

State of Maine
Master Score Sheet

RFP# 202402042					
Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations					
Bidder Name:		Liberty Consulting	Overland Consulting	Silverpoint Consulting	London Economics
Proposed Cost:		\$534,076	\$410,000	\$433,000	
Scoring Sections	Points Available				*Ineligible; not scored
Section I: Preliminary Information	N/A				
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	30	31	27	
Section III: Proposed Services	30	29	28	26	
Section IV: Cost Proposal	35	27	35	33	
TOTAL	<u>100</u>	<u>86</u>	<u>94</u>	<u>86</u>	
Bidder Name:					
Proposed Cost:					
Scoring Sections	Points Available				
Section I: Preliminary Information					
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience					
Section III: Proposed Services					
Section IV: Cost Proposal					
TOTAL	<u>100</u>				

Award Justification Statement
RFP# 202402042

I. Summary

The Maine Public Utilities Commission (Commission) issued this RFP seeking proposals for a consultant to conduct a management audit of Versant Power's (Versant) overall management of the company, customer service and credit and collections functions, service quality and the operation and reliability of its transmission and distribution system, and compliance with reorganization requirements ordered by the Commission. The consultant is expected to review, analyze, and provide recommendations regarding these matters, and will also provide recommendations with respect to just and reasonable levels of costs related to these matters.

II. Evaluation Process

A team of four was assembled to review the four proposals received. Sally Zeh and Michael Simmons are Director and Deputy Director, respectively, of the Electric Division. Nora Healey is an attorney with over 20 years of utility regulation experience. Joyce Horton is an analyst in the Electric Division.

First, each reviewer was given a copy of each of the four bids. Each member of the evaluation team read and reviewed each proposal and took individual evaluation notes. The team then assembled for consensus review and to consensus score each proposal. The evaluation team reviewed and assigned points to one proposal at a time by proceeding through each of the RFP's evaluation criteria, except cost. Once all proposals were consensus scored, cost information was reviewed by the team for evaluation. The proposal with the lowest bid was awarded 35 points. Proposals with higher bids values were awarded proportionately fewer points calculated in comparison with the lowest bid as discussed in the RFP.

III. Qualifications & Experience

Several factors resulted in the scoring of awarded bidder being scored favorably over other bids:

- Well established company in business since 1992 with numerous examples of relevant experience.

- Several sample projects included scopes that were directly on-point with the work being sought through this RFP.
- Project team, including subcontractors, have direct relevant experience, including New England utility experience.

IV. Proposed Services

Several factors resulted in the scoring of awarded bidder being scored favorably:

- The selected bidder's RFP response offered a succinct plan to achieve project deliverables.
- Proposal demonstrates that the selected bidder is fully prepared to defend their audit result in a Commission proceeding if necessary.
- Proposal demonstrates a clear delineation between the work and findings of a management audit versus a rate case review.
- Project timeline suggests a December 2024 target completion date. While this may be an optimistic timeline, it is ahead of schedule and should ensure the project is completed on time.

V. Cost Proposal

The cost proposal from the winning bidder, Overland Consulting, was \$410,000 which is also the lowest cost proposal received.

VI. Conclusion

The evaluation team concluded that Overland Consulting's relevant project experience, subject matter knowledge and experienced staff will provide quality services to accomplish the proposed project workplan on schedule and at a reasonable cost.



STATE OF MAINE
PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION

Philip L. Bartlett II
CHAIR

Patrick J. Scully
Carolyn C. Gilbert
COMMISSIONERS

Amy Dumeny
ADMINISTRATIVE DIRECTOR

April 25, 2024

Mr. John Antonuk, President
The Liberty Consulting Group
1451 Quentin Road, Suite 400 #343
Lebanon, PA 17042

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402042, Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

Dear Mr. Antonuk:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Public Utilities Commission for Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations. The Commission has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Commission is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Overland Consulting

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Commission will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Commission and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Commission is executed. The Commission further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Amy Dumeny".

