

# State of Maine

## Master Score Sheet

RFP# 202310214					
Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers					
Bidder Name:		CBRE	Colliers Int'l Valuation & Advisory Svcs.	J. Powell Appraisals	LandVest
Proposed Cost:		\$200-275/hour	\$250-500/hour	\$150/hour	\$150-400/hour
Scoring Sections	Points Available				
Section I: Preliminary Information	Pass/Fail	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	45	40	50	43
Section III: Proposed Services	25	22	25	25	5
Section IV: Cost Proposal	25	20	15	23	18
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>87</u></b>	<b><u>80</u></b>	<b><u>98</u></b>	<b><u>66</u></b>
Bidder Name:		McManus & Nault			
Proposed Cost:		\$100/hour			
Scoring Sections	Points Available				
Section I: Preliminary Information	Pass/Fail	Pass			
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	50			
Section III: Proposed Services	25	23			
Section IV: Cost Proposal	25	25			
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>98</u></b>			

**Award Justification Statement**  
**RFP # 202310214**  
**Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers**

**I. Summary**

The Department of Agriculture, Conservation and Forestry (DACF) issued RFP number 202310214 to establish a pre-qualified vendor list (PQVL) of certified general real property appraisers to appraise agricultural land and other real property, and produce appraisal reports that are compliant with the most recent edition of the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP). The PFAS Fund within the Commissioner's Office needs appraisers to assess the value of agricultural land that DACF will purchase from PFAS-impacted commercial farms.

A total of 5 proposals were received. The review panel evaluated each proposal and determined that all five bidders should be added to the PQVL of certified general real property appraisers.

The successful firms are:

- CBRE
- Colliers International Valuation & Advisory Services
- J. Powell Appraisals
- LandVest
- McManus & Nault

**II. Evaluation Process**

Four evaluators reviewed the proposals:

- Beth Valentine, PFAS Fund Director (responsible for overall management of the PFAS Fund). Beth served as RFP Coordinator, Evaluator, Notetaker, and Facilitator.
- Melissa Hamlin, PFAS Fund Management Specialist (responsible for land acquisition and management by the PFAS Fund).
- William Patterson, Deputy Director of the Bureau of Public Lands (responsible for acquisition and management of public lands).
- Denice Baron, Resource Administrator (RA for the Commissioner's office).

Each evaluator recorded Individual Evaluation Notes for each proposal. The team met on December 20, 2023, to score the proposals using a consensus-based approach (i.e., using Team Consensus Evaluation Notes and a Master Score Sheet).

The team employed the following scoring rubric:

Section 1, Preliminary Information, 0 potential points

Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience, 50 potential points

Section III. Proposed Services, 25 potential points

Section IV. Cost Proposal, 25 potential points

### **III. Qualifications & Experience**

#### **CBRE:**

- Large firm with significant resources and a dedicated agricultural practice.

#### **Colliers International Valuation & Advisory Services:**

- Another large firm with a specialized agricultural practice.

#### **J. Powell Appraisals:**

- Local firm that employs a team approach and has extensive relevant experience.

#### **LandVest:**

- Significant experience assessing natural and working lands, e.g., for the Massachusetts Department of Agriculture and The Nature Conservancy.

#### **McManus & Nault:**

- Local firm that specializes in appraisals of land, farmland, farms, conservations, easements, timberland, landlocked land, recreational land, waterfront land, islands, and condemnation appraisals for road construction.

### **IV. Proposed Services**

#### **CBRE:**

- CBRE will appraise properties anywhere in the State.
- Corey Gustafson, understands nuances of USPAP and the valuation of agricultural [land]. The proposal includes a thorough description of CBRE's project approach.

- Highlights Maine ROW Valuation Team.

**Colliers International Valuation & Advisory Services: T**

- Colliers will appraise properties anywhere in the State.
- Colliers will produce USPAP compliant, narrative Appraisal Reports.

**J. Powell Appraisals:**

- J. Powell Appraisals will appraise properties anywhere in the State.
- Will provide USPAP compliant reports, knowledgeable about databases, zoning requirements, and deeds.

**LandVest:**

- Landvest did not specify the geographic scope of their services, although 2 of their sample projects were in Maine.
- LandVest did not describe their process for conducting appraisals.

**McManus & Nault:**

- McManus & Nault will perform appraisals in all Maine counties except Aroostook, Piscataquis, Penobscot, and Washington.
- Provided a thorough description of the process they use to determine highest and best use.

**V. Cost Proposal**

**CBRE:** Mid-range.

**Colliers International Valuation & Advisory Services:** Highest cost.

**J. Powell Appraisals:** Second lowest cost.

**LandVest:** Second highest cost.

**McManus & Nault:** Lowest cost.

**VI. Conclusion**

The evaluation team is confident that all five firms can perform the work described in the RFP and should be invited to bid on particular projects using the PQVL Mini-Bid Process as the need for appraisal services arises.



**STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF AGRICULTURE, CONSERVATION AND FORESTRY**

**Janet T. Mills  
Governor**

**Amanda E. Beal  
Commissioner**

January 17, 2024

Corey Gustafson  
CBRE  
33 Arch Street, 28<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Boston, MA 02110

VIA EMAIL: [corey.gustafson@cbre.com](mailto:corey.gustafson@cbre.com)

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Conditional Pre-Qualified Vendor List Awards under RFP # 202310214,  
Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers

Dear Mr. Gustafson:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Agriculture, Conservation and Forestry for a Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional awards to the following bidders.

- CBRE, Inc.
- Colliers International Valuation & Advisory Services, LLC
- J. Powell Appraisals, LLC
- LandVest, Inc.
- McManus & Nault Appraisal Company, Inc.

The bidders listed above have met the requirements for placement on the Pre-Qualified Vendor List. Vendors added to this Pre-Qualified Vendor List (PQVL) are not guaranteed a contract with the State of Maine but are eligible to submit bids on projects issued through the PQVL Mini-Bid Process, as defined in the RFP. Any Notice of Conditional Contract Award resulting from a Mini-Bid award is subject to execution of a written contract. As a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendors. The vendors shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award and dissolve the Pre-Qualified Vendor List at any time.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Beth Valentine". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a large loop at the end.

Beth Valentine, PFAS Fund Director

Phone: 207-313-0962

Email: [beth.valentine@maine.gov](mailto:beth.valentine@maine.gov)

## **STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS**

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



**STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF AGRICULTURE, CONSERVATION AND FORESTRY**

**Janet T. Mills  
Governor**

**Amanda E. Beal  
Commissioner**

January 17, 2024

Chris Stickney  
Colliers International Valuation and Advisory Services, LLC  
100 Federal Street, 13<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Boston, MA 02110

VIA EMAIL: [chris.stickney@colliers.com](mailto:chris.stickney@colliers.com)

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Conditional Pre-Qualified Vendor List Awards under RFP # 202310214,  
Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers

Dear Mr. Stickney:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Agriculture, Conservation and Forestry for a Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional awards to the following bidders.

- Colliers International Valuation & Advisory Services, LLC
- CBRE, Inc.
- J. Powell Appraisals, LLC
- LandVest, Inc.
- McManus & Nault Appraisal Company, Inc.

The bidders listed above have met the requirements for placement on the Pre-Qualified Vendor List. Vendors added to this Pre-Qualified Vendor List (PQVL) are not guaranteed a contract with the State of Maine but are eligible to submit bids on projects issued through the PQVL Mini-Bid Process, as defined in the RFP. Any Notice of Conditional Contract Award resulting from a Mini-Bid award is subject to execution of a written contract. As a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendors. The vendors shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award and dissolve the Pre-Qualified Vendor List at any time.



As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Beth Valentine". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a large loop at the end.

Beth Valentine, PFAS Fund Director

Phone: 207-313-0962

Email: [beth.valentine@maine.gov](mailto:beth.valentine@maine.gov)

## **STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS**

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



**STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF AGRICULTURE, CONSERVATION AND FORESTRY**

**Janet T. Mills  
Governor**

**Amanda E. Beal  
Commissioner**

January 17, 2024

John L. Powell  
J. Powell Appraisals LLC  
11 Blizzard Drive  
Newry, ME 04261

VIA EMAIL: [john@jpowellappraisals.com](mailto:john@jpowellappraisals.com)

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Conditional Pre-Qualified Vendor List Awards under RFP # 202310214,  
Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers

Dear Mr. Powell:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Agriculture, Conservation and Forestry for a Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional awards to the following bidders.

