

State of Maine
Master Score Sheet

RFP Number 202406119					
Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Life and Health Actuarial Services					
Bidder Name:		Berry Dunn	Lewis & Ellis LLC	Milliman Inc.	Novarest Inc.
Proposed Hourly Rates:		\$250 - \$425	\$220 - \$500	\$355 - \$685	\$155 - \$305
Scoring Sections	Points Available				
Section I: Preliminary Information	Pass/Fail	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	35	50	35	35
Section III: Proposed Services	25	15	25	20	20
Section IV: Cost Proposal	25	17	16	9	25
TOTAL	100	67	91	64	80
Bidder Name:		Oliver Wyman	RRC	Wakely	
Proposed Hourly Rates:		\$410 - \$500	\$175 - \$305	\$210 - \$620	
Scoring Sections	Points Available				
Section I: Preliminary Information	Pass/Fail	Pass	Pass	Pass	
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	45	22	40	
Section III: Proposed Services	25	20	12	15	
Section IV: Cost Proposal	25	11	24	11	
TOTAL	100	76	48	66	



Janet T. Mills
Governor

STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF PROFESSIONAL & FINANCIAL REGULATION
BUREAU OF INSURANCE



Robert L. Carey
Superintendent

August 16, 2024

Jennifer Elwood, Principal
BerryDunn
2211 Congress Street
Portland, ME 04102-1955

RE: RFP Number 202406119 Notice of Conditional Pre-Qualified Vendor List Awards

Dear Ms. Elwood:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Professional and Financial Regulation for Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Life and Health Actuarial Services RFP number 202406119. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional award(s) to the following bidder(s):

Berry, Dunn, McNeil & Parker, LLC
Lewis & Ellis, LLC
Milliman, Inc.
NovaRest, Inc.
Oliver Wyman Actuarial Consulting, Inc.
Risk & Regulatory Consulting, LLC
Wakely Consulting Group, LLC, an HMA Company

The bidder(s) listed above have met the requirements for placement on the Pre-Qualified Vendor List. Vendors added to this Pre-Qualified Vendor List (PQVL) are not guaranteed a contract with the State of Maine but are eligible to submit bids on projects issued through the PQVL Mini-Bid Process, as defined in the RFP. Any Notice of Conditional Contract Award resulting from a Mini-Bid award is subject to execution of a written contract. As a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor(s). The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award and dissolve the Pre-Qualified Vendor List at any time.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

Office Location: 76 Northern Avenue, Gardiner, Maine 04345
Mailing Address: 34 State House Station, Augusta, Maine 04333
www.maine.gov/insurance

Phone: (207) 624-8475

TTY: Please Call Maine Relay 711

Consumer Assistance: 1-800-300-5000

Fax: (207) 624-8599

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Marti Hooper". The signature is written in a cursive style with a vertical line separating the first and last names.

Marti Hooper, ASA, MAAA
Life and Health Actuary
Maine Bureau of Insurance
(207) 557-1845





STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF PROFESSIONAL & FINANCIAL REGULATION
BUREAU OF INSURANCE



Janet T. Mills
Governor

Anne L. Head
DPFR Commissioner

Robert L. Carey
Superintendent

August 16, 2024

Jason Dunavin, Vice President
Lewis & Ellis LLC
6600 Chase Oaks Boulevard, Suite 150
Plano, TX 75023

RE: RFP Number 202406119 Notice of Conditional Pre-Qualified Vendor List Awards

Dear Mr. Dunavin:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Professional and Financial Regulation for Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Life and Health Actuarial Services RFP number 202406119. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional award(s) to the following bidder(s):

Berry, Dunn, McNeil & Parker, LLC
Lewis & Ellis, LLC
Milliman, Inc.
NovaRest, Inc.
Oliver Wyman Actuarial Consulting, Inc.
Risk & Regulatory Consulting, LLC
Wakely Consulting Group, LLC, an HMA Company

The bidder(s) listed above have met the requirements for placement on the Pre-Qualified Vendor List. Vendors added to this Pre-Qualified Vendor List (PQVL) are not guaranteed a contract with the State of Maine but are eligible to submit bids on projects issued through the PQVL Mini-Bid Process, as defined in the RFP. Any Notice of Conditional Contract Award resulting from a Mini-Bid award is subject to execution of a written contract. As a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor(s). The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award and dissolve the Pre-Qualified Vendor List at any time.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

Office Location: 76 Northern Avenue, Gardiner, Maine 04345
Mailing Address: 34 State House Station, Augusta, Maine 04333
www.maine.gov/insurance

Phone: (207) 624-8475

TTY: Please Call Maine Relay 711

Consumer Assistance: 1-800-300-5000

Fax: (207) 624-8599

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,



Marti Hooper, ASA, MAAA
Life and Health Actuary
Maine Bureau of Insurance
(207) 557-1845



Printed on Recycled Paper
Offices Located as 76 Northern Avenue, Gardiner, Maine 04345
www.maine.gov/insurance



Janet T. Mills
Governor

STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF PROFESSIONAL & FINANCIAL REGULATION
BUREAU OF INSURANCE



Robert L. Carey
Superintendent

August 16, 2024

Kenneth Laskowski
Milliman, Inc.
1301 Fifth Avenue Suite 3800
Seattle, WA 98101-2646

RE: RFP Number 202406119 Notice of Conditional Pre-Qualified Vendor List Awards

Dear Mr. Laskowski:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Professional and Financial Regulation for Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Life and Health Actuarial Services RFP number 202406119. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional award(s) to the following bidder(s):

Berry, Dunn, McNeil & Parker, LLC
Lewis & Ellis, LLC
Milliman, Inc.
NovaRest, Inc.
Oliver Wyman Actuarial Consulting, Inc.
Risk & Regulatory Consulting, LLC
Wakely Consulting Group, LLC, an HMA Company

The bidder(s) listed above have met the requirements for placement on the Pre-Qualified Vendor List. Vendors added to this Pre-Qualified Vendor List (PQVL) are not guaranteed a contract with the State of Maine but are eligible to submit bids on projects issued through the PQVL Mini-Bid Process, as defined in the RFP. Any Notice of Conditional Contract Award resulting from a Mini-Bid award is subject to execution of a written contract. As a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor(s). The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award and dissolve the Pre-Qualified Vendor List at any time.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

Office Location: 76 Northern Avenue, Gardiner, Maine 04345
Mailing Address: 34 State House Station, Augusta, Maine 04333
www.maine.gov/insurance

Phone: (207) 624-8475

TTY: Please Call Maine Relay 711

Consumer Assistance: 1-800-300-5000

Fax: (207) 624-8599

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Marti Hooper". The signature is written in a cursive style with a vertical line separating the first and last names.

