

State of Maine
Master Score Sheet

RFP# 202103043 – ENGINEERING SECTION

Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services

Bidder Name:		Watershed Resource Consultants, LLC	Biodiversity Research Institute (BRI)	Crede Associates, LLC	
Proposed Cost:		Rate sheet provided	Rate sheet provided	Rate sheet provided	
Scoring Sections	Points Available				
Section I: Preliminary Information	N/A				
Section I: Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	0	0	0	
Section II: Proposed Services	25	0	0	0	
Section III: Cost Proposal	25	25	20	15	
TOTAL	100	25*	20*	15*	
Bidder Name:					
Proposed Cost:					
Scoring Sections	Points Available				
Section I: Preliminary Information	N/A				
Section I: Organization Qualifications and Experience	50				
Section II: Proposed Services	25				
Section III: Cost Proposal	25				
TOTAL	100				

State of Maine
Master Score Sheet

RFP# 202103043 – SOIL SERVICES

Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services

Bidder Name:		Watershed Resource Consultants, LLC	Biodiversity Research Institute (BRI)	Crede Associates, LLC	
Proposed Cost:		Rate sheet provided	Rate sheet provided	Rate sheet provided	
Scoring Sections	Points Available				
Section I: Preliminary Information	N/A				
Section I: Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	50	0	0	
Section II: Proposed Services	25	20	0	0	
Section III: Cost Proposal	25	25	20	15	
TOTAL	<u>100</u>	<u>95</u>	<u>20*</u>	<u>15*</u>	
Bidder Name:					
Proposed Cost:					
Scoring Sections	Points Available				
Section I: Preliminary Information	N/A				
Section I: Organization Qualifications and Experience	50				
Section II: Proposed Services	25				
Section III: Cost Proposal	25				
TOTAL	<u>100</u>				

State of Maine
Master Score Sheet

RFP# 202103043 – WETLAND SERVICES

Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services

Bidder Name:		Watershed Resource Consultants, LLC	Biodiversity Research Institute (BRI)	Creder Associates, LLC	
Proposed Cost:		Rate sheet provided	Rate sheet provided	Rate sheet provided	
Scoring Sections	Points Available				
Section I: Preliminary Information	N/A				
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	50	45	40	
Section III: Proposed Services	25	20	10	15	
Section IV: Cost Proposal	25	25	20	15	
TOTAL	<u>100</u>	<u>95</u>	<u>75</u>	<u>70</u>	
Bidder Name:					
Proposed Cost:					
Scoring Sections	Points Available				
Section I: Preliminary Information	N/A				
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	50				
Section III: Proposed Services	25				
Section IV: Cost Proposal	25				
TOTAL	<u>100</u>				

State of Maine
Master Score Sheet

RFP# 202103043 – WILDLIFE SERVICES

Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services

Bidder Name:		Watershed Resource Consultants, LLC	Biodiversity Research Institute (BRI)	Crede Associates, LLC	
Proposed Cost:		Rate sheet provided	Rate sheet provided	Rate sheet provided	
Scoring Sections	Points Available				
Section I: Preliminary Information	N/A				
Section I: Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	10	45	40	
Section II: Proposed Services	25	10	10	15	
Section III: Cost Proposal	25	25	20	15	
TOTAL	<u>100</u>	<u>45*</u>	<u>75</u>	<u>70</u>	
Bidder Name:					
Proposed Cost:					
Scoring Sections	Points Available				
Section I: Preliminary Information	N/A				
Section I: Organization Qualifications and Experience	50				
Section II: Proposed Services	25				
Section III: Cost Proposal	25				
TOTAL	<u>100</u>				

Award Justification Statement
RFP# 202103043
Pre-Qualified Vendor List for
Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services

I. Summary

The Department of Environmental Protection (Department) and the Land Use Planning Commission (LUPC) sought proposals in an annual enrollment process to expand the Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services in the areas of wetland delineation and functional assessment, wildlife habitat identification and assessment, soil mapping and suitability assessment, and professional engineering services including erosion control plan review and assessment and stormwater management plan review and assessment.

II. Evaluation Process

A team, consisting of two LUPC staff and one DEP staff, evaluated the proposals as outlined in Part V of the RFP, including use of a consensus approach to evaluate the bidders' organization qualifications and experience, proposed services, and proposed costs. The team met in one Microsoft Teams video call to discuss the proposals. After discussion and development of the team evaluation notes, the team scored each bidder together for each discipline the bidder was seeking pre-qualification and reached consensus on each score. The LUPC staff included the LUPC Executive Director, Stacie Beyer; the LUPC Planning Manager, Ben Godsoe, and DEP Licensing and Compliance Manager, Dawn Hallowell. Each of these staff brought expertise in applicable agency statutes and rules, agency consulting service needs, third-party peer review services, and the requirements of the RFP.

