

State of Maine

RFP / Proposal Master Score Sheet

Instructions: Complete the Master Score Sheet below providing all of the requested information for each bidder that submitted a proposal in response to the RFP. This document is to be included in the Selection Package submitted to the Division of Procurement Services for review/approval.

SCORESHEET FOR RFP#201903044: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development									
PROPOSAL SUBMITTED BY:		CCSWCD Mosher Brook		County of Aroostook Cross Lake		CWD Wilson Pond		KCSWCD China Lake	
COST:		Cost:	\$22,017.87	Cost:	\$17,419	Cost:	\$18,300	Cost:	\$27,590
EVALUATION ITEM	POINTS AVAIL.								
Section I: Applicant Qualifications Experience	15	11		9		13		11	
Section II. Relative Value of Waterbody	10	1		6		4		8	
Section III. Water Quality Problem	10	3		6		8		9	
Section IV. Nature Extent Severity NPS Prob.	10	4		8		6		6	
Section V. Feasibility for Success	25	15		19		13		18	
Section VI. Cost Effectiveness	25	12		23		14		18	
Section VII. Comprehensive Plan	5	5		4		4		4	
Total	100	51		75		62		74	

PROPOSAL SUBMITTED BY:		Town of Brunswick Mare Brook							
COST:		Cost:	\$35,254.04	Cost:		Cost:		Cost:	
EVALUATION ITEM	POINTS AVAIL.								
Section I. Applicant Qualifications Experience	15	12							
Section II. Relative Value of Waterbody	10	7							
Section III. Water Quality Problem	10	5							
Section IV. Nature Extent Severity NPS Prob.	10	5							
Section V. Feasibility for Success	25	21							
Section VI. Cost Effectiveness	25	18							
Section VII. Comprehensive Plan	5	5							
Total	100	73							



JANET T. MILLS
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION



GERALD D. REID
COMMISSIONER

Ryan Pelletier
County of Aroostook
144 Sweden Street, Suite 1
Caribou, ME 04736

June 10, 2019

RE: Notice of Conditional Contract Awards - RFP#201903044, Watershed-based Plan Development

Dear Mr. Pelletier:

This letter is in regard to the Request for Proposals (RFP) referenced above, issued by the State of Maine Department of Environmental Protection. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP and is hereby announcing its conditional contract awards to the following bidders:

Bidder	Proposal Title
County of Aroostook	Cross Lake Watershed-Based Management Plan Development
Kennebec County SWCD	China Lake Watershed-Based Plan Development
Town of Brunswick	Mare Brook Watershed-Based Plan Development

The bidders listed above received the evaluation team's highest rankings. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidders soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6). This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for submitting a proposal to help improve and protect Maine's waters.

Sincerely,

Wendy Garland
NPS Program Coordinator, Bureau of Water Quality

AUGUSTA
17 STATE HOUSE STATION
AUGUSTA, MAINE 04333-0017
(207) 287-7688 FAX: (207) 287-7826

BANGOR
106 HOGAN ROAD, SUITE 6
BANGOR, MAINE 04401
(207) 941-4570 FAX: (207) 941-4584

PORTLAND
312 CANCO ROAD
PORTLAND, MAINE 04103
(207) 822-6300 FAX: (207) 822-6303

PRESQUE ISLE
1235 CENTRAL DRIVE, SKYWAY PARK
PRESQUE ISLE, MAINE 04769
(207) 764-0477 FAX: (207) 760-3143

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



JANET T. MILLS
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION



GERALD D. REID
COMMISSIONER

John Eldridge, Town Manager
Town of Brunswick
85 Union Street
Brunswick, ME 04011

June 10, 2019

RE: Notice of Conditional Contract Awards - RFP#201903044, Watershed-based Plan Development

Dear Mr. Eldridge:

This letter is in regard to the Request for Proposals (RFP) referenced above, issued by the State of Maine Department of Environmental Protection. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP and is hereby announcing its conditional contract awards to the following bidders:

Bidder	Proposal Title
County of Aroostook	Cross Lake Watershed-Based Management Plan Development
Kennebec County SWCD	China Lake Watershed-Based Plan Development
Town of Brunswick	Mare Brook Watershed-Based Plan Development

The bidders listed above received the evaluation team's highest rankings. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidders soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6). This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for submitting a proposal to help improve and protect Maine's waters.

Sincerely,

Wendy Garland
NPS Program Coordinator, Bureau of Water Quality

AUGUSTA
17 STATE HOUSE STATION
AUGUSTA, MAINE 04333-0017
(207) 287-7688 FAX: (207) 287-7826

BANGOR
106 HOGAN ROAD, SUITE 6
BANGOR, MAINE 04401
(207) 941-4570 FAX: (207) 941-4584

PORTLAND
312 CANCO ROAD
PORTLAND, MAINE 04103
(207) 822-6300 FAX: (207) 822-6303

PRESQUE ISLE
1235 CENTRAL DRIVE, SKYWAY PARK
PRESQUE ISLE, MAINE 04769
(207) 764-0477 FAX: (207) 760-3143

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



JANET T. MILLS
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION



GERALD D. REID
COMMISSIONER

Carol Ann Doucette, Chair
Cumberland County SWCD
35 Main Street, Suite 3
Windham, ME 04062

June 10, 2019

RE: Notice of Conditional Contract Awards - RFP#201903044, Watershed-based Plan Development

Dear Carol Ann:

This letter is in regard to the Request for Proposals (RFP) referenced above, issued by the State of Maine Department of Environmental Protection. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP and is hereby announcing its conditional contract awards to the following bidders:

Bidder	Proposal Title
County of Aroostook	Cross Lake Watershed-Based Management Plan Development
Kennebec County SWCD	China Lake Watershed-Based Plan Development
Town of Brunswick	Mare Brook Watershed-Based Plan Development

The bidders listed above received the evaluation team's highest rankings. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidders soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6). This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for submitting a proposal to help improve and protect Maine's waters.

Sincerely,

Wendy Garland
NPS Program Coordinator, Bureau of Water Quality

AUGUSTA
17 STATE HOUSE STATION
AUGUSTA, MAINE 04333-0017
(207) 287-7688 FAX: (207) 287-7826

BANGOR
106 HOGAN ROAD, SUITE 6
BANGOR, MAINE 04401
(207) 941-4570 FAX: (207) 941-4584

PORTLAND
312 CANCO ROAD
PORTLAND, MAINE 04103
(207) 822-6300 FAX: (207) 822-6303

PRESQUE ISLE
1235 CENTRAL DRIVE, SKYWAY PARK
PRESQUE ISLE, MAINE 04769
(207) 764-0477 FAX: (207) 760-3143

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



JANET T. MILLS
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION



GERALD D. REID
COMMISSIONER

Bill Monagle
Cobbossee Watershed District
P.O. Box 418
Winthrop, ME 04364

June 10, 2019

RE: Notice of Conditional Contract Awards - RFP#201903044, Watershed-based Plan Development

Dear Bill:

This letter is in regard to the Request for Proposals (RFP) referenced above, issued by the State of Maine Department of Environmental Protection. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP and is hereby announcing its conditional contract awards to the following bidders:

Bidder	Proposal Title
County of Aroostook	Cross Lake Watershed-Based Management Plan Development
Kennebec County SWCD	China Lake Watershed-Based Plan Development
Town of Brunswick	Mare Brook Watershed-Based Plan Development

The bidders listed above received the evaluation team's highest rankings. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidders soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6). This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for submitting a proposal to help improve and protect Maine's waters.