Marti Hooper, ASA, MAAA
Life and Health Actuary
Maine Bureau of Insurance
(207) 557-1845





Janet T. Mills
Governor

STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF PROFESSIONAL & FINANCIAL REGULATION
BUREAU OF INSURANCE



Robert L. Carey
Superintendent

August 16, 2024

Wayne Novak, Principal
NovaRest, Inc.
156 W Calle Gija
Sahuarita, AZ 85629

RE: RFP Number 202406119 Notice of Conditional Pre-Qualified Vendor List Awards

Dear Mr. Novak:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Professional and Financial Regulation for Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Life and Health Actuarial Services RFP number 202406119. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional award(s) to the following bidder(s):

Berry, Dunn, McNeil & Parker, LLC
Lewis & Ellis, LLC
Milliman, Inc.
NovaRest, Inc.
Oliver Wyman Actuarial Consulting, Inc.
Risk & Regulatory Consulting, LLC
Wakely Consulting Group, LLC, an HMA Company

The bidder(s) listed above have met the requirements for placement on the Pre-Qualified Vendor List. Vendors added to this Pre-Qualified Vendor List (PQVL) are not guaranteed a contract with the State of Maine but are eligible to submit bids on projects issued through the PQVL Mini-Bid Process, as defined in the RFP. Any Notice of Conditional Contract Award resulting from a Mini-Bid award is subject to execution of a written contract. As a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor(s). The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award and dissolve the Pre-Qualified Vendor List at any time.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

Office Location: 76 Northern Avenue, Gardiner, Maine 04345
Mailing Address: 34 State House Station, Augusta, Maine 04333
www.maine.gov/insurance

Phone: (207) 624-8475

TTY: Please Call Maine Relay 711

Consumer Assistance: 1-800-300-5000

Fax: (207) 624-8599

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Marti Hooper". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Marti Hooper, ASA, MAAA
Life and Health Actuary
Maine Bureau of Insurance
(207) 557-1845





Janet T. Mills
Governor

STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF PROFESSIONAL & FINANCIAL REGULATION
BUREAU OF INSURANCE



Robert L. Carey
Superintendent

August 16, 2024

Jenn Smagula, Principal
Oliver Wyman
99 High Street
Boston, MA 02110

RE: RFP Number 202406119 Notice of Conditional Pre-Qualified Vendor List Awards

Dear Ms. Smagula:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Professional and Financial Regulation for Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Life and Health Actuarial Services RFP number 202406119. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional award(s) to the following bidder(s):

Berry, Dunn, McNeil & Parker, LLC
Lewis & Ellis, LLC
Milliman, Inc.
NovaRest, Inc.
Oliver Wyman Actuarial Consulting, Inc.
Risk & Regulatory Consulting, LLC
Wakely Consulting Group, LLC, an HMA Company

The bidder(s) listed above have met the requirements for placement on the Pre-Qualified Vendor List. Vendors added to this Pre-Qualified Vendor List (PQVL) are not guaranteed a contract with the State of Maine but are eligible to submit bids on projects issued through the PQVL Mini-Bid Process, as defined in the RFP. Any Notice of Conditional Contract Award resulting from a Mini-Bid award is subject to execution of a written contract. As a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor(s). The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award and dissolve the Pre-Qualified Vendor List at any time.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

Office Location: 76 Northern Avenue, Gardiner, Maine 04345
Mailing Address: 34 State House Station, Augusta, Maine 04333
www.maine.gov/insurance

Phone: (207) 624-8475

TTY: Please Call Maine Relay 711

Consumer Assistance: 1-800-300-5000

Fax: (207) 624-8599

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,



Marti Hooper, ASA, MAAA
Life and Health Actuary
Maine Bureau of Insurance
(207) 557-1845



Printed on Recycled Paper
Offices Located as 76 Northern Avenue, Gardiner, Maine 04345
www.maine.gov/insurance



Janet T. Mills
Governor

STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF PROFESSIONAL & FINANCIAL REGULATION
BUREAU OF INSURANCE



Robert L. Carey
Superintendent

August 16, 2024

LeeAnne Creevy, President
Risk & Regulatory Consulting, LLC
20 Batterson Park, Suite 380
Farmington, CT 06032

RE: RFP Number 202406119 Notice of Conditional Pre-Qualified Vendor List Awards

Dear Ms. Creevy:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Professional and Financial Regulation for Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Life and Health Actuarial Services RFP number 202406119. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional award(s) to the following bidder(s):

Berry, Dunn, McNeil & Parker, LLC
Lewis & Ellis, LLC
Milliman, Inc.
NovaRest, Inc.
Oliver Wyman Actuarial Consulting, Inc.
Risk & Regulatory Consulting, LLC
Wakely Consulting Group, LLC, an HMA Company

The bidder(s) listed above have met the requirements for placement on the Pre-Qualified Vendor List. Vendors added to this Pre-Qualified Vendor List (PQVL) are not guaranteed a contract with the State of Maine but are eligible to submit bids on projects issued through the PQVL Mini-Bid Process, as defined in the RFP. Any Notice of Conditional Contract Award resulting from a Mini-Bid award is subject to execution of a written contract. As a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor(s). The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award and dissolve the Pre-Qualified Vendor List at any time.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

Office Location: 76 Northern Avenue, Gardiner, Maine 04345
Mailing Address: 34 State House Station, Augusta, Maine 04333
www.maine.gov/insurance

Phone: (207) 624-8475

TTY: Please Call Maine Relay 711

Consumer Assistance: 1-800-300-5000

Fax: (207) 624-8599

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Marti Hooper". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Marti Hooper, ASA, MAAA
Life and Health Actuary
Maine Bureau of Insurance
(207) 557-1845





Janet T. Mills
Governor

STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF PROFESSIONAL & FINANCIAL REGULATION
BUREAU OF INSURANCE



Robert L. Carey
Superintendent

August 16, 2024

Ann Filiault, Director
Wakely Consulting Group LLC
2501 Woodlake Circle, Suite 100
Okemos, MI 48864

RE: RFP Number 202406119 Notice of Conditional Pre-Qualified Vendor List Awards

Dear Ms. Filiault:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Professional and Financial Regulation for Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Life and Health Actuarial Services RFP number 202406119. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional award(s) to the following bidder(s):

Berry, Dunn, McNeil & Parker, LLC
Lewis & Ellis, LLC
Milliman, Inc.
NovaRest, Inc.
Oliver Wyman Actuarial Consulting, Inc.
Risk & Regulatory Consulting, LLC
Wakely Consulting Group, LLC, an HMA Company

The bidder(s) listed above have met the requirements for placement on the Pre-Qualified Vendor List. Vendors added to this Pre-Qualified Vendor List (PQVL) are not guaranteed a contract with the State of Maine but are eligible to submit bids on projects issued through the PQVL Mini-Bid Process, as defined in the RFP. Any Notice of Conditional Contract Award resulting from a Mini-Bid award is subject to execution of a written contract. As a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor(s). The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award and dissolve the Pre-Qualified Vendor List at any time.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

Office Location: 76 Northern Avenue, Gardiner, Maine 04345
Mailing Address: 34 State House Station, Augusta, Maine 04333
www.maine.gov/insurance

Phone: (207) 624-8475

TTY: Please Call Maine Relay 711

Consumer Assistance: 1-800-300-5000

Fax: (207) 624-8599

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Marti Hooper". The signature is written in a cursive, slightly slanted style.