Amy Dumeny
Administrative Director

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE
PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION

Philip L. Bartlett II
CHAIR

Patrick J. Scully
Carolyn C. Gilbert
COMMISSIONERS

Amy Dumeny
ADMINISTRATIVE DIRECTOR

April 25, 2024

Ms. Marie Fagan
London Economics International LLC
717 Atlantic Avenue, Suite 1A
Boston, MA 02111

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402042, Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

Dear Ms. Fagan:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Public Utilities Commission for Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations. The Commission has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Commission is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Overland Consulting

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Commission will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Commission and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Commission is executed. The Commission further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Amy Dumeny".

Amy Dumeny
Administrative Director

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE
PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION

Philip L. Bartlett II
CHAIR

Patrick J. Scully
Carolyn C. Gilbert
COMMISSIONERS

Amy Dumeny
ADMINISTRATIVE DIRECTOR

April 25, 2024

Mr. Howard E. Lubow
Overland Consulting
5407 West 124th Court
Overland Park, KS 66209

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402042, Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

Dear Mr. Lubow:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Public Utilities Commission for Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations. The Commission has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Commission is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Overland Consulting

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Commission will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Commission and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Commission is executed. The Commission further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Amy Dumeny".

Amy Dumeny
Administrative Director

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE
PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION

Philip L. Bartlett II
CHAIR

Patrick J. Scully
Carolyn C. Gilbert
COMMISSIONERS

Amy Dumeny
ADMINISTRATIVE DIRECTOR

April 25, 2024

Ms. Stephanie Vavro, Principal
Silverpoint Consulting LLC
1519 Whispering Woods Circle
Allentown, PA 18106

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402042, Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

Dear Ms. Vavro:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Public Utilities Commission for Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations. The Commission has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Commission is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Overland Consulting

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Commission will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Commission and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Commission is executed. The Commission further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Amy Dumeny".

Amy Dumeny
Administrative Director

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER: Liberty Consulting

DATE: April 9, 2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Maine Public Utilities Commission

Name of RFP Coordinator: Celeste Gaylord

Names of Evaluators: Sally Zeh, Michael Simmons, Nora Healy, Joyce Horton

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	X	
• Business relationships with a Maine IOU or their affiliates within the last 10 years		
• Payments made by a Maine IOU or their affiliates to the Bidder		
•		
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	30
Section III. Proposed Services	30	29
Section IV. Cost Proposal	35	27
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>86</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER: Liberty Consulting

DATE: April 9, 2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER: Liberty Consulting

DATE: April 9, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	30

Evaluation Team Comments:

- I. Overview of the Organization
 - Demonstrates numerous examples of relevant experience; deep relevant experience
 - Liberty has conducted previous audits for the Commission, including of Versant's predecessor. There may be a benefit to Liberty's familiarity with the company, but the upcoming audit may also benefit from "fresh eyes."
- II. Subcontractors
 - None proposed
- III. Organizational Chart
 - Project team clearly identified
 - Continuity of team members who performed the prior audit, who may or may not have preconceived ideas from prior experience with the company.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER: Liberty Consulting

DATE: April 9, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	30	29

Evaluation Team Comments:

- Scope of work clearly stated and consistent with RFP.
- Some areas of review may be broader than desired, but can likely be brought within scope through discussion with MPUC staff.
- Detailed list of review criteria. Well organized but rather wordy and repetitive.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER: Liberty Consulting

DATE: April 9, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal		Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
\$410,000	,	\$534,076	x	35 points	=	27

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER: London Economics

DATE: April 9, 2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Maine Public Utilities Commission

Name of RFP Coordinator: Celeste Gaylord

Names of Evaluators: Sally Zeh, Michael Simmons, Nora Healy, Joyce Horton

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)		X
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Business relationships with a Maine IOU or their affiliates within the last 10 years • Payments made by a Maine IOU or their affiliates to the Bidder • 		
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	N/A
Section III. Proposed Services	30	N/A
Section IV. Cost Proposal	35	N/A
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>N/A</u>