III. Qualifications & Experience

This award is for a pre-qualified vendor list. Therefore, multiple bidders have been selected. Some of the key factors that resulted in the awarded bidders being scored higher in this section included:

- Demonstrated experience in conducting third-party reviews
- Level of relevant work experience in Maine
- Level of relevant work experience in the LUPC's service area
- For disciplines where specific Maine licenses or certifications are required, demonstrated evidence that the bidder has at least one person holding the license or certification on staff
- Evidence of staff with advanced certifications or training in relevant disciplines

IV. Proposed Services

Some of the key factors that resulted in the awarded bidders being scored higher in this section included:

- Proposed services that recognized the work would include third-party reviews
- Proposed services that included descriptions of methods and resources that went beyond the scope of services provided in the RFP
- Reasonable level of detail in how level of services would be provided, specifically details on the bidder's approach to third-party reviews
- Use of methodologies well supported in the industry for each discipline, and an established QA/QC process

V. Cost Proposal

This award is for a pre-qualified vendor list. Therefore, multiple bidders have been selected. Although the cost of the proposal is reviewed, cost is a bigger factor in review of mini-bids submitted pursuant to the RFP. The key factor that resulted in the awarded bidders being scored higher in this section included: rate sheets that seemed reasonable and in line with other consulting firms reviewed in the past

VI. Conclusion

Since this is an award for a pre-qualified vendor list, multiple bidders could be and were selected. It is important to the credibility of a third-party review, for both the Department and LUPC to have well-qualified, knowledgeable consultants providing the service. It is also important to make sure the costs borne by the State will be reasonable. All bidders were reviewed and scored separately for each of the disciplines they were seeking pre-qualification. The Evaluation Team, consistent with past practice, felt that any bidder with an overall score of 50 points or less in a discipline, did not demonstrate sufficient qualifications and experience, and/or methodologies to meet the agency's needs and were not awarded a bid. Each bidder was awarded bids for two disciplines.



**STATE OF MAINE
AGRICULTURE, CONSERVATION AND
FORESTRY, AND ENVIRONMENTAL
PROTECTION**

**Amanda E. Beal &
Melanie Loyzim
Commissioners**

**Janet T. Mills
Governor**

May 31, 2023

Biodiversity Research Institute (BRI)
Attn. David Evers, Ph.D
276 Canco Road,
Portland ME, 04103

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Pre-Qualified Vendor List Awards under RFP # 202103043,
Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil, and Engineering Consulting
Services

Dear Dr. Evers:

This letter is regarding the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Departments of Agriculture, Conservation and Forestry, and Environmental Protection for the Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services. The Departments have evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Departments are hereby announcing their conditional awards adding the following bidders to the existing pre-qualified vendor list:

Engineering Services

- No additional vendors

Soil Services

- Watershed Resource Consultants, LLC

Wetland Services

- Biodiversity Research Institute (BRI)
- Credere Associates, LLC
- Watershed Resource Consultants, LLC

Wildlife Services

- Biodiversity Research Institute (BRI)
- Credere Associates, LLC

The bidders listed above have met the requirements for placement on the Pre-Qualified Vendor List. Vendors added to this Pre-Qualified Vendor List (PQVL) are not guaranteed a contract with the State of Maine but are eligible to submit bids on projects issued through the PQVL Mini-Bid Process, as defined in the RFP. Any Notice of Conditional Contract Award resulting from a Mini-Bid award is subject to execution of a written contract. As a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendors. The vendors shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to contract services

until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the applicable Department is executed. The Departments further reserve the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award and dissolve the Pre-Qualified Vendor List at any time.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "SR Beyer".

Stacie R. Beyer
Executive Director
Land Use Planning Commission

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



**STATE OF MAINE
AGRICULTURE, CONSERVATION AND
FORESTRY, AND ENVIRONMENTAL
PROTECTION**

**Amanda E. Beal &
Melanie Loyzim
Commissioners**

**Janet T. Mills
Governor**

May 31, 2023

Credere Associates, LLC
Attn. Theresa Patten, President
776 Main Street
Westbrook, ME 04092

**SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Pre-Qualified Vendor List Awards under RFP # 202103043,
Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting
Services**

Dear Ms. Patten:

This letter is regarding the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Departments of Agriculture, Conservation and Forestry, and Environmental Protection for the Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services. The Departments have evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Departments are hereby announcing their conditional awards adding the following bidders to the existing pre-qualified vendor list:

Engineering Services

- No additional vendors

Soil Services

- Watershed Resource Consultants, LLC

Wetland Services

- Biodiversity Research Institute (BRI)
- Credere Associates, LLC
- Watershed Resource Consultants, LLC

Wildlife Services

- Biodiversity Research Institute (BRI)
- Credere Associates, LLC

The bidders listed above have met the requirements for placement on the Pre-Qualified Vendor List. Vendors added to this Pre-Qualified Vendor List (PQVL) are not guaranteed a contract with the State of Maine but are eligible to submit bids on projects issued through the PQVL Mini-Bid Process, as defined in the RFP. Any Notice of Conditional Contract Award resulting from a Mini-Bid award is subject to execution of a written contract. As a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendors. The vendors shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the applicable Department is

executed. The Departments further reserve the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award and dissolve the Pre-Qualified Vendor List at any time.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "SR Beyer".