Marti Hooper, ASA, MAAA
Life and Health Actuary
Maine Bureau of Insurance
(207) 557-1845



Printed on Recycled Paper
Offices Located as 76 Northern Avenue, Gardiner, Maine 04345
www.maine.gov/insurance

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Berry Dunn McNeil & Parker LLC
DATE: 08/01/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Department of Professional and Financial Regulation
Name of RFP Coordinator: Mary M Hooper
Names of Evaluators: Mary Hooper, Sherry Worth, Stuart Turney

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)		
• All bidders determined to be eligible	X	
•		
•		
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	35
Section III. Proposed Services	25	15
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	17
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>67</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Berry Dunn McNeil & Parker LLC
DATE: 08/01/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

Consensus that all bidders are eligible for Life and Health Actuarial Services Pre-qualified Vendor List.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Berry Dunn McNeil & Parker LLC
DATE: 08/01/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	35

Evaluation Team Comments:

Headquartered in ME;
 Qualified organization;
 Has provided legislative support for health insurance pricing
 Has provided legislative support for filing reviews;
 Has performed market conduct work for NH;
 Has performed mandated benefit reviews for MD.
 Acceptable health actuarial experience;
 Notable healthcare focus.

MBOI noted that Compass Health Analytics merged with BD in 2017;

Subcontractors - none noted.

Insurance certificate:

Hanover American Ins Co	Commercial liability	\$1M/\$2M
Massachusetts Bay Ins Co	Commercial auto	\$1M
The Hanover Ins Co	Umbrella	\$8M
Maine Employers Mutual Ins Co	Workers comp	\$1M
Continental Casualty Ins Co	Professional liability	\$1M/\$1M

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Berry Dunn McNeil & Parker LLC
DATE: 08/01/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	25	15

Evaluation Team Comments:

Services to be Provided:

1. Mandated benefits
2. LTC rate review – NO SERVICE OFFERED
3. ACA compliant
4. EHB benchmark

Of note:

BD core service appears to be mandated benefits;
Provided evidence of 2024 biomarker testing
Provided evidence of family building
Provided detailed ACA rate review procedural description

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Berry Dunn McNeil & Parker LLC
DATE: 08/01/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	Cost Proposal Being Scored	Score Possible	Score
	Consensus Score	25	17

Evaluation Team Comments:

<u>Function</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Hourly Rate</u>	<u>Staff Credential</u>	<u>Staff Name</u>
Lead	Principal/Senior	\$ 425	FSA	Elwood
Support	Principal/Senior	\$ 425	ASA	Kennedy
Support	Senior Actuary	\$ 390	FSA	Wilson
Technical	Senior Actuary	\$ 390	FSA	Shields
Technical	Senior Actuary	\$ 390	FSA	Qin
Technical	Senior HP Manager	\$ 325		Hamilton
Technical	Senior HP Analyst	\$ 250		Nash
Technical	Senior Data Analyst	\$ 250		Miller

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Lewis & Ellis LLC
DATE: 08/01/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Department of Professional and Financial Regulation
Name of RFP Coordinator: Mary M. Hooper
Names of Evaluators: Mary Hooper, Sherry Worth, Stuart Turney

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)		
• All bidders determined to be eligible	X	
•		
•		
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	50
Section III. Proposed Services	25	25
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	16
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>91</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Lewis & Ellis LLC
DATE: 08/01/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

Consensus that all bidders are eligible for Life and Health Actuarial Services Pre-qualified Vendor List.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Lewis & Ellis LLC
DATE: 08/01/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	50

Evaluation Team Comments:

Qualified organization; acceptable health actuarial experience; healthcare focused.

Of note:

Proposed team includes 4 FSA;
 Primary clients are state regulators;
 Team has provided LTC related services to state regulators;
 LTC experience includes valuation, pricing, experience studies;
 Ten states have contracted with L&E to perform LTC rate reviews;
 Has provided mandated benefit reviews in several states;
 Has provided EHB Benchmark plan revisions services to several states;
 Can assist with the CMS application process and provide the required actuarial certifications;
 Has provided ACA rate review for NV and KY;

Subcontractors - none noted.

Insurance certificate:

Federal Ins Co	Commercial liability	\$1M/\$2M
Federal Ins Co	Commercial auto	\$1M
Federal Ins Co	Umbrella	\$5M
Federal Ins Co	Workers comp	\$1M
Federal Ins Co	Crime	\$1M
Bridgeway Ins Co	Professional liability	\$5M
Trisura Ins Co	Cyber liability	\$5M

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Lewis & Ellis LLC
DATE: 08/01/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	25	25

Evaluation Team Comments:

Services to be Provided:

1. Mandated benefits
2. LTC rate review
3. ACA compliant
4. EHB benchmark

Of note:

Provided elaborate LTC process description;
Cited Maine specific regulations;
Provided insightful description of mandate review process;
Described defrayal requirement;
Described basic EHB benchmark redesign steps.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Lewis & Ellis LLC
DATE: 08/01/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	Cost Proposal Being Scored	Score Possible	Score
	Consensus Score	25	16

Evaluation Team Comments:

Title	Rate
Principal	\$ 500
FSA	\$ 375
ASA	\$ 300
Data Science	\$ 250
Senior Associate	\$ 250
Associate	\$ 220

Could not connect the proposed L&E team with the associated L&E titles and L&E rates.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Milliman Inc
DATE: 08/01/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Department of Professional and Financial Regulation
Name of RFP Coordinator: Mary M. Hooper
Names of Evaluators: Mary Hooper, Sherry Worth, Stuart Turney

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)		
• All bidders determined to be eligible	X	
•		
•		
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	35
Section III. Proposed Services	25	20
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	9
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>64</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Milliman Inc
DATE: 08/01/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

Consensus that all bidders are eligible for Life and Health Actuarial Services Pre-qualified Vendor List.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Milliman Inc
DATE: 08/01/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	35

Evaluation Team Comments:

Qualified organization;
 Acceptable health actuarial experience;
 Healthcare focused team;
 Deep qualified FSA team;
 LTC actuary familiar with Unum Life Insurance Company of America.

Of note:
 Mandated benefit support projects in CA, CO, MD, and WA;
 EHB benchmark support projects in NY;
 ACA support projects in CA.

Subcontractors - none noted.

Insurance certificate:		
Federal Ins Co	Commercial liability	\$1M/\$2M
Federal Ins Co	Commercial auto	\$1M
ACE American Ins Co	Workers Comp	\$1M

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Milliman Inc
DATE: 08/01/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	25	20

Evaluation Team Comments:

Services to be Provided:

1. Mandated benefits
2. LTC rate review
3. ACA compliant
4. EHB benchmark

Exceedingly brief description of proposed services processes.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Milliman Inc
DATE: 08/01/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	Cost Proposal Being Scored	Score Possible	Score
	Consensus Score	25	9

Evaluation Team Comments:

<u>Function</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Hourly Rate</u>	<u>Staff Name</u>	<u>Staff Credential</u>
Lead	Senior Consulting	\$ 585	Laskowski	FSA
Manager	Principal Consulting	\$ 685	Collier	FSA
Expertise	Health Policy Consultant	\$ 355	Karcher	FSA
Expertise	Consulting	\$ 510	Lu	FSA
Expertise	Principal Consulting	\$ 685	Kempen	FSA
Expertise	Senior Consulting	\$ 585	Hamilton	FSA
Expertise	Senior Consulting	\$ 585	Nitz	FSA
Expertise	Principal Consulting	\$ 685	Dewey	FSA

