### State of Maine Master Score Sheet

RFP# 202401012					
	Large Boiler Cleaning and Service				
	Bidder Name:	Blake Thermal	Thayer LLC		
P	roposed Cost:	Unknown	\$34,669		
Scoring Sections	Points Available				
Section I: Preliminary Information	Pass/Fail	Fail	Pass		
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	40		38		
Section III: Proposed Services	25		10		
Section IV: Cost Proposal	35		35		
TOTAL	<u>100</u>		<u>83</u>		

### Award Justification Statement RFP# 202401012 - Large Boiler Cleaning and Service

#### I. Summary

The Department is seeking to engage a service provider for comprehensive annual cleaning and preventive maintenance for six Viessmann Boilers Model CA3B 6.0 located at the Maine Correctional Center in Windham, Maine. This includes a mandatory 24/7/365 on-call service with a guaranteed two-hour response time. The service provider is expected to adhere strictly to the manufacturer's specifications for maintenance, which encompasses cleaning and inspecting various components such as heat exchangers, burners, and vents, among others. Replacement of critical parts such as oil filters, pump strainers, and nozzles is also part of the requirement, along with performing a complete combustion analysis and providing a detailed report of the findings within a week of testing. Additionally, the contractor must manage the removal and disposal of all replaced parts and waste, ensuring a clean site post-maintenance.

#### II. Evaluation Process

The evaluation process for proposals submitted in response to this RFP were conducted by a well qualified evaluation team, using a consensus-based approach. This method emphasizes collective decision-making, wherein all members of the evaluation team discuss and agree on the allocation of points for each section of the proposals, rather than scoring these sections on an individual basis.

The evaluation team comprises three key members, each bringing a distinct set of skills and experience relevant to the project at hand. Scott Goulette serves as the Department's contract and procurement manager, bringing over two decades of specialized experience in contract administration. Sally Russillo, the Deputy Director of the Corrections Service Center, offers in-depth knowledge of public finance, making her exceptionally qualified to evaluate the financial aspects of the proposals, including budgeting and cost-effectiveness. Lastly, William Sinclair, a Plant Maintenance Engineer with more than fifteen years of experience working with the specific types of boilers in question, will contribute technical expertise to the evaluation. His practical experience with these boilers provides him with the unique ability to judge the technical merits and feasibility of the proposed maintenance solutions. Furthermore, William's role as the primary point of contact with the selected vendor post-award underscores the importance of his technical assessment in the evaluation process. Collectively, the team's diverse expertise ensures a thorough and fair evaluation of proposals, focusing on both the technical and administrative competencies of the bidders.

### III. Qualifications & Experience (Thayer LLC) Organization's Depth of Experience

- Over 42 years of experience in boiler cleaning and maintenance.
- Possession of a large, technically equipped staff with thirty-five technicians, enhancing their capability to respond promptly to emergency service requests.

#### **Licensure and Certification**

- Comprehensive documentation of staff licensure, ensuring all technicians meet the necessary professional standards for boiler maintenance.
- Staff licenses encompass a broad range of expertise, including Maine Oil and Solid Fuel, Natural Gas and Propane, Electrical, and Plumbing, which aligns with the project's specific requirements.
- Verification of staff licenses with the State of Maine website confirms their current standing and relevance.

#### Independence in Project Execution

 Non-reliance on subcontractors, indicating Thayer LLC's capability to manage and deliver the project with their in-house resources, which could lead to more streamlined communication and project management.

#### IV. Proposed Services

 Indicated they are capable of performing regular maintenance on these types of boilers.

#### V. Cost Proposal

Thayer LLC had the lowest cost proposal totaling 34,669.00 over five years.

#### VI. Conclusion

Thayer LLC has been selected as the service provider for RFP# 202401012 for the comprehensive annual cleaning and preventive maintenance of six Viessmann Boilers Model CA3B 6.0 at the Maine Correctional Center in Windham, Maine. This decision is based on Thayer LLC's extensive experience and technical capability, strong licensure and certification credentials, the operational independence demonstrated by their inhouse resource capacity, and a competitive cost proposal that offers the best value for the Department.

### STATE OF MAINE DEPARTMENT OF CORRECTIONS



RANDALL LIBERTY
Commissioner

April 8, 2024

Lindsey Foster 1400 Hotel Road Auburn, ME 04210

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202401012,

Large Boiler Cleaning and Service

Dear Lindsey Foster,

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Corrections for Large Boiler Cleaning and Service. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

· Thayer, LLC

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

Page 1 of 3 rev. 3/5/2018

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Conner McFarland RFP Coordinator

**Department of Corrections** 

Compald.