Stacie R. Beyer
Executive Director
Land Use Planning Commission

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



**STATE OF MAINE
AGRICULTURE, CONSERVATION AND
FORESTRY, AND ENVIRONMENTAL
PROTECTION**

**Amanda E. Beal &
Melanie Loyzim
Commissioners**

**Janet T. Mills
Governor**

May 31, 2023

Watershed Resource Consultants, LLC
Attn. Roger St. Amand, Principal
1366 State Highway 102, #6
Bar Harbor, ME 04609

**SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Pre-Qualified Vendor List Awards under RFP # 202103043,
Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting
Services**

Dear Mr. Amand:

This letter is regarding the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Departments of Agriculture, Conservation and Forestry, and Environmental Protection for the Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services. The Departments have evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Departments are hereby announcing their conditional awards adding the following bidders to the existing pre-qualified vendor list:

Engineering Services

- No additional vendors

Soil Services

- Watershed Resource Consultants, LLC

Wetland Services

- Biodiversity Research Institute (BRI)
- Credere Associates, LLC
- Watershed Resource Consultants, LLC

Wildlife Services

- Biodiversity Research Institute (BRI)
- Credere Associates, LLC

The bidders listed above have met the requirements for placement on the Pre-Qualified Vendor List. Vendors added to this Pre-Qualified Vendor List (PQVL) are not guaranteed a contract with the State of Maine but are eligible to submit bids on projects issued through the PQVL Mini-Bid Process, as defined in the RFP. Any Notice of Conditional Contract Award resulting from a Mini-Bid award is subject to execution of a written contract. As a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendors. The vendors shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the applicable Department is

executed. The Departments further reserve the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award and dissolve the Pre-Qualified Vendor List at any time.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "SR Beyer".

Stacie R. Beyer
Executive Director
Land Use Planning Commission

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services

BIDDER: Biodiversity Research Institute (BRI)

DATE: May 11, 2023

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: DACF, LUPC

Name of RFP Coordinator: Stacie Beyer

Names of Evaluators: Stacie Beyer, Benjamin Godsoe, Dawn Hallowell

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	NA	NA
<u>Scoring Sections*</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section I. Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	45
Section II. Proposed Services	25	10
Section III. Cost Proposal	25	20
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>75</u>

*Bid scored for Wetland and Wildlife Services. With no documentation of licensed soil scientists or professional engineers on staff, the bid receives 0 for both organization qualifications and proposed services, which disqualified them for those two disciplines.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services

BIDDER: Biodiversity Research Institute (BRI)

DATE: May 11, 2023

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

NA

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services

BIDDER: Biodiversity Research Institute (BRI)

DATE: May 11, 2023

**EVALUATION OF SECTION I
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Availabl e</u>	<u>Points Awarde d</u>
Section I. Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	45

Evaluation Team Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

A. Overview of Organization

- *Experience in wetland delineation*
- *Experienced in wildlife habitat assessments*
- *Experienced in UT/ OT*
- *Most experience overall is in direct assessments, not third-party reviews, and solar/wind energy development projects.*

B. Subcontractors

- *N/A*

C. Organizational Chart

- *Professional Wetland Scientist- certified (but expired?), Associate Wildlife Biologist, Wetland Professional in Training(2), Eagle Hill wetland delineation training, MEDEP 3PI, LMSSE*
- *Bat specialist*
- *No soil scientist or professional engineer on staff*

D. Certificate of Insurance- expired 5/1/2023

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services

BIDDER: Biodiversity Research Institute (BRI)

DATE: May 11, 2023

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Proposed Services	25	10

Evaluation Team Comments:

II. Proposed Services

A. Services to be Provided

- *Wetlands and wildlife services*
- *Appropriate methodology for field services*
- *Did not address scope of RFP in terms of third-party review services*

B. Implementation – Work Plan

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services

BIDDER: Biodiversity Research Institute (BRI)

DATE: May 11, 2023

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
	,		x	25 points	=	20

Evaluation Team Comments:

- Seems to be average in terms of rates

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services

BIDDER: Credere Associates, LLC

DATE: May 11, 2023

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: DACF, LUPC

Name of RFP Coordinator: Stacie Beyer

Names of Evaluators: Stacie Beyer, Benjamin Godsoe, Audie Arbo, Dawn Hallowell

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)		
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section I. Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	
Section II. Proposed Services	25	
Section III. Cost Proposal	25	
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services

BIDDER: Credere Associates, LLC

DATE: May 11, 2023

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services

BIDDER: Credere Associates, LLC

DATE: May 11, 2023

**EVALUATION OF SECTION I
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Availabl e</u>	<u>Points Awarde d</u>
Section I. Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	40

Evaluation Team Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

A. Overview of Organization

- *Extensive experience in wetland delineation*
- *Extensive wildlife experience- habitat assessments*
- *Experience in OT/ not in UT*
- *No reported third-party reviews*

B. Subcontractors

- *N/A*

C. Organizational Chart

- *Certified Professional Wetland Scientist*
- *Wetland delineation training*
- *Wildlife degrees*
- *No professional engineer or certified soil scientist*

D. Certificate of Insurance- current

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services

BIDDER: Credere Associates, LLC

DATE: May 11, 2023

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Availabl e</u>	<u>Points Awarde d</u>
Section II. Proposed Services	25	15

Evaluation Team Comments:

II. Proposed Services

A. Services to be Provided

- *Wetland delineation*
- *Wildlife habitat assessment*
- *Provided scope of services responsive to RFP re third-party reviews- somewhat more than just copying and pasting from the RFP*
- *Available for field work and compliance reviews*
- *QA/AC good, but three tier review might be expensive*

B. Implementation – Work Plan

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services

BIDDER: Credere Associates, LLC

DATE: May 11, 2023

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
	,		x	25 points	=	15

Evaluation Team Comments:

Seems a bit high

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services

BIDDER: Watershed Resource Consultants, LLC

DATE: May 11, 2023

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: DACF, LUPC

Name of RFP Coordinator: Stacie Beyer

Names of Evaluators: Stacie Beyer, Benjamin Godsoe, Dawn Hallowell

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>		
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	NA	NA		
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>		
		Wetlands	Wildlife	Soils
Section I. Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	50	10	50
Section II. Proposed Services	25	20	10	20
Section III. Cost Proposal	25	25	25	25
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>95</u>	<u>45</u>	<u>95</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services