Rates excessive; of note FSA Principal rate = \$685.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Novarest Inc
DATE: 08/01/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Department of Professional and Financial Regulation
Name of RFP Coordinator: Mary M. Hooper
Names of Evaluators: Mary Hooper, Sherry Worth, Stuart Turney

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)		
• All bidders determined to be eligible	X	
•		
•		
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	35
Section III. Proposed Services	25	20
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	25
<u>Total Points</u>	100	80

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Novarest Inc
DATE: 08/01/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

Consensus that all bidders are eligible for Life and Health Actuarial Services Pre-qualified Vendor List.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Novarest Inc
DATE: 08/01/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	35

Evaluation Team Comments:

Qualified organization;
 Acceptable credentials, yet not optimal;
 Healthcare focused;

Of note:

Overview of Organization • Has worked with BOI on proposed mandate reports and fertility benefits

Only 1 FSA and 3 ASA actuaries listed available for projects;

Mandate benefit review experience with ND & MD;

Asserted EHB Benchmark analysis projects for ND, MI, OR, IL, and VA.

Subcontractors - none noted.

Insurance certificate:

Great Divide Ins Co	Professional liability	\$3M
Hiscox Ins Co	Cyber/Prvacy/Network	\$2M
Hartford Fire	Workers Comp	\$1M

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Novarest Inc
DATE: 08/01/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	25	20

Evaluation Team Comments:

Services to be Provided:

1. Mandated benefits
2. Not to offer services – LTC rate review
3. ACA compliance
4. EHB benchmark

Sufficient EHB review process detail;
Sufficient ACA rate review process detail;
Sufficient mandated benefit review process detail.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Novarest Inc
DATE: 08/01/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	Cost Proposal Being Scored	Score Possible	Score
	Consensus Score	25	25

Evaluation Team Comments:

Function	Hourly Rate	Staff Credential	Staff Name
Lead	\$ 305	ASA	D Novak
Manager	\$ 255	ASA	R Caldwell
Support	\$ 285	FSA	A Halvorsen
Support	\$ 285	ASA	K Epperson
Technical Staff	\$ 155		A Rocha; W Novak; K Bell
Administrative	\$ 55		

Lead not an FSA;
 Manager not an FSA.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Oliver Wyman Actuarial Consulting Inc
DATE: 08/01/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Department of Professional and Financial Regulation
Name of RFP Coordinator: Mary M. Hooper
Names of Evaluators: Mary Hooper, Sherry Worth, Stuart Turney

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)		
• All bidders determined to be eligible	X	
•		
•		
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	45
Section III. Proposed Services	25	20
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	11
<u>Total Points</u>	100	76

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Oliver Wyman Actuarial Consulting Inc
DATE: 08/01/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

Consensus that all bidders are eligible for Life and Health Actuarial Services Pre-qualified Vendor List.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Oliver Wyman Actuarial Consulting Inc
DATE: 08/01/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	45

Evaluation Team Comments:

Qualified organization;
 Focused life & health experience;

Of note:
 5 FSA actuaries listed available for projects;
 Significant legislative experience;
 Numerous health insurance pricing projects;
 Numerous filing review support work;
 MA & RI ACA rate filing review support work
 NH health cost driver analysis work;
 MA LTC rate filing review work;
 EHB Benchmark analyses work (noted - not full submission) for HI, IL, MA, NC, TN.

Subcontractors - none noted.

Insurance certificate:

National Union Fire Ins Co	Commercial liability	\$3M/\$6M
National Union Fire Ins Co	Commercial auto	\$5M
National Union Fire Ins Co	Umbrella	\$5M
National Union & AIU Ins Co	Workers' comp	\$2M

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Oliver Wyman Actuarial Consulting Inc
DATE: 08/01/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	25	20

Evaluation Team Comments:

Services to be Provided:

1. Mandated benefits
2. LTC rate review
3. ACA compliance
4. EHB benchmark

Adequate description of each proposed service.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Oliver Wyman Actuarial Consulting Inc
DATE: 08/01/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	Cost Proposal Being Scored	Score Possible	Score
	Consensus Score	25	11

Evaluation Team Comments:

<u>Function</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Hourly Rate</u>	<u>Staff Name</u>	<u>Staff Credential</u>
Lead	Principal	\$ 500	Smagula	FSA
Co-lead	Principal	\$ 500	Schultz	FSA
Co-lead	Principal	\$ 500	Rivera	FSA
Co-lead	Senior Manager	\$ 410	Kaczmarek	FSA
Expertise	Partner	\$ 500	Tomczyk	FSA

Deep qualified FSA team.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Risk & Regulatory Consulting LLC
DATE: 08/01/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Department of Professional and Financial Regulation
Name of RFP Coordinator: Mary M. Hooper
Names of Evaluators: Mary Hooper, Sherry Worth, Stuart Turney

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)		
• All bidders determined to be eligible	X	
•		
•		
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	22
Section III. Proposed Services	25	12
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	24
<u>Total Points</u>	100	48

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Risk & Regulatory Consulting LLC
DATE: 08/01/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

Consensus that all bidders are eligible for Life and Health Actuarial Services Pre-qualified Vendor List.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Risk & Regulatory Consulting LLC
DATE: 08/01/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	22

Evaluation Team Comments:

Qualified organization;
Life & health experience.

Of note:
RRC primarily known for financial examination work & market conduct work;
Relatively recent established actuarial practice;
Team consists of 9 FSA and 7 ASA;
State regulators are primary clients;
LTC review with NE;
Have not explicitly valued impact of mandated benefits;
Provided rate review services in multiple states;
Significant valuation and life focused work;
No EHB redesign experience.

Subcontractors - none noted.

Insurance certificate:		
American Casualty of Reading PA Ins Co	Auto	\$1M
National Fire Ins Co of Hartford	General liability	\$1M/\$2M
Sentry Ins Co	Workers' Comp	\$1M
The Continental Ins Co	Umbrella	\$5M

MBOI has worked with firm in the past. Past engagements were financial/market conduct oriented.

Appearance of FSA ex-regulators.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Risk & Regulatory Consulting LLC
DATE: 08/01/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	25	12

Evaluation Team Comments:

Services to be Provided:

1. Mandated benefits
2. LTC rate review
3. ACA compliance
4. EHB benchmark

Cursory EHB project approach explanation;
Detailed ACA project approach explanation.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Risk & Regulatory Consulting LLC
DATE: 08/01/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	Cost Proposal Being Scored	Score Possible	Score
	Consensus Score	25	24

Evaluation Team Comments:

<u>Function</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Hourly Rate</u>	<u>Staff Name</u>	<u>Staff Credential</u>
Engagement Partner	Partner	\$ 305	Matson	FSA
Project leader	Director	\$ 275	Leiser	FSA
Project leader	Manager	\$ 275	Kiffel	FSA
Project leader	Manager	\$ 275	Nguyen	ASA
Project leader	Manager	\$ 275	Rarus	ASA
Project leader	Manager	\$ 275	Sheppard	FSA
Project leader	Manager	\$ 275	Widmer	FSA
Project support	Supervisor	\$ 245	Korean	ASA
Project support	Supervisor	\$ 245	Kuo	FSA
Project support	Supervisor	\$ 245	Larocque	ASA
Project support	Supervisor	\$ 245	Parker	ASA
Project support	Supervisor	\$ 245	Romanelli	ASA
Project support	Supervisor	\$ 245	Segal	FSA
Project support	Senior	\$ 215	Bender	ASA
Project support	Senior	\$ 215	Cooper	FSA
Project support	Senior	\$ 215	Ehrsmann	FSA
Staff	Staff	\$ 175		
Administration	Administration	\$ 60		