****PROPOSAL WAS NOT SCORED. PLEASE SEE "EVALUATION OF SECTION I" COMMENTS.**

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER: London Economics

DATE: April 9, 2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

LEI did not specifically disclose work for Versant's parent company, ENMAX, as instructed in Appendix C to the RFP. However, sample project three is a project for ENMAX. The evaluation team believes that the work conducted for ENMAX is closely enough related to the work sought by the RFP so as to create an unacceptable conflict of interest. Thus, the evaluation team believes LEI is ineligible for this award and the proposal was not reviewed further.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER: Overland Consulting

DATE: April 9, 2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Maine Public Utilities Commission

Name of RFP Coordinator: Celeste Gaylord

Names of Evaluators: Sally Zeh, Michael Simmons, Nora Healy, Joyce Horton

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	X	
• Business relationships with a Maine IOU or their affiliates within the last 10 years		
• Payments made by a Maine IOU or their affiliates to the Bidder		
•		
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	31
Section III. Proposed Services	30	28
Section IV. Cost Proposal	35	35
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>94</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER: Overland Consulting

DATE: April 9, 2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER: Overland Consulting

DATE: April 9, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Availabl e</u>	<u>Points Awarde d</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	31

Evaluation Team Comments:

- I. Overview of the Organization
 - Substantial recent experience, including US operating company with a Canadian parent. NY PSC (Central Hudson) and CT PURA (UI, etc) projects seem particularly on point.
 - In business since 1992
 - No prior experience with MPUC

- II. Subcontractors
 - FTI Consulting. Company has New England utility experience.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER: Overland Consulting

DATE: April 9, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	30	28

Evaluation Team Comments:

- Lists a potentially optimistic December 2024 target completion date, which is ahead of what is asked for in RFP.
- Appears fully prepared to defend their audit result as part of a Commission proceeding.
- Demonstrates a mindset of distinguishing a management audit from a rate case review. This is potentially beneficial.
- Scope is potentially too broad, but can likely be focused through discussion with MPUC staff. Work plan is very specific and detailed.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER: Overland Consulting

DATE: April 9, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	.	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
\$410,000	.	\$410,000	x	35 points	=	35

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER: Silverpoint Consulting

DATE: April 9, 2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Maine Public Utilities Commission

Name of RFP Coordinator: Celeste Gaylord

Names of Evaluators: Sally Zeh, Michael Simmons, Nora Healy, Joyce Horton

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	X	
• Business relationships with a Maine IOU or their affiliates within the last 10 years		
• Payments made by a Maine IOU or their affiliates to the Bidder		
•		
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	27
Section III. Proposed Services	30	26
Section IV. Cost Proposal	35	33
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>86</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER: Silverpoint Consulting

DATE: April 9, 2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER: Silverpoint Consulting

DATE: April 9, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	27

Evaluation Team Comments:

I. Overview of the Organization

- One of the proposed team members is from Green Mountain Power. If Silverpoint is the winning proposal, would want clarification about whether that team member has an prior experience with Versant's president when he worked in Vermont. Could present a possible conflict. Would possibly need to request a change of team member.
- Relevant past experience
- Prior positive experience with MPUC unrelated to this engagement.

II. Subcontractors

- None proposed. Proposal says they have no fixed employees so a bit unclear how project is staffed – likely through contract employees as needed.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER: Silverpoint Consulting

DATE: April 9, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	30	26

Evaluation Team Comments:

- Proposal demonstrated a heavy focus on reliability and storm response, which is not the focus of this audit. Similarly, proposal lacked focus on company and parent company management. Could potentially be focused through discussion with MPUC staff.
- Services to be provided address the areas requested in RFP, but is rather generic and vague.
- Work areas two and three include assessment of company's data collection process and the integrity of data from underlying source systems.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER: Silverpoint Consulting

DATE: April 9, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	.	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
\$410,000	.	\$433,000	x	35 points	=	33

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER NAME: Liberty

DATE: April 9, 2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Nora Healy

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

Individual Evaluator Comments: - Liberty

Directions: Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.