Sincerely,

Wendy Garland
NPS Program Coordinator, Bureau of Water Quality

AUGUSTA
17 STATE HOUSE STATION
AUGUSTA, MAINE 04333-0017
(207) 287-7688 FAX: (207) 287-7826

BANGOR
106 HOGAN ROAD, SUITE 6
BANGOR, MAINE 04401
(207) 941-4570 FAX: (207) 941-4584

PORTLAND
312 CANCO ROAD
PORTLAND, MAINE 04103
(207) 822-6300 FAX: (207) 822-6303

PRESQUE ISLE
1235 CENTRAL DRIVE, SKYWAY PARK
PRESQUE ISLE, MAINE 04769
(207) 764-0477 FAX: (207) 760-3143

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



JANET T. MILLS
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION



GERALD D. REID
COMMISSIONER

Dale Finseth
Kennebec County SWCD
21 Enterprise Drive, Suite #1
Augusta, ME 04330

June 10, 2019

RE: Notice of Conditional Contract Awards - RFP#201903044, Watershed-based Plan Development

Dear Dale:

This letter is in regard to the Request for Proposals (RFP) referenced above, issued by the State of Maine Department of Environmental Protection. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP and is hereby announcing its conditional contract awards to the following bidders:

Bidder	Proposal Title
County of Aroostook	Cross Lake Watershed-Based Management Plan Development
Kennebec County SWCD	China Lake Watershed-Based Plan Development
Town of Brunswick	Mare Brook Watershed-Based Plan Development

The bidders listed above received the evaluation team's highest rankings. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidders soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6). This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for submitting a proposal to help improve and protect Maine's waters.

Sincerely,

Wendy Garland
NPS Program Coordinator, Bureau of Water Quality

AUGUSTA
17 STATE HOUSE STATION
AUGUSTA, MAINE 04333-0017
(207) 287-7688 FAX: (207) 287-7826

BANGOR
106 HOGAN ROAD, SUITE 6
BANGOR, MAINE 04401
(207) 941-4570 FAX: (207) 941-4584

PORTLAND
312 CANCO ROAD
PORTLAND, MAINE 04103
(207) 822-6300 FAX: (207) 822-6303

PRESQUE ISLE
1235 CENTRAL DRIVE, SKYWAY PARK
PRESQUE ISLE, MAINE 04769
(207) 764-0477 FAX: (207) 760-3143

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: KCSWCD (China Lake)

DATE: 5/29/19

Instructions: The purpose of this form is to record all evaluation notes and scoring that is obtained through consensus discussions among the full evaluation team for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. The RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator should complete this form and maintain the only copy. This form should reflect the full team's consensus evaluations, and this form is **not** meant to take the place of individual evaluation notes, which are still required from each member of the evaluation team. A separate form is available for individual evaluation notes. Please submit a copy of this document to the Division of Procurement Services as part of your contract award selection documents.

DEPARTMENT NAME: Maine DEP

NAME OF RFP COORDINATOR: Wendy Garland

NAMES OF EVALUATORS: Greg Beane, Phil Carey, Wendy Garland, Amanda Pratt

SUMMARY PAGE

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>		
	<u>Pass:</u>	<u>Fail:</u>
◆ Match at least 25%	X	
◆ Eligible recipient	X	
◆ NPS Priority Watershed	X	
	<u>Points Awarded:</u>	
<u>Numerical Score:</u>		
Section I. Applicant Qualifications and Experience (Max: 15 Points)	11	
Section II. Relative Value of Waterbody (Max: 10 Points)	8	
Section III. Water Quality Problem (Max: 10 Points)	9	
Section IV. Nature, Extent and Severity of NPS Problems (Max: 10 Points)	6	
Section V. Feasibility for Success (Max: 25 Points)	18	
Section VI. Cost Effectiveness (Max: 25 Points)	18	
Section VII. Comprehensive Plan (Max: 5 Points)	4	
TOTAL POINTS (Max: 100 Points)	74	

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: KCSWCD (China Lake)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION I

Applicant Qualifications and Experience

Total Points Available: 15 points

Score: 11

Evaluation Team Comments:

[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: KCSWCD (China Lake)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION II

Relative Value of Waterbody

Total Points Available: 10 Score: 8

Evaluation Team Comments:

[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: KCSWCD (China Lake)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION III

Water Quality Problem

Total Points Available: 10 Score: 9

Evaluation Team Comments:

[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: KCSWCD (China Lake)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION IV

Nature, Extent and Severity of NPS Problems

Total Points Available: 10 Score: 6

Evaluation Team Comments:

[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: KCSWCD (China Lake)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION V

Feasibility of Success

Total Points Available: 25 Score: 18

Evaluation Team Comments:

[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: KCSWCD (China Lake)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION VI

Cost Effectiveness

Total Points Available: 25

Score: 18

Evaluation Team Comments:[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: KCSWCD (China Lake)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION VII Comprehensive Plan

Total Points Available: 5 Score: 4

.....

Evaluation Team Comments:

[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: County of Aroostook (Cross Lake)

DATE: 5/29/19

Instructions: The purpose of this form is to record all evaluation notes and scoring that is obtained through consensus discussions among the full evaluation team for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. The RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator should complete this form and maintain the only copy. This form should reflect the full team's consensus evaluations, and this form is **not** meant to take the place of individual evaluation notes, which are still required from each member of the evaluation team. A separate form is available for individual evaluation notes. Please submit a copy of this document to the Division of Procurement Services as part of your contract award selection documents.