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Wakely and HMA Company
DATE: 08/01/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Department of Professional and Financial Regulation
Name of RFP Coordinator: Mary M. Hooper
Names of Evaluators: Mary Hooper, Sherry Worth, Stuart Turney

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)		
• All bidders determined to be eligible	X	
•		
•		
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	40
Section III. Proposed Services	25	15
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	11
<u>Total Points</u>	100	66

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Wakely and HMA Company
DATE: 08/01/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

Consensus that all bidders are eligible for Life and Health Actuarial Services Pre-qualified Vendor List.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Wakely and HMA Company
DATE: 08/01/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	40

Evaluation Team Comments:

Qualified organization;
National recognized firm;
Healthcare focused ASA leading project.

Of note:

Significant legislative experience in several states;
Health insurance pricing legislative support work;
Health insurance filing review legislative support work;
Worked with more than 10 states with EHB;
Three current EHB projects;
Mandate benefit review work related to IVF;
1332 waiver experience working with MN, MT, & WY;
Standardized plan review work with various states;
ACA rate review work for GA;
Experience with all aspects of actuarial services needed.

Subcontractors - none noted.

Insurance certificate:

Great Northern Ins Co	Commercial liability	\$1M/\$2M
Great Northern Ins Co	Commercial auto	\$1M
Federal Ins Co	Umbrella	\$10M
Pacific Employers Inc Co	Workers Comp	\$1M
Allied World Ins Co	E&O	\$5M
Fortegra Specialty Ins Co	Cyber	\$5M

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Wakely and HMA Company
DATE: 08/01/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	25	15

Evaluation Team Comments:

Services to be Provided:

1. Mandated benefits
2. LTC rate review
3. ACA compliance
4. EHB benchmark

Can summarize additional benefits in other states;
Demonstrated use of proprietary internal datasets.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Wakely and HMA Company
DATE: 08/01/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	Cost Proposal Being Scored	Score Possible	Score
	Consensus Score	25	11

Evaluation Team Comments:

Function	Title	Hourly Rate	Staff Name Credential
Lead	Actuary II	\$ 555	Sauter, ASA
Manager	Actuary I	\$ 425	Stefan, ASA
Project Advisor	Director	\$ 605	Cohen
Project Advisor	Principal	\$ 620	Peper, FSA
Support	Analyst A	\$ 300	unidentified
Support	Analyst B	\$ 210	unidentified

Matt Sauter, ASA for project lead – EHB projects;
 Jenna Stefan, ASA for project manager – ACA focus;
 Project Advisor rates excessive, of note \$605 for a non-qualified actuary;
 Principal FSA rates excessive, of note \$620.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202406119

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Life and Health Actuarial Services

BIDDER NAME: BerryDunn

DATE: 7/29/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Mary Hooper

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Professional and Financial Regulation

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Has worked with BOI on different projects not these specific ones*
- Local company headquartered in Maine*
- 4 FSA actuaries listed available for projects*
- Has worked with legislation, pricing health insurance, reviewing filings*
- Worked with state regulators*
- NH for market conduct*
- MD for mandate bft reviews*

II. Proposed Services

Mandate bft review their core services – biomarker testing in 2024 and family building

Provided detailed description of process

Does not perform LTC rate review

Detailed explanation of ACA rate review

Basic description of EHB review

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202406119

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Life and Health Actuarial Services

BIDDER NAME: Lewis & Ellis

DATE: 7/29/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Mary Hooper

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Professional and Financial Regulation

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

- 4 FSA on team
- primary clients are state regulators
- staff that have served as LTC regulators on behalf of state DOIs. and reviewers predominately consist of associates and fellows of the Society of Actuaries (SOA) with various LTC experience including valuation, pricing, experience studies. Ten states have contracted with L&E to perform LTC rate reviews for the stated time periods.
- Current contract with Maine for rate reviews
- mandates in various states, including
- consultants have performed services related to EHB Benchmark plan revisions, most recently for the District of Columbia, Nevada, and Kansas. We can assist with the CMS application process and provide the required actuarial certifications.
- ACA rate review for multiple states including NV and KY
- LTC rate reviews – 32 since 2013
- Kansas and Texas Offices

II. Proposed Services

Listed all the items reviewed for ACA rate filings

Provided details about LTC process and items reviewed, mentioned Maine specific regulations, ASOPs

Provided a brief description of mandate review process including Maine statute and the defrayal requirement.

Mentioned basic steps for EHB benchmark redesign

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202406119

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Life and Health Actuarial Services

BIDDER NAME: Milliman

DATE: 7/29/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Mary Hooper

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Professional and Financial Regulation

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience – national actuarial firm

1. Overview of Organization

- *mandates in various states, including California, Colorado, Maryland, and Washington*
- *concern with quality and accuracy of work due to review of MGARA, merged market work*
- *EHB work for NY 2021 & 2022*
- *ACA work for CA during initial implementation*
- *Not much relevant work mentioned recently except CA*
- *LTC work with companies except valuation with Maine*

II. Proposed Services

Brief description of processes

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202406119

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Life and Health Actuarial Services

BIDDER NAME: NovaRest

DATE: 7/29/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Mary Hooper

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Professional and Financial Regulation

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Has worked with BOI on proposed mandate reports and fertility benefits*
- 1 FSA and 3 ASA actuaries listed available for projects*
- No LTC rate filing review*
- Mandate benefit reviews for ME, ND & MD*
- Our team has experience performing a variety of EHB Benchmark analyses for states and regulatory agencies that include:*
- • ND, MI, OR, IL, VA*

II. Proposed Services

Not for LTC rate review

Very detailed EHB review process described

Very detailed ACA rate review and mandate review process

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202406119

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Life and Health Actuarial Services

BIDDER NAME: Oliver Wyman

DATE: 7/29/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Mary Hooper

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Professional and Financial Regulation

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience – nationally recognized actuarial firm

1. Overview of Organization

- *Has worked with BOI on different projects not these specific ones*
- *5 FSA actuaries listed available for projects*
- *Has worked with legislation, pricing health insurance, reviewing filings*
- *Worked with MA & RI state regulators on ACA rate filings*
- *Health cost drivers for NH analysis*
- *LTC rate filings w/ MA*
- *experience performing a variety of EHB Benchmark analyses but not full submissions for states and regulatory agencies that include:*
 - *Hawaii, Illinois, Massachusetts, Maine, North Carolina, Tennessee, and CCIO*

II. Proposed Services

Brief description of each proposed service

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202406119

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Life and Health Actuarial Services

BIDDER NAME: RRC

DATE: 7/29/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Mary Hooper

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Professional and Financial Regulation