- I. *Organization Qualifications and Experience*
 1. *Overview of Organization*
 - *File 1 = P*
 - *P = Past audit of Emera Maine - 2016*
 - *P and N? = Prior work for MPUC generally*
 - *P = Deep, relevant experience*
 2. *Subcontractors*
 - *No*
 3. *Organizational Chart*
 4. *Etc.*

- II. *Proposed Services*
 1. *Services to be Provided*
 - *P=Detailed evaluation criteria specified for each topic*

 2. *Implementation – Work Plan*
 - *P=Complete in early 2025*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER NAME: Liberty Consulting

DATE: 4/3/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Joyce Horton

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Directions: *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 1. Overview of Organization
 - Liberty outlines all their previous experience with mgmt & ops audits, have plenty of experience with utilities all over the country. Have completed an audit for Maine (CMP).
 - Liberty completed in 2021 an engagement for the Maine Public Utilities Commission, consisting of a management audit of Central Maine Power's organization and management structure and whether the services provided to it by affiliates are in the best interests of Maine customers.
 - Michigan Public Utilities Commission engaged Liberty in 2023 to perform management audits of both of Michigan's investor-owned electric distribution companies
 - Illinois Commerce Commission Grid Plan Work selected liberty to perform an engagement designed to provide an objective and complete description of the history over the 10-year period from 2012 – 2021 of capital and operations and maintenance activities and expenditures of Commonwealth Edison (ComEd) and Ameren Illinois (Ameren)
 2. Subcontractors
 - No subcontractors to be used
 3. Organizational Chart
 - Included, very comprehensive

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER NAME: Liberty Consulting

DATE: 4/3/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Joyce Horton

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

4. *Litigation*

- *None*

5. *Financial Viability*

- *Liberty does not offer financial statements at the proposal level*

6. *Licensure/Certification*

- *N/A*

7. *Certificate of Insurance*

- *Provided*

II. *Proposed Services*

1. *Services to be Provided*

- *Highly detailed and well organized but wordy and repetitive*
- *Shows knowledge of Versant structure and outlines tasks*
- *Breaks goal into smaller goals and goes into great detail on how to target them*
- *Lists a set of conditions/commitments to be examined for compliance*

2. *Implementation – Work Plan*

- *LC identifies the team members that would work on each area. Feels overly wordy and slightly repetitive. Draft due by Feb 21, 2025; final due by March 21, 2025.*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER NAME: Liberty

DATE: 3/27/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: M Simmons

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Liberty provided relevant experience and references.
- Significant experience working in Maine & knowledge of ME utilities.

2. Subcontractors

- N/A

3. Organizational Chart

- Project team is clearly identified.
- Team members have continuity with prior audit.
- Team members may have preconceived ideas based on past experience with the utility.

4. Etc.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Scope of work is clearly stated and consistent with the RFP.
- Provided definitions, study guidelines, evaluation criteria, and work activities for each task.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- Work plan would conclude in March 2025
- Nearly 1,700 hours of work reflects the robust scope of work.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER NAME: Liberty Consulting Group

DATE: April 3, 2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sally Zeh

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

- *Overview of Organization*
 - Many years of management audit experience, including for MPUC.
 - Example projects highlighted are not precisely on point, although they clearly have the experience necessary to perform this work.

