

**State of Maine**  
**Master Score Sheet**

RFP# 202402026						
Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel						
Bidder Name:		Love Fisheries (F/V Titan)	Balzano (F/V Northern Lights)	Robert Michael (F/V Robert Michael)	Dana Hammond II (F/V Nicole Leigh)	
Proposed Cost:		\$304,000	\$328,125	\$345,000	\$358,125	
Scoring Sections	Points Available					
Section I: Preliminary Information	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	35	35	35	35	35
Section III: Proposed Services	40	40	40	38	35	35
Section IV: Cost Proposal	25	25	23.2	22	21.2	21.2
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>98.2</u></b>	<b><u>95</u></b>	<b><u>93.2</u></b>	<b><u>93.2</u></b>
Bidder Name:		Jordan Lynn (F/V Jocka)	Geodynamics (R/V Shackleford)	Spear Fisheries (F/V Jacalwa)	Lynn & William Inc (F/V Lynn William)	
Proposed Cost:		\$312,500	\$935,000	\$454,000	\$1,458,000	
Scoring Sections	Points Available					
Section I: Preliminary Information	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	34	34	35	25	25
Section III: Proposed Services	40	30	40	30	40	40
Section IV: Cost Proposal	25	24.3	8.1	16.7	5.2	5.2
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>88.3</u></b>	<b><u>82.1</u></b>	<b><u>81.7</u></b>	<b><u>70.2</u></b>	<b><u>70.2</u></b>

<b>Bidder Name:</b>		<b>Lynn &amp; William Inc (F/V William Lynn)</b>	<b>Lynn &amp; William Inc (F/V Patriot)</b>		
<b>Proposed Cost:</b>		<b>\$1,500,000</b>	<b>\$1,596,000</b>		
<b>Scoring Sections</b>	<b>Points Available</b>				
Section I: Preliminary Information	N/A	N/A	N/A		
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	25	25		
Section III: Proposed Services	40	40	40		
Section IV: Cost Proposal	25	5.1	4.8		
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>70.1</u></b>	<b><u>69.8</u></b>		

**Award Justification Statement**  
**RFP# 202402026 - Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**

**I. Summary**

The State of Maine is seeking proposals to hire a commercial fishing vessel or vessels capable of 4-5 day duration trips conducting 24-hour operations up to 60 miles offshore to conduct seafloor sonar mapping surveys in the Gulf of Maine. An estimated 840 square nautical miles are expected to be completed in multiple trips to the proposed survey areas east of Cashes Ledge and south of Jeffreys Bank, located approximately 60 miles south of Boothbay Harbor, Maine, 75 miles east-southeast of Portland, Maine, and 100 miles east of Gloucester, Massachusetts.

**II. Evaluation Process**

Submitted applications for this RFP were evaluated by a panel of four with expertise in configuring vessels for sonar seafloor mapping, fisheries trawl surveys, State of Maine vessel contracts, business operations, and finance and grants management. Proposals were scored according to a standardized rubric, as stated in the RFP document. Applications were reviewed by the evaluators individually, and the evaluators convened on April 17<sup>th</sup> and April 19<sup>th</sup> to reach a group consensus on how to score each proposal. After viewing the top-scoring vessel in person to confirm suitability, the evaluation panel finalized their scoring. Love Fisheries, Inc. was the highest scoring Bidder and was determined to provide best value to the State of Maine.

**III. Qualifications & Experience**

For this scored section, the evaluation panel was looking for applicants with:

- Knowledge and experience with commercial fishing in the Gulf of Maine.
- Experience collaborating with scientific agencies or nonprofit entities for the purpose of marine research.

All but one applicant reported extensive experience in Gulf of Maine fisheries, and most reported past experience collaborating in scientific research. Five of the 10 bidders received the full 35 points for this section, with some bidders receiving fewer points because they lacked science support experience, or did not specify what their science support experience entailed. One bidder did not report commercial fishing experience in the Gulf of Maine.

**IV. Proposed Services**

For this scored section, the evaluation panel was primarily assessing the suitability of the applicant's vessel for the multi-day continuous sonar survey efforts. Vessels were evaluated across many different criteria, as outlined in Appendix F, but some of the primary criteria of concern for the evaluation committee included:

- Inspection or certification demonstrating the ability to work >50 miles from shore.

- A wheelhouse that has ample room to mount a hydrographer workstation and accommodate a wildlife observer in addition to the captain.
- A boat interior that is comfortable and well equipped to host 4 DMR scientists for multi-day trips, including sufficient water, space, and cooking facilities.
- A private, enclosed head.
- A suitable cruising speed to reach offshore survey sites (55+ miles offshore).
- The ability to mount the sonar and associated equipment needed for offshore mapping surveys.
- Outriggers or stabilizers to dampen boat motion and improve sonar data acquisition.

All of the applicants had suitable vessels for seafloor mapping, but not every vessel could support a crew of 6 for multi-day operations. Not every vessel was certified for operations beyond 50 miles from shore. Not every boat met the suite of needs, including bunk space, power and water supplies, or vessel stability, or the applications lacked sufficient detail to assess these factors. The awarded vessel was the largest vessel with a history of and experience with science support that also provided sufficient bunk space, abundant freshwater supplies, a large workspace in the cabin, and has a captain and crew with operational credentials and licenses.

## V. Cost Proposal

Cost proposal scoring is calculated according to the following formula.

$$(\text{Lowest proposal cost} / \text{Current proposal cost}) \times 25 \text{ pts}$$

By this formula, the lowest cost proposal automatically receives the full 25 points for this section. The selected vessel in this case submitted the lowest daily rate, which combined with the second lowest onshore mobilization/demobilization day rate scales to a lowest cost proposal for the full 60-day mapping season. The other applicants for this contract had proposed costs on average \$455,075 greater than the contract recipient, with a range of \$8,500 to \$1,292,000 more than the selected vessel.

## VI. Conclusion

Based on the above criteria, Love Fisheries, Inc. was selected as the recipient of this contract. Love's vessel scored top points in all sections of the RFP scoring, and therefore received the highest overall score of the RFP applicants. No other applicant received full points in every section.



**STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF MARINE RESOURCES**

**Janet T. Mills  
Governor**

**Patrick Keliher  
Commissioner**

5/15/2024

Love Fisheries, Inc.  
Michael Love  
178 Haskell Rd.  
North Yarmouth, ME 04097

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402026,  
Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel

Dear Mr. Love:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Marine Resources for Seafloor Mapping Vessel services. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Love Fisheries, Inc.

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Jesse Minor

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads 'Jesse Minor'.

jesse.minor@maine.gov  
207-350-7816

## **STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS**

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



**STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF MARINE RESOURCES**

**Janet T. Mills  
Governor**

**Patrick Keliher  
Commissioner**

5/15/2024

Balzano LLC  
Vincent Balzano  
31 Vines Rd  
Saco, ME 04072

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402026,  
Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel

Dear Mr. Balzano:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Marine Resources for Seafloor Mapping Vessel services. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Love Fisheries, Inc.

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Jesse Minor

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Jesse Minor".

jesse.minor@maine.gov  
207-350-7816

## **STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS**

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



**STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF MARINE RESOURCES**

**Janet T. Mills  
Governor**

**Patrick Keliher  
Commissioner**

5/15/2024

Robert Michael  
18 Machigonne St.  
Portland, ME 04102

**SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402026,  
Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**

Dear Mr. Michael:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Marine Resources for Seafloor Mapping Vessel services. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Love Fisheries, Inc.

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team’s highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Jesse Minor

jesse.minor@maine.gov  
207-350-7816

## **STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS**

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



**STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF MARINE RESOURCES**

**Janet T. Mills  
Governor**

**Patrick Keliher  
Commissioner**

5/15/2024

Dana I. Hammond, II  
386 Split Rock Rd  
Bristol, ME 04539

**SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402026,  
Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**

Dear Mr. Hammond:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Marine Resources for Seafloor Mapping Vessel services. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Love Fisheries, Inc.

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Jesse Minor

jesse.minor@maine.gov  
207-350-7816

## **STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS**

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



**STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF MARINE RESOURCES**

**Janet T. Mills  
Governor**

**Patrick Keliher  
Commissioner**

5/15/2024

Jordan Linn, Inc.  
Terry Alexander  
67 Grover Ln.  
Harpwell, ME 04079

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402026,  
Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel

Dear Mr. Alexander:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Marine Resources for Seafloor Mapping Vessel services. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Love Fisheries, Inc.

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Jesse Minor

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads 'Jesse Minor'.

jesse.minor@maine.gov  
207-350-7816

## **STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS**

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



**STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF MARINE RESOURCES**

**Janet T. Mills  
Governor**

**Patrick Keliher  
Commissioner**

5/15/2024

Geodynamics, LLC  
Mike Conn  
310 A Greenfield Dr.  
Newport, NC 28570

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402026,  
Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel

Dear Mr. Conn:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Marine Resources for Seafloor Mapping Vessel services. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Love Fisheries, Inc.

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Jesse Minor

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads 'Jesse Minor'.

jesse.minor@maine.gov  
207-350-7816

## **STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS**

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



**STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF MARINE RESOURCES**

**Janet T. Mills  
Governor**

**Patrick Keliher  
Commissioner**

5/15/2024

Spear Fisheries, LLC.  
Marshall Spear  
373 Bayview St.  
Yarmouth, ME 04096

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402026,  
Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel

Dear Mr. Spear:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Marine Resources for Seafloor Mapping Vessel services. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Love Fisheries, Inc.

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Jesse Minor

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads 'Jesse Minor'.

jesse.minor@maine.gov  
207-350-7816

## **STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS**

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



**STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF MARINE RESOURCES**

**Janet T. Mills  
Governor**

**Patrick Keliher  
Commissioner**

5/15/2024

Lynn & William, Inc. (F/V Lynn William)  
Bartley W. McNeel  
83 Chase Hill Dr.  
Westbrook, ME 04092

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402026,  
Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel

Dear Mr. McNeel:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Marine Resources for Seafloor Mapping Vessel services. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Love Fisheries, Inc.

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Jesse Minor

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads 'Jesse Minor'.

jesse.minor@maine.gov  
207-350-7816

## **STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS**

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



**STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF MARINE RESOURCES**

**Janet T. Mills  
Governor**

**Patrick Keliher  
Commissioner**

5/15/2024

Lynn & William, Inc. (F/V William Lynn)  
Bartley W. McNeel  
83 Chase Hill Dr.  
Westbrook, ME 04092

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402026,  
Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel

Dear Mr. McNeel:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Marine Resources for Seafloor Mapping Vessel services. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Love Fisheries, Inc.

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Jesse Minor

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Jesse Minor".

jesse.minor@maine.gov  
207-350-7816

## **STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS**

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



**STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF MARINE RESOURCES**

**Janet T. Mills  
Governor**

**Patrick Keliher  
Commissioner**

5/15/2024

Dianne Lynn, Inc. (F/V Patriot)  
Bartley W. McNeel  
83 Chase Hill Dr.  
Westbrook, ME 04092

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402026,  
Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel

Dear Mr. McNeel:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Marine Resources for Seafloor Mapping Vessel services. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Love Fisheries, Inc.

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Jesse Minor

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Jesse Minor".

jesse.minor@maine.gov  
207-350-7816

## **STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS**

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Love Fisheries LLC**  
**DATE: 4/19/2024**

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name: MARINE RESOURCES**  
**Name of RFP Coordinator: Jesse Minor**  
**Names of Evaluators: Rebecca Peters, Peyton Benson, Caleb Hodgdon**

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>X</b>	
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>35</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>40</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>25</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Love Fisheries LLC**  
**DATE: 4/19/2024**

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

*Eligibility Requirements*

- i) Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam Michael Love has 5000 ton Master license, unlimited 3<sup>rd</sup> Mate license*
- ii) Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters provided*

Put in a complete bid

Images provided, but field trip might be necessary to evaluate the vessel.