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

Overview of Organization – newer firm 2012

- *9 FSA and many ASA on team*
- *primary clients are state regulators*
- *LTC review with NE*
- *Have not explicitly valued impact of mandated bfts for a state*
- *Rate reviews multiple states*
- *Mostly valuation and life focused work*
- *No EHB redesign exp*

II. Proposed Services

Cursory explanation of EHB project

Very descriptive process for ACA reviews

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202406119

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Life and Health Actuarial Services

BIDDER NAME: Wakely

DATE: 7/29/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Mary Hooper

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Professional and Financial Regulation

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- *Has worked with BOI on different projects not these specific ones*
- *Has worked with legislation, pricing health insurance, reviewing filings*
- *Worked with more than 10 states with EHB – and three states currently*
- *Mandate estimates for IVF*
- *1332 waiver experience working with states: MN, MT, WY*

2. Organizational Chart

- *Matt Sauter, ASA for project lead – EHB projects*
- *Jenna Stefan, ASA for project manager – ACA focus*
- *Julie Peper, FSA advisor*
- *Micheal Cohen, PhD advisor*
- *Denver office*

*3. Worked with states on standardized plans, ACA rate review: GA
Experience with all aspects of actuarial services needed.*

II. Proposed Services

FSA as advisor, Analysts on projects

Can summarize other additional benefits in other states

Use of their internal datasets

STATE OF MAINE INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Berry Dunn McNeil & Parker LLC
DATE: 07/26/2024
EVALUATOR NAME: SE Turney
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: PFR

Instructions: The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department’s RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.

Individual Evaluator Comments:

1. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 Berry Dunn McNeil & Parker LLC (“BD”) is a Maine based organization with nine offices in other states.
 Bid state that “Our Health Analytics Practice Group has regularly provided similar services as requested by MBOI for over 20 years.” Reviewer knows of only one two-year BD contract. Reviewer noted that Compass Health Analytics merged with BD in 2017. MBOI had extensive experience with Compass Health Analytics.
 - a. Overview of Organization
 Qualified organization; acceptable health actuarial experience; healthcare focused
 - b. Subcontractors

 None noted.
 - c. Organizational Chart

<u>Function</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Hourly Rate</u>	<u>Staff Credential</u>	<u>Staff Name</u>
Lead	Principal/Senior	\$ 425	FSA	Elwood
Support	Principal/Senior	\$ 425	ASA	Kennedy
Support	Senior Actuary	\$ 390	FSA	Wilson
Technical	Senior Actuary	\$ 390	FSA	Shields
Technical	Senior Actuary	\$ 390	FSA	Qin
Technical	Senior HP Manager	\$ 325		Hamilton
Technical	Senior HP Analyst	\$ 250		Nash
Technical	Senior Data Analyst	\$ 250		Miller

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Berry Dunn McNeil & Parker LLC
DATE: 07/26/2024
EVALUATOR NAME: SE Turney
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: PFR

2. Proposed Services

- a. Services to be Provided
 - 1. Mandated benefits
 - 2. No service offered - LTC rate review
 - 3. ACA compliant
 - 4. EHB benchmark

MBOI has knowledge of bidder's life and health, P&C, and examination support. May want to contact DC regarding EHB benchmark work. May want to contact CO and NVDC regarding mandated benefit work. No clear mandated benefits reference.

- b. Implementation – Work Plan
Reasonable work plan; reviewer is not an actuary, as such, refrains from opining on work plan merit.

c. Insurance certificate		
Hanover American Ins Co	Commercial liability	\$1M/\$2M
Massachusetts Bay Ins Co	Commercial auto	\$1M
The Hanover Ins Co	Umbrella	\$8M
Maine Employers Mutual Ins Co	Workers comp	\$1M
Continental Casualty Ins Co	Professional liability	\$1M/\$1M

Acceptable PQVL bidder.

STATE OF MAINE INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Lewis & Ellis LLC
DATE: 07/25/2024
EVALUATOR NAME: SE Turney
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: PFR

Instructions: The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.

Individual Evaluator Comments:

1. Organization Qualifications and Experience

MBOI has extensive favorable experience with Lewis & Ellis, Inc.

a. Overview of Organization

Qualified organization; national recognized firm; acceptable health actuarial experience healthcare focused

b. Subcontractors

None noted.

c. Organizational Chart

<u>Function</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Rate</u>	<u>Credential</u>
	Principal	\$ 500	
	FSA	\$ 375	
	ASA	\$ 300	
	Data Science	\$ 250	
	Senior Associate	\$ 250	unidentified
	Associate	\$ 220	unidentified

Unclear relationship between proposed L&E team, L&E titles and L&E rates.

STATE OF MAINE INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Lewis & Ellis LLC
DATE: 07/25/2024
EVALUATOR NAME: SE Turney
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: PFR

2. Proposed Services

a. Services to be Provided

1. Mandated benefits
2. LTC rate review
3. ACA compliant
4. EHB benchmark

MBOI has knowledge of bidder's life and health, P&C, and examination support. May want to contact DC regarding EHB benchmark work. May want to contact CO and NV regarding mandated benefit work. No clear mandated benefits reference.

b. Implementation – Work Plan

Reasonable work plan; reviewer is not an actuary, as such, refrains from opining on work plan merit.

c. Insurance certificate

Federal Ins Co	Commercial liability	\$1M/\$2M
Federal Ins Co	Commercial auto	\$1M
Federal Ins Co	Umbrella	\$5M
Federal Ins Co	Workers comp	\$1M
Federal Ins Co	Crime	\$1M
Bridgeway Ins Co	Professional liability	\$5M
Trisura Ins Co	Cyber liability	\$5M

Acceptable PQVL bidder.

STATE OF MAINE INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Milliman Inc
DATE: 07/26/2024
EVALUATOR NAME: SE Turney
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: PFR

Instructions: The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.

Individual Evaluator Comments:

1. Organization Qualifications and Experience

a. Overview of Organization

Qualified organization; national recognized firm; strong life and health experience. MBOI has engaged Milliman in the past and is presently engaged. Milliman has significant long term care experience.

b. Subcontractors

Not specifically included or excluded.

c. Organizational Chart

		Hourly	Staff	Staff
Function	Title	Rate	Name	Credential
Lead	Senior Consulting	\$ 585	Laskowski	FSA
Manager	Principal Consulting	\$ 685	Collier	FSA
Expertise	Health Policy Consultant	\$ 355	Karcher	FSA
Expertise	Consulting	\$ 510	Lu	FSA
Expertise	Principal Consulting	\$ 685	Kempen	FSA
Expertise	Senior Consulting	\$ 585	Hamilton	FSA
Expertise	Senior Consulting	\$ 585	Nitz	FSA
Expertise	Principal Consulting	\$ 685	Dewey	FSA

Deep qualified FSA team. LTC actuary Lu is familiar with Unum Life Insurance Company of America.

Rates excessive; of note \$685 for FSA.