BIDDER: Watershed Resource Consultants, LLC

DATE: May 11, 2023

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

NA

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services

BIDDER: Watershed Resource Consultants, LLC

DATE: May 11, 2023

**EVALUATION OF SECTION I
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section I. Organization Qualifications and Experience		
Wetlands		50
Wildlife	50	10
Soils		50

Evaluation Team Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

A. Overview of Organization

- *Knowledgeable in wetland delineations/ functional assessments*
- *Confident in their work*
- *Extensive experience in wetlands, wildlife, and soil surveys*
- *Experience in the UT/ OT*
- *Experience in third-party reviews*

B. Subcontractors

- *NA*

C. Organizational Chart

- *Maine Licensed Soil Scientists*
- *Professional Wetland Scientist*
- *NH Certified Wetland Scientist*
- *No Professional Engineers on staff*
- *No Certified Wildlife Biologists (one staff member with degree in Wildlife, but no higher-level training or certification, and limited wildlife related experience)*

D. Certificate of Insurance- expired 4/15/2023

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services

BIDDER: Watershed Resource Consultants, LLC

DATE: May 11, 2023

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Availabl e</u>	<u>Points Awarde d</u>
Section II. Proposed Services Wetland & Soils Wildlife	25	20 10

Evaluation Team Comments:

II. Proposed Services

A. Services to be Provided

- *Response addresses scope of RFP*
- *Goes beyond a cut and paste of the RFP language*
- *Good level of detail*
- *Addresses three disciplines- wetlands, wildlife, and soils.*
- *Can review non-engineered E/S and stormwater BMPs (not included as a separate discipline in the scope of the RFP)*
- *Have drone services available*
- *Wildlife services more limited than provided by a more experienced Wildlife Biologist*

B. Implementation – Work Plan

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services

BIDDER: Watershed Resource Consultants, LLC

DATE: May 11, 2023

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	÷	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
	÷	All disciplines		25 points	=	25

Evaluation Team Comments:

- Appears within expectations, somewhat lower than other firms.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services

BIDDER NAME: Biodiversity Research Institute (BRI)

DATE: 5-11-2023

EVALUATOR NAME: Benjamin Godsoe

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DACF

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- *Not a lot of detail, especially about 3rd party review experience*
- *UT and OT experience*

2. Subcontractors

- *N/A*

3. Organizational Chart

- *No soil scientist*
- *Good wildlife and wetlands credentials*

4. Etc.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- *Did not adequately describe 3rd party review part of scope*
- *Copy paste information*

2. Implementation – Work Plan

-

III. Cost Proposal

- *Seems moderately expensive*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services

BIDDER NAME: Credere Associates, LLC

DATE: 5-11-2023

EVALUATOR NAME: Benjamin Godsoe

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DACF

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- *Lots of wetland delineation and wildlife expertise*
- *No UT experience*
- *Some reference to 3rd party inspections but not a full description of what they would do*

2. Subcontractors

- *N/A*

3. Organizational Chart

- *Wetland Scientist*
- *Wildlife Biologist*
- *No certified soil scientist*

4. Etc.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- *Not a full description of what they would do for 3rd party inspections*
- *Wetland and wildlife services, but minimal qualifications for 3rd party reviews for soils*

2. Implementation – Work Plan

-

III. Cost Proposal

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services

BIDDER NAME: Credere Associates, LLC

DATE: 5-11-2023

EVALUATOR NAME: Benjamin Godsoe

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DACF

- *Seems expensive*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services

BIDDER NAME: Watershed Resource Consultants, LLC

DATE: 5-11-2023

EVALUATOR NAME: Benjamin Godsoe

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DACF

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- *Good description of 3rd party review role and experience with it in the past.*
- *UT/OT experience*
- *Lots of experience with Maine regulations*

2. Subcontractors

- *N/A*

3. Organizational Chart

- *Wetland Scientist*
- *Soil Scientist*
- *No wildlife biologist*

4. Etc.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- *Seem to understand expectations of 3rd party review role and process*
- *Wetlands and Soils, but no wildlife credentials/qualifications*

2. Implementation – Work Plan

-

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services

BIDDER NAME: Watershed Resource Consultants, LLC

DATE: 5-11-2023

EVALUATOR NAME: Benjamin Godsoe

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DACF

III. Cost Proposal

- *Seems to be reasonable hourly rate across the board*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: PRE-QUALIFIED VENDOR LIST FOR WETLAND, WILDLIFE, SOIL AND ENGINEERING CONSULTING SERVICES

BIDDER NAME: BIODIVERSITY RESEARCH INSTITUTE (BRI)

DATE: 5/10/23

EVALUATOR NAME: DAWN HALLOWELL

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

.....