- *Subcontractors*
 - No subcontractors are proposed

- *Organizational Chart*
 - Experienced project team

II. Proposed Services

- *Services to be Provided*
 - Proposed scope reflects an accurate understanding of desired audit.
 - Logical, although generic, approach proposed
 -

- *Implementation – Work Plan*
 - Proposed work plan covers all areas required by RFP, but as described may not be 100% on-point.
 - Appears to have some focus on affiliate services that are not specifically part of the scope of this audit.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER NAME: Liberty Consulting Group

DATE: April 3, 2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sally Zeh

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

- Customer Service and T&D Operation and Reliability review is perhaps broader than desired, but can likely be brought within scope through discussion with MPUC staff
- Clear and detailed evaluation criteria and work activities provided
- Anticipated Completion Feb 2024 with estimated 1688 hours

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER NAME: London Economics

DATE: April 9, 2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Nora Healy

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

Individual Evaluator Comments: London Economics

Directions: Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- *File 1 = P*
- *N=Description of Project 2 is messed up. Is a MI project but gave Eric Bryant and Maine PUC as client contact*
- *N=Project 3, LEI worked for ENMAX on PBR-DQ?*
- *P=Have worked with Marie Fagan in past – good working relationship*

2. Subcontractors

-
-
-

3. Organizational Chart

4. Etc.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

-
-
-

2. Implementation – Work Plan

-
-

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER NAME: London Economics

DATE: 4/3/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Joyce Horton

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Directions: *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Over 25 yrs experience in the NE market (has worked with MPUC, OPA, ISO-NE) but do not specify in what capacity, except for MPUC.
- They mention "numerous engagements which involve Management Audits" in Louisiana, Mississippi, and Ohio, not sure what "numerous engagements involving ..." means, have they done management audits or not?
- Served as contractor on docket 2022-00038, INVESTIGATION OF CMP MANAGEMENT ISSUES AND RELATED RATEMAKING AND PERFORMANCE INCENTIVE MECHANISMS
- Conducted annual fuel procurement and management audit of Entergy Mississippi (under Eric Bryant)
- Assisted with ENMAX performance based ratemaking audit
- Dates were not included and it seemed lacking and vague

2. Subcontractors

- LEI does not address this

3. Organizational Chart

- Included

4. Litigation

- Not involved in any litigation

5. Financial Viability

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER NAME: London Economics

DATE: 4/3/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Joyce Horton

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

- *LEI will provide financial statements if LEI is awarded the audit, and a contract is signed with the Commission*
- 6. *Licensure/Certification*
 - *LEI does not address this requirement*
- 7. *Certificate of Insurance*
 - *Included*

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- *Vague proposal, does not go into specifics. Includes a variety of trivial figures that do not add to proposal.*

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- *Unrealistic tandem work ie. LEI proposes to engage in meetings for entire contract duration, even during audit report finalization; no specificity in regards to actual dates; does not indicate which staff would be working on which tasks; Gives a vague date of Mar 2025 for finalizing audit report.*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER NAME: London Economics

DATE: 3/27/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: M Simmons

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- LEI has extensive experience working with the MPUC.
- LEI has demonstrated limited management audit experience.
- One of the project experience references was from work for ENMAX. Did they disclose?

2. Subcontractors

- N/A

3. Organizational Chart

- Org chart included but did not include CV for project team. Only three individuals were identified.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Described the approach to the four areas for evaluation.
- The strongest area seems to be the overall management structure, less sure about customer service and reliability areas of focus.
- Comparative and quantitative assessment included.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- Tasks are adequate.
- Final Report in March 2025.
- LEI Provided a draft outline of the Final Report.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER NAME: London Economics, Inc

DATE: April 3 2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sally Zeh

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Experience seems more focused on markets than on management audits, although they have identified management audit experience.
- Past experience with MPUC
- Example projects are not precisely on-point. Seem more focused on ratemaking.
- Prior experience with ENMAX (Versant's parent company). Note that this was disclosed as an example project and not as a specific disclosure of prior work for the utility or an affiliate. Need to consider whether this presents a conflict of interest. Timing of that engagement is not identified.

