

**State of Maine  
Master Score Sheet**

RFP# 202402023					
Workforce Attraction Marketing Services					
Bidder Name:		AVA TopRight	Black Travel Maine	Blaze Partners	Broadreach PR
Proposed Cost:		\$2,500,000	\$2,492,800	\$2,165,000	\$2,500,000
Scoring Sections	Points Available				
Section I: Preliminary Information	N/A				
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	26	10	32	28
Section III: Proposed Services	40	20	15	15	32
Section IV: Cost Proposal	25	12	15	13	12
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>58</u></b>	<b><u>40</u></b>	<b><u>60</u></b>	<b><u>72</u></b>
Bidder Name:		Campfire Naretiv	CashmanKatz	Creative Direct Marketing	DCI
Proposed Cost:		\$2,320,000	\$2,500,000	\$2,499,000	\$1,798,730
Scoring Sections	Points Available				
Section I: Preliminary Information	N/A				
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	18	20	5	32
Section III: Proposed Services	40	12	12	0	25
Section IV: Cost Proposal	25	12	9	18	16
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>42</u></b>	<b><u>41</u></b>	<b><u>23</u></b>	<b><u>73</u></b>

**RFP# 202402023**

**Workforce Attraction Marketing Services**

<b>Bidder Name:</b>		<b>Elephant in the Room</b>	<b>Fuseideas</b>	<b>Golden Shovel Agency</b>	<b>Hirons</b>
<b>Proposed Cost:</b>		<b>\$2,534,500</b>	<b>\$2,477,800</b>	<b>\$2,493,000</b>	<b>\$2,450,000</b>
<b>Scoring Sections</b>	<b>Points Available</b>				
Section I: Preliminary Information	N/A				
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	10	27	5	10
Section III: Proposed Services	40	10	20	5	8
Section IV: Cost Proposal	25	12	12	13	12
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>32</u></b>	<b><u>59</u></b>	<b><u>23</u></b>	<b><u>30</u></b>
<b>Bidder Name:</b>		<b>Hoffman York</b>	<b>Moxie Strategies</b>	<b>PeterMayer</b>	<b>Red House Communications</b>
<b>Proposed Cost:</b>		<b>\$2,440,000</b>	<b>\$2,500,000</b>	<b>\$2,500,000</b>	<b>\$2,499,135</b>
<b>Scoring Sections</b>	<b>Points Available</b>				
Section I: Preliminary Information	N/A				
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	29	15	15	28
Section III: Proposed Services	40	27	15	8	20
Section IV: Cost Proposal	25	12	19	10	12
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>68</u></b>	<b><u>49</u></b>	<b><u>33</u></b>	<b><u>60</u></b>

**RFP# 202402023**

**Workforce Attraction Marketing Services**

<b>Bidder Name:</b>		<b>Results Marketing &amp; Design</b>	<b>Rigaud Global Company</b>	<b>Rinck Advertising</b>	<b>WeUsThem</b>
<b>Proposed Cost:</b>		<b>\$2,499,517</b>	<b>\$2,396,000</b>	<b>\$2,400,000</b>	<b>\$2,500,000</b>
<b>Scoring Sections</b>	<b>Points Available</b>				
Section I: Preliminary Information	N/A				
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	28	5	29	15
Section III: Proposed Services	40	25	8	27	10
Section IV: Cost Proposal	25	12	12	12	12
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>65</u></b>	<b><u>25</u></b>	<b><u>68</u></b>	<b><u>37</u></b>

**Award Justification Statement**  
**RFP# 202402023 - Workforce Attraction Marketing Services**

**I. Summary**

The State of Maine Department of Economic and Community Development is seeking workforce attraction marketing, outreach and support services. This includes creating a brand and campaign, using targeted advertising and PR for marketing, creating a website and toolkits, and utilizing events for recruitment. Development Counsellors International (DCI) is our awarded bidder for this contract.

**II. Evaluation Process**

The Department followed the proposal evaluation process prescribed by State procurement procedures. Evaluation team members reviewed each proposal independently and took notes comparing the submissions against the RFP. We then met as a group and reviewed and discussed each proposal, assigning a score for the Organization Qualifications and Experience and Proposed Services sections. After that, the RFP Coordinator assigned scores to the cost proposals. The team then met one more time to confirm the scores were correct and identify the top scorer. Evaluation team members included marketing and communications experience, web development and IT policy experience, and experience managing the Economic Development Strategy that spurred this RFP.

**III. Qualifications & Experience**

- Remarkable depth of experience conducting services for other states exactly in line with what the Department is seeking.
- Displayed expertise across many of the key services requested and had high-quality examples of relevant projects.
- Wide range of geographic experience, accessing markets across the U.S.

**IV. Proposed Services**

- Overall had strong detail across the Proposed Services document, presenting a clear understanding and strong match to the RFP. Any exceptions to this were made up for by the strength of other sections and are addressable in contract discussions.
- Addressed the creation of a brand guide well.

- Strong discussion of the website, which will be a central hub for the campaign, going above and beyond the RFP.

## **V. Cost Proposal**

The awarded bidder proposed a total cost of \$1,798,730. This was the lowest of all submitted proposals, although they were not quite the highest-scoring cost proposal due to the specific scoring formula for this RFP. They received 16 out of 25 points available for the cost proposal, while the highest-scoring bidder in this section received 19 points.

## **VI. Conclusion**

The awarded bidder's experience and proposal instilled confidence that they are well-suited to conduct the requested services for the Department. They have remarkably strong experience in the specific field of state workforce attraction marketing and provided a detailed proposal demonstrating their ability to carry out what the Department is seeking.



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

August 16, 2024

Matthew Kruchko  
AVA TopRight, LLC  
1 Concourse Parkway  
Suite 800  
Atlanta, GA 30328

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402023, Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

Dear Matthew Kruchko:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Economic and Community Development for Workforce Attraction Marketing Services. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Development Counsellors International (DCI)

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Phoenix McLaughlin  
Director of Strategy Implementation



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

## STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).





JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

August 16, 2024

Lisa Jones  
Black Travel Maine  
10 Water Street  
#110  
Waterville, ME 04901

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402023, Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

Dear Lisa Jones:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Economic and Community Development for Workforce Attraction Marketing Services. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Development Counsellors International (DCI)

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Phoenix McLaughlin  
Director of Strategy Implementation



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

## STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

August 16, 2024

Jenna Klein Jonsson  
Blaze Partners  
269 US-1  
Suite 201  
Falmouth, ME 04105

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402023, Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

Dear Jenna Klein Jonsson:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Economic and Community Development for Workforce Attraction Marketing Services. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Development Counsellors International (DCI)

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Phoenix McLaughlin  
Director of Strategy Implementation



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

## STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

August 16, 2024

Linda Varrell  
Broadreach Public Relations, LLC  
19 Commercial St.  
3<sup>rd</sup> Floor  
Portland, ME 04101

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402023, Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

Dear Linda Varrell:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Economic and Community Development for Workforce Attraction Marketing Services. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Development Counsellors International (DCI)

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Phoenix McLaughlin  
Director of Strategy Implementation





JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

## STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

August 16, 2024

Mark Benjamin  
Campfire Naretiv  
21 Elm St.  
Second Floor  
Camden, ME 04843

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402023, Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

Dear Mark Benjamin:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Economic and Community Development for Workforce Attraction Marketing Services. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Development Counsellors International (DCI)

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Phoenix McLaughlin  
Director of Strategy Implementation



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

## STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT



August 16, 2024

Amanda Mueller  
CashmanKatz  
76 Eastern Boulevard  
Glastonbury, CT 06033

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402023, Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

Dear Amanda Mueller:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Economic and Community Development for Workforce Attraction Marketing Services. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Development Counsellors International (DCI)

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Phoenix McLaughlin  
Director of Strategy Implementation



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

## STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

August 16, 2024

Michael Oppenheimer  
Creative Direct Marketing Group  
1313 4<sup>th</sup> Ave. N  
Nashville, TN 37208

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402023, Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

Dear Michael Oppenheimer:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Economic and Community Development for Workforce Attraction Marketing Services. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Development Counsellors International (DCI)

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.





JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Phoenix McLaughlin  
Director of Strategy Implementation



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

## STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

August 16, 2024

Patience Fairbrother  
Development Counsellors International (DCI)  
215 Park Ave S  
14<sup>th</sup> Floor  
New York, NY 10003

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402023, Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

Dear Patience Fairbrother:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Economic and Community Development for Workforce Attraction Marketing Services. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Development Counsellors International (DCI)

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Phoenix McLaughlin  
Director of Strategy Implementation



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

## STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

August 16, 2024

Scott Gross  
Elephant In The Room  
301 N Main St  
Ste 2100  
Winston-Salem, NC 27101

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402023, Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

Dear Scott Gross:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Economic and Community Development for Workforce Attraction Marketing Services. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Development Counsellors International (DCI)

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Phoenix McLaughlin  
Director of Strategy Implementation



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

## STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).





JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

August 16, 2024

Steve Mason  
Fuseideas  
34-A Exchange Street  
3<sup>rd</sup> Floor  
Portland, ME 04101

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402023, Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

Dear Steve Mason:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Economic and Community Development for Workforce Attraction Marketing Services. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Development Counsellors International (DCI)

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Phoenix McLaughlin  
Director of Strategy Implementation



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

## STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

August 16, 2024

Laura Christie  
Golden Shovel Agency  
43 Broadway East  
Little Falls, MN 56345

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402023, Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

Dear Laura Christie:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Economic and Community Development for Workforce Attraction Marketing Services. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Development Counsellors International (DCI)

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Phoenix McLaughlin  
Director of Strategy Implementation



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

## STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

August 16, 2024

Andy Driscoll  
Hirons and Company Communications  
422 E New York Street  
Indianapolis, IN 46202

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402023, Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

Dear Andy Driscoll:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Economic and Community Development for Workforce Attraction Marketing Services. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Development Counsellors International (DCI)

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Phoenix McLaughlin  
Director of Strategy Implementation





JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

## STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

August 16, 2024

Angie Buchanan  
Hoffman York  
200 N Water St.  
Milwaukee, WI 53202

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402023, Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

Dear Angie Buchanan:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Economic and Community Development for Workforce Attraction Marketing Services. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Development Counsellors International (DCI)

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Phoenix McLaughlin  
Director of Strategy Implementation



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

## STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

August 16, 2024

Hira Shaikh  
Moxie Strategies LLC  
603 Mattison Ave  
Ste 2100  
Asbury Park, NJ 07712

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402023, Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

Dear Hira Shaikh:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Economic and Community Development for Workforce Attraction Marketing Services. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Development Counsellors International (DCI)

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Phoenix McLaughlin  
Director of Strategy Implementation



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

## STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

August 16, 2024

Liz Murnin  
PETERMAYER  
923 Tchoupitoulas St.  
New Orleans, LA 70130

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402023, Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

Dear Liz Murnin:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Economic and Community Development for Workforce Attraction Marketing Services. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Development Counsellors International (DCI)

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.





JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Phoenix McLaughlin  
Director of Strategy Implementation



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

## STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

August 16, 2024

Matt Blint  
Red House Communications, Inc.  
1908 Sarah Street  
Pittsburgh, PA 15203

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402023, Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

Dear Matt Blint:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Economic and Community Development for Workforce Attraction Marketing Services. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Development Counsellors International (DCI)

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Phoenix McLaughlin  
Director of Strategy Implementation



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

## STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

August 16, 2024

Ted Darling  
Results Marketing & Design  
17 Ash St.  
Westbrook, ME 04092

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402023, Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

Dear Ted Darling:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Economic and Community Development for Workforce Attraction Marketing Services. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Development Counsellors International (DCI)

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Phoenix McLaughlin  
Director of Strategy Implementation



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

## STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).





JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

August 16, 2024

Raphael Rigaud  
Rigaud Global Company  
2700 Neabsco Common Pl  
Ste 101  
Woodbridge, VA 22191

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402023, Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

Dear Raphael Rigaud:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Economic and Community Development for Workforce Attraction Marketing Services. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Development Counsellors International (DCI)

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Phoenix McLaughlin  
Director of Strategy Implementation



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

## STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

August 16, 2024

Kathleen de Silva  
Rinck Advertising, Inc.  
113 Lisbon Street  
Lewiston, ME 04240

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402023, Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

Dear Kathleen de Silva:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Economic and Community Development for Workforce Attraction Marketing Services. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Development Counsellors International (DCI)

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Phoenix McLaughlin  
Director of Strategy Implementation



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

## STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT



August 16, 2024

Sarah Van Achte  
WeUsThem Inc.  
1791 Barrington St, Suite 402  
Halifax, Nova Scotia B3J 3K9  
Canada

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202402023, Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

Dear Sarah Van Achte:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Economic and Community Development for Workforce Attraction Marketing Services. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Development Counsellors International (DCI)

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.



JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Phoenix McLaughlin  
Director of Strategy Implementation





JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC  
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**MAINE.**  
ECONOMIC & COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT  
HEATHER JOHNSON  
COMMISSIONER

## STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** AVA TopRight

**DATE:** 7/19/24

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** Economic and Community Development

**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**Names of Evaluators:** Victoria Foley; Logan Ryan; Phoenix McLaughlin

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>N/A</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>26</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>20</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>12</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>58</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** AVA TopRight  
**DATE:** 7/19/24

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

None

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** AVA TopRight  
**DATE:** 7/19/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>26</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- I. Overview of the Organization
  - Experience with government marketing and attraction. Alignment with RFP from prior work.
  - Evidence of creating brand identities and multichannel campaigns.
  - Adequate experience.
  - Not 100% overlap between project examples and this RFP, but a decent amount.
- II. Subcontractors
  - Clear experience with government work among subcontractors.
- III. Organizational Chart
  -
- IV. Litigation
  -
- V. Financial Viability
  - Didn't offer requested report.
- VI. Certificate of Insurances
  -

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** AVA TopRight  
**DATE:** 7/19/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>20</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

1. Services to be Provided
  - Objectives not clearly articulated. At least potential objectives would be good to include. Didn't get good sense of how reporting would work.
  - Geography component fairly generic.
  - Good research upfront.
  - No reference to brand standards document, which is common practice.
  - Discussed economic development portal for Maine, which is not what we're looking for.
  - Strong targeted ad language.
  - Technical info on website was lacking. Expected to see more requirements there. What happens to website after website ends? Do agree to follow our IT policies.
  
2. Implementation – Work Plan
  - Extensive target audience discussion. Reference proprietary AI-based audience segmentation. A lot of this was already undertaken, which made for a robust proposal, but indicates a potentially less collaborative approach.
  - Very detailed. Marketing concepts already drafted. Understandable, but that is to be developed collaboratively.
  - Timeline could have been clearer, more specifics included. Notably not detailed relative to rest of proposal.
  - Q1 2025 launch is fine.

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** AVA TopRight

**DATE:** 7/19/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$40,350</b>	,	<b>\$234,260</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>10 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>1.7</b>
<b>\$1,498,800</b>	,	<b>\$2,265,740</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>15 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>9.9</b>
				<b>TOTAL (rounded)</b>		<b>12</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Black Travel Maine

**DATE:** 7/19/24

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** Economic and Community Development

**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**Names of Evaluators:** Victoria Foley; Logan Ryan; Phoenix McLaughlin

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>N/A</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>10</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>15</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>15</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>40</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Black Travel Maine  
**DATE:** 7/19/24

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

None



**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Black Travel Maine

**DATE:** 7/19/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>10</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- I. Overview of the Organization
  - Relevant examples not provided. Needed to see much more about relevant background.
  - Background focused on tourism marketing. Not entirely relevant to this RFP.
- II. Subcontractors
  - Many subcontractors. Indicates they are new and don't have many of their own employees.
- III. Organizational Chart
  - Tourism focused. Good breakdown of tasks by individuals.
- IV. Litigation
  -
- V. Financial Viability
  -
- VI. Certificate of Insurances
  -

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Black Travel Maine  
**DATE:** 7/19/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>15</b>

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

1. Services to be Provided
  - Four clear objectives. Good effort, if not fully fleshed out.
  - Not enough detail on how they would necessarily accomplish everything.
  - Did hit all website development technical points.
  - A lot of high-level descriptions that could be more detailed.
  - Good brand toolkit language.
  - Didn't like the proposed campaign line very much.
  - Not much talk about research, stakeholder discussions, etc. for collaborative work that RFP envisions to create brand.
  - Again, too much tourism focus.
  - Good understanding of context and purpose of RFP.
  
2. Implementation – Work Plan
  - Confusing way of breaking down entire timeline by target audiences. Would be easier to understand if broken down by strategy/timeline. Atypical for a marketing plan.

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Black Travel Maine

**DATE:** 7/19/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$40,350</b>	,	<b>\$994,000</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>10 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>0.4</b>
<b>\$1,498,800</b>	,	<b>\$1,498,800</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>15 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>15</b>
				<b>TOTAL (rounded)</b>		<b>15</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Blaze Partners  
**DATE:** 7/19/24

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** Economic and Community Development  
**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Phoenix McLaughlin  
**Names of Evaluators:** Victoria Foley; Logan Ryan; Phoenix McLaughlin

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>N/A</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>32</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>15</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>13</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>60</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Blaze Partners  
**DATE:** 7/19/24

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

None

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Blaze Partners

**DATE:** 7/19/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>32</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- I. Overview of the Organization
  - Provides complete overview of organization, multiple relevant examples of experience.
  - Very detailed company overview.
  - Very impressed by experience.
  - Uncertain about how much experience they have outside of Maine.
- II. Subcontractors
  - Strong subcontractor choices. Great detail about subcontractors.
- III. Organizational Chart
  - Good chart, good detail on staff.
- IV. Litigation
  -
- V. Financial Viability
  -
- VI. Certificate of Insurances
  -

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Blaze Partners  
**DATE:** 7/19/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>15</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

1. Services to be Provided
  - Proposal states they will leverage the existing Live + Work in Maine brand, but RFP calls for the creation of a brand. In addition to not meeting this RFP requirement, this raises a basic intellectual property issue that may not be resolvable. Under this proposal, the State would not receive a brand it can use but instead fund work on an existing organization's brand that we presumably will not have access to after the end of the contract. We would be contracting to support a brand but not own it.
  - Suggested campaign could be improved, but they do acknowledge that would be worked on collaboratively.
  - Proposal says they want to use Live + Work in Maine's website instead of creating a new one. Not what was requested in the RFP and creates another fundamental ownership problem. Would the State take ownership of the website during the contract? Would the State retain ownership after the end of the contract? The website proposal fundamentally does not meet the State's technology requirements in this regard.
  - This proposal is not awardable as is because of these IP and IT issues. It does not meet the requirements of the RFP. The evaluation team does not feel we can score this proposal given those first-order problems.
  
2. Implementation – Work Plan
  - No timeline.

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Blaze Partners  
**DATE:** 7/19/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$40,350</b>	,	<b>\$292,000</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>10 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>1.4</b>
<b>\$1,498,800</b>	,	<b>\$1,873,000</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>15 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>12.0</b>
				<b>TOTAL (rounded)</b>		<b>13</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**



**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Broadreach PR

**DATE:** 7/19/24

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** Economic and Community Development

**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**Names of Evaluators:** Victoria Foley; Logan Ryan; Phoenix McLaughlin

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>N/A</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>28</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>32</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>12</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>72</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Broadreach PR  
**DATE:** 7/19/24

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

None

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Broadreach PR  
**DATE:** 7/19/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>28</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- I. Overview of the Organization
  - Impressive client list.
  - Referenced workforce attraction experience, although they did not give detail on those workforce-focused projects.
  - Limited to no out-of-state workforce experience.
  - Experience in full range of services requested.
- II. Subcontractors
  - Like that they included bios and relevant experience for all involved.
  - Good subcontractor arrangements to cover gaps.
- III. Organizational Chart
  - Fine chart. Helpful bios. Doesn't explicitly state what each individual will do for this contract.
- IV. Litigation
  -
- V. Financial Viability
  -
- VI. Certificate of Insurances
  -

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Broadreach PR  
**DATE:** 7/19/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>32</b>

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

1. Services to be Provided
  - Good approach to creating the brand. Seems well thought out.
  - Followed requirements of RFP.
  - Like thoughtfulness of targeting certain geographies based on what they lack relative to Maine.
  - Talk specifically about brand guide, which is good.
  - Objectives lacking intermediate steps between marketing engagement and people moving.
  - Good specificity in strategies section, although tool kit piece is lacking.
  - Thought through collaboration potential.
  - Good development approach, tracking and reporting. Overall meet technical website components well. Great from that perspective.
  
2. Implementation – Work Plan
  - Clear and easy to understand approach and timeline.
  - Would have liked to see notation that year 2 campaign would have been developed before year 2.
  - Objectives and tactics somewhat lacking.
  - If we don't have clear objectives, that makes it harder to hold to contract.