Page 2 of 3 rev. 3/5/2018

#### STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).

Page 3 of 3 rev. 3/5/2018

#### STATE OF MAINE DEPARTMENT OF CORRECTIONS



Governor

**RANDALL LIBERTY** Commissioner

April 8, 2024

Gary Sholler Blake Thermal Sales and Service 70 Ingersol Rd. Unit 2 Portland, Maine 04103

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202401012,

Large Boiler Cleaning and Service

Dear Gary Sholler,

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Corrections for Large Boiler Cleaning and Service. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

Thayer, LLC

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

Page 1 of 3 rev. 3/5/2018 This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Conner McFarland RFP Coordinator

**Department of Corrections** 

Confald.

Page 2 of 3 rev. 3/5/2018

#### STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).

Page 3 of 3 rev. 3/5/2018

**RFP #:** 202401012

RFP TITLE: Large Boiler Cleaning and Service

**BIDDER:** Blake Thermal **DATE:** April 1, 2024

#### **SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** Corrections

Name of RFP Coordinator: Conner McFarland

Names of Evaluators: Scott Goulette, Sally Russillo, William Sinclair

Pass/Fail Criteria	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)		
Licensure		Х
•		
•		
Scoring Sections	Points Availabl e	Points Awarde d
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	40	
Section III. Proposed Services	25	
Section IV. Cost Proposal	35	
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	XX

**RFP #:** 202401012

RFP TITLE: Large Boiler Cleaning and Service

**BIDDER:** Blake Thermal **DATE:** April 1, 2024

#### OVERVIEW OF SECTION I Preliminary Information

Section I. Preliminary Information

#### **Evaluation Team Comments:**

The RFP document requires that companies "Bidder must have qualified technicians with active appropriate licenses, such as a Master Oil Burner to perform service in order to submit bids in response to this Request for Proposals." and that "Bidders must provide documentation to demonstrate meeting eligibility requirements."

Blake Thermal did not provide the required information to demonstrate meeting the eligibility requirements outlined in the RFP, and is therefore disqualified from award consideration.

**RFP #:** 202401012

RFP TITLE: Large Boiler Cleaning and Service

**BIDDER:** Blake Thermal **DATE:** April 1, 2024

### **EVALUATION OF SECTION II Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	Points Availabl e	Points Awarde d
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience		

### **Evaluation Team Comments**:

### EVALUATION OF SECTION III Proposed Services

	Points Availabl e	Points Awarde d
Section III. Proposed Services		

### **Evaluation Team Comments**:

### **EVALUATION OF SECTION IV Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	د	Cost Proposal Being Scored	х	Score Weight	=	Score
\$34,669	5		x	35 points	=	

**RFP #:** 202401012

RFP TITLE: Large Boiler Cleaning and Service

**BIDDER:** Thayer LLC **DATE:** April 1, 2024

#### **SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** Corrections

Name of RFP Coordinator: Conner McFarland

Names of Evaluators: Scott Goulette, Sally Russillo, William Sinclair

Pass/Fail Criteria	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)		
Licensure	Х	
Scoring Sections	Points Availabl e	Points Awarde d
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	40	38
Section III. Proposed Services	25	10
Section IV. Cost Proposal	35	35
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>83</u>

**RFP #:** 202401012

RFP TITLE: Large Boiler Cleaning and Service

**BIDDER:** Thayer LLC **DATE:** April 1, 2024

### OVERVIEW OF SECTION I Preliminary Information

Section I. Preliminary Information

### **Evaluation Team Comments:**

1. Provided a list of technicians and their applicable State of Maine licenses and certifications.

**RFP #:** 202401012

RFP TITLE: Large Boiler Cleaning and Service

**BIDDER:** Thayer LLC **DATE:** April 1, 2024

### EVALUATION OF SECTION II Organization Qualifications and Experience

	Points Availabl e	Points Awarde
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	40	38

#### **Evaluation Team Comments**:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
  - A. Overview of Organization
    - Over 42 years of boiler cleaning and maintenance experience.
    - Thirty-five technicians on staff, indicating a higher likelihood of responding to emergency calls.
  - B. Similar Projects
    - Provided information on three projects, but descriptions did not provide details about the type of work they were performing.
  - C. Subcontractors
    - They do not use subcontractors.
  - D. Litigation
    - No current litigation
  - E. Licensure/Certification
    - Provided a full list of staff with their applicable licenses
    - Licensed staff includes Maine Oil and Solid Fuel, Natural Gas and Propane, Electrical, and Plumbing. Licenses matched what was on the State of Maine website.
  - F. Certificate of Insurance
    - Provided certificate of insurance
    - Insurance amounts are adequate for the project.