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Love Fisheries LLC**  
**DATE: 4/19/2024**

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>35</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- I. *Organization Qualifications and Experience*
  - A. *Fishing Experience in Gulf of Maine*
    - *Scalloping, mid-water trawling, traps*
    - *Decades of experience in menhaden, urchin, sea cucumber, scallops*
    - *Crew or co-captain experience is also specified*
  - B. *Experience with Science Support*
    - *General Dynamics, unspecified defense-related work*
    - *Industry-based cod survey*
    - *GMRI, not specified*
    - *acoustic and bottom-mapping on factory trawlers*
    - *unspecified “surveys” for State of Maine out of Eastport*
- II. *Subcontractors: none listed*
- III. *Org chart. Owner/operator*
- IV. *Litigation. None listed*
- V. *Certificate of Insurance. not provided*

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026  
RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel  
BIDDER: Love Fisheries LLC  
DATE: 4/19/2024**

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>40</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

*I. Proposed Services*

*A. Vessel Suitability (incl Appendix F)*

- *66' x 22', Frank Weckesser custom built 1999*
- *7.5 kts*
- *stabilizing fins AND outriggers/birds*
- *2 gensets 20kW 90 amps and 65 kW 300 amps*
- *4-bunk state room and lockers*
- *“endless showers”, 2,000 gallons freshwater*
- *Enclosed on-deck office room*
- *12-day capability*
- *Has galley with refrigeration and cooktop/oven.*
- *Boat looks stable and comfortable*
- *Michael Love has Merchant Mariner credential; 5,000 ton Master license; 3<sup>rd</sup> Mate unlimited, Able Seaman unlimited, et*
- *Lists captain and crew (or co-captain?) experiences*
- *Specifies that boat is free to work and we have “undivided” attention*
- *Home ported in Gloucester and Portland*

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402026  
 RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel  
 BIDDER: Love Fisheries LLC  
 DATE: 4/19/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	÷	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$304,000</b>	÷	<b>\$304,000</b>	x	<b>25 points</b>	=	<b>25</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

1. *Day rate, onshore and at sea*
  - *\$304,000 total for the 60 day survey season*
  - *\$4,900/day mapping*
  - *\$2,000 day onshore*

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Balzano LLC (F/V Northern Lights)**  
**DATE: 4/19/2024**

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name: MARINE RESOURCES**  
**Name of RFP Coordinator: Jesse Minor**  
**Names of Evaluators: Rebecca Peters, Peyton Benson, Caleb Hodgdon**

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>X</b>	
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>35</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>40</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>23.2</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>98.2</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Balzano LLC (F/V Northern Lights)**  
**DATE: 4/19/2024**

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Put in a complete bid; vessel is suitable and stable and has sufficient power and electricity; plenty of fishing and science support experience.

Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam not provided  
Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters not provided

No images provided, so field trip might be necessary to evaluate the vessel.

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Balzano LLC (F/V Northern Lights)**  
**DATE: 4/19/2024**

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>35</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- I. *Organization Qualifications and Experience*
  - A. *Fishing Experience in Gulf of Maine*
    - *36 years of experience in commercial fisheries (groundfish, scallops, shrimp, whiting, herring, menhaden, lobster)*
    - *Active in management councils and panels and task forces*
  - B. *Experience with Science Support*
    - *Lots of experience with science support*
    - *GMRI/Nature Conservancy, bycatch study*
    - *Maine DMR, Shrimp study*
    - *GMRI, shrimp acoustics*
    - *30 years of science support on the water, clearly knows how to work with agencies and nonprofits*
  - ii) *No use of subcontractors*
  - iii) *Org chart is Balzano as owner/operator*
  - iv) *no mention of litigation*
  - v) *Balzano provided his current Certificate of Insurance*

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Balzano LLC (F/V Northern Lights)**  
**DATE: 4/19/2024**

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>40</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

*I. Proposed Services*

*A. Vessel Suitability (incl Appendix F)*

- 55', so possibly on the small side for this work but totally fine
- 8 kts speed
- Not a huge amount of freshwater capacity (155 gal)
- 6 bunks all together, no privacy
- Birds for stability
- 7.5 kW generator/5500 watt inverter
- Interested in working with partner vessel for offshore safety considerations
- Application was very thorough, suggesting attention to detail and knowledge of working with DMR
- Could install extra shelving for computers if needed
- Portland is home port
- Already contracted with Wind/Trawl project, potential conflict with timing of projects
- Likely would mount sonar on rail/side mount
- Less privacy for scientific crew; ability to shower?

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Balzano LLC (F/V Northern Lights)**  
**DATE: 4/19/2024**

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

---

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	÷	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$328,125</b>	÷	<b>\$304,000</b>	x	<b>25 points</b>	=	<b>23.2</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

1. *Day rate, onshore and at sea*
  - *\$328,125 total*
  - *\$5,250/day mapping for 60 days*
  - *\$2,625/day onshore for 5 days*

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Robert Michael**  
**DATE: 4/22/2024**

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name: MARINE RESOURCES**  
**Name of RFP Coordinator: Jesse Minor**  
**Names of Evaluators: Rebecca Peters, Peyton Benson, Caleb Hodgdon**

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>X</b>	
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>35</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>38</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>22</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>95</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Robert Michael**  
**DATE: 4/22/2024**

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

*Eligibility Requirements*

- i) Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam not provided*
- ii) Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters not provided*

Bid contains the other required elements.

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Robert Michael**  
**DATE: 4/22/2024**

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>35</b>

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

*Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience*

- i) Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form):*
  - A. Fishing Experience in Gulf of Maine*
    - *20+ years fishing, but fisheries are not specifically highlighted*
  - B. Experience with Science Support*
    - *17 years with MENH Trawl Survey*
    - *“well known within DMR”, not specifically described what that means*
- ii) Subcontractors not mentioned*
- iii) Org chart. Rob Tetrault is owner/operator*
- iv) Litigation. None listed*
- v) Certificate of Insurance. Not provided.*

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Robert Michael**  
**DATE: 4/22/2024**

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>38</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- A. *Vessel Suitability (incl Appendix F)*
- *54', on the small side but definitely suitable*
  - *6-7 kts, on the slow side for long transits*
  - *Outriggers/birds for stability*
  - *6 bunks, all together with little privacy*
  - *Private head and shower (might not be used frequently)*
  - *Appendix F lacks some useful detail; assures us there's "plenty" of water and power*
  - *Open to improving comfort if selected*
  - *Conscious of hygiene*
  - *Free late May – late September because of Trawl survey; might be a some conflict in our schedules*

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Robert Michael**  
**DATE: 4/22/2024**

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	÷	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$304,000</b>	÷	<b>\$345,000</b>	x	<b>25 points</b>	=	<b>22</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- I. Day rate, onshore and at sea*
- \$345,000+ for 60 days
  - \$172,500+ for 30 days
  - \$5,750/day mapping

*Onshore rate is given as TBD, so an onshore rate couldn't be used to calculate full contract cost. It is almost certainly higher than the \$345,000 listed*

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Dana Hammond II; F/V Nicole Leigh**  
**DATE: 4/22/2024**

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name: MARINE RESOURCES**  
**Name of RFP Coordinator: Jesse Minor**  
**Names of Evaluators: Rebecca Peters, Peyton Benson, Caleb Hodgdon**

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>X</b>	
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>35</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>35</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>21.2</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>93.2</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Dana Hammond II; F/V Nicole Leigh**  
**DATE: 4/22/2024**

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Bid contains required elements.

*Eligibility Requirements*

- i) proof of F/V Safety Exam was provided, although the vessel is limited to <50 nmi. Our survey areas of interest exceed those distances.*
- ii) Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters provided; this is a Documented vessel*

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Dana Hammond II; F/V Nicole Leigh**  
**DATE: 4/22/2024**

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>35</b>

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- I. *Organization Qualifications and Experience*
  - A. *Fishing Experience in Gulf of Maine*
    - *30+ years, incl offshore*
    - *Worked aboard Robert Michael (another applicant)*
  
  - B. *Experience with Science Support*
    - *ME Inshore Trawl Survey & Scallop Survey*
    - *GMRI project support*
    - *ME DEP surveys*
    - *Test-tow Cooperative Sampling for shrimp*
    - *Statoil Hywind Maine (bird/bat avian survey)*
    - *US Navy bottom surveys*
  
- Subcontractors: none listed*
- iii) *Org chart. Dana Hammond II is owner/operator.*
- iii) *Litigation. None listed*
- iv) *Certificate of Insurance was provided*

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Dana Hammond II; F/V Nicole Leigh**  
**DATE: 4/22/2024**

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>35</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- A. *Vessel Suitability (incl Appendix F)*
- *44' (small for our purposes?)*
  - *8 kts*
  - *Stabilizing fins*
  - *22 kW generator capacity*
  - *150 gallons freshwater Implementation – Work Plan (Ability to furnish crew, food, and mount gear)*
  - *Coast Guard sticker limits to <50 nm*
  - *Worked aboard Robert Michael (another applicant)*
  - *Willing to work with another partner vessel for safety (likely has Balzano in mind as he used similar language)*
  - *Pictures can be furnished on request*
  - *Berth space and head are unclear*
  - *Wheelhouse has limited space*
  - *Home port is Bristol or Portland*

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Dana Hammond II; F/V Nicole Leigh**  
**DATE: 4/22/2024**

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$304,000</b>	,	<b>\$358,125</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>25 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>21.2</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

*Day rate, onshore and at sea*

- *\$358,125 total*
- *\$5,250/day for 60 days mapping*
- *\$2,625/day onshore for 5 days*
- *Day rate is negotiable*

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Jordan Linn Inc (F/V Jocka)**  
**DATE: 4/19/2024**

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name: MARINE RESOURCES**  
**Name of RFP Coordinator: Jesse Minor**  
**Names of Evaluators: Rebecca Peters, Peyton Benson, Caleb Hodgdon**

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>X</b>	
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>34</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>30</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>24.3</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>88.3</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Jordan Linn Inc (F/V Jocka)**  
**DATE: 4/19/2024**

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

*Eligibility Requirements*

- i) Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam not provided*
- ii) Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters not provided*

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Jordan Linn Inc (F/V Jocka)**  
**DATE: 4/19/2024**

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>34</b>

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- I. *Organization Qualifications and Experience*
  - A. *Fishing Experience in Gulf of Maine*
    - *46 years fishing Gulf of Maine*
    - *Trawling and navigating*
  
  - B. *Experience with Science Support*
    - *Reports cooperative research in the past, but not past 5 years*
    - *We could ask for details if desired*
  
- ii) *Subcontractors: none mentioned*
- iii) *Org chart. Not provided; sole proprietorship*
- iv) *Litigation. None mentioned*
- v) *Certificate of Insurance. Not provided*

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Jordan Linn Inc (F/V Jocka)**  
**DATE: 4/19/2024**

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>30</b>

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- A. *Vessel Suitability (incl Appendix F)*
- 61'
  - 7.5 kts
  - Outriggers/birds
  - 2 gensets (33 and 40 kW) = abundant power
  - 4 berths; insufficient space for science team and crew
  - Uncertain freshwater capacity
  - Provided marine survey report on vessel
  - Provided good representative photos of vessel and living space
  - Details are a bit sparse on this section

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402026  
 RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel  
 BIDDER: Jordan Linn Inc (F/V Jocka)  
 DATE: 4/19/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	÷	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$304,000</b>	÷	<b>\$312,500</b>	x	<b>25 points</b>	=	<b>24.3</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

*Day rate, onshore and at sea*

- *\$312,500 for 60 days mapping and mobilization/demobilization*
- *\$5,000/day mapping*
- *\$2,500/day onshore*

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Geodynamics (R/V Shackleford)**  
**DATE: 4/19/2024**

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name: MARINE RESOURCES**  
**Name of RFP Coordinator: Jesse Minor**  
**Names of Evaluators: Rebecca Peters, Peyton Benson, Caleb Hodgdon**

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>X</b>	
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>34</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>40</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>8.1</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>82.1</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Geodynamics (R/V Shackleford)**  
**DATE: 4/19/2024**

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

*Eligibility Requirements*

- i) Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam not provided, although documentation suggests captain is licensed 100 ton or greater.*
- ii) Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters was provided*

Very thorough and professionally prepared bid

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402026  
 RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel  
 BIDDER: Geodynamics (R/V Shackelford)  
 DATE: 4/19/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>34</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

*I. Organization Qualifications and Experience*

*A. Fishing Experience in Gulf of Maine*

- *No knowledge of fishing techniques and fishing grounds in Gulf of Maine is claimed*
- *they're NC-based and do research support*
- *no fishing experience reported in bid*

*B. Experience with Science Support*

- *SSS, acoustic sonar, video samples 1-60 nmi offshore for FL Fish & Wildlife*
- *Duke Energy, survey for met buoys and floating LiDAR buoys 24-28 nmi offshore*
- *Hydrographic surveys in NC for OSW*
- *Very detailed accounting of marine research and science support across a suite of project types.*
- *Very good detail provided, and they are clearly capable of partnering with agencies for this type of work.*

