company background provided.*
- *National firm – so resources probably not an issue.*

•

2. Subcontractors

- *Not planning to use subcontractors.*

•

3. Organization Chart

- *Provided*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402054

RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP

BIDDER NAME: Deloitte Consulting

DATE: 04/16/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sandra Royce

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DAFS – Office of the State Controller

4. *Litigation*

- *Statement provided, but no list of cases – if there are any.*

•

5. *Financial Viability*

- *Provided – large firm with multiple offices across the states.*

•

6. *Licensure/Certification*

- *Provided*

•

7. *Certificate of Insurance*

- *Provided*

•

III. *Proposed Services*

1. *Services to be Provided*

- *Given many years of experience with the State of Maine there will be no ramp up time and can hit the ground running. Given the short time frame, this is critical.*
- *In depth understanding of the State MaineCare system.*
- *Consistent track record of successful and timely reporting.*
- *No issue with the Office of the State Auditor with previous year's reports.*
- *Detailed proposed services and the data security info was helpful.*
- *The ability to do recast analysis is very helpful in measuring accuracy of previous years reports.*

2. *Implementation – Work Plan*

- *Excellent detailed work plan by task, timeframe and staff level.*
- *Will provide all reporting requirements and the low-mid-high IBNP reserve as we require.*

IV. *Cost Proposal*

- *Provided*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402054

RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP

BIDDER NAME: Deloitte Consulting, LLP

DATE: 04/23/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Stacey Thomas

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DAFS – Office of the State Controller

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department’s RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Preliminary Information

1. Proposal Cover Page

- *Provided and signed*

2. Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification

- *Provided and signed*

3. Eligibility Requirements

- *The supervising actuary must meet the American Academy of Actuaries Qualification Standards and be a Fellow or an Associate of the Society of Actuaries or an Associate of the Society of Actuaries, etc.*
 - *All the proposed key actuaries maintain their credentials with the American Academy of Actuaries (AAA),*
- *The Bidder must have direct experience providing IBNP actuarial valuation services for at least two (2) other state governments*
 - *Listed two (2) projects with direct experience providing IBNP actuarial valuation services – State of New York Department of Health and State of Georgia Medicaid IBNR Valuation*
- *The Bidder must have at least ten (10) years of experience providing services similar to those described in this RFP*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402054

RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP

BIDDER NAME: Deloitte Consulting, LLP

DATE: 04/23/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Stacey Thomas

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DAFS – Office of the State Controller

- *Engagement Principal, Senior Project Leader and Subject Matter experts have extensive experience ranging from 35 years to 11 years.*

II. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- *National firm with presence in most states.*
- *Deloitte health actuary group has assisted various states and health plans with IBNP and IBNR estimates for Medicaid programs.*
- *Has deep knowledge and experience in Maine's Medicaid programs and services which extends to over 18 years.*

2. Subcontractors

- *No plans to use a subcontractor*

3. Organization Chart

- *Provided*
- *Available members for the project are identified, as well as their planned roles and relevant experience*

4. Litigation

- *Had a general statement regarding litigation and they (Deloitte) do not believe that it will affect their ability to provide consulting services. The State of Maine has worked extensively with Deloitte in the past with no issues.*

5. Financial Viability

- *Provided a balance sheet.*
- *Since Deloitte's US firms are privately-owned companies, they do not have audited financial statements, however, the US Firm's privately placed debt carries an NAIC 1 designation which is NAIC 1 highest designation; comparable to an A or better rating from one of the nationally recognized rating agencies*

6. Licensure/Certification

- *All key members of the actuary group maintain credentials with the American Academy of Actuaries, Casualty Actuarial Society*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402054

RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP

BIDDER NAME: Deloitte Consulting, LLP

DATE: 04/23/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Stacey Thomas

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DAFS – Office of the State Controller

*(CAS), Society of Actuaries (SOA) and/or Conference of
Consulting Actuaries (CCA)*

7. Certificate of Insurance

- *Workers Compensation, Employer's Liability and Professional Indemnity Insurance through Continental Casualty Company and North American Capacity Ins Co*

III. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- *Has extensive experience with the data and knowledge of the valuation process.*
- *Has worked with the State since 2005. Deloitte has in-depth experience with the warehousing data, analyzing data, MaineCare programs, processes and reporting.*
- *Can handle tasks efficiently with no transition time and has substantial historical information to evaluate the current IBNP estimates. .*

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- *Has worked with the State of Maine for many years and has a comprehensive plan*
- *Work plan provided in a timeline chart with proposed deadline for deliverables to be early October*
- *Detail explanation of each step of the work plan and position responsible for completing those steps.*

IV. Cost Proposal

- *Cost proposal provided for all periods (initial and renewal periods)*
- *Initial periods: Not to exceed \$71,000 per year. Renewal periods: Not to exceed \$74,000 per year*
- *Does not appear to include any costs related to the preparation of this submission or the negotiation of contract with the State.*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402054

RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP

BIDDER NAME: Milliman, Inc

DATE: 04/16/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brad Rodrigue

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DAFS – Office of the State Controller

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department’s RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Preliminary Information