RFP #: 202401012

RFP TITLE: Large Boiler Cleaning and Service

**BIDDER:** Thayer LLC **DATE:** April 1, 2024

### EVALUATION OF SECTION III Proposed Services

	Points Availabl e	Points Awarde d
Section III. Proposed Services	25	10

### **Evaluation Team Comments**:

- I. Proposed Services
  - A. Services to be Provided
    - No discussion provided, except that they will provide services as described in the RFP.
    - It's not clear if the vendor has a clear understanding of the requested services.

**RFP #:** 202401012

RFP TITLE: Large Boiler Cleaning and Service

**BIDDER:** Thayer LLC **DATE:** April 1, 2024

### **EVALUATION OF SECTION IV Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	5	Cost Proposal Being Scored	Х	Score Weight	=	Score
\$34,669.00	5	34,669.00	x	35 points	II	35

### **Evaluation Team Comments:**

• Vendor had the lowest cost proposal.

RFP #: 20241012

RFP TITLE: Large Boiler Cleaning and Service

**BIDDER NAME: THAYER LLC** 

DATE: 3/22/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME: SALLY RUSSILLO** 

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DAFS, CORRECTIONS SERVICE CENTER** 

#### **Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
  - 1. Overview of Organization
    - 42 YEARS IN BUSINESS
    - 35 FULL TIME TECHS
    - •
  - 2. Subcontractors
    - NONE USED
    - •
    - •
  - 3. Litigation
    - NO INFORMATION
    - •
    - •
  - 4. Licensure/Certification
    - LIST OF VARIOUS LICENSE NUMBERS ATTACHED NO CERTIFICATES
    - •
    - •
  - 5. Certificate of Insurance
    - 1,000,000 G.L., 5,000,000 UMBRELLA
    - •

RFP #: 20241012

RFP TITLE: Large Boiler Cleaning and Service

**BIDDER NAME: THAYER LLC** 

DATE: 3/2/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME: SALLY RUSSILLO** 

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DAFS, CORRECTIONS SERVICE CENTER** 

SEVERAL TYPOS – IN PROJECT LISTING, PROJECT 2 & 3 HAVE SAME

**DESCRIPTION** 

- II. Proposed Services
  - 1. Services to be Provided
    - ONE SENTENCE DESCRIPTION DOESN'T ALLOW FOR MUCH UNDERSTANDING OF SCOPE

•

•

RFP #: 20241012

RFP TITLE: Large Boiler Cleaning and Service

**BIDDER NAME:** Thayer, LLC

**DATE: March 29, 2024** 

**EVALUATOR NAME: Scott Goulette** 

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Corrections** 

\*

Instructions: The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.

#### **Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

- 1. Overview of Organization
  - In business for 42 years
  - 35 full-time service techs; no part time employees
  - No subs
  - No litigation reported (no mention)
- 2. Location/Licensure/Certification
  - Located in Auburn, ME
  - List of licensees provided; includes state and license #
  - Certificate of Insurance provided; good through 10/1/2024

Appendix C (3 similar projects)

- 1. Maine DOT Aroostook County currently; other locations in the past
- 2. Windham School District Over 5 years on refrigeration, HVAC and boiler equipment
- 3. Brunswick Schools used same description as #2 (Windham), forgot to update

#### II. Proposed Services

 No discussion provided; only that they will provide annual maintenance tasks on the 6 Visseman boilers

RFP#: 20241012

**RFP TITLE**: Large Boiler Cleaning and Service **BIDDER NAME**: Lindsey Foster (Thayer LLC)

DATE: 4/1/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME: William Sinclair** 

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Corrections

<u>Instructions:</u> The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by <u>individual</u> evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is <u>required</u> that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.