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- provides environmental consulting services including: wildlife surveys; renewable energy environmental assessments and impact studies; wetland, vernal pool, and vegetation surveys; freshwater and marine surveys; contaminant assessments; environmental planning, permitting, and management; habitat restoration; geospatial data management; and science communications
- team includes wildlife research biologists, natural resource scientists, ecologists, environmental planners, GIS analysts, ecological statisticians, data managers, and science communications specialists

2. Subcontractors

- N/A
-
-

3. Organizational Chart

- Attachment 1
- No soil scientists (Steve Knapp is licensed site evaluator)
- Bat Specialist on staff
-

4. Etc.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: PRE-QUALIFIED VENDOR LIST FOR WETLAND, WILDLIFE, SOIL AND ENGINEERING CONSULTING SERVICES

BIDDER NAME: BIODIVERSITY RESEARCH INSTITUTE (BRI)

DATE: 5/10/23

EVALUATOR NAME: DAWN HALLOWELL

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

- wetland delineations and peer review wetland delineations completed by others
- complete surveys for vernal pools using the criteria for identifying a Significant Vernal Pool detailed in the April 2014 Maine Association of Wetland Scientists Vernal Pool Technical Committee Vernal Pool Survey Protocol.
- evaluates wetland functions and values using the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers (USACE) Highway Methodology. In order to fully assess wetland functions and values, a combination of desktop and field variables are used. Based on the assessment, potential compensation for loss of functions or values can be assessed
- expertise researching and monitoring wildlife, including species listed under the Endangered Species Act (ESA). We conduct a range of survey types including baseline presence/absence, distribution and abundance, home range, telemetry, and acoustics
- multiple individuals that have been certified in erosion and sedimentation control, through the Maine Department of Environmental Protection. Since 2021, BRI staff have completed onsite weekly erosion and sediment control inspections for a large number of solar development projects within the State. These duties have included review of best management practices and assisting with permit compliance (Note - this vendor talks about erosion & sedimentation control but not Soils or Engineering)

2. Implementation – Work Plan

-

III. Cost Proposal

- *competitive*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: PRE-QUALIFIED VENDOR LIST FOR WETLAND, WILDLIFE, SOIL AND ENGINEERING CONSULTING SERVICES

BIDDER NAME: BIODIVERSITY RESEARCH INSTITUTE (BRI)

DATE: 5/10/23

EVALUATOR NAME: DAWN HALLOWELL

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

Biodiversity Research Institute 2023 Rate Sheet

Category	Hourly Rate
Senior Project Manager	\$139
Project Manager	\$119
Senior Environmental Scientist	\$129
Assistant Project Manager	\$98
GIS Manager	\$98
Environmental Scientist	\$88
Environmental Technician	\$78

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: PRE-QUALIFIED VENDOR LIST FOR WETLAND, WILDLIFE, SOIL AND ENGINEERING CONSULTING SERVICES

BIDDER NAME: Credere Associates, LLC

DATE: 5/10/23

EVALUATOR NAME: DAWN HALLOWELL

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- provides a wide range of Natural Resource Consulting Services in support of planning, permitting, design, and construction projects including Federal, Energy, Coastal, Commercial, and Residential development projects throughout the Northeast
- follows the standard best practices in Wetland Delineation based on soils, vegetation and hydrologic indicators
- extensive experience in natural resource assessments, NEPA assessments, NEPA impact statements, wetland delineation and permitting, vernal pool identification, threatened and endangered species inventories, ecological restoration planning, project planning, environmental compliance inspection
- no discussion of third party reviews

2. Subcontractors

- N/A
-
-

3. Organizational Chart

- Section 4, Attachment 1
- No professional engineer or certified soil scientist

4. Etc.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: PRE-QUALIFIED VENDOR LIST FOR WETLAND, WILDLIFE, SOIL AND ENGINEERING CONSULTING SERVICES

BIDDER NAME: Credere Associates, LLC

DATE: 5/10/23

EVALUATOR NAME: DAWN HALLOWELL

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

- verification and confirmation of data and interpretations for wetland delineations, functional assessments, and wildlife habitat evaluations for rare, threatened, and endangered (RTE) wildlife and plants
- submit a written technical review memorandum that provides technical input on the assumptions, variables, methodologies, analysis and conclusions presented by the applicant. All written comments will be submitted to the Department and/or the LUPC within 30 days of receiving a formal request for project review from the Department
- ensure that impact assessments are thorough and accurately characterize actual impacts based on credible data reviews and field studies
- verify that all pertinent agencies have been consulted for input, including Maine Natural Areas Program, Maine Inland Fisheries and Wildlife, and US Fish and Wildlife Service
- perform visits as requested to proposed project development sites to gain firsthand understanding of the individual site characteristics and facilitate understanding and aid in the development of technical review
- recommend to the Department and/or the LUPC what, if any, additional studies and/or postconstruction monitoring requirements are warranted by a project and provide, as needed, technical review in the development of any required studies or post-construction monitoring methodology
- review and comment on any post-construction monitoring data and additional plans submitted as a condition of approval for a Department and/or LUPC permit
- participate in meetings and/or conference calls to discuss the findings and recommendations with Department with the applicant, the Department and/or the LUPC. All discussions will be fully documented
- Respond to questions raised by the Department and/or the LUPC regarding the technical aspects of the project, findings and/or the contractor's recommendations
- Address questions raised by the general public relating to a project. The contractor will only be responsible for answering general public questions that have been directed to the contractor through the Department and/or the LUPC
- Review and comment on any supplemental materials requested of the applicant by the Department and/or LUPC in response to the contractor's initial written comments.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: PRE-QUALIFIED VENDOR LIST FOR WETLAND, WILDLIFE, SOIL AND ENGINEERING CONSULTING SERVICES

BIDDER NAME: Credere Associates, LLC

DATE: 5/10/23

EVALUATOR NAME: DAWN HALLOWELL

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

- written or direct testimony or comment, as needed, at any legal proceeding before the Maine Board of Environmental Protection and/or the Land Use Planning Commission.
- inspect a project development site during and after construction to determine compliance with the approved permit and associated development plans (Note - this vendor talks about erosion & sedimentation control but not Soils or Engineering)