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Broadreach PR  
**DATE:** 7/19/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$40,350</b>	,	<b>\$212,175</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>10 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>1.9</b>
<b>\$1,498,800</b>	,	<b>\$2,287,825</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>15 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>9.8</b>
				<b>TOTAL (rounded)</b>		<b>12</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Campfire Naretiv

**DATE:** 7/23/24

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** Economic and Community Development

**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**Names of Evaluators:** Victoria Foley; Logan Ryan; Phoenix McLaughlin

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>N/A</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>18</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>12</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>12</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>42</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Campfire Naretiv  
**DATE:** 7/23/24

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

None

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Campfire Naretiv  
**DATE:** 7/23/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>18</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- I. Overview of the Organization
  - Interesting that they just started a strategic partnership last year.
  - Combined experiences of the group were adequate for RFP. Some demonstrated work in workforce development.
  - They drew connection between tourism and workforce attraction marketing.
  - MaineHealth campaign example is a good one, although it appears the workforce attraction component was only one part of their overall advertising work.
- II. Subcontractors
  - Clear what the subcontractor will be doing, have long partnership. Good clients.
  - Perhaps could have included others to cover gaps.
- III. Organizational Chart
  - Chart is fine but doesn't explain who will do what for this contract.
- IV. Litigation
  -
- V. Financial Viability
  -
- VI. Certificate of Insurances
  -



**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Campfire Naretiv  
**DATE:** 7/23/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>12</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

1. Services to be Provided
  - Thorough description. Glad the brand guidance was included.
  - Website and toolkit are both mentioned and aligned with requirements. However, didn't provide any info about how they would accomplish web design and build.
  - Concerned about reducing campaign flight time to 12-18 months. Feel that would limit its effectiveness. Would want to see at least 18 months of flight time.
  - Appreciated event examples.
  - The remaining components are lacking detail. How exactly will the targeted ads be used to further this campaign in particular? How will events be managed?
  - Discussion of target audiences is also thin.
  
2. Implementation – Work Plan
  - September 2025 campaign launch is much later than preferred. That will only leave about nine months of a two-year contract for the actual advertising, event attendance, recruiting, etc.

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Campfire Naretiv  
**DATE:** 7/23/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$40,350</b>	,	<b>\$240,000</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>10 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>1.7</b>
<b>\$1,498,800</b>	,	<b>\$2,080,000</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>15 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>10.8</b>
				<b>TOTAL (rounded)</b>		<b>12</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** CashmanKatz

**DATE:** 7/23/24

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** Economic and Community Development

**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**Names of Evaluators:** Victoria Foley; Logan Ryan; Phoenix McLaughlin

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>N/A</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>20</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>12</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>9</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>41</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** CashmanKatz  
**DATE:** 7/23/24

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

None

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** CashmanKatz  
**DATE:** 7/23/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>20</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- I. Overview of the Organization
  - Variety of clients including state agencies. Integrated sister companies.
  - Tourism and economic development experience, mostly in CT.
  - Like that they provided and described examples with specifics of RFP in mind.
  - No workforce attraction specific experience.
- II. Subcontractors
  - None
- III. Organizational Chart
  - Chart is acceptable. Mention what each person will do for this project, but did not include bios in text.
- IV. Litigation
  -
- V. Financial Viability
  -
- VI. Certificate of Insurances
  -

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** CashmanKatz

**DATE:** 7/23/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>12</b>

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

1. Services to be Provided
  - Strategy seems fine for creating brand.
  - Geography research included.
  - Focusing on visitor demographic is very narrow.
  - Toolkit piece unclear.
  - Didn't cover what they need for website.
  - Nothing on events.
  - Big misunderstanding of RFP purpose to dismiss people pursuing careers here. Misunderstanding of context.
  - Like the ME Locate app and the speed to market focus.
  - Good discussion of marketing tactics and data.
  
2. Implementation – Work Plan
  - Project plan is entirely focused on paid advertising. That is only one component of the RFP. No timeline given.
  - Overall, this does not respond to all aspects of the RFP.

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** CashmanKatz  
**DATE:** 7/23/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	>	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$40,350</b>	>	<b>Stated "TBD"</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>10 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b>\$1,498,800</b>	>	<b>\$2,500,000</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>15 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>9.0</b>
				<b>TOTAL (rounded)</b>		<b>9</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Creative Direct Marketing Group

**DATE:** 7/23/24

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** Economic and Community Development

**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**Names of Evaluators:** Victoria Foley; Logan Ryan; Phoenix McLaughlin

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>N/A</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>5</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>0</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>18</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>23</u></b>



**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Creative Direct Marketing Group  
**DATE:** 7/23/24

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Creative Direct Marketing Group

**DATE:** 7/23/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>5</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- I. Overview of the Organization
  - Extensive history. But very sparse. This is a direct mail firm. Little info to help us evaluate.
- II. Subcontractors
  -
- III. Organizational Chart
  - Not fully addressed.
- IV. Litigation
  -
- V. Financial Viability
  -
- VI. Certificate of Insurances
  - Out of date

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Creative Direct Marketing Group

**DATE:** 7/23/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>0</b>

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

1. Services to be Provided

Does not fully respond to RFP.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

Does not fully respond to RFP.

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Creative Direct Marketing Group

**DATE:** 7/23/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$40,350</b>	,	<b>\$44,000</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>10 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>9.2</b>
<b>\$1,498,800</b>	,	<b>\$2,455,000</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>15 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>9.2</b>
				<b>TOTAL (rounded)</b>		<b>18</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** DCI

**DATE:** 7/23/24

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** Economic and Community Development

**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**Names of Evaluators:** Victoria Foley; Logan Ryan; Phoenix McLaughlin

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>N/A</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>32</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>25</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>16</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>73</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** DCI  
**DATE:** 7/23/24

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

None

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** DCI  
**DATE:** 7/23/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>32</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- I. Overview of the Organization
  - Good overview. Long history.
  - Identifies relevant experience, including workforce attraction.
  - Wide range of geographical experience.
  - Specific state talent attraction campaign experience. Some specific alignment with what we are seeking with some of the examples.
  - Little event experience.
  - Example project outcomes focused on marketing metrics, less on intermediate, ultimate impacts.
- II. Subcontractors
  - None.
- III. Organizational Chart
  - Well written bios. Very clear chart. Clear statements of what they will do for us.
- IV. Litigation
  -
- V. Financial Viability
  -
- VI. Certificate of Insurances
  -

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** DCI  
**DATE:** 7/23/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>25</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

1. Services to be Provided
  - Very good detail in this section. Good brand guide discussion. Website discussion good, beyond RFP in some cases.
  - Digital toolkit discussion robust.
  - Talent Wars report is interesting.
  - Went through full software development cycle for website, which is impressive for this. Discusses hosting and maintenance. Didn't address how it would be handed over at the end of contract.
  - Overall impressed with level of detail.
  - Exclusion of photo/video production is a problem. Would be required to add to scope if considered for an award. This is a significant negative.
  - Sparse events plan.
  - Generally more digitally focused and website-centric work.
  
2. Implementation – Work Plan
  - Somewhat slow timeline. Web launch in April 2025, media campaign launch in May. Unclear if media production is factored in.
  - Good grasp of the context of this work.
  - Good breakdown of the target audiences and matchup of objectives and strategies. Again, tactics are largely focused on digital media.



**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** DCI  
**DATE:** 7/23/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$40,350</b>	,	<b>\$280,400</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>10 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>1.4</b>
<b>\$1,498,800</b>	,	<b>\$1,518,330</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>15 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>14.8</b>
				<b>TOTAL (rounded)</b>		<b>16</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Proposal did not include full video/photo production management costs.

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Elephant In The Room

**DATE:** 7/23/24

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** Economic and Community Development

**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**Names of Evaluators:** Victoria Foley; Logan Ryan; Phoenix McLaughlin

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>N/A</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>10</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>10</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>12</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>32</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Elephant In The Room

**DATE:** 7/23/24

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

None

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Elephant In The Room  
**DATE:** 7/23/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>10</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- I. Overview of the Organization
  - Good experience, but not much with workforce attraction.
  - Well credentialed as a small design firm. Less clear how well they would handle the other aspects of this RFP—ad production, events, etc. Seems they would lean on subcontractors for a lot.
- II. Subcontractors
  - Many subcontractors. Unclear which would be on this contract.
- III. Organizational Chart
  - Chart is fine but doesn't specify who would do what.
- IV. Litigation
  -
- V. Financial Viability
  -
- VI. Certificate of Insurances
  -

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Elephant In The Room

**DATE:** 7/23/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>10</b>

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

1. Services to be Provided
  - Repeatedly recommends \$15 million media budget. If approach is driven by that expectation, then it is not going to work. Also may imply high overhead expenses.
  - Not a lot of info on how they'd create the brand.
  - Hits on right components but lacking detail.
  
2. Implementation – Work Plan
  - Again, very sparse.
  - Overall lacking detail on how contract would be executed.

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Elephant In The Room

**DATE:** 7/23/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$40,350</b>	,	<b>\$215,000</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>10 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>1.9</b>
<b>\$1,498,800</b>	,	<b>\$2,319,500</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>15 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>9.7</b>
				<b>TOTAL (rounded)</b>		<b>12</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Fuseideas  
**DATE:** 7/23/24

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** Economic and Community Development  
**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Phoenix McLaughlin  
**Names of Evaluators:** Victoria Foley; Logan Ryan; Phoenix McLaughlin

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>N/A</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>27</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>20</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>12</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>59</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Fuseideas  
**DATE:** 7/23/24

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

None



**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Fuseideas  
**DATE:** 7/23/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>27</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- I. Overview of the Organization
  - Nice mission statement.
  - Clear case for experience. And understanding of Maine market.
  - Experience in talent acquisition campaigns, even if not state workforce attraction exactly.
  - Highlighted strength in each of RFP's required services.
  - Two project examples give tangible impacts.
- II. Subcontractors
  - Subcontractor makes sense.
- III. Organizational Chart
  - Chart is fine. No bios or info on who would do what for this contract.
- IV. Litigation
  -
- V. Financial Viability
  -
- VI. Certificate of Insurances
  -

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Fuseideas  
**DATE:** 7/23/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>20</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

1. Services to be Provided
  - Very long
  - Mostly aligns with RFP. Would have appreciated more details/actions about brand creation.
  - Mentions intention to work with Live + Work in Maine and MOT.
  - Didn't speak to functional website components, although nonfunctional pieces were good. Discussed transfer post contract.
  - Good PR section.
  - Events section was a miss, only discussed in-state events.
  
2. Implementation – Work Plan
  - Timeline seemed mostly reasonable. Website would be launched in 4.5-5 months. Not sure if launching toolkits before website makes sense.
  - Campaign example isn't perfect.
  - Audience breakdowns are good. Good thoughtfulness to pairing info with each audience. However, that detailed breakdown doesn't quite speak to cohesiveness across campaign. We want one campaign that then has targeted elements. Tracking campaigns separately for each audience will be unwieldy.
  - A lot of information, but at the end of the day the volume of information makes it difficult to see how exactly everything fits together into a cohesive approach.

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Fuseideas  
**DATE:** 7/23/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$40,350</b>	,	<b>\$287,220</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>10 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>1.4</b>
<b>\$1,498,800</b>	,	<b>\$2,190,580</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>15 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>10.3</b>
				<b>TOTAL (rounded)</b>		<b>12</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

\$14,400 discrepancy between line items and listed total on their cost proposal form. This score is based on their listed line items.

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Golden Shovel Agency

**DATE:** 7/23/24

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** Economic and Community Development

**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**Names of Evaluators:** Victoria Foley; Logan Ryan; Phoenix McLaughlin

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>N/A</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>5</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>5</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>13</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>23</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Golden Shovel Agency  
**DATE:** 7/23/24

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

None

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Golden Shovel Agency

**DATE:** 7/23/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>5</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- I. Overview of the Organization
  - Little description of project examples.
  - Very little info.
  - Many components not responded to.
- II. Subcontractors
  -
- III. Organizational Chart
  -
- IV. Litigation
  -
- V. Financial Viability
  -
- VI. Certificate of Insurances
  -

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Golden Shovel Agency

**DATE:** 7/23/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>5</b>

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

1. Services to be Provided
  - Little info provided.
2. Implementation – Work Plan
  - Didn't respond to all requested components of RFP.

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Golden Shovel Agency  
**DATE:** 7/23/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$40,350</b>	,	<b>\$598,000</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>10 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>0.7</b>
<b>\$1,498,800</b>	,	<b>\$1,895,000</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>15 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>11.9</b>
				<b>TOTAL (rounded)</b>		<b>13</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**



**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Hirons

**DATE:** 7/23/24

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** Economic and Community Development

**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**Names of Evaluators:** Victoria Foley; Logan Ryan; Phoenix McLaughlin

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>N/A</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>10</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>8</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>12</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>30</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Hirons  
**DATE:** 7/23/24

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

None

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Hirons

**DATE:** 7/23/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>10</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- I. Overview of the Organization
  - No northeast experience.
  - Seem to have workforce development experience in Indianapolis.
  - Little significant substance to discuss.
- II. Subcontractors
  - Not sure what relationship is with Sutherland Weston and who would do what.
  - Workforce development subcontractor—unclear why included.
- III. Organizational Chart
  - Chart provided but little additional info.
- IV. Litigation
  -
- V. Financial Viability
  - Not what was requested.
- VI. Certificate of Insurances
  -

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Hirons  
**DATE:** 7/23/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>8</b>

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

1. Services to be Provided
  - Hard to tell what brand or campaign they are proposing or what they are saying they would provide.
  - Seems more about employee development.
  - Mention proposed services, but key services not given real detail.
  - Reporting section adequate.
  - Media channels outlined, but didn't give enough detail, e.g. flight calendar.
  - 6-10 events every year, good to see a number.
  - Didn't address a lot of specific sections requested, left proposal feeling generic.
  
2. Implementation – Work Plan
  - No timeline. Most of these RFP components not addressed.

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Hirons

**DATE:** 7/23/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$40,350</b>	,	<b>\$305,000</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>10 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>1.3</b>
<b>\$1,498,800</b>	,	<b>\$2,145,000</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>15 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>10.5</b>
				<b>TOTAL (rounded)</b>		<b>12</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Hoffman York

**DATE:** 7/25/24

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** Economic and Community Development

**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**Names of Evaluators:** Victoria Foley; Logan Ryan; Phoenix McLaughlin

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>N/A</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>29</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>27</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>12</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>68</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Hoffman York  
**DATE:** 7/25/24

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

None

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Hoffman York  
**DATE:** 7/25/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>29</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- I. Overview of the Organization
  - Long history, they do all the core requested work in house. Experience in state agency workforce attraction and destination marketing.
  - Good experience, relevant to RFP.
  - Helpful project examples. Strong Wisconsin example, did a good job making other examples relevant as well.
  - Not much direct recruitment or events experience.
- II. Subcontractors
  - None.
- III. Organizational Chart
  - Clear chart and bios. Doesn't specify who would do what for this contract.
- IV. Litigation
  -
- V. Financial Viability
  -
- VI. Certificate of Insurances
  -



**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Hoffman York  
**DATE:** 7/25/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>27</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

1. Services to be Provided
  - Good explanation of brand and campaign approach.
  - Detailed approach for some of the nonfunctional requirements of the website, could have been more detailed, but decent.
  - No specifics on leveraging events.
  - Good language about cohesion across brands. Good understanding about all components launching in concert.
  - Showed prior examples instead of hypothetical mockups, which is good.
  - Good reporting language.
  - States that they attend events all over the country and would gladly travel to Maine.
  
2. Implementation – Work Plan
  - Ambassador program idea is a good one
  - Lacking further detail on link between services and the target audiences and intended outcomes. Sounds like that will be left to the brand creation phase, which is understandable to an extent, but some specifics were requested in the RFP.
  - April 2025 campaign launch is later than preferred. That leaves 15 months for campaign to run.
  - Good understanding of the competitive challenge. Good description of objective-setting and KPI examples.

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Hoffman York

**DATE:** 7/25/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$40,350</b>	,	<b>\$330,000</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>10 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>1.2</b>
<b>\$1,498,800</b>	,	<b>\$2,110,000</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>15 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>10.7</b>
				<b>TOTAL (rounded)</b>		<b>12</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Moxie Strategies

**DATE:** 7/25/24

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** Economic and Community Development

**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**Names of Evaluators:** Victoria Foley; Logan Ryan; Phoenix McLaughlin

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>N/A</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>15</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>15</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>19</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>49</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Moxie Strategies  
**DATE:** 7/25/24

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

None

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Moxie Strategies

**DATE:** 7/25/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>15</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- I. Overview of the Organization
  - Very new firm. Good experience as individuals, but little as a firm.
  - Experience includes state & local government work.
  - Tried to tailor examples to what we're looking for but not exactly matched. Wanted more from project descriptions.
- II. Subcontractors
  - Number of subcontractors with high level overview.
- III. Organizational Chart
  - Fine but didn't describe who will do what.
- IV. Litigation
  -
- V. Financial Viability
  -
- VI. Certificate of Insurances
  -

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Moxie Strategies  
**DATE:** 7/25/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>15</b>

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

1. Services to be Provided
  - Good themes and concepts.
  - Little detail around targeted advertising and event planning.
  - More framed as a mockup than a proposal.
  - Said website would be created, but didn't give detail on how. Would want to see more.
  - Would rather have seen more on brand approach than going right into logo options.
  - Liked crafting messages to target audiences.
  - Notes PR work done by Maine based subcontractor, which has pros and cons.
  - Did homework on geographic challenges and strategic plan.
  - Tool kits not addressed.
  
2. Implementation – Work Plan
  - Clear timeline. Good January launch. Would want more detail on each phase.
  - Overall a good framework but lacks detail and structure for a holistic campaign.

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Moxie Strategies

**DATE:** 7/25/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$40,350</b>	,	<b>\$40,350</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>10 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>10.0</b>
<b>\$1,498,800</b>	,	<b>\$2,459,650</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>15 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>9.1</b>
				<b>TOTAL (rounded)</b>		<b>19</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** PeterMayer  
**DATE:** 7/25/24

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** Economic and Community Development  
**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Phoenix McLaughlin  
**Names of Evaluators:** Victoria Foley; Logan Ryan; Phoenix McLaughlin

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>N/A</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>15</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>8</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>10</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>33</u></b>



**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** PeterMayer  
**DATE:** 7/25/24

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

None

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** PeterMayer  
**DATE:** 7/25/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>15</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- I. Overview of the Organization
  - Firm has been around for a long time. Lots of tourism experience.
  - Full service agency.
  - Impressive client list.
- II. Subcontractors
  - Web design subcontractor.
- III. Organizational Chart
  - Not provided
- IV. Litigation
  - Not provided
- V. Financial Viability
  - Not provided
- VI. Certificate of Insurances
  - Not provided

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** PeterMayer

**DATE:** 7/25/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>8</b>

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

1. Services to be Provided
  - Very generic, high level. Little detail. Unclear if they understood exactly what was being asked.
  
2. Implementation – Work Plan
  - Very slow timeline. Website launch three months after campaign began.
  - Overall very sparse proposal.

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** PeterMayer  
**DATE:** 7/25/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	>	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$40,350</b>	>	<b>Events not addressed</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>10 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b>\$1,498,800</b>	>	<b>\$2,306,120</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>15 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>9.7</b>
				<b>TOTAL (rounded)</b>		<b>10</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Red House Communications

**DATE:** 7/25/24

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** Economic and Community Development

**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**Names of Evaluators:** Victoria Foley; Logan Ryan; Phoenix McLaughlin

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>N/A</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>28</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>20</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>12</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>60</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Red House Communications  
**DATE:** 7/25/24

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

None

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Red House Communications

**DATE:** 7/25/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>28</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- I. Overview of the Organization
  - Good project examples, including info on how they were delivered and some results. Some with overlap on workforce development.
  - Experience largely aligned with what we're looking for.
  - Unclear experience with PR and events.
- II. Subcontractors
  - Nice to see a specific firm focused on veteran recruitment included.
- III. Organizational Chart
  - Acceptable. Didn't specify who would do what for this project.
- IV. Litigation
  -
- V. Financial Viability
  -
- VI. Certificate of Insurances
  -

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Red House Communications

**DATE:** 7/25/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>20</b>

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

1. Services to be Provided
  - 150 day process for branding. Misunderstanding of timing.
  - Surprised to see traditional TV mentioned.
  - Little detail on media buys and actual campaigns.
  - Good approach to designing websites. Few questions on this if selected.
  - Events not given much detail. Tool kits not mentioned.
  - Proposal seems to end abruptly.
  
2. Implementation – Work Plan
  - Separate project plan not provided.
  - Timeline is later than preferred.
  - Missing deeper objectives/metrics explanation.