- J. Powell Appraisals, LLC
- CBRE, Inc.
- Colliers International Valuation & Advisory Services, LLC
- LandVest, Inc.
- McManus & Nault Appraisal Company, Inc.

The bidders listed above have met the requirements for placement on the Pre-Qualified Vendor List. Vendors added to this Pre-Qualified Vendor List (PQVL) are not guaranteed a contract with the State of Maine but are eligible to submit bids on projects issued through the PQVL Mini-Bid Process, as defined in the RFP. Any Notice of Conditional Contract Award resulting from a Mini-Bid award is subject to execution of a written contract. As a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendors. The vendors shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award and dissolve the Pre-Qualified Vendor List at any time.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Beth Valentine", with a large, stylized loop at the end.

Beth Valentine, PFAS Fund Director

Phone: 207-313-0962

Email: [beth.valentine@maine.gov](mailto:beth.valentine@maine.gov)

## **STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS**

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



**STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF AGRICULTURE, CONSERVATION AND FORESTRY**

**Janet T. Mills  
Governor**

**Amanda E. Beal  
Commissioner**

January 17, 2024

Jay E. Closser  
LandVest  
888 Boylston Street, Suite 520  
Boston, MA 02199

VIA EMAIL: [jclosser@landvest.com](mailto:jclosser@landvest.com)

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Conditional Pre-Qualified Vendor List Awards under RFP # 202310214,  
Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers

Dear Mr. Closser:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Agriculture, Conservation and Forestry for a Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional awards to the following bidders.

- LandVest, Inc.
- CBRE, Inc.
- Colliers International Valuation & Advisory Services, LLC
- J. Powell Appraisals, LLC
- McManus & Nault Appraisal Company, Inc.

The bidders listed above have met the requirements for placement on the Pre-Qualified Vendor List. Vendors added to this Pre-Qualified Vendor List (PQVL) are not guaranteed a contract with the State of Maine but are eligible to submit bids on projects issued through the PQVL Mini-Bid Process, as defined in the RFP. Any Notice of Conditional Contract Award resulting from a Mini-Bid award is subject to execution of a written contract. As a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendors. The vendors shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award and dissolve the Pre-Qualified Vendor List at any time.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Beth Valentine", with a large, stylized loop at the end.

Beth Valentine, PFAS Fund Director

Phone: 207-313-0962

Email: [beth.valentine@maine.gov](mailto:beth.valentine@maine.gov)

## **STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS**

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).





**STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF AGRICULTURE, CONSERVATION AND FORESTRY**

**Janet T. Mills  
Governor**

**Amanda E. Beal  
Commissioner**

January 17, 2024

Peter I. Nault  
McManus & Nault Appraisal Company, LLC  
1494 Route 3A, Suite 6  
Bow, NH 03304

VIA EMAIL: [peternault@comcast.net](mailto:peternault@comcast.net)

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Conditional Pre-Qualified Vendor List Awards under RFP # 202310214,  
Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers

Dear Mr. Nault:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Agriculture, Conservation and Forestry for a Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional awards to the following bidders.

- McManus & Nault Appraisal Company, Inc.
- CBRE, Inc.
- Colliers International Valuation & Advisory Services, LLC
- J. Powell Appraisals, LLC
- LandVest, Inc.

The bidders listed above have met the requirements for placement on the Pre-Qualified Vendor List. Vendors added to this Pre-Qualified Vendor List (PQVL) are not guaranteed a contract with the State of Maine but are eligible to submit bids on projects issued through the PQVL Mini-Bid Process, as defined in the RFP. Any Notice of Conditional Contract Award resulting from a Mini-Bid award is subject to execution of a written contract. As a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendors. The vendors shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award and dissolve the Pre-Qualified Vendor List at any time.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Beth Valentine". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a large loop at the end.

Beth Valentine, PFAS Fund Director

Phone: 207-313-0962

Email: [beth.valentine@maine.gov](mailto:beth.valentine@maine.gov)

## **STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS**

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers**

**BIDDER: CBRE**

**DATE: December 20, 2023**

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name: DACF**

**Name of RFP Coordinator: Beth Valentine**

**Names of Evaluators: Denice Baron, Melissa Hamlin, William Patterson, Beth Valentine,**

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)		
• Maine-licensed certified general real property appraiser	<b>Pass</b>	
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>50</b>	<b>45</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>25</b>	<b>22</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>20</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>87</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers**

**BIDDER: CBRE**

**DATE: December 20, 2023**

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- 1) Is the applicant a Maine-licensed Certified General Real Property Appraiser?  
Yes. Corey Gustafson
- 2) Did the applicant submit a Proposal Cover Page (**Appendix A**)?  
Yes. HQ in Dallas. Primary point of contact, Corey Gustafson, is based in Boston.
- 3) Did the applicant submit a Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification (**Appendix B**)?  
Yes

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers**

**BIDDER: CBRE**

**DATE: December 20, 2023**

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>50</b>	<b>45</b>

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- 1) Did the applicant submit an Organization Qualifications and Experience form (**Appendix C**)?  
Yes

Strengths include the firm's size and number of appraisers. Also, relevant experience, dedicated specialized agricultural practice, necessary in-house expertise, experience working with government clients, and experience appraising many types of natural resource lands.

- 2) Will the applicant employ subcontractors? If so, did the applicant include a list of subcontractors?

The bidder does not anticipate using subcontractors but will discuss with the State of Maine if the need for specialized services arises.

- 3) Did the applicant include a list of all current/recent litigation or otherwise comment on litigation within the past 5 years?

The bidder has 117,000 employees worldwide. With a company of this size, some litigation is incidental to business. All litigation is disclosed in SEC filings. Applicant stated that no current litigation is likely to be materially adverse to the bidder's ability to perform services related to this RFP.

- 4) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certificate of Insurance?

Yes. Included sample and will meet all insurance obligations if put on the PQVL.

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers**

**BIDDER: CBRE**

**DATE: December 20, 2023**

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>25</b>	<b>22</b>

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- 1) Geographic scope of practice (e.g., Statewide, selected counties):

Entire State of Maine

- 2) Did the bidder describe the process they will employ for conducting appraisals?

See page 13. Corey Gustafson, understands nuances of USPAP and the valuation of agricultural [land]. The proposal includes a thorough description of the bidder's project approach. Highlights Maine ROW Valuation Team.

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers**

**BIDDER: CBRE**

**DATE: December 20, 2023**

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Director/Principal = \$275/hour

MAI Appraiser - \$275/hour

Appraiser = \$200/hour

20 pts



**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers**

**BIDDER:** Colliers International Valuation & Advisory Services, LLC

**DATE:** December 20, 2023

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** DACF

**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Beth Valentine

**Names of Evaluators:** Denice Baron, Melissa Hamlin, William Patterson, Beth Valentine

---

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)		
• Maine-licensed certified general real property appraiser	<b>Pass</b>	
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>50</b>	<b>40</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>25</b>	<b>25</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>15</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>80</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers**

**BIDDER:** Colliers International Valuation & Advisory Services, LLC

**DATE:** December 20, 2023

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- 1) Is the applicant a Maine-licensed Certified General Real Property Appraiser?  
Yes, Chris Stickney, Managing Director of the Boston office.
- 2) Did the applicant submit a Proposal Cover Page (**Appendix A**)?  
Yes. HQ in CO, office in Boston
- 3) Did the applicant submit a Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification (**Appendix B**)?  
Yes

Pass

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers**

**BIDDER:** Colliers International Valuation & Advisory Services, LLC

**DATE:** December 20, 2023

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>50</b>	<b>40</b>

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- 1) Did the applicant submit an Organization Qualifications and Experience form (**Appendix C**)?  
Yes

Strengths include the bidder's agricultural specialty group and the overall capacity of a large firm. Also, they have conducted over 225 appraisals in Maine in recent years and have highly relevant experience, including appraisals of agricultural land and farm buildings.

- 2) Will the applicant employ subcontractors? If so, did the applicant include a list of subcontractors?

The bidder did not indicate whether or not they would employ subcontractors.

- 3) Did the applicant include a list of all current/recent litigation or otherwise comment on litigation within the past 5 years?

The bidder did not include a list of all current/recent litigation or otherwise comment on litigation within the past 5 years.

- 4) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certificate of Insurance?

