

**State of Maine**  
**Master Score Sheet**

RFP# 202311233					
Emissions Projections And Benefits Analysis For The Maine Climate Council					
<b>Bidder Name:</b>		<b>Applied Economics Clinic</b>	<b>CohnReznick LLP</b>	<b>Eastern Research Group, Inc.</b>	<b>Evolved Energy Research</b>
<b>Proposed Cost:</b>		<b>\$225,000.00</b>	<b>\$670,750.00</b>	<b>\$609,860.00</b>	<b>\$418,000.00</b>
<b>Scoring Sections</b>	<b>Points Available</b>				
Section I: Preliminary Information	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	18	10	28	27
Section III: Proposed Services	45	20	10	40	39
Section IV: Cost Proposal	25	25.0	8.4	9.2	13.5
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>63.0</u></b>	<b><u>28.4</u></b>	<b><u>77.2</u></b>	<b><u>79.5</u></b>
<b>Bidder Name:</b>		<b>Hatch Associates</b>	<b>KERAMIDA</b>	<b>Lotus Engineering and Sustainability, LLC</b>	<b>nZero</b>
<b>Proposed Cost:</b>		<b>\$399,960.00</b>	<b>\$275,000.00</b>	<b>\$279,096.00</b>	<b>\$465,500.00</b>
<b>Scoring Sections</b>	<b>Points Available</b>				
Section I: Preliminary Information	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	10	15	15	10
Section III: Proposed Services	45	10	15	20	9
Section IV: Cost Proposal	25	14.1	20.5	20.2	12.1
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>34.1</u></b>	<b><u>50.5</u></b>	<b><u>55.2</u></b>	<b><u>31.1</u></b>

RFP# 202311233				
Emissions Projections And Benefits Analysis For The Maine Climate Council				
Bidder Name:		Sustainability Solutions Group USA, Inc.	Vermont Energy Investment Corporation (VEIC)	Vanasse Hangen Brustlin, Inc. (VHB)
Proposed Cost:		\$252,440.00	\$670,100.00	\$775,000.00
Scoring Sections	Points Available			
Section I: Preliminary Information	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	15	20	12
Section III: Proposed Services	45	10	30	9
Section IV: Cost Proposal	25	22.3	8.4	7.3
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>47.3</u></b>	<b><u>58.4</u></b>	<b><u>28.3</u></b>

**Award Justification Statement**  
**RFP# 202311233 - Emissions Projections and Benefits Analysis for the Maine Climate Council**

**I. Summary**

The Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future (GOPIF) is seeking proposals to provide services on behalf of the Maine Climate Council (MCC), including:

1. Updated modeling of emissions reductions that will result from proposed new measures and changes to existing measures in Maine's climate plan
2. Cost/benefit analysis of climate mitigation measures
3. Cost/benefit analysis of climate adaptation and resilience measures
4. Low income and disadvantaged communities (LIDAC) benefits analysis
5. Support for Maine Climate Council process to integrate results from 1), 2), 3), and 4) into the updated climate action plan.

**II. Evaluation Process**

The evaluation team was comprised of a team of policy and technical leads from the Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future, the Governor's Energy Office, and the Department of Environmental Protection. Evaluation team members collectively possess experience in energy and emissions modeling, climate planning, cost-benefit analysis, and equity. Evaluation team members completed individual evaluations before proceeding to team consensus evaluations and scoring.

**III. Qualifications & Experience**

The selected bidder, Evolved Energy Research has experience with state-level energy and decarbonization modeling. Additionally, the selected bidder is currently engaged in energy and emissions modeling for the Governor's Energy Office.

**IV. Proposed Services**

- The selected bidder proposed a robust and detailed plan for emissions modeling and cost/benefit analysis that is responsive to the needs of the Maine Climate Council and working groups
- The selected bidder proposed a modeling approach that uses tools currently being used to develop the Pathway to 2040 State Energy Plan for the Governor's Energy Office
- The selected bidder displayed a thorough understanding of the Climate Pollution Reduction Grant program timeline and deliverables and how these needs align with the Maine Climate Council timeline and deliverables
- The selected bidder proposed a robust approach to modeling costs/benefits and assessing costs and benefits on low income and disadvantaged communities (LIDACs)

**V. Cost Proposal**

The selected bidder proposed a budget of \$418,000.

**VI. Conclusion**

The selected bidder has extensive technical experience and proposed a scope of work that was detailed and highly responsive to this RFP. The selected bidder clearly demonstrated their ability to complete the tasks requested by this proposal.



STATE OF MAINE  
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE OF POLICY INNOVATION AND THE FUTURE  
181 STATE HOUSE STATION  
AUGUSTA, MAINE  
04333-0181

JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

HANNAH PINGREE  
DIRECTOR

March 11, 2024

Tanya Stasio  
Applied Economics Clinic  
6 Liberty Sq., PMB 98162  
Boston, MA, 02109

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202311233,  
Emissions Projections and Benefits Analysis for the Maine Climate Council

Dear Tanya,

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future for Emissions Projections and Benefits Analysis for the Maine Climate Council. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Evolved Energy Research

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see next page.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Hannah Pingree  
Director, Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

## **STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS**

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE  
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE OF POLICY INNOVATION AND THE FUTURE  
181 STATE HOUSE STATION  
AUGUSTA, MAINE  
04333-0181

JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

HANNAH PINGREE  
DIRECTOR

March 11, 2024

Jenny Brusgul, ESG Advisory Practice Leader  
CohnReznick LLP  
8000 Towers Crescent Drive, Suite 1000  
Tysons, VA 22182

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202311233,  
Emissions Projections and Benefits Analysis for the Maine Climate Council

Dear Jenny,

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future for Emissions Projections and Benefits Analysis for the Maine Climate Council. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Evolved Energy Research

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see next page.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Hannah Pingree  
Director, Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

## **STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS**

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).





STATE OF MAINE  
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE OF POLICY INNOVATION AND THE FUTURE  
181 STATE HOUSE STATION  
AUGUSTA, MAINE  
04333-0181

JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

HANNAH PINGREE  
DIRECTOR

March 11, 2024

Jeremy Hargreaves, Principal  
Evolved Energy Research  
2443 Fillmore St #380-5304  
San Francisco, CA, 94115

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202311233,  
Emissions Projections and Benefits Analysis for the Maine Climate Council

Dear Jeremy,

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future for Emissions Projections and Benefits Analysis for the Maine Climate Council. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Evolved Energy Research

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see next page.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Hannah Pingree  
Director, Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

## **STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS**

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE  
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE OF POLICY INNOVATION AND THE FUTURE  
181 STATE HOUSE STATION  
AUGUSTA, MAINE  
04333-0181

JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

HANNAH PINGREE  
DIRECTOR

March 11, 2024

Charles Goodhue, VP/Senior Economist  
Eastern Research Group, Inc. (ERG)  
561 Virginia Road, Bldg. 4, Suite 300  
Concord, Massachusetts, 01742

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202311233,  
Emissions Projections and Benefits Analysis for the Maine Climate Council

Dear Charles,

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future for Emissions Projections and Benefits Analysis for the Maine Climate Council. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Evolved Energy Research

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see next page.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Hannah Pingree  
Director, Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

## **STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS**

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE  
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE OF POLICY INNOVATION AND THE FUTURE  
181 STATE HOUSE STATION  
AUGUSTA, MAINE  
04333-0181

JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

HANNAH PINGREE  
DIRECTOR

March 11, 2024

Alan Falk, Global Director, Climate Change  
Hatch Associates Consultants, Inc.  
100 West Butler Avenue  
Ambler, PA 19002

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202311233,  
Emissions Projections and Benefits Analysis for the Maine Climate Council

Dear Alan,

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future for Emissions Projections and Benefits Analysis for the Maine Climate Council. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Evolved Energy Research

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see next page.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Hannah Pingree  
Director, Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

## **STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS**

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE  
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE OF POLICY INNOVATION AND THE FUTURE  
181 STATE HOUSE STATION  
AUGUSTA, MAINE  
04333-0181

JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

HANNAH PINGREE  
DIRECTOR

March 11, 2024

Nick McCreary, VP Sustainability & Climate Services  
KERAMIDA Inc.  
401 North College Avenue  
Indianapolis, IN, 46202

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202311233,  
Emissions Projections and Benefits Analysis for the Maine Climate Council

Dear Nick,

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future for Emissions Projections and Benefits Analysis for the Maine Climate Council. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Evolved Energy Research

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see next page.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Hannah Pingree  
Director, Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

## **STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS**

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).





STATE OF MAINE  
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE OF POLICY INNOVATION AND THE FUTURE  
181 STATE HOUSE STATION  
AUGUSTA, MAINE  
04333-0181

JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

HANNAH PINGREE  
DIRECTOR

March 11, 2024

Tom Herrod/Managing Director and Project Manager  
Lotus Engineering and Sustainability, LLC  
1627 Vine St  
Denver, CO 80206

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202311233,  
Emissions Projections and Benefits Analysis for the Maine Climate Council

Dear Tom,

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future for Emissions Projections and Benefits Analysis for the Maine Climate Council. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Evolved Energy Research

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see next page.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Hannah Pingree  
Director, Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

## **STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS**

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE  
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE OF POLICY INNOVATION AND THE FUTURE  
181 STATE HOUSE STATION  
AUGUSTA, MAINE  
04333-0181

JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

HANNAH PINGREE  
DIRECTOR

March 11, 2024

Maeve Colarusso, Government Affairs Manager  
nZero  
50 S Virginia St., PO Box 388  
Reno, NV 89501

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202311233,  
Emissions Projections and Benefits Analysis for the Maine Climate Council

Dear Maeve,

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future for Emissions Projections and Benefits Analysis for the Maine Climate Council. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Evolved Energy Research

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see next page.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Hannah Pingree  
Director, Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

## **STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS**

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE  
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE OF POLICY INNOVATION AND THE FUTURE  
181 STATE HOUSE STATION  
AUGUSTA, MAINE  
04333-0181

JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

HANNAH PINGREE  
DIRECTOR

March 11, 2024

Yuill Herbert, Principal  
Sustainability Solutions Group USA, Inc.  
90 State Street Ste 700 Office 40  
Albany, NY 12207

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202311233,  
Emissions Projections and Benefits Analysis for the Maine Climate Council

Dear Yuill,

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future for Emissions Projections and Benefits Analysis for the Maine Climate Council. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Evolved Energy Research

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see next page.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Hannah Pingree  
Director, Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

## **STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS**

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE  
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE OF POLICY INNOVATION AND THE FUTURE  
181 STATE HOUSE STATION  
AUGUSTA, MAINE  
04333-0181

JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

HANNAH PINGREE  
DIRECTOR

March 11, 2024

Damon Lane, Managing Analyst  
Vermont Energy Investment Corporation (VEIC)  
20 Winooski Falls Way, 5th Floor  
Winooski, VT 05404

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202311233,  
Emissions Projections and Benefits Analysis for the Maine Climate Council

Dear Damon,

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future for Emissions Projections and Benefits Analysis for the Maine Climate Council. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Evolved Energy Research

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see next page.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Hannah Pingree  
Director, Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

## **STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS**

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).





STATE OF MAINE  
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE OF POLICY INNOVATION AND THE FUTURE  
181 STATE HOUSE STATION  
AUGUSTA, MAINE  
04333-0181

JANET T. MILLS  
GOVERNOR

HANNAH PINGREE  
DIRECTOR

March 11, 2024

Donny Goris-Kolb, Senior Sustainability Planner/Project Manager  
Vanasse Hangen Brustlin, Inc. (VHB)  
101 Walnut Street, PO Box 9151  
Watertown, Massachusetts 02471

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202311233,  
Emissions Projections and Benefits Analysis for the Maine Climate Council

Dear Donny,

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future for Emissions Projections and Benefits Analysis for the Maine Climate Council. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Evolved Energy Research

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see next page.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

Hannah Pingree  
Director, Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

## **STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS**

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Applied Economics Clinic

**DATE:** February 2, 2024

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Amalia Siegel

**Names of Evaluators:** Ethan Tremblay, Sarah Curran, Amalia Siegel, Allison Montgomery

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>N/A</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>30</b>	<b>18</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>45</b>	<b>20</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>25.0</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>63.0</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Applied Economics Clinic

**DATE:** February 2, 2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Responsive

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Applied Economics Clinic

**DATE:** February 2, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>30</b>	<b>18</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Summary: Listed projects show strong experience evaluating equity impacts of policies, and less clear experience performing emissions projections and cost-benefit analyses.

**I. Organization Qualifications and Experience**

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Team provides extensive experience in designing, implementing, and evaluating both emissions inventories and climate and energy plans</li><li>• Emissions forecasting, emissions policy impact planning, environmental justice and equity analysis, identification of overburdened communities and assessment of climate and policy impacts on these communities</li><li>• Mission-based non-profit consulting group that offers expert services in the areas of energy, environment, consumer protection, and equity</li></ul>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. State of Maine Renewable Energy Goals Market Assessment – Evaluated equity impacts of options for meeting Maine’s renewable targets over the next decade</li><li>2. AEC Emissions Measurement Tool – Developed a spreadsheet-based tool that provides users with an interface to build a greenhouse</li></ol>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Applied Economics Clinic

**DATE:** February 2, 2024

	gas emissions inventory (and 20-year emissions projections) for a specific geographic region 3. Equity Assessment of Electrification Incentives in the District of Columbia - examine a potential pathway for reducing emissions in the District of Columbia: equitable electrification
Any other listed projects	
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Does not include addresses, phone number only provided for Dr. Rachel Bouvier</li> <li>Planning Communities - firm specializes in developing fun and engaging planning tools and geospatial-based analysis, applications, resources and data-derived insights needed to solve complex community, environmental, economic and infrastructure challenges</li> <li>rbouvier Consulting - specializes in conducting comprehensive socio-economic analyses, vulnerability assessments, as well as traditional economic impact analyses</li> </ul>
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes, unclear if organizational chart is project-specific
Each position identifies title	Yes
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	Not included
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Yes, included

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Applied Economics Clinic

**DATE:** February 2, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>45</b>	<b>20</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Summary: Team member roles are not clearly described in Services to be Provided; work plan includes information which should be in Part 4. Unclear if the Emissions Measurement Inventory tool has been used in any other applications.

**II. Proposed Services**

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	Yes, with list of subtasks and deliverables
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Provide GOPIF with written memos and associated Excel workbooks that summarize the findings of their quantitative analyses</li></ul> <p>Task 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Will use AEC Emissions Measurement Inventory Tool to make projections. This is a tool that has been developed by AEC; unclear if it has been used for any other projects.</li><li>• Will use wedge analyses to demonstrate impact of policy options</li><li>• Does not specifically state that they will provide all input data and assumptions for this task</li></ul> <p>Task 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Geographically identify LIDAC populations according to the CEJST criteria for each burden category</li></ul>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Applied Economics Clinic

**DATE:** February 2, 2024

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Will produce LIDAC maps, including one statewide map and 8 region-level maps</li> <li>• For CCAP, will provide a quantitative assessment of the benefits to LIDACS (little detail provided)</li> </ul> <p>Task 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Utilize the data and methods from 2020 economic benefits analysis</li> <li>• Limited detail provided</li> </ul> <p>Task 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Utilize the data and methods from 2020 economic benefits analysis</li> <li>• Limited detail provided</li> </ul> <p>Task 5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Will create a climate strategies matrix to organize key assessment metrics on each climate measure based on the results of Tasks 1-4</li> </ul>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	Does not identify which tasks will be performed by subcontractors
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Describes tasks and month, does not specify person responsible
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	Does not note any tasks delegated to subcontractors except in budget information, which belongs in Part 4.



**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Applied Economics Clinic

**DATE:** February 2, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

---

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$225,000.00</b>	,	<b>\$225,000.00</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>25 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>25.0</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** CohnReznick LLP

**DATE:** February 2, 2024

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Amalia Siegel

**Names of Evaluators:** Ethan Tremblay, Sarah Curran, Amalia Siegel, Allison Montgomery

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>N/A</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>30</b>	<b>10</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>45</b>	<b>10</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>8.4</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>28.4</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** CohnReznick LLP

**DATE:** February 2, 2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Responsive

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** CohnReznick LLP

**DATE:** February 2, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>30</b>	<b>10</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Summary: The listed projects do not demonstrate the qualifications we are seeking in this RFP.

**I. Organization Qualifications and Experience**

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Firm provides a complete range of services...including greenhouse gas emissions projections and cost-benefits analysis</li><li>Has a long history of working with community developers and renewable energy companies to analyze impacts of tax credit capital raise, project underwriting, and tax incentives</li></ul>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>InfrastructureDC: Washington Union Station Expansion Project – cost benefit analysis for Washington DC transportation system</li><li>Maine Department of Transportation – Alternatives assessment and design for roadway adaptation Phippsburg Rt 216 and Rt 209</li><li>Manchester-by-the-Sea, MA – Complete a coastal vulnerability action plan- project listed in introduction as being done by CohnReznick but was actually done by Fuss &amp; O'Neill</li></ol>
Any other listed projects	

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** CohnReznick LLP

**DATE:** February 2, 2024

<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Yes, included for all</li> <li>• Fuss &amp; O'Neill: Engineering and science based firm, help clients achieve organizational and community decarbonization goals</li> <li>• Maroozu: Developer of intelligent software solutions and related services</li> </ul>
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes
Each position identifies title	Yes
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	Unclear about litigation issues over the last 5 years. Provided statement that any proceedings will have no "material financial impact on the firm" or their ability to satisfy the RFP.
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Included

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** CohnReznick LLP

**DATE:** February 2, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>45</b>	<b>10</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Summary: Lacks detail on deliverables, assumptions to be provided, and activities to be performed by subcontractors.

**II. Proposed Services**

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	Included for all tasks
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<p>Task 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Did not state that they will provide inputs and assumptions</li><li>• Approach will pinpoint activities that maximize the magnitude of both near-term and long-term GHG emission reductions for the State with a clear emphasis on practical approach, high quality impact, and actionable strategies</li><li>• Utilize the Department of Energy's Energy Information Administration (EIA)'s State Inventory Tool (SIT), State Energy Data System (SEDS), Carbon Mitigation Initiative's (CMI) Stabilization Wedges</li></ul> <p>Task 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Will gather geospatial data to map out LIDACs, encompassing demographic data, income levels, and other socio-economic indicators from sources like the U.S. Census Bureau and the State</li></ul>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** CohnReznick LLP

**DATE:** February 2, 2024

	<p>of Maine’s local government database.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Will also estimate the proportion of benefits expected to accrue in the identified communities as compared to the total benefits resulting from the GHG emission reduction measures described in the CCAP</li></ul> <p>Task 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Lacks detail about proposed deliverables</li><li>• To evaluate the financial and broader implications of each initiative, analysis will encompass both direct and indirect costs</li><li>• Calculation will subtract the total costs (e.g. both direct and indirect) from the quantified benefits (e.g. energy savings, percentage of communities with access to electricity during power outages, etc.), and will also consider long term implications</li></ul> <p>Task 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Three major factors in consideration: 1) bolstering coastal community resilience, 2) informing the location of development, and 3) addressing “getting out of harm’s way”.</li><li>• Provide a ranking matrix highlighting to what extent that climate adaptation strategies provide added benefits to communities (e.g., improved public safety, economic development, greenhouse gas emissions reductions, etc.).</li></ul> <p>Task 5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Will develop a Project Communication Plan detailing approach to interfacing with all</li></ul>
--	---

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** CohnReznick LLP

**DATE:** February 2, 2024

	parties, including working groups and Maine Climate Council
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	Does not identify tasks to be performed by subcontractors
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Includes task and month but not person responsible for each task
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	Does not note tasks delegated to subcontractors



**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** CohnReznick LLP

**DATE:** February 2, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

---

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$225,000.00</b>	,	<b>\$670,750.00</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>25 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>8.4</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Evolved Energy Research

**DATE:** February 13, 2024

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Amalia Siegel

**Names of Evaluators:** Ethan Tremblay, Sarah Curran, Amalia Siegel, Allison Montgomery

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>N/A</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>30</b>	<b>27</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>45</b>	<b>39</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>13.5</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>79.5</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Evolved Energy Research

**DATE:** February 13, 2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Responsive

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Evolved Energy Research

**DATE:** February 13, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>30</b>	<b>27</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Summary: Experienced energy and economic modeling team that is currently working on Maine Pathways to 2040 study and has experience working on state-level decarbonization plans.