DEPARTMENT NAME: Maine DEP

NAME OF RFP COORDINATOR: Wendy Garland

NAMES OF EVALUATORS: Greg Beane, Phil Carey, Wendy Garland, Amanda Pratt

SUMMARY PAGE

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>		
	<u>Pass:</u>	<u>Fail:</u>
◆ Match at least 25%	X	
◆ Eligible recipient	X	
◆ NPS Priority Watershed	X	
	<u>Points Awarded:</u>	
<u>Numerical Score:</u>		
Section I. Applicant Qualifications and Experience (Max: 15 Points)	9	
Section II. Relative Value of Waterbody (Max: 10 Points)	6	
Section III. Water Quality Problem (Max: 10 Points)	6	
Section IV. Nature, Extent and Severity of NPS Problems (Max: 10 Points)	8	
Section V. Feasibility for Success (Max: 25 Points)	19	
Section VI. Cost Effectiveness (Max: 25 Points)	23	
Section VII. Comprehensive Plan (Max: 5 Points)	4	
TOTAL POINTS (Max: 100 Points)	75	

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: County of Aroostook (Cross Lake)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION I

Applicant Qualifications and Experience

Total Points Available: 15 points

Score: 9

Evaluation Team Comments:[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: County of Aroostook (Cross Lake)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION II

Relative Value of Waterbody

Total Points Available: 10 Score: 6

Evaluation Team Comments:[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: County of Aroostook (Cross Lake)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION III

Water Quality Problem

Total Points Available: 10 Score: 6

Evaluation Team Comments:

[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: County of Aroostook (Cross Lake)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION IV

Nature, Extent and Severity of NPS Problems

Total Points Available: 10 Score: 8

Evaluation Team Comments:

[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: County of Aroostook (Cross Lake)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION V

Feasibility of Success

Total Points Available: 25 Score: 19

Evaluation Team Comments:

[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: County of Aroostook (Cross Lake)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION VI

Cost Effectiveness

Total Points Available: 25

Score: 23

Evaluation Team Comments:[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: Brunswick (Mare Brook)

DATE: 5/29/19

Instructions: The purpose of this form is to record all evaluation notes and scoring that is obtained through consensus discussions among the full evaluation team for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. The RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator should complete this form and maintain the only copy. This form should reflect the full team's consensus evaluations, and this form is **not** meant to take the place of individual evaluation notes, which are still required from each member of the evaluation team. A separate form is available for individual evaluation notes. Please submit a copy of this document to the Division of Procurement Services as part of your contract award selection documents.

DEPARTMENT NAME: Maine DEP

NAME OF RFP COORDINATOR: Wendy Garland

NAMES OF EVALUATORS: Greg Beane, Phil Carey, Wendy Garland, Amanda Pratt

SUMMARY PAGE

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>		
	<u>Pass:</u>	<u>Fail:</u>
◆ Match at least 25%	X	
◆ Eligible recipient	X	
◆ NPS Priority Watershed	X	
	<u>Points Awarded:</u>	
<u>Numerical Score:</u>		
Section I. Applicant Qualifications and Experience (Max: 15 Points)	12	
Section II. Relative Value of Waterbody (Max: 10 Points)	7	
Section III. Water Quality Problem (Max: 10 Points)	5	
Section IV. Nature, Extent and Severity of NPS Problems (Max: 10 Points)	5	
Section V. Feasibility for Success (Max: 25 Points)	21	
Section VI. Cost Effectiveness (Max: 25 Points)	18	
Section VII. Comprehensive Plan (Max: 5 Points)	5	
TOTAL POINTS (Max: 100 Points)	73	

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: Brunswick (Mare Brook)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION I

Applicant Qualifications and Experience

Total Points Available: 15 points

Score: 12

Evaluation Team Comments:[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: Brunswick (Mare Brook)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION II

Relative Value of Waterbody

Total Points Available: 10 Score: 7

Evaluation Team Comments:

[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: Brunswick (Mare Brook)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION III

Water Quality Problem

Total Points Available: 10 Score: 5

Evaluation Team Comments:

[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: Brunswick (Mare Brook)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION IV

Nature, Extent and Severity of NPS Problems

Total Points Available: 10 **Score: 5**

.....

Evaluation Team Comments:

[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: Brunswick (Mare Brook)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION V

Feasibility of Success

Total Points Available: 25 Score: 21

Evaluation Team Comments:

[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: Brunswick (Mare Brook)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION VI

Cost Effectiveness

Total Points Available: 25

Score: 18

Evaluation Team Comments:[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: Brunswick (Mare Brook)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION VII

Comprehensive Plan

Total Points Available: 5 Score: 5

Evaluation Team Comments:

[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: CCSWCD (Mosher Brook)

DATE: 5/29/19

Instructions: The purpose of this form is to record all evaluation notes and scoring that is obtained through consensus discussions among the full evaluation team for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. The RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator should complete this form and maintain the only copy. This form should reflect the full team's consensus evaluations, and this form is **not** meant to take the place of individual evaluation notes, which are still required from each member of the evaluation team. A separate form is available for individual evaluation notes. Please submit a copy of this document to the Division of Procurement Services as part of your contract award selection documents.

DEPARTMENT NAME: Maine DEP

NAME OF RFP COORDINATOR: Wendy Garland

NAMES OF EVALUATORS: Greg Beane, Phil Carey, Wendy Garland, Amanda Pratt

SUMMARY PAGE

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>		
	<u>Pass:</u>	<u>Fail:</u>
◆ Match at least 25%	X	
◆ Eligible recipient	X	
◆ NPS Priority Watershed	X	
	<u>Points Awarded:</u>	
<u>Numerical Score:</u>		
Section I. Applicant Qualifications and Experience (Max: 15 Points)	11	
Section II. Relative Value of Waterbody (Max: 10 Points)	1	
Section III. Water Quality Problem (Max: 10 Points)	3	
Section IV. Nature, Extent and Severity of NPS Problems (Max: 10 Points)	4	
Section V. Feasibility for Success (Max: 25 Points)	15	
Section VI. Cost Effectiveness (Max: 25 Points)	12	
Section VII. Comprehensive Plan (Max: 5 Points)	5	
TOTAL POINTS (Max: 100 Points)	51	

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: CCSWCD (Mosher Brook)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION I

Applicant Qualifications and Experience

Total Points Available: 15 points

Score: 11

Evaluation Team Comments:[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: CCSWCD (Mosher Brook)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION II

Relative Value of Waterbody

Total Points Available: 10 Score: 1

Evaluation Team Comments:[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: CCSWCD (Mosher Brook)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION III

Water Quality Problem

Total Points Available: 10 Score: 3

Evaluation Team Comments:

[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: CCSWCD (Mosher Brook)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION IV

Nature, Extent and Severity of NPS Problems

Total Points Available: 10 Score: 4

.....

Evaluation Team Comments:

[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: CCSWCD (Mosher Brook)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION V

Feasibility of Success

Total Points Available: 25 Score: 15

Evaluation Team Comments:

[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: CCSWCD (Mosher Brook)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION VI

Cost Effectiveness

Total Points Available: 25

Score: 12

Evaluation Team Comments:

[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: CCSWCD (Mosher Brook)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION VII Comprehensive Plan

Total Points Available: 5 Score: 5

.....

Evaluation Team Comments:

[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: CWD (Wilson Pond)

DATE: 5/29/19

Instructions: The purpose of this form is to record all evaluation notes and scoring that is obtained through consensus discussions among the full evaluation team for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. The RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator should complete this form and maintain the only copy. This form should reflect the full team's consensus evaluations, and this form is **not** meant to take the place of individual evaluation notes, which are still required from each member of the evaluation team. A separate form is available for individual evaluation notes. Please submit a copy of this document to the Division of Procurement Services as part of your contract award selection documents.