**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Red House Communications

**DATE:** 7/25/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$40,350</b>	,	<b>\$349,935</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>10 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>1.2</b>
<b>\$1,498,800</b>	,	<b>\$2,149,200</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>15 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>10.5</b>
				<b>TOTAL (rounded)</b>		<b>12</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Results Marketing & Design

**DATE:** 7/25/24

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** Economic and Community Development

**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**Names of Evaluators:** Victoria Foley; Logan Ryan; Phoenix McLaughlin

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>N/A</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>28</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>25</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>12</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>65</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Results Marketing & Design

**DATE:** 7/25/24

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

None

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Results Marketing & Design

**DATE:** 7/25/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>28</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- I. Overview of the Organization
  - Highlights work done for Maine companies and agencies.
  - Large team.
  - Meets ability to cover required services.
  - Two workforce related project examples, which is good. None that are specifically workforce attraction.
  - Unclear direct event and recruitment experience.
- II. Subcontractors
  - Subcontractors cover gaps.
- III. Organizational Chart
  - Chart works. Employee descriptions are good.
- IV. Litigation
  -
- V. Financial Viability
  -
- VI. Certificate of Insurances
  -

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Results Marketing & Design

**DATE:** 7/25/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>25</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

1. Services to be Provided
  - Geography discussion missing?
  - No mention of brand guide/brand identity. Seems to consider campaign to be the brand. Doesn't meet RFP ask for that. If they're planning to do a brand, they haven't explained that process. Very important piece of the RFP.
  - Website programming and deliverables looked good technically. Didn't mention adhering to State policies, which we'd prefer to see. Should clarify ownership.
  - Creative concept reel was outstanding.
  - Like their proposal to dispel misconceptions and highlight attractive pieces of Maine.
  - Events piece was clear.
  - Very good audience and objective discussions.
  - Very strong creatively. But can't build a nice website if the brand isn't established.
  
2. Implementation – Work Plan
  - Clear events plan. Would confirm that they would be the one doing the events.
  - Hard to launch website before branding finished. That doesn't make sense.
  - Timeline not presented in the most helpful format.
  - Tool kit component largely absent.
  - Very clear project plan.

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Results Marketing & Design

**DATE:** 7/25/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$40,350</b>	,	<b>\$150,175</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>10 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>2.7</b>
<b>\$1,498,800</b>	,	<b>\$2,349,342</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>15 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>9.6</b>
				<b>TOTAL (rounded)</b>		<b>12</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Rigaud Global Company

**DATE:** 7/25/24

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** Economic and Community Development

**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**Names of Evaluators:** Victoria Foley; Logan Ryan; Phoenix McLaughlin

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>N/A</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>5</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>8</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>12</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>25</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Rigaud Global Company  
**DATE:** 7/25/24

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

None



**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Rigaud Global Company

**DATE:** 7/25/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>5</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- I. Overview of the Organization
  - Doesn't indicate depth of experience with workforce attraction. Project examples not relevant.
- II. Subcontractors
  -
- III. Organizational Chart
  - Three team members, high level bios for each.
- IV. Litigation
  -
- V. Financial Viability
  -
- VI. Certificate of Insurances
  - Not sure this meets requirements.

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Rigaud Global Company

**DATE:** 7/25/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>8</b>

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

1. Services to be Provided
  - Targeted ads not addressed.
  - Geography not addressed.
  - Unclear what the website plan would be.
  - Events not really addressed.
  - Ambitious set of proposals for a team of three.
  - Most of RFP components addressed otherwise.
  - Objectives not backed by detail.
  
2. Implementation – Work Plan
  - Not enough detail to give confidence it could be achieved.
  - Workforce boost an odd inclusion.
  - Timeline unclear.

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Rigaud Global Company

**DATE:** 7/25/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$40,350</b>	,	<b>\$181,000</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>10 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>2.2</b>
<b>\$1,498,800</b>	,	<b>\$2,215,000</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>15 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>10.1</b>
				<b>TOTAL (rounded)</b>		<b>12</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Rinck Advertising

**DATE:** 7/25/24

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** Economic and Community Development

**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**Names of Evaluators:** Victoria Foley; Logan Ryan; Phoenix McLaughlin

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>N/A</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>29</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>27</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>12</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>68</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Rinck Advertising  
**DATE:** 7/25/24

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

None

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Rinck Advertising  
**DATE:** 7/25/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>29</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- I. Overview of the Organization
  - Thorough overview.
  - Work with a variety of Maine organizations. Workforce attraction experience related to healthcare employer.
  - Student recruitment.
  - Specific event experience, although more consumer goods focused.
- II. Subcontractors
  - Good detail on subcontractors and what they would.
  - Bidding out photo/video production services. Acceptable as long as budgeted for.
- III. Organizational Chart
  - Job descriptions for team members who will be on this project.
- IV. Litigation
  -
- V. Financial Viability
  -
- VI. Certificate of Insurances
  -

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** Rinck Advertising  
**DATE:** 7/25/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>27</b>

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

1. Services to be Provided
  - Clear objectives, although not focused on impacts.
  - Unclear if they would create new brand or use DECD’s existing brands.
  - Events section light on detail. Some ideas for breaking out by target audiences.
    - Not sure how realistic it is to do this many events.
  - Some good campaign ideas, but not all.
  - Would do full geography analysis to support project.
  - Hits what we need on the website, addressed all required technical pieces.
  - Needs clarity on branding approach.
  
2. Implementation – Work Plan
  - Detailed and sufficient, covering everything requested.
  - Like website launch by end of year, campaign launch in January. Great timeline.
  - Objectives miss intermediate steps between marketing impressions and broad goal of 75,000 workers by 2030.
  - Good target audience discussions, with a good grasp of each one and what may work for them. Well thought out.
  - Strong on the details, but left feeling somewhat unclear how everything fits together. Length of the proposal potentially took away from clarity.

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** Rinck Advertising

**DATE:** 7/25/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$40,350</b>	,	<b>\$404,250</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>10 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>1.0</b>
<b>\$1,498,800</b>	,	<b>\$1,995,750</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>15 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>11.3</b>
				<b>TOTAL (rounded)</b>		<b>12</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**



**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** WeUsThem  
**DATE:** 7/25/24

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** Economic and Community Development  
**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Phoenix McLaughlin  
**Names of Evaluators:** Victoria Foley; Logan Ryan; Phoenix McLaughlin

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>N/A</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>15</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>10</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>12</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>37</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** WeUsThem  
**DATE:** 7/25/24

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

None

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** WeUsThem  
**DATE:** 7/25/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>35</b>	<b>15</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- I. Overview of the Organization
  - Work experience does not relate to workforce attraction. Project examples not exactly relevant.
  - In house capacity to meet services requested.
  - Good client list.
- II. Subcontractors
  - Subcontractors make sense, open to others if needed.
- III. Organizational Chart
  - Don't connect names to jobs shown.
- IV. Litigation
  -
- V. Financial Viability
  -
- VI. Certificate of Insurances
  -

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services  
**BIDDER:** WeUsThem  
**DATE:** 7/25/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>40</b>	<b>10</b>

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

1. Services to be Provided
  - Interesting presentation. Workflow broken out, clear and understandable.
  - PR relationships and efforts could be challenging.
  - Website piece gave methodology but not much detail on what would be delivered.
  - Events and tool kits not addressed.
  
2. Implementation – Work Plan
  - Timeline too slow.
  - Target audience and geography not addressed.
  - Overall, the proposal is not very responsive to the specifics of the RFP.

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER:** WeUsThem

**DATE:** 7/25/24

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$40,350</b>	,	<b>\$443,250</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>10 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>0.9</b>
<b>\$1,498,800</b>	,	<b>\$2,056,750</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>15 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>10.9</b>
				<b>TOTAL (rounded)</b>		<b>12</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES  
**BIDDER NAME:** AVA TopRight  
**DATE:** 7/17/2024  
**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department’s RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**Directions:** *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

I.	<i>Preliminary Information</i>
	1. <i>Proposal Cover Page P</i>
	2. <i>Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification P</i>
II.	<i>Organizational Qualifications and Experience</i>
	1. <i>Overview of the Organization P - Founded in 2006, TopRight is one of North America’s leading boutique marketing agencies specializing in working with complex organizations operating in complex ecosystems. In this context, as we represent clients across many industries nationally and internationally, our passion and experience lies in addressing the marketing challenges of complex business and government clients across their entire ecosystem.</i>
	2. <i>Subcontractors P – 2 subcontractors</i>
	3. <i>Organizational Chart P</i>
	4. <i>Litigation P - None</i>
	5. <i>Financial Viability C - Not covered by dun or other rating agency</i>
	6. <i>Licensure/Certification C – None provided</i>
	7. <i>Certificate of Insurance P</i>
III.	<i>Proposed Services</i>
	1. <i>Services to be Provided</i>
	• <i>Objectives</i>
	• <i>Target Audiences P</i>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** AVA TopRight

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Geography P</i></li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Strategies</i></li> </ul>
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <i>Creating a Brand P</i> – Gave their approach but no actual brand ideas</li> </ol>
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>2. <i>Creating a Campaign P</i></li> </ol>
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>3. <i>Using Highly-Targeted Paid Advertising P</i> – media research and analysis, consumer research</li> </ol>
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>4. <i>Maximizing Public Relations P</i></li> </ol>
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>5. <i>Creating a Tool Kit P</i> - Brand Toolkit, Stakeholder Training</li> </ol>
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>6. <i>Designing a Website C</i> – did not have details required, such as messages and materials available one standalone site. (Did agree to Policy compliance)</li> </ol>
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>7. <i>Creating, Leveraging and Attending Events P</i> – Showed approach no details</li> </ol>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Brand and Campaign Theme Creation</i></li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Market Analysis and Recommendations</i></li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Workforce Attraction Tactical Campaign Plan</i></li> </ul>
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>2. <i>Project Plan</i></li> </ol>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Objectives by Target Audience C</i> – Did not see</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Strategies by Target Audience P</i></li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Tactics by Target Audience P</i></li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Timeline for Implementation C</i> - Did not see</li> </ul>
<b>IV. Cost Proposal</b>
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <i>Cost Proposal Form</i></li> </ol>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** Black Travel Maine

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department’s RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**Directions:** *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

I. Preliminary Information
1. Proposal Cover Page P
2. Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification P
II. Organizational Qualifications and Experience
1. Overview of the Organization P - Black Travel Marketing (BTM) specializes in crafting compelling travel marketing content and strategic development of destinations. Operating under the umbrella of Black Travel Maine, the BTM division dedicates itself to enhancing the appeal and accessibility of travel experiences through innovative marketing strategies and content that resonates with audiences
2. Subcontractors P – 5 subcontractors
3. Organizational Chart P – Good organizational Chart with only one vacant position.
4. Litigation P – No Litigation
5. Financial Viability P – High risk score with low credit limit \$13,000
6. Licensure/Certification C - They do not have any
7. Certificate of Insurance P - Insured
III. Proposed Services
1. Services to be Provided
• Objectives P – 4 objectives: Objective 1: Alignment with and Leverage State Economic and Development Plans,



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** Black Travel Maine

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

Objective 2: Strengthen Media Integration, Objective 3: Foster Community-Building, Objective 4: Grow Local Talent and Attract New People from Out of State
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Target Audiences P</i></li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Geography P</i> - BTM will launch a statewide campaign and conduct recruitment efforts across northeast states, universities, professional organization chapters and media channels.</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Strategies</i></li> </ul>
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <i>Creating a Brand P</i></li> </ol>
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>2. <i>Creating a Campaign P</i> - Leverage Storytelling and Content Development, Engage in Strategic Partnerships, Implement a Comprehensive Marketing and PR Campaign,</li> </ol>
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>3. <i>Using Highly-Targeted Paid Advertising P</i> - Expand Market Intelligence, Support Workforce and Small Business Development, Create Inclusive Marketing Collateral: Luxury Group Experiences/ Social Media Campaigns/Influencer Marketing</li> </ol>
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>4. <i>Maximizing Public Relations P</i> – All methods accounted for, well detailed.</li> </ol>
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>5. <i>Creating a Tool Kit P</i> - Phase 1: Define Core Components of the Tool Kit, Phase 2: Develop Specific Materials for Different Audiences, Phase 3: Create Digital and Interactive Tools, Phase 4: Facilitate Training and Support, Ongoing: Monitor and Evaluate Effectiveness</li> </ol>
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>6. <i>Designing a Website P</i> - The core features will include an interactive map, a comprehensive resource hub, user-generated content capabilities, a dynamic event calendar, a business promotion section, and integration with social media platforms.</li> </ol>
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>7. <i>Creating, Leveraging and Attending Events P</i> - <i>BTM will create, tailor and leverage events for specific target audience groups to effectively promote Maine as a vibrant and inclusive destination, attracting to a diverse array of workers, employers and visitors. Table 3.0 includes specific</i></li> </ol>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** Black Travel Maine

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

<i>strategies and activities for reaching target audience groups and to welcome a diverse population of visitors.</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Brand and Campaign Theme Creation P</i></li> <li>• <i>Market Analysis and Recommendations P</i></li> <li>• <i>Workforce Attraction Tactical Campaign Plan P</i></li> </ul>
<i>2. Project Plan</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Understanding of the Current Context P - Maine's tourism industry, a cornerstone of the state's economy, faces several significant challenges. These challenges, alongside evolving national trends, present both obstacles and "Welcome to Maine, There is So Much to Learn" 19 opportunities for Maine to enhance its appeal and competitiveness as a place to live and work. Understanding these factors is crucial for developing effective strategies that promote diversity and inclusivity in Maine's workforce and attract new talent to the state.</i></li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Objectives by Target Audience P</i></li> <li>• <i>Strategies by Target Audience P</i></li> <li>• <i>Tactics by Target Audience P</i></li> <li>• <i>Timeline for Implementation P</i></li> </ul>
<i>IV. Cost Proposal</i>
<i>1. General Instructions</i>
<i>2. Cost Proposal Form</i>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** Blaze

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**Directions:** *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

I. Preliminary Information
1. Proposal Cover Page P
2. Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification P
II. Organizational Qualifications and Experience
1. Overview of the Organization P - Founded in 2015, Blaze Partners is a privately held Limited
2. Liability Company (LLC) chartered in the State of Maine. The three managing partners are Jenna Klein Jonsson, Kevin Kayne and Jim Hauptman. Eliza Hill, Blaze's VP of Business Growth & Strategy and Account Director, oversees the account team.
3. Blaze became a Certified B Corp in August 2022, a certification for organizations that abide by the highest ethical, social and environmental standards. Blaze was only the 4th full-service advertising agency to achieve B Corp status in New England, and received a local economic development impact business model by B Corp due to our outsized impact on our local communities.
Staff: Blaze currently employs fifteen marketing professionals full-time and one part-time. Blaze is proud to offer benefits commensurate with organizations many times our size and therefore have an excellent employee retention rate. The agency occasionally engages subcontractors and freelance specialists to

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** Blaze

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

enable us to work on assignments for billion-dollar brands as adeptly as smaller start-ups.
4. <i>Subcontractors P</i> – “Live and work in Maine”
5. <i>Organizational Chart P</i>
6. <i>Litigation P</i> - None
7. <i>Financial Viability P</i> – Low/Moderate Risk Credit \$45,000
8. <i>Licensure/Certification C</i> – Did not see any
9. <i>Certificate of Insurance P</i>
<i>III. Proposed Services</i>
1. <i>Services to be Provided</i>
• <i>Objectives P</i>
• <i>Target Audiences P</i>
• <i>Geography P</i>
• <i>Strategies</i>
1. <i>Creating a Brand P</i> – Leverage existing brand with Subcontractor
2. <i>Creating a Campaign P</i> – Plans to integrate with other workforce attraction efforts.
3. <i>Using Highly-Targeted Paid Advertising P</i> – not a lot of detail
4. <i>Maximizing Public Relations P</i> – Not a lot of detail
5. <i>Creating a Tool Kit P</i>
6. <i>Designing a Website C</i> – Does not want to create a new website, wants to utilize their own existing and add to it.
7. <i>Creating, Leveraging and Attending Events P</i>
• <i>Brand and Campaign Theme Creation P</i>
• <i>Market Analysis and Recommendations C</i> – did not see.
• <i>Workforce Attraction Tactical Campaign Plan P</i>
2. <i>Project Plan</i>
• <i>Objectives by Target Audience P</i>
• <i>Strategies by Target Audience P</i>
• <i>Tactics by Target Audience P</i>
• <i>Timeline for Implementation C</i> – did not see.
<i>IV. Cost Proposal</i>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** Blaze

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

<i>1. Cost Proposal Form</i>
------------------------------

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** Broadreach Public Relations

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department’s RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**Directions:** *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

I. Preliminary Information
1. Proposal Cover Page P
2. Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification P
II. Organizational Qualifications and Experience
1. Overview of the Organization P - Founded in 2007, Broadreach is a women-owned, privately held company headquartered in Portland, Maine specializing in strategic and crisis communications, public relations, marketing, event services and government relations. We help our clients build, protect, and preserve their reputational capital. We work with organizations representing myriad sectors including, but not limited to workforce development, veteran services, rural broadband, technology & telemedicine, craft brewing, marine sciences, financial and professional services, agri-business, law, higher education, nonprofit, and government. The firm has nine (9) employees featuring a blend of accomplished senior-level professionals paired with associates serving clients in ME, NH, MA, and VT. Broadreach is a full adopter of the Entrepreneurial Operating System (EOS) and embraces four core values: intellectual curiosity and critical thinking, candor, making ‘it’ happen and team spirit.
2. Subcontractors P – 1 subcontractor
3. Organizational Chart P

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** Broadreach Public Relations

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

4. <i>Litigation P</i> – None
5. <i>Financial Viability P</i> – Low-Moderate risk \$34,500 credit
6. <i>Licensure/Certification C</i> – Pursuing WBENC and WOSB Certification. Subcontractor is WBENC Certified. Members hold various certifications. No licensure mentioned
7. <i>Certificate of Insurance P</i>
<b>III. Proposed Services</b>
1. <i>Services to be Provided</i>
• <i>Objectives P</i>
• <i>Target Audiences P</i>
• <i>Geography P</i>
• <i>Strategies</i>
1. <i>Creating a Brand P</i> – (No details yet, just a plan of approach)
2. <i>Creating a Campaign Brand P</i> – (No details yet, just a plan of approach)
3. <i>Using Highly-Targeted Paid Advertising P</i> – (No details yet, just a plan of approach)
4. <i>Maximizing Public Relations P</i> – (No details yet, just a plan of approach)
5. <i>Creating a Tool Kit P</i> - Key Messages Banner Ads for newsletters and/or websites Speakers' Bureau information Newsletter content Social media content Templates for Posters, Direct Mail, Emails Broadreach Public Relations Training resources Spouse / Partner resources And, in rural communities - PowerPoint slides for Public Access Television.
6. <i>Designing a Website P</i> – They have a development approach, tracking and reporting, Accessibility standards, Scalability Training and documentation to hand off the app after contract.
7. <i>Creating, Leveraging and Attending Events P</i> – Job fairs and Expos, Veteran Owned Business meet and greets, Online Seminars/Workshops, Employer Showcases
• <i>Brand and Campaign Theme Creation P- Maine is SO ME, Maine Your next adventure,</i>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** Broadreach Public Relations

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

<i>• Market Analysis and Recommendations P</i>
<i>• Workforce Attraction Tactical Campaign Plan P</i>
<i>2. Project Plan</i>
<i>• Objectives by Target Audience P</i>
<i>• Strategies by Target Audience</i>
<i>• Tactics by Target Audience P</i>
<i>• Timeline for Implementation P</i>
<i>IV. Cost Proposal</i>
<i>1. Cost Proposal Form</i>



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES  
**BIDDER NAME:** Campfire Naretiv  
**DATE:** 7/17/2024  
**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MainelT

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department’s RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**Directions:** *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

<i>I. Preliminary Information</i>	
<i>1. Proposal Cover Page P</i>	
<i>2. Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification P</i>	
<i>II. Organizational Qualifications and Experience</i>	
<i>1. Overview of the Organization P - Naretiv and Campfire Consulting last year formed a strategic partnership that merges compelling storytelling with data-driven communications. Together we are a powerhouse agency that specializes in the scope of work outlined in this RFP: Our combined experience with major Maine tourism and worker recruitment initiatives means we are experienced and skilled at drawing people to Maine for work and play. (Notably, this new partnership started off with a bang when we immediately signed a significant contract with Stonyfield Organic in New Hampshire.)</i>	
<i>2. Subcontractors P – one subcontractor: Redbird Media</i>	
<i>3. Organizational Chart P</i>	
<i>4. Litigation P - None</i>	
<i>5. Financial Viability C – No Dun report</i>	
<i>6. Licensure/Certification C – Did not see any</i>	
<i>7. Certificate of Insurance P</i>	
<i>III. Proposed Services</i>	
<i>1. Services to be Provided</i>	