Yes

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers**

**BIDDER:** Colliers International Valuation & Advisory Services, LLC

**DATE:** December 20, 2023

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>25</b>	<b>25</b>

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

5) Geographic scope of practice (e.g., Statewide, selected counties):

The bidder will perform appraisals throughout the state without limitation.

6) Did the bidder describe the process they will employ for conducting appraisals?

Yes, the bidder will produce USPAP compliant, narrative Appraisal Reports for the highest and best use of subject properties. The bidder noted they would employ a hypothetical condition as requested (i.e., no PFAS).

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers**

**BIDDER:** Colliers International Valuation & Advisory Services, LLC

**DATE:** December 20, 2023

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

\$250-500 per hour, 15 points

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers**

**BIDDER: J Powell Appraisals LLC**

**DATE: December 20, 2023**

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name: DACF**

**Name of RFP Coordinator: Beth Valentine**

**Names of Evaluators: Denice Baron, Melissa Hamlin, William Patterson, Beth Valentine**

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)		
• Maine-licensed certified general real property appraiser	<b>Pass</b>	
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>50</b>	<b>50</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>25</b>	<b>25</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>23</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>98</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers**

**BIDDER: J Powell Appraisals LLC**

**DATE: December 20, 2023**

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information App. A & B; license

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- 1) Is the applicant a Maine-licensed Certified General Real Property Appraiser?  
Yes
- 2) Did the applicant submit a Proposal Cover Page (**Appendix A**)?  
Yes. Based in Newry, ME
- 3) Did the applicant submit a Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification (**Appendix B**)?  
Yes

Pass

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers**

**BIDDER: J Powell Appraisals LLC**

**DATE: December 20, 2023**

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>50</b>	<b>50</b>

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- 1) Did the applicant submit an Organization Qualifications and Experience form (**Appendix C**)?  
Yes

Strengths include the firm's team-based approach and experience with complex acreage and natural resource valuation. Also, they are a small, local firm with relevant experience.

- 2) Will the applicant employ subcontractors? If so, did the applicant include a list of subcontractors?

The bidder will not use subcontractors.

- 3) Did the applicant include a list of all current/recent litigation or otherwise comment on litigation within the past 5 years?

The bidder responded "N/A".

- 4) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certificate of Insurance?

Yes



**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers**

**BIDDER: J Powell Appraisals LLC**

**DATE: December 20, 2023**

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>25</b>	<b>25</b>

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- 1) Geographic scope of practice (e.g., Statewide, selected counties):

The bidder will conduct appraisals throughout the entire state.

- 2) Did the bidder describe the process they will employ for conducting appraisals?

The bidder will provide USPAP compliant reports supported by their knowledge of databases, zoning requirements, and deeds. The bidder asserts they communicate often with clients and are very conscious of due dates.

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers**

**BIDDER: J Powell Appraisals LLC**

**DATE: December 20, 2023**

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

\$150/hour, 23 points

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers**

**BIDDER:** LandVest

**DATE:** December 20, 2023

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** DACF

**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Beth Valentine

**Names of Evaluators:** Denice Baron, Melissa Hamlin, William Patterson, Beth Valentine

---

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)		
• Maine-licensed certified general real property appraiser	<b>Pass</b>	
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>50</b>	<b>43</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>25</b>	<b>5</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>18</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>66</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers**

**BIDDER: LandVest**

**DATE: December 20, 2023**

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- 1) Is the applicant a Maine-licensed Certified General Real Property Appraiser?  
Yes, Jay Closser, Michael Hart, Mark Savage, Robert Ball. Mailing address is Boston.
  - 2) Did the applicant submit a Proposal Cover Page (**Appendix A**)?  
Yes
  - 3) Did the applicant submit a Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification (**Appendix B**)?  
Yes
- Pass

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers**

**BIDDER: LandVest**

**DATE: December 20, 2023**

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>50</b>	<b>43</b>

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- 1) Did the applicant submit an Organization Qualifications and Experience form (**Appendix C**)?  
Yes

Strengths include the bidder's experience working with the Massachusetts Department of Agriculture and The Nature Conservancy. The firm was established in 1968 and does a lot of conservation easements.

- 2) Will the applicant employ subcontractors? If so, did the applicant include a list of subcontractors?

The bidder did not specify whether they would use subcontractors, although subcontractors are referenced on the rate sheet.

- 3) Did the applicant include a list of all current/recent litigation or otherwise comment on litigation within the past 5 years?

The bidder did not respond to the question about litigation.

- 4) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certificate of Insurance?

Yes

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers**

**BIDDER: LandVest**

**DATE: December 20, 2023**

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>25</b>	<b>5</b>

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

5) Geographic scope of practice (e.g., Statewide, selected counties):

The bidder did not specify the geographic scope of their practice. Two of their sample projects were in Maine.

6) Did the bidder describe the process they will employ for conducting appraisals?

The bidder did not address the process they use to conduct appraisals.

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers**

**BIDDER:** LandVest

**DATE:** December 20, 2023

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Managing Director, Senior Appraisers, \$400/hour

Project Managers, \$300/hour

Assistant Project Managers, \$150/hour

18 pts.

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers**

**BIDDER:** McManus & Nault Appraisal Company, Inc.

**DATE:** December 20, 2023

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** DACF

**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Beth Valentine

**Names of Evaluators:** Denice Baron, Melissa Hamlin, William Patterson, Beth Valentine

---

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)		
• Maine-licensed certified general real property appraiser	<b>Pass</b>	
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>50</b>	<b>50</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>25</b>	<b>23</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>25</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>98</u></b>



**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers**

**BIDDER:** McManus & Nault Appraisal Company, Inc.

**DATE:** December 20, 2023

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- 1) Is the applicant a Maine-licensed Certified General Real Property Appraiser?  
Yes, Peter Nault
- 2) Did the applicant submit a Proposal Cover Page (**Appendix A**)?  
Yes. Based in Bow, NH.
- 3) Did the applicant submit a Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification (**Appendix B**)?  
Yes

Pass

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers**

**BIDDER:** McManus & Nault Appraisal Company, Inc.

**DATE:** December 20, 2023

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>50</b>	<b>50</b>

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- 1) Did the applicant submit an Organization Qualifications and Experience form (**Appendix C**)?  
Yes

**P** (Positive): Indicates what the evaluators see as a strength.

Strengths include the bidder's specialization in appraisals of land, farmland, farms, conservation easements, timberland, landlocked land, recreational land, waterfront land, islands, and condemnation appraisals for road construction. The bidder has conducted 100s of appraisals for NRCS, USFS, DOI, and the IRS (conservation easements & donations). They have also done work for the ME, NH & VT departments of transportation.

- 2) Will the applicant employ subcontractors? If so, did the applicant include a list of subcontractors?

The bidder will not use subcontractors.

- 3) Did the applicant include a list of all current/recent litigation or otherwise comment on litigation within the past 5 years?

The bidder is not involved in any current or past litigation.

- 4) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certificate of Insurance?

Yes.

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers**

**BIDDER:** McManus & Nault Appraisal Company, Inc.

**DATE:** December 20, 2023

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>25</b>	<b>23</b>

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

- 1) Geographic scope of practice (e.g., Statewide, selected counties):

The bidder will work in all Maine counties except Aroostook, Piscataquis, Penobscot, and Washington.

- 2) Did the bidder describe the process they will employ for conducting appraisals?

Page 10 describes the bidder's process to determine the highest and best use of real estate.

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers**

**BIDDER:** McManus & Nault Appraisal Company, Inc.

**DATE:** December 20, 2023

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

\$100/hour. 25 points

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: PRE-QUALIFIED VENDOR LIST FOR CERTIFIED GENERAL REAL PROPERTY APPRAISERS**

**BIDDER NAME: CBRE**

**DATE: 12-19-2023**

**EVALUATOR NAME: Bill Patterson**

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Agriculture, Conservation & Forestry**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) Is the applicant a Maine-licensed Certified General Real Property Appraiser? Yes
- 2) Did the applicant submit a Proposal Cover Page (**Appendix A**)? Yes
- 3) Did the applicant submit a Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification (**Appendix B**)? Yes
- 4) Did the applicant submit an Organization Qualifications and Experience (**Appendix C**)? Yes
- 5) Please record your reactions to Appendix C, Qualifications and Experience Form and related attachments, using the following categories:
  - **P** (Positive): Indicates what the evaluator sees as a strength.
  - **N** (Negative): Indicates what the evaluator sees as a weakness.
  - **Q** (Question): Indicates the evaluator is uncertain about the information presented.
  - **I** (Interesting): Indicates the evaluator finds the information interesting (i.e. when proposal provides an innovative approach or solution – “outside the box”).