DEPARTMENT NAME: Maine DEP

NAME OF RFP COORDINATOR: Wendy Garland

NAMES OF EVALUATORS: Greg Beane, Phil Carey, Wendy Garland, Amanda Pratt

SUMMARY PAGE

Pass/Fail Criteria		
	Pass:	Fail:
◆ Match at least 25%	X	
◆ Eligible recipient	X	
◆ NPS Priority Watershed	X	
	Points Awarded:	
Numerical Score:		
Section I. Applicant Qualifications and Experience (Max: 15 Points)	13	
Section II. Relative Value of Waterbody (Max: 10 Points)	4	
Section III. Water Quality Problem (Max: 10 Points)	8	
Section IV. Nature, Extent and Severity of NPS Problems (Max: 10 Points)	6	
Section V. Feasibility for Success (Max: 25 Points)	13	
Section VI. Cost Effectiveness (Max: 25 Points)	14	
Section VII. Comprehensive Plan (Max: 5 Points)	4	
TOTAL POINTS (Max: 100 Points)	62	

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: CWD (Wilson Pond)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION I

Applicant Qualifications and Experience

Total Points Available: 15 points

Score: 13

Evaluation Team Comments:

[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: CWD (Wilson Pond)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION II

Relative Value of Waterbody

Total Points Available: 10 Score: 4

Evaluation Team Comments:[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: CWD (Wilson Pond)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION III

Water Quality Problem

Total Points Available: 10 Score: 8

Evaluation Team Comments:

[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: CWD (Wilson Pond)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION IV

Nature, Extent and Severity of NPS Problems

Total Points Available: 10 Score: 6

Evaluation Team Comments:

[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: CWD (Wilson Pond)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION V

Feasibility of Success

Total Points Available: 25 **Score:** 13

Evaluation Team Comments:

[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: CWD (Wilson Pond)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION VI

Cost Effectiveness

Total Points Available: 25

Score: 14

Evaluation Team Comments:

[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects Watershed-based Plan Development

BIDDER: CWD (Wilson Pond)

DATE: 5/29/19

EVALUATION OF SECTION VII

Comprehensive Plan

Total Points Available: 5 Score: 4

Evaluation Team Comments:

[illegible]

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: Aroostook County (Cross Lake)

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator) 5-2-19

EVALUATOR NAME: Amanda Pratt

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

Instructions: The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Qualifications + Experience: Does not look like there is a ton of	(M)
604(b)/319 experience	
Many partners w/diverse experience.	(P)
use of consultants	
Waterbody Value: mostly residential, habitat value for coldwater	(M)
fish, wetlands + threatened/endangered species	(P)
wild brook trout recreational use	
Water Quality Problem: Does not appear to have declining	(M)
water quality trend since it's always been poor (since '81)	
Clearly has a WQ problem, but lack of data is an issue	(P/M)
on Impaired list	(P)
TP, SDT	
↳ lakesofmaine.org has more data, gap between 2010-2015	
Nature/Extent/Severity of NPS: Lack of recent study	(M)
Clearly impacted by agricultural loading of Phos.	(P)
Would be great to have results of watershed survey 1st	(M)
-Anticipated change in zoning/future development	

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: Ardenstook County (Cross Lake)

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator)

EVALUATOR NAME: Amanda Pratt

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

Feasibility of success: seems to have a lot of enthusiasm
and partner buy-in (12 partner organizations)

Island- Use of consultant may help w/ lack of expertise
owner/
development Impact of inputs from wider watershed (Long + mud lakes)
as well as 2 impaired streams providing most of
the pond's water may limit success

Cost effectiveness: 65% match is good

\$175 an hour for a "modeling + internal
loading expert"?

Are these estimates realistic?

Sec VI Part 1 amount of hours
is very low

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: Cumberland County Soil + Water Conservation District (mesher Brook)

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator) 5-2-19

EVALUATOR NAME: Amanda Pratt

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

Instructions: The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Q/M	Does not mention development of 9-element plan specifically	
	Qualifications + Experience: CESWCD is an experienced	P
	organization + has completed several WBP projects	
	Several local groups/individuals involved	P
	Waterbody Value: some recreational use of the watershed,	M
	habitat	
	Water quality problem: Impaired - DO + E. coli	P
	why only draft TMDL? (2015) MS4	Q
	Turbid, DO issues, bacteria - Agriculture	
	Not much WQ info provided	

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: CCSWCD (Masher Brook)

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator) 5-2-19

EVALUATOR NAME: Amanda Pratt

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

Nature/Extent/Severity of NPS: mainly due to agriculture extent + severity not well described - what is the water quality in the upper, forested reaches of the brook? Limited buildings along edge of brook makes me wonder how significant nutrient loading from failing septic is. What types of agriculture are practiced in the watershed?

Q

Feasibility of Success: very little NPS work to date moderate ~~good~~ amount of partner participation - not many sources of match Plan appears to be comprehensive in addressing potential issues - should include geomorph in stream survey. - what about stressor analysis?

P/m

P

Future development of watershed is likely why not partner w/ USM?

\$6600 for septic + sewer survey that may not be needed

[stream survey/stressor analysis may better pinpoint sources of impairment more cheaply

Cost Effectiveness: most expensive project proposed, but also has the highest % match

P/m

volunteer time is billed at \$28.35/hr??

Q

high indirect costs

M

significantly larger budget than proposal from last year

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: Town of Brunswick (~~West~~ Brook)

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator) 5-2-19 Mare

EVALUATOR NAME: Amanda Pratt

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

Instructions: The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Qualifications + Experience: CCSWCD is an experienced	(P)
partner organization (sub-grantee), use of consultants	
Town of Brunswick staff does not appear to have 604/312	(M)
experience.	
Consultants (2)	
Waterbody value: Drains to economically important	(P)
shellfish habitat, habitat for brook trout	
Not clear how much recreational/local value there is	(M)
Water Quality Problem: Impaired - aquatic life non-attainment	(P)
18% impervious cover (16 TMDL)	
Did not provide details of monitoring data	

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: Town of Brunswick (Mare Brook)

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator) 5-2-19

EVALUATOR NAME: Amanda Pratt

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

Nature/Extent/Severity of NPS: legacy of pollution from
Naval Air Station from tributary

(P)

Urban Impaired-residential/transportation (airport)

Stressor analysis required to pinpoint causes of ^{impairment} NPS

Did not discuss numbers in detail; no land use %

(M)

No on-the-ground work done to date
to address NPS issues

38.7% forest 61% urban
need more of a breakdown

Feasibility for Success: Few partners, ~~no~~ evidence of
local citizen support is limited (little active involvement)

(M)

Mixed uses + issues may make it difficult to address
all the identified pollution sources (3/4 mi culvert)

(M)

Planned tasks appear comprehensive + appropriate
for the goal of the project

(P)

Cost effectiveness: high total cost, relatively low match

(M)

Hourly rates seem high (Part 2 notes)

(Q)

Match does not include a diverse array of
partners/stakeholders

(M)

\$9K for steering committee seems high

(Q)

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: Cobbossee Watershed District (Wilson Lake) Pond

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator) 5-2-19

EVALUATOR NAME: Amanda Pratt

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

Instructions: The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Qualifications & Experience: CWD has been the recipient	(P)
of numerous 604/319 projects	
No other partners	(M)
Waterbody Value: residential, boat launch, beach	
No mention of threatened/endangered species habitat	
Water Quality Problem: Impaired, abrupt decline in water	(P)
quality in 1990s, algae blooms, DO depletion	
Upstream ponds have average water quality	
Nature/Extent/Severity of NPS: Internal recycling of phos.	
Development, Agriculture	
No land use % data, but development is light-mod.	(M)
No mention of septic	

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: CWD (Wilson Lake) Pond

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator) 5-2-19

EVALUATOR NAME: Amanda Pratt

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

Feasibility for success: Relatively few partner organizations

(M)

Not much detail as to how Task 5 (Internal load determination)

(Q)

will be carried out - specific model/formula?