2. Implementation – Work Plan

•

III. Cost Proposal

- *more expensive*

**Standard Labor Rates
Credere Associates, LLC
2023**

<u>Personnel</u>	<u>Rate/Hour</u>
Principal-in-Charge - Rip Patten, PE	\$170
Senior Project Manager – Peter Thompson.....	\$150
Principal Reviewer, Senior Biologist/Wetlands Scientist - David Santillo, Susanne Schaller.....	\$125
Geologist II / GIS Specialist III - Ian Desjarlais	\$105
Environmental Scientist II - Nathaniel Weiss	\$95
Engineer I - Lauren Kaija.....	\$95
Environmental Scientist I - Stacy Towne.....	\$85
Administrative Assistant - Jenn Taiani	\$60

<u>Other Direct Costs</u>	<u>Rate</u>
Communication Fee	3% of labor costs
Mileage	Current IRS Rate (\$TBD/mile)
Copies	\$0.20 per copy
Large Plots	\$10.00 per copy
Soil Sampling Equipment	\$20/day
GPS	\$140/day; \$550/week
Subconsultant/Subcontractor Expenses	cost +10%
Direct Expenses	cost

•

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: PRE-QUALIFIED VENDOR LIST FOR WETLAND, WILDLIFE, SOIL AND ENGINEERING CONSULTING SERVICES

BIDDER NAME: Watershed Resource Consultants, LLC

DATE: 5/10/23

EVALUATOR NAME: DAWN HALLOWELL

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- conduct and review identification, delineation, classification and mapping of protected natural resources including coastal, lacustrine, marine, and freshwater wetlands; vernal pools; streams; coastal sand dunes; fragile mountain areas; and Significant wildlife habitats; freshwater and marine wetland functional assessments which include assessments of wildlife use and impact; wetland compensation plans; RTE botanical surveys; wildlife habitat identification and assessment (DWA, IWWH, Vernal Pools); soil surveys for soil suitability assessment; soil test pit documentation for stormwater systems; soil site evaluations for subsurface wastewater disposal; and non-engineered stormwater and erosion/sedimentation control plans
- GPS technology for field location of resources and pertinent features, and uses the latest CAD and GIS software for creating plans and analyzing project sites. WRC has three persons on staff with high proficiency in the use of CAD and GIS. WRC owns several drones and is proficient in using drones for remote data collection and analysis. WRC has two licensed persons on staff with proficiency in drone and associated software use
- three persons on staff that are MDEP Certified Erosion Control Inspectors. These persons are on the MDEP's 3PI/EI list of inspectors and regularly work to help contractors and clients to achieve successful projects with as little harm to resources and erosion/sedimentation control issues as possible, while meeting contract specifications
- experience doing third party reviews for municipalities

2. Subcontractors

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: PRE-QUALIFIED VENDOR LIST FOR WETLAND, WILDLIFE, SOIL AND ENGINEERING CONSULTING SERVICES

BIDDER NAME: Watershed Resource Consultants, LLC

DATE:5/10/23

EVALUATOR NAME: DAWN HALLOWELL

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

- N/A

3. *Organizational Chart*

- Attachment 1
- No wildlife biologists on staff (one tech has BS wildlife degree)
- Licensed soil scientist
- Prof wetland scientists
- No prof engineers

4. *Etc.*

II. *Proposed Services*

1. *Services to be Provided*

- conduct 3PI/EI services for engineered stormwater plans. WRC will conduct a review of delineations, assessments, reports and plans submitted by project applicants to determine if they are reasonably accurate and technically correct according to applicable Department and LUPC laws/regulations on wetland and wildlife impacts, soil suitability and erosion control and wildlife impacts.
- pay particular attention to the methodology used by the applicant/consultant in conducting their work. We will be seeking that the work was conducted using the most recent versions of applicable identification, delineation and mapping standards as published by the MDEP, LUPC, U.S. Army Corps of Engineers, and Maine Association of Professional Soil Scientists (soil mapping standards)
- review the provided Cowardin classifications of wetlands, waterbodies and streams, as well as classifications of “Wetlands of Special Significance” and “Wetlands Not of Special Significance” (MDEP); and PWL-1, PWL-2 and PWL-3 classifications (LUPC). We will check if the applicant contacted the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, Maine Department of Inland Fisheries and Wildlife, and Maine Natural Areas Program and used provided information in determining the MDEP and LUPC wetland classifications
- review provided wetland data regarding soils, vegetation and hydrology, including any data provided on Corps Wetland Data Forms; provided stream data regarding depth, width, bottom type and hydroperiod; provided vernal pool data regarding hydroperiod, species use, diversity

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: PRE-QUALIFIED VENDOR LIST FOR WETLAND, WILDLIFE, SOIL AND ENGINEERING CONSULTING SERVICES

BIDDER NAME: Watershed Resource Consultants, LLC

DATE: 5/10/23

EVALUATOR NAME: DAWN HALLOWELL

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

and richness, including any data as presented on Maine State Vernal Pool Assessment Forms; provided marine wetland data; provided Significant Wildlife Habitat information; and any other Protected Natural Resource information/data supplied