CBRE is clearly qualified and we will need as many prequalified appraisers as possible due to limited availability.

- 6) Geographic scope of practice (e.g., Statewide, selected counties):  
Statewide
- 7) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certified General Real Property Appraiser license? Yes
- 8) Will the applicant employ subcontractors?

If so, did the applicant include a list of subcontractors?  
No

9) Did the applicant include a list of all current/recent litigation or otherwise comment on litigation within the past 5 years?

Yes

10) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certificate of Insurance?

Yes

11) Did the applicant include a Rate Sheet?

Comments: Yes

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: PRE-QUALIFIED VENDOR LIST FOR CERTIFIED GENERAL REAL PROPERTY APPRAISERS**

**BIDDER NAME:** Colliers

**DATE:** 12-19-2023

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Bill Patterson

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Agriculture, Conservation & Forestry

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) Is the applicant a Maine-licensed Certified General Real Property Appraiser? Yes
- 2) Did the applicant submit a Proposal Cover Page (**Appendix A**)? Yes
- 3) Did the applicant submit a Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification (**Appendix B**)? Yes
- 4) Did the applicant submit an Organization Qualifications and Experience (**Appendix C**)? Yes
- 5) Please record your reactions to Appendix C, Qualifications and Experience Form and related attachments, using the following categories:
  - **P** (Positive): Indicates what the evaluator sees as a strength.
  - **N** (Negative): Indicates what the evaluator sees as a weakness.
  - **Q** (Question): Indicates the evaluator is uncertain about the information presented.
  - **I** (Interesting): Indicates the evaluator finds the information interesting (i.e. when proposal provides an innovative approach or solution – “outside the box”).

Colliers has US Forest Service appraisal experience which is valuable to BPL. Colliers is clearly qualified and we will need as many prequalified appraisers as possible due to limited availability.

- 6) Geographic scope of practice (e.g., Statewide, selected counties):  
Statewide
- 7) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certified General Real Property Appraiser license? Yes

- 8) Will the applicant employ subcontractors?  
If so, did the applicant include a list of subcontractors?  
No
- 9) Did the applicant include a list of all current/recent litigation or otherwise comment on litigation within the past 5 years?  
No
- 10) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certificate of Insurance?  
Yes
- 11) Did the applicant include a Rate Sheet?  
Comments: Yes



**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: PRE-QUALIFIED VENDOR LIST FOR CERTIFIED GENERAL REAL PROPERTY APPRAISERS**

**BIDDER NAME:** J. Powell

**DATE:** 12-19-2023

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Bill Patterson

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Agriculture, Conservation & Forestry

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) Is the applicant a Maine-licensed Certified General Real Property Appraiser? Yes
- 2) Did the applicant submit a Proposal Cover Page (**Appendix A**)? Yes
- 3) Did the applicant submit a Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification (**Appendix B**)? Yes
- 4) Did the applicant submit an Organization Qualifications and Experience (**Appendix C**)? Yes
- 5) Please record your reactions to Appendix C, Qualifications and Experience Form and related attachments, using the following categories:

- **P** (Positive): Indicates what the evaluator sees as a strength.
- **N** (Negative): Indicates what the evaluator sees as a weakness.
- **Q** (Question): Indicates the evaluator is uncertain about the information presented.
- **I** (Interesting): Indicates the evaluator finds the information interesting (i.e. when proposal provides an innovative approach or solution – “outside the box”).

J. Powell is a medium size firm, exp. With Coastal maine Botanical Gardens is some limited local experience. J. Powell is clearly qualified and we will need as many prequalified appraisers as possible due to limited availability.

- 6) Geographic scope of practice (e.g., Statewide, selected counties):  
Statewide
- 7) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certified General Real Property Appraiser license? Yes

- 8) Will the applicant employ subcontractors?  
If so, did the applicant include a list of subcontractors?  
No
- 9) Did the applicant include a list of all current/recent litigation or otherwise comment on litigation within the past 5 years?  
No
- 10) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certificate of Insurance?  
Yes
- 11) Did the applicant include a Rate Sheet?  
Comments: Yes

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: PRE-QUALIFIED VENDOR LIST FOR CERTIFIED GENERAL REAL PROPERTY APPRAISERS**

**BIDDER NAME:** LandVest

**DATE:** 12-19-2023

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Bill Patterson

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Agriculture, Conservation & Forestry

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) Is the applicant a Maine-licensed Certified General Real Property Appraiser? Yes
- 2) Did the applicant submit a Proposal Cover Page (**Appendix A**)? Yes
- 3) Did the applicant submit a Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification (**Appendix B**)? Yes
- 4) Did the applicant submit an Organization Qualifications and Experience (**Appendix C**)? Yes
- 5) Please record your reactions to Appendix C, Qualifications and Experience Form and related attachments, using the following categories:
  - **P** (Positive): Indicates what the evaluator sees as a strength.
  - **N** (Negative): Indicates what the evaluator sees as a weakness.
  - **Q** (Question): Indicates the evaluator is uncertain about the information presented.
  - **I** (Interesting): Indicates the evaluator finds the information interesting (i.e. when proposal provides an innovative approach or solution – “outside the box”).

LandVest has a great deal of forestland appraisal experience in Maine and is very experienced with forest land appraisals that BPL needs often. LandVest is clearly qualified and we will need as many prequalified appraisers as possible due to limited availability.

- 6) Geographic scope of practice (e.g., Statewide, selected counties):  
Statewide
- 7) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certified General Real Property Appraiser license? Yes

- 8) Will the applicant employ subcontractors?  
If so, did the applicant include a list of subcontractors?  
No
- 9) Did the applicant include a list of all current/recent litigation or otherwise comment on litigation within the past 5 years?  
No
- 10) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certificate of Insurance?  
Yes
- 11) Did the applicant include a Rate Sheet?  
Comments: Yes

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: PRE-QUALIFIED VENDOR LIST FOR CERTIFIED GENERAL REAL PROPERTY APPRAISERS**

**BIDDER NAME:** McManus & Nault

**DATE:** 12-19-2023

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Bill Patterson

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Agriculture, Conservation & Forestry

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) Is the applicant a Maine-licensed Certified General Real Property Appraiser? Yes
- 2) Did the applicant submit a Proposal Cover Page (**Appendix A**)? Yes
- 3) Did the applicant submit a Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification (**Appendix B**)? Yes
- 4) Did the applicant submit an Organization Qualifications and Experience (**Appendix C**)? Yes
- 5) Please record your reactions to Appendix C, Qualifications and Experience Form and related attachments, using the following categories:
  - **P** (Positive): Indicates what the evaluator sees as a strength.
  - **N** (Negative): Indicates what the evaluator sees as a weakness.
  - **Q** (Question): Indicates the evaluator is uncertain about the information presented.
  - **I** (Interesting): Indicates the evaluator finds the information interesting (i.e. when proposal provides an innovative approach or solution – “outside the box”).

McManus & Nault was most reasonably priced proposal. McManus & Nault is clearly qualified and we will need as many prequalified appraisers as possible due to limited availability.