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** Campfire Naretiv

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Objectives</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Target Audiences</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Geography</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Strategies</li> </ul>
1. <i>Creating a Brand P</i> – stated approach no details
2. <i>Creating a Campaign P</i> – stated approach no details
3. <i>Using Highly-Targeted Paid Advertising P</i> – stated approach no details
4. <i>Maximizing Public Relations P</i> – stated approach maximizing public interest up front
5. <i>Creating a Tool Kit P</i> – stated approach not a lot of detail
6. <i>Designing a Website C</i> – did not talk to detail of how they will accomplish or what. Only stated they had experience in it.
7. <i>Creating, Leveraging and Attending Events P</i> – stated approach in detail, give 4 examples of events they will manage.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Brand and Campaign Theme Creation P</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Market Analysis and Recommendations P</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Workforce Attraction Tactical Campaign Plan P</li> </ul>
2. <i>Project Plan</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Objectives by Target Audience C – Did not see</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Strategies by Target Audience P</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Tactics by Target Audience C – Did not see</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Timeline for Implementation P</li> </ul>
IV. <i>Cost Proposal</i>
1. <i>Cost Proposal Form</i>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES  
**BIDDER NAME:** CashmanKatz  
**DATE:** 7/17/2024  
**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department’s RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**Directions:** *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

I. Preliminary Information P
1. Proposal Cover Page P
2. Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification P
II. Organizational Qualifications and Experience
1. Overview of the Organization P - We’re a multi-service enterprise that feels like a creative boutique. An unassuming shop with the game-changing ideas and the resources to see it through. Our smaller feel and full capabilities mean smart, defensible solutions delivered quickly and without the expected time and cost casualties of big agency process.
2. Subcontractors P - None
3. Organizational Chart P – Full Graph with 16 positions listed
4. Litigation P - None
5. Financial Viability P – Moderate risk with \$25,500 credit
6. Licensure/Certification P - Google Ads Certified Google Analytics CertifiedHubSpot Content Marketing Certified Hootsuite Social Marketing Certified Cision / PR Newswire Licensed
7. Certificate of Insurance P
III. Proposed Services
1. Services to be Provided
• Objectives P

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** CashmanKatz

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Target Audiences P</i> - Well detailed strategies on how to reach these audiences.</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Geography P</i> – Used regional visitors to help detail a target audience with average visitor details.</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Strategies</i></li> </ul>
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <i>Creating a Brand P</i> - Messaging strategy seems good. Focus on life work balance, Choice, Sense of self</li> </ol>
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>2. <i>Creating a Campaign P</i> – Focus on family, and work life balance. Well thought out (I choose ME)</li> </ol>
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>3. <i>Using Highly-Targeted Paid Advertising P</i></li> </ol>
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>4. <i>Maximizing Public Relations P</i> – Lots of adds targeting public spaces, creating an app to advertise.</li> </ol>
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>5. <i>Creating a Tool Kit C</i> – Is this accomplished in the app and digital services?</li> </ol>
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>6. <i>Designing a Website P</i> – Is covered in web services.</li> </ol>
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>7. <i>Creating, Leveraging and Attending Events C</i> – Didn't see this represented</li> </ol>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Brand and Campaign Theme Creation P</i></li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Market Analysis and Recommendations P</i></li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Workforce Attraction Tactical Campaign Plan P</i></li> </ul>
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>2. <i>Project Plan</i></li> </ol>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Objectives by Target Audience</i></li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Strategies by Target Audience</i></li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Tactics by Target Audience</i></li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Timeline for Implementation</i></li> </ul>
<p><b>IV. Cost Proposal</b></p>
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <i>Cost Proposal Form</i></li> </ol>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** Creative Directive Marketing Group

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department’s RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**Directions:** *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

I. Preliminary Information
1. Proposal Cover Page P
2. Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification P
II. Organizational Qualifications and Experience
Overview of the Organization P – Advertising group since 1974, worked with Chevron, Blue Cross Blue Shield, Based out of Tennessee small business with 17 employees.
1. Subcontractors P - None
2. Organizational Chart P – 5 members
3. Litigation P - None
4. Financial Viability C – no Dun report and did not give information requested.
5. Licensure/Certification C - None
6. Certificate of Insurance C – Both policies submitted are out of date.
III. Proposed Services
1. Services to be Provided
• Objectives
• Target Audiences
• Geography
• Strategies
1. Creating a Brand C - None

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** Creative Directive Marketing Group

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MainelT

<i>2. Creating a Campaign C - None</i>
<i>3. Using Highly-Targeted Paid Advertising C - None</i>
<i>4. Maximizing Public Relations C - None</i>
<i>5. Creating a Tool Kit C - None</i>
<i>6. Designing a Website C - None</i>
<i>7. Creating, Leveraging and Attending Events C - None</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><i>• Brand and Campaign Theme Creation C - None</i></li> <li><i>• Market Analysis and Recommendations C - None</i></li> <li><i>• Workforce Attraction Tactical Campaign Plan C - None</i></li> </ul>
<i>2. Project Plan</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><i>• Objectives by Target Audience C - None</i></li> <li><i>• Strategies by Target Audience C - limited</i></li> <li><i>• Tactics by Target Audience C - None</i></li> <li><i>• Timeline for Implementation C - None</i></li> </ul>
<i>IV. Cost Proposal</i>
<i>1. Cost Proposal Form</i>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES  
**BIDDER NAME:** DCI  
**DATE:** 7/17/2024  
**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department’s RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**Directions:** *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

I.	<i>Preliminary Information</i>
	1. <i>Proposal Cover Page P</i>
	2. <i>Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification P</i>
II.	<i>Organizational Qualifications and Experience</i>
	1. <i>Overview of the Organization P - Established in New York City in 1960, Development Counsellors International (DCI) specializes in tourism, economic development and talent attraction marketing. We have worked for more than 500 cities, counties, regions, and states and we understand the unique challenges and opportunities that states and communities face.</i>
	2. <i>Subcontractors P - None</i>
	3. <i>Organizational Chart P</i>
	4. <i>Litigation P - None</i>
	5. <i>Financial Viability P Moderate, Credit \$23,000</i>
	6. <i>Licensure/Certification C – None provided</i>
	7. <i>Certificate of Insurance P</i>
III.	<i>Proposed Services</i>
	1. <i>Services to be Provided</i>
	• <i>Objectives</i>
	• <i>Target Audiences</i>
	• <i>Geography</i>
	• <i>Strategies</i>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** DCI

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

1. <i>Creating a Brand P</i> – Gave approach in detail
2. <i>Creating a Campaign P</i> – Gave approach in detail
3. <i>Using Highly-Targeted Paid Advertising</i>
4. <i>Maximizing Public Relations P</i> – Gave some approaches
5. <i>Creating a Tool Kit P</i> – Gave approach in detail
6. <i>Designing a Website P</i> – Gave approach in detail: Discovery & Strategy, Content & Imagery, Wireframes & Design, Development & Launch, Training & Support, Website Hosting & Maintenance, Very well detailed.
7. <i>Creating, Leveraging and Attending Events C</i> – Did not see
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Brand and Campaign Theme Creation P</i></li> <li>• <i>Market Analysis and Recommendations P</i></li> <li>• <i>Workforce Attraction Tactical Campaign Plan P</i></li> </ul>
2. <i>Project Plan</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Objectives by Target Audience P</i></li> <li>• <i>Strategies by Target Audience P</i></li> <li>• <i>Tactics by Target Audience P</i></li> <li>• <i>Timeline for Implementation P</i></li> </ul>
IV. <i>Cost Proposal</i>
1. <i>Cost Proposal Form</i>



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** Elephant in the Room

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department’s RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**Directions:** *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

I. Preliminary Information
1. Proposal Cover Page P
2. Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification P
II. Organizational Qualifications and Experience
1. Overview of the Organization P
2. Subcontractors C – Many subcontractors.
3. Organizational Chart P
4. Litigation P - None
5. Financial Viability P – Low Risk (not a dun report though)
6. Licensure/Certification C – none stated
7. Certificate of Insurance P
III. Proposed Services
1. Services to be Provided
• Objectives
• Target Audiences C – Did not see this
• Geography C – Did not see this
• Strategies P
1. Creating a Brand C – no brand just a plan to create one
2. Creating a Campaign C – Needs more details
3. Using Highly-Targeted Paid Advertising P
4. Maximizing Public Relations C – Did not see this

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** Elephant in the Room

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MainelT

<i>5. Creating a Tool Kit C – Did not see this</i>
<i>6. Designing a Website C – did not talk about after contract handing over resources or documentation.</i>
<i>7. Creating, Leveraging and Attending Events</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Brand and Campaign Theme Creation C – None yet</i></li> <li>• <i>Market Analysis and Recommendations C – initial research/thoughts</i></li> <li>• <i>Workforce Attraction Tactical Campaign Plan</i></li> </ul>
<i>2. Project Plan</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Objectives by Target Audience C – Did not see this</i></li> <li>• <i>Strategies by Target Audience C – Did not see this</i></li> <li>• <i>Tactics by Target Audience C – Did not see this</i></li> <li>• <i>Timeline for Implementation P</i></li> </ul>
<i>IV. Cost Proposal</i>
<i>1. Cost Proposal Form</i>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** Fuseideas

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department’s RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**Directions:** *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

I. Preliminary Information
1. Proposal Cover Page P
2. Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification P
II. Organizational Qualifications and Experience
1. Overview of the Organization P – organization of 50 employees, gave their mission statement and are a full service agency.
2. Subcontractors P – one, the Lou Hammond Group
3. Organizational Chart P
4. Litigation P - None
5. Financial Viability C – Did not provide dun report, just report number
6. Licensure/Certification P - Fuseideas, LLC is registered as a Massachusetts corporation and is registered and/or certified in many states and other countries as necessary for the conduct of business with clients in those states and countries.
7. Certificate of Insurance P
III. Proposed Services
1. Services to be Provided
• Objectives P – Clear and concise
• Target Audiences P
• Geography P – Approach but no detail
• Strategies

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** Fuseideas

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

1. <i>Creating a Brand P</i> - Approach but no details
2. <i>Creating a Campaign P</i> - Approach but no details
3. <i>Using Highly-Targeted Paid Advertising P</i> - Approach and details: CRM Data/Look-alike modeling Search and/or web activite Alumni affiliations Professional affiliations Persons whose devices have been located in Maine Persons who interact with sites such as Live + Work in Maine or Maine Tourism
4. <i>Maximizing Public Relations P</i> – Gave 7 strategies for this
5. <i>Creating a Tool Kit P</i> – Has a good approach with a lot of detail.
6. <i>Designing a Website P</i> – Has all non functional requirements as well as Accessibility requirements. Did say that the system will be turned over to us but not sure on the wording for service and customizing the web page.
7. <i>Creating, Leveraging and Attending Events P</i> - Approach and some details
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Brand and Campaign Theme Creation P</i> - Approach but no details on what</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Market Analysis and Recommendations P</i></li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Workforce Attraction Tactical Campaign Plan P</i></li> </ul>
2. <i>Project Plan</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Objectives by Target Audience P</i></li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Strategies by Target Audience P</i></li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Tactics by Target Audience P</i></li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Timeline for Implementation P</i></li> </ul>
IV. <i>Cost Proposal</i>
1. <i>Cost Proposal Form</i>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES  
**BIDDER NAME:** Golden Shovel  
**DATE:** 7/17/2024  
**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department’s RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**Directions:** *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

I. Preliminary Information
1. Proposal Cover Page P
2. Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification P
II. Organizational Qualifications and Experience
1. Overview of the Organization P - Golden Shovel Agency brings over 15 years of expertise in delivering comprehensive strategy, marketing, and communications services to state, regional, county, and local organizations focused on fostering economic growth through business and talent attraction initiatives.
2. Subcontractors P
3. Organizational Chart C – was not present
4. Litigation C – was not present
5. Financial Viability C – was not present
6. Licensure/Certification C – was not present
7. Certificate of Insurance P
III. Proposed Services
1. Services to be Provided
• Objectives P
• Target Audiences
• Geography C – was not present
• Strategies C – was not present
1. Creating a Brand

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** Golden Shovel

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

2. <i>Creating a Campaign C</i> – was not present
3. <i>Using Highly-Targeted Paid Advertising C</i> – was not present
4. <i>Maximizing Public Relations C</i> – was not present
5. <i>Creating a Tool Kit P</i> – Mentioned different methods for this.
6. <i>Designing a Website C</i> – Did not give a proposal, just said they have and can do it for us once agreed upon. Told us their offered services for websites.
7. <i>Creating, Leveraging and Attending Events C</i> – was not present
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Brand and Campaign Theme Creation C</i> – was not present</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Market Analysis and Recommendations C</i> – was not present</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Workforce Attraction Tactical Campaign Plan C</i> – was not present</li> </ul>
2. <i>Project Plan</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Objectives by Target Audience C</i> – was not present</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Strategies by Target Audience C</i> – was not present</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Tactics by Target Audience C</i> – was not present</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Timeline for Implementation C</i> – was not present</li> </ul>
IV. <i>Cost Proposal</i>
1. <i>Cost Proposal Form</i>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES  
**BIDDER NAME:** Hirons  
**DATE:** 7/17/2024  
**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department’s RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**Directions:** *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

I. Preliminary Information
1. Proposal Cover Page P
2. Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification P
II. Organizational Qualifications and Experience
1. Overview of the Organization P - Hirons is a full-service advertising, public relations, and digital firm with offices in downtown Indianapolis and Chicago. Founded in 1978, Hirons has effectively delivered clients’ messages for more than 45 years.
2. Subcontractors P – 2 subcontractors
3. Organizational Chart P
4. Litigation P - None
5. Financial Viability C – did not provide actual report. Details provided were lacking
6. Licensure/Certification C - none
7. Certificate of Insurance P
III. Proposed Services
1. Services to be Provided
• Objectives P
• Target Audiences P
• Geography C – Not present
• Strategies

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** Hiron

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

1. <i>Creating a Brand C</i> – Not present
2. <i>Creating a Campaign C</i> – Not present
3. <i>Using Highly-Targeted Paid Advertising P</i>
4. <i>Maximizing Public Relations C</i> – Not present
5. <i>Creating a Tool Kit C</i> – Briefly mentioned, no detail
6. <i>Designing a Website C</i> – No detail on how creating the website will be achieved.
7. <i>Creating, Leveraging and Attending Events P</i> – 6-10 events every year
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Brand and Campaign Theme Creation C</i> – Not present</li> <li>• <i>Market Analysis and Recommendations C</i> – Not present</li> <li>• <i>Workforce Attraction Tactical Campaign Plan C</i> – Not present</li> </ul>
2. <i>Project Plan</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Objectives by Target Audience C</i> – Not present</li> <li>• <i>Strategies by Target Audience C</i> – Not present</li> <li>• <i>Tactics by Target Audience C</i> – Not present</li> <li>• <i>Timeline for Implementation C</i> – Not present</li> </ul>
IV. <i>Cost Proposal</i>
1. <i>Cost Proposal Form</i>



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** Hoffman York

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department’s RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**Directions:** *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

I.	<i>Preliminary Information</i>
	1. <i>Proposal Cover Page P</i>
	2. <i>Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification P</i>
II.	<i>Organizational Qualifications and Experience</i>
	1. <i>Overview of the Organization P - Founded in 1933, Hoffman York is considered one of the longest-running independent communications agencies in the United States. As a fully integrated agency</i>
	2. <i>Subcontractors P - None</i>
	3. <i>Organizational Chart P</i>
	4. <i>Litigation P - None</i>
	5. <i>Financial Viability P Low risk, \$135,000 Credit</i>
	6. <i>Licensure/Certification C - None</i>
	7. <i>Certificate of Insurance P</i>
III.	<i>Proposed Services</i>
	1. <i>Services to be Provided</i>
	• <i>Objectives</i>
	• <i>Target Audiences C – was not answered clearly</i>
	• <i>Geography P – detailed approach</i>
	• <i>Strategies</i>
	1. <i>Creating a Brand C – detailed approach</i>
	2. <i>Creating a Campaign C – detailed approach</i>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** Hoffman York

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

3.	<i>Using Highly-Targeted Paid Advertising P</i> – detailed approach and technologies that would be used.
4.	<i>Maximizing Public Relations C</i> – detailed approach only
5.	<i>Creating a Tool Kit C</i> – detailed approach only
6.	<i>Designing a Website C</i> – detailed approach to some non functional requirements only. Did not mention in much detail how it would be accomplished. Did not state with what technologies.
7.	<i>Creating, Leveraging and Attending Events C</i> – detailed approach only, not what events or how many would be provided.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Brand and Campaign Theme Creation C</i> – detailed approach only</li> </ul>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Market Analysis and Recommendations C</i> – detailed approach only</li> </ul>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Workforce Attraction Tactical Campaign Plan</i></li> </ul>
2.	<i>Project Plan</i>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Objectives by Target Audience C</i> – was not present</li> </ul>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Strategies by Target Audience C</i> – was not present</li> </ul>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Tactics by Target Audience C</i> – was not present</li> </ul>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Timeline for Implementation P</i></li> </ul>
IV.	<i>Cost Proposal</i>
1.	<i>Cost Proposal Form</i>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES  
**BIDDER NAME:** Moxie  
**DATE:** 7/17/2024  
**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department’s RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**Directions:** *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

I. Preliminary Information
1. Proposal Cover Page P
2. Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification P
II. Organizational Qualifications and Experience
1. Overview of the Organization P - Moxie Strategies is an innovative boutique firm specializing in advertising, strategy, and public affairs.
2. Subcontractors P – 4 subcontractors
3. Organizational Chart P
4. Litigation P - None
5. Financial Viability C – No Dun report
6. Licensure/Certification P - Moxie Strategies is proud to be a Certified Women Business Enterprise (WBE) and a Certified Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, Queer, Questioning+ Business Enterprise (LGBTQ+) in the State of New Jersey
7. Certificate of Insurance P
III. Proposed Services
1. Services to be Provided
• Objectives C – Was not present
• Target Audiences P
• Geography C – Was not present
• Strategies

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** Moxie

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

1. <i>Creating a Brand P</i> – Had themes and concepts.
2. <i>Creating a Campaign P</i> – Had themes and concepts.
3. <i>Using Highly-Targeted Paid Advertising C</i> – Was not present
4. <i>Maximizing Public Relations C</i> – Was not present
5. <i>Creating a Tool Kit C</i> – Was not present
6. <i>Designing a Website C</i> – Did state they would build stand alone website but did not give detail or state any technologies used. Also did not give service expectations.
7. <i>Creating, Leveraging and Attending Events</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Brand and Campaign Theme Creation P</i></li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Market Analysis and Recommendations C</i> – Was not present</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Workforce Attraction Tactical Campaign Plan</i></li> </ul>
2. <i>Project Plan</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Objectives by Target Audience P</i></li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Strategies by Target Audience P</i></li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Tactics by Target Audience P</i></li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Timeline for Implementation P</i></li> </ul>
IV. <i>Cost Proposal</i>
1. <i>Cost Proposal Form</i>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES  
**BIDDER NAME:** Peter Mayer  
**DATE:** 7/17/2024  
**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department’s RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**Directions:** *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

I.	<i>Preliminary Information</i>
	1. <i>Proposal Cover Page P</i>
	2. <i>Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification P</i>
II.	<i>Organizational Qualifications and Experience</i>
	1. <i>Overview of the Organization P - <b>PETERMAYER is a full-service advertising agency with in-house capabilities to develop holistic, integrated campaigns</b></i>
	2. <i>Subcontractors P – 1 Look Far Labs for web development</i>
	3. <i>Organizational Chart C – Not present</i>
	4. <i>Litigation C – Not present</i>
	5. <i>Financial Viability C – Not present</i>
	6. <i>Licensure/Certification C – Not present</i>
	7. <i>Certificate of Insurance C – Not present</i>
III.	<i>Proposed Services</i>
	1. <i>Services to be Provided</i>
	• <i>Objectives P</i>
	• <i>Target Audiences C – Not present</i>
	• <i>Geography P – answered indirectly with some detail</i>
	• <i>Strategies</i>
	1. <i>Creating a Brand P– detailed approach only</i>
	2. <i>Creating a Campaign C – Not present</i>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** Peter Mayer

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

3. <i>Using Highly-Targeted Paid Advertising C – Not present</i>
4. <i>Maximizing Public Relations</i>
5. <i>Creating a Tool Kit P– detailed approach only</i>
6. <i>Designing a Website P – details around approach of developing web page with us. No technologies or service agreement.</i>
7. <i>Creating, Leveraging and Attending Events P – Included briefly, no details</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Brand and Campaign Theme Creation C – Not present</i></li> <li>• <i>Market Analysis and Recommendations C – Not present</i></li> <li>• <i>Workforce Attraction Tactical Campaign Plan C – Not present</i></li> </ul>
2. <i>Project Plan</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Objectives by Target Audience C – Not present</i></li> <li>• <i>Strategies by Target Audience C – Not present</i></li> <li>• <i>Tactics by Target Audience C – Not present</i></li> <li>• <i>Timeline for Implementation P</i></li> </ul>
IV. <i>Cost Proposal</i>
1. <i>Cost Proposal Form</i>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** Red House Communications

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department’s RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**Directions:** *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

I. Preliminary Information
1. Proposal Cover Page P
2. Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification P
II. Organizational Qualifications and Experience
1. Overview of the Organization P - Red House Communications is, first and foremost, a consumer branding and marketing agency
2. Subcontractors P – 2 subcontractors
3. Organizational Chart P
4. Litigation P - None
5. Financial Viability P – Low/Moderate \$26,500 credit
6. Licensure/Certification C – Not present
7. Certificate of Insurance P
III. Proposed Services
1. Services to be Provided
• Objectives P
• Target Audiences P
• Geography C – Not present
• Strategies
1. Creating a Brand C – Did not detail much, gave general approach
2. Creating a Campaign C – Did not detail much, gave general approach