#### **Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**Directions:** Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
  - 1. Overview of Organization
    - 42 yrs. Exp. In the boiler cleaning services field
    - 35 full time service technicians
  - 2. Subcontractors
    - None used
  - 3. Litigation
    - No current litigation listed on Appendix B of Proposal Cover page
  - 4. Licensure/Certification
    - List of names broken down by license certification and state
    - Propane/Natural Gas Certs
    - Maine Oil/Solid Fuel Cert
    - Electrical Certs
  - 5. Certificate of Insurance
    - Sufficient coverages listed

RFP #: 20241012

**RFP TITLE:** Large Boiler Cleaning and Service **BIDDER NAME:** Lindsey Foster (Thayer LLC)

DATE: 4/1/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME: William Sinclair** 

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Corrections

- II. Proposed Services
  - 1. Services to be Provided
    - Perform annual maintenance on 6 Viessmann boilers listed in bid

# Janet T. Mills Governor

#### STATE OF MAINE **DEPARTMENT OF CORRECTIONS**

Randall Liberty Commissioner

### AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT RFP #: 202401012

RFP TITLE: Large	Boiler Cleaning and Service
Conner McFarland	accept the
Maine Department of Corrections. I do he	for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of the
indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I limited to: current or former ownership in to membership; current or former employme contractual relationship with the bidder (exceptationship to a bidder's official which contracts the bidder is a bidder's official which contracts the bidder is a bidder in the bidder in the bidder in the bidder is a bidder in the bidder	e family have a personal or financial interest, direct owill be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not the bidder's company; current or former Board at with the bidder; current or former personal cample: paid consultant); and/or current or former all reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of received by the public as a potential conflict of interests.
I have not advised, consulted with or assisubmitted in response to this RFP nor have endorsement.	sted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal re I submitted a letter of support or similar
without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I are no circumstances that would reasonal	n process is to be conducted in an impartial manner nereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there bly support a good faith charge of bias. I further charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide cipation in the evaluation process.
	on related to the contents of Requests for process until such time as the Department otices for public distribution.
DocuSigned by:  Connet McFalland  FD522942914A4F8	3/21/2024
Signature	Date



DocuSigned by:

### STATE OF MAINE DEPARTMENT OF CORRECTIONS

Randall Liberty Commissioner

## AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT RFP #: 202401012 RFP TITLE: Large Boiler Cleaning and Service

Scott Goulette accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Corrections. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP. Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest). I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement. I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process. I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department

Sult Gowlette 3/22/2024

Signature Date

formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.



Signature

### STATE OF MAINE DEPARTMENT OF CORRECTIONS

Randall Liberty Commissioner

#### AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT RFP #: 202401012 RFP TITLE: Large Boiler Cleaning and Service

1X11 111 EE	Large Boner Oleaning and Oct vide
Sally Russillo I.	accept the
offer to become a member of the F Maine Department of Corrections.	Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND elationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has
indirect, in the bidders whose prop limited to: current or former owners membership; current or former em contractual relationship with the bi- relationship to a bidder's official wh	nmediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or osals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not ship in the bidder's company; current or former Board ployment with the bidder; current or former personal dder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former nich could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of by be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest)
	or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar
without bias or prejudice. In this re are no circumstances that would re understand that in the event a goo	raluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner gard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there easonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further d faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide om participation in the evaluation process.
Proposals presented during the	formation related to the contents of Requests for review process until such time as the Department ision notices for public distribution.
DocuSigned by:	
Sally Russillo	3/22/2024

**Date** 



#### STATE OF MAINE **DEPARTMENT OF CORRECTIONS**

Randall Liberty Commissioner

### AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT RFP #: 202401012

RFP TITLE: Large	Boiler Cleaning and Service
William Sinclair	accept the
Maine Department of Corrections. I do here	or Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of by accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND p I may have in connection with a bidder who has
indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I w limited to: current or former ownership in the membership; current or former employment contractual relationship with the bidder (exa relationship to a bidder's official which could	family have a personal or financial interest, direct or ill be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not e bidder's company; current or former Board t with the bidder; current or former personal ample: paid consultant); and/or current or former d reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of ceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest
I have not advised, consulted with or assiste submitted in response to this RFP nor have endorsement.	ed any bidder in the preparation of any proposal I submitted a letter of support or similar
without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I he are no circumstances that would reasonably	process is to be conducted in an impartial manner ereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there y support a good faith charge of bias. I further large of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide ipation in the evaluation process.
	on related to the contents of Requests for brocess until such time as the Department tices for public distribution.
Docusigned by: William Sindair	3/29/2024
Signature	Date