1. Proposal Cover Page

- Provided and signed*

2. Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification

- Provided and signed*

3. Eligibility Requirements

- The supervising actuary must meet the American Academy of Actuaries Qualification Standards and be a Fellow or an Associate of the Society of Actuaries or an Associate of the Society of Actuaries, etc.*
 - a. Both David Koenig and Michael Polakowski are fellows of the Society of Actuaries and meet the American Academy of Actuaries Qualifications for issuing Statements of Actuarial Opinions*
- The Bidder must have direct experience providing IBNP actuarial valuation services for at least two (2) other state governments*
 - a. The bidder has provided justification of direct experience providing IBNP actuarial valuation services for at least two other state governments, which include the State of Idaho, Department of Health and Welfare, as well as the State of Washington, Department of Social and Health Services*
- The Bidder must have at least ten (10) years of experience providing services similar to those described in this RFP*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402054

RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP

BIDDER NAME: Milliman, Inc

DATE: 04/16/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brad Rodrigue

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DAFS – Office of the State Controller

- a. *The two supervising actuaries, David Koenig and Michael Polakowski have 14 years and 16 years respectively experience with IBNP analysis which includes experience related to Medicaid and Medicare.*

II. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- *Three projects presented. All seem to involve the required IBNP analysis including estimating the Incurred but not Paid (IBNP) liabilities.*
- *Two projects appear to involve State level IBNP experience.*
- *One project involved providing a Statement of Actuarial Opinion for each health insurer under the parent company's (Centene) umbrella. Not sure this is related to any State level project, but the project does demonstrate their experience and expertise in performing these services.*

2. Subcontractors

- *No plans to use a subcontractor*

3. Organization Chart

- *Provided*
- *Available members for the project are identified, though clear roles do not appear to be identified with respect to the proposed engagement*

4. Litigation

- *The Seattle Health practice, the office involved in this engagement, has not been involved in any litigation related to the services contemplated in their proposal*

5. Financial Viability

- *Dunn & Bradstreet Information Report Snapshot provided*
- *Per the report, appears to be low-Moderate risk with overall assessment as "Stable Condition" and perceived sustainability of the company as "Likelihood of Continued Operations"*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402054

RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP

BIDDER NAME: Milliman, Inc

DATE: 04/16/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brad Rodrigue

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DAFS – Office of the State Controller

6. Licensure/Certification

- *Provided an IRS certification verifying that it is a US Corporation*
- *No license information provided related to the actuarially services that will be provided?*
- *Do we ask for the actuary license information? This was already provided (via print screen of Actuarial Directory) in the first section (Preliminary Information)*

7. Certificate of Insurance

- *Provided – up to \$1 million in liability insurance per occurrence*

III. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- *Milliman's claim liability estimates are based on the actuarial completion factor method that develops monthly completion factors based on past claim payment patterns, paired with the projection method that estimates the total incurred amount based on historical claim costs and expected trends.*
- *Deliverables will be delivered as a letter that will provide their best estimate reserve (mid-level reserve estimate), along with a low and high estimate.*

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- *Work plan provided in a timeline chart with proposed deadline for deliverables to be October 2024*
- *No breakdown of individuals within Milliman that would be performing each tasks*

IV. Cost Proposal

- *Cost proposal provided for all periods (initial and renewal periods)*
- *Initial periods: \$43,000; \$37,000; \$39,000; Renewal periods: \$41,000; \$43,000; \$45,000*
- *Does not appear to include any costs related to the preparation of this submission or the negotiation of contract with the State.*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402054

RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP

BIDDER NAME: Milliman, Inc

DATE: 04/16/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sandra Royce

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DAFS – Office of the State Controller

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department’s RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Preliminary Information

1. Proposal Cover Page

- *Provided*

•

2. Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification

- *Provided*

•

3. Eligibility Requirements

- *State of Idaho work appears to meet the direct IBNP actuarial services required.*
- *State of Washington work appears to be related to the school system IBNP vs the State Medicaid program. (Does appear to qualify since it is IBNP related - but not to the level of Medicaid IBNP).*

II. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- *Company background included. Excellent service has been provided by them for numerous years.*
- *Secure portal established to transfer data.*

2. Subcontractors

- *Not planning to use subcontractors.*

•

3. Organization Chart

- *Provided*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402054

RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP

BIDDER NAME: Milliman, Inc

DATE: 04/16/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sandra Royce

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DAFS – Office of the State Controller

4. Litigation

- *Provided*

5. Financial Viability

- *Financial Stress – was rated as moderate risk, but overall was low to moderate.*

6. Licensure/Certification

- *Provided for each proposed engagement member.*
-
-

7. Certificate of Insurance

- *Provided*

III. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- *Provided – but very little detail included.*
- *Requesting 4 years of data may be difficult for DHHS to provide.*
- *Deliverables will provide the low-mid-high IBNP reserve as we require. No mention of tables being provided.*

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- *Timeline shows they will meet the Oct deadline but not much detail provided in the Tasks. No breakdown of responsibility by vendor/client as requested.*
- *Concerned that trying to get 4 years of data and recalc prior years IBNP along with trying to provide current year may cause issues with the scheduled delivery date.*
- *Additional time and effort will be required by DHHS to provide numerous years of data.*

IV. Cost Proposal

- *Provided*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402054

RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP

BIDDER NAME: Milliman, Inc.