*II. Org chart. Detailed org chart is provided for the vessel, crew, and connected to Geodynamics and DMR, with specific roles and qualifications defined*

*III. Litigation. None listed*

*IV. Certificate of Insurance was provided*

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Geodynamics (R/V Shackleford)**  
**DATE: 4/19/2024**

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>40</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

*A. Vessel Suitability (incl Appendix F)*

- 72.5'
- 27 kts
- Obviously a very comfortable vessel for a large team
- Very new vessel
- 2 21 kW generators
- 8 bunks, 2 heads
- Vessel fully suits the needs for this work
- No information on stabilizers
- Unsure about stability across sea states and offshore/cold water
- Already mounted with some equipment we are providing (MBES)
- Are they planning on staffing with sonar operators? That would duplicate the people we've hired for this project
- Very thorough and professional application (clearly have office staff and support for bids, unlike typical commercial fishing outfits)
- Lacks lifeboats (commonly required offshore safety equipment)

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Geodynamics (R/V Shackleford)**  
**DATE: 4/19/2024**

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$304,000</b>	,	<b>\$935,000</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>25 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>8.1</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

*Day rate, onshore and at sea*

- *\$635,000-\$935,000 total cost for 60 days*
- *\$10,000-\$15,000/day mapping (cost range not fully explained)*
- *\$7,000/day mobilization*
  
- *Cost range provided uncertainty, not sure what their actual rate would be for this work*
- *Unclear whether there is an additional charge for use of their MBES*
- *It's unclear what day rate we should use for this bid. Midpoint? Low or high? not sure what their actual rate would be.*
- *Would they expect day rate for days they are not working?*

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Spear Fisheries LLC (F/V Jacalwa)**  
**DATE: 4/19/2024**

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name: MARINE RESOURCES**  
**Name of RFP Coordinator: Jesse Minor**  
**Names of Evaluators: Rebecca Peters, Peyton Benson, Caleb Hodgdon**

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>X</b>	
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>35</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>30</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>16.7</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>81.7</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Spear Fisheries LLC (F/V Jacalwa)**  
**DATE: 4/19/2024**

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Put in a very thorough bid, including org chart

*Eligibility Requirements*

- i) Proof of F/V Safety Exam was provided*
- ii) Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters was provided*

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Spear Fisheries LLC (F/V Jacalwa)**  
**DATE: 4/19/2024**

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>35</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

*I. Organization Qualifications and Experience  
Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form):*

*A. Fishing Experience in Gulf of Maine*

- 28 yrs in lobster, groundfish, scallop, tuna, menhaden
- Some fisheries are multi-day
- Maintains a multi-vessel fleet

*B. Experience with Science Support*

- Lobster removals prior to dredging Portland harbor with DMR
- Ventless trap survey, sea sampling with DMR

- ii) Subcontractors: not listed*
- iii) Org chart. Detailed Org chart provided*
- iv) Litigation. None listed*
- v) Certificate of Insurance was provided*

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026  
RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel  
BIDDER: Spear Fisheries LLC (F/V Jacalwa)  
DATE: 4/19/2024**

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>30</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- A. Vessel Suitability (incl Appendix F)*
- *46' lobsterboat, could be pretty small for multi-day with 6 people*
  - *20 kts, lifting rails for stability*
  - *Has head*
  - *Limited freshwater (50 gal), has galley*
  - *Power supply unclear*
  - *Has tuna tower for observers!!*
  - *USCG limited to <20 nmi, and most of our survey area is outside this distance from shore*
  - *Provided detailed narrative outlining services*
  - *describes safety and maintenance as important, including drills*
  - *org chart specifies that crew are capable of navigation and meals*
  - *space may be limited for 6 ppl on multi-day trips*
  - *Wrote good scope of work; application is thorough*

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Spear Fisheries LLC (F/V Jacalwa)**  
**DATE: 4/19/2024**

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$304,000</b>	,	<b>\$454,000</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>25 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>16.7</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

*Day rate, onshore and at sea*

- *\$454,000 total*
- *\$7,500/day*
- *\$800/day onshore*

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Lynn & William LLC (F/V Lynn William)**  
**DATE: 4/19/2024**

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name: MARINE RESOURCES**  
**Name of RFP Coordinator: Jesse Minor**  
**Names of Evaluators: Rebecca Peters, Peyton Benson, Caleb Hodgdon**

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>X</b>	
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>25</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>40</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>5.2</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>70.2</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Lynn & William LLC (F/V Lynn William)**  
**DATE: 4/19/2024**

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

*Eligibility Requirements*

- i) Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam not provided*
- ii) Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters not provided*

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402026  
RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel  
BIDDER: Lynn & William LLC (F/V Lynn William)  
DATE: 4/19/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>25</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience*
- A. Fishing Experience in Gulf of Maine*
- *Trawling since 1986, GOM and George's Bank*
  - *Owns 4 trawlers (3 were applicants for this RFP)*
  - *Otter trawling experience primarily*
  - *plenty of fishing experience in the relevant region*
- B. Experience with Science Support*
- *None listed*
- ii) Subcontractors: they didn't mention subcontractors.*
- iii) Org chart. Bart is president, no org chart supplied*
- iv) Litigation. None listed*
- v) Certificate of Insurance. Not provided*

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402026  
 RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel  
 BIDDER: Lynn & William LLC (F/V Lynn William)  
 DATE: 4/19/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>40</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

*I. Proposed Services*

*A. Vessel Suitability (incl Appendix F)*

- 78'
- Does not report hull speed
- Stabilizers and birds = stability
- 30 kW and 40 kW generators= electrical capacity is good
- 6 berths and 4-berth rooms
- 1,000-2,000 gallons freshwater
- Submitted tons of photos, which is great.
- Submitted without email subject lines, which made application review challenging
- Asks if trips can be 8-10 days to reduce transit
- McNeel misreports vessel length and other factors compared to the survey reports.

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Lynn & William LLC (F/V Lynn William)**  
**DATE: 4/19/2024**

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$304,000</b>	,	<b>\$1,458,000</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>25 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>5.2</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- A. *Day rate, onshore and at sea*
  - *\$1,458,000 total bid*
    - *\$10,150 day rate, 120 days*
    - *\$4,000 onshore rate, 60 days*

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Lynn & William Inc (F/V William Lynn)**  
**DATE: 4/17/2024**

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name: MARINE RESOURCES**  
**Name of RFP Coordinator: Jesse Minor**  
**Names of Evaluators: Rebecca Peters, Peyton Benson, Caleb Hodgdon**

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>X</b>	
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>25</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>40</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>5.1</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>70.1</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Lynn & William Inc (F/V William Lynn)**  
**DATE: 4/17/2024**

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

*Eligibility Requirements*

- i) Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam not provided*
- ii) Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters not provided*

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Lynn & William Inc (F/V William Lynn)**  
**DATE: 4/17/2024**

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>25</b>

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

*Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form):*

*A. Fishing Experience in Gulf of Maine*

- Trawling since 1986, GOM and George's Bank*
- Owns 4 trawlers (3 were applicants for this RFP)*
- Obviously that's a lot of fishing experience in the relevant region*

*B. Experience with Science Support*

- None listed*

*ii) Subcontractors: they didn't mention subcontractors.*

*iii) Org chart. Bart is president, no org chart supplied*

*iv) Litigation. None listed*

*v) Certificate of Insurance. Not provided*

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Lynn & William Inc (F/V William Lynn)**  
**DATE: 4/17/2024**

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>40</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

*I. Proposed Services*

*A. Vessel Suitability (incl Appendix F)*

- 76.7'
- 8-9 kts
- 40 kW genset and 30 kW genset with 12V service via batteries
- 4-berth stateroom and 2 2-berth staterooms w lockers
- 4,000 gallons freshwater
- 20 days of fuel
- Adequate size, speed, and electrical
- Has a head
- Has galley with refrigeration and cooktop/oven
- McNeel misreports vessel length and other factors compared to the survey reports.
- Submitted tons of photos, which is great. Submitted without email subject lines, which made proposal review more challenging.
- Additional photos of the vessel would be useful to determine suitability for scientific crew and mounting locations for required survey systems
- No mention of providing food or plan for mounting of external equipment
- No detailed work plan defined but is available for planning meetings

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Lynn & William Inc (F/V William Lynn)**  
**DATE: 4/17/2024**

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$304,000</b>	,	<b>\$1,500,000</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>25 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>5.1</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- A. *Day rate, onshore and at sea*
- *\$1,500,000 total bid*
    1. *\$10,400 day rate, 120 days*
    2. *\$4,200 onshore rate, 60 days*

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Lynn & William Inc (F/V Patriot)**  
**DATE: 4/17/2024**

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name: MARINE RESOURCES**  
**Name of RFP Coordinator: Jesse Minor**  
**Names of Evaluators: Rebecca Peters, Peyton Benson, Caleb Hodgdon**

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>X</b>	
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>25</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>40</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>4.8</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>69.8</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Lynn & William Inc (F/V Patriot)**  
**DATE: 4/17/2024**

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

*Eligibility Requirements*

- i) Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam not provided*
- ii) Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters not provided*

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Lynn & William Inc (F/V Patriot)**  
**DATE: 4/17/2024**

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>25</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

*Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form):*

*A. Fishing Experience in Gulf of Maine*

- *Trawling since 1986, GOM and George’s Bank*
- *Owns 4 trawlers (3 were applicants for this RFP)*
- *Obviously that’s a lot of fishing experience in the relevant region*

*B. Experience with Science Support*

- *None listed*

*ii) Subcontractors: they didn’t mention subcontractors.*

*iii) Org chart. Bart is president, no org chart supplied*

*iv) Litigation. None listed*

*v) Certificate of Insurance. Not provided*

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER: Lynn & William Inc (F/V Patriot)**  
**DATE: 4/17/2024**

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>40</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

*I. Proposed Services*

*A. Vessel Suitability (incl Appendix F)*

- 76’
- 8-10 kts
- 11 days of fuel
- Outriggers/birds
- 4,500 gallons freshwater
- 6 berths + master’s cabin
- Has galley with refrigeration and cooktop/oven
- Asks if trips can be 8-10 days to reduce transit
- Submitted tons of photos, which is great. Submitted without email subject lines, which was a little harder to deal with.
- Overestimated the days by 2x at least
- Lists boat length at 87’ but survey says 76’
- No mention of providing food or plan for mounting of external equipment

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202402026  
 RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel  
 BIDDER: Lynn & William Inc (F/V Patriot)  
 DATE: 4/17/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$304,000</b>	,	<b>\$1,596,000</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>25 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>4.8</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- A. *Day rate, onshore and at sea*
- *\$1,596,000 total bid*
  - *\$11,150 day rate, 120 days*
  - *\$4,300 onshore rate, 60 days*

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER NAME: Love Fisheries INC.**  
**DATE: 4/17/2024**  
**EVALUATOR NAME: Caleb Hodgdon**  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) **Section I Preliminary Information**  
**Eligibility Requirements**
  - i) **Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam**
  - ii) **Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters**
    - a. **Provided their USCG license am unsure if this is the inspection too.**
  
- 2) **Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience**
  - i) **Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form): Vessel homeports in Gloucester, MA. Has a lot of experience operating in Gulf of Maine fisheries including Sea Urchin, Sea Cucumber, Scallop and menhaden. Has done surveys for the State of Maine on another vessel in Eastport, ME. Holds a master of fishing industry vessel up to 5,000GT (captain license). Has done previous research with cod survey and has worked on various acoustic and bottom mapping systems. Has worked with General dynamics with the F/V Titan over 5 years ago for acoustic work.**
  - ii) **Subcontractors: did not mention any**
  - iii) **Org chart.: none included.**
  - iv) **Litigation: did not mention any.**
  - v) **Certificate of Insurance – none provided.**
  
- 3) **Section III Proposed Services**
  - i) **Has plenty of space for the crew. The boat is of adequate size and meets speed and electrical supply. Has head and shower.**
  