STATE OF MAINE INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Milliman Inc
DATE: 07/26/2024
EVALUATOR NAME: SE Turney
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: PFR

2. Proposed Services

a. Services to be Provided

1. Mandated benefits
2. LTC rate review
3. ACA compliance
4. EHB benchmark

MBOI has knowledge of bidder's long term rate reserve analysis work.

b. Implementation – Work Plan

Reasonable work plan; time frame examples; reviewer is not an actuary, as such, refrains from opining on work plan merit.

c. Insurance certificate

Federal Ins Co	Commercial liability	\$1M/\$2M
Federal Ins Co	Commercial auto	\$1M
ACE American Ins Co	Workers Comp	\$1M

Acceptable PQVL bidder. Review cost estimates carefully. No evidence of cyber insurance or professional liability insurance.

STATE OF MAINE INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Novarest Inc
DATE: 07/24/2024
EVALUATOR NAME: SE Turney
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: PFR

Instructions: The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.

Individual Evaluator Comments:

1. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 The MBOI has engaged Novarest in the past.
 Organization is qualified.

a. Overview of Organization
 Nineteen years - Primary consulting actuary firm performing mandated benefit analyses for the MBOI;
 Supported IL, MD, ND, NJ, NY, and SC mandated benefit projects;
 Supported AK, AZ, CA, CO, GA, IL, IO, ME, MN, NJ, NM, PA, PR, RI, VT, and DC rate filing review work;
 Supported state regulators, NAIC, HHS ACA implementation;
 Specific Maine Knowledge;

b. Subcontractors
 None noted.

c. Organizational Chart

	Hourly	Staff	Staff Name	
Function	Rate	Credential	Credential	
Lead	\$ 305	ASA	D Novak	
Manager	\$ 255	ASA	R Caldwell	
Support	\$ 285	FSA	A Halvorson	
Support	\$ 285	ASA	K Epperson	
Technical Staff	\$ 155		A Rocha; W Novak; K Bell	
Administrative	\$ 55			

Lead not an FSA; Manager not an FSA; questionable lead actuarial credentialing.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Novarest Inc
DATE: 07/24/2024
EVALUATOR NAME: SE Turney
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: PFR

2. Proposed Services

a. Services to be Provided

1. Mandated benefits
2. Not to offer services – LTC rate review
3. ACA compliance
4. EHB benchmark

MBOI has knowledge of bidder’s mandated benefit work, and rate filing work; would like to contact IL and ND for EHB related work references.

b. Implementation – Work Plan

Nothing necessarily distinctive of note. Reviewer is not an actuary, as such, refrains from opining on work plan merit.

c. Liability Insurance certificate

Great Divide Ins Co	Professional liability	\$3M
Hiscox Ins Co	Cyber/Prvacy/Network	\$2M
Hartford Fire	Workers Comp	\$1M

Acceptable PQVL bidder.

STATE OF MAINE INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Oliver Wyman Actuarial Consulting Inc
DATE: 07/26/2024
EVALUATOR NAME: SE Turney
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: PFR

Instructions: The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.

Individual Evaluator Comments:

1. Organization Qualifications and Experience

a. Overview of Organization

Qualified organization; national, recognized firm; strong life and health experience.

b. Subcontractors

None noted.

c. Organizational Chart

		Hourly	Staff	Staff
Function	Title	Rate	Name	Credential
Lead	Principal	\$ 500	Smagula	FSA
Co-lead	Principal	\$ 500	Schultz	FSA
Co-lead	Principal	\$ 500	Rivera	FSA
Co-lead	Senior Manager	\$ 410	Kaczmarek	FSA
Expertise	Partner	\$ 500	Tomczyk	FSA

Deep qualified FSA team. Principal Smagula is familiar with the MBOI.

2. Proposed Services

a. Services to be Provided

1. Mandated benefits
2. LTC rate review
3. ACA compliance
4. EHB benchmark

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Oliver Wyman Actuarial Consulting Inc
DATE: 07/26/2024
EVALUATOR NAME: SE Turney
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: PFR

MBOI has knowledge of bidder's and certain individual employee(s) past healthcare consultation services .

b. Implementation – Work Plan

Reasonable work plan; reviewer is not an actuary, as such, refrains from opining on work plan merit.

c. Insurance certificate

National Union Fire Ins Co	Commercial liability	\$3M/\$6M
National Union Fire Ins Co	Commercial auto	\$5M
National Union Fire Ins Co	Umbrella	\$5M
National Union & AIU Ins Co	Workers' comp	\$2M

Acceptable PQVL bidder. Review cost estimates carefully.

STATE OF MAINE INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Risk & Regulatory Consulting LLC
DATE: 07/25/2024
EVALUATOR NAME: SE Turney
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: PFR

c. Organizational Chart

<u>Function</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Hourly Rate</u>	<u>Staff Name</u>	<u>Staff Credential</u>
Engagement Partner	Partner	\$ 305	Matson	FSA
Project leader	Director	\$ 275	Leiser	FSA
Project leader	Manager	\$ 275	Kiffel	FSA
Project leader	Manager	\$ 275	Nguyen	ASA
Project leader	Manager	\$ 275	Rarus	ASA
Project leader	Manager	\$ 275	Sheppard	FSA
Project leader	Manager	\$ 275	Widmer	FSA
Project support	Supervisor	\$ 245	Korean	ASA
Project support	Supervisor	\$ 245	Kuo	FSA
Project support	Supervisor	\$ 245	Larocque	ASA
Project support	Supervisor	\$ 245	Parker	ASA
Project support	Supervisor	\$ 245	Romanelli	ASA
Project support	Supervisor	\$ 245	Segal	FSA
Project support	Senior	\$ 215	Bender	ASA
Project support	Senior	\$ 215	Cooper	FSA
Project support	Senior	\$ 215	Ehrsmann	FSA
Staff	Staff	\$ 175		
Administration	Administration	\$ 60		

Rates appear to be relatively reasonable.

2. Proposed Services

a. Services to be Provided

1. Mandated benefits
2. LTC rate review
3. ACA compliance
4. EHB benchmark

MBOI has worked with firm in the past. Past engagements were financial/market conduct oriented. Past engagements not optimal. Would recommend contacting NJ, GA, and NE references.

b. Implementation – Work Plan

Reasonable work plan; time frame examples; reviewer is not an actuary, as such, refrains from opining on work plan merit.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Risk & Regulatory Consulting LLC
DATE: 07/25/2024
EVALUATOR NAME: SE Turney
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: PFR

c. Insurance certificate

American Casualty of Reading PA Ins Co	Auto	\$1M
National Fire Ins Co of Hartford	General liability	\$1M/\$2M
Sentry Ins Co	Workers' Comp	\$1M
The Continental Ins Co	Umbrella	\$5M

Acceptable PQVL bidder based on reference outcome.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Risk & Regulatory Consulting LLC
DATE: 07/25/2024
EVALUATOR NAME: SE Turney
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: PFR

Instructions: The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.

Individual Evaluator Comments:

1. Organization Qualifications and Experience

a. Overview of Organization

Qualified organization; extensive FSA bench. healthcare focused

b. Subcontractors

None noted.

STATE OF MAINE INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Wakely and HMA Company
DATE: 07/25/2024
EVALUATOR NAME: SE Turney
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: PFR

Instructions: The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.