No deliverables for task 4, none for calculations

(M)

done in task 5 - vague

This is an update of the 2009 plan, but they do

(M)

not provide much evidence of the success of that

plan, and it does not appear that "extensive changes and/or advanced monitoring" are taking place,

except perhaps Task 5, which is not detailed enough.

Cost effectiveness: relatively low match %

(M)

only match is CWD, basically

(M)

(would be good to have buy-in

from other organizations ^{FCW, etc.} rather

than just volunteer time)

low overall cost

(P)

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: Kennebec County Soil + Water Conservation District (China Lake)

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator) 5/2/19

EVALUATOR NAME: Amanda Pratt

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

Instructions: The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Qualifications & Experience: SWCD, use of consultant	(P)
would be good if there were other partners with	(M)
- - - expertise so that there was less reliance on consultant	
what is NRCS? (not defined)	(Q)
Waterbody value: residential, <u>drinking water</u> , wildlife habitat	(P)
-> (though the type of project necessitates use of consultant)	(Brown Trout)
Water Quality Problem: Impaired, algae blooms, documented	(P)
WQ decline/good WQ monitoring record, internal nutrient recycling	
max/mean depth?	(Q)
Nature/Extent/Severity of NPS:	
% of various land uses?	(Q/M)
No indication of causes of WQ decline /	(M)
clear sources of NPS pollution (development?)	
Internal loading appears to be the most	
significant NPS source	

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: KCSWCD (China Lake)

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator) 5-2-19

EVALUATOR NAME: Amanda Pratt

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

Feasibility for Success:

Strong local commitment to project/Lake

modeling/monitoring/surveying tasks appear comprehensive

several past projects+activities have not improved
water quality (yet)

Cost Effectiveness: 58% match is good, diverse sources

441 hours is a lot of time for

a consultant (40 hr/wk for 11 wks)

"Cash" is not a ^{valid} cost category in the

task tables + does not match Part 2 notes

of cost breakdowns (Task 3, 5, 7) → Contractual

2 consultants, 1 @ \$75/hr 1 @ \$175/hr?

Mate Brook

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: Town of Brunswick

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator) 5/8/19

EVALUATOR NAME: K. Beane

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MDEP

Instructions: The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Quality & experience - Excellent based on partnership w/ sub grantee CCSWCD - top notch

(P+)

Value of waterbody - high supports sea run brook trout fishery, fishing & skating at Coffin pond and drains to commercial clam flat.

(P)

Water quality problem - 18% I.C. in watershed and anything over 10% is problematic. Slows through a 3/4 mile long culvert under Brunswick executive airport. Not water quality but a habitat issue. Doesn't meet aquatic life use criteria.

(P)

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: Brunswick

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator) 5/8/19

EVALUATOR NAME: Greg Beane

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DCP

nature, extent & severity of NPS problems. Non attainment issues are related to impervious cover, alteration and urban developments. Issues are significant when you consider it is collected for 3/4 mile. (P)

~~Value of information~~ Feasibility for success
- I ~~rate~~ rate this high - I like the organization of existing information of the watershed combined with the assessment work described in task 4. The brook has brook trout so water quality & habitat can't be terrible. Make Brook strikes me as being highly restorable and I think this project would create a good plan to accomplish that. (P)

Cost effectiveness - Very good, total project cost is reasonable for what will be accomplished. Decent match commitment & good support by City of Brunswick. (P)

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

Cross Lake

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: *Acushnet County*

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator) *5/9/18*

EVALUATOR NAME: *B. Bedke*

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: *MDP*

Instructions: The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Quals & experience - Not as much experience developing WMP's as some other grantees but have coordinated grant projects competently in the past. Good support from UMF and leaders from FGL are obviously well qualified to lead project. Also ~~utilizing~~ utilizing a consultant to help develop the plan is a plus. (P)

Value of waterbody - high good public access and heavily utilized by surrounding communities. Important for wild brook trout. (P)

Water quality problem - Below average water quality and high potential for algae blooms. SDT readings often < 2 meters since 1981. Increasing trophic state. (P)

Cross Lake

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: Arcoastak County

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator) 5/9/19

EVALUATOR NAME: G. Beane

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

~~State~~ Nature, extent & severity of NPS problems -
Historic agricultural nutrient loading
in the Cross Lake watershed. Sampling
shows it exceeds it's TMDL target
of 16 ppb (18-20 ppb) - phosphorus. (P)

Feasibility for success - I think this
proposal, if executed, stands a
very good chance of creating a
successful WBNP. It appears all (P)
components are in place to
address major NPS input and
internal phosphorus recycling.
I am concerned about possibility
of large scale watershed develop-
ment on drying land. ~~this is not~~

Cost effectiveness - Excellent - very
~~high~~ high match, lot of bang for
the buck with this proposal. (P+)
*Note - Local coordinators (St.
Peters) donating their time &
expertise is huge.

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: CCSWCD

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator) 5/7/19

EVALUATOR NAME: B. Beane

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MOEP

Instructions: The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.

Individual Evaluator Comments:

there
 Quals & Experience - Not better CCSWCD has been a partner regarding NPS planning and implementation projects for a long time. The District project coordinator is very experienced and ~~there~~ there is strong support for project. pt

Value of waterbody - Somewhat low, in my opinion does not provide much recreational opportunity. Its main value is being part of a wildlife corridor in southern Maine which is a significant attribute. M

Water quality problem - Low DO, and presence of E. coli bacteria (level?)
 Habitat Assessment Score is 144 out of 200 (low). Agricultural inputs

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: CCSWCD

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator) 5/7/19

EVALUATOR NAME: G. Beane

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

Contribute to N&P loading. Lots of issues -

(P)

Nature, extent & severity of NPS problems -
the proposal does that as a good
job describing NPS problems and
its impact on water quality. For
example, the brook has periods of
low DO, how low? 2 mg/L? 5 mg/L?
E. coli bacteria present - ok - quantify?
Geo mean?