- 4) **Section IV Cost Proposal**
  - **Total cost: \$304,000**

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**

**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**

**BIDDER NAME: Love Fisheries INC.**

**DATE: 4/17/2024**

**EVALUATOR NAME: Caleb Hodgdon**

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER NAME: Love Fisheries, Inc. (F/V Titan)**  
**DATE: 4/17/2024**  
**EVALUATOR NAME: Jesse Minor**  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) *Section I Preliminary Information  
Eligibility Requirements*
  - i) *Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam Michael Love has 5000 ton Master license, unlimited 3<sup>rd</sup> Mate license*
  - ii) *Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters provided*
  
- 2) *Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience*
  - i) *Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form):*
    1. *Fishing Experience in Gulf of Maine*
      - *Scalloping, mid-water trawling, traps*
      - *Decades of experience in menhaden, urchin, sea cucumber, scallops*
      - *Crew or co-captain experience is also specified*
    2. *Experience with Science Support*
      - *General Dynamics, unspecified defense-related work*
      - *Industry-based cod survey*
      - *GMRI, not specified*
      - *acoustic and bottom-mapping on factory trawlers*
      - *unspecified "surveys" for State of Maine out of Eastport*
  - ii) *Subcontractors: none listed*
  - iii) *Org chart. Owner/operator*
  - iv) *Litigation. None listed*
  - v) *Certificate of Insurance. not provided*
  
- 3) *Section III Proposed Services*
  1. *Vessel Suitability (incl Appendix F)*

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**

**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**

**BIDDER NAME: Love Fisheries, Inc. (F/V Titan)**

**DATE: 4/17/2024**

**EVALUATOR NAME: Jesse Minor**

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

- 66'
- 7.5 kts, stabilizing fins
- 2 gensets 20kW 90 amps and 65 kW 300 amps
- 4-bunk state room and lockers
- "endless showers", 2,000 gallons freshwater
- Boat looks super comfortable
- Michael Love has Merchant Mariner credential; 5,000 ton Master license; 3<sup>rd</sup> Mate unlimited, Able Seaman unlimited, et
- Lists captain and crew (or co-captain?) experiences
- Specifies that boat is free to work and we have "undivided" attention

4) *Section IV Cost Proposal*

2. *Day rate, onshore and at sea*

- \$304,000 total for the 60 day survey season
- \$4,900/day mapping
- \$2,000 day onshore

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402026  
**RFP TITLE:** Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel  
**BIDDER NAME:** Love Fisheries Inc  
**DATE:** 04/17/2024  
**EVALUATOR NAME:** Peyton Benson  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Marine Resources

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) Section I Preliminary Information  
Eligibility Requirements
  - a. Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam
  - b. Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters
    - i. Provided USCG license
  
- 2) Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience
  - a. Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form): Bidder has decades of commercial fishing experience in the Gulf of Maine including scalloping, trawling, pot fishing, sea urchin, and sea cucumber. Bidder has supported cod survey, GMRI projects, and General Dynamics project with USS Momsen. Bidder also has experience with acoustic and bottom mapping systems aboard factory trawlers in the North Pacific, Eastern Atlantic, and Baltic Sea.
  - b. Organizational chart provided
  - c. Litigation not mentioned
  - d. Insurance certification was not provided
  
- 3) Section III Proposed Services
  - a. 66' x 22', Frank Weckesser custom built 1999
  - b. Vessel speed and electricity appear to be sufficient for survey needs and the vessel has outriggers + birds. Also has stabilizing fins as well. Seems like a very stable platform
  - c. No images of the vessel were included. I would very much like to see the vessel before approving on mounting space and accommodations
  - d. No mention of providing food or plan for mounting of external equipment

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402026

**RFP TITLE:** Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel

**BIDDER NAME:** Love Fisheries Inc

**DATE:** 04/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Peyton Benson

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Marine Resources

- e. Has galley with refrigeration and cooktop/oven. Also has private 4-bunk stateroom and showers
  - f. Noted dedication to the work and interest in surveying with availability owing to involvement in Stellwagen scallop fishery.
- 4) Section IV Cost Proposal
- a. \$4,900 day rate at sea, \$2,000 day rate for setup and takedown
  - b. Total cost for full contract rate is \$304,000.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER NAME: FV Titan – Love Fisheries**  
**DATE: 4.18.2024**  
**EVALUATOR NAME: Rebecca Peters**  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department’s RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) **Section I Preliminary Information**  
**Eligibility Requirements**
  - i) **Copy of USCG Captain’s License or proof of F/V Safety Exam**
  - ii) **Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters**
    - a. **Provided their USCG license am unsure if this is the inspection too.**
  
- 2) **Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience**
  - i) **Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form): Vessel homeports in Gloucester, MA. Has a lot of experience operating in Gulf of Maine fisheries (says decades but does not provided exact years) – participated in multiple fisheries: menhaden, sea urchin, sea cucumber, scallop. One of the captains has done surveys for the State of Maine on another vessel in Eastport, ME. The owner Michael Love is a master of fishing industry vessel up to 5,000G. Has done previous research work in the Gulf of Maine on the Industry based cod survey and has worked on various acoustic and bottom mapping systems before which is what this project will be doing. Michael Love has experience scalloping, participating in the mid water and demersal trawl fisheries, and pot fisheries. General dynamics have contracted the FV Titan over 5 years ago for acoustic work.**
  - ii) **Subcontractors: did not mention any**
  - iii) **Org chart.: none included**
  - iv) **Litigation: did not mention any.**
  - v) **Certificate of Insurance – none provided.**
  
- 3) **Section III Proposed Services**

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**

**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**

**BIDDER NAME: FV Titan – Love Fisheries**

**DATE: 4.18.2024**

**EVALUATOR NAME: Rebecca Peters**

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

- i) **Has private bunk space to bunk scientific staff, has closed compliant head and shower on board which is good for the overnight trips that will occur. Has enough space to setup computer for mapping operations.**
  
- 4) **Section IV Cost Proposal**

  - **Total cost: \$304,000**

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER NAME: Balzano**  
**DATE: 4.18.2024**  
**EVALUATOR NAME: Rebecca Peters**  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) **Section I Preliminary Information**  
**Eligibility Requirements**
  - i) **Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam**
  - ii) **Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters**
    - a. **Has these since this boat is currently under contract by DMR for another project.**
  
- 2) **Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience**
  - i) **Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form): Has 36 years of experience participating in the groundfish, scallop, shrimp, whiting, herring, and lobster fishing industries in the Gulf of Maine. He is still an active groundfish and scallop trawling vessel in the Gulf of Maine. They have worked on collaborative research projects in the past with DMR and the Gulf of Maine Research Institute. Is currently under contract with DMR as the vessel platform for the trawl survey being conducted in Maine's Research Array.**
  - ii) **Subcontractors: None listed**
  - iii) **Org chart. None provided**
  - iv) **Litigation. None mentioned**
  - v) **Certificate of Insurance – provided and has this.**
  
- 3) **Section III Proposed Services**
  - **Has the space to fit 4 scientific staff. Bunks are all in one spot with no privacy. Has a private head at least. Smaller boat with no privacy for sleeping, but has wheelhouse to work in too.**
  
- 4) **Section IV Cost Proposal**
  - i) **Total cost: \$328,125**

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER NAME: Balzano LLC**  
**DATE: 4/17/2024**  
**EVALUATOR NAME: Caleb Hodgdon**  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) **Section I Preliminary Information**  
**Eligibility Requirements**
  - i) **Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam**
  - ii) **Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters**
    - a. **Has these since this boat is currently under contract by DMR for another project.**
  
- 2) **Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience**
  - i) **Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form): 36+ years of experience fishing for scallop, shrimp, whiting, herring, and lobster in the Gulf of Maine. Has worked on research projects in the past with DMR and the Gulf of Maine Research Institute. Is currently under contract with DMR as the vessel platform for the trawl survey being conducted in Maine's Research Array.**
  - ii) **Subcontractors: None listed**
  - iii) **Org chart. None provided**
  - iv) **Litigation. None mentioned**
  - v) **Certificate of Insurance – provided and has this.**
  
- 3) **Section III Proposed Services**
  - **Has needed space for crew. Also has needed speed and electrical supply. Roughly 4 days of fuel available.**
  
- 4) **Section IV Cost Proposal**
  - i) **Total cost: \$328,125.00**

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER NAME: Balzano LLC**  
**DATE: 4/15/2024**  
**EVALUATOR NAME: Jesse Minor**  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) *Section I Preliminary Information  
Eligibility Requirements*
  - i) *Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam not provided*
  - ii) *Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters not provided*
  
- 2) *Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience*
  - i) *Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form):*
    - *36 years of experience in commercial fisheries (groundfish, scallops, shrimp, whiting, herring, menhaden, lobster)*
    - *Active in management councils and panels and task forces*

*Experience with Science Support*

    - *Listed 22 different research projects he has assisted with spanning 1995-2013 in addition to more recent projects*
    - *Lots of experience with science support*
    - *GMRI/Nature Conservancy, bycatch study*
    - *Maine DMR, Shrimp study*
    - *GMRI, shrimp acoustics*
    - *30 years of science support on the water, clearly knows how to work with agencies and nonprofits*
  - ii) *No use of subcontractors*
  - iii) *Org chart is Balzano as owner/operator*
  - iv) *no mention of litigation*
  - v) *Balzano provided his current Certificate of Insurance.*

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**

**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**

**BIDDER NAME: Balzano LLC**

**DATE: 4/15/2024**

**EVALUATOR NAME: Jesse Minor**

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

3) *Section III Proposed Services*

1. i) *Vessel Suitability (incl Appendix F)*

- *55', so possibly on the small side for this work but totally fine*
- *8 kts speed*
- *Not a huge amount of freshwater capacity (155 gal)*
- *Birds for stability*
- *7.5 kW generator/5500 watt inverter*
- *Interested in working with partner vessel for offshore safety considerations*
- *Application was very thorough, suggesting attention to detail and knowledge of working with DMR*

4) *Section IV Cost Proposal*

2. *Day rate, onshore and at sea*

- *\$328,125 total*
- *\$5,250/day mapping for 60 days*
- *\$2,625/day onshore for 5 days*

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402026  
**RFP TITLE:** Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel  
**BIDDER NAME:** Balzano LLC  
**DATE:** 04/17/2024  
**EVALUATOR NAME:** Peyton Benson  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Marine Resources

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) Section I Preliminary Information  
Eligibility Requirements
  - a. Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam
  - b. Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters
    - i. Vessel is under contract with DMR on another project so bidder is known to have this documentation
  
- 2) Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience
  - a. Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form): Bidder has 36 years of experience as a day trip dragger. Has also served on the NE Fisheries management council from 2013-2021. Bidder demonstrates history of supporting scientific efforts with DMR, UNH, GMRI, UNE, and SMAST dating back to 1995.
  - b. Subcontractors not mentioned. Did indicate willingness to work alongside a second contracted vessel
  - c. Organizational chart not provided
  - d. Litigation not mentioned
  - e. Insurance certification was provided
  
- 3) Section III Proposed Services
  - a. 54'11" x 17' Northeast, built 1981
  - b. Vessel appears to have suitable speed capabilities, sufficient electricity, and has outriggers + birds for stability. Based on description alone, it appears to be a good platform for this project.
  - c. Noted ability to install additional shelving for computers if needed
  - d. No mention of food or mounting of external equipment
  - e. Has galley with refrigeration and cooktop/oven

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402026

**RFP TITLE:** Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel

**BIDDER NAME:** Balzano LLC

**DATE:** 04/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Peyton Benson

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Marine Resources

- f. No images of the vessel were included. I would very much like to see the vessel before approving on mounting space and accommodations
- 4) Section IV Cost Proposal
- a. \$5,250 day rate at sea, \$2,625 day rate for setup and takedown
  - b. Total cost for full contract rate is \$328,125
  - c. Noted terms of contract are negotiable

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER NAME: FV Robert Michael**  
**DATE: 4.18.2024**  
**EVALUATOR NAME: Rebecca Peters**  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) **Section I Preliminary Information**  
**Eligibility Requirements**
  - i) **Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam**
  - ii) **Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters**
    - a. **Did not provide these, but has them since this boat is currently under contract for DMR's MENH Inshore Trawl Survey.**
  
- 2) **Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience**
  - i) **Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form): Has been a fishermen for a long time (20+ years) in multiple fisheries in the gulf of maine – scallop, groundfish, shrimp. Has done cooperative research in the past with DMR and within the last five years. Is the current vessel under contract for DMR's MENH Inshore Trawl Survey.**
  - ii) **Subcontractors: None listed.**
  - iii) **Org chart: none provided**
  - iv) **Litigation: did not list any**
  - v) **Certificate of Insurance: Did not provide.**
  