**I. Organization Qualifications and Experience**

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Has experience modeling economy-wide decarbonization</li><li>• Has built a comprehensive model of Maine's economy-wide energy demands, and how those demands can be met by supply of electricity and fuels during the Maine Pathways to 2040 Study.</li><li>• Clients include state and federal agencies, consulting companies, large companies, utilities, and NGOs</li></ul>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. Washington 2023 State Hydrogen Strategy, Washington 2021 State Energy Strategy: estimates of total decarbonization costs and investments, and guidance on how to support development of hydrogen supply and new markets for hydrogen and hydrogen derived fuels</li><li>2. Maine Governor's Energy Office (GEO) 2040 Energy Plan: leading energy modeling work to develop and compare alternative pathways to decarbonize Maine's economy</li></ol>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Evolved Energy Research

**DATE:** February 13, 2024

	3. Massachusetts Decarbonization Roadmap: authored one of six technical reports called "Energy Pathways to Deep Decarbonization," outlining eight different energy system pathways for the Northeast
Any other listed projects	
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	N/A
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes
Each position identifies title	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Yes</li> <li>• One team member is based in Maine</li> </ul>
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	Statement about litigation included; no litigation
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Yes, included

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Evolved Energy Research

**DATE:** February 13, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>45</b>	<b>39</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Summary: Scope of work includes detailed energy, emissions and cost-benefit analysis; demonstrates clear understanding of CPRG deliverables.

**II. Proposed Services**

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	Included for all tasks
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<p>Task 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Will develop a database of greenhouse gas (GHG) reduction measures using combined set of sources from past Maine reports, additional literature review, and EER's own work</li><li>Will use 2 tools developed by EER: EnergyPATHWAYS, a bottom-up energy system model and RIO, an optimal capacity expansion model that simulates hourly operations</li><li>propose to model up to 6 policy scenarios</li><li>Deliverables will include summary report, slide deck, full written report, and explanation of methods used to produce GHG projections and emissions reduction estimates, including all assumptions, input data, and emission and conversion factors</li></ul> <p>Task 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Will use CEJST and EJ Screen to identify LIDACs, and identify non-</li></ul>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Evolved Energy Research

**DATE:** February 13, 2024

	<p>geographic LIDACs by setting thresholds for each criterion and identifying what percentage of each census tract falls under the priority population definition</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Will estimate bill impacts of transitioning from fossil fuels to electricity</li> </ul> <p>Task 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• calculate the cost of the energy economy and non-energy emissions reductions measures for each scenario.</li> <li>• Calculate net costs and benefits including health job creation, increased climate resilience, and other environmental benefits</li> <li>• Use EPA COBRA tool to estimate public health benefits</li> <li>• Use IMPLAN to estimate economic benefits</li> </ul> <p>Task 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Continue to leverage the tools used in the 2020 report, including benefit-cost analysis, cost-effectiveness analysis, and economic impact analysis, in addition to IMPLAN</li> </ul> <p>Task 5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Interfacing with the working group schedule and process, providing technical assistance and guidance as needed</li> </ul>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	N/A
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes, included
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Yes
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	N/A

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Evolved Energy Research

**DATE:** February 13, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

---

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$225,000.00</b>	,	<b>\$418,000.00</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>25 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>13.5</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**



**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Eastern Research Group, Inc.

**DATE:** February 6, 2024

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Amalia Siegel

**Names of Evaluators:** Ethan Tremblay, Sarah Curran, Amalia Siegel, Allison Montgomery

---

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>N/A</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>30</b>	<b>28</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>45</b>	<b>40</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>9.2</b>
<u><b>Total Points</b></u>	<u><b>100</b></u>	<u><b>77.2</b></u>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Eastern Research Group, Inc.

**DATE:** February 6, 2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Responsive

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Eastern Research Group, Inc.

**DATE:** February 6, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>30</b>	<b>28</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Summary: Experienced team that has worked with the Maine Climate Council process in the past. Strong technical experience and tools to complete modeling and economic analysis.

**I. Organization Qualifications and Experience**

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• ERG led emissions and cost-benefit analysis for Maine Climate Council 4 years ago</li><li>• ERG has completed well over 100 economic analyses for NOAA, FEMA, USACE and state and local governments related to climate change, adaptation and resilience, and GHG emissions and emission reduction measures</li><li>• E3 is working with NH, NESCAUM, and 3 other states to develop deliverables for EPA Climate Pollution Reduction Grant (CPRG) program</li><li>• Relevant qualifications for each team member were provided, including resumes</li></ul>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. GOPIF - Assessing Impacts Climate Change May Have on Maine's Economy, Revenues, and Investment Decisions: produced four volumes of reports in a project to support Maine's December 2020 Climate Action Plan</li><li>2. E3 completed US Climate Alliance modeling and scenario analysis to</li></ol>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Eastern Research Group, Inc.

**DATE:** February 6, 2024

	<p>support the US Climate Alliance's 2021 and 2023 Annual Reports</p> <p>3. Barnstable County Economic Impacts of Climate Change - supported Cape Cod Commission's climate action planning process by assessing the economic impacts of climate change, and the costs and benefits of strategies to address climate impacts</p>
Any other listed projects	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. ResilientMass Plan: 2023 MA State Hazard Mitigation and Climate Adaptation Plan</li> <li>2. New York State Climate Impacts Assessment (NYSERDA)</li> <li>3. Alameda CARP (City of Alameda, CA)</li> <li>4. What Will Adaptation Cost? An Economic Framework for Coastal Community Infrastructure (NOAA Office for Coastal Management)</li> <li>5. Sea Grant Economics (NOAA National Sea Grant Office)</li> <li>6. Flood Pilots + Flood Mapping (NOAA Office for Coastal Management)</li> <li>7. Great Bay Ecosystem Service Valuation (NOAA Office for Coastal Management)</li> <li>8. CPRG Support (E3) (Three confidential state agencies)</li> <li>9. Greenhouse Gas Emissions Scenarios through 2050 (E3) (US Climate Alliance)</li> <li>10. Integration Analysis Technical Supplement to Draft Scoping Plan (NYSERDA)</li> <li>11. Maine Renewable Energy Goals Market Assessment (Maine Governor's Energy Office)</li> <li>12. Energy Storage Market Assessment (Maine Governor's Energy Office)</li> </ol>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Eastern Research Group, Inc.

**DATE:** February 6, 2024

<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Yes, included for all</li> <li>• Energy+Environmental Economics (E3): Energy consulting firm that helps regulators, policy makers, utilities, developers, and investors make the best strategic decisions possible as they understand and implement new clean energy and climate policies.</li> <li>• Dr. Charles Colgan: consultant/advisor, has collaborated with ERG on eight projects over the last 10 years for a range of clients, including the State of Maine (Assessing the Impacts Climate Change May have on the State's Economy, Revenues, and Investment Decisions, 2020), the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA), and the Bureau of Economic Analysis (BEA)</li> </ul>
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes
Each position identifies title	Yes
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	Statement about litigation included
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Included

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Eastern Research Group, Inc.

**DATE:** February 6, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>45</b>	<b>40</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Summary: Robust scope of work that demonstrates clear understanding of CPRG deliverables and Maine Climate Council process.

**II. Proposed Services**

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Yes, included for all</li><li>• Explained timeline needed to meet deliverables for EPA CPRG program</li></ul>
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<p>Task 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• The GHG modelling will be conducted for three key levels of resolution: measure-specific level as required for the CPRG program's quantified GHG reduction measure deliverables, at the sectoral level, and for the state of Maine as a whole</li><li>• Deliverables include explanation of methods used to produce GHG projections and emissions reduction estimates, including all assumptions, input data, emission and conversion factors, and equations. This methodology section will be added to the report as appendices</li><li>• Use E3 PATHWAYS model to analyze emissions projections for two scenarios, a "business as usual" and a "GHG mitigation" scenario, taking into account 2020</li></ul>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Eastern Research Group, Inc.

**DATE:** February 6, 2024

	<p>Maine Won't Wait assumptions as well as new analysis conducted since 2020</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Will interface with Maine Climate Council (MCC) to design scenarios</li></ul> <p>Task 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• E3 will leverage the Climate and Economic Justice Screening Tool (CEJST) and the EJScreen tool to identify LIDAC regions within Maine</li><li>• In addition to identifying LIDAC regions based on EPA guidance, E3 will identify priority populations based on the work of the MCC Equity Subcommittee</li><li>• ERG team will estimate the proportion of benefits that will be accrued to identified communities compared to the total statewide benefits;</li></ul> <p>Task 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• leverage EPA's Co-Benefits Risk Assessment (COBRA) screening model</li><li>• will assess the uptake of strategies by subgroups of the population to assess the distribution of the net benefits (or net costs) in these financial benefit-cost analyses</li><li>• The ERG team will assess impacts on jobs for each mitigation strategy, will use an input-output model called IMPLAN to assess the indirect and induced impact of the strategies</li></ul> <p>Task 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Will use IMPLAN identify the job impacts from different adaptation strategies.</li><li>• Will perform riverine and coastal flooding scenarios and specifically isolate priority populations and</li></ul>
--	--

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Eastern Research Group, Inc.

**DATE:** February 6, 2024

	<p>LIDAC to see how these populations and communities compare to the rest of the state</p> <p>Task 5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>ERG will focus support on providing technical support to help prioritize and select mitigation measures (indicators, sharing of existing studies, expert knowledge from team, and discussions with WGs).</li> </ul>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes, included
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Yes
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	Yes



**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Eastern Research Group, Inc.

**DATE:** February 6, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

---

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$225,000.00</b>	,	<b>\$609,860.00</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>25 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>9.2</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Hatch Associates

**DATE:** February 13, 2024

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Amalia Siegel

**Names of Evaluators:** Ethan Tremblay, Sarah Curran, Amalia Siegel, Allison Montgomery

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>N/A</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>30</b>	<b>10</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>45</b>	<b>10</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>14.1</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>34.1</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Hatch Associates

**DATE:** February 13, 2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Responsive

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Hatch Associates

**DATE:** February 13, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>30</b>	<b>10</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Summary: Engineering firm with limited climate planning experience.

**I. Organization Qualifications and Experience**

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Professional services firm with experience in the infrastructure, energy, and metals sectors</li> <li>Has teams dedicated to Climate Change, Urban Solutions, and Sustainable Transportation</li> </ul>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Maine Department of Transportation: Fleet electrification plans for 8 transit agencies</li> <li>Vale Base Metals: Developed approach to reducing GHG emissions</li> <li>Rincon Consultants: Supporting municipal climate action plans in California- Hatch role not clearly described</li> </ol>
Any other listed projects	17 additional projects listed
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	N/A
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes
Each position identifies title	Identifies role in project but does not identify position at firm for all employees
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	Statement about litigation not included
Additional details	

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Hatch Associates

**DATE:** February 13, 2024

<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Included

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Hatch Associates

**DATE:** February 13, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>45</b>	<b>10</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Summary: Limited detail provided for all tasks.

**II. Proposed Services**

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	Included for all tasks
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<p>Task 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Will use proprietary modeling tools where appropriate but will seek to leverage the existing models provided by GOPIF</li><li>Deliverables include full report, slide deck, and executive summary, as well as explanation of methods</li></ul> <p>Task 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Limited detail on how LIDAC benefits analysis will be conducted</li></ul> <p>Task 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Pollutant reduction estimates will be based on a review of the proposed measures, the project team's experience with implementing these measures, as well as the various tools developed by EPA, including the AVERT model, the MOVES model, and other tools detailed on the CPRG website</li><li>Estimate of additional co-benefits will draw heavily on results of 2020 economic benefits analysis</li></ul>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Hatch Associates

**DATE:** February 13, 2024

	<p>Task 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Relies heavily on 2020 economic benefits analysis, limited detail on how new analysis will be performed</li> </ul> <p>Task 5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Representatives of the project team will attend all Council, Science and Technical Subcommittee, and working group meetings</li> </ul>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	N/A
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes, included
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Yes
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	N/A

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Hatch Associates

**DATE:** February 13, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

---

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$225,000.00</b>	,	<b>\$399,960.00</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>25 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>14.1</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**



**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** KERAMIDA

**DATE:** February 13, 2024

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Amalia Siegel

**Names of Evaluators:** Ethan Tremblay, Sarah Curran, Amalia Siegel, Allison Montgomery

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>N/A</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>30</b>	<b>15</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>45</b>	<b>15</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>20.5</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>50.5</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** KERAMIDA

**DATE:** February 13, 2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Responsive

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** KERAMIDA

**DATE:** February 13, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>30</b>	<b>15</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Summary: KERAMIDA lacks experience with state-level climate and emissions modeling; subcontractor provides custom web-based modeling software.

**I. Organization Qualifications and Experience**

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>KERAMIDA has completed several municipal climate action plans and is a global leader in corporate ESG services.</li></ul>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>Grand Valley Metropolitan Council: Preliminary Climate Action Plan, Implementation Grant, Comprehensive Climate Action Plan, and Status Report for the Climate Pollution Reduction Grants</li><li>Swedish Climate Policy Council: Panorama dashboard to track Sweden's transition to sustainability</li><li>City of Cincinnati: Modeling of socioeconomic impacts of climate mitigation and adaptation strategies</li></ol>
Any other listed projects	Four additional projects listed
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Yes, included</li><li>ClimateView AB: Creator of ClimateOS, a web application for the creation, implementation, monitoring, communication, and financing of climate action plans</li></ul>
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** KERAMIDA

**DATE:** February 13, 2024

Specifies project being proposed	Yes but not specific to the project tasks
Each position identifies title	Yes
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	One litigation listed
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Included

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** KERAMIDA

**DATE:** February 13, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>45</b>	<b>15</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Summary: Proposal relies heavily on ClimateOS modeling platform; limited detail on how analyses will be conducted.

**II. Proposed Services**

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	Yes, included for all tasks
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Proposal does not describe how or if ClimateOS modeling platform will be available after the scope of the project is finished</li></ul> <p>Task 1:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Will use ClimateOS tool to model impacts of greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions reduction measures</li><li>Deliverables include two intermediary presentations, a final report with executive summary and slide deck, and a chapter explaining methodology (equations may be generalized, as ClimateOS processes hundreds of functions)</li></ul> <p>Task 2:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Use CEJST to identify LIDACs, or other tools as requested</li><li>Using the ClimateOS Platform, the Delivery Team will identify which census tracts mitigation measures will impact</li></ul> <p>Task 3:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Will use ClimateOS to assess benefits and costs of mitigation</li></ul>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** KERAMIDA

**DATE:** February 13, 2024

	<p>measures, including co-pollutant reductions</p> <p>Task 4:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Use ClimateOS to estimate costs and benefits of adaptation and resilience measures</li> <li>• Will collaborate with experts in relevant fields to leverage their insights into emerging technologies and industry best practices and explore pilot projects to validate the technological feasibility of crucial components before full-scale implementation</li> </ul> <p>Task 5:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Videography group will develop and deliver videos documenting the process of updating MWW</li> </ul>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	No, but identified in Qualifications and Experience section
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes, but limited detail
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Limited detail and states that specific assignments within each Task will be allocated to individual staff once the project begins
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	No, but this is described in Qualifications and Experience section

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** KERAMIDA

**DATE:** February 13, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

---

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$225,000.00</b>	,	<b>\$275,000.00</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>25 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>20.5</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Lotus Engineering and Sustainability, LLC

**DATE:** February 13, 2024

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Amalia Siegel

**Names of Evaluators:** Ethan Tremblay, Sarah Curran, Amalia Siegel, Allison Montgomery

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>N/A</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>30</b>	<b>15</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>45</b>	<b>20</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>20.2</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>55.2</u></b>



**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Lotus Engineering and Sustainability, LLC

**DATE:** February 13, 2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Responsive

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Lotus Engineering and Sustainability, LLC

**DATE:** February 13, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>30</b>	<b>15</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Summary: Sustainability consulting firm with no statewide climate planning experience; emissions modeling experience is also limited. Subcontractor Resilient Analytics is only working on Task 4.

**I. Organization Qualifications and Experience**

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Certified women-owned sustainability consulting firm based out of Denver, Colorado</li><li>• Key practice areas include greenhouse gas (GHG) accounting and visualizations, climate action and resiliency planning, and communications and engagement</li></ul>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. Denver Regional Council of Governments (DRCOG): Sole contractor for developing requirements of the CPRG grant</li><li>2. YMCA of the Rockies: Developed Sustainability Action Plan including GHG inventory, emissions modeling, and cost evaluation of GHG reduction strategies</li><li>3. Georgia Institute of Technology: review, reorganize, and rewrite their existing sustainability action plan</li></ol>
Any other listed projects	Two projects listed for subcontractor, Resilient Analytics, both state-level analyses of cost of climate impacts
<b>Subcontractors</b>	

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Lotus Engineering and Sustainability, LLC

**DATE:** February 13, 2024

Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Yes, included</li> <li>• Two projects listed for subcontractor, Resilient Analytics, both state-level analyses of cost of climate impacts</li> </ul>
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes
Each position identifies title	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Yes</li> <li>• Team has clear experience with GHG inventories, adaptation cost assessments, and cost-benefit analyses and equity, but less detail on experience with modeling</li> </ul>
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	Statement about litigation included; no litigation listed
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Yes, included

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Lotus Engineering and Sustainability, LLC

**DATE:** February 13, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>45</b>	<b>20</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Summary: Lacking detail about the model that will be used for emissions projections. Task 2 response includes activities outside the scope of this RFP. Task 4 contains limited detail about how costs and benefits of proposed strategies will be assessed.

**II. Proposed Services**

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	Yes, included for all tasks
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<p>Task 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Emission reduction models will be developed by sector (e.g., building energy, transportation, waste, industrial activity, etc.) and results will be displayed by sector and in aggregate for all identified measures</li><li>Unclear if model they will be using has already been developed and/or used in any other applications</li><li>Deliverables will include models and all input data, GHG and co-pollutant modeling tool, and explanation of methods</li></ul> <p>Task 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Proposal includes support for the equity subcommittee and priority population engagement, which is outside the scope of this RFP</li><li>Develop a series of socio-economic, equity, resilience, and</li></ul>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Lotus Engineering and Sustainability, LLC

**DATE:** February 13, 2024

	<p>climate vulnerability metrics that can be tracked over time</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Proposed tool will allow the MCC to update metrics over time and track progress toward reducing climate vulnerability and addressing equity concerns, assisting in the creation of the 4-year LIDAC Status Report</li> </ul> <p>Task 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Will use marginal abatement cost curves to depict the cost per ton of CO2 for each measure</li> <li>Will also include cost of inaction to capture additional avoided costs that are not included in marginal abatement costs</li> </ul> <p>Task 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Resilient Analytics will utilize the Infrastructure Planning Support System (IPSS) analysis framework</li> <li>Analysis will specifically address the existing physical and socio-economic conditions (and burdens) throughout the community</li> <li>Example shown from Pennsylvania emphasizes the cost of climate impacts across statewide road infrastructure; limited detail about how costs and benefits of proposed strategies will be assessed</li> </ul> <p>Task 5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Proposal includes 8 meetings with the ESC but only one meeting with working groups</li> </ul>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	Yes
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Yes

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Lotus Engineering and Sustainability, LLC

**DATE:** February 13, 2024

(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	Yes
---	-----

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Lotus Engineering and Sustainability, LLC

**DATE:** February 13, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

---

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$225,000.00</b>	,	<b>\$279,096.00</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>25 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>20.2</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** nZero

**DATE:** February 14, 2024

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Amalia Siegel

**Names of Evaluators:** Ethan Tremblay, Sarah Curran, Amalia Siegel, Allison Montgomery

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>N/A</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>30</b>	<b>10</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>45</b>	<b>9</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>12.1</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>31.1</u></b>



**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** nZero

**DATE:** February 14, 2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Responsive

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** nZero

**DATE:** February 14, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>30</b>	<b>10</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Summary: Carbon accounting platform with limited climate planning experience. Example projects are municipal and county projects.

**I. Organization Qualifications and Experience**

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>nZero is a carbon accounting and management platform that enables stakeholders across an organization to access, visualize, and leverage accurate energy, emissions, and associated financial data for better decision making.</li><li>Has worked with local governments and state governments (looking at state-owned buildings and assets)</li></ul>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>City of Reno, NV: Tracking and reporting of GHG emissions and development of sustainability plan</li><li>Town of Truckee, CA: Emissions tracking and accounting, public engagement for the Town</li><li>Washoe County, NV: GHG emissions accounting and policy recommendation at County level</li></ol>
Any other listed projects	
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Crosswalk Labs: startup that offers a unique measurement, reporting, and verification tool using a proprietary methodology called the</li></ul>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** nZero

**DATE:** February 14, 2024

	Vulcan Project (Vulcan) to estimate fossil fuel carbon dioxide (FFCO <sub>2</sub> ) emissions
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Does not specify project being proposed, does not include subcontractors
Each position identifies title	Yes
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	Statement about litigation included; none listed
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Included

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** nZero

**DATE:** February 14, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>45</b>	<b>9</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Summary: Limited detail, minimally responsive outside of existing software platform capabilities.