(M)

Feasibility for Success - ~~Not that far~~

Said, I think the proposal does
a pretty good job of describing
how they plan to identify
and address stressors. Unfortunately
I think the "B" Classification is
high for this brook - should that be
a concern? - topic for ET discussion.
I like commitment from town of Gorham.

(Q)

Cost effectiveness - High Marks for this
Costs seem very reasonable and
high match commitment.

(P+)

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

China Lake

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: Kennebec County SUCD

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator) 5/14/19

EVALUATOR NAME: Greg Beane

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MOEP

Instructions: The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Quals & experience - Excellent qualifications, experienced grantee with proven track record. Good to use a consultant (P)

Value of Waterbody - High, water supply for Waterville. Lots of camps on east basin and good public access. Lake has bloomed annually since 1983 - has recreational use dropped off (swimming) due to poor water quality? (P+Q)

Water quality problem - Severe, annual blooms since 1983. Despite a lot of work to address NPS inputs over the last 25 years water quality has not recovered. It appears that historical phosphorus inputs to the lake are being recycled. (P)

China Lake

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: KCSW

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator) 5/19/19

EVALUATOR NAME: G. Beane

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

Nature, extent & severity of NPS problems - China Lake probably has the most severe, historic water quality issues of any lake in Maine.

(P+)

Feasibility for success - I feel the proposal is well written and does a good job of addressing both past issues and accomplishments, with future needs including in lake treatment.

(P)

Cost effectiveness - OK, this is a complex undertaking where specialized skills are needed but personnel/con-sultant costs seem high. On the other hand, good match from a broad range of constituents showing strong project support.

(P/M)

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

Wilson Pond

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: CWP

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator) 5/9/19

EVALUATOR NAME: G. Beashe

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: MDEP

Instructions: The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Quals & experience - Very good, CWP has 40 years experience ~~at~~ coordinating many grant projects including Watershed Management plan Development. to match (P)

Value of waterbody - Fair, it exists in a "late rich" area but it does offer good public access and some recreational opportunity. There are about 120 camps along the shore-line (M)

Water quality problem - Long term deteriorating trophic trend, declining SDT and algae blooms. On 303d impaired waters list. (P)

Wilson Pond

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: CWD

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator) 5/9/19

EVALUATOR NAME: G. Beane

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

Nature, extent and severity of NPS problem -
It appears the documented decline
in water quality goes back 27 years.
Since that time quite a bit of assess-
ment, planning and NPS implementation
has been done. Issues seem to be
deep rooted and ~~very~~ persistent... (P)

Feasibility for Success - Fairly low I
think, it seems that Perry & Dexter
ponds have a large influence on Wilson
pond but it seems they are not
being given enough attention. Also I
get the sense that towns are only
lukewarm in supporting this effort. (M)
For instance - no match locations
from town ~~where~~ where typically
towns exhibit stronger support.

Cost effectiveness - Lowest match.
commitment of all candidate projects -
reflection of lack of town/local
support. Also, rather high personnel
~~costs~~ cost. (M)

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: Chiba Lake

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator) 5/28/19

EVALUATOR NAME: Phil Carey

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: J DAF

Instructions: The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Quals: Good track record
Value: Alewives, KWD source
Problem: Serious Algae blooms
Severity: Many studies by multiple parties
Feasibility: Well conceived and described - many partners with meaningful contributions
Cost: Strong overmatch

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUTION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: Cross Lake

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator) 5/28/19

EVALUATOR NAME: Phil Cárdenas

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: *DACE*

Instructions: The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Quads: Little track record/support from Kathy Hoppe
Value: Sport fishery of state-wide significance
Quality Problem
Severity: Potential Irving Development
Dated prior studies
Feasibility: Survey being done prior to project start
Cost: Strong overmatch
Low overall project cost

[illegible]

此致 敬礼

而由于本行在报告期内未发生任何关联交易，故未发生关联交易定价公允性分析。

Quals:	Very good track record
Value	Part of valuable system
Water Quality	Moderate decline over long term
NPS	May need to look more at non-road NPS sources
Feasibility:	Many partnerships / vague program
Cost	Relatively low cost

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUTION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: Mere Brook

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator) 5/28/19

EVALUATOR NAME: Phil Carey
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DACE

Instructions: The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Quals: Bruns Planner has good track record
 Value: Urban recreation/shellfish outlet
 Water Quality: Fair except for anomalous spikes
 NPS: Drainage from streets/yards
 Feasibility: Grown network already done with CCG grant
 Cost: Reasonable

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUTION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: Mosher Brook.

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator) 5/28/19

EVALUATOR NAME: Phil Carey
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DACE

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: *✓ DACT*

Instructions: The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Goals: CCSWC
Value: Potential public rec access
Upland Sandpiper habitat
Water: Low DO, Sediment (how bad?)
Problem: Ag, Res, gravel pit
Feasibility: Will be tough to achieve Class B standards
Cost: Strong overmatch, but expensive total cost

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

5

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: CWD

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator) 5/22/19

Wilson Pond

EVALUATOR NAME: Wendy Garland

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

Instructions: The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.

Individual Evaluator Comments:

+ Quals - CWD extensive 319/604b/water quality experience. ++
Current Annabessacook WBP project behind schedule - in part due to lack of local support. Good team depth @ CWD with Bill Monagle, Wendy Dennis + Ryan Burton.

+ Value - ^{State} Boat launch in Monmouth + public beach owned by N. Monmouth Comm. Club. Some power boats but mostly canoe, kayak, fishing, swimming. Cold/water fisheries - 8 native species + 6 introduced. Also N. pike. Stocked w/ brook + brook trout. Lots of lakes in area.

+ WQ Problem - Impaired - declining trend. Listed ↑ TP, ↓ clarity + DO depletion. 1990s - abrupt decline. 5.6 m → 4.5 m. annual average. 4.2 → 3.1 m. average minimum SDI. 2018 worst bloom - 2.0 m. Listed in 2006. 2009 WBP, 2007 TMDL. Good info. shared. Jeff said - still time to address/not too bad. Internal loading info not provided.

Not annual blooms.

OK NPS Problem Past studies estimated: 30% upstream lakes, 26% develop; 21% ag.; 15% other; 8% atmospheric. TMDL estimated 90 kg P/yr internal loading. ~2007 survey 82 NPS sites - 3 ponds (14 H, 35 M) (only seemed to be roads surveyed). Septico? 2009 project - 24 NPS sites + 200' shoreline; 2014 project - 16 NPS sites, 700' SL. 2009 WBP. Relatively little info/surveys on full watershed.

⊖

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: CWD

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator) 5/24/19

EVALUATOR NAME: Wendy Garland

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

Feas Success - Are septicos an issue?

- ① Partner Interest/Involvement not apparent. Towns, FOCW + Lake Assoc. 'invited' to participate. No letters of commitment. Only \$1945 in match. Mostly from CWD

Task 2 - 4 SC mtgs.