- 3) **Section III Proposed Services**
  - **There are 6 bunks on the boat – enough for 4 scientists and a captain and crew. Private head and there is a shower on board. Not a large cabin but there is space in the wheelhouse for computers and people to sit.**
  
- 4) **Section IV Cost Proposal**
  - i) **Total coast: gave only a day rate of \$5750/day but total cost would be - \$345,000 based on that day rate.**

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER NAME: Robert Michael**  
**DATE: 4/17/2024**  
**EVALUATOR NAME: Caleb Hodgdon**  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) **Section I Preliminary Information**  
**Eligibility Requirements**
  - i) **Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam**
  - ii) **Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters**
    - a. **Did not provide these but has them since this boat is currently under contract for DMR's MENH Inshore Trawl Survey.**
  
- 2) **Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience**
  - i) **Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form): 20+ years fishing in the Gulf of Maine. Has been involved in multiple fisheries including scallops, groundfish, shrimp. Has done cooperative research in the past with DMR and within the last five years. Is the current vessel under contract for DMR's MENH Inshore Trawl Survey.**
  - ii) **Subcontractors: None listed.**
  - iii) **Org chart: none provided.**
  - iv) **Litigation: did not list any**
  - v) **Certificate of Insurance: Did not provide.**
  
- 3) **Section III Proposed Services**
  - **Plenty of space for crew. Vessel has needed power supply and speed.**
  
- 4) **Section IV Cost Proposal**
  - i) **Total cost: \$345,000**

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER NAME: Robert Michael, Inc.**  
**DATE: 4/15/2024**  
**EVALUATOR NAME: Jesse Minor**  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) *Section I Preliminary Information  
Eligibility Requirements*
  - i) *Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam not provided*
  - ii) *Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters not provided*
  
- 2) *Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience*
  - i) *Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form):*
    1. *Fishing Experience in Gulf of Maine*
      - *20+ years fishing, but fisheries are not specifically highlighted*
    2. *Experience with Science Support*
      - *17 years with MENH Trawl Survey*
      - *"well known within DMR", not specifically described what that means*
  - ii) *Subcontractors not mentioned*
  - iii) *Org chart. Rob Tetrault is owner/operator*
  - iv) *Litigation. None listed*
  - v) *Certificate of Insurance. Not provided.*
  
- 3) *Section III Proposed Services*
  1. *Vessel Suitability (incl Appendix F)*
    - *54', on the small side but definitely suitable*
    - *6-7 kts, on the slow side for long transits*
    - *Outriggers/birds*

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**

**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**

**BIDDER NAME: Robert Michael, Inc.**

**DATE: 4/15/2024**

**EVALUATOR NAME: Jesse Minor**

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

- *Appendix F lacks some useful detail; assures us there's "plenty" of water and power*

4) *Section IV Cost Proposal*

II. *Day rate, onshore and at sea*

- *\$345,000+ for 60 days*
- *\$172,500+ for 30 days*
- *\$5,750/day mapping*
- *Onshore rate is TBD, so the onshore rate couldn't be used to calculate full contract cost*

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402026  
**RFP TITLE:** Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel  
**BIDDER NAME:** Robert Michael Inc  
**DATE:** 04/17/2024  
**EVALUATOR NAME:** Peyton Benson  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Marine Resources

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) Section I Preliminary Information  
Eligibility Requirements
  - a. Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam
  - b. Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters
    - i. Did not provide this documentation but is under contract with DMR so the vessel is known to have the required forms.
  
- 2) Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience
  - a. Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form): Bidder has 20+ years of fishing experience. Bidder has worked on the ME/NH Trawl Survey for 17+ years.
  - b. Subcontractors not mentioned
  - c. Organizational chart not provided
  - d. Litigation not mentioned
  - e. Insurance certification was not provided
  
- 3) Section III Proposed Services
  - a. 54' x 18', built 1980
  - b. Vessel speed appears to be sufficient for survey needs and the vessel has outriggers + birds, although no figure was provided for available power other than "plenty of power".
  - c. Vessel speed may have to be reduced slightly for survey due to cruise speed topping out at 7 kt
  - d. Photos of the vessel would be useful to determine suitability for scientific crew and mounting locations for required survey systems
  - e. No mention of providing food or plan for mounting of external equipment
  - f. Has galley with refrigeration and cooktop/oven

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402026

**RFP TITLE:** Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel

**BIDDER NAME:** Robert Michael Inc

**DATE:** 04/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Peyton Benson

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Marine Resources

- 4) Section IV Cost Proposal
  - a. \$5,750 day rate at sea, day rate for setup and takedown not provided
  - b. Total cost for full contract rate is \$345,000 with just sea time.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER NAME: FV Nicole Leigh**  
**DATE: 4.18.2024**  
**EVALUATOR NAME: Rebecca Peters**  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) **Section I Preliminary Information**  
**Eligibility Requirements**
  - i) **Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam**
  - ii) **Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters**
    - a. **Provided a photo of USGC sticker – expires in oct 2024.**
  
- 2) **Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience**
  - i) **Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form): Has been a fishermen for a long time (30+ years) in multiple fisheries in the gulf of maine – scallop, groundfish, shrimp. Has done cooperative research in the past with DMR and Gulf of Maine Research Institute in the past five years. Crew members on DMR's MENH Inshore Trawl Survey, participated in DMR's northern gulf of maine scallop survey.**
  - ii) **Subcontractors: None listed.**
  - iii) **Org chart: none provided**
  - iv) **Litigation: did not list any**
  - v) **Certificate of Insurance: provided this.**
  
- 3) **Section III Proposed Services**
  - **Says there is the space to fit 4 scientific staff. Bunks are all in one spot with no privacy. May have a head for some privacy but unsure. Would need to tour the boat to confirm. A smaller vessel with little space in the wheelhouse for scientific staff to setup for mapping.**
  
- 4) **Section IV Cost Proposal**
  - i) **Total coast: \$328,125.00**

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER NAME: FV Nicole Leigh**  
**DATE: 4/17/2024**  
**EVALUATOR NAME: Caleb Hodgdon**  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) **Section I Preliminary Information**  
**Eligibility Requirements**
  - i) **Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam**
  - ii) **Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters**
    - a. **Provided a photo of USGC sticker – expires in oct 2024.**
  
- 2) **Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience**
  - i) **Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form): Has 30+ years' experience fishing in the Gulf of Maine. Has fished for scallop, groundfish and shrimp. Has done science support type work including trawl survey, DEP survey's, MENH bottom survey, and scallop work. Also worked on the Robert Micheal for 5 years doing DMR surveys.**
  - ii) **Subcontractors: None listed.**
  - iii) **Org chart: none provided.**
  - iv) **Litigation: did not list any**
  - v) **Certificate of Insurance: provided this.**
  
- 3) **Section III Proposed Services**
  
- 4) **Says there is adequate room for 4 survey staff. This boat is on the smaller side, and I would like to see it in person before making a decision if the vessel will fit our needs.**  
**Section IV Cost Proposal**
  - i) **Total cost: \$358,125.00**

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**

**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**

**BIDDER NAME: F/V Nicole Leigh (Dana Hammond II)**

**DATE: 4/17/2024**

**EVALUATOR NAME: Jesse Minor**

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) *Section I Preliminary Information  
Eligibility Requirements*
  - i) *proof of F/V Safety Exam was provided, although the vessel is limited to <50 nmi. Our survey areas of interest exceed those distances.*
  - ii) *Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters provided; this is a Documented vessel*
  
- 2) *Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience*
  - i) *Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form):*
    1. *Fishing Experience in Gulf of Maine*
      - *30+ years, incl offshore and down to mid-Atlantic, coastal and offshore*
      - *Worked aboard Robert Michael (another applicant)*
    2. *Experience with Science Support*
      - *ME Inshore Trawl Survey & Scallop Survey*
      - *ME DEP surveys*
      - *Test-tow Cooperative Sampling for shrimp*
      - *Statoil Hywind Maine (bird/bat avian survey)*
      - *US Navy bottom surveys*
  - ii) *Subcontractors: none listed*
  - iii) *Org chart. Dana Hammond II is owner/operator.*
  - iv) *Litigation. None listed*
  - v) *Certificate of Insurance was provided*
  
- 3) *Section III Proposed Services*
  1. *Vessel Suitability (incl Appendix F)*

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**

**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**

**BIDDER NAME: F/V Nicole Leigh (Dana Hammond II)**

**DATE: 4/17/2024**

**EVALUATOR NAME: Jesse Minor**

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

- *44' (small for our purposes?)*
- *8 kts*
- *Stabilizing fins*
- *22 kW generator capacity*
- *150 gallons freshwater*
- *Worked aboard Robert Michael (another applicant)*
- *Willing to work with another partner vessel for safety (likely has Balzano in mind as he used similar language)*
- *Pictures can be furnished on request*

4) *Section IV Cost Proposal*

i) *Day rate, onshore and at sea*

- *\$358,125 total*
- *\$5,250/day for 60 days mapping*
- *\$2,625/day onshore for 5 days*
- *Day rate is negotiable*

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402026  
**RFP TITLE:** Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel  
**BIDDER NAME:** F/V Nicole Leigh  
**DATE:** 04/17/2024  
**EVALUATOR NAME:** Peyton Benson  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Marine Resources

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) Section I Preliminary Information  
Eligibility Requirements
  - a. Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam
  - b. Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters
    - i. Provided USCG inspection sticker valid until October 2024
  
- 2) Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience
  - a. Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form): Bidder has 30+ years of experience fishing in the Gulf of Maine and Mid-Atlantic Coastal and Offshore regions. Bidder noted support for several state scientific survey efforts with ME, NH, and MA, in addition to some avian and bat work supporting Statoil Hywind
  - b. Subcontractors not mentioned
  - c. Organizational chart not provided
  - d. Litigation not mentioned
  - e. Insurance certification was provided
  
- 3) Section III Proposed Services
  - a. 44' x 16'6", built 1983
  - b. Vessel speed and electricity appear to be sufficient for survey needs and the vessel has outriggers + birds
  - c. I have reservations regarding the size of the vessel with regard to accommodating scientific crew
  - d. No images of the vessel were included. I would very much like to see the vessel before approving on mounting space and accommodations
  - e. No mention of providing food or plan for mounting of external equipment
  - f. Has galley with refrigeration and cooktop/oven

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402026

**RFP TITLE:** Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel

**BIDDER NAME:** F/V Nicole Leigh

**DATE:** 04/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Peyton Benson

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Marine Resources

- 4) Section IV Cost Proposal
  - a. \$5,250 day rate at sea, \$2,625 day rate for setup and takedown
  - b. Total cost for full contract rate is \$358,125
  - c. Noted day rate is negotiable

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER NAME: FV Jocka**  
**DATE: 4.18.2024**  
**EVALUATOR NAME: Rebecca Peters**  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) **Section I Preliminary Information**  
**Eligibility Requirements**
  - i) **Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam**
  - ii) **Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters**
    - a. **Did not provide these but can provide before the start of any contract if needed**
  
- 2) **Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience**
  - i) **Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form): Has 46 year experience with fishing in the Gulf of Maine – groundfishing experience and experience fishing out where mapping will occur. Has worked on collaborative research projects in the past but not in the past five years so didn't list the projects. He works with DMR and the state of Maine serving as an advisor on MEOSW research consortium and was on the fisheries working group of MEOSW roadmap.**
  - ii) **Subcontractors: no mention of subcontractors**
  - iii) **Org chart: None included**
  - iv) **Litigation: None listed**
  - v) **Certificate of Insurance: Provided this so has it.**
  
- 3) **Section III Proposed Services**
  - i) **Discuss Appendix F and vessel suitability**
    - Says there is the space to fit 4 scientific staff. Bunks are all in one spot with no privacy. Does not have a head and not sure if it would be a great vessel to do multiple overnight trips on with no privacy space. If this was a top option you'd probably want to try and tour the boat first before making a decision. Seems to be able to mount the gear. Just unsure if the vessel is great for overnight trips.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**

**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**

**BIDDER NAME: FV Jocka**

**DATE: 4.18.2024**

**EVALUATOR NAME: Rebecca Peters**

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

**4) Section IV Cost Proposal**

- **Total cost: \$312,500**

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**

**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**

**BIDDER NAME:** Jordan Linn Inc. F/V Jocka. Terry Alexander

**DATE:** 04/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Caleb Hodgdon

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MARINE RESOURCES

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**1) Section I Preliminary Information**