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** Red House Communications

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

	3. <i>Using Highly-Targeted Paid Advertising P</i> – Gave a good approach with details on targeted audience.
	4. <i>Maximizing Public Relations C</i> – Not present
	5. <i>Creating a Tool Kit C</i> – Not present
	6. <i>Designing a Website C</i> – Gave their web development approach with SDLC until release but no service agreement details on when project is over. What happens to website then, do we get documentation and code base. What technology used.
	7. <i>Creating, Leveraging and Attending Events C</i> – Not present
	• <i>Brand and Campaign Theme Creation C</i> – Not present
	• <i>Market Analysis and Recommendations C</i> – Not present
	• <i>Workforce Attraction Tactical Campaign Plan C</i> – Not present
	2. <i>Project Plan</i>
	• <i>Objectives by Target Audience C</i> – Not present
	• <i>Strategies by Target Audience C</i> – Not present
	• <i>Tactics by Target Audience C</i> – Not present
	• <i>Timeline for Implementation P</i> – Gave phases
IV.	<i>Cost Proposal</i>
	1. <i>Cost Proposal Form</i>



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023  
**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES  
**BIDDER NAME:** Results Marketing & Design  
**DATE:** 7/17/2024  
**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan  
**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

su\*\*\*\*\*  
 \*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department’s RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**Directions:** *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

<i>I. Preliminary Information</i>
<i>1. Proposal Cover Page P</i>
<i>2. Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification P</i>
<i>II. Organizational Qualifications and Experience</i>
<i>1. Overview of the Organization P</i> Ethos is a multiplatform agency with a 60-person team of marketing, public relations, social media, digital advertising, website development, and creative professionals, with all of the capabilities envisioned by this RFP in-house.
<i>2. Subcontractors P – 2 subcontractors</i>
<i>3. Organizational Chart P</i>
<i>4. Litigation P - None</i>
<i>5. Financial Viability P – Low/Moderate \$22,500 credit</i>
<i>6. Licensure/Certification C - None</i>
<i>7. Certificate of Insurance P</i>
<i>III. Proposed Services</i>
<i>1. Services to be Provided</i>
• <i>Objectives P</i>
• <i>Target Audiences P</i>
• <i>Geography C – Was not present</i>
• <i>Strategies</i>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** Results Marketing & Design

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

1. <i>Creating a Brand P</i> – Leverage current
2. <i>Creating a Campaign P</i> – Leverage existing campaigns in Maine
3. <i>Using Highly-Targeted Paid Advertising P</i> – Many examples, mail pieces, Airport ads, Digital and social media.
4. <i>Maximizing Public Relations C</i> – Was not present
5. <i>Creating a Tool Kit</i>
6. <i>Designing a Website P</i> – Website Programming and Deliverables are detailed nicely, but nothing policies, or what technologies.
7. <i>Creating, Leveraging and Attending Events P</i> – Gave details about even booth.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Brand and Campaign Theme Creation P</i></li> <li>• <i>Market Analysis and Recommendations P</i></li> <li>• <i>Workforce Attraction Tactical Campaign Plan P</i></li> </ul>
2. <i>Project Plan</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Objectives by Target Audience</i></li> <li>• <i>Strategies by Target Audience P</i></li> <li>• <i>Tactics by Target Audience P</i></li> <li>• <i>Timeline for Implementation P</i></li> </ul>
IV. <i>Cost Proposal</i>
1. <i>Cost Proposal Form</i>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** Riguard Global Company

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department’s RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**Directions:** *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

I.	<i>Preliminary Information</i>
	1. <i>Proposal Cover Page P</i>
	2. <i>Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification P</i>
II.	<i>Organizational Qualifications and Experience</i>
	1. <i>Overview of the Organization P - Rigaud Global Company (RGC) is a specialized marketing and communications firm with extensive experience developing impactful campaigns for government agencies, educational institutions, and organizations focused on social good. Founded in 2019 and based in at 2700 Neabsco Common PI Ste 101, Woodbridge, VA 22191, RGC has quickly established itself as a leader in creating strategic communications initiatives that drive positive change and empower communities.</i>
	2. <i>Subcontractors P - None</i>
	3. <i>Organizational Chart P</i>
	4. <i>Litigation P</i>
	5. <i>Financial Viability C – Can not provide a Dun report</i>
	6. <i>Licensure/Certification P - <b>Certificate of Good Standing</b> (No licensure stated is incorporated in Virginia.</i>
	7. <i>Certificate of Insurance P</i>
III.	<i>Proposed Services</i>
	1. <i>Services to be Provided P</i>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** Riguard Global Company

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

• Objectives P
• Target Audiences P
• Geography C – Did not see this addressed
• Strategies P
1. Creating a Brand
2. Creating a Campaign
3. Using Highly-Targeted Paid Advertising C – Did not see this addressed
4. Maximizing Public Relations C – Did not see this addressed
5. Creating a Tool Kit
6. Designing a Website C – They only talked about a video on a website.
7. Creating, Leveraging and Attending Events C – Did not see this addressed
• Brand and Campaign Theme Creation P
• Market Analysis and Recommendations P – Did not see details just approach
• Workforce Attraction Tactical Campaign Plan P – Did not see details just approach
2. Project Plan
• Objectives by Target Audience P
• Strategies by Target Audience P
• Tactics by Target Audience P
• Timeline for Implementation P- Timeline intervals every 3-4 months
IV. Cost Proposal
1. Cost Proposal Form

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** Rinck Advertising

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department’s RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**Directions:** *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

I. Preliminary Information
1. Proposal Cover Page P
2. Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification P
II. Organizational Qualifications and Experience
1. Overview of the Organization P – Maine Based Advertising company
2. Subcontractors P – 2 Subcontractors
3. Organizational Chart P
4. Litigation P - None
5. Financial Viability P -Low/Moderate risk, \$90,000 Credit
6. Licensure/Certification C - None
7. Certificate of Insurance P
III. Proposed Services
1. Services to be Provided
• Objectives P
• Target Audiences P
• Geography P
• Strategies
1. Creating a Brand P – gave a good, detailed approach and strategy
2. Creating a Campaign P – shared development process

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** Rinck Advertising

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

	3. <i>Using Highly-Targeted Paid Advertising P</i> – They the general various methods to achieve this. But not specific technologies.
	4. <i>Maximizing Public Relations P</i> – Showed good methodology.
	5. <i>Creating a Tool Kit C</i> – Not a lot of detail, just general process/experience
	6. <i>Designing a Website C</i> – Not a lot of detail just general concepts
	7. <i>Creating, Leveraging and Attending Events P</i> – Gave great Examples: Professional Conferences Trade Shows Resource Distribution Tours Virtual & in-person meetings, forums, summits, and presentations In-School Programs & Educational Events Brand-to-Audience Events Brand-to-Press Events Brand-to-Influencer Events Special Events & Fundraisers Product Sampling Tours PR Stunts/Guerilla Marketing
	• <i>Brand and Campaign Theme Creation P</i>
	• <i>Market Analysis and Recommendations P</i>
	• <i>Workforce Attraction Tactical Campaign Plan P</i>
	2. <i>Project Plan</i>
	• <i>Objectives by Target Audience P</i>
	• <i>Strategies by Target Audience P</i>
	• <i>Tactics by Target Audience P</i>
	• <i>Timeline for Implementation P</i>
	IV. <i>Cost Proposal</i>
	1. <i>Cost Proposal Form</i>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** WeUsThem

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department’s RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**Directions:** *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

I. Preliminary Information
1. Proposal Cover Page P
2. Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification P
II. Organizational Qualifications and Experience
1. Overview of the Organization P
2. Subcontractors P – 4 subcontractors
3. Organizational Chart P
4. Litigation P - None
5. Financial Viability C – No Dun report
6. Licensure/Certification C - None
7. Certificate of Insurance P
III. Proposed Services
1. Services to be Provided
• Objectives
• Target Audiences
• Geography
• Strategies
1. Creating a Brand C – Not present
2. Creating a Campaign C – Not present
3. Using Highly-Targeted Paid Advertising C – Not present
4. Maximizing Public Relations C – Not present

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** WORKFORCE ATTRACTION MARKETING SERVICES

**BIDDER NAME:** WeUsThem

**DATE:** 7/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Logan Ryan

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** MaineIT

5. <i>Creating a Tool Kit C</i> – Not present
6. <i>Designing a Website C</i> – Gave some Policies and development methodologies but did not give technology details, service details, or what would be delivered as part of a website.
7. <i>Creating, Leveraging and Attending Events C</i> – Not present
• <i>Brand and Campaign Theme Creation C</i> – Not present
• <i>Market Analysis and Recommendations C</i> – Not present
• <i>Workforce Attraction Tactical Campaign Plan C</i> – Not present
2. <i>Project Plan</i>
• <i>Objectives by Target Audience C</i> – Not present
• <i>Strategies by Target Audience C</i> – Not present
• <i>Tactics by Target Audience C</i> – Not present
• <i>Timeline for Implementation C</i> – Not present
IV. <i>Cost Proposal</i>
1. <i>Cost Proposal Form</i>



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** AVA TopRight

**DATE:** 07/10/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

TopRight appears to have experience in the area of government marketing and in particular workforce attraction. Their company overview is sufficient and the examples of prior work clearly indicate alignment with the RFP.

Prior work includes evidence of creating brand identities as well as multi-channel campaigns. Very good.

2. Subcontractors

Two named: Marketing Doctor (media partner) and Violet PR (PR partner). Both have clear experience including government work in the economic development space.

3. Organizational Chart

Provided. Details of project team members and their experience is extensive.

4. Litigation

AVA TopRight, LLC has not been subject to any litigation within the last five (5) years.

5. Certificate of Insurance

Provided

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** AVA TopRight

**DATE:** 07/10/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

The outline of services to be provided includes reference to proprietary AI-based audience segmentation. As a follow-up to that, the organization indicates robust reporting to show the value of the data analysis tools they use. A lot of the audience segmentation appears to have been undertaken already, or at least begun, given the depth of information in the proposal.

For the brand identity piece, I would have liked to see a reference to a brand standards document to accompany the effort and ensure consistent use across multiple stakeholders.

The proposal includes developing what the organization calls an “economic development portal for Maine” – this seems a bit misaligned with the RFP. I understand that the RFP seeks a sort of landing page for the campaigns rather than a complete rework of Maine’s economic development website (DECD’s site).

2. Implementation – Work Plan

The work plan is very detailed, including what appear to be a set of marketing concepts already drafted.

The timeline for implementation could have been presented in a clearer way, with more specifics for each task. It’s okay but not exceptional, and is notable for its lack of detail in comparison the rest of the proposal.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Black Travel Maine

**DATE:** 07/12/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

The overview of BTM is sufficient. Examples of prior projects that would be relevant to the RFP are not provided, though reference is made to an ERIH grant received in 2023.

2. Subcontractors

Five subcontractors are named and a summary of information is provided about each.

3. Organizational Chart

Provided, along with responsibilities outlined for each member of the team.

4. Litigation

“In response to the request for a list of all current litigation in which our company is named, as well as a list of all closed cases within the past five (5) years where we paid the claimant either as part of a settlement or by decree, we are pleased to inform you that we have no such cases to report. There are no current litigations involving our company, nor have there been any closed cases in the past five years where we have made payments to claimants.”

5. Certificate of Insurance

Provided.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Black Travel Maine

**DATE:** 07/12/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

“Black Travel Marketing is excited to present a groundbreaking multicultural campaign to promote Maine as desirable place to live and work, "Welcome to Maine, There is So Much to Learn", campaign is tailored to align with the Maine 2020-2029 Economic Development Strategy: THE 2024 RESET. This innovative program is designed to position Maine as an inclusive and welcoming destination for people from diverse backgrounds. By integrating with the state's 10-year economic plan and destination tourism strategy, our campaign leverages strategic collaborations and partnerships both within and beyond Maine. Our goal is to highlight Maine's natural beauty, rich cultural heritage, and vibrant, inclusive community to attract a broad spectrum of talent and drive economic growth.”

The proposal includes a clear mention of ensuring alignment with the MOT marketing plan, which I think is a plus. It shows an awareness of various marketing campaigns for the State and how they might build upon one another.

Description of the brand toolkit includes specific reference to providing logo, color scheme and typography – this is great. Will help to ensure consistent application of the brand by various partners and other users.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

The work plan chart is long and difficult to follow, though I appreciate the estimates of which activities will be undertaken in which timespans (far right column). It does demonstrate a clear understanding of the various audiences and indicates steps to be taken to best leverage/reach those groups.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Blaze

**DATE:** 07/12/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
  - 1. Overview of Organization

Blaze provides a complete overview of their organization, and cites multiple examples of relevant experience including recent work on the 10-Year EDS Reset.

The company overview is really detailed.

- 2. Subcontractors

Four named: Live + Work in Maine, Kurt Graser, Angie Helton, Isa Morton. Bios and experience outlined for each subcontractor.

- 3. Organizational Chart

Provided and detailed. Key staff from Blaze and from Live + Work in Maine have details provided.

- 4. Litigation

None:

“Neither Blaze nor Live and Work in Maine have any litigation to disclose.”

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Blaze

**DATE:** 07/12/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

5. Certificate of Insurance

Provided.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

Suggests leveraging the Live + Work in Maine brand rather than creating a new brand identity. While this would be expedient, it is not completely aligned with the requirements of the RFP, which calls for the creation of a brand.

The proposal does call out the intention of aligning with other branding efforts at the State level and through Live + Work in Maine campaigns.

The campaign tagline appears to be “Here for Good”

The proposal also seeks to use Live + Work in Maine’s existing website rather than creating a new one. This is also out of step with the RFP requirements. I have some concerns about putting these state-funded assets on an external website, particularly since the contract would end at some point – and we would want a public-facing place for the assets to live that would outlast the contract.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

There is a media flow chart which I appreciate, but there is no clear or visually presented timeline of how the consultation process and other work will occur if Blaze were to be awarded the contract.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Broadreach PR

**DATE:** 07/12/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
  - 1. Overview of Organization

The overview is comprehensive and includes details of relevant experience relating to workforce attraction campaigns for both public and private sector organizations. There are also links to public relations results/coverage.

There are three groups (Broadreach, iBec, and NL Partners) and there are qualifications and experience listed for each.

- 2. Subcontractors

Two listed: iBec Creative and NL Partners. Qualifications and delegated activities are clearly outlined for each.

- 3. Organizational Chart

Provided. Shows the team at Broadreach PR as well as the vendors/subcontractors at NL Partners and iBec.

- 4. Litigation

None.

- 5. Certificate of Insurance

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Broadreach PR

**DATE:** 07/12/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

Provided.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

The description of services to be provided clearly follows the requirements of the RFP and is well organized. There is some creative information included, such as targeting certain states/areas based on where they lag Maine in certain desirable elements for attracting new talent. I like the thoughtfulness this displays.

The outline also clearly notes that a brand guide will be provided – a key piece to ensuring consistent use of the brand identity by the Department and partners over time.

Several sample campaigns are provided:

“Campaign 1: Maine is SO ME

Campaign 2: Maine Your next adventure”

2. Implementation – Work Plan

The work plan/timeline is clear and easy to understand. It is broken out by year and within each year as well. I would like to see notation that campaigns for year 2 would be developed prior to the beginning of year 2, but generally speaking the timeline for campaign and collateral development seems reasonable.



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Campfire Naretiv

**DATE:** 07/12/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
  - 1. Overview of Organization

The combined experience of Naretiv and Campfire Consulting seems to be adequate to meet the requirements of the RFP.

The overview highlights demonstrated work in the field of workforce development for Campfire:

“Campfire has championed several Maine workforce development initiatives: partnering with the Roux Institute on a Blue Economy Innovation Start Summit, collaborating with the Maine Development Foundation and the Maine Downtown Center to promote regional workforce development in our historic downtown areas, teaming up with Live + Work in Maine to host Welcome Home Events that strengthen social capital for remote workers and newcomers, and contributing to entrepreneurial projects designed to enhance place-based economic development.”

There is an effort in the overview to draw a connection between tourism and workforce attraction, which may be valid given the importance of targeting varied and specific audience segments.

- 2. Subcontractors
- One noted: Redbird Media

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Campfire Naretiv

**DATE:** 07/12/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

“Naretiv will work with Redbird Media to produce video pieces. Redbird is a women-owned B Corp that has partnered with Naretiv on major projects for nearly a decade.”

There is not much additional detail provided about Redbird Media.

3. Organizational Chart

Provided, and clearly outlines who does what and which organization they are with (Naretiv/Campfire/Redbird). Bios of project team are not provided.

4. Litigation

None.

5. Certificate of Insurance

Provided.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

The description of services to be provided is thorough. I appreciate that a brand guide is called out and specifically proposed.

Several brainstormed campaign themes include:

“More is More”

“Take the Leap”

The website and toolkit for partners are both also mentioned and appear aligned with the requirements of the RFP.

The proposal suggests reducing the flight to 12-18 months, which I think could limit effectiveness. The work would be 24 months, and six months to accomplish production and editing for the campaign seems very adequate. I would want to see at *least* 18 months flight time.

“Flighting: Suggest reducing flight to 12-18 months to maximize reach across most audiences/channels”

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Campfire Naretiv

**DATE:** 07/12/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community  
Development

2. Implementation – Work Plan

The work plan is thorough and easy to follow. It also appears to have a realistic timeline attached to the creation and launch of the campaigns. The work plan calls for the campaign launch to be in September of 2025. It is likely that the work could be accomplished in a timelier way, as I mentioned above.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** CashmanKatz

**DATE:** 07/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

The overview says the company has a 30-year history, and references work for a variety of clients including state agencies.

“Over the course of our 30-year history, we have partnered with a variety of clients - from state agencies to private companies - for the strategy and execution of public education, recruitment, tourism and economic development campaign, among countless other initiatives. Additional information such as our Agency Background, qualifications and experience are in the pages that follow.”

Founded in 1992, CashmanKatz has 3 “integrated sister companies.”

They reference extensive tourism and economic development experience, and it appears many of the examples provided are Connecticut-based.

They cite the RFP in providing two specific relevant examples

“that highlight a challenge that was faced, the goals set, strategy employed and the executions and outcome.”

2. Subcontractors

No subcontractors proposed. Company cites integrated operation.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** CashmanKatz

**DATE:** 07/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

3. Organizational Chart

Provided, along with job description information to supplement the names listed on the chart.

4. Litigation

“CK has not had any litigation cases within the past five (5) years.”

5. Certificate of Insurance

Provided

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

The company has done their homework, citing not only the 10-year plan but also MOT research that is relevant to the scope of the RFP.

I realize that the proposals are not firm commitments to campaign messaging, but I am troubled by one of the statements in this proposal:

“People who choose career may not choose Maine. But people who choose themselves just might”

This is not the message I think we are looking to send. We want people to come to Maine for their careers, not in spite of them.

I like the “Choose ME” language, but wish it were not so dismissive of career. This seems to be a misunderstanding of the RFP in the sense that a connection to the 10-year EDS would be more innovation and career-focused rather than a tourism/”slow down” feel.

The MELocate app is creative and demonstrates that the company understood the RFP in the sense of promoting talent attraction to all areas of the state, not just the densely populated urban areas.

I like the focus on “speed to market” the proposal mentions.

“Speed to market and flexibility will be important. In a rapidly changing environment, it is crucial to be able to quickly adapt to audience needs and market conditions. Another great

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** CashmanKatz

**DATE:** 07/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

strength of our team – particularly our digital performance team – is to adapt our clients’ campaigns very quickly to those ever-changing needs. Sometimes that means adapting campaigns to new realities. Other times, it means getting new campaigns through planning, conception and launch quickly in order to capture opportunities. When a campaign is launched in market, the work doesn’t end. Our team constantly evaluates performance across a number of metrics and looks for opportunities to stay ahead of the curve – instead of behind it.”

2. Implementation – Work Plan

The proposal does not appear to include a work plan document. I would have liked to see one to visualize the timing the company envisions for creating and launching the campaigns.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Creative Direct Marketing Group

**DATE:** 07/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

The company appears to have a long history, having been founded in 1974. The overview lists experience in the various channels that would be included in a marketing campaign. As the name suggests, it seems they have deep experience in direct mail-type marketing.

However, the three projects cited as examples of work are extremely high-level, with almost no detail about the type of project, goals of project, and how any are directly relevant to the requirements of this RFP.

2. Subcontractors

None.

3. Organizational Chart

Provided, for leadership team of Creative Direct Marketing Group. High-level detail provided for the leadership team members pictured.

4. Litigation

“There is no current litigation in which Creative Direct Marketing Group is named, and no closed cases within the past five (5) years, in which CDMG paid the claimant either as part of a settlement or by decree.”