2. Subcontractors

- No subcontractors identified

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Scope of work described is somewhat vague.
- Perhaps too focused on the merger case and not on the other areas of concern identified in the RFP. Some other areas, e.g. operation and reliability of T&D system not precisely on point. Could possibly be focused correctly with direction from MPUC staff.
- Proposed audit techniques seem reasonable, albeit generic.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- Work plan is rather generic, but logical.
- Anticipates conclusion in March 2024.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER NAME: Overland

DATE: April 9, 2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Nora Healy

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments: Overland

Directions: *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

I. *Organization Qualifications and Experience*

1. *Overview of Organization*

- *File 1 = P*
- *File = P – Substantial, recent experience with utility management audits and mergers. Experience includes US utilities with Canadian parent;*
- *I= ringfencing conditions-empirical model*

2. *Subcontractors*

- *I = Relationship with FTI Consulting*

3. *Organizational Chart*

- *P=In business since 1992*

4. *Etc.*

II. *Proposed Services*

1. *Services to be Provided*

- *P= Overland is fully prepared and committed to defending the audit report in administrative proceedings before the Commission*
- *P=Monthly written status reports and other regular check-ins*
- *T&D Asset Analysis – Do we need this given EPE's work?*
- *P = "The type of analysis performed in management audit reviews is not and cannot necessarily be directly associated with the review*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER NAME: Overland

DATE: April 9, 2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Nora Healy

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

*in rate proceedings leading to revenue requirement
determinations."*

2. *Implementation – Work Plan*

- *Q=Complete by end of year?*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER NAME: Overland Consulting

DATE: 4/3/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Joyce Horton

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Directions: *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 1. Overview of Organization
 - Have performed management and operations audits of Central Hudson Gas & Electric, NY State Electric & Gas, Rochester Gas & Electric, Public Service Gas & Electric Company, South Jersey Gas Company, Atlantic City Electric. Have also performed numerous other audits.
 2. Subcontractors
 - FTI Consulting team members included in proposed project team.
Info included
 3. Organizational Chart
 - Included
 4. Litigation
 - Not involved in any litigation
 5. Financial Viability
 - Overland has never been required to produce financial statements to any third party in connection with performing consulting services. We have no debt and do not provide financial statements to banks or other financial institutions.
 6. Licensure/Certification
 - N/A
 7. Certificate of Insurance
 - Included

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER NAME: Overland Consulting

DATE: 4/3/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Joyce Horton

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- *Audit will follow standards set by NARUC, prepared to defend audit in proceeding, lay out a set of tasks for preliminary review, have set in place a problem ID and resolution process. Proposal is well organized.*
- *Overland provides detailed deliverable targets. They explain format and methodologies for each of the services they intend to provide*
- *Overland identifies the metrics (set in merger condition 18) it will evaluate against the condition's methodologies (call answer time (service level), call abandonment rate and billing error rate, CAIDI, SAIFI)*
- *Overland lays out a work plan and goes into specifics without bogging down with too much detail*
- *Overland again lays out a plan and identifies individual metrics(SAIDI, SAIFI, CAIDI) for this deliverable. Briefly covers veg mgmt.*

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- *Overland goes into great detail to outline their proposed timeline. They include individual team members and list how many hours they would be working on each task area. Very thorough. They also propose an aggressive timeline which would yield a draft by Oct 2024 (MPUC proposed date of Feb 21, 2025) and a final report by Dec 2024 (MPUC proposed date Mar 21, 2025).*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER NAME: Overland Consulting

DATE: 3/27/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: M Simmons

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- *Significant relevant management audit experience.*
- *Project sheets were on point. UI specifically is relevant.*
- *Demonstrated understanding of the RFP.*

2. Subcontractors

- *FTI Consulting. Regulatory and energy industry experience. (Lorvig, Finance, Hassett, PMP)*
- *FTI has New England utility experience.*

3. Organizational Chart

- *Org chart included and separated out the technical, customer service and corporate governance functions.*

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- *Clear understanding of the RFP*
- *Robust summary of the tasks to be performed.*
- *Clear demonstration of how Overland will conduct itself.*

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- *Work plan is very specific.*
- *Hours by individual and task provided.*
- *RFP deadline met or exceeded. Optimistic, but possibly helpful for rate case.*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER NAME: Overland Consulting

DATE: April 3, 2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sally Zeh

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Relevant, recent management audit experience for other PUCs, including review of governance, operations and customer service/billing functions.
- NY PSC (Central Hudson) and CT PURA (UI, etc) projects seem particularly on point.
- Proposed project staff appears to have extensive relevant audit experience.

