State of Maine
RFP / Proposal Master Score Sheet

Instructions: *Complete the Master Score Sheet below providing all of the requested information for each bidder that submitted a proposal in response to the RFP. This document is to be included in the Selection Package submitted to the Division of Procurement Services for review/approval.*

RFP #: 201805094 - NRDA Ecology & Economic Analysis

	PROPOSAL SUBMITTED BY:		Abt Associates, Inc		Environment International Ltd		Industrial Economics, Inc	
		COST:	Cost:	$21, 891.00	Cost:	$24,862.80	Cost:	$16,764.75
EVALUATION ITEM		**POINTS AVAIL.**						
Section I: Organization Qualifications and Experience		40	35		40		40	
Section II: Proposed Services		20	20		20		20	
Section III: Cost Proposal		25	19		17		25	
Rate Sheet		5	5		5		5	
Section IV: Maine Business and Economic Impact Consideration		10	2		4		2	
TOTAL		**100**	**81**		**86**		**92**	

Rev. 3/5/2018

STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

Paul R. LePage
Governor

Paul Mercer
Commissioner

AWARD NOTIFICATION LETTER

July 2, 2018

Jamie Holmes
Principal Associate/Vice President
Abt Associates, Inc.
1881 Ninth Street, Suite 201
Boulder, Colorado 80302

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Awards under RFP # 201805094, Pre-Qualified Vendor List for NRDA Ecology & Economic Analysis

Dear Mr. Holmes:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Environmental Protection for Pre-Qualified Vendor List for NRDA Ecology & Economic Analysis. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract awards to the following bidders:

- Abt Associates, Inc.
- Environment International Ltd
- Industrial Economics, Inc.

The bidders listed above received the evaluation team's highest rankings. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidders soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Butch Bowie
Oil & Hazardous Materials Specialist II
Division of Petroleum Management
Maine Department of Environmental Protection
(207) 215-4583 (cell)

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).

STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

Paul R. LePage
Governor

Paul Mercer
Commissioner

AWARD NOTIFICATION LETTER

July 2, 2018

Valerie Lee, President
Environment International Ltd
9752 North Lake Shore NE
Seattle, WA 98115

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Awards under RFP # 201805094, Pre-Qualified Vendor List for NRDA Ecology & Economic Analysis

Dear Ms. Lee:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Environmental Protection for Pre-Qualified Vendor List for NRDA Ecology & Economic Analysis. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract awards to the following bidders:

- Abt Associates, Inc.
- Environment International Ltd
- Industrial Economics, Inc.

The bidders listed above received the evaluation team's highest rankings. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidders soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Butch Bowie
Oil & Hazardous Materials Specialist II
Division of Petroleum Management
Maine Department of Environmental Protection
(207) 215-4583 (cell)

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).

STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

Paul R. LePage
Governor

Paul Mercer
Commissioner

AWARD NOTIFICATION LETTER

July 2, 2018

Scott Friedman
Principal
Industrial Economics, Inc.
2067 Massachusetts Ave.
Cambridge, MA 02140

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Awards under RFP # 201805094, Pre-Qualified Vendor List for NRDA Ecology & Economic Analysis

Dear Mr. Friedman:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Environmental Protection for Pre-Qualified Vendor List for NRDA Ecology & Economic Analysis. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract awards to the following bidders:

- Abt Associates, Inc.
- Environment International Ltd
- Industrial Economics, Inc.

The bidders listed above received the evaluation team's highest rankings. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidders soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Butch Bowie
Oil & Hazardous Materials Specialist II
Division of Petroleum Management
Maine Department of Environmental Protection
(207) 215-4583 (cell)

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).

STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201805094
RFP TITLE: NRDA Ecology & Economic Analysis
BIDDER: Abt Associates.
DATE: 6/28/18

****

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record all evaluation notes and scoring that is obtained through consensus discussions among the full evaluation team for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. The RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator should complete this form and maintain the only copy. This form should reflect the full team's consensus evaluations, and this form is* ***not*** *meant to take the place of individual evaluation notes, which are still required from each member of the evaluation team. A separate form is available for individual evaluation notes. Please submit a copy of this document to the Division of Procurement Services as part of your contract award selection documents.*

DEPARTMENT NAME: Environmental Protection
NAME OF RFP COORDINATOR: Butch Bowie
NAMES OF EVALUATORS: Butch Bowie, Stacy Ladner, and Ginger McMullin

****

SUMMARY PAGE

Pass/Fail Criteria		
	Pass:	Fail:
✦ NA		
✦		
✦		
	Points Awarded:	
Numerical Score: (Edit sections below to match evaluation criteria within RFP)		
Section I. Organization Qualifications and Experience (Max: 40 Points)	35	
Section II. Proposed Services (Max: 20 Points)	20	
	19	
Section III: Cost Proposal (Max: 25 Points)	5	
Rate Sheet (Max: 5 Points)		
Section IV: Maine Business and Economic Impact Consideration (Max: 10 Points)	2	
TOTAL POINTS (Max: 100 Points)	81	

STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201805094
RFP TITLE: NRDA Ecology & Economic Analysis
BIDDER: Abt Associates.
DATE: 6/28/18

****

EVALUATION OF SECTION I
Organization Qualifications and Experience

Total Points Available: 40 **Score:** 35

****

Evaluation Team Comments:

- Very qualified - Well organized
- Government Work
- Identified Partners

- Litigation issues ?

STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201805094
RFP TITLE: NRDA Ecology & Economic Analysis
BIDDER: Abt Associates.
DATE: 6/28/18

****

EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Proposed Services

Total Points Available: 20 **Score:** 20

****

Evaluation Team Comments:

Can Provide a wide range of Services
Some Maine experience

STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201805094
RFP TITLE: NRDA Ecology & Economic Analysis
BIDDER: Abt Associates.
DATE: 6/28/18

****

EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Cost Proposal
Price: Comparison with Lowest Bid

Total Points Available: 25 **Score: 19**

****

Lowest submitted Cost Proposal	÷	Cost Proposal being scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
$16,764.75	÷	**$21,891.00**	x	**25 points**	=	**19**
Rate Sheet				Max 5 Points		5

Evaluation Team Comments:

STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201805094
RFP TITLE: NRDA Ecology & Economic Analysis
BIDDER: Abt Associates.
DATE: 6/28/18

****

EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Maine Business and Economic Impact Consideration

Total Points Available: (Insert maximum points available) **Score: 2**

****

MAINE BUSINESS ANALYSIS			
	Total	Maine Resident	Maine Impact
Number of FTE Employees:	1075	5.0	.5%
Payroll:	$129,492,964	$474,687	.4%
Average percent of MAINE BUSINESS ANALYSIS:			**.4%**

1-74%:	2 points
75-100%:	4 points

MAINE ECONOMIC IMPACT	
	Total amount in Maine
Income Taxes Paid (State):	$ 0
Property Taxes Paid (Local):	$ 0
Wages to Maine Residents:	$ 474,687
Payments to Maine Subcontractors Estimated:	$ 100,282
Sum of MAINE ECONOMIC IMPACT:	**$ 574,969**

$1 - $1,000,000:	2 points
$1,000,001 - $10,000,000:	4 points
>$10,000,000:	6 points

Total Points for Maine Business and Economic Impact Consideration:	**2**

STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201805094
RFP TITLE: NRDA Ecology & Economic Analysis
BIDDER: Environment International, Ltd.
DATE: 6/28/18

****

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record all evaluation notes and scoring that is obtained through consensus discussions among the full evaluation team for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. The RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator should complete this form and maintain the only copy. This form should reflect the full team's consensus evaluations, and this form is* ***not*** *meant to take the place of individual evaluation notes, which are still required from each member of the evaluation team. A separate form is available for individual evaluation notes. Please submit a copy of this document to the Division of Procurement Services as part of your contract award selection documents.*

DEPARTMENT NAME: Environmental Protection
NAME OF RFP COORDINATOR: Butch Bowie
NAMES OF EVALUATORS: Butch Bowie, Stacy Ladner, and Ginger McMullin

****

SUMMARY PAGE

Pass/Fail Criteria		
	Pass:	Fail:
✦ NA		
✦		
✦		
	Points Awarded:	
Numerical Score: (Edit sections below to match evaluation criteria within RFP)		
Section I. Organization Qualifications and Experience (Max: 40 Points)	40	
Section II. Proposed Services (Max: 20 Points)	20	
Section III: Cost Proposal (Max: 25 Points)	17	
Rate Sheet (Max: 5 Points)	5	
Section IV: Maine Business and Economic Impact Consideration (Max: 10 Points)	4	
TOTAL POINTS (Max: 100 Points)	86	

STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201805094
RFP TITLE: NRDA Ecology & Economic Analysis
BIDDER: Environment International, Ltd.
DATE: 6/28/18

****

EVALUATION OF SECTION I
Organization Qualifications and Experience

Total Points Available: 40 **Score:** 40

****

Evaluation Team Comments:

Good charts
Good Expertise

3 Good examples

Experience with different groups.