**Eligibility Requirements**

- i) Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam**
- ii) Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters**
  - a. Did not provide these but can provide before the start of any contract if needed.**

**2) Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience**

- i) Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form): 46+ years' experience fishing in the Gulf. The work was mostly ground fishing. He has worked with research projects in the past and can list them upon request. Works with DMR and the state as an advisor on MEOSW research consortium and was on the fisheries working group of MEOSW roadmap.**
- ii) Subcontractors: no mention of subcontractors**
- iii) Org chart: None included.**
- iv) Litigation: None listed**
- v) Certificate of Insurance: Provided this so has it.**

**3) Section III Proposed Services**

- i) Discuss Appendix F and vessel suitability.**
  - Vessel is of adequate size and has the necessary speed and electrical supply. Has no head but it is willing to install. I would like to see this boat in person before committing to it.**

**4) Section IV Cost Proposal**

- Total cost: \$312,500**

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER NAME: Jordan Linn Inc. (F/V Jocka)**  
**DATE: 4/15/2024**  
**EVALUATOR NAME: Jesse Minor**  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) *Section I Preliminary Information  
Eligibility Requirements*
  - i) *Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam not provided*
  - ii) *Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters not provided*
  
- 2) *Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience*
  - i) *Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form)*
    1. *Fishing Experience in Gulf of Maine*
      - *46 years fishing Gulf of Maine*
      - *Trawling and navigating*
    2. *Experience with Science Support*
      - *Reports cooperative research in the past, but not past 5 years*
  - ii) *Subcontractors: none mentioned*
  - iii) *Org chart. Not provided; sole proprietorship*
  - iv) *Litigation. None mentioned*
  - v) *Certificate of Insurance. Not provided*
  
- 3) *Section III Proposed Services*
  1. *Vessel Suitability (incl Appendix F)*
    - *61'*
    - *7.5 kts*
    - *Outriggers/birds*
    - *2 gensets (33 and 40 kW)*
    - *4 berths*
    - *Provided marine survey report on vessel*

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**

**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**

**BIDDER NAME: Jordan Linn Inc. (F/V Jocka)**

**DATE: 4/15/2024**

**EVALUATOR NAME: Jesse Minor**

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

- *Provided good representative photos of vessel and living space*

4) *Section IV Cost Proposal*

*Day rate, onshore and at sea*

- *\$312,500 for 60 days mapping and mobilization/demobilization*
- *\$5,000/day mapping*
- *\$2,500/day onshore*

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402026  
**RFP TITLE:** Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel  
**BIDDER NAME:** Jordan Linn Inc. F/V Jocka  
**DATE:** 04/17/2024  
**EVALUATOR NAME:** Peyton Benson  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Marine Resources

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) Section I Preliminary Information  
Eligibility Requirements
  - a. Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam
  - b. Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters
    - i. None provided but indicated these can be provided prior to start date
  
- 2) Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience
  - a. Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form): Bidder has 46 years of experience fishing in the Gulf of Maine. Bidder claimed history of supporting cooperative research but did not provide any examples
  - b. Subcontractors not mentioned
  - c. Organizational chart not provided
  - d. Litigation not mentioned
  - e. Insurance certification was provided
  
- 3) Section III Proposed Services
  - a. 61'9" x 20', built 2002
  - b. Vessel appears to have suitable speed capabilities, sufficient electricity, and has outriggers + birds for stability
  - c. Dimensions of vessel and pictures provided indicate it could be a suitable platform for this project
  - d. I would like to see more of the crew accommodations/space before approving suitability for staff
  - e. No freshwater capacity noted and no mention of providing food
  - f. No plan for mounting of external equipment
  - g. Has galley with refrigeration and cooktop/oven

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402026

**RFP TITLE:** Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel

**BIDDER NAME:** Jordan Linn Inc. F/V Jocka

**DATE:** 04/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Peyton Benson

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Marine Resources

- 4) Section IV Cost Proposal
  - a. *\$5,000 day rate at sea, \$2,500 day rate for setup and takedown*
  - b. Total cost for full contract rate is \$312,500

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER NAME: RV Shackelford – geodynamics**  
**DATE: 4.18.2024**  
**EVALUATOR NAME: Rebecca Peters**  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

\*\*\*\*\*  
**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department’s RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*  
\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) **Section I Preliminary Information**
  - Eligibility Requirements**
    - i) **Copy of USCG Captain’s License or proof of F/V Safety Exam**
    - ii) **Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters**
      - a. **Provided a certificate of inspection by the USCG.**
- 2) **Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience**
  - i) **Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form): This is a research vessel and the vessel hasn’t done work in the Gulf of Maine in the past. The vessel hasn’t done any fishing in the past since it’s specifically designed as a research vessel so has no experience in any fisheries in the Gulf of Maine. The vessel has completed similar work to what is being asked since the company is specifically designed to conduct bathymetric mapping surveys.**
  - ii) **Subcontractors: None listed.**
  - iii) **Org chart: none provided**
  - iv) **Litigation: did not list any**
  - v) **Certificate of Insurance: Provided this.**
- 3) **Section III Proposed Services**
  - **Provided a vessel diagram and photos of the research vessel setup and has the space needed to conduct this work. The vessel is specifically designed for site development and cable surveys for offshore wind and telecommunications work and can do 12-14hour operations. It has enough bunks for scientific staff and crew and from the information provided there are separate bunk spaces for scientific staff.**
- 4) **Section IV Cost Proposal**
  - i) **Total coast: gave a range for their daily rate of \$10,000-\$15,000/day so difficult to determine total cost but the range for total cost is \$635,000-\$935,000.**

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER NAME: Geodynamics**  
**DATE: 4/17/2024**  
**EVALUATOR NAME: Caleb Hodgdon**  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) **Section I Preliminary Information**  
**Eligibility Requirements**
  - i) **Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam**
  - ii) **Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters**
    - a. **Provided a certificate of inspection by the USCG.**
- 2) **Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience**
  - i) **Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form): Strictly a research vessel and has no fishing experience. Has not worked in the Gulf of Maine as of yet. Currently is setup and does the type of work we are asking for.**
  - ii) **Subcontractors: None listed.**
  - iii) **Org chart: none provided**
  - iv) **Litigation: did not list any**
  - v) **Certificate of Insurance: Provided this.**
- 3) **Section III Proposed Services**
  - **Provided all documents and images of the vessel we asked for. Has more than enough sleeping space for the crew. Would be a great vessel for the type of work that we are asking.**
- 4) **Section IV Cost Proposal**
  - i) **Total cost: \$635,000-\$935,000**

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**

**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**

**BIDDER NAME: Geodynamics LLC, R/V Shackleford**

**DATE: 4/15/2024**

**EVALUATOR NAME: Jesse Minor**

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) *Section I Preliminary Information  
Eligibility Requirements*
  - i) *Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam not provided, although documentation suggests captain is licensed 100 ton or greater.*
  - ii) *Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters was provided*
  
- 2) *Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience*
  - i) *Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form):*
    1. *Fishing Experience in Gulf of Maine*
      - *No knowledge of fishing techniques and fishing grounds in Gulf of Maine is claimed*
      - *they're NC-based and do research support*
  
    2. *Experience with Science Support*
      - *SSS, acoustic sonar, video samples 1-60 nmi offshore for FL Fish & Wildlife*
      - *Duke Energy, survey for met buoys and floating LiDAR buoys 24-28 nmi offshore*
      - *Hydrographic surveys in NC for OSW*
      - *Very detailed accounting of marine research and science support across a suite of project types.*
      - *Very good detail provided, and they are clearly capable of partnering with agencies for this type of work.*
  
  - iii) *Org chart. Detailed org chart is provided for the vessel, crew, and connected to Geodynamics and DMR, with specific roles and qualifications defined*

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**

**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**

**BIDDER NAME: Geodynamics LLC, R/V Shackleford**

**DATE: 4/15/2024**

**EVALUATOR NAME: Jesse Minor**

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

- iv) *Litigation. None listed*
  - v) *Certificate of Insurance was provided*
- 3) *Section III Proposed Services*
- 3. *Vessel Suitability (incl Appendix F)*
    - *72.5'*
    - *27 kts*
    - *Obviously a very comfortable vessel for a large team*
    - *Really nice workspaces*
    - *Very new vessel*
    - *Unsure about stability across sea states and offshore/cold water*
    - *2 21 kW generators*
    - *8 bunks, 2 heads*
    - *Already mounted with some equipment we are providing (MBES)*
    - *Are they planning on staffing with sonar operators? That would duplicate the people we've hired for this project*
    - *Very thorough and professional application (clearly have office staff and support for bids, unlike typical commercial fishing outfits)*
    - *Lacks lifeboats (commonly required offshore safety equipment)*
- 4) *Section IV Cost Proposal*
- 4. *Day rate, onshore and at sea*
    - *\$635,000-\$935,000 total cost for 60 days*
    - *\$10,000-\$15,000/day mapping (cost range not fully explained)*
    - *\$7,000/day mobilization*
    - *It's unclear what day rate we should use for this bid. Midpoint? Low or high? not sure what their actual rate would be.*
    - *Would they expect day rate for days they are not working?*

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402026  
**RFP TITLE:** Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel  
**BIDDER NAME:** Geodynamics LLC  
**DATE:** 04/17/2024  
**EVALUATOR NAME:** Peyton Benson  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Marine Resources

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) Section I Preliminary Information  
Eligibility Requirements
  - a. Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam
  - b. Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters
    - i. Provided USCG certificate of inspection
  
- 2) Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience
  - a. Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form): Bidder has extensive history of hydrographic and geophysical projects with federal and private organizations. Has a track record high-quality results meeting national and international standards for data. No fishing experience noted.
  - b. Subcontractors not mentioned
  - c. Organizational chart provided
  - d. Litigation not mentioned
  - e. Insurance certification was provided
  
- 3) Section III Proposed Services
  - a. 72'6" x 28', All American Marine (catamaran) built 2023
  - b. Vessel size, speed, and electricity production are more than sufficient to meet project needs
  - c. No outriggers, but given vessel size, the platform is likely stable enough for survey operations offshore
  - d. Vessel already has 5 dedicated computer stations
  - e. Accommodations are very nice
  - f. My read of the moon-pool is our MBES could be deployed in lieu of their system?
  - g. No mention of providing food

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402026

**RFP TITLE:** Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel

**BIDDER NAME:** Geodynamics LLC

**DATE:** 04/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Peyton Benson

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Marine Resources

- h. Crew appointments are near-luxurious and vessel has refrigeration and cooktop with a full galley and two heads
  
- 4) Section IV Cost Proposal
  - a. \$10,000-15,500 day rate at sea (varies based on equipment used) and \$7,000 day rate for setup and takedown
  - b. Total cost for full contract rate is \$635,000-\$935,000.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER NAME: Spear Fisheries FV Jacalwa**  
**DATE: 4.18.2024**  
**EVALUATOR NAME: Rebecca Peters**  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) **Section I Preliminary Information**  
**Eligibility Requirements**
  - i) **Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam**
  - ii) **Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters**
    - a. **Provided a photo of the USCG FV safety examine, but on it is says from coastline to <20nm and work for this survey would occur outside of 20nm from the coast.**
  
- 2) **Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience**
  - i) **Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form): 28 years as a fishermen in the gulf of maine and participated in multiple fisheries (groundfish, lobster, scallop, Atlantic bluefin tuna, menhaden). Has participated in some cooperative research in the past. Was a captain for DMR's ventless trap survey a long time ago and used to take sea samplers but hasn't taken one since 2016.**
  - ii) **Subcontractors: none listed**
  - iii) **Org chart. Provided an org chart of the Spear Fisheries LLC.**
  - iv) **Litigation. None mentioned**
  - v) **Certificate of Insurance. Provided insurance certificate.**
  
- 3) **Section III Proposed Services**
  - **The smallest vessel and unsure if the size of this vessel would be able to complete the multiple overnight trips needed for this project due to size. The vessel may not be able to work in adverse weather because of the size and limited water capacity. Has a head. Not mention of enough space for scientific crew and what bunk space is like.**
  
- 4) **Section IV Cost Proposal**

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**

**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**

**BIDDER NAME: Spear Fisheries FV Jacalwa**

**DATE: 4.18.2024**

**EVALUATOR NAME: Rebecca Peters**

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

i) **Total cost: \$454.000**

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER NAME: Spear Fisheries FV Jacalwa**  
**DATE: 4/17/2024**  
**EVALUATOR NAME: Caleb Hodgdon**  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) **Section I Preliminary Information**  
**Eligibility Requirements**
  - i) **Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam**
  - ii) **Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters**
    - a. **Provided a photo of the USCG FV safety examine, but on it is says from coastline to <20nm and work for this survey would occur outside of 20nm from the coast.**
  