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Creative Direct Marketing Group

**DATE:** 07/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

5. Certificate of Insurance  
Provided.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

The services to be provided is a very high-level document. While the proposal outlines various audiences, there is not a reference to the RFP requirement of creating a brand, building a website, etc. I wanted to see more detail on the process, as well as a true project plan, rather than an outline of various audiences with high-level potential suggestions.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

Not provided, at least not in any useful level of detail.



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** DCI

**DATE:** 07/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
  - 1. Overview of Organization

The organization appears to have deep experience:

“Established in New York City in 1960, Development Counsellors International (DCI) specializes in tourism, economic development and talent attraction marketing. We have worked for more than 500 cities, counties, regions, and states and we understand the unique challenges and opportunities that states and communities face.”

Experience cited includes Florida, Kansas, and Virginia, all working on talent attraction-specific campaigns. For the Virginia campaign specifically, there is alignment in the area of innovation as a focus for talent attraction.

- 2. Subcontractors

None.

- 3. Organizational Chart

Provided, along with bios for “key” team members. Seems like quite a large firm. Certified women-owned business.

- 4. Litigation

None.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** DCI

**DATE:** 07/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

5. Certificate of Insurance

Provided.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

The detail in this section is great. I am pleased to see specific mention of a brand guide, as well as the website component and the one-pager that are requirements of the RFP.

There are some specific website recommendations that may go beyond the requirements of the RFP but would potentially add value:

An interactive state and region map

Company cluster map

Find your community quiz

Cost of living calculator

Additionally, the digital toolkit seems robust and well thought out.

I note that DCI has specifically tracked/reported on talent attraction for eight years:

“DCI’s Talent Wars report, now in its eight edition, is the leading intelligence behind all of our talent attraction campaigns.”

The proposal also discusses specifically leveraging tourism, which the RFP calls out as an opportunity for alignment:

“We like to say that today’s visitor is tomorrow’s talent. Our national research consistently finds that perceptions are influenced strongly by firsthand experience – and Maine has the advantage of a strong reputation as a place to visit. In addition, tourism marketing has an impact on where people decide to move.”

2. Implementation – Work Plan

Implementation timeline provided and very detailed. The timeline for creating the campaign is reasonable, though I would ideally like to see the website launching before April 2025.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** DCI

**DATE:** 07/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community  
Development

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Elephant in the Room

**DATE:** 07/18/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

“Elephant In The Room is a collective of brand specialists uniquely positioned to provide world-class strategic creative and marketing services for select clients.”

The overview states that the company does not have a media preference but instead creates solutions that best fit each client. This seems like a good fit for what the RFP requests.

The examples of experience have connection to economic development but are less focused on specific workforce attraction.

2. Subcontractors

Fifteen subcontractors listed. Company refers to themselves as the “agency quarterback.”

3. Organizational Chart

Provided, along with short bios for each person shown. A part-time copywriter who lives in Maine is specifically mentioned.

“Lauren Supron / Copywriter

Lauren is our secret weapon. Lauren is not a full-time employee but an extremely trusted copywriting partner that has worked with David for many years.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Elephant in the Room

**DATE:** 07/18/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

In early 2022, Lauren moved to Portland as a remote worker. She knows the journey and the triggers that made Maine a fit for her and her entire family. (Yes, her sister, mom, dad and fiancé relocated as well.) Maybe she'll become a full-time remote worker for us."

4. Litigation

"In our 18-year history, we've navigated the rocky seas of business with such finesse that we've never once found ourselves in the stormy waters of litigation. Not a single courtroom drama, no legal acrobatics – just smooth seas."

5. Certificate of Insurance  
Provided.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

The proposal is detailed and touches on each of the requirements of the RFP. Good.

The proposal specifically calls out provision of a brand guidelines document, which is also very good.

However, the proposal repeatedly states that their recommendation is a \$15M media budget (separate from agency and production costs, it appears) – this is completely misaligned with the RFP and the amount to be awarded. If the approach is driven by an expectation that the spend is much much greater than what the RFP provides, that could be a big problem.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

The work plan is clear and time-bound, which may increase accountability. I like that the website is prioritized and planned for launch by end of January 2025.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Fuseideas

**DATE:** 07/18/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

Fuseideas makes a clear case for their experience and understanding of the Maine market. They note that they are Maine-based, and have significant experience in attraction/acquisition campaigns.

I especially appreciate that the company outlines their experience in specific areas of strength required/requested in the RFP.

2. Subcontractors

One, Lou Hammond Group (PR services).

3. Organizational Chart

Provided for both Fuseideas and Lou Hammond Group.

4. Litigation

None.

5. Certificate of Insurance

Provided.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Fuseideas

**DATE:** 07/18/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

The outline of services to be provided is extensive and appears to mostly align with the RFP. I would have liked to see some additional detail about the brand creation; that piece seems quite high-level.

“Creating a Brand: We prefer to approach this task as “discovering the brand” then developing the most appropriate and effective creative expression of that brand. This is because brand strategy must be authentic and based on key truths. We know the brand strategy will be centered on Maine Quality of life — Quality of place. But to flesh out the brand strategy we will closely examine the Audience, Brand and Competition to uncover key insights that contribute to an overall brand strategy. We understand that significant investment has been made in building Maine’s brand equity through Tourism marketing and other efforts, so we will take care to align our brand strategy for this assignment to work with and supplement existing programs, fine-tuning it for our audiences.”

2. Implementation – Work Plan

The work plan is provided and seems adequate. The timelines seem mostly reasonable as well, with the website (a key component of the RFP) proposed as a 4½ -5 month timeframe. Launching the toolkits for partners prior to the website being launched seems like a backwards strategy, but maybe it would be possible to adjust that timeline if the company were awarded.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Golden Shovel Agency

**DATE:** 07/18/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

The organization states that their work is targeted to economic development and talent attraction:

“Golden Shovel Agency brings over 15 years of expertise in delivering comprehensive strategy, marketing, and communications services to state, regional, county, and local organizations focused on fostering economic growth through business and talent attraction initiatives.”

Further:

“Golden Shovel Agency has a proven track record in implementing talent attraction campaigns tailored to the target audiences identified by the state of Maine: workers and families with existing ties, young families, remote workers, new Americans and people overseas, recent college graduates, and transitioning military personnel and their families.”

Specific experience in talent attraction and for the audiences outlined in the RFP seems like a strength.

Experience noted for subcontractor 19 Oaks includes the Greater Portland Metro campaign they worked on. Dates not provided for that work/campaign.

2. Subcontractors

19 Oaks, a Maine-based firm. Details about 19 Oaks and some examples of their experience are included in the proposal.



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Golden Shovel Agency

**DATE:** 07/18/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

3. Organizational Chart

Provided, with photos.

4. Litigation

None.

5. Certificate of Insurance

Provided.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

The proposal outlines services and notes deliverables. The brand style guide is called out as something the company will provide.

“As a final deliverable, you will receive a comprehensive brand style guide that includes the logo design, typography, color palettes, and other essential elements. This guide will serve as a reference and resource for your organization and strategic partners.” Good.

I appreciate this acknowledgement of the importance of the website component of the RFP:

“A talent attraction website will be your front door - the first thing individuals and families see when evaluating moving to Maine. Golden Shovel Agency’s (GSA) award-winning websites elevate community and organization brands while making it possible to build connections and generate leads.”

This proposal includes reference to virtual reality tours as part of the campaign package/website content. I think this is interesting.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

A visual work plan is not provided.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Hirons

**DATE:** 07/18/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

“Hirons is a full-service advertising, public relations, and digital firm with offices in downtown Indianapolis and Chicago. Founded in 1978, Hirons has effectively delivered clients’ messages for more than 45 years. Our history is entrenched in providing research-based, innovative, and bold solutions that support our clients’ goals. Our strategy is to outthink, outwork, and outperform while consistently exceeding client expectations.”

The firm does have specific experience in workforce development in Indianapolis. Examples of work do not include any Northeast experience.

2. Subcontractors

Two subcontractors are noted: Sutherland Weston Marketing Communications and TPMA. Brief information is provided on each.

3. Organizational Chart

Provided, high-level.

4. Litigation

None.

5. Certificate of Insurance

Provided.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Hiron

**DATE:** 07/18/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

The proposed services are outlined sufficiently. The website deliverable is given little space in the proposal, however, which may be problematic. The website will be a key piece of the campaign(s) and the details here are thin.

The reporting aspect seems adequate. The media channels are outlined but the specific mix and any media flight calendar are not included.

The creative asset examples provided are not bad (the concept commercial scripts, for example). This proposal is not very visual, but does show examples of the firm's prior work.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

I do not see a timeline/time-bound work plan in this proposal.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Hoffman York

**DATE:** 07/18/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

The firm has a long history and does the core work (and things required in RFP) in-house.

“Founded in 1933, Hoffman York is considered one of the longest-running independent communications agencies in the United States. As a fully integrated agency, we’re proud to offer interdisciplinary expertise for our clients. And we do all the core disciplines in-house: research, strategy and analytics; traditional and digital creative and production; media planning and buying; public relations; and web UX and development.”

They cite experience in destination marketing and specifically in workforce attraction for state agencies:

“Experienced in Workforce Attraction: After rebranding the Wisconsin Economic Development Corporation in the first year of our relationship, we’ve turned our attention to building an increasingly sophisticated talent attraction program with defined strategies and tactics at both the state and regional levels. You can read more about it in the Projects section of this document. We’ve also developed campaigns for the State of Montana including “Come Home Montana,” an initiative to bring past residents back to the state, and “Care Montana,” a campaign that recruited healthcare workers.”

This is good experience and relevant to the RFP.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Hoffman York

**DATE:** 07/18/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

The examples of work provided are helpful. One is the workforce attraction work done in Wisconsin, while the other two examples are destination marketing work.

2. Subcontractors

None.

3. Organizational Chart

Provided, along with bio information for team members.

4. Litigation

None in the past 5 years.

5. Certificate of Insurance

Provided.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

The proposal of services to be provided clearly walks through the requirements of the RFP.

I appreciate the clear indication that in addition to a new logo/brand, brand guidelines will be shared to ensure consistent usage of the new logo/brand identity for all partners and stakeholders:

“We’re here to ensure Maine’s Workforce Attraction brand makes that connection at every touchpoint. Developed with respect for, and in relation to, other State brands (Visit Maine, DECD) to ensure cohesion, the new brand will tell Maine’s story across all campaign materials. We’ll also create a brand toolkit and guidelines to make implementation easy for partners across the state.”

Since the website is a critical component of the campaign and of the RFP requirements, I am glad to see this understanding outlined in the proposal:

“Our digital philosophy is based on the premise that in today’s world, websites are the face of the brand. The digital ecosystem through which a consumer finds the website—via search, clicking on a social media post, following a link in an email or snapping a QR code—must work in concert with the website to represent an integrated brand experience.”

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Hoffman York

**DATE:** 07/18/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

Under the portion of the proposal relating to brand campaigns, I appreciate that the firm has shown examples of prior work rather than mockups or potential campaign branding before the stakeholder and other process pieces are undertaken. This is good.

Intention around reporting seems strong and aligned with the RFP.

Travel to Maine is not a barrier and is specifically noted in the proposal:

“Our team attends and activates events all over the country on behalf of our clients and would gladly travel to Maine, and the New England region, to further the DECD’s goals.”

2. Implementation – Work Plan

A timebound work plan is provided and has sufficient detail. Again, the website is planned for launch in February 2025 which is later than I would like to see. The campaign launch is planned for April 2025, which also seems like quite a lag – but branding is not an overnight process.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Moxie Strategies

**DATE:** 07/19/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

Moxie Strategies is a newer firm, founded in April of 2024.

Their experience includes work with state and city governments as well as a specific talent attraction campaign in New Jersey.

“Choose New Jersey is the state's leading non-profit business attraction organization, leveraging the collective power of New Jersey's business, government, labor, and academic sectors to expand the state's economy.”

2. Subcontractors

Four subcontractors are named, and high-level information is provided on each. MV Digital, Paper Tiger, Media Fortitude Partners and Cushman Creative.

3. Organizational Chart

Provided.

4. Litigation

“Moxie is not subject to any current or pending litigation. The company has never been named in a lawsuit.”

5. Certificate of Insurance

Provided.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Moxie Strategies

**DATE:** 07/19/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

The proposal outlines a few creative concepts, but I would have liked to see more information about branding (and branding that was more aligned with MOT's work, as required in the RFP) rather than straight into logo options.

I do appreciate that the proposal notes that the firm would seek to craft individualized messages for each target audience in the RFP:

“Our goal is to ensure Maine’s workforce attraction campaign is driven by captivating and engaging content that is not one-size-fits-all – we will work with you to create unique messages for each target audience under the umbrella of one overarching brand. Our award-winning team excels in graphic design, copywriting, and advertising development across multiple media platforms, including print, broadcast, and digital. Our services include video production, photography, stock photography, and illustrations. Our creative team is led by Pearl Gabel, an award-winning strategist, content creator and storyteller recognized by Fortune’s 40 Under 40 and PRWeek’s Most Influential People in PR and Business.”

The proposal notes that PR work will be done by the Maine-based subcontractor Cushman Creative.

The proposal shows that the firm did their homework to understand some of the demographic challenges and the 10-Year Plan goal. This is good to see.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

The implementation timeline is clear and easy to follow. It is high-level but contains sufficient detail about the actions to be taken in each phase.



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** PeterMayer

**DATE:** 07/19/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

The firm has been around for a long time.

“In 1967, Peter Arno Mayer opened his doors for business in downtown New Orleans. A gifted communicator and a community-minded businessman, Pete grew the agency to become the largest in Louisiana. He passed control to his sons, Mark and Josh, who preserved the agency’s independence and commitment to Louisiana, as the industry underwent waves of consolidation within big cities. The Mayer family passed the torch to longtime President and Chief Strategy Officer Michelle Edelman in January 2022.”

The firm has many years of experience in destination marketing, which appears to be primarily tourism-focused.

The agency does seem to meet the requirements of the RFP in terms of being a full-service agency:

“PETERMAYER is a full-service advertising agency with in-house capabilities to develop holistic, integrated campaigns — from strategy, research and analytics to creative concept and design to media planning and buying, PR and social media.”

2. Subcontractors

One subcontractor, for website design: LookFar Labs. A brief overview of the subcontractor is provided.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** PeterMayer

**DATE:** 07/19/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

3. Organizational Chart

Provided, but no names attached to the roles shared.

4. Litigation

I did not find this in the email Phoenix shared for this firm.

5. Certificate of Insurance

I did not find this in the email Phoenix shared for this firm.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

The proposal reflects that the firm did some homework and background to prepare. It even appears that the colors of the proposal have been chosen to align with the 10-Year EDS. The visualization of the various steps and timeline for potential moves is good and adds value.

Overall, the proposal is high-level in terms of process and proposed services. I would have preferred to see more detail on the branding and website – those pieces in particular seem light on detail.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

The go-to-market timeline envisions a 7-month lead up (starting in January) to get a campaign to market, which seems too long. Furthermore, the website launch is proposed for almost 3 months after the campaign begins. This is a big miss in my opinion.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Red House Communications

**DATE:** 07/19/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

The Pittsburgh-based firm has experience in destination marketing and other specialties including economic development work for Pennsylvania and Maryland:

“In addition to our deep experience in destination marketing, since November of 2016, Red House has been researching, strategizing, designing, filming, photographing, marketing, writing and championing economic development brands for Pennsylvania and other destinations across the Mid-Atlantic.”

Experience seems aligned with the RFP. I appreciate the examples that include the work the firm did relating to an economic development strategy in Pennsylvania, which seems to have strong resemblance to the work the RFP envisions.

2. Subcontractors

Two subcontractors are intended: Wahila Creative and Neptune Holdings d/b/a Viqtory.

3. Organizational Chart

Provided, high-level with names and titles. Sufficient.

4. Litigation

None.

5. Certificate of Insurance

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Red House Communications

**DATE:** 07/19/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

Provided.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

Branding is proposed as a 150-day process. This seems like a lot, particularly for a two-year contract.

There seems to be a misunderstanding about the timing, per this section of the proposal:

“Brand Launch Campaign

The new workforce attraction brand are currently being translated into integrated brand launch campaigns. There’s no doubt that this work will extend well past June into the later half of 2024. This serves to announce the brand, and begin to lay top-of-mind awareness foundation for future more targeted efforts.”

The reference to layered media (sometimes also referred to as vertically integrated campaign strategy) makes sense to me. However, I was surprised to see traditional TV mentioned. Connected TV seems to make more sense.

The timeline for brand development is lengthy, but then there is very little detail on the actual campaigns and media buys. I was disappointed by the abrupt end of the proposal. There was a lot more I wanted to know relative to the RFP.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

This is sort of provided in narrative format in the latter half of the proposed services document. It ends abruptly and does not fully show/explain the planned campaign or media flights.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Results Marketing & Design, Inc. d/b/a Ethos

**DATE:** 07/23/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

The firm highlights the work they have done for Maine companies, as well as workforce attraction campaigns undertaken for DOL, MCCS, SMCC, and others:

“Ethos also has a long history of helping employers create and execute workforce campaigns that deliver results even in a tight labor market, for organizations like the Maine Department of Labor/ Maine Apprenticeship Program, the Maine Motor Transport Association, Enercon, Piper Shores, the Maine Community College System, the Harold Alfond Center for Advancement of Maine's Workforce, Southern Maine Community College, First Atlantic Healthcare, the Maine Long-Term Care Ombudsman Program, Sweetser, and the Respite for ME Caregiver program, among others.”

The firm's team is large and appears to meet the requirements of the RFP in terms of ability to provide all requested services.

Two of the examples of work provided are workforce attraction-specific. Good.

2. Subcontractors

Two noted: Lone Spruce Creative and Portland Marketing Analytics, LLC. Information provided on both firms.

3. Organizational Chart

Provided, along with high level information about various members of the team. Connections to Maine are noted for each team member highlighted.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Results Marketing & Design, Inc. d/b/a Ethos

**DATE:** 07/23/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

4. Litigation

None.

5. Certificate of Insurance

Provided.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

In this section, as in the overview, the firm references the Minnesota Star of the North campaign, but it is unclear if the campaign was their work. If it was, why not provide that example in the relevant experience section?

The creative concept reel is outstanding. Really, really good. Emotive, aligned with tourism but not exclusively tourism. Good tagline.

I appreciate that the firm proposes to dispel misconceptions about Maine and focusing on growth potential:

“Dispel misconceptions about working in Maine by conveying the limitless possibilities in a state with abundant natural resources—position Maine as a hub for developing innovative solutions and creating good-paying jobs to solve the global climate crisis and other issues.”

One negative: I understand the idea of highlighting the low crime rate but I think that will be a tough sell given recent tragedies.

Website plan is detailed and clear. Recommend clarifying ownership and ability to update the website as needed, including after the end of this contract. Not sure about the standalone component and how that would look post-contract.

The events component is very detailed and clear with actionable items and reasoning for each proposed event. Good.

There is no mention of a brand guide/brand standards document. It seems the firm considers the campaign the “brand” rather than creating a brand identity, as required by the RFP.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Results Marketing & Design, Inc. d/b/a Ethos

**DATE:** 07/23/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community  
Development

2. Implementation – Work Plan

The project plan includes good detail and timing, and I especially appreciate that the website is prioritized and planned for launch by the end of 2024. However, it will be hard to launch the website before the branding is settled. This piece feels like a miss.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Rigaud Global Company

**DATE:** 07/23/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

The overview of the firm does not immediately indicate a depth of experience in workforce attraction.

“Rigaud Global Company (RGC) is a specialized marketing and communications firm with extensive experience developing impactful campaigns for government agencies, educational institutions, and organizations focused on social good.”

None of the provided examples are relevant to workforce attraction.

2. Subcontractors

None listed.

3. Organizational Chart

Provided. Three team members and high level bios provided.

4. Litigation

“Rigaud Global Company is pleased to report that we currently have NO ongoing litigation. Furthermore, we have not been involved in any closed cases within the past five (5) years where we paid any claimant either as part of a settlement or by decree.”

5. Certificate of Insurance

Provided, may require additional discussion to meet all requirements of the RFP.



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Rigaud Global Company

**DATE:** 07/23/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

For a team of three (shown in the org chart) the proposed services seem to be really ambitious. The naming of various pieces of the proposal confused me a bit, but I think I see most of the RFP requirements included. There are several repeat references to particular programs, like the SRTC and Alford Grant.

The objectives set in the proposal are not backed by sufficient process detail to engender confidence in the ability of the firm to meet all RFP requirements.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

The timeline for implementation is not nearly detailed enough to give me confidence that it can be achieved. For example, it notes the beginning of website development but does not clearly indicate when that website would be launched.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Rinck Advertising

**DATE:** 07/24/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

The overview is thorough and I note that the firm is Maine-based. They note work with a variety of Maine-based organizations including DHHS and UMS. Their experience in workforce attraction seems to be related to their work with MaineGeneral Health to assist in recruitment.

Work examples provided include student recruitment at USM, recruitment for a business, and an awareness campaign for IFW.