- 6) Geographic scope of practice (e.g., Statewide, selected counties):  
Limited to some counties which is not a big deal it will just limit what projects they can work on.
- 7) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certified General Real Property Appraiser license? Yes

- 8) Will the applicant employ subcontractors?  
If so, did the applicant include a list of subcontractors?  
No
- 9) Did the applicant include a list of all current/recent litigation or otherwise comment on litigation within the past 5 years?  
No
- 10) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certificate of Insurance?  
Yes
- 11) Did the applicant include a Rate Sheet?  
Comments: Yes

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202310214

**RFP TITLE:** Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers

**BIDDER NAME:** CBRE, Inc.

**DATE:** 12/19/23

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Denice Baron

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Dept of Agriculture, Conservation and Forestry

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

***Directions:*** *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

***I. Organization Qualifications and Experience***

***1. Overview of Organization***

- *Headquarters TX, closest office in Boston, MA*
- *Formed in 1906*
- *Very large company with many resources*
- *Provided 3 projects*
- *Licensed in Maine and provided copy*
- *Has a dedicated national Agricultural Specialty Practice Group*

***2. Subcontractors – Not planning on needed but will use if needed for Maine***

***3. Litigation – In their opinion, no litigation to which CBRE is currently a party.***

***4. Certificate of Insurance – Provided and is current***

***II. Proposed Services***

***1. Services to be Provided***

- *Will provide services throughout entire State of Maine.*
- *Provided lots of details on their valuation process*

***III. Cost***

***1. Rates \$80 - \$275/hr***

***2. Rate excludes any court type activities***

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202310214

**RFP TITLE:** Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers

**BIDDER NAME:** Colliers International Valuation & Advisory Services, LLC

**DATE:** 12/19/23

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Denice Baron

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Dept of Agriculture, Conservation and Forestry

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

***Directions:*** *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

***I. Organization Qualifications and Experience***

***1. Overview of Organization***

- *Headquarters CO, closest office in Boston, MA*
- *Formed in 2018*
- *Varied farmland appraisals for rural properties*
- *Provided 3 projects*
- *Licensed in Maine and provided copy and will license other staff if added to PQVL*
- *Provided resumes/experience of multiple staff as well as details of other clients and valuation professionals.*
- *Has a dedicated national Agricultural Specialty Practice Group*

***2. Subcontractors – Not addressed***

***3. Litigation – Not addressed***

***4. Certificate of Insurance – Provided and is current***

***II. Proposed Services***

***1. Services to be Provided***

- *Will provide services throughout entire State of Maine.*
- *Provided some of details on their valuation process*

***III. Cost***

***1. Rates \$75 - \$500/hr***



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202310214

**RFP TITLE:** Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers

**BIDDER NAME:** J Powell Appraisals LLC

**DATE:** 12/19/23

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Denice Baron

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Dept of Agriculture, Conservation and Forestry

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

***Directions:*** *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

**NOTE:** *Debarment was completed but appeared to be unsigned.*

**I. Organization Qualifications and Experience**

**1. Overview of Organization**

- Headquarters Newry Maine
- Firm of 6 people
- Provided 3 projects all in the State of Maine
- Licensed in Maine and provided copy

**2. Subcontractors – N/A**

**3. Litigation – N/A**

**4. Certificate of Insurance – Provided and is current**

**II. Proposed Services**

**1. Services to be Provided**

- Will provide services throughout entire State of Maine.
- Provided some details on their valuation process

**III. Cost**

**1. Rates \$150/hr – Generally fees are between \$2,500-\$7,500**

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202310214

**RFP TITLE:** Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers

**BIDDER NAME:** LandVest, Inc.

**DATE:** 12/19/23

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Denice Baron

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Dept of Agriculture, Conservation and Forestry

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

***Directions:*** *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

***I. Organization Qualifications and Experience***

***1. Overview of Organization***

- *Headquarters Boston, MA*
- *Formed in 1968*
- *Provided 3 projects, including in Maine – BPL (32 mile railway) and The Nature Conservancy*
- *Licensed in Maine and other NE states, provided copies*

***2. Subcontractors – No specific details provided***

***3. Litigation – not addressed in their proposal***

***4. Certificate of Insurance – Provided and is current***

***II. Proposed Services***

***1. Services to be Provided***

- *None provided but feel like they could provide some if not all services needed.*

***III. Cost***

***1. Rates \$125 - \$400/hr***

***2. IRS mileage reimbursement rate***

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202310214

**RFP TITLE:** Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers

**BIDDER NAME:** McManus & Nault Appraisal Company Inc.

**DATE:** 12/19/23

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Denice Baron

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Dept of Agriculture, Conservation and Forestry

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

***Directions:*** *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

**NOTE:** *Debarment was completed but appeared to be unsigned.*

**I. Organization Qualifications and Experience**

**1. Overview of Organization**

- Headquarters NH
- Formed in 2002
- Provides services in ME, NH and VT
- Specializes in many different types of farmlands, conservation, timbers
- Provided resume/experience
- Provided 3 projects
- Licensed in Maine and provided copies

**2. Subcontractors – N/A**

**3. Litigation – N/A**

**4. Certificate of Insurance – Provided and is current**

**II. Proposed Services**

**1. Services to be Provided**

- Will provide services throughout entire State of Maine, excluding Aroostook, Piscataquis, Penobscot and Washington Counties.
- Provided some details on their valuation process

**III. Cost**

**1. Rates \$100/hr**

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: PRE-QUALIFIED VENDOR LIST FOR CERTIFIED GENERAL REAL PROPERTY APPRAISERS**

**BIDDER NAME: CBRE**

**DATE: December 12, 2023**

**EVALUATOR NAME: Beth Valentine**

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Agriculture, Conservation & Forestry**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) Is the applicant a Maine-licensed Certified General Real Property Appraiser? Yes. Corey Gustafson
- 2) Did the applicant submit a Proposal Cover Page (**Appendix A**)? Yes. HQ in Dallas. Primary point of contact, Corey Gustafson, is based in Boston.
- 3) Did the applicant submit a Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification (**Appendix B**)? Yes
- 4) Did the applicant submit an Organization Qualifications and Experience (**Appendix C**)? Yes
- 5) Please record your reactions to Appendix C, Qualifications and Experience Form and related attachments, using the following categories:

- **P (Positive):** Indicates what the evaluator sees as a strength.

Largest commercial real estate services and investment firm in the world. Based in Dallas, > 500 offices worldwide. VAS group has more than 1,900 valuation professionals. Large staff allows for extreme flexibility in scheduling, as well as quick response and delivery time. Experienced with all property types, including farms. Access to latest technology and software.

Local [how is that defined?] includes over 20 valuation specialists. Tina O'Connell, MAI based in Maine.

**Project 1:** US Army Corps of Engineers. Subsurface mineral rights. Complied with UASFLA (federal) standard. **Why did they highlight this project?**

**Project 2.** USDA. Partial taking of raw timberland for conservation easement using federal standards for appraisals. Near Bangor.

**Project 3:** Ski Hearth Farm. Estimated amount of compensation for repair & relocation of a bridge. Limited going-concern and xc skiing. Client was NHDOT.

**Proposed Services:** Page 13. Corey Gustafson, understands nuances of USPAP and the valuation of agricultural [land].

Acknowledged hypothetical (i.e., value as if no PFAS).

- **N (Negative):** Indicates what the evaluator sees as a weakness.

None of the sample projects were especially ag-focused. No mention of soils.

**Proposed Services:** Proposal included a thorough description of CBRE's project approach, although it is written for a government taking of a ROW, as opposed to a fee simple sale. Highlights Maine ROW Valuation Team and experience with aviation-related assets.

- **Q (Question):** Indicates the evaluator is uncertain about the information presented.

CBRE has a dedicated Agricultural Specialty Practice group. Where?

- **I (Interesting):** Indicates the evaluator finds the information interesting (i.e. when proposal provides an innovative approach or solution – “outside the box”).

6) Geographic scope of practice (e.g., Statewide, selected counties):  
Entire State of Maine.

7) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certified General Real Property Appraiser license? Yes, Corey Gustafson

8) Will the applicant employ subcontractors?  
If so, did the applicant include a list of subcontractors?  
Does not anticipate using subcontractors. Will discuss with SOM if need for specialized services arise.

9) Did the applicant include a list of all current/recent litigation or otherwise comment on litigation within the past 5 years? 117,000 employees worldwide. Some litigation incidental to business, disclosed in SEC filings. None likely to be materially adverse to CBRE's ability to perform services related to this RFP.

10) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certificate of Insurance? Yes.

11) Did the applicant include a Rate Sheet? Yes.  
Comments:

- Director/Principal = \$275/hour
- MAI Appraiser - \$275/hour
- Appraiser = \$200/hour



**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: PRE-QUALIFIED VENDOR LIST FOR CERTIFIED GENERAL REAL PROPERTY APPRAISERS**

**BIDDER NAME:** Colliers International Valuation & Advisory Services, LLC

**DATE:** December 12, 2023

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Beth Valentine

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Agriculture, Conservation & Forestry

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) Is the applicant a Maine-licensed Certified General Real Property Appraiser? Yes, Chris Stickney, Managing Director of the Boston office.
- 2) Did the applicant submit a Proposal Cover Page (**Appendix A**)? Yes. HQ in CO, office in Boston
- 3) Did the applicant submit a Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification (**Appendix B**)? Yes
- 4) Did the applicant submit an Organization Qualifications and Experience (**Appendix C**)? Yes
- 5) Please record your reactions to Appendix C, Qualifications and Experience Form and related attachments, using the following categories:

- **P (Positive):** Indicates what the evaluator sees as a strength.