**II. Proposed Services**

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	Yes, but limited detail provided for some tasks
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<p>Task 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Will use nZero Recommendation &amp; Planning tool</li><li>• Deliverables will include a summary report with an executive summary for policymakers along with a distilled slide deck showing results of emissions projections and quantifiable GHG reductions associated with measures in the climate action plan- statement about providing data and methods is included (verbatim from RFP)</li></ul> <p>Task 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Limited detail on how benefits to LIDACs will be assessed</li></ul> <p>Task 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Limited detail on how costs and benefits of mitigation measures will be assessed</li></ul> <p>Task 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• This task references mitigation measures, not resilience measures as requested</li></ul> <p>Task 5</p>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** nZero

**DATE:** February 14, 2024

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>nZero's Delivery Manager will interface with the Council, Science and Technical Subcommittee, Working Groups, and GOPIF to incorporate the results of the above analyses into the Maine Won't Wait update, along with other relevant project team members</li> </ul>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	Yes- data platform supplied by Crosswalk
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes, included
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Task and month included, but does not list person responsible
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	Not included

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** nZero

**DATE:** February 14, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

---

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$225,000.00</b>	,	<b>\$465,500.00</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>25 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>12.1</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Sustainability Solutions Group USA, Inc.

**DATE:** February 14, 2024

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Amalia Siegel

**Names of Evaluators:** Ethan Tremblay, Sarah Curran, Amalia Siegel, Allison Montgomery

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>N/A</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>30</b>	<b>15</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>45</b>	<b>10</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>22.3</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>47.3</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Sustainability Solutions Group USA, Inc.

**DATE:** February 14, 2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Responsive



**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Sustainability Solutions Group USA, Inc.

**DATE:** February 14, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>30</b>	<b>15</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Summary: Experienced climate planning firm with limited statewide project experience and many local government projects.

**I. Organization Qualifications and Experience**

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Canada's premier climate planners</li><li>• SSG has completed nearly 100 projects on climate action for municipalities of all sizes and in a diversity of political and geographical contexts</li><li>• Currently working with six municipalities and councils of governments to develop Priority Climate Action Plans (PCAP) and Comprehensive Climate Action Plans (CCAP) for Climate Pollution Reduction Grants (CPRG)</li></ul>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. Miami Valley Regional Planning Commission, OH: Recently awarded a contract to develop PCAP and CCAP for Dayton-Kettering OH Metropolitan Statistical Area</li><li>2. Oregon Department of Energy &amp; Center for the New Energy Economy at Colorado State University: Worked with Oregon Global Warming Commission to develop an updated pathway to 2035: the Transformational Integrated Greenhouse Gas</li></ol>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Sustainability Solutions Group USA, Inc.

**DATE:** February 14, 2024

	Emissions Reduction (TIGHGER) Plan for Oregon 3. Halifax Regional Municipality: Worked with Halifax to develop a combined mitigation and adaptation plan that addresses both corporate and community energy use, GHG emissions, risks, and vulnerabilities from 2019 to 2050
Any other listed projects	23 additional projects listed, including some state-level climate planning and scenario analysis (NV, OR, WA)
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	N/A
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes, roles are clearly defined in pages following organizational chart
Each position identifies title	Yes
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	Statement about litigation included; none listed
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Included

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Sustainability Solutions Group USA, Inc.

**DATE:** February 14, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>45</b>	<b>10</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Summary: Lack of detail on methodology for Task 2-4 and some components in the required scope of work were included as add-ons for an additional fee.

**II. Proposed Services**

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Included for all tasks; difficult to identify which information goes with each task. Did not follow format for scope of work.</li><li>• Demonstrates clear understanding of CPRG deliverables and timeline</li></ul>
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<p>Task 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• GOPIF will be required to assemble all data used for Task 1</li><li>• All modeling data, data sources and assumptions are transparent; we outline them in a Data Methods, and Assumptions (DMA) manual that can be shared publicly.</li><li>• Will model a business as usual scenario and a low carbon scenario</li><li>• Deliverables include a presentation and a summary report showing the results of emissions projections and quantifiable GHG reductions associated with the measures.</li></ul> <p>Task 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Will use CEJST and EJScreen to identify relevant communities</li></ul>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Sustainability Solutions Group USA, Inc.

**DATE:** February 14, 2024

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Limited detail on how quantitative impacts to LIDACs will be assessed; however, examples are shown</li> </ul> <p>Task 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Will use EPA COBRA tool to estimate financial impacts of health benefits of the low carbon scenario</li> <li>Other benefits such as increased resilience, decreased energy costs, environmental benefits, and improved access to amenities and economic development opportunities will also be assessed; limited detail on how benefits will be calculated</li> </ul> <p>Task 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Proposed scope focuses on “synergistic benefits” of mitigation strategies, “quantitative modeling of the financial costs and benefits of resilience actions” is offered for an additional fee</li> </ul> <p>Task 5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Support includes one presentation to MCC and working groups about cost-benefit framework and up to two meetings with the MCC and working groups to provide technical support and guidance</li> </ul>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	N/A
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes, included
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Describes task and month but not person responsible for each task
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	N/A

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Sustainability Solutions Group USA, Inc.

**DATE:** February 14, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

---

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$225,000.00</b>	,	<b>\$252,440.00</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>25 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>22.3</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Vermont Energy Investment Corporation (VEIC)

**DATE:** February 15, 2024

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Amalia Siegel

**Names of Evaluators:** Ethan Tremblay, Sarah Curran, Amalia Siegel, Allison Montgomery

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>N/A</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>30</b>	<b>20</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>45</b>	<b>30</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>8.4</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>58.4</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Vermont Energy Investment Corporation (VEIC)

**DATE:** February 15, 2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Responsive

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Vermont Energy Investment Corporation (VEIC)

**DATE:** February 15, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>30</b>	<b>20</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Summary: Strong subject matter and implementation expertise; limited modeling expertise. Subcontractors have relevant experience in Maine.

**I. Organization Qualifications and Experience**

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• VEIC has expertise in energy efficiency, building decarbonization, transportation, electrification, demand management, and program implementation</li><li>• The VEIC Team has been doing jurisdictional energy and decarbonization planning for 10 years</li><li>• Team has experience working in Maine</li></ul>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. The Tennessee Valley Authority (TVA): created a baseline for the 171-county multistate region, a reference scenario, and several low emissions scenarios</li><li>2. Energy Action Network: Analyzed barriers facing communities of color, renters, and non-native speakers of English to accessing energy efficiency programs; implemented new approaches to program design and stakeholder engagement</li></ol> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Beech Hill Research - Maine Governor's Office for Policy,</li></ul>



**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Vermont Energy Investment Corporation (VEIC)

**DATE:** February 15, 2024

	Innovation, and the Future: Prioritize and establish equity metrics for Maine Won't Wait
Any other listed projects	Four additional projects listed for subcontractors, including benefits analysis and statewide infrastructure vulnerability assessment (Maine)
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Yes, included for all</li> <li>• Beech Hill Research: provides energy and climate equity research and advisory services to state agencies, utilities, NGOs, and energy service firms</li> <li>• Climate Advisory: Maine-based, certified WBE firm with deep expertise in climate change and resilience.</li> <li>• Industrial Economics: Consulting firm with expertise in climate impact and adaptation assessments, environmental policy and regulatory analysis, economic analysis, program evaluation, health and ecological risk assessment, habitat restoration, natural resource damage assessment, and information management</li> </ul>
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes
Each position identifies title	Yes
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	Statement about litigation included; states that "VEIC can confirm that there are no past, present, or anticipated lawsuits, claims or disputes that would affect VEIC's ability to render the services outlined in its proposal"
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Included

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Vermont Energy Investment Corporation (VEIC)

**DATE:** February 15, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>45</b>	<b>30</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Summary: Modeling performed using a free and open-source software, relies on inputs and assumptions from 2020 model. Proposal for Tasks 2-4 is robust.

**II. Proposed Services**

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	Yes, included for all tasks
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>For each task, we will explain the methods used to produce the results and provide all assumptions, equations and formulas, spreadsheets, and GIS files</li></ul> <p>Task 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>VEIC will review the 2020 model and inputs with the intention of reusing inputs and assumptions that are still valid</li><li>Will use LEAP, a free and transparent software developed by the Stockholm Environmental Institute that enables “simple modeling”</li><li>Will model a reference case, 1-3 initial scenarios, and 1-4 final scenarios</li><li>Deliverables include a slide deck and a full report, with an executive summary for policy makers, explanation of methods</li></ul> <p>Task 2</p>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Vermont Energy Investment Corporation (VEIC)

**DATE:** February 15, 2024

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Will create a “benefits taxonomy” for each proposed measure, identify potential benefits, beneficiaries, and indicators that describe beneficiaries</li> <li>• Provide a rationale for considering data beyond the overall CEJST score to represent LIDACs in Maine</li> </ul> <p>Task 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Analysis includes Direct costs to implement each measure, Direct GHG reduction benefits of each measure, and Co-benefits of GHG reduction measures</li> <li>• Will use EPA COBRA tool to assess air quality co-benefits</li> </ul> <p>Task 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Proposes several possible approaches to quantitative modeling of resilience measures depending on the sector that is of most interest to MCC</li> </ul> <p>Task 5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Working with GOPIF and the MCC, VEIC will design an engagement process for stakeholders to review and provide input on the analysis in each Task as needed to support the priorities of the MCC, equity best practices, data inputs, and timeline feasibility</li> <li>• Anticipate 5-8 meetings to support this work</li> </ul>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	No, but identified in work plan
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Yes
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	Yes

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Vermont Energy Investment Corporation (VEIC)

**DATE:** February 15, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

---

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$225,000.00</b>	,	<b>\$670,100.00</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>25 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>8.4</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Vanasse Hangen Brustlin, Inc. (VHB)

**DATE:** February 15, 2024

**SUMMARY PAGE**

**Department Name:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

**Name of RFP Coordinator:** Amalia Siegel

**Names of Evaluators:** Ethan Tremblay, Sarah Curran, Amalia Siegel, Allison Montgomery

---

<b><u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u></b>	<b><u>Pass</u></b>	<b><u>Fail</u></b>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	<b>N/A</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b><u>Scoring Sections</u></b>	<b><u>Points Available</u></b>	<b><u>Points Awarded</u></b>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>30</b>	<b>12</b>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>45</b>	<b>9</b>
Section IV. Cost Proposal	<b>25</b>	<b>7.3</b>
<b><u>Total Points</u></b>	<b><u>100</u></b>	<b><u>28.3</u></b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Vanasse Hangen Brustlin, Inc. (VHB)

**DATE:** February 15, 2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I  
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

---

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Responsive

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Vanasse Hangen Brustlin, Inc. (VHB)

**DATE:** February 15, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II  
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	<b>30</b>	<b>12</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Summary: Infrastructure consultant with little experience modeling greenhouse gas emissions.

**I. Organization Qualifications and Experience**

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• VHB has worked with communities across Maine and New England to secure grants, lead stakeholder engagement workshops, prepare vulnerability assessments, and develop resiliency and adaptation plans</li><li>• Have completed transportation plans for MaineDOT and Northern New England Passenger Rail Authority</li></ul>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. Massachusetts Port Authority: developed Authority-wide Net Zero Roadmap by 2031</li><li>2. MassCEC: Evaluate, rewrite, and manage the hosting environment, as well as provide five years of maintenance and operational support for their Production Tracking System (PTS).</li></ol> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Maine Governor's Energy Office and Department of Economic and Community Development: launch and manage a \$1.25 million ARPA-funded statewide program that provides technical assistance to communities looking to foster</li></ul>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Vanasse Hangen Brustlin, Inc. (VHB)

**DATE:** February 15, 2024

	new economic activity by implementing development projects in areas with underutilized energy infrastructure (HR&A)
Any other listed projects	
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Address, phone number, and contact person not included</li> <li>HR&amp;A: Real estate, economic development, and public infrastructure firm that helps clients create more equitable, resilient, and dynamic communities</li> </ul>
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes
Each position identifies title	Yes but does not describe role in project for all team members
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	Lists 5 current cases and 8 that are settled or resolved
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Included



**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Vanasse Hangen Brustlin, Inc. (VHB)

**DATE:** February 15, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III  
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	<b>45</b>	<b>9</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

Summary: Limited detail provided for methodology on all tasks.

**II. Proposed Services**

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	Yes, included for all tasks
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<p>Task 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>For newly identified mitigation measures, VHB will either leverage the existing MWW models (refined as needed) or build new models (as needed) to quantify their GHG emissions benefits</li><li>Will develop a “business as usual” scenario and a “planning” scenario</li><li>Will leverage the EPA’s State Inventory and Projection Tool</li><li>Deliverables include summary report, slide deck, and explanation of methods (verbatim from RFP)</li></ul> <p>Task 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Will use CEJST to identify LIDACs</li><li>Use IMPLAN to assess job impacts; generally describes approach to assessing other benefits such as impact of enhanced EV rebates on low income households</li></ul> <p>Task 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Limited detail provided</li></ul> <p>Task 4</p>

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Vanasse Hangen Brustlin, Inc. (VHB)

**DATE:** February 15, 2024

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Will leverage the methodology used in the 2020 economic benefits analysis</li> </ul> <p>Task 5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The VHB team will be available to provide technical on-call assistance throughout the duration of the project schedule</li> </ul>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	Yes
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Does not list person responsible for each task
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	Yes

**STATE OF MAINE  
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER:** Vanasse Hangen Brustlin, Inc. (VHB)

**DATE:** February 15, 2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV  
Cost Proposal**

---

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
<b>\$225,000.00</b>	,	<b>\$775,000.00</b>	<b>x</b>	<b>25 points</b>	<b>=</b>	<b>7.3</b>

**Evaluation Team Comments:**

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** AEC

**DATE:** 2/2/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Sarah Curran

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** GOPIF

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

*I. Organization Qualifications and Experience*

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• National emissions forecasting and emissions policy impact consultant</li><li>• Extensive experience in environmental justice and equity analysis</li></ul>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• State of Maine Renewable Energy Goals Market Assessment: AEC's role was to assess equity impacts</li><li>• AEC Emissions Measurement Tool (AEC-EMIT): a spreadsheet-based tool—AEC's Emissions Measurement Inventory Tool (AEC-EMIT)—that provides users with an interface to build a greenhouse gas emissions inventory (and 20-year emissions projections) for a specific geographic region</li><li>• Equity Assessment of Electrification Incentives in the District of Columbia: equitable electrification</li></ul>
Any other listed projects	
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Planning Communities (PC) has extensive experience in greenhouse gas emission accounting, estimating reduction potential from a range of climate action policies and programs, as well as assessing the co-benefits of such strategies and typical barriers and opportunities associated with implementation.</li></ul>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** AEC

**DATE:** 2/2/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Sarah Curran

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** GOPIF

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>rbouvier consulting, economics and climate change</li> <li>The AEC/PC/rbouvier team brings deep technical expertise as well as robust skills in communication and visualization of climate data and information, and an approach that fosters collaboration and stakeholder insight throughout each work product.</li> </ul>
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Org chart but not project specific
Each position identifies title	Yes
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	Did not include
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Included

**II. Proposed Services**

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	Yes
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	Task 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>AEC Emissions Measurement Inventory Tool</li> <li>Wedge analyses</li> </ul> Task 2 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>CEJST</li> <li>Limited detail provided</li> </ul> Task 3 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Limited detail provided</li> </ul> Task 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Limited detail provided</li> </ul> Task 5
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	No

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** AEC

**DATE:** 2/2/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Sarah Curran

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** GOPIF

<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Does not include who is responsible
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	No

# STATE OF MAINE INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Applied Economics Clinic

**DATE:** 2/1/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

## Individual Evaluator Comments:

### I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<p>The proposal is a partnership with AEC, Planning Communities (PC), and rbouvier consulting</p> <p>AEC has experience in emissions accounting, emissions forecasting, and emissions policy impact planning and is led by Senior Economist, Liz Stanton, PhD. AEC is a mission-based non-profit based in Massachusetts and founded in 2017.</p>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<p><b>Project 1:</b> State of Maine Renewable Energy Goals Market Assessment for the Governor's Energy Office. AEC collaborated with E3 to analyze future scenarios to meet Maine's renewable energy targets.</p> <p>did not provide client contact info for the State of Maine.</p> <p><b>Project 2:</b> AEC Emissions Measurement Tool</p> <p>this project is presented as a tool that AEC has created but it was not shared if it has been used and contact information for the project is AEC staff</p> <p><b>Project 3:</b> Equity Assessment of the Electrification Incentives in the District of Columbia</p> <p>AEC examined a potential pathway for reducing emissions in the District of Columbia, including equitable electrification—a transition away from fossil fuels while taking into consideration equity implications, in both existing and future decarbonization efforts</p> <p>No client contact information was given.</p>
Any other listed projects	
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	<p>Planning Communities – climate and sustainability planning</p> <p>-contact info provided</p>

# STATE OF MAINE INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Applied Economics Clinic

**DATE:** 2/1/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

	rbouvier – Rachel Bouvier is an Economics/Environmental Science and Policy Associate Professor at University of Southern Maine and has experience in economic and statistical analysis in energy and environmental fields. -contact info provided
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes, chart provided but not project specific
Each position identifies title	yes
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	Litigation was not mentioned in the proposal – section left out
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Acord form provided

## II. Proposed Services

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	yes
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<p>Task 1: AEC's emission measurement inventory tool will be used for forecasts. States that this tool provides "transparent access and interpretation for review by GOPIF staff"</p> <p>The project team will conduct wedge analyses to demonstrate adoption of multiple policy options.</p> <p>Task 2: project team will identify LIDAC using US American Community Survey, CDC's PLACES, FEMA National Risk Index, First Street Foundation, U.S. Dept. of Energy's Low-Income Energy Affordability Dataset Tool, U.S. EPA's EJScreen, and CEJEST</p> <p>Task 3: Will utilize data and methods from the economic benefit analysis in 2020 Maine Wont Wait and data and assumptions from Task 1.</p> <p>Limited detail provided</p>



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Applied Economics Clinic

**DATE:** 2/1/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

	<p>Task 4: Will utilize data and methods from the economic benefit analysis in 2020 Maine Wont Wait and data and assumptions from Task 3.</p> <p>Limited detail provided</p> <p>Task 5: AEC plans to be involved with the MCC and working groups throughout the project term and plans to create a climate strategies matrix to organize key assessment metrics on each climate measure</p>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Yes, but people responsible not included
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	No

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Applied Economics Clinic

**DATE:** February 1, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Team provides extensive experience in designing, implementing, and evaluating both emissions inventories and climate and energy plans</li><li>• AEC extensive background in conducting quantitative analyses related to emissions accounting as well as examining the intersection of economic impacts, environmental costs and benefits, and issues of social equity</li><li>• Emissions forecasting, emissions policy impact planning, environmental justice and equity analysis, identification of overburdened communities and assessment of climate and policy impacts on these communities</li><li>• mission-based non-profit consulting group that offers expert services in the areas of energy, environment, consumer protection, and equity from seasoned professionals while providing on-the-job training to the next generation of technical experts</li><li>• AEC professional staff includes experts in electric, multi-sector and economic systems modeling, climate and emissions analysis, green technologies, and translating technical information for a general audience</li></ul>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Applied Economics Clinic

**DATE:** February 1, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. State of Maine Renewable Energy Goals Market Assessment – Evaluated equity impacts of options for meeting Maine's renewable targets over the next decade</li><li>2. AEC Emissions Measurement Tool – Developed a spreadsheet-based tool that provides users with an interface to build a greenhouse gas emissions inventory (and 20-year emissions projections) for a specific geographic region</li><li>3. Equity Assessment of Electrification Incentives in the District of Columbia - examine a potential pathway for reducing emissions in the District of Columbia: equitable electrification</li></ol>
Any other listed projects	
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Does not include addresses, phone number only provided for Dr. Rachel Bouvier</li><li>• Planning Communities - firm specializes in developing fun and engaging planning tools and geospatial-based analysis, applications, resources and data-derived insights needed to solve complex community, environmental, economic and infrastructure challenges</li><li>• rbouvier Consulting - specializes in conducting comprehensive socio-economic analyses, vulnerability assessments, as well as traditional economic impact analyses</li></ul>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Applied Economics Clinic