2. Subcontractors

Two noted: Market Decisions Research and PrograMetrix. High level detail provided about how they would work with Rinck.

3. Organizational Chart

Provided, along with a job description for team members who would work on this project if Rinck were awarded.

4. Litigation

“Rinck currently has no pending or outstanding litigations. Rinck has had no litigation in the previous five years.”

5. Certificate of Insurance

Provided.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Rinck Advertising

**DATE:** 07/24/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

The proposal begins with clear objectives.

It is not clear if the agency intends to create a new brand or rework the Department's existing brand. This may be problematic, since the project is not promoting DECD, but rather, workforce attraction. However – this is a clever way to leverage the MOT brand, which the State has ownership of, and align the campaign for workforce attraction with a very similar look. I can see how that might work.

The event section is light on detail and direction. There are some creative high-level ideas for making the most of event attendance, broken out by target audiences. I'm not sure how realistic it is to accomplish attendance at so many events within the budget.

There is some interesting creative proposed here: Maine Character, "We're Maine. And we're looking for believers."

2. Implementation – Work Plan

The work plan is detailed and sufficient. I like that the website launch is proposed by the end of 2024 with the campaign launching in January. Shows an awareness of the value the website brings to the whole campaign.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** WeUsThem

**DATE:** 07/24/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

This firm is located outside of the United States, in Nova Scotia. They note experience with various Canadian institutions including various agencies of the Canadian government. The examples of work experience provided do not relate to workforce attraction, though there is some mention of student recruitment for Dalhousie University and volunteer recruitment specific to the Greater Halifax region for Big Brothers Big Sisters Canada.

The firm does have the capacity in-house to meet the requirements of the RFP in terms of services. They also showcase branding work and strategy work they have done for other clients.

2. Subcontractors

Four mentioned: Spider Video, Aaron McKenzie Fraser, VillageWorks Content Co. and Steve Jackson.

3. Organizational Chart

Provided with illustrations, no names connected to jobs shown.

Bios follow the chart for six individuals who are termed "key personnel."

4. Litigation

None.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** WeUsThem

**DATE:** 07/24/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Victoria Foley

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

5. Certificate of Insurance  
Provided.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

This is an interesting presentation, with workflow broken out for various key parts of the RFP. Clear and understandable.

KPIs are outlined.

Media relationships (and thus PR efforts) could be challenging for this organization based outside the US; the Canadian media landscape is more consolidated.

The invitation to Barrington Street for an in-person meeting feels a bit like this portion of the proposal was copied and pasted.

Nothing wows me about this proposal.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

The timeline feels too laid back – it proposes launching the website and the campaign in May of 2025. This is a two-year contract and it will be important to move as efficiently as possible to achieve maximum ROI for the budget available. It could be that this timeline overemphasizes the process of branding (which can sometimes be a lengthy endeavor) and sacrifices on the timing of other deliverables such as website.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** AVA TopRight

**DATE:** 07/11/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

Fine statement of qualifications. Not specific to this RFP. Example projects seem like good marketing examples, although no stated experience focused on workforce attraction or with hands-on events and recruitment. No state government work. Middlesex County, NJ work likely similar or larger scale to proposed State of Maine work, however.

2. Subcontractors

Subcontractors seem good. Unclear in this document what the relationship is with Violet PR. What would they be doing for this project?

3. Organizational Chart

Chart is satisfactory. Project Team lists 15 of the organization's 20 staff.

4. Litigation

Satisfactory.

5. Financial Viability

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** AVA TopRight

**DATE:** 07/11/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

Did not provide requested report, perhaps due to misunderstanding of request.

6. Certificate of Insurance

Satisfactory.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Documents combined are much longer than requested.
- Interested in their audience segmentation language and how that may differ from approached 5-10 years ago, if at all.
- Interesting and strong audience breakdowns and data. Valuable information. But is it addressing what was asked in the RFP?
- Strong targeted paid advertising language.
- Brand toolkit language is light but relevant.
- We are not seeking a digital economic development portal.
- Website and event language feels generic. I find that less concerning for the website component but more concerning for the event component.
- I appreciate the effort of doing a small survey ahead of time. That is good branding on their part.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- Very thorough breakdown of the process for creating an effective targeted advertising campaign. That is a positive in that I expect it will be a well-researched and grounded campaign, but it does give some concern about the ability to hit deadlines. That said, beginning marketing in earnest before the end of Q1 2025 is acceptable, if they hit their proposed timeline.
- Again, I appreciate the thoughtfulness and level of detail that went into the proposal. It communicates confidence on the branding and targeted advertising side of the proposed services. Experience and ability for other aspects of the RFP is still somewhat less clear.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** AVA TopRight

**DATE:** 07/11/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community  
Development



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Black Travel Maine

**DATE:** 07/15/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

Focused on tourism marketing, which is not the purpose of this RFP. Examples of past work and references are interesting and could be compelling if this was a tourism-focused RFP. Workforce or employee attraction and recruitment is not mentioned anywhere.

2. Subcontractors

Appears work will largely be organized through and performed by subcontractors. Subcontractors do seem to be chosen well and broken out into smart lines of work.

3. Organizational Chart

I appreciate the clear breakdown of tasks by individual. However, the tasks are again skewed towards tourism marketing and not workforce attraction.

4. Litigation

Satisfactory.

5. Financial Viability

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Black Travel Maine

**DATE:** 07/15/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

Satisfactory.

6. Certificate of Insurance

Would need to confirm this is adequate if awarded.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Glad to see clear focus on talent attraction upfront. I also appreciate stating measurable goals at the top. Some of those goals are good, but they may reach further than is possible within the funding and time allotted. And they include tourism-related metrics that don't need to be here. While we do want this campaign to be aligned with the tourism campaign, it does not need to also include tourism components. Additionally, while I like the community-building component, that may be out of scope depending on how it's done.
- Good understanding of the target audiences.
- Much of the Strategies section hits the right notes, although I would be interested to see more detail in terms of "who" and "how" on most items. Who would they involve in the brand creation process, for example?
- Very good Strategic Partnerships and Creating and Attending Events sections. Specific, achievable, and likely to be successful. Reunion events are a particularly good idea.
- The process of the Toolkits section is good, but again misses by focusing on tourism. The tool kits as requested in the RFP would not be for MOT or focused on tourism.
- The challenges, opportunities, and national trends section is astute. They have a good understanding of the basic context we are working within. This sentence nicely captures the need for this RFP: "While Maine is known for its natural beauty and outdoor attractions, there is a need to enhance marketing efforts to promote the state as an attractive place to live and work, especially for diverse and multicultural populations."

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Black Travel Maine

**DATE:** 07/15/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community  
Development

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- Breaking the timeline down by target audiences is somewhat messy and would be a confusing way to track things in practice. A better approach would be to break the overall work of the contract down into specific tasks and list the timeline for those tasks.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Blaze Partners

**DATE:** 07/15/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Big picture, it was smart to join forces between a marketing agency and a workforce attraction nonprofit. They may complement each other well to fully cover the requested services in the RFP.
- Interesting that their media placement is handled in-house. Media buys may be a large component of this contract—would want to ensure they have capacity.
- Strong ties to relevant actors outside of DECD—employers, UMS, other agencies, and nonprofits.
- Interested to know what the current outcomes are of the teacher and healthcare recruitment campaigns.
- Would have been interested to see project examples with other private firms and nonprofits. Boots2Roots is a good example.

2. Subcontractors

Will want to see in the next file exactly what the breakdown will be between work performed by LWM and Blaze. Certainly a good partner pick overall.

3. Organizational Chart

I appreciate the clear statements of what each individual will be doing for the contract.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Blaze Partners

**DATE:** 07/15/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

4. Litigation

Satisfactory.

5. Financial Viability

Satisfactory.

6. Certificate of Insurance

Satisfactory.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- I appreciate the discussion of the goals. They hit on the right points and wisely name the proposed metrics as only preliminary. There would need to be a step between referrals and DOL employment data.
- Decent understanding of opportunities and challenges related to workforce attraction. Interested to see how that manifests in the rest of the proposal.
- Decent geography choice, but that's something we could dig into if awarded. For the purposes of evaluating the proposal, the thoughtfulness behind the selection is a positive.
- Interesting approach to commit to the LWM brand. Being able to double down on an existing recognizable brand is a clear strength of this proposal. That said, I would have appreciated more detail on why the brand is worth committing to, other than the efficiency of doing so. What metrics have demonstrated its success over the years? Is there any room for improvement or adjustment as part of this campaign?
- I agree with the approach of amplifying existing websites, but I would want to ensure there is a clear entry point for various target audiences and that their various use cases are considered.
- Interested what they have in mind for a dashboard tracking results.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Blaze Partners

**DATE:** 07/15/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

- Exceptional breakdown of target audiences and associated media and event components, including dollar values. I may choose a different emphasis than they did, judging by the assigned dollar values, but adjustment is something that could be discussed if awarded. Very good structure and understanding of audiences and tying that understanding to proposed services.
- Interested to know if Boots2Roots would also function as a subcontractor at some point, given stated involvement on pg. 12.
- Good toolkit understanding and proposal.
- Interested how exactly a CRM tool would be integrated into the LWM site.
- “Here for Good” slogan is clever. Would need further discussion before any particular slogan is committed to.
- Good events overview, will want to see specific plan and schedule if awarded.
- Appears to be missing a timeline?

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Broadreach PR

**DATE:** 07/15/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Impressive client list within Maine.
- Would like to have seen at least one example project description of workforce attraction services, since it sounds like they have at least a couple past or current experiences in that field between the partners. I appreciate seeing private-sector experience, but ultimately we are not looking for consumer goods marketing like Subway or Maine Spirits, and I would prefer to hear more about the DHHS workforce campaign or recruitment for Baker Neuman Noyes.

2. Subcontractors

- Sensible subcontractor setup, looks like they will be closely engaged for this contract.
- Overall, it seems the partners are well suited to cover the different aspects included in this RFP.

3. Organizational Chart

- Chart makes sense.
- Does not specifically state what each individual will do for this contract, although it can be inferred from their bios to an extent.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Broadreach PR

**DATE:** 07/15/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

4. Litigation

Satisfactory.

5. Financial Viability

Satisfactory.

6. Certificate of Insurance

Satisfactory.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- The suggested objective ideas are exclusively marketing engagement metrics. While those are fine day-to-day indicators, the objective of this RFP is to attract workers to Maine, and I would like to see proposed metrics along intermediate steps to that goal, as well as that goal itself. These objectives/metrics/KPIs do not need to be fully fleshed out in the proposal, but I would prefer to see some reference to the bigger picture.
- Target audience discussion is acceptable but the list of statistics doesn't ...
- Geography choices are sensible. The paragraph on crossover opportunities may have something to it, but the specific examples do not seem realistic as the basis of marketing for workforce attraction.
- Good specificity to the Strategies section. Overall, the section provides clear, realistic descriptions of the work that will be done. The tool kit section is relatively sparse—that would be a good area to highlight potential partnerships with employers.
- Very good campaign ideas. "Rush hour in Maine" could be very effective on Boston highways and the T.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- Decent language on understanding the current context.
- Objectives by target audience are a mix of good and clear and so-so and vague. They don't seem to fit together or paint a clear picture of an



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Broadreach PR

**DATE:** 07/15/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community  
Development

overall goal or how this proposal will achieve it. For example, "1% of target (750) have participated in engagement survey, in first year, 2% in second" is quite specific. "Increase awareness of Life / Work balance" is not. Others I am not sure exactly what they mean, like "Reach at least 10% of the growth industry sectors with messaging".

- Good strategies by target audience.
- Tactics by target audience not especially helpful since they're largely copied for each one.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Campfire Naretiv

**DATE:** 07/15/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- No apparent event experience. Media placement experience is also somewhat unclear. Not sure if they usually create the collateral and media that others then place/post, or if they do that themselves.
- Good selection of projects relevant to this RFP, although the depth and breadth of overall experience is not entirely clear.
- MaineHealth campaign example is a good one, although it appears the workforce attraction component was only one part of their overall advertising work.

2. Subcontractors

- Perhaps could have included more partners to cover gaps in experience/expertise needed for this RFP. Again, since it is unclear if they handle ad placement and event management themselves, those could have been useful subcontractor relationships.

3. Organizational Chart

- Chart is acceptable. No further explanation of individuals' experience or role for this project. (Brief bios included at the end of File 3.)

4. Litigation

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Campfire Naretiv

**DATE:** 07/15/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

Satisfactory.

5. Financial Viability

Not what was asked for. Can revisit if awarded.

6. Certificate of Insurance

Satisfactory.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- It's true that we do not necessarily want the awarded bidder to spend excessive time on brand research. Preferably, they would be able to build on existing information, as this proposal states. That said, the process of "researching the research" may be more work than is implied here, and it would be helpful to get an indication of the "who" and "how" for going about it.
- Descriptions of creating a brand and campaign are brief but clear.
- The remaining components are lacking detail. How exactly will the targeted ads be used to further this campaign in particular? Any specific ideas for events to attend? Who will go?
- Discussion of target audiences is also thin.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- I appreciate the timeline graphic.
- September 2025 campaign launch is much later than I would prefer. That will only leave about nine months of a two-year contract for the actual advertising, event attendance, recruiting, etc.
- Context question in RFP was not addressed.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Cashman Katz

**DATE:** 07/15/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Strong project examples in Connecticut. No workforce attraction experience mentioned. I appreciate the brief descriptions highlighting purpose and impact, but I would prefer to also get detail on the specific type of work the firm performed. Overall appear to be a well-experienced marketing agency but unclear if they have enough relevant experience for this workforce attraction work specifically.

2. Subcontractors

- None.

3. Organizational Chart

- Chart is satisfactory. Helpful descriptions of what each person will be doing for this project.

4. Litigation

Satisfactory.

5. Financial Viability

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Cashman Katz

**DATE:** 07/15/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

Satisfactory.

6. Certificate of Insurance

Satisfactory.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Good big-picture objectives
- Good understanding of some of the target audiences and how to target them. Not sure why they didn't include transitioning military families. Also, specifically targeting people internationally to move to Maine might be beyond our scope. Noting their ability to cover multiple languages is a positive, however.
- Geography section is not fully on the mark but could be improved if awarded.
- Event component of the RFP not addressed at all.
- "Maine can tout its industries and employers, but shouldn't compete primarily on that front." This is true to an extent, but at the end of the day we are aiming to recruit people to Maine's workforce. We will need a campaign that make people excited to both live and work here.
- Little explanation of specific strategies. More emphasis on the services the firm provides, but the descriptions are more general and could be applied to any RFP.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- Project plan is entirely focused on paid advertising. That is only one component of the RFP. No timeline given.
- Overall, this does not respond to all aspects of the RFP.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Creative Direct Marketing Group

**DATE:** 07/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

Very sparse. Little specific information provided to help evaluate their qualifications for this work.

2. Subcontractors

None.

3. Organizational Chart

Not a chart, sparse descriptions, no explanation of who would do what for this contract.

4. Litigation

Satisfactory.

5. Financial Viability

Not what was requested.

6. Certificate of Insurance

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Creative Direct Marketing Group

**DATE:** 07/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community  
Development

Acceptable, although not in the form requested.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

Does not fully respond to RFP.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

Does not fully respond to RFP.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Development Counsellors International

**DATE:** 07/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Remarkably good qualifications. Specialization and experience doing almost exactly what we are seeking with this RFP. My only negative notes would be:
  - Focus and experience seems to be exclusively marketing-based, which is a significant portion but not the entirety of what we are seeking. Kansas example states that they helped come up with event ideas but implies they did not actually do them.
  - Example projects give outcomes in terms of marketing/website impressions but not data on actual moves to the state/region. Did their work accomplish the fundamental goal they were hired for?
- Example collateral and websites are strong.

2. Subcontractors

None.

3. Organizational Chart

Very clear chart, bios, and statements of what each person will be doing for this contract. Again, only criticism would be no clear experience with or assignment for direct recruitment and events.



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Development Counsellors International

**DATE:** 07/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community  
Development

4. Litigation

Satisfactory.

5. Financial Viability

Satisfactory.

6. Certificate of Insurance

Satisfactory.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Smart research plan to start the contract.
- Less sure what the function and potential outcomes of the internal focus groups would be, but that could be discussed/negotiated if awarded.
- Brand development seems solid if starting from scratch. However, we may want to see what existing work can be built on. This could get time and resource intensive (will compare in work plan).
- Good tool kit plan. However, the regional one pagers may need more hands-on work from the Bidder than proposed—regional partners may or may not have the capacity. It also would be good to leave door open to help employers adapt tool kit to their needs.
- We will not be issuing a separate RFP for video/photo production, and we can't have that gap if those services are needed to complete the advertisements this Bidder would then be placing. I would have preferred to see them include those costs in the proposal at least as an optional portion. Given the phrasing in section 2.H.1 of the RFP, this may be considered as an element not responding to what was requested. Regardless, I am concerned this may have been a way to reduce the overall cost to improve the cost proposal score while technically remaining responsive to the RFP.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Development Counsellors International

**DATE:** 07/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

- Note: will need to account for this exclusion when scoring the cost proposal.
  - I appreciate the intention to create a strategy, although I would expect that to start before all the research. Perhaps that is the intention, but I'm not 100% clear given the organization.
  - Very strong website component—that appears to be the centerpiece of their campaigns.
  - The only proposed targeted advertising is through Google and three social media platforms, leaving open the possibility of adding more based on research. There are more targeted digital advertising avenues than that, including some mentioned as examples in the RFP, which would have been good to see addressed. I agree with the approach of not deciding on the specific avenues and scale of advertising until the brand and market research is complete, but there could perhaps have been additional suggestions here.
  - Okay PR plan, but the only specific associated outcome seems to be 3-4 reporter visits over two years. Maine likely receives more reporter visits for lifestyle/livability coverage than that already. The other bullets may have larger associated outcomes, which would have been good to see articulated.
  - Events plan is somewhat sparse, and seems to reflect that this may not be a usual focus of work for the firm. Creating and running three events over two years is fine (perhaps light), but the bulk of the opportunity in this category will likely be from attending a multitude of existing events.
  - Proposed outcomes reflect more digitally focused and website-centric work. That seems to be the theme of the proposed services overall, which is neither positive nor negative on its own.
2. Implementation – Work Plan

- Good grasp of the context of this work.
- Good breakdown of the target audiences and matchup of objectives and strategies. Again, tactics are largely focused on digital media.
- Solid timeline. Slightly more time dedicated to prep work (studies, research, testing, strategizing, etc.) than may be ideal, but acceptable. Actual marketing period covers about 15 months from launch.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Development Counsellors International

**DATE:** 07/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community  
Development

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Elephant in the Room

**DATE:** 07/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

Well credentialed as a small design firm. Less clear how well they would handle the other aspects of this RFP—ad production, events, etc. Seems they would lean on subcontractors for a lot.

2. Subcontractors

Many subcontractors listed, unclear which would actually be engaged on this contract.

3. Organizational Chart

Chart itself is fine. Doesn't specify who would do what for this contract.

4. Litigation

Satisfactory.

5. Financial Viability

Satisfactory. May request full report if awarded.

6. Certificate of Insurance

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Elephant in the Room

**DATE:** 07/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

Satisfactory.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Services section hits on right themes but is very broad. I am left wanting more detail on "how" and "who".

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- Again, this section is quite sparse.
- Not sure why airfare cost screenshot is included.
- “STEP 2 is a well-crafted onboarding process that will kick us off on the right foot.” What is that process? This is an example of something that would benefit from being described in the proposal instead of taken on faith.
- Fine language on the context, but somewhat lacking a “so what” interpretation of the listed stats.
- The need to attract 7,500 residents each year is a misinterpretation, but an understandable one. The specific numbers can be discussed as part of the strategy if awarded. I appreciate that they are setting a specific goal of number of people attracted.
- Strategy language repeated for some reason.
- Decent media breakdown.
- Timeline is acceptable.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Fuseideas

**DATE:** 07/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Solid experience in each category of work requested in the RFP. Very strong client portfolio.
- Two of the project examples state tangible results: increases in applications, increases in reservations.
- No examples of state workforce attraction work quite like what we are seeking.

2. Subcontractors

- Subcontractor relationship makes sense and seems capable for this work.

3. Organizational Chart

Provided chart is good. Surprising if as many staff members as indicated on the chart would be working on this contract. Does not go into further detail on staff bios or what each one would be doing for this contract.

4. Litigation

Satisfactory.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Fuseideas

**DATE:** 07/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

5. Financial Viability

Misunderstood request for Dunn & Bradstreet report, but that can be discussed if awarded. Provided information is acceptable for review.