Colliers has an Agricultural Specialty Practice Group led by Ben Slaughter. Founded in 2018, 10 appraisers. Valued property in 30+ states, e.g., row crops, pasture, woodland, orchards, etc. See pg. 14-17. LARGE properties. One apple orchard in NH (p. 16).

Ben Slaughter, head of the Agricultural Specialty Practice Group, has 20 years of experience in ag property valuation.

Project 1: 353.95 acres, orchards, pasture, cropland, agritourism, event venue, woodland. Connecticut Valley. What state?

Project 2: 446 acres, 30 as a vineyards, woodland, homesites, onsite irrigation reservoir, 16 tobacco curing barns. Connecticut.

Project 3: 2 farms in Vermont. Rural residential homesites.

**Proposed Services:** Colliers will produce USPAP compliant, narrative Appraisal Reports. Highest and best use of subject properties. Noted they would employ a hypothetical condition (i.e., no PFAS).

- **N (Negative):** Indicates what the evaluator sees as a weakness.

Didn't mention soil types in project examples.

No Maine examples. Vermont has a similar economy. Connecticut is very different, though.

Page 7. Chris Stickney does not highlight any experience with farmland.

Ben Slaughter, head of the Agricultural Specialty Practice Group, is located in Fresno, CA. He's a farmer in San Joaquin Valley (very different from Maine!).

- **Q (Question):** Indicates the evaluator is uncertain about the information presented.

Supported by Boston office. If selected, member(s) of the Agricultural Practice Group would seek reciprocal licensure in Maine and be co-signed by Chris Stickney.

- **I (Interesting):** Indicates the evaluator finds the information interesting (i.e. when proposal provides an innovative approach or solution – "outside the box").

6) Geographic scope of practice (e.g., Statewide, selected counties):  
Throughout the state without limitation.

7) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certified General Real Property Appraiser license? Yes, Chris Stickney.

8) Will the applicant employ subcontractors? Undisclosed, not likely.  
If so, did the applicant include a list of subcontractors?

9) Did the applicant include a list of all current/recent litigation or otherwise comment on litigation within the past 5 years? No

10) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certificate of Insurance? Yes

11) Did the applicant include a Rate Sheet? Yes

Comments:

Managing Director \$500/hour

Valuation Specialist \$250/hour



**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: PRE-QUALIFIED VENDOR LIST FOR CERTIFIED GENERAL REAL PROPERTY APPRAISERS**

**BIDDER NAME:** J Powell Appraisals LLC

**DATE:** December 12, 2023

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Beth Valentine

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Agriculture, Conservation & Forestry

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) Is the applicant a Maine-licensed Certified General Real Property Appraiser? Yes
- 2) Did the applicant submit a Proposal Cover Page (**Appendix A**)? Yes. Based in Newry, ME
- 3) Did the applicant submit a Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification (**Appendix B**)? Yes
- 4) Did the applicant submit an Organization Qualifications and Experience (**Appendix C**)?
- 5) Please record your reactions to Appendix C, Qualifications and Experience Form and related attachments, using the following categories:

- **P (Positive):** Indicates what the evaluator sees as a strength.

6-person firm. Experience with commercial property in New England (ME, MA, RI & NH), including farms. John Powell has had his firm since 2006, and has been an appraiser since 1997.

Uses collaborative process, & secure digital folders.

Project 1: Coastal Maine Botanical Garden. Complex property assignment.

Project 2: 810 acre hunting/fishing property with several dwellings & other buildings. Has a Tree Growth Management Plan.

Project 3: 74 acre horse farm in Vassalboro, single-family home and several barns and support buildings.

**Proposed Services:** Will provide USPAP compliant reports, knowledgeable about databases, zoning requirements, and deeds. Communicate often with clients. Very conscious of due dates.

Produced 8 reports for 2 owners of 935 acres of farmland in Dover-Foxcroft.

- **N (Negative):** Indicates what the evaluator sees as a weakness.

Project 3: Nothing about ag soils even though a “large portion of the land would be considered useful as farmland.”

**Proposed Services:** Did not reference hypothetical condition.

- **Q (Question):** Indicates the evaluator is uncertain about the information presented.
- **I (Interesting):** Indicates the evaluator finds the information interesting (i.e. when proposal provides an innovative approach or solution – “outside the box”).

6) Geographic scope of practice (e.g., Statewide, selected counties):  
Entire state. P. 9

7) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certified General Real Property Appraiser license? Yes, John L. Powell

8) Will the applicant employ subcontractors? Responded “N/A”  
If so, did the applicant include a list of subcontractors?

9) Did the applicant include a list of all current/recent litigation or otherwise comment on litigation within the past 5 years? Responded “N/A”

10) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certificate of Insurance? Yes

11) Did the applicant include a Rate Sheet?

Comments:

\$150/hour, commercial appraisal fees \$2,500 - \$7,500.

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: PRE-QUALIFIED VENDOR LIST FOR CERTIFIED GENERAL REAL PROPERTY APPRAISERS**

**BIDDER NAME:** LandVest

**DATE:** December 12, 2023

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Beth Valentine

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Agriculture, Conservation & Forestry

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) Is the applicant a Maine-licensed Certified General Real Property Appraiser? Yes, Jay Closser, Michael Hart, Mark Savage, Robert Ball. Mailing address is Boston.
- 2) Did the applicant submit a Proposal Cover Page (**Appendix A**)? Yes
- 3) Did the applicant submit a Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification (**Appendix B**)? Yes
- 4) Did the applicant submit an Organization Qualifications and Experience (**Appendix C**)? Yes
- 5) Please record your reactions to Appendix C, Qualifications and Experience Form and related attachments, using the following categories:

- **P (Positive):** Indicates what the evaluator sees as a strength.

New England-based, formed in 1968. Focused on land, especially timberland.

Jay Closser has been appraising farmland in MA since 1992, and in NH since 2000.

**Project 1:** 79 acres for MA Depart. of Agriculture. Valued an ag easement. Report included an analysis of soil types and capabilities and a breakdown between tillable acreage and other support acreage. April 2023.

**Project 2:** Appraisal of a corridor for a 32-mile rail trail for ME DACF/LMF: woodland, open land, and intown commercial. Spring 2021.

**Project 3:** 604 acres in Madrid, ME. Highest and best use = timber and recreation. Client was The Nature Conservancy. Fall 2023.

- **N (Negative):** Indicates what the evaluator sees as a weakness.

**Proposed services:** Did not specifically mention USPAP compliant report, how projects are managed, hypothetical condition, . . .

- **Q (Question):** Indicates the evaluator is uncertain about the information presented.

LandVest both manages and assesses timberland?

Michael Hart, Mark Savage, and Robert Ball have a mix of experience, but not specifically farmland.

- **I (Interesting):** Indicates the evaluator finds the information interesting (i.e. when proposal provides an innovative approach or solution – “outside the box”).

6) Geographic scope of practice (e.g., Statewide, selected counties):  
Did not specify.

7) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certified General Real Property Appraiser license? Yes, four (Jay Closser, Michael Hart, Mark Savage, Robert Ball)

8) Will the applicant employ subcontractors? Did not specify.  
If so, did the applicant include a list of subcontractors?

9) Did the applicant include a list of all current/recent litigation or otherwise comment on litigation within the past 5 years? No, did not include.

10) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certificate of Insurance? Yes

11) Did the applicant include a Rate Sheet? Yes

Comments:

- Managing Director, Senior Appraisers, \$400/hour
- Project Managers, \$300/hour
- Assistant Project Managers, \$150/hour

Incomplete/cursory proposal.

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: PRE-QUALIFIED VENDOR LIST FOR CERTIFIED GENERAL REAL PROPERTY APPRAISERS**

**BIDDER NAME:** McManus & Nault Appraisal Company, Inc.

**DATE:** December 12, 2023

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Beth Valentine

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Agriculture, Conservation & Forestry

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) Is the applicant a Maine-licensed Certified General Real Property Appraiser? Yes
- 2) Did the applicant submit a Proposal Cover Page (**Appendix A**)? Yes. Based in Bow, NH.
- 3) Did the applicant submit a Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification (**Appendix B**)? Yes
- 4) Did the applicant submit an Organization Qualifications and Experience (**Appendix C**)? Yes
- 5) Please record your reactions to Appendix C, Qualifications and Experience Form and related attachments, using the following categories:

- **P** (Positive): Indicates what the evaluator sees as a strength.