**DATE:** February 1, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes
Each position identifies title	Yes
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	Not included
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Yes, included

**II. Proposed Services**

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	Yes, with list of subtasks and deliverables
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Provide GOPIF with written memos and associated Excel workbooks that summarize the findings of their quantitative analyses</li> </ul> <p>Task 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Will use AEC Emissions Measurement Inventory Tool to make projections</li> <li>Will use wedge analyses to demonstrate impact of policy options</li> </ul> <p>Task 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Geographically identify LIDAC populations according to the CEJST criteria for each burden category</li> <li>Will produce LIDAC maps, including one statewide map and 8 region-level maps</li> <li>For CCAP, will provide a quantitative assessment of the benefits to LIDACS (little detail provided)</li> </ul>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Applied Economics Clinic

**DATE:** February 1, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

	<p>Task 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Utilize the data and methods from 2020 economic benefits analysis</li> </ul> <p>Task 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Utilize the data and methods from 2020 economic benefits analysis</li> </ul> <p>Task 5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Will create a climate strategies matrix to organize key assessment metrics on each climate measure based on the results of Tasks 1-4</li> </ul>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	Does not identify which tasks will be performed by subcontractors
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Describes tasks and month, does not specify person responsible
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	Does not note any tasks delegated to subcontractors

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Applied Economics Clinic

**DATE:** 2/1/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Ethan Tremblay

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Energy Office

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

*I. Organization Qualifications and Experience*

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
<i>Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services</i>	<p>Yes – AEC/PC/rbouvier team “extensive experience in designing, implementing, and evaluating both emissions inventories and climate and energy plans”</p> <p><i>Data-driven decision-making, equity, implementation focus</i></p> <p>AEC – emissions forecasting, policy impact  PC – emissions accounting, reduction potential, co-benefits  Rbouvier – teaching, leading engagement on planning</p>
<i>Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services</i>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Maine Renewable Energy Goals Market Assessment (AEC subcontractor to E3)</li> <li>2. AEC Emissions Measurement Tool (EMIT) – not clear if internal tool or specific client engagement?</li> <li>3. Equity Assessment of Electrification Incentives in DC -- Office of the People's Counsel</li> </ol>
<i>Any other listed projects</i>	n/a
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
<i>Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included</i>	<i>Names, limited contact information (no addresses), staff biographies and experience provided</i>
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
<i>Specifies project being proposed</i>	Yes
<i>Each position identifies title</i>	Yes
<b>Litigation</b>	
<i>Any listed litigation</i>	No statement provided
<i>Additional details</i>	No

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Applied Economics Clinic

**DATE:** 2/1/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Ethan Tremblay

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Energy Office

<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
<i>ACORD form or similar</i>	<i>Provided</i>

**II. Proposed Services**

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
<i>Describes scope of services to be provided</i>	<i>Yes, proposes series of written memos and excel workbooks as deliverables</i>
<i>Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks</i>	<i>Wedge analysis Near-term and long-term emissions forecasts, economy-wide and sector-specific, BAU and full implementation (AEC-EMIT tool) PCAP and CCAP, quantitative LIDAC impact analysis Indicates working knowledge of CPRG requirements and process and familiarity with MWW Climate strategies matrix to shape interface with working groups/MCC</i>
<i>(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform</i>	<i>All tasks generally full project team</i>
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
<i>Work plan included in timeline form</i>	<i>Yes, detailed Gantt's</i>
<i>Describes each task, month, and person responsible</i>	<i>Yes task and month, lacking detail on responsible person</i>
<i>(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors</i>	<i>Yes, through budget/hours table (should be in Part 4)</i>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** CohnReznick

**DATE:** 2/2/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Sarah Curran

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** GOPIF

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**I. Organization Qualifications and Experience**

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• National advisory, audit and tax firm</li><li>• Consulting services to public and private companies including greenhouse gas emissions projections and cost-benefit analysis.</li><li>• Carbon accounting, environmental justice, social impact and equity, funding and financing, financial modeling, cost-benefit analysis, deep industry knowledge, and strong project management.</li><li>• Affordable housing and renewable energy</li><li>• Stakeholder engagement</li></ul>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Washington Union Station Expansion</li><li>• Phippsburg Low-Lying Road Climate Adaptation for MaineDOT</li><li>• Manchester-By-The-Sea received a grant from the Office of Coastal Zone Management to reduce coastal flood risks and increase coastal resilience</li></ul>
Any other listed projects	
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Maroozu, Inc. will bring a unique perspective from a climate accelerator, start-up innovator, technology disruptor, and academic thought leader.</li><li>• Fuss &amp; O'Neill engineering and science firm</li></ul>
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** CohnReznick

**DATE:** 2/2/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Sarah Curran

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** GOPIF

Each position identifies title	Yes
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	Not included - doesn't believe any one of them will materially impact our ability to provide services set forth in the RFP.
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Yes

**II. Proposed Services**

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	Yes
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<p>Task 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Using SIT and SEDS data, proposal does not specify model</li> </ul> <p>Task 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>CJEST and EJScreen</li> <li>Qualitative and Quantitative Benefit Analysis</li> </ul> <p>Task 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Quantify co-benefits</li> </ul> <p>Task 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>assess costs and benefits</li> </ul> <p>Task 5 interface</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>strong PMO function</li> </ul>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** CohnReznick

**DATE:** 2/2/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Sarah Curran

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** GOPIF

(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	No
---	----

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** CohnReznick

**DATE:** 2/1/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<p>CohnReznick is a leading advisory, assurance, and tax firm. Can provide “a complete range of services” to public and private companies, including ghg emissions projects and cost-benefit analysis</p> <p>Will partner with Maroozu Inc and Fuss&amp;O’Neill for this proposal</p>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<p><b>Project 1:</b> Infrastructure: Washington Union Station Expansion Project. CohnReznick provided cost benefit analysis, best practices, and guidance for transforming the greater Washington region’s transportation network</p> <p><b>Project 2:</b> Maine Dept. of Transportation – Phippsburg Low-Lying Road Climate Adaptation. Fuss &amp; O’Neill provided alternatives assessment for road improvement design for low-lying roadway. (Fuss &amp; O’Neill’s project)</p> <p><b>Project 3:</b> Manchester-by-the-Sea Coastal Vulnerability Action Plan completed by Fuss &amp; O’Neill. The project included coastal modeling, quantifying flooding probability, alternatives cost-benefit analysis.</p>
Any other listed projects	
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	<p>Yes</p> <p>Fuss &amp; O’Neill – engineer and science based firm</p> <p>Maroozu – Maine-based intelligent software solutions. “climate accelerator, start-up innovator, technology disruptor, and academic thought leader” consisting of Dr. Richard Corey and Justin Hafner</p>

# STATE OF MAINE INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** CohnReznick

**DATE:** 2/1/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

	Q- Unclear what the actual work/role of Maroozu is for this project or what subject matter they will be bringing expertise on. Bios imply that they are experts in technology research and business start-ups.
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes, split into tasks and roles identified
Each position identifies title	yes
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	unclear about litigation issues over the last 5 years. Provided statement that any proceedings will have no "material financial impact on the firm" or their ability to satisfy the RFP.
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Provided Acord certificate of insurance.

## II. Proposed Services

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	Yes
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<p>Task 1: will use EPA's SIT for modelling</p> <p>Limited detail provided for this task and no mention of providing data inputs and assumptions to GOPIF</p> <p>Task 2: will use CEJST to identify LIDAC and EJScreen</p> <p>-limited detail provided</p> <p>Task 3: will identify climate mitigation measures (using 2020 economic benefit analysis as a guide), provide measure feasibility assessments, and use EPA's Avoided Emissions and generation tool (AVERT) for forecasting</p> <p>Q- mention of the ability to create "Easy-to-digest dashboards" but it's unclear if that is what they are proposing to give GOPIF</p>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** CohnReznick

**DATE:** 2/1/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

	<p>Task 4: approach includes the systematic evaluation of resilience strategies (including an analysis of updates to possible legislative levers like the Shoreland Zoning Act, Natural Resources Protection Act, Statewide Standards for Timber Harvesting, Stormwater Management Act, Maine Floodplain Management Model ordinance, Land Use Regulation, etc.) and funding mechanisms (Community Development Block Grants, explore Maine Municipal Bond Bank delivery mechanisms, Drinking Water State Revolving Fund, etc.) to generate an adaptation portfolio (or matrix) for each social, economic, and environmental impact under consideration</p> <p>Task 5: will bring project management experience. Listed weekly workstream meeting, bi-weekly advisory group meetings, and opportunities for informal meetings</p> <p>Limited detail about actual deliverables for the tasks and no mention of providing input data and assumptions</p>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	yes
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	yes
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Yes, but person responsible not included
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	no

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** CohnReznick LLP

**DATE:** February 1, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Firm provides a complete range of services...including greenhouse gas emissions projections and cost-benefits analysis</li><li>• has a long history of working with community developers and renewable energy companies to analyze impacts of tax credit capital raise, project underwriting, and tax incentives</li></ul>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. InfrastructureDC: Washington Union Station Expansion Project – cost benefit analysis for Washington DC transportation system</li><li>2. Maine Department of Transportation – Alternatives assessment and design for roadway adaptation Phippsburg Rt 216 and Rt 209</li><li>3. Manchester-by-the-Sea, MA – Complete a coastal vulnerability action plan</li></ol>
Any other listed projects	
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Yes, included for all</li><li>• Fuss &amp; O'Neill: Engineering and science based firm, help clients achieve organizational and community decarbonization goals</li><li>• Maroozu: Developer of intelligent software solutions and related services</li></ul>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** CohnReznick LLP

**DATE:** February 1, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes
Each position identifies title	Yes
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	None listed
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Included

**II. Proposed Services**

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	Included for all tasks
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<p>Task 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Our approach will pinpoint activities that maximize the magnitude of both near-term and long-term GHG emission reductions for the State with a clear emphasis on practical approach, high quality impact, and actionable strategies</li><li>• Utilize the Department of Energy's Energy Information Administration (EIA)'s State Inventory Tool (SIT), State Energy Data System (SEDS), Carbon Mitigation Initiative's (CMI) Stabilization Wedges</li></ul> <p>Task 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• We will gather geospatial data to map out LIDACs, encompassing demographic data, income levels, and other socio-economic indicators from sources like the U.S. Census Bureau and the State</li></ul>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** CohnReznick LLP

**DATE:** February 1, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

	<p>of Maine's local government database.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• We will also estimate the proportion of benefits expected to accrue in the identified communities as compared to the total benefits resulting from the GHG emission reduction measures described in the CCAP.</li></ul> <p>Task 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• To evaluate the financial and broader implications of each initiative, our analysis will encompass both direct and indirect costs</li><li>• Our calculation will subtract the total costs (e.g. both direct and indirect) from the quantified benefits (e.g. energy savings, percentage of communities with access to electricity during power outages, etc.), and will also consider long term implications</li></ul> <p>Task 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• We understand this work to have three major factors in consideration: 1) bolstering coastal community resilience, 2) informing the location of development, and 3) addressing "getting out of harm's way".</li><li>• provide a ranking matrix highlighting to what extent that climate adaptation strategies provide added benefits to communities (e.g., improved public safety, economic development,</li></ul>
--	---



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** CohnReznick LLP

**DATE:** February 1, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

	<p>greenhouse gas emissions reductions, etc.).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Our team will identify potential sources of funding for implementing each strategy, including the ease or difficulty of obtaining supplemental grant funding and the ability to utilize existing capital funding streams</li> </ul> <p>Task 5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Will develop a Project Communication Plan detailing approach to interfacing with all parties, including working groups and Maine Climate Council</li> </ul>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	Does not identify tasks to be performed by subcontractors
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Includes task and month but not person responsible for each task
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	Does not note tasks delegated to subcontractors

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** CohnReznick

**DATE:** 2/1/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Ethan Tremblay

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Energy Office

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

*I. Organization Qualifications and Experience*

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
<i>Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services</i>	<i>Top US accounting firm, merged in 2012. Expertise in housing and renewable energy through tax credit and incentive activity</i>
<i>Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services</i>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><i>1. Washington Union Station Expansion – strategic governance, best practices, roadmap for delivery of greater Washington region transportation network re-envisioning</i></li> <li><i>2. MaineDOT – alternatives assessment and design for Route 209 (Fuss &amp; O'Neill project)</i></li> <li><i>3. Manchester-by-the-Sea CZM-funded coastal risk and resilience assessment</i></li> </ol> <p><i>No examples of emissions strategy evaluation or modeling projects</i></p>
<i>Any other listed projects</i>	
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
<i>Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included</i>	<p><i>Fuss &amp; O'Neill – New England/NY engineering firm</i></p> <p><i>Maroozu, Inc. – Dr. Corey, VEMI Lab Director and School of Computing and Information Science associate faculty at UMaine; Justin Hafner, co-founder/CEO/chairman</i></p> <p><i>Contact information and qualifications provided</i></p>
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
<i>Specifies project being proposed</i>	<b>Yes</b>
<i>Each position identifies title</i>	<b>Yes</b>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** CohnReznick

**DATE:** 2/1/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Ethan Tremblay

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Energy Office

<b>Litigation</b>	
<i>Any listed litigation</i>	<i>Statement provided</i>
<i>Additional details</i>	<i>None</i>
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
<i>ACORD form or similar</i>	<i>Provided</i>

**II. Proposed Services**

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
<i>Describes scope of services to be provided</i>	<p><i>Task 1</i>  1. <i>EIA SEDS, SIT</i></p> <p><i>Task 2</i>  1. <i>Propose unspecified number of LIDAC stakeholder interviews</i></p> <p><i>Task 3</i>  1. <i>Emphasis on funding opportunities, financing strategies/tax credits</i></p> <p><i>Task 4</i>  1. <i>Matrix ranking adaptation strategies with additional benefits</i></p> <p><i>Task 5</i>  1. <i>Propose development of project communications plan</i></p>
<i>Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks</i>	<i>See above. Overall limited detail beyond affirmation of RFP requirements</i>
<i>(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform</i>	<i>Some additional project experience case studies included from each team member</i>
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
<i>Work plan included in timeline form</i>	<i>Gantt charts for each task broken by phase</i>
<i>Describes each task, month, and person responsible</i>	<i>No</i>
<i>(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors</i>	<i>No</i>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Evolved Energy Research

**DATE:** 2/6/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Sarah Curran

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** GOPIF

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**I. Organization Qualifications and Experience**

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Experienced economy-wide modeling firm</li><li>Clients include state and federal agencies, consulting companies, large technology and manufacturing companies, utilities, and NGOs</li><li>Detailed and specific, projects and examples demonstrate firms experience and expertise to each Task</li></ul>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Maine 2040 Energy Plan for the Governor's Energy Office</li><li>Massachusetts Decarbonization Roadmap</li><li>Washington State Hydrogen Strategy and Washington 2021 State Energy Strategy</li></ul>
Any other listed projects	
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	None
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes
Each position identifies title	Yes
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	None
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Included

**II. Proposed Services**

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Evolved Energy Research

**DATE:** 2/6/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Sarah Curran

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** GOPIF

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	Yes
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<p>Task 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• (1) EnergyPATHWAYS, a bottom-up energy system model; and (2) the Regional Investment and Operations (RIO) model, an optimal capacity expansion model that simulates hourly operations</li></ul> <p>Task 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Geographically-defined LIDAC, using both the Climate and Economics Justice Screening Tool (CEJEST) and the Environmental Justice Screening and Mapping Tool (EJScreen), and non-geographical “priority populations”, building on the framework identified by the MCC Equity Subcommittee (ESC) by creating thresholds for each criterion</li></ul> <p>Task 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• COBRA tool, IMPLAN</li><li>• economic costs and benefits described above, layered with public health benefits. In addition to these categories, we will include job creation, increased climate resilience, and other environmental benefits.</li></ul> <p>Task 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Cost curve</li><li>• Costs and benefits, risk and uncertainty</li></ul> <p>Task 5</p>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Evolved Energy Research

**DATE:** 2/6/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Sarah Curran

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** GOPIF

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Proactively coordinate</li></ul>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	N/A
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Yes
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	N/A

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Evolved Energy Research

**DATE:** 2/5/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	Evolved Energy Research (Evolved) was founded in 2016 and is focused on accurately modeling decarbonization of the economy. Evolved is currently working on the Maine 2040 Energy Plan for the Maine Governor's Energy Office
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<p>Project 1: Washington State Dept. of Commerce, Energy policy Office - Evolved Energy Research partnered with the Clean Energy Transition Institute to provide technical analysis in development of the Washington 2021 State Energy Strategy.</p> <p>Project 2: Maine Governor's Energy Office (GEO) 2040 Energy Plan (2023-2024) - Evolved and The Brattle Group are supporting the Governor's Energy Office to develop and compare alternative pathways to decarbonize Maine's economy</p> <p>Project 3: Massachusetts Executive Office of Energy and Environmental Affairs - Massachusetts Decarbonization Roadmap (2020-2022) Evolved supported development of the decarbonization roadmap and authored of six tech reports for the project. "This is the first study to examine energy and industrial emissions targets consistent with net-zero GHGs by 2050 for the region."</p>
Any other listed projects	-Other projects are vaguely referenced with figures meant to show Evolved's modelling capabilities
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	No subcontractors for the project
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	yes
Each position identifies title	yes

# STATE OF MAINE INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Evolved Energy Research

**DATE:** 2/5/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	No litigation in last 5 years
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Acord form provided

## II. Proposed Services

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	yes
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<p>Task 1: Evolved Energy Research performs ongoing review of literature to keep their own database of economy-wide ghg emissions reduction measures. They will use the combined set of sources from past Maine reports, additional literature review, and their own work, to develop an up-to-date measure database</p> <p>Evolved will use EnergyPATHWAYS (bottom-up energy system model) and the RIO model (supply-side optimization model) to evaluate GHG reduction measures (cause and effect models)</p> <p>Will provide all data inputs and assumptions</p> <p>Task 2: PCAP update will be literature review</p> <p>CCAP/MWW update – will use spatial statistical tools to determine the proportion of Costs and Benefits from Task 3 and 4 that will impact LIDAC and priority populations. All results will be downscaled, with spatially aligned data or using covariate-dependent downscaling, to the LIDAC level of observation</p> <p>Task 3: Task 1 modeling toolkit has integrated all capital expenditures and operating costs of achieving GHG emissions reductions for selected measures. Will include economic costs and benefits, layered with public health benefits. Analysis will also include job creation, increased climate resilience, and other environmental benefits.</p>



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Evolved Energy Research

**DATE:** 2/5/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

	<p>Will use IMPLAN (input output analysis)</p> <p>Task 4: Evolved will continue to leverage the tools used in the 2020 report, including benefit-cost analysis, cost-effectiveness analysis, and economic impact analysis. Evolved can apply models proposed in Task 3, including running scenarios in IMPLAN and their econometric models</p> <p>Task 5: listed identified relevant meeting scenarios (e.g. kickoff meeting, review of reports and presentations with GOPIF, project update meetings)</p> <p>Evolved will communicate the findings of the analysis and stakeholder conversations in summaries, presentations, task reports, and a final, written report that combines the reports for each task.</p>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	N/A
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	yes
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Yes
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Evolved Energy Research

**DATE:** February 7, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Has experience modeling economy-wide decarbonization</li><li>• Has built a comprehensive model of Maine's economy-wide energy demands, and how those demands can be met by supply of electricity and fuels during the Maine Pathways to 2040 Study.</li><li>• Cost-benefit analysis including the costs of all capital investments, operating costs, and fuel purchases across all sectors of the economy, translating emissions reduction pathways into costs and benefits relative to a baseline scenario and evaluating climate mitigation measures side by side</li><li>• Additional economic impact analysis will estimate jobs and economic development spurred by Maine's decarbonization investments</li></ul>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. Washington 2023 State Hydrogen Strategy, Washington 2021 State Energy Strategy: estimates of total decarbonization costs and investments, and guidance on how to support development of hydrogen supply and new markets for hydrogen and hydrogen derived fuels</li><li>2. Maine Governor's Energy Office (GEO) 2040 Energy Plan: leading energy modeling work to develop</li></ol>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Evolved Energy Research