6. Certificate of Insurance

Satisfactory.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Given the split-page formatting and size, this document is functionally three times as long as the 25 pages requested in the RFP.
- Leads with very ambitious goal. Perhaps too ambitious, but that can be discussed if awarded. I appreciate the clarity that the ultimate goal is increased net migration (although beyond that, it's migration of people into the workforce).
- Good understanding of target audiences.
- Did not fully address geography component of RFP (although touched on more in the project plan section).
- Good brand and campaign creation plans.
- Strong PR section.
- Event section is a bit of a miss, since it focuses only on events within Maine. While that would be a part of the work, part of it will also be identifying and even creating events outside of Maine to attract graduating students, transitioning military members, potential boomerangs, etc.
- Good understanding of the current context, although I don't understand its placement on page 13.
- Overall, the services section reiterates sense that the firm is well versed in much of the types of work requested in the RFP. However, there may be more work to do to translate that experience to this particular subject

2. Implementation – Work Plan

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Fuseideas

**DATE:** 07/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

- The beginning of this section is interesting and potentially a strong example of how they would approach building insights for how to position the campaign. However, it's not clear to me if pages 25-30 are intended to be an example or actually be the groundwork of the campaign overall. I am less persuaded if it is the latter—attracting remote workers would only address part of our workforce challenge and can only be one of multiple target audiences. And the most likely hook for someone to move to Maine is not necessarily that they visit Maine but that they have friends or family here.
- Good breakdown of strategies by audience—demonstrates a good level of thoughtfulness of how to match positive information with the relevant audience.
- The downside of the target audience sections is the extent to which each audience is separated, which is particularly evident in the timeline. We want one campaign that is consistent and effective across audiences, although each target audience may require different tactics and variations on the overall theme. Tracking campaigns separately for each audience will likely be unwieldy.
- Good preparation timeline, seems able to get marketing into action relatively quickly.



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Golden Shovel Agency

**DATE:** 07/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Little description of project examples.
- I am left wondering what areas they have expertise in and if that fully covers the range of services required for the RFP. It seems marketing and business development might be their main focus?

2. Subcontractors

- 19 Oaks is an implied subcontractor, although that is not explicitly stated.

3. Organizational Chart

Not provided. Select staff listed, but it's only "some" of the assigned team members. No further detail about those listed staff or who else may be involved.

4. Litigation

Not provided.

5. Financial Viability

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Golden Shovel Agency

**DATE:** 07/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

Not provided.

6. Certificate of Insurance

Satisfactory.

Not responsive to the requested components of the RFP up to this point.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Briefly touches on each service requested in the RFP.
- The Economic Gateway and Gatekeeper branded services as presented seem attuned to business attraction services, which is not what we are seeking.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- Limited discussion of current context.
- Much of the content requested in this section is not addressed. Little to no detailed discussion of objectives, strategies, and tactics for different target audiences.
- No discussion of objectives or metrics beyond the overall 75,000 goal.
- No timeline.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Hirons

**DATE:** 07/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Good marketing and design experience.
- Project examples are decent, although none quite like the workforce attraction services we are seeking. Examples do not give ultimate impact metrics.

2. Subcontractors

- Not exactly clear what the relationship is with Sutherland Weston and who will be doing what.
- The TPMA addition is interesting, although this is not a workforce development RFP. Again, wondering who will be doing what.

3. Organizational Chart

Chart provided but there isn't sufficient explanation of who will be working on this contract and exactly what each person will be doing.

4. Litigation

Satisfactory.

5. Financial Viability

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Hiron

**DATE:** 07/17/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

Not the format requested but does address some of the key numbers. Will request full report if awarded.

6. Certificate of Insurance

Satisfactory.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- The “personas” approach is fine as described.
- The select examples of ad ideas are appreciated.
- Overall, while this section touches on each of the requested services from the RFP, the lack of a distinct project plan section, additional target audience discussions, or proposed objectives and metrics leaves much of the proposal somewhat generic.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- The “project plan” content was not distinct and was instead combined with the overall “services to be provided” content. No timeline was provided, and other components of the project plan section were not addressed (current context, strategies for each audience).

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Hoffman York

**DATE:** 07/18/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Appears to have strong experience across most of the services requested in this RFP, perhaps with the exception of direct recruitment events.
- Great project example with the Wisconsin workforce attraction contract, showing good (although not 100%) overlap with the specific services we are requesting. It does seem like the contract is still in relatively early stages so outcomes are not yet known. The goals/KPIs are on point.
- Other two project examples are good and demonstrate general marketing expertise with state initiatives, although not as relevant as the first example.

2. Subcontractors

None.

3. Organizational Chart

Clear chart and bios of individuals who will be assigned to this project. I would appreciate a few words specifying what exactly each individual will be doing for this contract.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Hoffman York

**DATE:** 07/18/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

4. Litigation

Satisfactory.

5. Financial Viability

Satisfactory.

6. Certificate of Insurance

Satisfactory.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Clear overview of the services they provide. Although brief, the descriptions correlate clearly with the requested services.
- They will bid out for certain services like video and photography. Interesting that they do not have a preferred partner for this work that they could name as a subcontractor. Perhaps they would be looking to specifically bid out the work in Maine, and they do not have any existing partners here. May need to confirm how this is reflected in the cost proposal—if a budget for bidding these services was not included, then that would need to be accounted for to accurately score the costs.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- Solid understanding of the current context. One exception is the recommendation that our priority audience be those who traveled to Maine. That is too big of a field and unlikely to be the most useful indicator of whether someone will actually decide to move here. That said, they don't seem to dwell on that point for the remainder of the proposal.
- Great understanding of the competitive challenge. Focus on state ranking publications is a reasonable way to make the argument, although I question how influential those webpages are on where people ultimately move. Regardless, they sum the answer up well:

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Hoffman York

**DATE:** 07/18/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

“Smart targeting coupled with an emotional reason to believe will yield the highest success rate for Maine.”

- Good description of objective-setting process and okay KPI examples.
- I like the ambassador program idea.
- Somewhat lacking detail linking the services they offer with the specific focus of this RFP, the proposed target audiences, and intended outcomes. It seems most of that would be left to the planning and brand creation phase. That is understandable to an extent, but arguably this section does not respond to the request for objectives, strategies, and tactics by target audience as noted in the RFP.
- April 2025 launch may be acceptable but is later than preferred. That would leave 15 months for the campaign to run. Would prefer to see a shorter discovery period.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Moxie Strategies

**DATE:** 07/18/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Seems to have strong experience in marketing and PR as individuals, but not sure as a firm.
- Example projects are not perfectly matched to what we are seeking in this RFP. Seems to be entirely website and social media focused. Also seem to be the individuals' prior work, not as part of the firm.

2. Subcontractors

Subcontractors make sense to fill gaps in provided services.

3. Organizational Chart

- Chart is fine but doesn't describe who will do what for this contract.

4. Litigation

Satisfactory.

5. Financial Viability

Should still be able to receive requested Dun & Bradstreet report as a privately held organization. Will request if awarded.



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Moxie Strategies

**DATE:** 07/18/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

6. Certificate of Insurance

Satisfactory.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- I appreciate the campaign examples as a way to illustrate understanding—“city lights to starry nights” is a fun one. That said, this would be a more helpful demonstration of the quality of proposed services if an example campaign was used in a more thorough discussion of target audience strategies.
- Proposed services hits on most of the requested points, although it lacks specificity in some areas. Perhaps the details of targeted advertising and event planning will be left to subcontractors, but that makes it difficult to evaluate the proposal.
- Tool kits are not addressed.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- Good understanding of current context.
- Geography sentence could use a bit more explanation. Why only New England? The following target audience examples are mostly not based in New England.
- The project plan lacks a discussion of overall objectives or goals, other than the very big-picture goal of adding 75,000 people to the workforce. There is an earlier section noting reporting of marketing metrics, but how will we know if that marketing reach is actually having an impact?
- Good target audience examples showing how certain groups might be reached.
- Good quick but realistic timeline. I appreciate the January 2025 campaign launch.
- Overall, this presents a good framework but somewhat lacks concrete structure for a proposed campaign. The audience examples are nice,

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Moxie Strategies

**DATE:** 07/18/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community  
Development

but how do those examples ladder up to a full campaign? What audiences, geographies, and mediums are prioritized?

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** PeterMayer

**DATE:** 07/18/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Impressive experience and client list as an ad agency. No listed experience with workforce attraction, however, which is not quite the same as the tourism campaigns they reference.
- Strong tourism campaign examples, but those are not a perfect match for what we are seeking. I appreciate the impacts listed with the example.
- Seems to largely be using this document to provide a general response to the proposed services section.

2. Subcontractors

Subcontractor for web development is fine.

3. Organizational Chart

Not provided. No indication of which individuals will work on this contract.

4. Litigation

Not provided.

5. Financial Viability

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** PeterMayer

**DATE:** 07/18/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

Not provided.

6. Certificate of Insurance

Not provided.

Not responsive to the RFP up to this point.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Largely generic description of services. We are not interested in “visitor persona and journey mapping development”, for example. This is not a tourism marketing RFP.
- Touches on each aspect of the requested services.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- Decent understanding of the context.
- Broad description of objective and goals—would prefer to see selection of metrics/goals that ladder up to the overall goal of increasing worker attraction.
- Brief but effective outline of the moving decision process. Very true that something tends to spark a decision to move, and the purpose of this campaign is to get Maine on people’s minds before that spark happens and get it to the top of the list once they’re deciding.
- Not much given for the geography and target audience discussions.
- Interested in their inclusion of the Live + Work in Maine website. Seems to be framed as if they would work on that website specifically?
- Slow timeline. Media campaign not launched until July 2025, website launched September 2025. That’s with assumed January 2025 start date though, so maybe it would move up if started in 2024, which is the plan?
- Overall a sparse proposal.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Red House Communications

**DATE:** 07/18/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Strong experience and client list in marketing and branding. Somewhat less clear if they have strong experience across the requested services, such as PR and events. Seems to be more emphasis on branding and ads.
- Good project examples, including one with some overlap with the workforce attraction marketing services we are seeking. However, the most relevant example, Work Smart Live Happy, doesn't state what the impacts were, and the story is somewhat unclear. Was it replaced by the PA Gets It Done campaign? The descriptions are somewhat sparse. Why did the PA Gets It Done campaign drop the workforce attraction aspect?

2. Subcontractors

Good subcontractor inclusions. Nice to see a specific firm focused on veteran recruitment included.

3. Organizational Chart

Chart is acceptable. No further indication of which individuals will be doing what exactly or their bios.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Red House Communications

**DATE:** 07/18/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

4. Litigation

Satisfactory.

5. Financial Viability

Satisfactory.

6. Certificate of Insurance

Satisfactory.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Good framing upfront.
- Very good matching of themes with target audiences. However, it doesn't address specific marketing/outreach tactics for the audiences.
- Not exactly clear what they mean in the direct-response and behavioral campaigns. Why would we be targeting specific executive groups at specific companies? What's the connection with home shopping behavior? These sections didn't necessarily need to be included but could have used more explanation since they were.
- Events only mentioned in passing. No discussion of or plan for these services.
- Tool kits not mentioned at all.
- The services that are included in this proposal are convincing, but it does not address all of the strategies requested in the RFP.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- Separate project plan section not provided. Woven into discussion of proposed services.
- Timeline is okay. April 2025 launch is acceptable, although earlier would be ideal.
- Missing deeper objectives/metrics explanation. States that there will be good measurement and reporting but doesn't propose what they might

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Red House Communications

**DATE:** 07/18/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community  
Development

be. What are the intermediate steps to know the campaign is having impact?

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Results Marketing & Design

**DATE:** 07/18/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Good client list; variety of public and private organizations.
- Solid branding and marketing experience. Less clear if they have event and direct recruitment experience, or if that was handled by others in the couple of instances where its mentioned.
- Good project examples, although only two are workforce related. Only one includes impact metrics (i.e. not marketing stats but ultimate results), but those results are positive.

2. Subcontractors

Subcontractors make sense and seem to cover gaps well.

3. Organizational Chart

Chart is acceptable. Employee descriptions are helpful; possible to infer who will do what for this contract based on those descriptions.

4. Litigation

Satisfactory.

5. Financial Viability



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Results Marketing & Design

**DATE:** 07/18/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

Satisfactory.

6. Certificate of Insurance

Satisfactory.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Good understanding of the context.
- Video example is very well done given that it's a sample, presumably produced on a short turnaround. Likely not something we'd use exactly, but demonstrates good grasp of what we are looking for.
- Overall objectives are pretty good. Overall strategies are very good, although perhaps too many for each to be a topline "strategy". Many phrases in this section demonstrate great understanding of what we are looking for and add good ideas. This gets a lot right: "We will launch the campaign at the end of December/beginning of January when the target audiences will likely be taking stock of their life and career and making long-term plans for the new year and beyond. We will tap into their emotional connections with Maine, including family, friends, childhood and summer camp experiences, and vacation memories." A pre-holiday launch is very desirable if possible to tap into that holiday travel.
- This gets the audience approach right: "Instead of creating six separate campaigns and diluting our media budget by running them concurrently, we will establish a universal message serving our consistent creative foundation. We will then amplify messaging to specific audience segments using targeted tactics."
- Overall strong target audience discussion. Not all of the specific messaging bullets get it right, in my opinion, but that could be ironed out if awarded. Tactics are good but didn't need to be fully copied and pasted for each one, given that most are the same. Events and tool kits are missing.
- I would have appreciated an attempt at proposing metrics/goals for the campaign. What results can we expect to see? Certainly those will

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Results Marketing & Design

**DATE:** 07/18/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

need to be established in conversation with DECD, but a first pass would help demonstrate Bidder's ideal impact of the proposed services.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- Exceptionally detailed and clear project plan. Leaves little room for doubt that they would be able to execute the proposed services.
- Events section is okay, but the way it's phrased, I'm not sure if they mean they will be recommending events for DECD or someone else to attend, presumably using materials they create. We are seeking that work to be performed as part of the contract, including attending and in some cases creating events.
- Tool kit component is largely absent from the proposal. It's referenced as something that will be available for employers on the website, but it's absence in an otherwise very detailed plan has me concerned that it may not received the intended level of attention. It will require some amount of hands-on work with employers.
- Clear, detailed timeline.
- Overall, this is a very compelling proposal for marketing services: branding, creative content, ad creation and placement, and web design. However, that is not the only focus of this RFP. While this appears to be a very capable firm, I am concerned the more hands-on components of the requested services—including working with employers and creating and attending events to recruit individuals—may not be given due attention.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Rigaud Global Company

**DATE:** 07/18/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Good experience as a marketing firm.
- Project examples are interesting, although none overlap with the type of campaign we are looking for. Metric examples are focused on marketing impressions and don't discuss ultimate impacts.

2. Subcontractors

None.

3. Organizational Chart

Only three individuals listed. Would want to see more extensive bios given the small size of the team assigned to this project. Not sure how they would be able to perform all of the requested services with that small of a team and no subcontractors. None of the three mention web development experience, for example.

4. Litigation

Satisfactory.

5. Financial Viability

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Rigaud Global Company

**DATE:** 07/18/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

Not the format requested, can request full report if needed.

6. Certificate of Insurance

Satisfactory.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Touches on all the requested services.
- Objectives/KPI discussion could use more detail. Includes actual impacts in addition to marketing metrics, which is appreciated, but I wonder how exactly they will directly measure conversion rates and migration—and who will do it.
- The proposal would benefit from more detail in general—more explanation of the “how” and some examples. Any specific hiring events that would be worth attending? Where? How will they be identified?
- Target geographies don’t seem to be addressed.
- RGC Workforce Boost section may be a misunderstanding of this RFP. Not in scope. Seems out of place with the rest of the proposal.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- Okay understanding of current context.
- Decent example target audience objectives and strategies. Tactics may be overly specific, especially since there isn’t an associated discussion of overall campaign structure that these tactics would fit into.
- Timeline could use a bit more clarity on order and length of each task.
- Risk mitigation section is an interesting addition.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Rinck Advertising

**DATE:** 07/18/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Good marketing experience and noted clients. Seems to have some event experience as well, although largely/exclusively consumer goods and marketing focused, not direct workforce recruitment like we are seeking.
- I appreciated that they lead the project examples with the desired impacts and note results in each case. No examples that are exactly like what is being requested in this RFP.
- Curious why the USM campaign was only one year.

2. Subcontractors

Listed subcontractors make sense. Notes that they will bid out video/photo production services.

3. Organizational Chart

Chart is okay. Detailed descriptions of staff bios and clear list of who will be assigned to this project.

4. Litigation

Satisfactory.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Rinck Advertising

**DATE:** 07/18/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

5. Financial Viability

Satisfactory.

6. Certificate of Insurance

Satisfactory.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Proposal over twice as long as requested.
- Not seeing objectives focused on impacts—how many recruited employees and moves to Maine.
- Fine descriptions of all the requested services. Would prefer to see a bit more “showing” than “telling”, but they do touch on each requested service.
  - Events section unclear if they will actually lead and attend events or only help plan them and create materials. Later on, it sounds like they do hire “Brand Touch” staff to be physically present, although the needs for a workforce recruitment event may be different than the consumer brand experience they describe.
- Overall, a decent description of proposed services but one that largely could be applied to any RFP. This section may have been better spent providing more concrete examples relevant to this RFP or shortening it to devote space to the project plan within the length requested.
- Not sure what distinguishes their Dynamic Integration approach, which they reference frequently, from a regular brand approach and marketing campaign.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- Pretty good understanding of context. Leans a bit too much on listing facts and stats, where I’d prefer a clearer picture on what they make of the situation and how that translates to this campaign. They lead with

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** Rinck Advertising

**DATE:** 07/18/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

an interesting premise: that focusing on quality of life is a trap. But what do we focus on instead?

- Email database is an interesting addition.
- Objectives miss intermediate steps between marketing impressions and broad goal of 75,000 workers by 2030. Our interest at the end of the day is getting people to move to Maine and work here, and whoever is awarded this contract needs to connect to that directly as an objective.
- Survey example is a good display of how they would research audiences, presumably done quickly. Would want to dig much more into how they would approach this research when building the brand if awarded. In reality, we haven't seen a ton of people moving here from Georgia and Ohio, for example, which are listed as examples of places where people indicated they were thinking about moving to Maine.
- Very interesting breakout of target groups by "close-in", "curious", and "concerned". Their descriptions don't necessarily get everything right, but it is an intuitive way to break out certain audiences. Unfortunately, they don't seem fully committed to it as a framework, since they follow up with a few other audiences that would receive separate targeting.
- "Call of Maine" idea for ads could be a fun one.
- "Maine character" idea is good as well.
- Website prototype displays good initiative and understanding.
- Extremely detailed target audience discussion. Very good grasp of each target audience, what may sway them, and what tactics may best reach them. Little that is simply copied and pasted from one to the other; each one clearly thought out. There may be details here and there that I may quibble with, but good overall.
- Detailed timeline. Appears to aim for Dec/Jan campaign launch, which is good.
- Strong proposal on the details. Somewhat less strong on how those details fit together—what impact could we hope this will have on workers moving to Maine, and how will the various audiences fit together?

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** WeUsThem

**DATE:** 07/19/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Good marketing experience and client list. No mention of events or workforce attraction experience.
- Project examples are interesting but not fully relevant to what is being requested in this RFP. I appreciate that they list impacts and results for the first one, although those are more focused on marketing impressions for the others.

2. Subcontractors

Subcontractor options make sense.

3. Organizational Chart

Chart is very nice visually, although it would be better to include people's names. List of key employees is good, but it is somewhat unclear if those are all of the individuals who will be working on this project.

4. Litigation

Satisfactory.

5. Financial Viability



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202402023

**RFP TITLE:** Workforce Attraction Marketing Services

**BIDDER NAME:** WeUsThem

**DATE:** 07/19/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Phoenix McLaughlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Maine Department of Economic & Community Development

Satisfactory.

6. Certificate of Insurance

Satisfactory.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- General descriptions of services that could be applied to any RFP. Events and tool kits not described at all.
- States that subcontractors won't be used unless we desire photo and video work, which the RFP states that we do.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- Okay understanding of context of the RFP.
- Target audience and geography components of RFP are functionally not addressed at all. Those are crucial components to demonstrate understanding and capacity to deliver requested services.
- Timeline is acceptable but does not clarify order or length of different tasks. May 2025 launch is later than preferred.
- Overall, the proposal is not very responsive to the specifics of this RFP.



**STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC AND  
COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT**

Janet T. Mills  
Governor

Heather Johnson  
Commissioner

**AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT**  
**RFP #: 202402023**  
**RFP TITLE: Workforce Attraction Marketing Services**

I, Phoenix McLaughlin, accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Economic and Community Development. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

**I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.**

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Phoenix McLaughlin'.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Signature

7/19/24  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Date



STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC AND  
COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

Janet T. Mills  
Governor

Heather Johnson  
Commissioner

**AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT**  
**RFP #: 202402023**  
**RFP TITLE: Workforce Attraction Marketing Services**

I, Logan D Ryan \_\_\_\_\_  
accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Economic and Community Development. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

**I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.**

*Logan D Ryan*  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Signature

7/19/24  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Date



**STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC AND  
COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT**

**Janet T. Mills  
Governor**

**Heather Johnson  
Commissioner**

**AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT  
RFP #: 202402023  
RFP TITLE: Workforce Attraction Marketing Services**

I, Victoria Foley accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Economic and Community Development. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

**I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.**

Victoria Foley  
Signature

07/10/2024  
Date