- review the Protected Natural Resources Report and Plan and determine if it meets the identification, delineation, and classification standards as required in the LUPC's Chapter 10 Land Use Districts and Standards, MDEP's Natural Resources Protection Act, Wetlands and Water Bodies Protection Rules, and Significant Wildlife Habitat Rules, as applicable. We will analyze the data and review the report conclusions with particular attention to if protected natural resource identification, delineation and classification were properly conducted and if potential impacts are addressed. WRC will review any provided information for compliance with the No Adverse Environmental Effect standard.
- review provided information for wildlife habitats identified and assess if additional surveys/studies should be required to fully vet no adverse impact to wildlife standards
- determine if the level of mapping meets that which is required in LUPC Chapter 10, the Soil Types Standard of the Site Location Law, and the MDEP's Site Location of Development Act, as applicable. We will then review the provided test pits and analyze if the test pits were properly correlated to NRCS named soils. We will review the soil survey plan and report and determine if it meets the Maine Association of Professional Soil Scientists Guidelines for Soil Identification and Mapping Standards for the required class of soil survey. We will analyze the data and review the report conclusions with particular attention to if limitations to the development due to soils (soil suitability) are addressed adequately. The project will also be reviewed for correlation with the Site Law's Soils Types Standard of the Site Location Law.
- review submitted erosion and sedimentation control plans for compliance with the MDEP's Best Erosion and Sediment Control Law and LUPC's Chapter 10 (applicable sections). WRC's review will be for non-engineered BMP's
- include a site visit with reconnaissance of applicable features, and technical review of information provided
- review non-engineered BMP's plans for compliance with the MDEP's Stormwater Management Law, Stormwater Management Compensation

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: PRE-QUALIFIED VENDOR LIST FOR WETLAND, WILDLIFE, SOIL AND ENGINEERING CONSULTING SERVICES

BIDDER NAME: Watershed Resource Consultants, LLC

DATE: 5/10/23

EVALUATOR NAME: DAWN HALLOWELL

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

Fees and Mitigation Credit, and LUPC's Chapter 10 (applicable sections).
WRC's review will be for non-engineered BMP's.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- review submitted plans and reports for correlation with the LUPC's Development Review and Approval Law, and MDEP's No Adverse Environmental Effect Standard
- conduct a general reconnaissance of the project site with attention given to the information presented in the provided reports and plans. We will conduct sampling plots (if needed) in key locations and compare our findings with the presented data. We will take photographs of key features on the site. We will observe and compare site conditions with proposed site changes, and compare our observations with those of the applicant/consultant. We will assess the site and proposed impacts from both a development scale and landscape scale impact.
- provide a written technical review memorandum which will include a description of our analyses of the contractors assumptions, variables, methodologies, analysis and conclusions presented by the applicant and/or the applicant's consultant. Our technical review will include an assessment of the methodologies used and if they are current, an assessment of the analysis given and if it leads to logical findings and conclusions, an assessment of applicability to current laws and rules that are triggered by the project, and an assessment of conclusions and recommendations of the presented material. In the report, we will make recommendations for further study, pre- or post-construction monitoring or assessment, if warranted. Our report will be submitted to the MDEP and/or the LUPC within 30 days of receiving a formal request for project review from the MDEP and/or the LUPC, or as requested by the agencies if different
- If requested, WRC will provide technical review services to the MDEP and/or the LUPC in the development of a methodology for and specifications of recommended further studies, monitoring or assessment
- available to attend and participate in MDEP and/or LUPC public meetings; participate in meetings and/or conference calls to discuss the findings and recommendations with the applicant, the MDEP and/or the LUPC; address questions raised by the MDEP and/or the LUPC regarding the technical aspects of the project, findings and/or the contractor's recommendations; address questions raised by the general public relating to a project; review and comment on any supplemental materials requested

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: PRE-QUALIFIED VENDOR LIST FOR WETLAND, WILDLIFE, SOIL AND ENGINEERING CONSULTING SERVICES

BIDDER NAME: Watershed Resource Consultants, LLC

DATE:5/10/23

EVALUATOR NAME: DAWN HALLOWELL

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

of the applicant by the MDEP and/or the LUPC in response to the contractor's initial written comments; and provide expert testimony or comment, as needed, at any legal proceedings before the Maine Board of Environmental Protection and/or the Land Use Planning Commission.

III. Cost Proposal

- *competitive*

2023 PROFESSIONAL RATE OVERVIEW		
Standard hourly fee	\$ 60-\$120	Includes consulting, travel and project management costs
Litigation/ expert testimony	1.5 x std.	Court and litigation related fees for expert testimony or consultation
Travel Expenses	At cost	Mileage billed at \$0.655/mi. meals, lodging etc. at cost or per diem
Sub consultant	Cost+ 10%	Sub-consultant fee may be marked up 10% (N.T.E. rate schedule)
Field expenses	At cost	Large format plots, copies, field supplies, etc.