**DATE:** February 7, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

	and compare alternative pathways to decarbonize Maine's economy 3. Massachusetts Decarbonization Roadmap: authored one of six technical reports called "Energy Pathways to Deep Decarbonization," outlining eight different energy system pathways for the Northeast
Any other listed projects	
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	N/A
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes
Each position identifies title	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Yes</li> <li>• One team member is based in Maine</li> </ul>
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	Statement about litigation included
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Yes, included

**II. Proposed Services**

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	Included for all tasks
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Does not identify number of personnel dedicated to each task</li> </ul> <p>Task 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Will develop a database of greenhouse gas (GHG) reduction measures using combined set of sources from past Maine reports,</li> </ul>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Evolved Energy Research

**DATE:** February 7, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

	<p>additional literature review, and EER's own work</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Will use 2 tools developed by EER: EnergyPATHWAYS, a bottom-up energy system model and RIO, an optimal capacity expansion model that simulates hourly operations</li><li>• propose to model up to 6 policy scenarios</li><li>• Deliverables will include summary report, slide deck, full written report, and explanation of methods used to produce GHG projections and emissions reduction estimates, including all assumptions, input data, and emission and conversion factors</li></ul> <p>Task 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Will use CEJST and EJ Screen to identify LIDACs, and identify non-geographic LIDACs by setting thresholds for each criterion and identifying what percentage of each census tract falls under the priority population definition</li><li>• Will estimate bill impacts of transitioning from fossil fuels to electricity</li></ul> <p>Task 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• calculate the cost of the energy economy and non-energy emissions reductions measures for each scenario.</li><li>• Calculate net costs and benefits including health job creation, increased climate resilience, and other environmental benefits</li></ul>
--	--

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Evolved Energy Research

**DATE:** February 7, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Use EPA COBRA tool to estimate public health benefits</li><li>• Use IMPLAN to estimate economic benefits</li></ul> <p>Task 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• continue to leverage the tools used in the 2020 report, including benefit-cost analysis, cost-effectiveness analysis, and economic impact analysis, in addition to IMPLAN</li></ul> <p>Task 5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Interfacing with the working group schedule and process, providing technical assistance and guidance as needed</li></ul>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	N/A
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes, included
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Yes
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	N/A

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Evolved Energy Research

**DATE:** 2/5/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Ethan Tremblay

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Energy Office

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

*I. Organization Qualifications and Experience*

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
<i>Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services</i>	<i>Founded 2016, toolkit and expertise to model decarbonization strategies State and federal agencies, consultancies, tech and manufacturing, utilities, NGOs NJ, WA, MA, ME state-level agency studies EnergyPATHWAYS bottom-up demand-side, RIO supply and operations and non-energy emissions – all sources and sinks</i>
<i>Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services</i>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Energy Policy Office, WA Department of Commerce – 2023 state hydrogen strategy, 2021 state energy strategy</li> <li>2. Maine GEO – Pathway to 2040 State Energy Plan</li> <li>3. MA Executive Office EEA – MA decarbonization roadmap 2020-2022</li> </ol>
<i>Any other listed projects</i>	
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
<i>Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included</i>	<i>None</i>
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
<i>Specifies project being proposed</i>	<i>Yes</i>
<i>Each position identifies title</i>	<i>Yes</i>
<b>Litigation</b>	
<i>Any listed litigation</i>	<i>Statement provided</i>
<i>Additional details</i>	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
<i>ACORD form or similar</i>	<i>Provided</i>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Evolved Energy Research

**DATE:** 2/5/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Ethan Tremblay

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Energy Office

*II. Proposed Services*

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
<i>Describes scope of services to be provided</i>	<p><i>Task 1</i></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><i>1. Combining WG-identified and existing database of GHG measures</i></li> <li><i>2. EnergyPATHWAYS and RIO combination to assess near- and long-term GHG impact</i></li> <li><i>3. Propose baseline/BAU and up to 6 scenarios meeting GHG reductions</i></li> </ol> <p><i>Task 2</i></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><i>1. Combined CEJST and EJScreen geographical identification per EPA; thresholds based on ESC criteria by census tract</i></li> <li><i>2. CCAP – estimate comprehensive LIDAC impacts from selected measures – iterative bill impacts</i></li> </ol> <p><i>Task 3</i></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><i>1. Household and economywide costs; public health impacts (COBRA integration); job creation and economic impact (IMPLAN); resilience; environmental benefits and disbenefits</i></li> </ol> <p><i>Task 4</i></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><i>1. As specified; propose risk/uncertainty incorporation as needed</i></li> </ol> <p><i>Task 5 – as specified</i></p>
<i>Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks</i>	<i>Yes, as above</i>
<i>(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform</i>	<i>N/A</i>
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
<i>Work plan included in timeline form</i>	<i>Yes, gantt by week/task/subtask/lead</i>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Evolved Energy Research

**DATE:** 2/5/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Ethan Tremblay

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Energy Office

<i>Describes each task, month, and person responsible</i>	Yes
<i>(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors</i>	N/A



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** ERG

**DATE:** 2/2/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Sarah Curran

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** GOPIF

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**I. Organization Qualifications and Experience**

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Environmental, engineering, economic, and laboratory services to federal, state, and local government agencies</li><li>• 2020 MWW analysis</li></ul>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Assessing Impacts Climate Change May Have on Maine's Economy, Revenues, and Investment Decisions</li><li>• United States Climate Alliance modeling and scenario analysis to support the U.S. Climate Alliance's 2021 and 2023 Annual Reports.</li><li>• Cape Cod Commission's climate action planning process by assessing the economic impacts of climate change, and the costs and benefits of strategies to address climate impacts</li></ul>
Any other listed projects	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• ResilientMass Plan: 2023 MA State Hazard Mitigation and Climate Adaptation Plan</li><li>• New York State Climate Impacts Assessment</li><li>• Alameda CARP</li><li>• What Will Adaptation Cost? An Economic Framework for Coastal Community Infrastructure</li><li>• Sea Grant Economics</li><li>• Flood Pilots + Flood Mapping</li><li>• Great Bay Ecosystem Service Valuation</li><li>• CPRG Support (E3)</li></ul>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** ERG

**DATE:** 2/2/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Sarah Curran

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** GOPIF

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Greenhouse Gas Emissions Scenarios through 2050 (E3)</li> <li>NYSERDA Integration Analysis Technical Supplement to Draft Scoping Plan (E3)</li> <li>Maine Renewable Energy Goals Market Assessment (E3)</li> <li>Maine Energy Storage Market Assessment (E3)</li> </ul>
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Energy and Environmental Economics, Inc. (E3) - robust technical analyses of deep decarbonization pathways</li> <li>Dr. Charlie Colgan - economic analyses related to ocean and other natural resources</li> </ul>
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes
Each position identifies title	Yes
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	None
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Yes

**II. Proposed Services**

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	Yes
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<p>Task 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Measure-specific level as required for the CPRG program's quantified GHG reduction measure deliverables, at the sectoral level, and for the state of Maine as a whole.</li> </ul>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** ERG

**DATE:** 2/2/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Sarah Curran

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** GOPIF

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• GHG Reduction Assessment Tool (transparent Excel workbook) to quantify the benefits of a selection of GHG reduction measures as proposed by the working groups - bottom-up tool</li><li>• E3's PATHWAYS model: Business-as-usual" or "reference" scenario and "GHG mitigation" scenario</li></ul> <p>Task 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Including identification of geographically defined LIDAC populations using EPA guidance and identification of priority populations using equity subcommittee guidance</li></ul> <p>Task 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• COBRA tool</li><li>• Phase 1: Technical support to help prioritize and select strategies.</li><li>• Phase 2: Technical support to estimate changes in benefits, costs, and emissions (including co-pollutants) from mitigation strategies.</li><li>• Co-pollutant emissions reductions + Per the Justice40 Initiative, other key benefits for consideration include investments in clean energy and energy efficiency; clean transit; affordable and sustainable housing; training and workforce development; the remediation and reduction of legacy pollution; and the development of clean water infrastructure</li></ul> <p>Task 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• IMPLAN</li></ul>
--	---

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** ERG

**DATE:** 2/2/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Sarah Curran

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** GOPIF

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Phase 1: Technical support to help prioritize and select adaptation and resilience strategies</li><li>• Phase 2: Technical support to estimate changes in benefits, costs, and job creation from adaptation and resilience strategies</li></ul> <p>Task 5</p>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	Yes
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Yes
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	Yes

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Eastern Research Group, Inc. (ERG)

**DATE:** 2/5/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<p>New England-based ERG has provided environmental, engineering, economic, and laboratory services to federal, state, and local government agencies since 1984.</p> <p>ERG will be pulling together a cross-disciplinary team from their Economic and Policy Analysis group, Climate and Resilience Solutions group, Environmental and Climate Justice Solutions group, and Strategic Communications group.</p> <p>ERG has assembled a team with Energy and Environmental Economics, Inc. (E3) to collaborate on Tasks 1, 2, 3 and 5 as well as Dr. Charlie Colgan who will provide Maine-specific economic advisory support.</p> <p>ERG did similar work for GOPIF in 2020 and will use the same project manager</p>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<p>Project 1: State of Maine, GOPIF – “Assessing the Impacts Climate Change May Have on the State’s Economy, Revenues, and Investment Decisions.”</p> <p>ERG produced four reports and an executive summary in a project to support Maine’s December 2020 Climate Action Plan</p>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Eastern Research Group, Inc. (ERG)

**DATE:** 2/5/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

	<p>Project 2: U.S. Climate Alliance – Modeling and Scenario Analysis for U.S. Climate Alliance’s 2021 and 2023 Annual reports (E3 project). E3 evaluated alliance wide GHG emissions through 2050 using E3’s pathways model.</p> <p>Project 3: Barnstable County via Cape Cod Commission – Economic Impacts of Climate Change ERG’s study supported Cape Cod Commission’s climate action planning process by assessing the economic impacts of climate change, and the costs and benefits of strategies to address climate impacts.</p>
Any other listed projects	<p>Mass. MEMA, Massachusetts Statewide Hazard Mitigation and Climate Action Plan (SHMCAP)(ERG), NYSERDA, New York State Climate Impacts Assessment, City of Alameda, CA, Alameda CARP (ERG), NOAA, What Will Adaptation Cost? An Economic Framework for Coastal Community Infrastructure (ERG), NOAA, Sea Grant Economics (ERG), NOAA, Flood Pilots + Flood Mapping (ERG), NOAA, Great Bay Ecosystem Service Valuation (ERG), Confidential State Agencies, CPRG support to Three States (E3), NYSERDA, Integration Analysis Technical Supplement to Draft Scoping Plan (E3), Maine Governor’s Energy Office, Maine Renewable Energy Goals Market Assessment (E3), Maine Governor’s Energy Office, Energy Storage Market Assessment (E3)</p>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Eastern Research Group, Inc. (ERG)

**DATE:** 2/5/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• E3 - Name and contact info provided</li><li>• Energy and Environmental Economics, Inc. (E3) is a 120-person energy consulting firm founded in 1989</li><li>• Dr. Charles Colgan – name and contact info provided.</li><li>• Charlie Colgan, PhD is the Director of Research for the Center for the Blue Economy (CBE) and Editor-inChief of the Journal of Ocean and Coastal Economics. Dr. Colgan has collaborated with ERG, specifically working with proposed project manager, Charles Goodhue, on eight projects over the last 10 years for a range of clients, including the State of Maine</li></ul>
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes – task specific
Each position identifies title	Yes – relevant qualifications for each team member were given along with full resumes.
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	No litigation in last 5 years
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Yes – Acord form provided

**II. Proposed Services**

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	yes

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Eastern Research Group, Inc. (ERG)

**DATE:** 2/5/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<p>Task 1:</p> <p>ERG will develop a flexible and dynamic bottom-up GHG Reduction Assessment Tool (transparent Excel workbook) that will be used to quantify the benefits of a selection of GHG reduction measures as proposed by the working groups.</p> <p>ERG team will develop emissions projections for the State of Maine based on a top-down scenario analysis that will evaluate both near-term (2030-2035) and long-term (2050) GHG emissions. ERG will model GHG emissions scenarios using in-house PATHWAYS model</p> <p>Task 2: E3 will leverage the Climate and Economic Justice Screening Tool (CEJST) and the EJScreen tool to identify LIDAC regions within Maine (previous experience). E3 will also identify priority populations based on the work of the MCC Equity Subcommittee.</p> <p>Co-pollutant emissions reductions will be evaluated based on the county-level for each CCAP measure using EPA's COBRA (2D dispersion model)</p> <p>- ERG team anticipates qualitative analysis of the benefits of GHG reduction measures on LIDAC areas will be high level but will meet the level of rigor required for grant funding for March 1, 2024 deadline.</p>
--	---



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Eastern Research Group, Inc. (ERG)

**DATE:** 2/5/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

	<p>Task 3: ERG will use COBRA screening model to estimate the spread of pollutants from their source.</p> <p>-will also use bottom-up GHG Reduction Assessment tool. E3 will assess the impact of GHG reduction measures on copollutants at the individual measure level. “based on inhouse metrics associated with air quality impacts that will be refined for this study through a literature review.”</p> <p>ERG will use an input-output model called IMPLAN to assess the indirect and induced impact of the strategies.</p> <p>Task 4: Outlined tools and approaches: HAZUS modelling for riverine and coastal flooding, intersecting flood layers with business data, benefit-transfer of ecosystem services, transfer benefits (or costs) from literature for other hazard, job impacts, and cost data</p> <p>Task 5: ERG will focus support on providing technical support to help prioritize and select mitigation measures (indicators, sharing of existing studies, expert knowledge from team, and discussions with WGs).</p> <p>I - Lessons learned from 2020 section related to interfacing with WGs and setting expectations were helpful</p>
--	--

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Eastern Research Group, Inc. (ERG)

**DATE:** 2/5/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	Yes, identifies which subtasks will be handled by subcontractors
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Yes - (written summary, responsibility matrix, and time line with subtasks)
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	Very clear outline and description of specific people responsible for each task including subcontractors

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Eastern Research Group, Inc.

**DATE:** February 6, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• has provided environmental, engineering, economic, and laboratory services to federal, state, and local government agencies since 1984</li><li>• Let emissions modeling for Maine Climate Council 4 years ago</li><li>• Charles Goodhue, proposed project manager, is same project manager as for 2020</li><li>• ERG has completed well over 100 economic analyses for NOAA, FEMA, USACE and state and local governments related to climate change, adaptation and resilience, and GHG emissions and emission reduction measures</li><li>• E3 is working with NH, NESCAUM, and 3 other states to develop deliverables for EPA Climate Pollution Reduction Grant (CPRG) program</li></ul>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. GOPIF - Assessing Impacts Climate Change May Have on Maine's Economy, Revenues, and Investment Decisions: produced four volumes of reports in a project to support Maine's December 2020 Climate Action Plan</li><li>2. US Climate Alliance modeling and scenario analysis to support the US Climate Alliance's 2021 and 2023 Annual Reports</li></ol>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Eastern Research Group, Inc.

**DATE:** February 6, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

	<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>3. Barnstable County Economic Impacts of Climate Change - supported Cape Cod Commission's climate action planning process by assessing the economic impacts of climate change, and the costs and benefits of strategies to address climate impacts</li></ol>
Any other listed projects	<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. ResilientMass Plan: 2023 MA State Hazard Mitigation and Climate Adaptation Plan</li><li>2. New York State Climate Impacts Assessment (NYSERDA)</li><li>3. Alameda CARP (City of Alameda, CA)</li><li>4. What Will Adaptation Cost? An Economic Framework for Coastal Community Infrastructure (NOAA Office for Coastal Management)</li><li>5. Sea Grant Economics (NOAA National Sea Grant Office)</li><li>6. Flood Pilots + Flood Mapping (NOAA Office for Coastal Management)</li><li>7. Great Bay Ecosystem Service Valuation (NOAA Office for Coastal Management)</li><li>8. CPRG Support (E3) (Three confidential state agencies)</li><li>9. Greenhouse Gas Emissions Scenarios through 2050 (E3) (US Climate Alliance)</li><li>10. Integration Analysis Technical Supplement to Draft Scoping Plan (NYSERDA)</li></ol>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Eastern Research Group, Inc.

**DATE:** February 6, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

	11. Maine Renewable Energy Goals Market Assessment (Maine Governor's Energy Office) 12. Energy Storage Market Assessment (Maine Governor's Energy Office)
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Yes, included for all</li> <li>• Energy+Environmental Economics (E3): Energy consulting firm that helps regulators, policy makers, utilities, developers, and investors make the best strategic decisions possible as they understand and implement new clean energy and climate policies.</li> <li>• Dr. Charles Colgan: consultant/advisor, has collaborated with ERG on eight projects over the last 10 years for a range of clients, including the State of Maine (Assessing the Impacts Climate Change May have on the State's Economy, Revenues, and Investment Decisions, 2020), the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA), and the Bureau of Economic Analysis (BEA)</li> </ul>
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes
Each position identifies title	Yes
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	Statement about litigation included
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Eastern Research Group, Inc.

**DATE:** February 6, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

ACORD form or similar	Included
-----------------------	----------

**II. Proposed Services**

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Yes, included for all</li><li>• Shows clear understanding of timeline needed to meet deliverables for EPA CPRG program</li></ul>
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<p>Task 1:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• The GHG modelling will be conducted for three key levels of resolution: measure-specific level as required for the CPRG program's quantified GHG reduction measure deliverables, at the sectoral level, and for the state of Maine as a whole</li><li>• Deliverables include explanation of methods used to produce GHG projections and emissions reduction estimates, including all assumptions, input data, emission and conversion factors, and equations. This methodology section will be added to the report as appendices</li><li>• For quantified greenhouse gas (GHG) reduction measures: Develop a flexible and dynamic bottom-up GHG Reduction Assessment Tool (transparent Excel workbook) that will be used to quantify the benefits of a selection of GHG reduction measures as proposed by the working groups</li></ul>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Eastern Research Group, Inc.

**DATE:** February 6, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• For GHG projections: develop emissions projections for the State of Maine based on a top-down scenario analysis that will evaluate both near-term (2030-2035) and long-term (2050) GHG emissions</li><li>• Use internal PATHWAYS model to analyze emissions projections for two scenarios, a “business as usual” and a “GHG mitigation” scenario, taking into account 2020 Maine Won’t Wait assumptions as well as new analysis conducted since 2020</li><li>• Will interface with Maine Climate Council (MCC) to design scenarios</li></ul> <p>Task 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• E3 will leverage the Climate and Economic Justice Screening Tool (CEJST) and the EJScreen tool to identify LIDAC regions within Maine</li><li>• In addition to identifying LIDAC regions based on EPA guidance, E3 will identify priority populations based on the work of the MCC Equity Subcommittee</li><li>• E3 and ERG will take stock of statewide benefits for proposed GHG reduction measures and will qualitatively assess their impact on LIDAC areas</li><li>• Co-pollutant emissions reductions (e.g., PM2.5, NOx, SO2, VOCs, air toxics, etc.) will be evaluated based on the county-level co-pollutant reductions calculated for each CCAP measure using</li></ul>
--	---

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Eastern Research Group, Inc.

**DATE:** February 6, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

	<p>COBRA (see Task 3 for additional detail).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• In addition to estimating the amount of benefits received by identified communities, as described in Subtask 2c2, the ERG team will estimate the proportion of benefits that will be accrued to identified communities compared to the total statewide benefits</li></ul> <p>Task 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Will help WGs prioritize strategies based on matrices that show low, medium, and high impacts across indicators such as financial return-on-investment, other non-market benefits such as health impacts, cost-effectiveness (cost per emissions reduction), equity in terms of who benefits, impacts to jobs within Maine, and feasibility</li><li>• To conduct the analysis, the team will leverage EPA's Co-Benefits Risk Assessment (COBRA) screening model</li><li>• As part of the financial benefit-cost analysis, the ERG team will assess the uptake of strategies by subgroups of the population to assess the distribution of the net benefits (or net costs) in these financial benefit-cost analyses.</li><li>• The ERG team will estimate the benefit of reducing GHGs by calculating the social cost of carbon</li><li>• The ERG team will assess impacts on jobs for each mitigation</li></ul>
--	---



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Eastern Research Group, Inc.