DATE: 04/23/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Stacey Thomas

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DAFS – Office of the State Controller

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department’s RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Preliminary Information

1. Proposal Cover Page

- *Provided and signed*

2. Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification

- *Provided and signed*

3. Eligibility Requirements

- *The supervising actuary must meet the American Academy of Actuaries Qualification Standards and be a Fellow or an Associate of the Society of Actuaries or an Associate of the Society of Actuaries, etc.*
 - *All the proposed key actuaries maintain their credentials with the American Academy of Actuaries (AAA),*
- *The Bidder must have direct experience providing IBNP actuarial valuation services for at least two (2) other state governments*
 - *Listed two (2) projects with direct experience providing IBNP actuarial valuation services – State of Idaho, Department of Health and Human Services and State of Washington, Department of Social and Health Services*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402054

RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP

BIDDER NAME: Milliman, Inc.

DATE: 04/23/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Stacey Thomas

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DAFS – Office of the State Controller

- *The Bidder must have at least ten (10) years of experience providing services similar to those described in this RFP*
 - *The supervising actuaries, David Koenig and Michael Polakowski have over 10 years of experience with IBNP analysis (14 and 16 years, respectively)*

II. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- *Long standing business- established in 1947*
- *Nation-wide expertise.*
- *Familiarity and past experience with other government organizations and the Medicaid program*
- *Years of experience in the Medicaid program*

2. Subcontractors

- *No plans to use a subcontractor*

3. Organization Chart

- *Provided*
- *Available members for the project are identified, as well as their planned roles and relevant experience*

4. Litigation

- *Has not been involved in any litigation related to the services contemplated in this proposal.*

5. Financial Viability

- *Financial stress was scored at moderate risk*
- *Dunn & Bradstreet listed the overall assessment of the company as Stable, Continued Operations and Very-Low-Potential-For-Severely-Delinquent-Payments*

6. Licensure/Certification

- *All key members of the actuary group maintain credentials with the American Academy of Actuaries, Casualty Actuarial Society (CAS), Society of Actuaries (SOA) and/or Conference of Consulting Actuaries (CCA)*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402054

RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP

BIDDER NAME: Milliman, Inc.

DATE: 04/23/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Stacey Thomas

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DAFS – Office of the State Controller

7. Certificate of Insurance

- *Professional Indemnity Insurance through Indian Harbor Insurance Company and Various Insurance Companies*

III. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- *While the deliverable section does not mention an issuance of a Public Statement of Actuarial Opinion (PSAO) in accordance with the Qualification Standards of the American Academy of Actuaries, in the Eligibility Section of Milliman’s proposal both David Koenig and Michael Polakowski are actively engaged in IBNP reserving and issuing Public Statement of Actuarial Opinion.*
- *Acknowledge a summary report with a low and high reserve scenario. Would they also include a mid range?*
- *Acknowledge the report will have a discussion on methods, major assumptions, caveats and limitations.*
- *Will the report include tables with summary Member Month data, IBNP Recast and IBNP Summary using current year data (as indicated in Part II – SCOPE OF SERVICES TO BE PROVIDED on page 8 of the RFP?*
- *Lead Actuary will validate all deliverables have been met and will review work before release.*

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- *Work plan provided in a timeline chart with proposed deadline for deliverables to be mid-October*
- *Detail of each phase of the project and the position responsible for those tasks were documented in the “Ensuring Outcomes” section of Millian’s proposal.*

IV. Cost Proposal

- *Cost proposal provided for all periods (initial and renewal periods*
- *Initial periods: Ranged from \$37,000 to \$43,000 with the highest being in the first year. Renewal periods: Ranged from \$41,000 to \$45,000 per year*
- *Does not appear to include any costs related to the preparation of this submission or the negotiation of contract with the State.*



STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF ADMINISTRATIVE
AND FINANCIAL SERVICES – OFFICE OF
THE STATE CONTROLLER

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Kirsten LC Figueroa
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: 202402054
RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP

I, **Brad Rodrigue** accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Administrative and Financial Services – Office of the State Controller. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

Brad Rodrigue
Signature

4/17/24
Date



STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF ADMINISTRATIVE
AND FINANCIAL SERVICES – OFFICE OF
THE STATE CONTROLLER

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Kirsten LC Figueroa
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: 202402054
RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP

I, **Sandra Royce** accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Administrative and Financial Services – Office of the State Controller. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

Sandra Royce
Signature

4/17/24
Date



STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF ADMINISTRATIVE
AND FINANCIAL SERVICES – OFFICE OF
THE STATE CONTROLLER

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Kirsten LC Figueroa
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: 202402054
RFP TITLE: Actuarial Services - IBNP

I, **Stacey Thomas** accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Administrative and Financial Services – Office of the State Controller. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

Stacey Thomas
Signature

4-16-24
Date