Worked with DEP in the Past

STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201805094
RFP TITLE: NRDA Ecology & Economic Analysis
BIDDER: Environment International, Ltd.
DATE: 6/28/18

****

EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Proposed Services

Total Points Available: 20 **Score:** 20

****

Evaluation Team Comments:

Right on target!
Good Section
Well qualified
Great analytical experience

STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201805094
RFP TITLE: NRDA Ecology & Economic Analysis
BIDDER: Environment International, Ltd.
DATE: 6/28/18

****

EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Cost Proposal
Price: Comparison with Lowest Bid

Total Points Available: 25 **Score:** 17

****

Lowest submitted Cost Proposal	÷	Cost Proposal being scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
$16,764.75	÷	**$24,862.80**	x	**25 points**	=	**17**
Rate Sheet				Max 5 Points		

Evaluation Team Comments:

STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201805094
RFP TITLE: NRDA Ecology & Economic Analysis
BIDDER: Environment International, Ltd.
DATE: 6/28/18

****

EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Maine Business and Economic Impact Consideration

Total Points Available: (Insert maximum points available) **Score:** 4

****

MAINE BUSINESS ANALYSIS			
	Total	Maine Resident	Maine Impact
Number of FTE Employees:	5.0	1.0	20%
Payroll:	$480,000	$30,000	6%
Average percent of MAINE BUSINESS ANALYSIS:			**13%**

1-74%:	2 points
75-100%:	4 points

MAINE ECONOMIC IMPACT	
	Total amount in Maine
Income Taxes Paid (State):	$ 0
Property Taxes Paid (Local):	$ 0
Wages to Maine Residents:	$ 30,000
Payments to Maine Subcontractors Estimated:	$ 0
Sum of MAINE ECONOMIC IMPACT:	**$ 30,000**

$1 - $1,000,000:	2 points
$1,000,001 - $10,000,000:	4 points
>$10,000,000:	6 points

Total Points for Maine Business and Economic Impact Consideration:	**4**

STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201805094
RFP TITLE: NRDA Ecology & Economic Analysis
BIDDER: Industrial Economics, Inc.
DATE: 6/28/18

****

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record all evaluation notes and scoring that is obtained through consensus discussions among the full evaluation team for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. The RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator should complete this form and maintain the only copy. This form should reflect the full team's consensus evaluations, and this form is* ***not*** *meant to take the place of individual evaluation notes, which are still required from each member of the evaluation team. A separate form is available for individual evaluation notes. Please submit a copy of this document to the Division of Procurement Services as part of your contract award selection documents.*

DEPARTMENT NAME: Environmental Protection
NAME OF RFP COORDINATOR: Butch Bowie
NAMES OF EVALUATORS: Butch Bowie, Stacy Ladner, and Ginger McMullin

****

SUMMARY PAGE

Pass/Fail Criteria		
	Pass:	Fail:
✦ NA		
✦		
✦		
	Points Awarded:	
Numerical Score: (Edit sections below to match evaluation criteria within RFP)		
Section I. Organization Qualifications and Experience (Max: 40 Points)	40	
Section II. Proposed Services (Max: 20 Points)	20	
Section III: Cost Proposal (Max: 25 Points)	25	
Rate Sheet (Max: 5 Points)	5	
Section IV: Maine Business and Economic Impact Consideration (Max: 10 Points)	2	
TOTAL POINTS (Max: 100 Points)	92	

STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201805094
RFP TITLE: NRDA Ecology & Economic Analysis
BIDDER: Industrial Economics, Inc.
DATE: 6/28/18

****

EVALUATION OF SECTION I
Organization Qualifications and Experience

Total Points Available: 40 **Score:** 40

****

Evaluation Team Comments:

Very well qualified
All projects listed were NRDA
Addressed all criteria very well

STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201805094
RFP TITLE: NRDA Ecology & Economic Analysis
BIDDER: Industrial Economics, Inc.
DATE: 6/28/18

****

EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Proposed Services

Total Points Available: 20 **Score:** 20

****

Evaluation Team Comments:

Can provide services
Very specific

STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201805094
RFP TITLE: NRDA Ecology & Economic Analysis
BIDDER: Industrial Economics, Inc.
DATE: 6/28/18

****

EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Cost Proposal
Price: Comparison with Lowest Bid

Total Points Available: 25 **Score: 25**

****

Lowest submitted Cost Proposal	÷	Cost Proposal being scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
$16,764.75	÷	**$16,764.75**	x	**25 points**	=	**25**
Rate Sheet				Max 5 Points		

Evaluation Team Comments:

STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201805094
RFP TITLE: NRDA Ecology & Economic Analysis
BIDDER: Industrial Economics, Inc.
DATE: 6/28/18

****

EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Maine Business and Economic Impact Consideration

Total Points Available: (Insert maximum points available) **Score: 2**

****

MAINE BUSINESS ANALYSIS			
	Total	Maine Resident	Maine Impact
Number of FTE Employees:	Not disclosed	.5	Less than 1%
Payroll:	Not disclosed	$55,068	Less than 1%
Average percent of MAINE BUSINESS ANALYSIS:			**Less than 1%**

1-74%:	2 points
75-100%:	4 points

MAINE ECONOMIC IMPACT	
	Total amount in Maine
Income Taxes Paid (State):	$ 0
Property Taxes Paid (Local):	$ 0
Wages to Maine Residents:	$ 55,068
Payments to Maine Subcontractors Estimated:	$ 0
Sum of MAINE ECONOMIC IMPACT:	**$ 55,068**

$1 - $1,000,000:	2 points
$1,000,001 - $10,000,000:	4 points
>$10,000,000:	6 points

Total Points for Maine Business and Economic Impact Consideration:	**2**

STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201805094
RFP TITLE: NRDA Ecology & Economic Analysis
BIDDER NAME: Abt Associates Inc.
DATE: ~~(Insert date proposal was reviewed by individual evaluator)~~ 6/21/2018
EVALUATOR NAME: Butch Bowie
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Environmental Protection

****

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by* ***individual*** *evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is* ***required*** *that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

****

Individual Evaluator Comments:

File 1 - Appendix A (yes)
Debarment - Appendix B (yes)

File 2 - Overview (yes)
- 3 examples included - Deep Water Horizon Spill
- Well qualified - Didn't see any work in ME listed
- Org Chart - (yes)
- Litigation (yes) Many!
- Financial Viability (yes)
- License and cert (yes) OSHA including Subcontractors (yes)
- Cert of Insurance (yes)

File 3 - Proposed Services
- Can provide wide variety of Services
- Maine Projects listed here

File 4 - Cost Proposal - Rate Sheet (yes)
Cost $ 21,891
identified staff and current rates

File 5 - Appendix E ME Business Eco Impact
Scored 2 points

Well qualified organization - Not a lot of work in Maine
Headquarters in MD
All required appendices included

STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201805094
RFP TITLE: NRDA Ecology & Economic Analysis
BIDDER NAME: Environment International Ltd.
DATE: 6/21/2018
EVALUATOR NAME: Butch Bowie
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Environmental Protection

****

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by* ***individual*** *evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is* ***required*** *that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

****

Individual Evaluator Comments:

File 1 Appendix A (yes)
Appendix B (yes)

File 2 Overview yes
Headquarters in WA - office in Scarborough ME
* Worked with ME Trustees on Hampden Site
Well qualified
- 3 project examples (yes)
- Org chart (yes)
- Litigation listed "none"
- Financial Viability (yes) not a lot of detail
* - License/Cert listed "none" No HAZWOPER? (likely not an issue for Scope of Services)
- Cert of Insurance (yes)

File 3 Proposed Services
Can provide wide variet of projects

File 4 Cost Proposal Rate Sheet (yes)
$ 24,862.80

File 5 Appendix E - ~~ME Business~~ and Eco Impact
(2 points)

Well qualified - Concise proposal
All required appendices included.

STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201805094
RFP TITLE: NRDA Ecology & Economic Analysis
BIDDER NAME: Industrial Economics, Inc.
DATE: 6/21/2018
EVALUATOR NAME: Butch Bowie
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Environmental Protection

****

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by* ***individual*** *evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is* ***required*** *that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

****

Individual Evaluator Comments:

File 1 Appendix A (yes) Headquarters - MA
Appendix B (yes) Some staff in ME

File 2 Overview Appendix C
3 examples given — Groundwater Assessment (Good)
Well qualified
- Org Chart (yes)
- Litigation 1 Case listed (yes)
- Financial Viability - Letter from Bank ?
- License/Cert (yes)

This section was 141 pages (!) Too long - My fault for allowing Resumes

File 3 Proposed Services
Can provide required services

File 4 Cost Proposal Appendix D Rate Sheet (yes)
$161,764.75 Good breakdown of costs
Good Rate sheet

File 5 Appendix E ME Business Eco Impact
2 points awarded

* Good qualifications
Experience with GW Assessment

STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201805094
RFP TITLE: Natural Resource Damage Assessments (NRDA) Ecology and Economic Analysis
BIDDER NAME: Abt Associates Inc.
DATE: June 27, 2018
EVALUATOR NAME: Stacy Ladner
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Environmental Protection

****

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by* ***Individual*** *evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is* ***required*** *that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

****

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Section I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

Overview of Organization
Positive:

- Nice overview description of the company and its technical capabilities
- Extensive NRDA experience (over 100 cases).
- Collecting quality data that will be scientifically defensible was stressed. This is important for making decision that will withstand technical and legal review.
- The reduced likelihood of a conflict of interest due to solely focusing on governmental clients. This is a key benefit of this company.
- Very broad relevant experience. Experience includes all media types, expansive types of biota, wide variety of types of sampling and broad end use of their contract work.
- Chart highlighted the categories of experience in: preliminary assessment, injury assessment and quantification, economic, restoration planning, case management, settlement and litigation support, and other damage assessment activities (examples were given).
- Abt draws upon partners to supplement their expertise. One such partner is a prominent Maine research organization (Biodiversity Research Institute).
- A chart provides Abt team members with their areas of expertise, education and years of experience.
- Detailed write ups are provided for each key team member with their NRDA experience highlighted.
- Three post NRDA projects were highlighted.

Negative:

- No Maine NRDA cases were on the project chart.
- Project terminated for failure to deliver work product. Extending circumstances were explained.

Organizational Chart
Positive:

- The team is identified along with their respective roles.
- Abt has over 2,800 staff over the globe with over 100 staff that specialize in NRDA.

Litigation
Negative:

- There is an extensive list of litigation over the last 5 years.

Financial Viability
Positive:

STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201805094
RFP TITLE: Natural Resource Damage Assessments (NRDA) Ecology and Economic Analysis
BIDDER NAME: Abt Associates Inc.
DATE: June 27, 2018
EVALUATOR NAME: Stacy Ladner
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Environmental Protection

• Consolidated Balance Sheets provided. Negative: • Requested financial health ratios were not provided.
Organization Licensure Positive: • Staff is certified for field work including OSHA HAZWOPER. Certificates of training were provided.
Certificate of Insurance Positive: • Certificates of insurance were provided. The certificates included various forms of liability insurance including professional liability.
Section II Specifications of Work to be Performed
Proposed Services Positive: • Clearly stated that they were seeking prequalification for all four categories. • Submitted evidence to support prequalification for all four categories. • Extensive experience with examples of determining impacts to wildlife from releases. • A hypothetical scenario was developed to illustrate their processes and methods for achieving the necessary response. • The roles of the various team members were explained. • Extensive relevant NRDA experience.
Section III, Cost Proposal
Cost Proposal Form Positive: • The cost proposal identifies method and costs for completion. • Rate sheets for hourly rates for personnel is included in the proposal. Propose escalation of rates using the Gross Domestic Product Implicit Price Deflator. • Cost Proposal Form was completed for the scenario.
Maine Business and Economic Impact Consideration Form Positive/: • Form was completed.

STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201805094
RFP TITLE: Natural Resource Damage Assessments (NRDA) Ecology and Economic Analysis
BIDDER NAME: Environmental International Ltd..
DATE: June 27, 2018
EVALUATOR NAME: Stacy Ladner
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Environmental Protection

****

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by* ***individual*** *evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is* ***required*** *that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

****

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Section I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
Overview of Organization Positive: • Nice overview description of the company and its technical capabilities • Extensive NRDA experience. • Has a Maine location. • Very broad relevant experience. • Chart highlighted the categories of experience in: economic analysis, ecotoxicology and ecological risk analysis, human toxicology and human health risk analysis, measuring and demonstrating impacts to wildlife caused by a release, measuring impacts to human health caused by a release, measuring lost used and services caused by releases, development of CSMs and contaminant exposure pathway analysis, • Detailed write ups are provided for each key team member with their NRDA experience highlighted. • Three post NRDA projects were highlighted. • Worked with Maine DEP on the Chevron NRD case.
Organizational Chart Positive: • The team is identified along with their respective roles.
Litigation Positive: • No litigation issues in the last 5 years.
Financial Viability Positive: • Assets and liabilities identified, but not from an audit or Consolidated Balance Sheet. Negative: • Requested financial health ratios were not provided.
Organization Licensure • Certifications identified for key staff.
Certificate of Insurance Positive: • Certificates of insurance were provided. The certificates included various forms of liability insurance including professional liability.
Section II Specifications of Work to be Performed

STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201805094
RFP TITLE: Natural Resource Damage Assessments (NRDA) Ecology and Economic Analysis
BIDDER NAME: Environmental International Ltd..
DATE: June 27, 2018
EVALUATOR NAME: Stacy Ladner
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Environmental Protection

Proposed Services Positive: • Submitted evidence to support prequalification for RFP work. • Extensive experience with examples of determining impacts to wildlife from releases. • The roles of the various team members were explained. • Extensive relevant NRDA experience.
Section III, Cost Proposal
Cost Proposal Form Positive: • The cost proposal identifies method and costs for completion. • Rate sheets for hourly rates for personnel is included in the proposal. Proposed escalation of rates in chart. • Cost Proposal Form was completed for the scenario.
Maine Business and Economic Impact Consideration Form Positive/: • Form was completed.

STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201805094
RFP TITLE: Natural Resource Damage Assessments (NRDA) Ecology and Economic Analysis
BIDDER NAME: Industrial Economics
DATE: June 27, 2018
EVALUATOR NAME: Stacy Ladner
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Environmental Protection

****

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

****

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Section I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
Overview of Organization Positive: • Nice overview description of the company and its technical capabilities • Extensive NRDA experience. • Worked with Maine DEP on NRD projects. • Stresses the importance of quality work to uphold litigation challenges. • Very broad relevant experience. • Chart highlighted the categories of experience in per team member for: type of injury evaluated, injury determination and quantification, economic damage determination, restoration evaluation planning or implementation, and additional NRDA areas of expertise, • Detailed write ups are provided for each key team member with their NRDA experience highlighted. • Three post NRDA projects were highlighted.
Organizational Chart Positive: • The team is identified along with their respective roles. • Extensive resumes of the qualifications of the staff.
Litigation Positive: • No substantial litigation in the last 5 years.
Financial Viability Positive: • Letter from bank generally relating to their finances. Negative: • Requested financial health ratios were not provided.
Organization Licensure • Nothing identified..
Certificate of Insurance Positive: • Certificates of insurance were provided. The certificates included various forms of liability insurance including professional liability.
Section II Specifications of Work to be Performed
Proposed Services

STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 201805094
RFP TITLE: Natural Resource Damage Assessments (NRDA) Ecology and Economic Analysis
BIDDER NAME: Industrial Economics
DATE: June 27, 2018
EVALUATOR NAME: Stacy Ladner
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Environmental Protection

Positive: • Submitted evidence to support prequalification for RFP work. • Extensive experience with examples of determining impacts to wildlife from releases. • The roles of the various team members were explained. • Extensive relevant NRDA experience.
Section III, Cost Proposal
Cost Proposal Form Positive: • The cost proposal identifies method and costs for completion. • Rate sheets for hourly rates for personnel is included in the proposal. Proposed escalation of rates in chart. • Cost Proposal Form was completed for the scenario.
Maine Business and Economic Impact Consideration Form Positive/: • Form was completed.

STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: (Insert RFP #) 2018 05 094
RFP TITLE: (Insert RFP Title) Pre-Qual Vendor List for NRDA Ecology + Econ. Analysis
BIDDER NAME: (Insert name of Bidder organization whose proposal is being reviewed) Abt Associates
DATE: (Insert date proposal was reviewed by individual evaluator) 6/26/18
EVALUATOR NAME: (Insert your name here) Virginia McMullin
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: (Insert your Department name here) DEP - BRWM - Response Services

****

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by* ***individual*** *evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is* ***required*** *that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

****

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Location: MD, MA etc. Have partnered w/ME firms (BKI)
Had issues w/ TX DOT contract - provided explanation + still have one contract with them. "State transaction terminated for cause" - Debarment form
Excellent qualifications + experience
Complete financial statement
All examples of qualifications addressed
All sections of proposal complete
Hypothetical: 21,891
Maine Economic Impact 574,969 (< 1%)
Lots of litigation?

STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: (Insert RFP #) 2018 05 094
RFP TITLE: (Insert RFP Title) Pre Qual Vendor List for NRDA Ecology + Econ. Analysis
BIDDER NAME: (Insert name of Bidder organization whose proposal is being reviewed) Environment Int'l Ltd.
DATE: (Insert date proposal was reviewed by individual evaluator) 6/26/18
EVALUATOR NAME: (Insert your name here) Virginia McMullin
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: (Insert your Department name here) DEP - BRWM - Response Services

****

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by* ***individual*** *evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is* ***required*** *that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

****

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Worked on Chevron in Hampden - 2011
Location: WA - office in Scarborough ME (1 person)
~~Not much documentation on personnel~~
~~other than org chart~~ (included at end)
Demonstrate experience
Very specifically address examples of qualifications as requested
Hypothetical: 74,862.80
Maine Economic Impact: 30,000 (13%)

STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: (Insert RFP #) 201805094
RFP TITLE: (Insert RFP Title) Pre-Qual. Vendor List for NRDA Ecology + Economic Anal.
BIDDER NAME: (Insert name of Bidder organization whose proposal is being reviewed) Industrial Economics
DATE: (Insert date proposal was reviewed by individual evaluator) 6/26/18
EVALUATOR NAME: (Insert your name here) Virginia McMullin
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: (Insert your Department name here) DEP- BRWM- Response Services

****

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by* ***individual*** *evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is* ***required*** *that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

****

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Specifically address all of the examples of qualifications sought (Part II)

Excellent qualifications / experience

Financial liability not addressed in as much detail as requested in RFP, but adequately per letter from bank.

Hypothetical : 16,769.75

ME Economic Impact 55,068 (< 1%)

All proposal contents complete

Location: MA - 1 staff member in ME

STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

Paul R. LePage
Governor

Paul Mercer
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: 201805094
RFP TITLE: NRDA Ecology & Economic Analysis

I, Butch Bowie, accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Environmental Protection. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the funding decision notices for public distribution.

Butch Bowie
Signature

6/22/2018
Date

Rev. Sept. 2013

STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF (enter Department)

Paul R. LePage
Governor

(Enter Commissioner)
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: ~~(Insert RFP #)~~ 201805094
RFP TITLE: ~~(Insert RFP title)~~ NRDA Ecology & Economic Analysis

I, (print name at right) Stacy Ladner
accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of (enter Department). I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the funding decision notices for public distribution.

Stacy A. Ladner
Signature

6/28/18
Date

Rev. Sept. 2013

STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF (enter Department)

Paul R. LePage
Governor

Paul Mercer
~~(Enter Commissioner)~~
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: ~~(Insert RFP #)~~ 201805094
RFP TITLE: ~~(Insert RFP title)~~ NRDA Ecology - Economic Analysis

I, (print name at right) Virginia McMullin
accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of (enter Department). I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the funding decision notices for public distribution.

V. McMullin
Signature

6/27/18
Date

Note: I was subcontracted through one of the bidder's contractors to NOAA during the Deepwater Horizon spill response in 2010, but did not work directly with the company (Industrial Economics Inc). Was still a state employee throughout —

Rev. Sept. 2013