**DATE:** February 6, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

	<p>strategy, will use an input-output model called IMPLAN to assess the indirect and induced impact of the strategies</p> <p>Task 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Includes technical support to help prioritize and select adaptation and resilience strategies and technical support to estimate changes in benefits, costs, and job creation from adaptation and resilience strategies</li> <li>Use Hazus modeling for riverine and coastal flooding</li> </ul> <p>Task 5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Meet with GOPIF to guide the direction of the work; interface with the WG process to help prioritize strategies, develop emissions and economic-related outputs, present results</li> </ul>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	Yes, included
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes, included
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Yes
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	Yes

# STATE OF MAINE INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Eastern Research Group, Inc. (ERG)

**DATE:** 2/1/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Ethan Tremblay

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Energy Office

## Individual Evaluator Comments:

### *I. Organization Qualifications and Experience*

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
<i>Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services</i>	<i>New England-based ERG has provided environmental, engineering, economic, and laboratory services to federal, state, and local government agencies since 1984 15 offices nationwide, more than 500 staff ERG previous lead contractor for GOPIF on climate plan analysis; E3 previous contractor for GEO on Renewable Energy Goals Market Assessment and Energy Storage Market Assessment</i>
<i>Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services</i>	<i>1. GOPIF – four reports for Assessing the Impacts Climate Change May Have on the State's Economy, Revenues, and Investment Decisions 2. USCA – 2021 and 2023 annual reports, assessing progress toward GHG reductions across alliance member jurisdictions (E3 project) 3. Barnstable County via Cape Cod Commission – climate action planning support including economic impact assessment, cost/benefit analysis of strategies</i>
<i>Any other listed projects</i>	<i>Fourteen projects provided in table form</i>
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
<i>Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included</i>	<i>Energy and Environmental Economics, Inc. (E3) Dr. Charlie Colgan</i>
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
<i>Specifies project being proposed</i>	<i>Yes, and includes narrative and tables with expertise and experience</i>
<i>Each position identifies title</i>	<i>Yes</i>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Eastern Research Group, Inc. (ERG)

**DATE:** 2/1/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Ethan Tremblay

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Energy Office

<b><i>Litigation</i></b>	
<i>Any listed litigation</i>	<i>Statement provided</i>
<i>Additional details</i>	
<b><i>Certificate of Insurance</i></b>	
<i>ACORD form or similar</i>	<i>Provided</i>

**II. Proposed Services**

<b><i>Services to be Provided</i></b>	
<i>Describes scope of services to be provided</i>	<p><i>Task 1</i></p> <p>1. <i>Extensive list of potential measures to examine; flexible bottom-up model to be developed</i></p> <p><i>Task 2</i></p> <p>1. <i>LIDAC identification through geographic tools and ES guidance</i></p> <p><i>Task 3</i></p> <p>1. <i>Top-down and bottom-up estimates of benefits and costs</i></p> <p><i>Task 4</i></p> <p>1. <i>NOAA data for coastal resilience, overlays with other sources</i></p> <p><i>Task 5</i></p> <p>1. <i>Responsive to specifications</i></p> <p><i>Clear understanding of CPRG requirements</i></p>
<i>Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks</i>	<p><i>Excel-based GHG Reduction Assessment tool – GHG measures</i></p> <p><i>PATHWAYS model top-down sector GHG modeling</i></p> <p><i>WG source for inputs/data</i></p> <p><i>COBRA tool for benefits/cobenefits</i></p> <p><i>IMPLAN for economic benefits</i></p> <p><i>Thorough explanation of methods and approach throughout</i></p>
<i>(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform</i>	<i>Discussed in narrative</i>
<b><i>Implementation – Work Plan</i></b>	
<i>Work plan included in timeline form</i>	<i>Yes, gantt by month/task+subtask</i>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Eastern Research Group, Inc. (ERG)

**DATE:** 2/1/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Ethan Tremblay

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Energy Office

<i>Describes each task, month, and person responsible</i>	<i>Yes, with RACI included</i>
<i>(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors</i>	<i>Yes in narrative</i>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** HATCH

**DATE:** 2/12/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Sarah Curran

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** GOPIF

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**I. Organization Qualifications and Experience**

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Professional services in the infrastructure, energy, and metals sectors</li><li>• While the firm's origins are in technical and engineering services, Hatch has evolved into in a full-service strategic advisory firm focusing on our clients' needs for upfront strategy and planning, market intelligence, and decision-making frameworks</li><li>• Climate change, urban solutions, sustainable transportation</li></ul>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• MaineDOT: Hatch was contracted to develop fleet electrification plans for eight Maine transit agencies</li><li>• Vale Base Metals: decarbonization strategic planning</li><li>• Rincon Consultants: Supporting Municipal Climate Action Plans</li></ul>
Any other listed projects	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Climate Lens assessment for the Calgary Green Line transit project in Alberta</li><li>• Mitigation strategies associated with water and wastewater infrastructure systems</li><li>• Multinational gold miner annual GHG emissions reporting</li><li>• Environmental Justice (EJ) landscape of the Cape Cod Regional Transportation Authority's service area</li></ul>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** HATCH

**DATE:** 2/12/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Sarah Curran

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** GOPIF

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Green Jobs Analysis for City of Santa Cruz Climate Action Plan</li> <li>• Vale Base Metals GHG Inventory and Decarbonization Initiative Quantification</li> <li>• Canadian potash producer Carbon and Energy Model</li> <li>• DBSA climate-aligned energy investment framework</li> <li>• MBTA battery-electric bus implementation</li> <li>• Toronto Transit Commission electric bus program</li> <li>• New York Power Authority Streamlined Solar Permitting</li> <li>• New York Power Authority Wind Power Interconnection Analysis</li> <li>• Great Lakes Offshore Wind</li> <li>• Technical Support Services for Solar New York Power Authority MAP</li> <li>• Nickel mine Wind Energy Storage</li> <li>• Vale Base Metals product carbon footprints</li> <li>• Review of GHG Accounting and Carbon Pricing Mechanisms of SK and Canada</li> <li>• Cradle-to-gate life cycle assessment (LCA) of a steel facility's operations</li> </ul>
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	None
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes
Each position identifies title	Yes
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	Not provided

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** HATCH

**DATE:** 2/12/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Sarah Curran

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** GOPIF

Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Included

**II. Proposed Services**

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<p>Task 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>proprietary GHG modeling tools + existing models provided by GOPIF</li> </ul> <p>Task 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Limited detail</li> </ul> <p>Task 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Limited detail</li> </ul> <p>Task 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Limited detail</li> </ul> <p>Task 5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Representatives of the project team will attend all Council, Science and Technical Subcommittee, and working groups meetings, either virtually or in-person, throughout the process.</li> </ul>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Yes
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Hatch Associates Consultants, Inc.

**DATE:** February 7, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Professional services firm with experience in the infrastructure, energy, and metals sectors</li><li>Has teams dedicated to Climate Change, Urban Solutions, and Sustainable Transportation</li></ul>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>Maine Department of Transportation: Fleet electrification plans for 8 transit agencies</li><li>Vale Base Metals: Developed approach to reducing GHG emissions</li><li>Rincon Consultants: Supporting municipal climate action plans in California</li></ol>
Any other listed projects	17 additional projects listed
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	N/A
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes
Each position identifies title	Identifies role in project but does not identify position at firm for all employees
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	Statement about litigation not included
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Included

II. Proposed Services

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	Included for all tasks



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Hatch Associates Consultants, Inc.

**DATE:** February 7, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<p>Task 1:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Will use proprietary modeling tools where appropriate but will seek to leverage the existing models provided by GOPIF</li><li>• Deliverables include full report, slide deck, and executive summary, as well as explanation of methods</li></ul> <p>Task 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Limited detail on how LIDAC benefits analysis will be conducted</li></ul> <p>Task 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Pollutant reduction estimates will be based on a review of the proposed measures, the project team's experience with implementing these measures, as well as the various tools developed by EPA, including the AVERT model, the MOVES model, and other tools detailed on the CPRG website</li><li>• Estimate of additional co-benefits will draw heavily on results of 2020 economic benefits analysis</li></ul> <p>Task 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Relies heavily on 2020 economic benefits analysis, limited detail on how new analysis will be performed</li></ul> <p>Task 5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Representatives of the project team will attend all Council, Science and Technical Subcommittee, and working group meetings</li></ul>
--	--

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Hatch Associates Consultants, Inc.

**DATE:** February 7, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	N/A
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes, included
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Yes
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	N/A

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Hatch Associates Consultants, Inc.

**DATE:** 2/5/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Ethan Tremblay

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Energy Office

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

*I. Organization Qualifications and Experience*

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
<i>Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services</i>	<i>Employee-owned multidisciplinary professional services firm – infrastructure, energy, and metals sectors More than 150 countries, 10,000 staff (800 in U.S.). Climate Change, Urban Solutions, and Sustainable Transportation practices</i>
<i>Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services</i>	<i>1. Maine DOT – transit fleet electrification plans 2. Vale Base Metals – GHG reduction goals customized strategic plan 3. Rincon Consultants – supporting municipal climate action and adaptation plans in CA</i>
<i>Any other listed projects</i>	<i>Others provided</i>
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
<i>Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included</i>	<i>None</i>
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
<i>Specifies project being proposed</i>	<i>Yes</i>
<i>Each position identifies title</i>	<i>Not in chart, bios provided separately</i>
<b>Litigation</b>	
<i>Any listed litigation</i>	<i>No list or statement provided</i>
<i>Additional details</i>	<i>No</i>
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
<i>ACORD form or similar</i>	<i>Provided</i>

*II. Proposed Services*

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
<i>Describes scope of services to be provided</i>	<i>Statement of project understanding Task 0 – project management Task 1</i>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Hatch Associates Consultants, Inc.

**DATE:** 2/5/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Ethan Tremblay

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Energy Office

	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <i>Emphasis on decarbonization assessment and planning for industrial/extraction sites</i></li> <li>2. <i>Limited detail regarding methods/tools for mitigation measure assessment</i></li> </ol> <p><b>Task 2</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <i>PCAP- use CEJST</i></li> <li>2. <i>CCAP – CEJST supplemented with ETC, EJScreen; bespoke census-tract research. Emphasis on geographic identification</i></li> </ol> <p><b>Task 3</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <i>Criteria pollutants per EPA methodology</i></li> <li>2. <i>Statewide and for LIDAC/priority communities</i></li> <li>3. <i>Literature review and prior state analyses</i></li> </ol> <p><b>Task 4</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <i>Utilize 2020 MCC work products; limited detail on identification/quantification of new categories</i></li> </ol> <p><b>Task 5</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <i>As specified; mentions periodic review of prior work products to ensure appropriateness</i></li> </ol>
<i>Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks</i>	See above
<i>(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform</i>	N/A
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
<i>Work plan included in timeline form</i>	Yes, gantt by week/task/subtask/lead
<i>Describes each task, month, and person responsible</i>	Yes
<i>(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors</i>	N/A

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Hatch Associates Consultants, Inc.

**DATE:** 2/5/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Ethan Tremblay

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Energy Office

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Hatch Associates Consultants

**DATE:** 2/6/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	Hatch Associates is a multi-disciplinary professional services firm. The firm's origins are in technical and engineering services but have evolved into in a full-service strategic advisory firm. They have Climate Action Plan experience in a list of California cities.
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<p>Project 1: Maine DOT – Clean Transportation Roadmap (2021)</p> <p>Outlined strategies to achieve carbon neutrality by 2045. Hatch contracted to develop fleet electrification plans for 8 Maine transit agencies. Hatch assessed infrastructure and operations, conducted a market analysis of the electric bus market, and created forecasts and projections</p> <p>Project 2: Vale Base Materials – GHG reduction Goals (2020-2022)</p> <p>deliverables included a map of emissions data across in-scope assets, a selection of priority sites to deliver maximum impact and a validated list of short- and longer-term abatement opportunities. Included analysis of the client's site-level operational data to identify emission reduction opportunities, including detailed process modeling and sensitivity analysis for high impact sites as well as development of a carbon and energy reduction model to quantify cost and abatement potentials.</p> <p>Project 3: Rincon Consultants – Supporting Municipal Climate Action Plans</p> <p>Hatch supported California in their CAAPs by developing business cases for various CA municipal and county governments, evaluating the potential financial returns and community benefits of CAAP policy actions. Work included economic impact analysis, fiscal impact analysis, funding</p>

# STATE OF MAINE INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Hatch Associates Consultants

**DATE:** 2/6/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

	and financing strategy, order of magnitude costing, and implementation strategy.  Q- Rincon Consultants listed as client and not State of CA or CA municipalities. Unclear if Hatch was a subcontractor on the project and if the listed work was completed solely by Hatch. Information provided was vague.
Any other listed projects	Short descriptions of related work in many different subject areas were provided. Some of the projects included Lifecycle GHG Emissions and Climate Risk and Resilience Measure – Calgary Green Line (Alberta, CA), Investigation of Greenhouse Gas Mitigation Opportunities in Water and Wastewater Infrastructure Systems – Infrastructure Canada, Environmental Justice Community Assessment – Cape Cod Regional Transport Authority, Low Carbon Energy Investment Framework – DBSA, Public Transit Electrification – Massachusetts Bay Transportation Authority
<b>Subcontractors</b>	none
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	n/a
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes – broken down by tasks
Each position identifies title	Yes – provided resumes for all identified project staff
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	Not addressed
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Acord certificate provided

## II. Proposed Services

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	yes

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Hatch Associates Consultants

**DATE:** 2/6/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<p>Task 0: project management</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>-quality management iso certification</li><li>-1 hour kick off-meeting and bi-weekly check in meetings</li></ul> <p>Task 1:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>-Hatch will review existing data, evaluate new and updated measures, and use proprietary data for estimating costs of proposed measures.</li><li>-Hatch will use proprietary GHG modeling tools to generate near and long-term ghg projections</li><li>-states that all input data and assumptions will be provided</li></ul> <p>Task 2: will use CEJST, DOT's Equitable Transportation Community Explorer (ETC), and EPA's EJST to identify LIDAC</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>- The preliminary LIDAC benefits analysis for inclusion in the PCAP will draw heavily upon the 2020 Economic Analysis. The LIDAC benefits analysis for the eCCAP/MWW update will draw upon the analysis being undertaken in Tasks 3 and 4, as well as the wide-scale public engagement effort currently being undertaken by GOPIF</li></ul> <p>Task 3:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>- co-pollutant reduction estimates will be based on a review of the proposed measures, the project team's experience with implementing these measures, as well as the various tools developed by EPA, including the AVERT model, the MOVES model, and other tools detailed on the CPRG website.</li><li>- The analysis will be undertaken for the entire State of Maine as well as for the LIDACs and priority communities.</li></ul> <p>Hatch will identify the GHG reduction measures developed as part of Task 1 that will specifically affect LIDACs</p> <p>Task 4: based on 2020 economic benefits analysis.</p> <p>Limited information provided</p>
--	---



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Hatch Associates Consultants

**DATE:** 2/6/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

	Task 5: will meet meeting/communication requirements with working groups and GOPIF
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	n/a
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	yes
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Yes, but does not include person responsible
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	n/a

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** KERAMIDA

**DATE:** 2/12/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Sarah Curran

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** GOPIF

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**I. Organization Qualifications and Experience**

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Municipal climate action plans</li><li>• Corporate ESG services</li></ul>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Grand Valley Metropolitan Council</li><li>• Swedish Climate Policy Council</li><li>• City of Cincinnati</li></ul>
Any other listed projects	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Regional Association Ruhr (RVR)</li><li>• Prairie Village Kansas</li><li>• Kent Ohio</li><li>• City of Dundee</li></ul>
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• ClimateView AB - ClimateOS emissions modeling and climate analysis</li></ul>
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes
Each position identifies title	Yes
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	Provided
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Included

**II. Proposed Services**

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	Yes
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• "Outcome Logic," a proven step-by-step process linking emission reductions to required behavioral changes</li></ul>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** KERAMIDA

**DATE:** 2/12/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Sarah Curran

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** GOPIF

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Propriety digital platform, ClimateOS, captures the methodology and blends advanced agent-based modeling with powerful data visualization.</li> </ul> <p>Task 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>ClimateOS,</li> </ul> <p>Task 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>CJEST and ClimateOS,</li> </ul> <p>Task 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>ClimateOS</li> </ul> <p>Task 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>ClimateOS</li> </ul> <p>Task 5</p>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	No
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Specific assignments within each Task will be allocated to individual staff once the project begins
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	No

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Keramida

**DATE:** 2/9/2024 & 2/12/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**I. Organization Qualifications and Experience**

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<p>KERAMIDA is an environmental, health &amp; safety, and sustainability consulting firm with over 30 years of experience. Keramida Recently completed municipal Climate Action Plans (CAP) for Prairie Village, KS and Kent, OH. Keramida is working with the Grand Valley Metro Council to develop the Grand Rapids MSA PCAP, CCAP, and Status Report. Keramida was recently by the National Academy of Sciences, the National Academy of Engineering, and the National Academy of Medicine to perform their GHG studies.</p> <p>Partnering with ClimateView for this proposal</p>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<p>Project 1: KERAMIDA and ClimateView are working together to develop the Preliminary Climate Action Plan, Implementation Grant, Comprehensive Climate Action Plan, and Status Report for the Grand Rapids MSA. - Grand Valley Metropolitan Council</p> <p>Project 2: Swedish Climate Policy Council The "Panorama" dashboard - a collaborative initiative of the Swedish Climate Policy Council, the Swedish Energy Agency, and EPA. Panorama provides a comprehensive overview of Sweden's transition to sustainability and is built on the ClimateOS platform</p> <p>Project 3: City of Cincinnati – Climate action plan and dashboard Climateview was used to create a CAP and climate plan dashboard for Cincinnati.</p> <p>Project 4: Regional Association Ruhr (RVR), Germany – ClimateView Platform</p> <p>The region is using the ClimateOS platform to facilitate data-driven decision-making and redefine</p>

# STATE OF MAINE INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Keramida

**DATE:** 2/9/2024 & 2/12/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

	civic administration in order to become the 'greenest industrial region in the world' by 2045
Any other listed projects	<p>5. Prairie Village Kansas - developed a comprehensive sustainability program that provides a cost-effective and science-based pathway to reach net-zero carbon emissions by 2050.</p> <p>6. Kent, Ohio – developed CAP</p> <p>7. City of Dundee, UK - Dundee is using ClimateOS in order to continuously and systematically develop the city's climate plan since 2020.</p>
<b>Subcontractors</b>	ClimateView AB - a climate tech company who provides ClimateOS, a web application for the creation, implementation, monitoring, communication, and financing of climate action plans. ClimateOS combines data management, agent-based modeling, and interactive visualizations in a single platform.
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	yes
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes – but not specific to project tasks, descriptions of staff vaguely identify which person will cover what area of the project
Each position identifies title	yes
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	Commonwealth of Kentucky, Estill Circuit Court, Civil Action
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Yes, Acord form provided

## II. Proposed Services

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	yes

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Keramida

**DATE:** 2/9/2024 & 2/12/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<p>Task 1: GHG emissions reductions - for each update or new measure proposed by the working groups, the team will select the corresponding “lever” in ClimateViewOS (levers correspond with outcome logic model)</p> <p>ClimateOS calculates the GHG emission reduction per lever at the technical level based on the activity-based inventory data. The software can model and compare the emission reduction of thousands of measures in real-time.</p> <p>The full report will include a chapter explaining the methods used to produce GHG projections and emissions reduction estimates, including all assumptions. Input data, emission and conversion factors, as well as equations (or if reasonable general equations, as with the Target balancing feature we are processing hundreds of functions) will be delivered in separate annexes, as well as in ClimateOS</p> <p>Task 2: Will use the ClimateOS Platform, the Climate and Economic Justice Screening Tool (CEJST), and guidance from the MCC Equity Subcommittee (ESC) to deliver a PCAP LIDAC Benefits Analysis and a CCAP LIDAC Benefits Analysis</p> <p>Task 3: Will be use the ClimateOS platform. The analysis is dynamic and can be repeated infinitely depending on new political decisions and/or changes in the underlying economic parameters due to external factors.</p> <p>ClimateOS’ modeling techniques adhere to IPCC guidelines and can provide precise estimates of co-pollutant reductions accompanying GHG reduction measures. The model encompasses various pollutants, including PM2.5, NOx, SO2, VOCs, and air toxics</p> <p>Task 4: Will use ClimateOS and will complete a holistic assessment of the costs and benefits of each resilience measure. Will provide insight into public health outcomes, economic benefits, job</p>
--	---

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Keramida

**DATE:** 2/9/2024 & 2/12/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

	creation, and GHG mitigation potential. Will include technological feasibility assessment.  Task 5: will include: 1. On-demand and scheduled advisory services for all groups involved with MWW as directed by GOPIF 2. Meeting summaries from all meetings, workshops, and presentations 3. Their videography group will develop and deliver videos documenting the process of updating MWW, to be used by the State of Maine and the USEPA as promotional and educational aids
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	Yes, but vague
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes, but vague
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	no
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	no

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** KERAMIDA Inc.