Individual Evaluator Comments:

1. Organization Qualifications and Experience

a. Overview of Organization

Qualified organization; national recognized firm; healthcare focused.

b. Subcontractors

None noted.

c. Organizational Chart

		Hourly	Staff Name
Function	Title	Rate	Credential
Lead	Actuary II	\$ 555	Sauter, ASA
Manager	Actuary I	\$ 425	Stefan, ASA
Project Advisor	Director	\$ 605	Cohen
Project Advisor	Principal	\$ 620	Peper, FSA
Support	Analyst A	\$ 300	unidentified
Support	Analyst B	\$ 210	unidentified

Lead not an FSA; Manager not an FSA; questionable actuarial credentialing for \$555/\$425 per hour, respectively.

Project Advisor rates excessive; of note \$605 for a non-qualified actuary.

STATE OF MAINE INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP NUMBER: 202406119
RFP TITLE: PQVL - Life and Health Actuarial Services
BIDDER NAME: Wakely and HMA Company
DATE: 07/25/2024
EVALUATOR NAME: SE Turney
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: PFR

2. Proposed Services

a. Services to be Provided

1. Mandated benefits
2. Not to offer services – LTC rate review
3. Not to offer services - ACA compliance
4. EHB benchmark

MBOI has knowledge of bidder's individual/small group merger project and geographic rating project; would like to contact VT, WA and CO for EHB related work references. No clear mandated benefits reference.

Bidder not to provide LTC rate review services. Bidder not to provide ACA compliant plan rate review services.

b. Implementation – Work Plan

Reasonable work plan; time frame examples; reviewer is not an actuary, as such, refrains from opining on work plan merit.

c. Insurance certificate

Great Northern Ins Co	Commercial liability	\$1M/\$2M
Great Northern Ins Co	Commercial auto	\$1M
Federal Ins Co	Umbrella	\$10M
Pacific Employers Inc Co	Workers Comp	\$1M
Allied World Ins Co	E&O	\$5M
Fortegra Specialty Ins Co	Cyber	\$5M

Acceptable PQVL bidder. Review cost estimates carefully.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202406119

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Life and Health Actuarial Services

BIDDER NAME: BerryDunn

DATE: 7/30/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Sherry Worth

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Professional and Financial Regulation

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - 5 qualified actuaries listed with decades of experience.
 - 4 litigation cases.
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - None

- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - Mandate reports at the core of their services. They have done several similar to recent reports conducted in Maine.
 - No LTC review.
 - Doesn't seem to have as much experience in EHB redesign.

 - 2. Implementation – Work Plan
 - Provided detailed steps for their approach.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202406119

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Life and Health Actuarial Services

BIDDER NAME: Lewis & Ellis

DATE: 7/30/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Sherry Worth

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Professional and Financial Regulation

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Directions: *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 1. Overview of Organization
 - 5 FSA's with decades of experience would be assigned to Maine.
 2. Subcontractors
 - None

- II. Proposed Services
 1. Services to be Provided
 - They have the expertise and experience to perform all four of the areas outlined in the RFP.
 2. Implementation – Work Plan
 - Plan and details for working on LTC.
 - Familiarity with the EHB redesign process and listed a detailed plan.
 - In-depth plan on ACA plan reviews.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202406119

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Life and Health Actuarial Services

BIDDER NAME: Milliman

DATE: 7/30/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Sherry Worth

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Professional and Financial Regulation

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Directions: *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 1. Overview of Organization
 - One of the largest actuarial consulting firms in the world with over 4,000 actuaries.
 - Proposing to provide 8 FSAs for the Maine project team.
 - Clients all over the country, including regulated entities. Conflict concerns?
 2. Subcontractors
 - Did not specify.

- II. Proposed Services
 1. Services to be Provided
 - Proposing to provide services on all 4 areas of the RFP.
 - Has developed proprietary Milliman LTC guidelines.
 - Has assisted Maine with Unum reserve monitoring.
 2. Implementation – Work Plan
 - Provided a brief generalized description but not many details.
 - Weak detailed plan.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202406119

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Life and Health Actuarial Services

BIDDER NAME: NovaRest

DATE: 7/30/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Sherry Worth

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Professional and Financial Regulation

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Directions: *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - 3 ASA's and 1 FSA plus technical staff.
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - None
- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - They submitted detailed plans to provide services for Mandated benefit reports, ACA review, and EHB redesign.
 - No LTC review.
 - They have conducted mandated benefit analyses in Maine and 6 other states.
 - Have provided support and analysis on EHB redesigns in 5 states.
 - 2. Implementation – Work Plan
 - Outlined a plan for Mandated benefit analysis, which matches what they have done in the past for Maine.
 - Detailed plan for ACA plan review.
 - Strong proposal for EHB redesign with check-ins and input from the state.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202406119

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Life and Health Actuarial Services

BIDDER NAME: Oliver Wyman

DATE: 7/30/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Sherry Worth

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Professional and Financial Regulation

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Directions: *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - Listed 4 FSA's to be assigned to Maine projects and 11 total at the company.
 - Extensive experience providing support to regulators.
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - None anticipated.
- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - Proposing to provide support for all four areas of the RFP.
 - 2. Implementation – Work Plan
 - Detailed plan and demonstration of understanding for each of the four areas of the RFP.
 - Budget monitoring, status updates and reports, and other internal controls.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202406119

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Life and Health Actuarial Services

BIDDER NAME: Risk & Regulatory Consulting

DATE: 7/30/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Sherry Worth

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Professional and Financial Regulation

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Directions: *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - Listed 16 actuaries on staff who may be assigned to a particular project based on expertise and availability at the time.
 - Primary clients are state regulators.
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - None
- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - Propose to provide service in all 4 areas.
 - Will assign different work based on expertise.
 - 2. Implementation – Work Plan
 - Provided a step-by-step work plan for each of the four areas requested in the RFP.
 - Least detail given to EHB redesign.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202406119

RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Life and Health Actuarial Services

BIDDER NAME: Wakely

DATE: 7/30/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Sherry Worth

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Professional and Financial Regulation

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Directions: *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - They would assign 2 ASA's and 1 FSA to work with Maine.
 - Also a Policy analytics individual with 10 years of experience working on health policy.
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - None
- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - Proposing to work on EHB Analysis and mandate reports.
 - No proposal to work on LTC or ACA compliant plan rate filing review.
 - 2. Implementation – Work Plan
 - Provided a detail plan on EHB analysis with a timeline and examples of work they did in other states.
 - Has worked with more than 10 states on EHB analysis.



**STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF PROFESSIONAL AND
FINANCIAL REGULATION**

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Anne Head
Commissioner

**AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: 202406119
RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Life
and Health Actuarial Services**

I, Mary Hooper
accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Professional and Financial Regulation. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be 'M. Hooper', written over a horizontal line.

Signature

7/24/2024
Date



**STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF PROFESSIONAL AND
FINANCIAL REGULATION**

**Janet T. Mills
Governor**

**Anne Head
Commissioner**

**AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: 202406119
RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Life
and Health Actuarial Services**

I, Stuart E. Turney accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Professional and Financial Regulation. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Stuart E. Turney'.

Signature

07/24/2024
Date



STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF PROFESSIONAL AND
FINANCIAL REGULATION

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Anne Head
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: 202406119
RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Life
and Health Actuarial Services

I, Sherry Worth accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Professional and Financial Regulation. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

Sherry Worth
Signature

7/25/2024
Date