Company formed in 2002, 21 years of experience.

Specialize in appraisals of land, farmland, farms, conservations, easements, timberland, landlocked land, recreational land, waterfront land, islands, and condemnation appraisals for road construction.

100s of appraisals for NRCS, USFS, DOI, IRS conservation easements & donations. ME, NH & VT DOT.

Project 1: 124.54 acres of farmland in NH for NRCS ag easement. Prime & locally significant ag soils.

Project 2: two wooded tracts in Bethel, ~527 ac. total. Recreational. USFS.

Project 3: 43.11 acres in NH for NRCS ag easements. Prime & locally significant soils, maple sugaring, good views.

**Proposed Services:** Page 10. Describes process used to determine highest and best use.

- **N (Negative):** Indicates what the evaluator sees as a weakness.

Ag valuations were for easements, not fee simple.

- **Q (Question):** Indicates the evaluator is uncertain about the information presented.
- **I (Interesting):** Indicates the evaluator finds the information interesting (i.e. when proposal provides an innovative approach or solution – “outside the box”).

- 6) Geographic scope of practice (e.g., Statewide, selected counties):  
Licensed in ME, NH & VT. Willing to work in all Maine counties except Aroostook, Piscataquis, Penobscot, and Washington.
- 7) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certified General Real Property Appraiser license? Yes, Peter Nault
- 8) Will the applicant employ subcontractors? No  
If so, did the applicant include a list of subcontractors? N/A
- 9) Did the applicant include a list of all current/recent litigation or otherwise comment on litigation within the past 5 years? No current or past litigation.
- 10) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certificate of Insurance? Yes
- 11) Did the applicant include a Rate Sheet? Yes  
Comments:
  - \$100/hour
  - Will be a set fee including all time spent and expenses

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: PRE-QUALIFIED VENDOR LIST FOR CERTIFIED GENERAL REAL PROPERTY APPRAISERS**

**BIDDER NAME:** CBRE, Inc.

**DATE:** 12/14/23

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Melissa Hamlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Agriculture, Conservation & Forestry

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) Is the applicant a Maine-licensed Certified General Real Property Appraiser? YES
- 2) Did the applicant submit a Proposal Cover Page (**Appendix A**)? YES
- 3) Did the applicant submit a Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification (**Appendix B**)? YES
- 4) Did the applicant submit an Organization Qualifications and Experience (**Appendix C**)? YES
- 5) Please record your reactions to Appendix C, Qualifications and Experience Form and related attachments, using the following categories:
  - **P** (Positive): Indicates what the evaluator sees as a strength.
  - **N** (Negative): Indicates what the evaluator sees as a weakness.
  - **Q** (Question): Indicates the evaluator is uncertain about the information presented.
  - **I** (Interesting): Indicates the evaluator finds the information interesting (i.e. when proposal provides an innovative approach or solution – “outside the box”).

Responsive to request for SOQ including characteristics of the organization:

- Many resources listed (company and tech); **P**
- Statement that the large staff allows for quick response and delivery times; **P**
- Lists advanced credentials, including those applicable to conservation easements; **P**
- Organization has a national Agricultural Specialty Practice group; **P**

Relevant points of experience:

- Project experience includes government clients; **P**
- Projects include rural lands, timberlands, wetlands; **P**
- Appraisals of productive farmland do not appear to be included; **Q**

- 6) Geographic scope of practice (e.g., Statewide, selected counties):

Statewide specified; two of the example projects are located in Piscataquis and Penobscot counties.

- 7) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certified General Real Property Appraiser license?

YES, for the managing director of the regional office. Two other appraisers are identified; their licenses are not included.

- 8) Will the applicant employ subcontractors?

The applicant states that no subcontractors are anticipated.

- 9) Did the applicant include a list of all current/recent litigation or otherwise comment on litigation within the past 5 years?

The applicant commented that as a large company, it is involved with litigation at times, none of which in its opinion is likely to have a materially adverse effect on its ability to perform the services.

- 10) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certificate of Insurance?

The applicant provided samples, including PL applicable to CBRE subsidiaries, along with a statement that the organization will meet any insurance requirements.

- 11) Did the applicant include a Rate Sheet? YES

Comments:

- Hourly rates are provided for various team members
- No fixed rate items are listed
- Rate sheet does not address expenses

Other comments:

- In both Section III and the SOQ (Section II(1)), there is a focus on right-of-way work, which is less relevant for this scope;
- Specifically identifies one Maine-based appraiser and two others based in a regional office.
- Section III, Proposed Services - Notes
  - The appraiser provided a review of the appraisal process
  - Approach to developing the scope is discussed
  - Methods and resources are addressed generally overall, with some detail
  - Appraiser helps meet expectations via internal QA/QC reviews



**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: PRE-QUALIFIED VENDOR LIST FOR CERTIFIED GENERAL REAL PROPERTY APPRAISERS**

**BIDDER NAME:** Colliers International Valuation & Advisory Services, LLC

**DATE:** 12/15/23

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Melissa Hamlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Agriculture, Conservation & Forestry

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) Is the applicant a Maine-licensed Certified General Real Property Appraiser? YES
- 2) Did the applicant submit a Proposal Cover Page (**Appendix A**)? YES
- 3) Did the applicant submit a Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification (**Appendix B**)? YES
- 4) Did the applicant submit an Organization Qualifications and Experience (**Appendix C**)? YES
- 5) Please record your reactions to Appendix C, Qualifications and Experience Form and related attachments, using the following categories:
  - **P** (Positive): Indicates what the evaluator sees as a strength.
  - **N** (Negative): Indicates what the evaluator sees as a weakness.
  - **Q** (Question): Indicates the evaluator is uncertain about the information presented.
  - **I** (Interesting): Indicates the evaluator finds the information interesting (i.e. when proposal provides an innovative approach or solution – “outside the box”).

Responsive to request for SOQ:

- Organization has a regional Agriculture Specialty Practice Group; **P**
- Nearest regional office has completed >225 appraisals in Maine in the last 3 years; **P**

Relevant points of experience:

- Four example regional projects were described; two included productive agricultural land and two included useable pastureland and farm buildings. Highly relevant experience; **P**

- 6) Geographic scope of practice (e.g., Statewide, selected counties):

- Statewide specified (Sec. III)

- 7) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certified General Real Property Appraiser license? YES, for the regional office's managing director (MA).
- One office of the Ag Practice Group is based regionally (NY)
  - "a member(s) of the Agriculture Practice Group would seek reciprocal licensure with the State of Maine and be co-signed with Chris Stickney, MAI."
- 8) Will the applicant employ subcontractors? Not specifically addressed  
If so, did the applicant include a list of subcontractors?
- 9) Did the applicant include a list of all current/recent litigation or otherwise comment on litigation within the past 5 years? NO
- 10) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certificate of Insurance? YES
- 11) Did the applicant include a Rate Sheet? YES  
Comments:
- Hourly rates included
  - No flat rate quotes provided; when projects are made available for bidding, will price assignments on a per-report basis
  - Expenses are not addressed
- Other comments:
- Section III, Proposed Services - Notes
    - Will apply appropriate scope of work per USPAP and any supplemental standards from DACF
    - Will produce USPAP compliant narrative reports based on HBU using hypothetical condition
    - Specific expectation management, subcontractors not discussed

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: PRE-QUALIFIED VENDOR LIST FOR CERTIFIED GENERAL REAL PROPERTY APPRAISERS**

**BIDDER NAME:** LandVest, Inc.

**DATE:** 12/15/23

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Melissa Hamlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Agriculture, Conservation & Forestry

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) Is the applicant a Maine-licensed Certified General Real Property Appraiser? YES
- 2) Did the applicant submit a Proposal Cover Page (**Appendix A**)? YES
- 3) Did the applicant submit a Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification (**Appendix B**)? YES
- 4) Did the applicant submit an Organization Qualifications and Experience (**Appendix C**)? YES
- 5) Please record your reactions to Appendix C, Qualifications and Experience Form and related attachments, using the following categories:
  - **P** (Positive): Indicates what the evaluator sees as a strength.
  - **N** (Negative): Indicates what the evaluator sees as a weakness.
  - **Q** (Question): Indicates the evaluator is uncertain about the information presented.
  - **I** (Interesting): Indicates the evaluator finds the information interesting (i.e. when proposal provides an innovative approach or solution – “outside the box”).