- ① 3 - Watershed assessment of direct + indirect watersheds. Only \$6K effort. Not likely to be comprehensive survey

4 - Load model/estimates - Relational Method

- ②/- 5 - Internal Load + Plan - Expanded CWD monitoring to semi-monthly w/ same parameters. Advanced monitoring beyond this is likely needed to assess (eg. early meter). DEP could probably supplement or

6 - Outreach, w/o prior 'bone bones' to plan.

7 - Plan - Plan would likely need more time than allotted. redirected as needed

- ① Would likely be completed. Could lead to restoration.

① Leverages previous efforts.

② Unsure of local support.

+ - Cost Effectiveness

- ① \$18K is relatively low cost for plan that could help restore lake.

task costs look reasonable, although perhaps low based on effort needed for WQ monitoring + watershed survey.

- ②/- Match relatively low amt. (\$7K) + mostly from CWD. CWD is funded by the towns so indirect town support.

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

4

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: CCSWCD

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator) 5/24/19

Master Brook

EVALUATOR NAME: Wendy Garland

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

Instructions: The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.

Individual Evaluator Comments:

+

Quals - CCSWCD has very long history w/ 319 + 6046 grants. 4 staff from CCSWCD on project team. Good depth in project mgmt, GIS, outreach + engineering. Strong extended team w/ Town Gorham, PRLT. CCSWCD doesn't have very much experience w/ stream WBS.

+/-

Value - Planned trails on Shaw Bros. Family Foundation land in watershed. Power line provides hunting opportunity + habitat for several species. HAI identified 3 fish species. Overall, some limited public + habitat value.

+/-

WQ Problem - Impaired for DO + E. coli. Little to no information provided on the specific data. How ~~high~~ high are E. coli + where? How low DO + where?

I reviewed EGAD data. Bacteria good in mainstem above trib. DO not very low but large DO swings in July + August. Probably ^{lack of} shading + nutrients - manure spreading?

Sp. Conductance - 300s.

OK

NPS Problem - Habitat Scored lower than similar ones that met Class B.

2015 Draft TMDL pointed to ag. NPS - 97% sed, 80% TN, 93% TP.

Gravel pit, development, sewers, septicos. - other potential sources. Some, but not much, info provided. What kind of ag. is active in watershed?

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: CCSWCD

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator) 5/24/19

EVALUATOR NAME: Wendy Garland

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

+
✓
(+)

Feas. Success

task 2 - 6 TAC mtgs, one public mtg

3 - Data analysis - watershed mapping, data analysis, septic/sewer survey, stream corridor survey, Q survey, SW infrastructure survey, WQ monitoring (\$6500), ordinance review

4 WBP

(+)

Well designed approach to figure out current + potential future impacts to stream.

+

Strong town support - 306 hrs \$27K + \$10K cash; PRLT match, volunteers

+

Would be a good, feasible project to study + develop WBP for a small developing watershed

+

Cost Effect. \$22K grant, \$46K match. Modest ^{grant} investment for a small stream. Good/reasonable cost associated w/ tasks. ^{appears} Enough hours for writing plan.

⊖

Several staff involved. Spread across 6 staff

Septic/sewer survey > \$6000

Stream survey \$7,000

Match over estimated. \$2000 meeting space. \$281/hr match rate

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

2

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: County of Ansonia

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator) 5/23/19

EVALUATOR NAME: Wendy Garland

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

Cross Lake

Instructions: The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- +** Quals - County has not directly held 319/604 b grants, but staff has grant + 319/604b experience. No info provided on County's grant experience. St. Peters are the local leaders; extensive ~~gr~~ + project mgmt + env. experience - mostly in remediation field. SWCD + NRCS + UMEK + ^{MFS} partners involved. Consultant to be hired to support plan.
- +/+** Value - Large public launch + picnic area. Closest water access to Caribou + surrounding towns. Extensive recreation, ice fishing, including Maine's largest ice fishing derby. Supports sport fishery of statewide significance - brook trout + landlocked salmon. Not stocked + self-sustained trout. "outstanding" botanical resources - Cross Lake Fen, 1500 wetland, + Cross Lake Bog (NWH). 5 threatened or endangered species, wetland.
- +/?** WQ Problem - listed 2004, SDI + TP. Several years since 1981 up to < 2 m SDI. Station 1 - SDI 2.6 m. average, 11 ppb ~~Chl~~ Chl, TP 16 ppb epicore, 30 ppb bottom grab, 20 ppb surface grab. Not enough data since 2009 to assess. (No monitor ??) 2018 new monitor. DEP baseline 2016-2018 → TP average 18 ppb.
- NPS Problem 2019 Survey planned to assess forest, ag + developed areas. Numerous past studies + surveys prior to 2006. No comprehensive assessment as is planned in June 2019. TMDL nutr. load - 78% ag, ~7% roads, 6% undeveloped, 4% actively managed forest, 2% shoreline devel. 5946 Kg P/yr watershed (4698 ag 59% row crops) + 2971 intrinal

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: *Arrostock*

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator) *5/24/19*

EVALUATOR NAME: *Wendy Garland*

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: *DEP*

NPS Problem - Several projects completed 1982-2006 to install of + other BMPs in watershed. Little recent activity

Feas. Success

- Excellent partner involvement + support. FOCL, UMTK, NRCS, SWCD, LUPC, MFS, Town + Irving. Consult. will provide tech services
- task 2 - SC (2 mtgs), 2 Stakeholders, 2 TAC mtgs., 5 landowner mtgs.
- 3 - WQ analysis, - good data collection protocols to determine internal loading
- 4 - Internal loading estimates
- 5 - Modeling - Some high cost - LLRM (\$9K^{total})
- 6 - Plan - Good inclusion for NRCS + MFS recommendations
- Well thought-out approach to analyze all major land uses + sources. Not clear if limnologist to be hired.
- Structured as per DEP recommendations.
- Should result in strong plan for restoration.

Cost \$17K grant excellent value for \$50K total plan cost for plan. \$32K match, mostly in-kind but strong involvement from several partners
task costs approx reasonable, except modeling task high
Rates of staff reasonable.
Very detailed budget

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

3

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: Brunswick 5/23/19 Mare Brook

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator)

EVALUATOR NAME: Wendy Garland

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

Instructions: The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.

Individual Evaluator Comments:

+

CCSWCD + Town have solid, extensive grant experience.

Goals - Well-rounded project team including CCSWCD

+ Town. Jared Worlston + Chris Baldwin have experience

w/ Mare Brook assessment. Good depth but CCSWCD doesn't do many

Value - Brook trout, Sea-run brook trout to Picnic Pond.

Coffin Pond - fishing - ice skating. Drains to Hepswell Cove

which is shellfish (soft shell) 2500 bushels/yr.

Kate Furber Preserve + Town Cammoco. Not mentioned

but also trails through Naval Air Station Property.