2. Subcontractors

- Proposes use of subcontractors as part of project team.
- Appears Overland has engaged the subcontractor firm in the past, and has also provided support as a subcontractor itself for the same company.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- General approach seems logical and comprehensive, albeit generic to management audit engagements in general which may be as expected.
- The technical phase is described as "we will verify compliance with applicable state and federal statutes, MPUC requirements and other regulatory policies that govern utility operations within the scope of this review, such as the Stipulations in the Commission's

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER NAME: Overland Consulting

DATE: April 3, 2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sally Zeh

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

Versant Power merger order” Will Overland give too little focus on general management effectiveness?

- State they will conduct reviews of accounting and management procedures and internal controls, but not explained in detail.
- Proposes monthly written status reports to MPUC staff, and informal updates at least weekly.
- Seems to have a plan to deal with challenges like schedule delay, scope changes, etc.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- Proposed work plan addresses all areas identified in RFP, including management and ENMAX efficiency and effectiveness. Customer service and T&D operations and compliance with merger conditions work plans are very broad, which may be okay but might need to be focused by Staff input.
- Proposed schedule has final report to staff in December 2024. This may be desirable.
- Total ~1400 project hours.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER NAME: Silverpoint

DATE: April 9, 2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Nora Healy

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

Individual Evaluator Comments: Silverpoint

Directions: Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.

- I. *Organization Qualifications and Experience*
 1. *Overview of Organization*
 - *File 1 = P*
 - *I = No fixed employees*
 - *N=Carolyn Anderson – p. 5 - Was chief compliance officer at GMP and may have worked closely with John Flynn. Would need to understand the relationship if any.*
 2. *Subcontractors*
 - *None*
 3. *Organizational Chart*
 4. *Etc.*

- II. *Proposed Services*
 1. *Services to be Provided*
 - *P=Sufficient detail; covers the subjects decently*

 2. *Implementation – Work Plan*
 - *P=Sufficient detail; complete first quarter of 2024/5*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER NAME: Silverpoint Consulting

DATE: 4/3/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Joyce Horton

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Directions: *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

I. **Organization Qualifications and Experience**

1. **Overview of Organization**

- They have no fixed employees, they don't go into detail as to how they procure team members other than "Silverpoint selects talented individuals with expertise and proficiency appropriate for the specific engagement who also have a demonstrated history of successful collaboration"
- Performed management performance audit of Rockland Electric on behalf of the New Jersey Board of Public Utilities
- Recently served as subcontractor to NorthStar Consulting on a focused management audit of Consolidated Edison Company of New York (CECONY) and Orange and Rockland (O&R) on behalf of the New York Public Service Commission.
- Investigated utility preparation, response, operational performance, and communications during a February 2021 winter weather event on behalf of the Arkansas Public Service Commission.

2. **Subcontractors**

- No subcontractors to be used

3. **Organizational Chart**

- Included

4. **Litigation**

- Silverpoint is not involved in any litigation.

5. **Financial Viability**

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER NAME: Silverpoint Consulting

DATE: 4/3/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Joyce Horton

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

- *Silverpoint is a sole member limited liability company and does not have independent audited financial statements. (Silverpoint is treated as a disregarded entity for federal tax purposes. Upon request, Silverpoint can provide copies of Schedule C Profit or Loss from a Business from the owner's federal tax filings.)*