- 2) **Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience**
  - i) **Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form): Over 28 years fishing in the Gulf of Maine in numerous fisheries: groundfish, lobster, scallop, Atlantic bluefin tuna, menhaden. Worked with DMR on lobster stock removal for dredging in Portland Harbor and also worked with the ventless trap survey.**
  - ii) **Subcontractors: none listed**
  - iii) **Org chart. Provided an org chart of the Spear Fisheries LLC.**
  - iv) **Litigation. None mentioned.**
  - v) **Certificate of Insurance. Provided insurance certificate.**
  
- 3) **Section III Proposed Services**
  - **This is the smallest vessel to apply. Setup more like traditional lobster boat. I am unsure of sleeping quarters as they may be very tight. I would need to ask more questions about the available electricity. Has fuel to support 8 day trip.**
  
- 4) **Section IV Cost Proposal**
  - i) **Total cost: \$454,000**

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER NAME: Spear Fisheries, LLC (F/V Jacalwa)**  
**DATE: 4/17/2024**  
**EVALUATOR NAME: Jesse Minor**  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) *Section I Preliminary Information  
Eligibility Requirements*
  - i) *Proof of F/V Safety Exam was provided*
  - ii) *Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters was provided*
  
- 2) *Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience  
Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form):*
  1. *Fishing Experience in Gulf of Maine*
    - *28 yrs in lobster, groundfish, scallop, tuna, menhaden*
    - *Some fisheries are multi-day*
    - *Maintains a multi-vessel fleet*
  2. *Experience with Science Support*
    - *Lobster removals prior to dredging Portland harbor with DMR*
    - *Ventless trap survey, sea sampling with DMR*
  - ii) *Subcontractors: not listed*
  - iii) *Org chart. Detailed Org chart provided*
  - iv) *Litigation. None listed*
  - v) *Certificate of Insurance was provided*
  
- 3) *Section III Proposed Services*
  3. *Vessel Suitability (incl Appendix F)*
    - *46' lobsterboat, could be pretty small for multi-day*
    - *20 kts, lifting rails for stability*
    - *Has head*
    - *Limited freshwater (50 gal), has galley*

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**

**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**

**BIDDER NAME: Spear Fisheries, LLC (F/V Jacalwa)**

**DATE: 4/17/2024**

**EVALUATOR NAME: Jesse Minor**

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

- *Power supply unclear*
- *Has tuna tower for observers!!*
- *USCG limited to <20 nmi, and most of our survey area is outside this distance from shore*
- *Provided detailed narrative outlining services*
- *describes safety and maintenance as important, including drills*
- *org chart specifies that crew are capable of navigation and meals*
- *probably pretty cramped for 6 ppl on multi-day trips*
- *Wrote good scope of work; application is thorough*

- 4) *Section IV Cost Proposal*
4. *Day rate, onshore and at sea*
- *\$454,000 total*
  - *\$7,500/day*
  - *\$800/day onshore*

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402026  
**RFP TITLE:** Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel  
**BIDDER NAME:** Spear Fisheries LLC  
**DATE:** 04/19/2024  
**EVALUATOR NAME:** Peyton Benson  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Marine Resources

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) Section I Preliminary Information  
Eligibility Requirements
  - a. Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam
  - b. Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters
    - i. Provided USCG FV safety exam but vessel is limited to within 20nm and target areas are well outside of this line.
  
- 2) Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience
  - a. Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form): Bidder has 28+ years of experience fishing commercially in the Gulf of Maine. Bidder has participated in ground fishing, lobster, scallop, bluefin tuna, and menhaden. Bidder has DMR science support listed from over 5 years ago.
  - b. Subcontractors not mentioned
  - c. Organizational chart provided
  - d. Litigation not mentioned
  - e. Insurance certification was provided
  
- 3) Section III Proposed Services
  - a. 46' x 16', Wesmac built 2016
  - b. Vessel speed appears to be sufficient for survey needs but no outriggers + birds
  - c. Unsure of electrical capability given 100 amp response
  - d. Size of the vessel brings reservations regarding crew space and platform stability for the project surveys
  - e. No interior images of the vessel were included. I would very much like to see the vessel before approving on mounting space and accommodations

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402026

**RFP TITLE:** Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel

**BIDDER NAME:** Spear Fisheries LLC

**DATE:** 04/19/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Peyton Benson

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Marine Resources

- f. Mentioned meal preparation with crew and has galley with refrigeration and cooktop/oven. Also noted proper provisioning in work plan
- 4) Section IV Cost Proposal
- a. \$7,500 day rate at sea, \$800 day rate for setup and takedown
  - b. Total cost for full contract rate is \$454,000.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER NAME: Lynn & William FV Lynn William**  
**DATE: 4.18.2024**  
**EVALUATOR NAME: Rebecca Peters**  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) **Section I Preliminary Information**  
**Eligibility Requirements**
  - i) **Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam**
  - ii) **Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters**
    - a. **Provided this information for this vessel**
  
- 2) **Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience**
  - i) **Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form): Has been participating and fishing in the groundfish fishery in 1986. The company own and operate 4 vessels of the same size 87-95' vessel. Fish out of Portland, ME and have fished in the Gulf of Maine since 1986 so has a lot of experience operating a vessel in this area. Has not done any collaborative research in the past, but it would be good to get new commercial fishing vessels and captains involved in collaborative research.**
  - ii) **Subcontractors: did not mention any**
  - iii) **Org chart: did not include one.**
  - iv) **Litigation. Did not list any.**
  - v) **Certificate of Insurance. Did not see this included.**
  
- 3) **Section III Proposed Services**
  - **Has the space and large enough vessel with enough bunk space to fit captain and crew and scientific staff. The largest vessels out of the ones that submitted bid so it could be better for reaching the farther off priority areas in tougher weather conditions allowing for more work to possibly get done. Has multiple bunk spaces to allow for privacy and has an enclosed head for privacy needed for overnight trips.**
  
- 4) **Section IV Cost Proposal**
  - i) **Total cost: \$629,000**

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**

**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**

**BIDDER NAME: Lynn & William FV Lynn William**

**DATE: 4.18.2024**

**EVALUATOR NAME: Rebecca Peters**

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER NAME: F/V Lynn William**  
**DATE: 4/17/2024**  
**EVALUATOR NAME: Caleb Hodgdon**  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) **Section I Preliminary Information**  
**Eligibility Requirements**
  - i) **Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam**
  - ii) **Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters**
    - a. **Provided this information for this vessel**
  
- 2) **Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience**
  - i) **Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form): 42+ years fishing in the Gulf of maine. Has not done any collaborative research in this time. ive research.**
  - ii) **Subcontractors: did not mention any**
  - iii) **Org chart: did not include one.**
  - iv) **Litigation. Did not list any.**
  - v) **Certificate of Insurance. Did not see this included.**
  
- 3) **Section III Proposed Services**
  - **A large boat with more than enough room for our crew. Vessel does provide the space, speed and electrical supply that we require.**
  
- 4) **Section IV Cost Proposal**
  - i) **Total cost: \$629,000**

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**

**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**

**BIDDER NAME: F/V Lynne William (Lynn & William Inc)**

**DATE: 4/17/2024**

**EVALUATOR NAME: Jesse Minor**

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) *Section I Preliminary Information  
Eligibility Requirements*
  - i) *Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam not provided*
  - ii) *Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters not provided*
  
- 2) *Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience*
  - i) *Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form):*
    1. *Fishing Experience in Gulf of Maine*
      - *Trawling since 1986, GOM and George's Bank*
      - *Owns 4 trawlers (3 were applicants for this RFP)*
      - *Obviously that's a lot of fishing experience in the relevant region*
    2. *Experience with Science Support*
      - *None listed*
  - ii) *Subcontractors: they didn't mention subcontractors.*
  - iii) *Org chart. Bart is president, no org chart supplied*
  - iv) *Litigation. None listed*
  - v) *Certificate of Insurance. Not provided*
  
- 3) *Section III Proposed Services*
  - i) *Discuss Appendix F and vessel suitability*
    - *78'*
    - *Does not report hull speed*
    - *Stabilizers and birds*
    - *30 kW and 40 kW generators*

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**

**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**

**BIDDER NAME: F/V Lynne William (Lynn & William Inc)**

**DATE: 4/17/2024**

**EVALUATOR NAME: Jesse Minor**

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

- *6 berths and 4-berth rooms*
- *Seems like a great platform for this work*
- *Submitted tons of photos, which is great. Submitted without email subject lines, which was a little harder to deal with. Maybe isn't super detail-oriented.*
- *McNeel misreports vessel length and other factors compared to the survey reports.*

**4) Section IV Cost Proposal**

- *\$1,458,000 total bid*
  1. *\$10,150 day rate, 120 days*
  2. *\$4,000 onshore rate, 60 days*
    - a. *Mapping season is only 60 days, with 5 days mobilization/demobilization*
- *Extrapolate to \$629,000 for 60 days + 5 onshore days*

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402026  
**RFP TITLE:** Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel  
**BIDDER NAME:** Lynn & William Inc (F/V Lynn William)  
**DATE:** 04/19/2024  
**EVALUATOR NAME:** Peyton Benson  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Marine Resources

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) Section I Preliminary Information  
Eligibility Requirements
  - a. Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam
  - b. Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters
    - i. Provided this information
  
- 2) Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience
  - a. Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form): Bidder has owned and operated 4 commercial otter trawls in Portland. Has had fishing vessels in Portland since 1986 and has been fishing in offshore Gulf of Maine since 1982. No scientific support listed.
  - b. Subcontractors not mentioned
  - c. Organizational chart not provided
  - d. Litigation not mentioned
  - e. Insurance certification was not provided
  
- 3) Section III Proposed Services
  - a. 77' x 23', Raised Forecastle, built 1980
  - b. Vessel dimensions differ on documentation provided. Survey report values referenced as correct
  - c. Vessel speed not listed
  - d. Electrical capability appears to be sufficient for survey needs and has outriggers + birds
  - e. Additional photos of the vessel would be useful to determine suitability for scientific crew and mounting locations for required survey systems
  - f. No mention of providing food or plan for mounting of external equipment
  - g. Has galley with refrigeration and cooktop/oven

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402026

**RFP TITLE:** Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel

**BIDDER NAME:** Lynn & William Inc (F/V Lynn William)

**DATE:** 04/19/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Peyton Benson

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Marine Resources

- 4) Section IV Cost Proposal
  - a. \$10,150 day rate at sea, \$4,000 day rate for setup and takedown
  - b. Total cost for full contract rate is \$629,000

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER NAME: Lynn & William FV William Lynn**  
**DATE: 4.18.2024**  
**EVALUATOR NAME: Rebecca Peters**  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

\*\*\*\*\*  
**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*  
\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) **Section I Preliminary Information**  
**Eligibility Requirements**
  - i) **Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam**
  - ii) **Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters**
    - a. **Provided this information for this vessel – expires October 31, 2024**
  
- 2) **Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience**
  - i) **Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form): Has been participating and fishing in the groundfish fishery in 1982. The company own and operate 4 vessels of the same size 87-95' vessel. Fish out of Portland, ME and have fished in the Gulf of Maine since 1982 so has a lot of experience operating a vessel in this area. Has not done any collaborative research in the past, but it would be good to get new commercial fishing vessels and captains involved in collaborative research.**
  - ii) **Subcontractors: did not mention any**
  - iii) **Org chart: did not include one.**
  - iv) **Litigation. Did not list any.**
  - v) **Certificate of Insurance. Did not see this included.**
  
- 3) **Section III Proposed Services**
  - **Has the space and large enough vessel with enough bunk space to fit captain and crew and scientific staff. The largest vessels out of the ones that submitted bid (largest of the 3 the company submitted bids for too) so it could be better for reaching the farther off priority areas in tougher weather conditions allowing for more work to possibly get done. Has multiple bunk spaces to allow for privacy and has an enclosed head for privacy needed for overnight trips.**
  