Good overall for stream but not overly used by public. → Phil + Jeff

Didn't include correct table. shared more

Water Quality Problem Impaired Benthic Macroinvertebrate Life + Habitat

Very little info provided on water quality. Where are the

impairments + how bad are they? There was a whole

CCG project that focused on data collection + geomorph

Nothing included. Mentioned 'legacy toxics' but no info/details.

That said - Fairly extensive monitoring conducted by DEP + FB. Intact riparian buffers

Floodplain. Approx. impacts likely due to sand movement/substrate. Troy Barry - bank erosion study.

NPS Issues - Proposal indicated that geomorph. is an issue

+ perhaps 'legacy toxics' However, no real info on land use

issue / NPS sources provided.

Stormwater is perhaps issue for bank erosion. Also, culverts issue?

7/10 reaches had very high or extreme predicted erosion rates

stream, WBP projects.

Phil + Jeff shared more trail info - use.

+/-

+/-

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: Brunswick

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator) 5/23/19

EVALUATOR NAME: Wendy Garland

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

+/?

Fees Success

task 2 - 6 SC mtg

3 - Summary data - \$9K met met \$9K met \$8K

4 - Stream ID, Grange, Collect/Outfall Inventory, SW Retrofits

5 - Poll. Loading

6 - Public input - 3 mtgs.

7 - Plan

+
?

Strong project plan + team. Could likely be completed as proposed. Seems to target main issues + leverage past work well. Some participation from several partners but not clear if/how important.

Cost -

+

?

- \$35K good investment to finish previous efforts + create a well developed plan.
- Given extensive past studies, wonder if need so much more in Task 4.
- Good match 41.2%, Mostly from the Town \$7500 Jared Watson
- Task costs - 2-6 SC Mtgs - \$9K somewhat high.
"1, 4, 3, 5, 6, 7 appropriate costs
- CCSWCD - (in indirect) Rates higher now to incorporate.

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

①

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: KCSWCD

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator) 5/24/19

EVALUATOR NAME: Wendy Garland

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

China Lake

Some good past work but not a current understanding of specific sources.

+
Watershed

NPS Problem - Agriculture, res. devel., roads, internal, septic

- 2008 WBP - 33% load reduction goal
- 2016 ^{road} ~~water~~ study - 46 roads surveyed, 9 needed improvements, 4 in fair condition, 25 failing culverts.
- Colby study (2006) - Identified shoreline, runoff + internal loading
- 2012 In-lake study - recommended drawdown + alum treatments

-?

Detailed info on specific #s + types of sites not included.

Were any detailed surveys conducted in past? - Found survey results but just roads?

Mitigation

- Phase I - 11 319 grants fixed 23 + 14 sites with significant load reductions. Extensive EGIP work during Phase II project.
- YCC has addressed 20+ sites/yr.
- Lake Street Program
- 10 road plans by KCSWCD
- NRCS - 337 BMPs since 2008. 276 BMPs focus on erosion + nutrients.
- Growth + septic additional issues.

How many properties?

Feas. Success

- ④ Strong match/participation by variety of groups - KWD, CRLA, CLA, town
- Consultant hired to manage project's technical tasks + help develop plan
- ④ WQ data analyses + additional monitoring. Not yet sure but good budget to support. QAPP? - not mentioned.

②

④ Watershed Modeling + internal loading/optimum analysis

Possible to do a more thorough watershed survey? - See properties

② Shoreline survey - Is this a major issue? How effective?

Ag + forestry survey - KCSWCD led. NRCS + MFS help? Methods? - Will farms allow?

See Cross Lake approach.

Septic analysis

• SC, Stakeholder + TAC - good approach.

④

Tasks are well sequenced + doable. Not sure if watershed assessment will give enough good info though.

④

Strong support

②

Able to restore/improve lake with this renewed effort + plan?

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

1

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: KCSWCD

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator) 5/24/19

EVALUATOR NAME: Wendy Garland

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: DEP

Instructions: The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.

Individual Evaluator Comments:

+

Quals KCSWCD extensive 319/6046 experience w/ good track record. Has served as grantee for recent East Pond + Great Pond 6046 projects. KCSWCD will provide admin (Dolo) + tech support for watershed survey (Josh Platt). Consulting services sought for plan outreach, GIS, modeling, WQ analyses + writing. Long history of KCSWCD in watershed. Strong reliance on consultant for most of project.

++

Value 3 public boat launches + 2 beaches. Heavy recreational use but no swimming in west basin. Also access by China Four Seasons Club + their semi-private beach. Historically, renowned landlocked salmon, togue + brook trout. Now bass fishing. Stocked brown + brook trout. 3 significant vernal pools. 3 species of concern (littlesm, ribbon snail, GBH). Priority in shifute restoration for DMR - stocked w/ 25,000 since 2015. Drinking water supply for Waterville + surrounding area. High potential if restored.

++

WQ Problem - Impaired lake. Blame since 1983. Cyanotoxin study - results? Anoxia in all 3 basins below 8-11 meters for July Aug + Sept. High TP + Chla in lake + very high for TP bottom grab in late summer. TMDL target TP - 15 ppb. Average is 19 west basin + 18-19 north + south basins.

Jeff Dennis - said would be good to evaluate WQ + options.

STATE OF MAINE - INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: GRANTS FOR NONPOINT SOURCE PROJECTS WATERSHED-BASED PLAN DEVELOPMENT

BIDDER NAME: *KE SWCD*

DATE: (reviewed by evaluator) *5/24/19*

EVALUATOR NAME: *Wendy Gortland*

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: *DEP*

Instructions: The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.

Individual Evaluator Comments:

(+)

Cost Effectiveness - Overall good cost effectiveness w/
excellent match quality + depth. Enough funds to do
a thorough plan w/ wq monitoring, ~~internal~~ internal local
review.

(+/-)

^{task} 5 Watershed Assessment - Should be beefed up? ~ \$12K

6 SC/TAC - ~ \$13K High cost for 8 mtgs.

Otherwise, task costs are reasonable.

(?)

Will this be a good investment for China Lake restoration/improvement?



STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Gerald D. Reid
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT

RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects
Watershed-based Plan Development

I, (print name at right) Amanda Pratt
accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Environmental Protection. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the funding decision notices for public distribution.

Amanda Pratt
Signature

May 1, 2019
Date



STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Gerald D. Reid
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects
Watershed-based Plan Development

I, (print name at right) Gregory E. Beane
accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Environmental Protection. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the funding decision notices for public distribution.

Gregory E. Beane
Signature

5/2/19
Date



STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Gerald D. Reid
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT

RFP #: 201903044

**RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects
Watershed-based Plan Development**

I, (print name at right) Philip Carey
accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Environmental Protection. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the funding decision notices for public distribution.

Signature

Date

5/6/2019



STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Gerald D. Reid
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: 201903044

RFP TITLE: Grants for Nonpoint Source Pollution Control Projects
Watershed-based Plan Development

I, (print name at right) Wendy Garland
accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Environmental Protection. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the funding decision notices for public distribution.

Wendy Garland
Signature

5/2/19
Date