**DATE:** February 7, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>KERAMIDA has completed several municipal climate action plans and is a global leader in corporate ESG services.</li></ul>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>Grand Valley Metropolitan Council: Preliminary Climate Action Plan, Implementation Grant, Comprehensive Climate Action Plan, and Status Report for the Climate Pollution Reduction Grants</li><li>Swedish Climate Policy Council: Panorama dashboard to track Sweden's transition to sustainability</li><li>City of Cincinnati: Modeling of socioeconomic impacts of climate mitigation and adaptation strategies</li></ol>
Any other listed projects	Four additional projects listed
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Yes, included</li><li>ClimateView AB: Creator of ClimateOS, a web application for the creation, implementation, monitoring, communication, and financing of climate action plans</li></ul>
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes
Each position identifies title	Yes
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	One litigation listed
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** KERAMIDA Inc.

**DATE:** February 7, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

ACORD form or similar	Included
-----------------------	----------

**II. Proposed Services**

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	Included for all tasks
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<p>Task 1:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Will use ClimateOS tool to model impacts of greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions reduction measures</li><li>Deliverables include two intermediary presentations, a final report with executive summary and slide deck, and a chapter explaining methodology (equations may be generalized, as ClimateOS processes hundreds of functions)</li></ul> <p>Task 2:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Use CEJST to identify LIDACs, or other tools as requested</li><li>Using the ClimateOS Platform, the Delivery Team will identify which census tracts mitigation measures will impact</li></ul> <p>Task 3:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Will use ClimateOS to assess benefits and costs of mitigation measures, including co-pollutant reductions</li></ul> <p>Task 4:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Use ClimateOS to estimate costs and benefits of adaptation and resilience measures</li><li>Will collaborate with experts in relevant fields to leverage their insights into emerging technologies and industry best</li></ul>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** KERAMIDA Inc.

**DATE:** February 7, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

	practices and explore pilot projects to validate the technological feasibility of crucial components before full-scale implementation  Task 5: <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Videography group will develop and deliver videos documenting the process of updating MWW</li></ul>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	No, but identified in Qualifications and Experience section
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes, but limited detail
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Limited detail and states that specific assignments within each Task will be allocated to individual staff once the project begins
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	No, but this is described in Qualifications and Experience section

# STATE OF MAINE INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** KERAMIDA, Inc.

**DATE:** 2/12/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Ethan Tremblay

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Energy Office

## **Individual Evaluator Comments:**

### *I. Organization Qualifications and Experience*

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
<i>Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services</i>	<i>KERAMIDA is a certified WEBNC that has been performing relevant projects for over 30 years Digital climate planning expertise</i>
<i>Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services</i>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><i>1. Grand Valley Metropolitan Council – PCAP and CCAP development</i></li> <li><i>2. Swedish Climate Policy Council – Panorama dashboard, comprehensive overview of Sweden's transition to sustainability</i></li> <li><i>3. City of Cincinnati – ClimateView platform ClimateOS dashboard</i></li> </ol>
<i>Any other listed projects</i>	<i>Four more provided</i>
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
<i>Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included</i>	<i>ClimateView – all required information provided</i>
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
<i>Specifies project being proposed</i>	<i>Unclear. One chart for KERAMIDA, one for ClimateView, one for delivery team</i>
<i>Each position identifies title</i>	<i>Yes</i>
<b>Litigation</b>	
<i>Any listed litigation</i>	<i>Provided</i>
<i>Additional details</i>	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
<i>ACORD form or similar</i>	<i>Provided</i>

### *II. Proposed Services*

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
<i>Describes scope of services to be provided</i>	<i>Task 1 – Propose to utilize ClimateOS platform for emissions modeling Will request necessary data from GOPIF Transition Atlas library of measures</i>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** KERAMIDA, Inc.

**DATE:** 2/12/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Ethan Tremblay

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Energy Office

	<i>Task 2 – PCAP utilizing tools as directed by GOPIF</i> <i>CCAP utilizing results from Task 3</i> <i>Task 3 – ClimateOS platform</i> <i>Task 4 – holistic assessment of costs and benefits of each resilience measure</i> <i>Task 5 – utilize ClimateOS to provide technical assistance to WGs</i>
<i>Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks</i>	<i>See above</i>
<i>(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform</i>	<i>ClimateView role is primarily provision of CLimateOS platform</i>
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
<i>Work plan included in timeline form</i>	<i>Yes</i>
<i>Describes each task, month, and person responsible</i>	<i>Task and month</i>
<i>(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors</i>	<i>No</i>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Lotus

**DATE:** 2/13/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Sarah Curran

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** GOPIF

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**I. Organization Qualifications and Experience**

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Sustainability consulting firm</li><li>• Greenhouse gas accounting, modeling, and visualizations</li><li>• Climate action and resiliency planning</li><li>• Communications and engagement</li><li>• Commitment to equity</li></ul>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Denver Regional Council of Governments (DRCOG) PCAP and CCAP</li><li>• YMCA of the Rockies Sustainability Action Plan</li><li>• Georgia Institute of Technology sustainability action plan</li></ul>
Any other listed projects	
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Resilient Analytics: climate vulnerability studies</li><li>• NYSERDA cost of climate change</li><li>• Center for Climate Integrity (CCI): climate changes impacts and costs</li></ul>
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Org chart but not project specific, does not include subcontractor
Each position identifies title	Yes
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	None
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Lotus

**DATE:** 2/13/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Sarah Curran

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** GOPIF

ACORD form or similar	Included
-----------------------	----------

**II. Proposed Services**

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	Yes
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<p>Task 0: Project Management</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project work plan</li> </ul> <p>Task 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>by developing a user-friendly and interactive modeling tool</li> </ul> <p>Task 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>CEJEST and EJScreen</li> <li>Engagement strategy</li> <li>build metrics</li> </ul> <p>Task 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Marginal Abatement Cost Curve</li> <li>Costs and implementation options, savings and avoided costs</li> </ul> <p>Task 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Infrastructure Planning Support System IPSS tool, an analysis framework developed by RA + available local datasets including DEM models, appropriate LiDAR data and existing GIS data</li> </ul> <p>Task 5</p>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	Yes
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Lotus

**DATE:** 2/13/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Sarah Curran

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** GOPIF

Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Yes
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	Yes

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Lotus Engineering and Sustainability

**DATE:** 2/12/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**I. Organization Qualifications and Experience**

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	Lotus Engineering is a certified women-owned sustainability consulting firm based out of Denver, Colorado. Team of fifteen employees has supported clients with sustainability initiatives through the development of greenhouse gas inventories and modeling; climate action and resiliency planning; stakeholder engagement; policy and program development and administration; training and outreach; and energy efficiency and renewable energy strategy creation. 15 years of experience
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<p>Project 1: Denver Regional Council of Governments (DRCOG) - DRCOG was awarded a \$1 million CPRG MSA grant from the EPA and hired Lotus to fulfill the requirements of the grant including a PCAP and CCAP. To date, Lotus has led and facilitated multiple community and stakeholder engagements, as well as completed 11 separate county-level GHG inventories for the region</p> <p>Project 2: YMCA of the Rockies – Lotus developed a Sustainability Action Plan that addressed the sustainability objectives of the YMCA of the Rockies strategic plan. Lotus conducted a comprehensive greenhouse gas emissions inventory as part of this work</p> <p>Project 3: Georgia Institute of Technology - The Offices of Sustainability and Innovation at Georgia Tech contracted with Lotus to review, reorganize, and rewrite their existing sustainability action plan</p>
Any other listed projects	<p>Projects by subcontractor Resilient Analytics</p> <p>Project 1: State of NY - CLIMATE CHANGE COST STUDY: The New York State Energy Research and Development Authority (NYSERDA) hired RA to undertake an in-depth, cross-sectoral economic impact analysis to</p>



# STATE OF MAINE INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Lotus Engineering and Sustainability

**DATE:** 2/12/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

	determine the costs associated with climate change in New York State  Project 2: The Center for Climate Integrity (CCI), a project of the Institute for Governance and Sustainable Development (IGSD) - PENNSYLVANIA CLIMATE CHANGE COST STUDY: The Center for Climate Integrity (CCI), a project of the Institute for Governance and Sustainable Development (IGSD), hired RA to undertake a study of climate change impacts and associated costs to the state of Pennsylvania
<b>Subcontractors</b>	Resilient Analytics
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	Yes.  Lotus has partnered with Resilient Analytics, a firm that helps organizations and communities protect against the impacts of climate change. RA uses climate, engineering, and economic modelling to help clients understand how climate stressors will impact infrastructure and people. Over 15 years of experience.
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes – does not outline roles based on task, but some project specific information is provided in mini-bios below. Does not clarify specific roles of subcontractors
Each position identifies title	yes
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	No litigation
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Acord form provided

## II. Proposed Services

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	yes
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	Task 0: project management  Task 1: Lotus will update and build upon the existing 2020 climate action plan and subsequent BAU projections incorporating new analyses such

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Lotus Engineering and Sustainability

**DATE:** 2/12/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

	<p>as the DEP Ninth Biennial Report on Progress toward Greenhouse Gas Reduction Goals, the Governor's Energy Office (GEO) 2040 energy plan, the US Climate Alliance (USCA) 2023 Decarbonization Pathways report, the Clean Transportation Roadmap, the Medium and Heavy Duty Roadmap, and other sector-specific analyses.</p> <p>Lotus will quantify GHG emission and co-pollutant reductions for each measure included in the final list of climate pollution reduction measures identified. Lotus will develop a user-friendly and interactive modeling tool. Emission reduction models will be developed by sector (e.g., building energy, transportation, waste, industrial activity, etc.) and results will be displayed by sector and in aggregate for all identified measures.</p> <p>Will provide "zipped file with all research and data"</p> <p>Task 2: Lotus will use tools such as CEJEST and EJScreen to provide, when possible, either the Census tract IDs or the Census block group IDs. Lotus will also work with GOPIF to summarize LIDAC public engagement efforts for the coming year.</p> <p>Lotus will refine the work completed for the PCAP LIDAC Analysis and build metrics to quantify the expected benefits of the CCAP/MWW. They will develop a series of socio-economic, equity, resilience, and climate vulnerability metrics that can be tracked over time.</p> <p>Task 3: Lotus will quantify the anticipated cost to implement each measure evaluated through Task 1. Lotus will utilize existing data sets and models, and where unavailable will conduct research to identify the implementation costs for each identified measure.</p> <p>Lotus will provide a Marginal Abatement Cost Curve that depicts the emissions reduction potential compared to the cost of implementation</p>
--	--

# STATE OF MAINE INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Lotus Engineering and Sustainability

**DATE:** 2/12/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

	<p>Task 4: RA will manage deliverables for Task 4. Will utilize the 6th generation of climate model data from IPCC and will include both direct hazards and indirect impacts. The combination of these potential hazards will be analyzed at multiple time intervals (e.g., 2030 and 2050) and across multiple emissions scenarios</p> <p>Resilient Analytics will utilize the Infrastructure Planning Support System (IPSS), an analysis framework developed by RA</p> <p>RA will deliver both an internal deliverable for the stakeholders that includes detailed methodology and results as well as a public-facing document. The internal document will include maps and charts illustrating impacts and benefits at a community level throughout the State. The public-facing document will likely be a Storymap that is an interactive, on-line method for presenting data and allowing for public interaction with the results.</p> <p>Task 5: Interactions with the MCC and other entities will include technical assistance so that work is well-understood. In order to accomplish this, they will meet virtually with the groups(s) and attend at least two MCC meetings in person.</p>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	Yes - Subcontractor will handle task 4
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	yes
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Yes, does not include person responsible in timeline but below is a list of tasks and leads, including subcontractor responsible
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	yes

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Lotus Engineering and Sustainability, LLC

**DATE:** February 7, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Certified women-owned sustainability consulting firm based out of Denver, Colorado</li><li>• Key practice areas include greenhouse gas (GHG) accounting and visualizations, climate action and resiliency planning, and communications and engagement</li></ul>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. Denver Regional Council of Governments (DRCOG): Sole contractor for developing requirements of the CPRG grant</li><li>2. YMCA of the Rockies: Developed Sustainability Action Plan including GHG inventory, emissions modeling, and cost evaluation of GHG reduction strategies</li><li>3. Georgia Institute of Technology: review, reorganize, and rewrite their existing sustainability action plan</li></ol>
Any other listed projects	Two projects listed for subcontractor, Resilient Analytics, both state-level analyses of cost of climate impacts
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Yes, included</li><li>• Resilient Analytics: helps organizations and communities protect against the impacts of climate change</li></ul>
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes
Each position identifies title	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Yes</li></ul>

# STATE OF MAINE INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Lotus Engineering and Sustainability, LLC

**DATE:** February 7, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Team has clear experience with GHG inventories, adaptation cost assessments, and cost-benefit analyses and equity, but less detail on experience with modeling</li> </ul>
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	Statement about litigation included
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Yes, included

## II. Proposed Services

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	Yes, included for all tasks
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<p>Task 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Emission reduction models will be developed by sector (e.g., building energy, transportation, waste, industrial activity, etc.) and results will be displayed by sector and in aggregate for all identified measures</li> <li>Q: Has the model that they will be using been developed and has it been used in any other applications?</li> <li>Q: Does the team have the resources and the expertise to conduct economy-wide modeling?</li> <li>Deliverables will include models and all input data, GHG and co-pollutant modeling tool, and explanation of methods</li> </ul> <p>Task 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Proposal includes support for the equity subcommittee and priority</li> </ul>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Lotus Engineering and Sustainability, LLC

**DATE:** February 7, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

	<p>population engagement, which is outside the scope of this RFP</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Develop a series of socio-economic, equity, resilience, and climate vulnerability metrics that can be tracked over time</li><li>• Proposed tool will allow the MCC to update metrics over time and track progress toward reducing climate vulnerability and addressing equity concerns, assisting in the creation of the 4-year LIDAC Status Report</li></ul> <p>Task 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Will use marginal abatement cost curves to depict the cost per ton of CO2 for each measure</li><li>• Will also include cost of inaction to capture additional avoided costs that are not included in marginal abatement costs</li></ul> <p>Task 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Analysis will specifically address the existing physical and socio-economic conditions (and burdens) throughout the community</li><li>• Resilient Analytics will utilize the Infrastructure Planning Support System (IPSS)</li><li>• IPSS analyzes large inventories of assets over a large geographic area and over multiple scenarios from an engineering-based perspective to determine specific impacts to each asset type</li><li>• Q: What types of infrastructure does this tool assess? What level of granularity?</li></ul>
--	---

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Lotus Engineering and Sustainability, LLC

**DATE:** February 7, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

	Task 5 <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Proposal includes 8 meetings with the ESC but only one meeting with working groups</li></ul>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	Yes
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Yes
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	Yes

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Lotus Engineering and Sustainability, LLC

**DATE:** 2/12/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Ethan Tremblay

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Energy Office

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

*I. Organization Qualifications and Experience*

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
<i>Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services</i>	<i>Certified women-owned sustainability consulting firm based in Denver. Eleven years of GHG inventories and modeling; climate action and resilience planning; stakeholder engagement; etc. Fifteen employees.</i>
<i>Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services</i>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li><i>1. Denver Regional Council of Governments – CPRG MSA grant, PCAP and CCAP</i></li><li><i>2. YMCA of the Rockies – sustainability action plan development</i></li><li><i>3. Georgia Institute of Technology – review and rewrite sustainability action plan</i></li></ol>
<i>Any other listed projects</i>	
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
<i>Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included</i>	<i>Resilient Analytics All required information provided</i>
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
<i>Specifies project being proposed</i>	<i>Yes, unclear if incorporates subcontractors</i>
<i>Each position identifies title</i>	<i>Yes</i>
<b>Litigation</b>	
<i>Any listed litigation</i>	<i>Statement provided</i>
<i>Additional details</i>	<i>N/A</i>
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
<i>ACORD form or similar</i>	<i>Provided</i>

*II. Proposed Services*

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
<i>Describes scope of services to be provided</i>	<i>Task 1 – BAU and updated GHG reduction modeling using existing data</i>



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Lotus Engineering and Sustainability, LLC

**DATE:** 2/12/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Ethan Tremblay

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Energy Office

	<i>sources. Propose 7-10 measures initial and optional 7-10 more.  Task 2 – build on ESC analysis, utilize CEJST and EJScreen as directed  Task 3 – propose development of marginal abatement cost curve  Task 4 – Infrastructure Planning Support System platform/analysis framework from Resilient Analytics  Task 5 – meet periodically with WGs, at least two in person with MCC</i>
<i>Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks</i>	<i>See above</i>
<i>(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform</i>	<i>Yes</i>
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
<i>Work plan included in timeline form</i>	<i>Yes</i>
<i>Describes each task, month, and person responsible</i>	<i>Gantt by task and month, task leads assigned</i>
<i>(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors</i>	<i>Yes</i>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311233

RFP TITLE: EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

BIDDER NAME: nZero

DATE: 2/13/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Sarah Curran

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: GOPIF

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**I. Organization Qualifications and Experience**

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Carbon accounting and management platform/carbon management company</li><li>• Expertise in environmental data collection and carbon analytics</li></ul>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• City of Reno, NV</li><li>• Town of Truckee, CA</li><li>• Washoe County, NV</li></ul>
Any other listed projects	
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Crosswalk Labs, Inc</li><li>• Start-up company providing a detailed, peer-reviewed approach to emissions data validated by atmospheric science</li></ul>
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Not project specific and does not include subcontractor
Each position identifies title	Yes
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	None
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Included

**II. Proposed Services**

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	Yes

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311233

RFP TITLE: EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

BIDDER NAME: nZero

DATE: 2/13/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Sarah Curran

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: GOPIF

Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<p>Task 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• asset- and site-specific modeling</li><li>• can be aggregated into portfolio-level or sector-specific plans</li></ul> <p>Task 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• emissions data down to individual census blocks</li></ul> <p>Task 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• multi-dimensional benefits</li></ul> <p>Task 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• GHG mitigation strategies</li></ul> <p>Task 5</p>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	Yes
Implementation – Work Plan	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	No
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	No

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** nZero

**DATE:** 2/13/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<p>nZero is a carbon accounting and management platform that enables stakeholders across an organization to access, visualize, and leverage accurate energy, emissions, and associated financial data for better decision making.</p> <p>nZero will partner with Crosswalk Labs, a high-level geospatial GHG modeling software that will further increase the accuracy of GHG measurements</p>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<p>Project 1: City of Reno, NV – renewable energy and energy use intensity analysis, GHG accounting, and other services. nZero data were used to create a Sustainability Plan Update to City Council to track progress on the formal goals outlined in the City's 2019-2025 Sustainability and Climate Action Plan.</p> <p>Project 2: Town of Truckee, CA – project included operational emissions tracking, creating of a public emissions portal and dashboard, and normalization of emissions data based on usage, occupancy and weather patterns to identify emissions hotspots.</p> <p>Project 3: Washoe County, NV – work included energy use intensity analysis, ghg accounting, use of nZero's Recommendation and Planning product for ghg reduction strategies, community-scale ghg inventory, and a public emissions portal/dashboard.</p>
Any other listed projects	
<b>Subcontractors</b>	<p>Crosswalk Labs – startup company – Jason Burnett- founder/CEO</p> <p>Crosswalk offers a unique measurement, reporting, and verification tool using a proprietary</p>

# STATE OF MAINE INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** nZero

**DATE:** 2/13/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

	methodology called the Vulcan Project (Vulcan) to estimate fossil fuel carbon dioxide (FFCO <sub>2</sub> ) emissions. Vulcan creates a digital twin of all FFCO <sub>2</sub> emission sectors across the United States. It represents all buildings at the census block scale, all roads, all commercial and industrial activity, commercial marine vessels, aviation, etc. Crosswalk also can leverage the capabilities of Vulcan to generate estimates for other GHGs
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	Yes
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Org chart is not specific to proposed project. It is limited (6 positions identified) and it is unclear which tasks the subcontractor is responsible for
Each position identifies title	yes
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	none
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Acord form provided

## II. Proposed Services

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	Yes
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	Task 1: The team will use Crosswalk. Crosswalk FFCO <sub>2</sub> emissions estimates are census-block level and can be aggregated to any geographic footprint, including city, county, planning or congressional district, and more. Crosswalk also provides emissions estimates across the categories of human emission activity. The granularity of Crosswalk FFCO <sub>2</sub> data, combined with nZero modeling, will enable nZero to develop near-term (2030-2035) and long-term (2050) sector-based reduction targets across the State.