- 4) **Section IV Cost Proposal**

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**

**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**

**BIDDER NAME: Lynn & William FV William Lynn**

**DATE: 4.18.2024**

**EVALUATOR NAME: Rebecca Peters**

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

- i) **Total cost: \$645,000**

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER NAME: William Lynn**  
**DATE: 4/17/2024**  
**EVALUATOR NAME: Caleb Hodgdon**  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) **Section I Preliminary Information**  
**Eligibility Requirements**
  - i) **Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam**
  - ii) **Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters**
    - a. **Provided this information for this vessel – expires October 31, 2024**
  
- 2) **Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience**
  - i) **Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form): 42+ years fishing in the Gulf of Maine. Owns and operates 4 vessels of the same size 87-95' vessels. Fishing out of Portland, ME. Has not done and science related work.**
  - ii) **Subcontractors: did not mention any**
  - iii) **Org chart: did not include one.**
  - iv) **Litigation. Did not list any.**
  - v) **Certificate of Insurance. Did not see this included.**
  
- 3) **Section III Proposed Services**
  - **Has adequate size, speed and electrical supply. One of the bigger boats with lots of crew space. Has fuel for 20 days at sea.**
  
- 4) **Section IV Cost Proposal**
  - i) **Total cost: \$645,000**

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**

**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**

**BIDDER NAME: Lynn & William Inc. (F/V William Lynn)**

**DATE: 4/17/2024**

**EVALUATOR NAME: Jesse Minor**

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

*Section I Preliminary Information*

*Eligibility Requirements*

- i) Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam not provided*
- ii) Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters not provided*

*2) Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience*

*i) Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form):*

- 1. Fishing Experience in Gulf of Maine*
  - Trawling since 1986, GOM and George's Bank*
  - Owns 4 trawlers (3 were applicants for this RFP)*
  - Obviously that's a lot of fishing experience in the relevant region*
- 2. Experience with Science Support*
  - None listed*

*ii) Subcontractors: they didn't mention subcontractors.*

*iii) Org chart. Bart is president, no org chart supplied*

*iv) Litigation. None listed*

*v) Certificate of Insurance. Not provided*

*3) Section III Proposed Services*

*i) Discuss Appendix F and vessel suitability*

- 76.7'*
- 8-9 kts*
- Stabilizers and birds*
- 40 kW genset and 30 kW genset with 12V service via batteries*

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**

**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**

**BIDDER NAME: Lynn & William Inc. (F/V William Lynn)**

**DATE: 4/17/2024**

**EVALUATOR NAME: Jesse Minor**

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

- *4-berth stateroom and 2 2-berth staterooms w lockers*
- *4,000 gallons freshwater*
- *Seems like a great platform for this work*
- *Submitted tons of photos, which is great. Submitted without email subject lines, which was a little harder to deal with. Maybe isn't super detail-oriented.*
- *McNeel misreports vessel length and other factors compared to the survey reports.*

4) *Section IV Cost Proposal*

- *\$1,500,000 total bid*
  1. *\$10,400 day rate, 120 days*
  2. *\$4,200 onshore rate, 60 days*
    - a. *Mapping season is only 60 days, with 5 days mobilization/demobilization*
- *Extrapolate to \$645,000 for 60 days + 5 onshore days*

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402026  
**RFP TITLE:** Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel  
**BIDDER NAME:** Lynn & William Inc (F/V William Lynn)  
**DATE:** 04/19/2024  
**EVALUATOR NAME:** Peyton Benson  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Marine Resources

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) Section I Preliminary Information  
Eligibility Requirements
  - a. Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam
  - b. Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters
    - i. Provided this information
  
- 2) Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience
  - a. Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form): Bidder has owned and operated 4 commercial otter trawls in Portland. Has had fishing vessels in Portland since 1986 and has been fishing in offshore Gulf of Maine since 1982. No scientific support listed.
  - b. Subcontractors not mentioned
  - c. Organizational chart not provided
  - d. Litigation not mentioned
  - e. Insurance certification was not provided
  
- 3) Section III Proposed Services
  - a. 77' x 24', Raised Forecastle built 1984
  - b. Vessel dimensions differ on documentation provided. Survey report values referenced as correct
  - c. Vessel speed and electrical capability appears to be sufficient for survey needs and has outriggers + birds
  - d. Additional photos of the vessel would be useful to determine suitability for scientific crew and mounting locations for required survey systems
  - e. No mention of providing food or plan for mounting of external equipment
  - f. Has galley with refrigeration and cooktop/oven

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402026

**RFP TITLE:** Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel

**BIDDER NAME:** Lynn & William Inc (F/V William Lynn)

**DATE:** 04/19/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Peyton Benson

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Marine Resources

4) Section IV Cost Proposal

- a. \$10,400 day rate at sea, \$4,200 day rate for setup and takedown
- b. Total cost for full contract rate is \$645,000

I. Proposed Services

1. Day rate, onshore and at sea

- \$10,400 day rate at sea, \$4,200 day rate for setup and takedown
- Proposed to fulfill 120 days sea time and 60 days of setup/takedown
- Proposed sea time is twice what the RFP calls for
- Total cost proposed was \$1,500,000

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER NAME: Lynn & William FV Patriot**  
**DATE: 4.18.2024**  
**EVALUATOR NAME: Rebecca Peters**  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) **Section I Preliminary Information**  
**Eligibility Requirements**
  - i) **Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam**
  - ii) **Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters**
    - a. **Provided this information for this vessel – expires October 31, 2024**
  
- 2) **Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience**
  - i) **Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form): Has been participating and fishing in the groundfish fishery in 1986. The company own and operate 4 vessels of the same size 87-95' vessel. Fish out of Portland, ME and have fished in the Gulf of Maine since 1986 so has a lot of experience operating a vessel in this area. Has not done any collaborative research in the past, but it would be good to get new commercial fishing vessels and captains involved in collaborative research.**
  - ii) **Subcontractors: did not mention any**
  - iii) **Org chart: did not include one.**
  - iv) **Litigation. Did not list any.**
  - v) **Certificate of Insurance. Did not see this included.**
  
- 3) **Section III Proposed Services**
  - **Has the space and large enough vessel with enough bunk space to fit captain and crew and scientific staff. The largest vessels out of the ones that submitted bid so it could be better for reaching the farther off priority areas in tougher weather conditions allowing for more work to possibly get done. Has multiple bunk spaces to allow for privacy and has an enclosed head for privacy needed for overnight trips.**
  
- 4) **Section IV Cost Proposal**
  - i) **Total cost: \$690,500**

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**

**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**

**BIDDER NAME: Lynn & William FV Patriot**

**DATE: 4.18.2024**

**EVALUATOR NAME: Rebecca Peters**

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER NAME: Lynn & William FV Patriot**  
**DATE: 4/17/2024**  
**EVALUATOR NAME: Caleb Hodgdon**  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) **Section I Preliminary Information**  
**Eligibility Requirements**
  - i) **Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam**
  - ii) **Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters**
    - a. **Provided this information for this vessel – expires October 31, 2024**
  
- 2) **Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience**
  - i) **Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form): Has 42+ years fishing in the Gulf of Maine. Owns and operates 4 vessels of similar size fishing out of Portland. Has not done any science related work.**
  - ii) **Subcontractors: did not mention any**
  - iii) **Org chart: did not include one.**
  - iv) **Litigation. Did not list any.**
  - v) **Certificate of Insurance. Did not see this included.**
  
- 3) **Section III Proposed Services**
  - **One of the bigger vessels. Has more than enough space for crew and electrical needs. Has fuel enough for 11 days at sea.**
  
- 4) **Section IV Cost Proposal**
  - i) **Total cost: \$\$690,500**

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**  
**BIDDER NAME: F/V Patriot (Dianne Lynn Inc)**  
**DATE: 4/17/2024**  
**EVALUATOR NAME: Jesse Minor**  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) *Section I Preliminary Information  
Eligibility Requirements*
  - i) *Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam not provided*
  - ii) *Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters not provided*
  
- 2) *Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience*
  - i) *Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form):*
    1. *Fishing Experience in Gulf of Maine*
      - *Trawling since 1986, GOM and George's Bank*
      - *Owns 4 trawlers (3 were applicants for this RFP)*
      - *Obviously that's a lot of fishing experience in the relevant region*
    2. *Experience with Science Support*
      - *None listed*
  - ii) *Subcontractors: they didn't mention subcontractors.*
  - iii) *Org chart. Bart is president, no org chart supplied*
  - iv) *Litigation. None listed*
  - v) *Certificate of Insurance. Not provided*
  
- 3) *Section III Proposed Services*
  - i) *Discuss Appendix F and vessel suitability*
    - *76'*
    - *8-10 kts*
    - *4,500 gallons freshwater*
    - *Does not report hull speed*

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202402026**

**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**

**BIDDER NAME: F/V Patriot (Dianne Lynn Inc)**

**DATE: 4/17/2024**

**EVALUATOR NAME: Jesse Minor**

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MARINE RESOURCES**

- *Stabilizers and birds*
- *30 kW and 40 kW generators*
- *6 berths and master's cabin*
- *Seems like a great platform for this work*
- *Submitted tons of photos, which is great. Submitted without email subject lines, which was a little harder to deal with. Maybe isn't super detail-oriented.*
- *McNeel misreports vessel length and other factors compared to the survey reports. Lists boat length at 87' but survey says 76'*
- *Asks if trips can be 8-10 days to reduce transit*
- 

**4) Section IV Cost Proposal**

- *\$1,596,000 total bid*
  1. *\$11,150 day rate, 120 days*
  2. *\$4,300 onshore rate, 60 days*
    - a. *Mapping season is only 60 days, with 5 days mobilization/demobilization*
- *Extrapolate to \$690,500 for 60 days + 5 onshore days*

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402026  
**RFP TITLE:** Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel  
**BIDDER NAME:** F/V Patriot  
**DATE:** 04/17/2024  
**EVALUATOR NAME:** Peyton Benson  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Marine Resources

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) Section I Preliminary Information  
Eligibility Requirements
  - a. Copy of USCG Captain's License or proof of F/V Safety Exam
  - b. Proof of current USCG inspection for vessel operating in federal waters
    - i. Provided and expires end of October 2024
  
- 2) Section II Organization Qualifications and Experience
  - a. Appx C (Qualification & Experience Form): Bidder has owned and operated 4 commercial otter trawls in Portland. Has had fishing vessels in Portland since 1986 and has been fishing in offshore Gulf of Maine since 1982. No scientific support listed.
  - b. Subcontractors not mentioned
  - c. Organizational chart not provided
  - d. Litigation not mentioned
  - e. Insurance certification was not provided
  
- 3) Section III Proposed Services
  - a. 87' x 23', Raised Forecastle built 1984
  - b. Vessel speed and electricity appear to be sufficient for survey needs and the vessel has outriggers + birds
  - c. Additional photos of the vessel would be useful to determine suitability for scientific crew and mounting locations for required survey systems
  - d. No mention of providing food or plan for mounting of external equipment
  - e. Has galley with refrigeration and cooktop/oven
  
- 4) Section IV Cost Proposal

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402026

**RFP TITLE:** Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel

**BIDDER NAME:** F/V Patriot

**DATE:** 04/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Peyton Benson

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Marine Resources

- a. \$11,150 day rate at sea, \$4,300 day rate for setup and takedown
- b. Total cost for full contract rate was \$690,500



STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF MARINE RESOURCES

Janet T. Mills  
Governor

Patrick Keliher  
Commissioner

**AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT**  
**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**

I, Caleb B. Hodgdon, accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Marine Resources. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

**I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.**

\_\_\_\_\_  
Signature

04/03/2024

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date



STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF MARINE RESOURCES

Janet T. Mills  
Governor

Patrick Keliher  
Commissioner

**AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT**  
**RFP #: 202402026**  
**RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**

I, Jesse Minor accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Marine Resources. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

**I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.**

Jesse Minor  
Signature

04/01/2024  
Date



**STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF MARINE RESOURCES**

Janet T. Mills  
Governor

Patrick Keliher  
Commissioner

**AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT  
RFP #: 202402026  
RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**

**I, Peyton Benson** accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Marine Resources. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

**I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.**

04/03/2024

---

Signature

---

Date



**STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF MARINE RESOURCES**

Janet T. Mills  
Governor

Patrick Keliher  
Commissioner

**AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT  
RFP #: 202402026  
RFP TITLE: Seafloor Mapping Survey Vessel**

I, \_\_\_\_\_Rebecca Peters\_\_\_\_\_ accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Marine Resources. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

**I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.**

\_\_\_\_\_  
Signature

4/3/2024

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date