6. *Licensure/Certification*

- *N/A*

7. *Certificate of Insurance*

- *Included*

II. *Proposed Services*

1. *Services to be Provided*

- *Shows a deep knowledge of Versant and management audits.*
- *Provides a thorough scope of work, with concrete targets and goals.*
- *Touches on all subjects required by RFP, little vague*
- *SP lists reliability and service quality benchmarks (CAIDI, SAIFI, % calls answered in 30 secs, % calls abandoned, bill error rate, estimated bills, field service requests along with targets per RC and merger stipulation) that it plans to use if awarded. Has cohesive workplan.*
- *SP would also conduct tech orientation to learn more about metering tech to include AMI.*
- *Would conduct a technical orientation session with Versant and lays out topics of discussion. Seems very thorough (mention PMI & PMBOK framework & standards, curious to know what Silverpoint's experience with it is). Goes into great detail of veg mgmt, putting forward a plan on how to approach the topic.*
- *Silverpoint lists all revised stipulation conditions and plans to determine whether versant followed all aspects*

2. *Implementation – Work Plan*

- *Schedule a bit vague but does mention they would collaborate with staff to create a more detailed schedule. Looks like they have identified a team in spite of them not having fixed employees. SP would deliver a draft report in February and the final report by March 21, 2024 (?).*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER NAME: Silverpoint Consulting

DATE: 4/3/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: M Simmons

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 1. Overview of Organization
 - Natural gas procurement experience with the MPUC.
 - Relevant experience with other PUC.
 - Considerable focus on reliability / resiliency and corresponding spending levels. Also storm response.
 2. Subcontractors
 - N/A
 3. Organizational Chart
 - Organizational chart provided with responsible leads identified.
 - All team members have utility executive experience.

- II. Proposed Services
 1. Services to be Provided
 - Services reflect understanding of the RFP.
 - Tasks are broken down into useful phases.
 - Not overly focused on the management / corporate relationship.
 2. Implementation – Work Plan
 - Heavy focus on the reliability ops section. Experience with VM audits.
 - review plans in Work Areas Two and Three will incorporate an assessment of the company's data collection process and the integrity of data from underlying source systems.
 - 1500 total hours.
 - Project schedule ends March 21, 2024 (sic).

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Evaluate Utility Management and Operations

BIDDER NAME: Silverpoint Consulting

DATE: April 3, 2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sally Zeh

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

- *Overview of Organization*
 - Appears to have extensive management audit experience
 - Prior work for MPUC on a topic unrelated to this engagement
 - Example projects demonstrate related experience
- *Subcontractors*
 - Not proposing use of subcontractors.
- *Organizational Chart*
 - Experienced team proposed.

II. Proposed Services

- *Services to be Provided*
 - Rather generic, but logical and addresses areas required by RFP.
- *Implementation – Work Plan*
 - Seems to have a focus on board of director's effectiveness which may not be precisely on-point. In general, work area one may not be precisely on-point
 - Logical and detailed work plan
 - Expected final report in March 2025, with 1500 hours.



STATE OF MAINE
MAINE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Phillip L. Bartlett, II
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: CONSULTING SERVICES TO EVALUATE UTILITY MANAGEMENT AND OPERATIONS

I, (print name at right) Nora Henry

_____ accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Public Utilities Commission I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

Nora Henry

3/26/24

Signature

Date



STATE OF MAINE
MAINE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Phillip L. Bartlett, II
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: CONSULTING SERVICES TO EVALUATE UTILITY MANAGEMENT AND
OPERATIONS

I, (print name at right) Joyce Horton, accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Public Utilities Commission I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

Signature

3/25/24

Date



STATE OF MAINE
MAINE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Philip L. Bartlett, II
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT

RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: CONSULTING SERVICES TO EVALUATE UTILITY MANAGEMENT AND OPERATIONS

I, (print name at right)

Michael Simmons

_____ accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Public Utilities Commission I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

Michael Simmons

Signature

3/27/2024

Date



STATE OF MAINE
MAINE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Philip L. Bartlett, II
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: 202402042

RFP TITLE: CONSULTING SERVICES TO EVALUATE UTILITY MANAGEMENT AND OPERATIONS

I, Sally Zeh accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Public Utilities Commission I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

Sally Zeh
Signature

3/25/2024
Date