RATE SCHEDULE BY CLASSIFICATION:

EMPLOYEE CLASSIFICATION	HOURLY RATE
Principal	\$120.00
Senior Scientist/Project Manager	\$110.00
Project Scientist	\$95.00
GIS/Cad Drafting/Designer	\$80.00
Field Technician	\$75.00
Administrative	\$60.00

EQUIPMENT RATES:

TYPE	RATE
Mapping grade Sub meter GPS	\$160/ day
Survey Equipment (total station/ level)	\$200/ day
ATV/UTV/boat/off-road vehicle	\$200/ day
field equipment (radios, camera, data collector, etc.)	\$25-50/ day

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services

BIDDER NAME: Biodiversity Research Institute (BRI)

DATE: May 8, 2023

EVALUATOR NAME: Stacie Beyer

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DACF

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Experienced in wetland delineation, Corps methodology
- Experienced in wildlife habitat assessment, particularly DWAs, vernal pools
- Worked for Biddeford, assessing potential wildlife impacts of proposed development
- Experience in UT, Three Corners Solar
- Most experience overall is in direct assessments, not third-party reviews, and solar/wind energy development projects.
- No professional engineer listed on staff

2. Subcontractors

- N/A
-
-

3. Organizational Chart

- *Provided*
- *Professional Wetland Scientist- certified (but expired?), Associate Wildlife Biologist, Wetland Professional in Training(2), Eagle Hill wetland delineation training, MEDEP 3PI, LMSSE,*

4. Certificate of Insurance- expired 5/1/2023

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services

BIDDER NAME: Biodiversity Research Institute (BRI)

DATE: May 8, 2023

EVALUATOR NAME: Stacie Beyer

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DACF

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- *Wetlands and wildlife services*
- *Also, lists erosion and sedimentation control, but no engineer on staff*

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- *Described appropriate methodologies for wetland delineation, vernal pool surveys, wetland functions and values assessment, and, wildlife habitat identification and assessment.*
- *Little detail was provided on how they would conduct third-party reviews.*

III. Cost Proposal

- *Environmental Tech- Senior Project Manager- \$78- \$139.*
- *Project Manager- \$119, Environmental Scientist \$88*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services

BIDDER NAME: Credere Associates, LLC

DATE: May 10, 2023

EVALUATOR NAME: Stacie Beyer

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DACF

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- *Extensive experience in wetland delineation and wildlife habitat assessments*
- *No reported UT experiences*
- *No reported experience in third-party reviews*
- *No documentation for licensed professional engineer and no licensed soil scientist on staff*
-

2. Subcontractors

- *None proposed*

3. Organizational Chart

- *Certified Professional Wetland Scientist*
- *Wetland delineation training*
- *Wildlife degrees*
- *Blurry org chart*

4. Certificate of Insurance- current

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- *Wetland delineation*
- *Wildlife habitat assessment*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services

BIDDER NAME: Credere Associates, LLC

DATE: May 10, 2023

EVALUATOR NAME: Stacie Beyer

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DACF

- *Provided scope of services responsive to RFP re third-party reviews- somewhat more than just copying and pasting from the RFP*
- *Three tier review might be expensive*

2. Implementation – Work Plan

-

III. Cost Proposal

- *Hourly rates range from \$60 to \$170, generally within expected range*
- *Project Manager- \$150, Environmental Scientist- \$85/95/\$105*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services

BIDDER NAME: Watershed Resource Consultants, LLC

DATE: May 11, 2023

EVALUATOR NAME: Stacie Beyer

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DACF

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- *Wetland delineation, classification, and assessment*
- *Wildlife habitat identification and assessment*
- *Soil surveys and suitability*
- *Extensive experience*
- *Experience in third-party reviews for municipalities*
- *Experience in the UT*

2. Subcontractors

- *None proposed*

3. Organizational Chart

- *Maine Licensed Soil Scientists*
- *Professional Wetland Scientist*
- *NH Certified Wetland Scientist*
- *No Professional Engineers on staff*
- *No Certified Wildlife Biologists (one staff member with degree in Wildlife)*
- *Blurry resumes and certifications*

4. Certificate of Insurance- expired 4/15/2023

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- *Response addresses scope of RFP*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202103043

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services

BIDDER NAME: Watershed Resource Consultants, LLC

DATE: May 11, 2023

EVALUATOR NAME: Stacie Beyer

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DACF

- *Goes beyond a cut and paste of the RFP language*
- *Good level of detail*
- *Addresses three disciplines, wetlands, wildlife, and soils.*
- *Non-engineered E/S and stormwater BMPs are not included as a separate discipline in the scope of the RFP*

2. Implementation – Work Plan

-

III. Cost Proposal

- *Range \$60-\$120- within range of expectations*
- *Project Manager \$110; Field Technician \$75.00*



Janet T. Mills
Governor

STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF AGRICULTURE,
CONSERVATION
AND FORESTRY AND ENVIRONMENTAL
PROTECTION

Amanda E. Beal and
Melanie Loyzim
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: 202103043
RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for
Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services

I, Benjamin Godsoe accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of State of Maine Department of Agriculture, Conservation and Forestry, and Environmental Protection. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

5-11-2023

Signature

Date



STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF AGRICULTURE, CONSERVATION
AND FORESTRY AND ENVIRONMENTAL
PROTECTION

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Amanda E. Beal and
Melanie Loyzim
Commissioners

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT

RFP #: 202103043

**RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for
Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services**

I, Dawn Hallowell accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Agriculture, Conservation and Forestry, and Environmental Protection. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the funding decision notices for public distribution.

Dawn Hallowell

Signature

5/10/23

Date



Janet T. Mills
Governor

STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF AGRICULTURE,
CONSERVATION
AND FORESTRY AND ENVIRONMENTAL
PROTECTION

Amanda E. Beal and
Melanie Loyzim
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: 202103043
RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for
Wetland, Wildlife, Soil and Engineering Consulting Services

I, Stacie Beyer accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of State of Maine Department of Agriculture, Conservation and Forestry, and Environmental Protection. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

SR Beyer

Signature

05/08/2023

Date