Responsive to request for SOQ:

- Has a focus on land-based assets, resource properties, esp. timberland: **P**
- Company leadership works in overlapping areas of forestry, real estate brokerage, appraisals and land planning: **P**
- Four CG appraiser licenses provided: **P**

Relevant points of experience:

- One appraiser has significant farmland appraisal experience; others have relevant experience: **P**
- Project one was not already a productive farm, but still highly relevant (valuation of acreage before and after agricultural easement, regional): **P/I**
- Project two was for ME DACF for an eventual rail to trail corridor, involving multiple types of property: **P**

- Project three's objective was to determine highest and best use and obtain FMV of large acreage in western Maine for nonprofit and considering LMF standards: **P**

6) Geographic scope of practice (e.g., Statewide, selected counties):

- **Q:** Not specified; scope of experience, especially with the timberland management of 1M acres in Maine, suggests broad range.

7) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certified General Real Property Appraiser license? YES, for all four appraisers mentioned.

8) Will the applicant employ subcontractors?

- Not explicitly stated; rate sheet mentions outside contracting.

If so, did the applicant include a list of subcontractors? NO

9) Did the applicant include a list of all current/recent litigation or otherwise comment on litigation within the past 5 years? NO; unaddressed

10) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certificate of Insurance? YES

11) Did the applicant include a Rate Sheet? YES

Comments:

- Hourly rates provided
- Outside consulting billed at cost
- Mileage included
- Other expenses, whether any markup, not listed
- No fixed fee items

Other comments:

- Section III, Proposed Services - Notes
  - None

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: PRE-QUALIFIED VENDOR LIST FOR CERTIFIED GENERAL REAL PROPERTY APPRAISERS**

**BIDDER NAME:** McManus & Nault Appraisal Company, Inc.

**DATE:** 12/14/23

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Melissa Hamlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Agriculture, Conservation & Forestry

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by individual evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is required that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) Is the applicant a Maine-licensed Certified General Real Property Appraiser? YES
- 2) Did the applicant submit a Proposal Cover Page (**Appendix A**)? YES
- 3) Did the applicant submit a Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification (**Appendix B**)? YES
- 4) Did the applicant submit an Organization Qualifications and Experience (**Appendix C**)? YES
- 5) Please record your reactions to Appendix C, Qualifications and Experience Form and related attachments, using the following categories:
  - **P** (Positive): Indicates what the evaluator sees as a strength.
  - **N** (Negative): Indicates what the evaluator sees as a weakness.
  - **Q** (Question): Indicates the evaluator is uncertain about the information presented.
  - **I** (Interesting): Indicates the evaluator finds the information interesting (i.e. when proposal provides an innovative approach or solution – “outside the box”).

Responsive to request for SOQ:

- Specializes in appraisals involving natural resources; **P**
- Lists advanced credentials, including those applicable to conservation easements; **P**

Relevant points of experience:

- Has completed hundreds of appraisals for governmental programs; **P**
- Project examples include appraisals of easement-encumbered lands; **P**
- Examples also include large acreages of woodland for fee appraisal factoring multiple parameters affecting value; **P**

- 6) Geographic scope of practice (e.g., Statewide, selected counties):

All counties except: Aroostook, Piscataquis, Penobscot, and Washington Counties.

- 7) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certified General Real Property Appraiser license? YES
- 8) Will the applicant employ subcontractors? NO
- 9) Did the applicant include a list of all current/recent litigation or otherwise comment on litigation within the past 5 years?

Commented that there have been no litigation actions involving the company.

- 10) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certificate of Insurance? YES

- 11) Did the applicant include a Rate Sheet? YES

Comments:

- Hourly rate is provided.
- **Q:** it is unclear how the NTE and fixed fee statements relate:
  - Section IV Costs: NTE can be provided when project details are known.
  - Section III: statement that “appraisals would be a set fee including all time spent and expenses associated with the work completing an appraisal.”
- **Q:** What are the fixed fees; none in cost sheet.

Other comments:

- A regional business partnership with one appraiser
- Section III, Proposed Services - Notes
  - The appraiser provided a brief synopsis of the appraisal process
  - The scope of work would be agreed with client upon receipt of all pertinent information
  - Methods and resources are addressed generally, also touching on alternate approaches to valuation
  - Appraiser helps meet expectations via ongoing communication as necessary

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: PRE-QUALIFIED VENDOR LIST FOR CERTIFIED GENERAL REAL PROPERTY APPRAISERS**

**BIDDER NAME:** J Powell Appraisals LLC

**DATE:** 12/15/23

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Melissa Hamlin

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Agriculture, Conservation & Forestry

\*\*\*\*\*

**Instructions:** *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

- 1) Is the applicant a Maine-licensed Certified General Real Property Appraiser? YES
- 2) Did the applicant submit a Proposal Cover Page (**Appendix A**)? Yes; NOT SIGNED
- 3) Did the applicant submit a Debarment, Performance and Non-Collusion Certification (**Appendix B**)? Yes; NOT SIGNED
- 4) Did the applicant submit an Organization Qualifications and Experience (**Appendix C**)? YES
- 5) Please record your reactions to Appendix C, Qualifications and Experience Form and related attachments, using the following categories:
  - **P** (Positive): Indicates what the evaluator sees as a strength.
  - **N** (Negative): Indicates what the evaluator sees as a weakness.
  - **Q** (Question): Indicates the evaluator is uncertain about the information presented.
  - **I** (Interesting): Indicates the evaluator finds the information interesting (i.e. when proposal provides an innovative approach or solution – “outside the box”).

Responsive to request for SOQ:

- Highly collaborative regional team; **P**
- Unclear whether there are multiple appraisers
- Relationship-based clients include financial, municipal, legal entities: **P**

Relevant points of experience:

- Commercial appraisals of both in-town (multi-unit buildings, retail, etc.) and rural (farms, land) properties: **P**
- Experience includes CMBG (complex acreage with natural resource features): **P**
- Appraised acreage with recreational and tree growth factors: **P**
- Appraised horse farm with agricultural land and support buildings: **P**

- 6) Geographic scope of practice (e.g., Statewide, selected counties):

Statewide specified.

- 7) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certified General Real Property Appraiser license? YES
- 8) Will the applicant employ subcontractors? NO (N/A specified)  
If so, did the applicant include a list of subcontractors?
- 9) Did the applicant include a list of all current/recent litigation or otherwise comment on litigation within the past 5 years?

N/A specified

- 10) Did the applicant include a copy of their Certificate of Insurance? YES

- 11) Did the applicant include a Rate Sheet?

- Hourly rate is included.

Comments:

- A broad range of generally expected commercial appraisal fees is provided.

Other comments:

- Have appraised additional farms and farmland
- Section III, Proposed Services - Notes
  - Methods: USPAP compliant appraisal reports
  - Resources: Maine Listings, CoStar, County Records and real estate firm databases; knowledgeable in zoning requirements and deeds
  - Frequent client communication; timely work
  - Goal to surpass expectations





STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF AGRICULTURE,  
CONSERVATION AND FORESTRY

Janet T. Mills  
Governor

Amanda E. Beal  
Commissioner

**AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT**

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers**

I, Beth Valentine accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Agriculture, Conservation and Forestry. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

**I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.**

*Elizabeth Valentine*

*December 6, 2023*

---

Signature

---

Date



STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF AGRICULTURE,  
CONSERVATION AND FORESTRY

Janet T. Mills  
Governor

Amanda E. Beal  
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT  
RFP #: 202310214

**RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers**

I, Denice Baron accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Agriculture, Conservation and Forestry. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

**I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.**

Denice M. Baron  
Signature

12/7/23  
Date



STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF AGRICULTURE,  
CONSERVATION AND FORESTRY

Janet T. Mills  
Governor

Amanda E. Beal  
Commissioner

**AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT**  
**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers**

I, Melissa Hamlin, accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Agriculture, Conservation and Forestry. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

**I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.**

Melissa Hamlin

Signature

12/11/2023

Date



STATE OF MAINE  
DEPARTMENT OF AGRICULTURE,  
CONSERVATION AND FORESTRY

Janet T. Mills  
Governor

Amanda E. Beal  
Commissioner

**AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT**

**RFP #: 202310214**

**RFP TITLE: Pre-Qualified Vendor List for Certified General Real Property Appraisers**

I, Bill Patterson accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Agriculture, Conservation and Forestry. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

**I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.**

Signature

12-20-2023

Date