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** nZero

**DATE:** 2/13/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

	<p>Task 2: Crosswalk will provide a GeoPackage (.gpkg) or similar spatial datafile for GOPIF to layer, in coordination with the EJScreen or CEJST. This will allow for identification of low income and disadvantaged communities as well as quantification of their emissions.</p> <p>Task 3: will use nZero's emission reduction planning tools and software. Limited detail provided.</p> <p>Task 4: nZero will use its expertise and analytical tools to accurately estimate the costs associated with implementing GHG reduction measures across sectors. Limited detail provided</p> <p>Task 5: The team will interface with the Working Group schedule and process, providing technical assistance and guidance as needed to 1) inform Working Group members about benefit-cost frameworks and 2) help GOPIF staff ensure that Working Group deliverables achieve the goals and targets in Maine Won't Wait.</p>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	Doesn't outline specifically the work that the subcontractor will perform
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	yes
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Yes, but does not include person responsible for tasks
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	Does not include tasks delegated to subcontractor

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** nZero

**DATE:** February 8, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>nZero is a carbon accounting and management platform that enables stakeholders across an organization to access, visualize, and leverage accurate energy, emissions, and associated financial data for better decision making.</li><li>Has worked with local governments and state governments (looking at state-owned buildings and assets)</li></ul>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>City of Reno, NV: Tracking and reporting of GHG emissions and development of sustainability plan</li><li>Town of Truckee, CA: Emissions tracking and accounting, public engagement for the Town</li><li>Washoe County, NV: GHG emissions accounting and policy recommendation at County level</li></ol>
Any other listed projects	
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Crosswalk Labs: startup that offers a unique measurement, reporting, and verification tool using a proprietary methodology called the Vulcan Project (Vulcan) to estimate fossil fuel carbon dioxide (FFCO<sub>2</sub>) emissions</li></ul>
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Does not specify project being proposed
Each position identifies title	Yes

# STATE OF MAINE INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** nZero

**DATE:** February 8, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	Statement about litigation included
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Included

## II. Proposed Services

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	Yes, but limited detail provided for some tasks
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<p>Task 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Will use nZero Recommendation &amp; Planning tool- appears to be built for facility, census-block, city, county, planning or congressional district levels rather than statewide</li> <li>Deliverables will include a summary report with an executive summary for policymakers along with a distilled slide deck showing results of emissions projections and quantifiable GHG reductions associated with measures in the climate action plan- statement about providing data and methods is included (verbatim from RFP)</li> </ul> <p>Task 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Limited detail on how benefits to LIDACs will be assessed</li> </ul> <p>Task 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Limited detail on how costs and benefits of mitigation measures will be assessed</li> </ul> <p>Task 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>This task references mitigation measures, not resilience measures as requested</li> </ul>



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** nZero

**DATE:** February 8, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

	<b>Task 5</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>nZero's Delivery Manager will interface with the Council, Science and Technical Subcommittee, Working Groups, and GOPIF to incorporate the results of the above analyses into the Maine Won't Wait update, along with other relevant project team members</li></ul>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	Yes- data platform supplied by Crosswalk
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes, included
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Task and month included, but does not list person responsible
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	Not included

# STATE OF MAINE INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** nZero

**DATE:** 2/13/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Ethan Tremblay

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Energy Office

## Individual Evaluator Comments:

### *I. Organization Qualifications and Experience*

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
<i>Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services</i>	<i>A carbon accounting and management platform that enables stakeholders across an organization to access, visualize, and leverage accurate energy, emissions, and associated financial data for better decisionmaking</i>
<i>Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services</i>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><i>1. City of Reno, EUI/GHG accounting/ESG and other sustainability planning</i></li> <li><i>2. Town of Truckee, CA – emissions tracking, public portal, engagement</i></li> <li><i>3. Washoe County, NV – EUI, GHG accounting, community inventory, public portal</i></li> </ol>
<i>Any other listed projects</i>	<i>No</i>
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
<i>Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included</i>	<i>Crosswalk Labs, Inc. – all required information provided</i> <i>Crosswalk offers a unique measurement, reporting, and verification tool using a proprietary methodology called the Vulcan Project (Vulcan) to estimate fossil fuel carbon dioxide (FFCO<sub>2</sub>) emissions. Vulcan creates a digital twin of all FFCO<sub>2</sub> emission sectors across the United States. It represents all buildings at the census block scale, all roads, all commercial and industrial activity, commercial marine vessels, aviation, etc. Crosswalk also can leverage the capabilities of Vulcan to generate estimates for other GHGs.</i>
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
<i>Specifies project being proposed</i>	<i>No</i>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** nZero

**DATE:** 2/13/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Ethan Tremblay

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Energy Office

<i>Each position identifies title</i>	Yes
<b>Litigation</b>	
<i>Any listed litigation</i>	"None."
<i>Additional details</i>	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
<i>ACORD form or similar</i>	Provided

*II. Proposed Services*

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
<i>Describes scope of services to be provided</i>	
<i>Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks</i>	<p><i>Task 1</i> Propose proprietary inventory tool Crosswalk FFCO<sub>2</sub>, census-block level Sinks "if feasible"</p> <p><i>Task 2</i> Emphasis on census block level results Propose providing spatial data file for GOPIF to layer with CEJST/EJScreen</p> <p><i>Task 3</i> Minimally responsive; lists required elements but does not explain methodology or approach in detail</p> <p><i>Task 4</i> Minimally responsive; lists required elements but does not explain detail</p> <p><i>Task 5</i> Indicates project lead will be available for any required meetings</p>
<i>(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform</i>	Subcontractor providing some software capabilities
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
<i>Work plan included in timeline form</i>	Provided as gantt and in table
<i>Describes each task, month, and person responsible</i>	Task by month, no staff assignments included
<i>(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors</i>	No

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** nZero

**DATE:** 2/13/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Ethan Tremblay

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Energy Office

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** SSG

**DATE:** 2/13/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Sarah Curran

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** GOPIF

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**I. Organization Qualifications and Experience**

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Canada's premier climate planners</li><li>• Has completed nearly 100 projects on climate action for municipalities of all sizes</li></ul>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Miami Valley Regional Planning Commission, OH: PCAP, CCAP</li><li>• Oregon Department of Energy &amp; Center for the New Energy Economy at Colorado State University updated pathway to 2035: the Transformational Integrated Greenhouse Gas Emissions Reduction (TIGHGER) Plan for Oregon</li><li>• Halifax Regional Municipality; Community Climate Action and Adaptation Plan</li></ul>
Any other listed projects	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• currently working with the Southeast Michigan Council of Governments (Detroit); State of Nevada; Miami Valley Regional Planning Commission, OH; Fresno Council of Governments, CA; Mid-America Regional Council (Kansas City); and Rapid City, SD to develop Priority Climate Action Plans (PCAP) and Comprehensive Climate Action Plans (CCAP)</li></ul>
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	None
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** SSG

**DATE:** 2/13/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Sarah Curran

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** GOPIF

Each position identifies title	Yes
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	None current or last 5 years
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Included

**II. Proposed Services**

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<p>Task 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Data, Methods, and Assumptions (DMA) Manual</li> <li>Business-As-Usual (BAU) and Low-Carbon Scenarios</li> </ul> <p>Task 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>CEJST and EJScreen)</li> <li>impact of the measures on the LIDAC communities will be assessed qualitatively</li> </ul> <p>Task 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>COBRA tool</li> </ul> <p>Task 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Will be assessed qualitatively</li> </ul> <p>Task 5</p> <p>Optional Add-Ons</p>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	N/A
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** SSG

**DATE:** 2/13/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Sarah Curran

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** GOPIF

Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Does not identify lead
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	N/A

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Sustainability Solutions Group

**DATE:** 2/13/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**I. Organization Qualifications and Experience**

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<p>SSG is a Canadian climate planning cooperative that was established in 2003.</p> <p>SSG has completed nearly 100 projects on climate action for municipalities of all sizes and in a diversity of political and geographical contexts.</p> <p>SSG's approach to climate action planning is aligned with EPA requirements for the Climate Pollution Reduction Grants (CPRG) program.</p>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<p>Project 1: Miami Valley Regional Planning Commission, OH – SSG was recently awarded a contract to develop a PCAP and CCAP for the Dayton-Kettering OH Metropolitan Statistical Area that will leverage and build upon the region's existing climate, energy, and sustainability plans.</p> <p>Project 2: Oregon Department of Energy &amp; Center for the New Energy Economy at Colorado State University - The Oregon Global Warming Commission (OGWC) was created to identify and recommend strategies to reduce GHG emissions for the state and legislature, and report on progress. The OGWC had previously developed a Roadmap to 2020, and SSG worked with them to develop an updated pathway to 2035: the Transformational Integrated Greenhouse Gas Emissions Reduction (TIGHGER) Plan for Oregon. TIGHGER will guide the Governor and Legislature on potential near- and medium-term strategies for achieving the state's GHG reduction goals while continuing to grow Oregon's economy and enhancing equity and quality of life for all Oregonians.</p> <p>Project 3: Halifax Regional Municipality - SSG worked with Halifax to complete a Community</p>



# STATE OF MAINE INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Sustainability Solutions Group

**DATE:** 2/13/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

	Climate Action and Adaptation Plan. A combined mitigation and adaptation plan, the plan addresses both corporate and community energy use, GHG emissions, risks, and vulnerabilities from 2019 to 2050
Any other listed projects	23 other related projects listed
<b>Subcontractors</b>	None for this project
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Org chart is limited and not project specific
Each position identifies title	yes
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	No litigation in the last 5 years
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Acord form provided

## II. Proposed Services

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	yes
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<p>Task 1: SSG will use a systems dynamics model to study complex urban energy systems. Developed in-house, SSG's model tracks how and where electricity and fuels are consumed in a city or region, the emissions produced, and the costs and savings of potential emission reduction actions. The model is transparent, integrated, multi-fuel, multi-sector, and was built specifically for analyzing spatially-disaggregated energy systems, GHG emissions reductions, and financial impacts.</p> <p>Task 2: SSG will use information from the Climate and Economic Justice Screening Tool (CEJST), the EPA Environmental Justice Screening and Mapping Tool (EJScreen), the CDC/ATSDR</p>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Sustainability Solutions Group

**DATE:** 2/13/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

	<p>Social Vulnerability Index (SVI), as well as other databases to support the identification of disadvantaged, marginalized communities and to inform the LIDAC Benefits Analysis</p> <p>Task 3: SSG will use EPA's Co-Benefits Risk Assessment Health Impacts Screening and Mapping Tool (COBRA) to calculate the financial value of the health benefits of the low-carbon scenario.</p> <p>Task 4: The benefits of strategies for adaptation will be identified in SSG's model</p> <p>Task 5: SSG will prepare an agenda for bi-weekly (every two weeks) project meetings with GOPIF staff and/or MCC representatives</p> <p>SSG will host a presentation of recommendations to the MCC and Working Groups as well as one training session on the cost-benefit framework used in their analysis. The training session will be held in-person, and the topic can be adjusted depending on the needs of the MCC and Working Groups</p> <p>SSG will host up to two meetings with the MCC and Working Groups to provide technical assistance and guidance in the Maine Won't Wait update process, as needed.</p>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	n/a
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	yes
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Yes, but does not identify person responsible
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Sustainability Solutions Group USA, Inc.

**DATE:** February 14, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• SSG has completed nearly 100 projects on climate action for municipalities of all sizes and in a diversity of political and geographical contexts</li><li>• Currently working with six municipalities and councils of governments to develop Priority Climate Action Plans (PCAP) and Comprehensive Climate Action Plans (CCAP) for Climate Pollution Reduction Grants (CPRG)</li></ul>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. Miami Valley Regional Planning Commission, OH: Recently awarded a contract to develop PCAP and CCAP for Dayton-Kettering OH Metropolitan Statistical Area</li><li>2. Oregon Department of Energy &amp; Center for the New Energy Economy at Colorado State University: Worked with Oregon Global Warming Commission to develop an updated pathway to 2035: the Transformational Integrated Greenhouse Gas Emissions Reduction (TIGHGER) Plan for Oregon</li><li>3. Halifax Regional Municipality: Worked with Halifax to develop a combined mitigation and adaptation plan that addresses both corporate and community energy use, GHG emissions, risks,</li></ol>

# STATE OF MAINE INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Sustainability Solutions Group USA, Inc.

**DATE:** February 14, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

	and vulnerabilities from 2019 to 2050
Any other listed projects	23 additional projects listed, including some state-level climate planning and scenario analysis (NV, OR, WA)
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	N/A
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes, roles are clearly defined in pages following organizational chart
Each position identifies title	Yes
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	Statement about litigation included; none listed
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Included

## II. Proposed Services

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Demonstrates clear understanding of CPRG deliverables and timeline</li> </ul>
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>SSG's integrated systems dynamics energy and emissions model simulates multiple dimensions of the state energy systems over time, incorporating projected population growth, the impact of planned and new policies, and feedback between sectors in space, with resolution for each county in the State.</li> <li>we designed our model to capture feedback among policies in different sectors</li> </ul>
Task 1	

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Sustainability Solutions Group USA, Inc.

**DATE:** February 14, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• All modeling data, data sources and assumptions are transparent; we outline them in a Data Methods, and Assumptions (DMA) manual that can be shared publicly.</li><li>• Will model a business as usual scenario and a low carbon scenario</li><li>• Deliverables include a presentation and a summary report showing the results of emissions projections and quantifiable GHG reductions associated with the measures.</li></ul> <p>Task 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Will use CEJST and EJScreen to identify relevant communities</li><li>• Limited detail on how quantitative impacts to LIDACs will be assessed; however, examples are shown</li></ul> <p>Task 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Will use EPA COBRA tool to estimate financial impacts of health benefits of the low carbon scenario</li><li>• Other benefits such as increased resilience, decreased energy costs, environmental benefits, and improved access to amenities and economic development opportunities will also be assessed; limited detail on how benefits will be calculated</li><li>• The model incorporates a comprehensive financial analysis of costs related to energy (i.e., energy costs for households, business, and the counties) and</li></ul>
--	--

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Sustainability Solutions Group USA, Inc.

**DATE:** February 14, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

	<p>emissions (i.e., social cost of carbon), as well as operating and capital costs for policies, strategies, and actions</p> <p>Task 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Proposed scope focuses on “synergistic benefits” of mitigation strategies, “quantitative modeling of the financial costs and benefits of resilience actions” is offered for an additional fee</li> </ul> <p>Task 5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Once our technical modeling and analysis for the CCAP is complete, SSG will work with the MCC and Working Groups to ensure this work is incorporated into their update of Maine Won't Wait.</li> <li>Support includes one presentation to MCC and working groups about cost-benefit framework and up to two meetings with the MCC and working groups to provide technical support and guidance</li> </ul>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	N/A
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes, included
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Describes task and month but not person responsible for each task
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	N/A

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Sustainability Solutions Group USA, Inc (SSG)

**DATE:** 2/13/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Ethan Tremblay

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Energy Office

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

*I. Organization Qualifications and Experience*

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
<i>Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services</i>	<i>Cooperative established in 2003 Canada's premier climate planners SSG has completed nearly 100 projects on climate action for municipalities of all sizes and in a diversity of political and geographical contexts. List several municipal/council of government clients currently supporting for CPRG, and one state (NV).</i>
<i>Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services</i>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><i>1. Miami Valley Regional Planning Commission (OH) – PCAP and CCAP development</i></li> <li><i>2. OR Dept. of Energy and Center for New Energy Economy at Colorado State University – OGWC 2035 study</i></li> <li><i>3. Halifax Regional Municipality – Community climate action and adaptation plan</i></li> </ol>
<i>Any other listed projects</i>	<i>Additional projects listed in table</i>
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
<i>Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included</i>	<i>None</i>
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
<i>Specifies project being proposed</i>	<i>No</i>
<i>Each position identifies title</i>	<i>Yes</i>
<b>Litigation</b>	
<i>Any listed litigation</i>	<i>Statement provided</i>
<i>Additional details</i>	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
<i>ACORD form or similar</i>	<i>Provided</i>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** Sustainability Solutions Group USA, Inc (SSG)

**DATE:** 2/13/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Ethan Tremblay

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Energy Office

*II. Proposed Services*

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
<i>Describes scope of services to be provided</i>	<i>Task 1 – submit detailed data request to GOPIF. Calibrate model, construct reference scenario and conduct emissions and financial analyses. Task 2 – CEJST/EJScreen for PCAP; limited detail on CCAP methodology. Task 3 – COBRA for financial value for low-carbon scenario. Task 4 – limited detail regarding methodology. Task 5 – Celebratory kickoff, biweekly check in schedule, up to two meetings with MCC and WGs. Engagement as an add-on.</i>
<i>Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks</i>	<i>Extensive introductory section with methods and management approach</i>
<i>(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform</i>	<i>N/A</i>
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
<i>Work plan included in timeline form</i>	<i>Yes</i>
<i>Describes each task, month, and person responsible</i>	<i>Yes, except staff</i>
<i>(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors</i>	



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** VEIC

**DATE:** 2/14/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Sarah Curran

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** GOPIF

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**I. Organization Qualifications and Experience**

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Full-service consulting business</li><li>• Expertise in energy efficiency, building decarbonization, transportation electrification, and demand management, and program administration</li><li>• Work in Maine</li><li>• Experience conducting the analyses and leading inclusive stakeholder engagement processes that produce equitable, actionable decarbonization plans</li></ul>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Tennessee Valley Authority Pathways Study (VEIC)</li><li>• Energy Action Network: Equity-Informed Program Design (VEIC)</li><li>• Maine Governor's Office for Policy, Innovation, and the Future: Equity Subcommittee (Beech Hill Research)</li></ul>
Any other listed projects	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Maine Governor's Office for Policy, Innovation, and the Future: J40 (Beech Hill Research)</li><li>• Maine Department of Transportation (Climate Advisory)</li><li>• NYSERDA (Illume/Beech Hill Research)</li><li>• Massachusetts Executive Office of Energy and Environmental Affairs (IEc)</li></ul>
<b>Subcontractors</b>	

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** VEIC

**DATE:** 2/14/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Sarah Curran

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** GOPIF

Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Industrial Economics Industrial Economics (IEc) has national experience modeling and converting emissions and climate action impacts into co-benefits such as air quality, public health, jobs, and workforce benefits.</li> <li>Two Maine-based, women-owned businesses: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Climate Advisory: climate vulnerability and risk assessments</li> <li>Beech Hill Research: Equity Subcommittee Final Report and J40 support</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes
Each position identifies title	Yes
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	no past, present, or anticipated lawsuits, claims or disputes that would affect VEIC's ability to render the services outlined in its proposal.
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Included

**II. Proposed Services**

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<p>Task 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Using the LEAP (Low Emissions Analysis Platform) software</li> </ul> <p>Task 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>CJEST</li> </ul>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** VEIC

**DATE:** 2/14/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Sarah Curran

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** GOPIF

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• LIDAC and priority populations</li><li>• quantitative and qualitative assessments</li></ul> <p>Task 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Direct costs, GHG reduction benefits, co-benefits</li></ul> <p>Task 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Technical feasibility and costs and benefits of potential adaptation and resilience: quantitative and qualitative analyses</li></ul> <p>Task 5</p>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	Yes
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Yes
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	Yes

# STATE OF MAINE INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** VEIC

**DATE:** 2/14/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

## Individual Evaluator Comments:

### I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<p>VEIC has expertise in energy efficiency, building decarbonization, transportation electrification, and demand management. In addition, VEIC administers three large-scale sustainable energy programs</p> <p>VEIC is partnering with Industrial Economics and two Maine-based, women-owned businesses: Climate Advisory and Beech Hill Research.</p>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<p>Project 1: The Tennessee Valley Authority (TVA) - VEIC partnered with Guidehouse to assess economy-wide GHG emissions and reduction pathways in TVA's service area (in 7 states, serving approximately 10 million people)</p> <p>Project 2: Energy Action Network - Equity-Informed Program Design: VEIC has operated Efficiency Vermont, the nation's longest-running statewide energy efficiency utility, since its inception in 2000. In 2016, Efficiency Vermont led the state's first energy burden analysis to better understand how to reach low-income Vermonters by examining energy costs relative to income through census block group and zip code. They also analyzed barriers facing communities of color, renters, and non-native speakers of English.</p> <p>Project 3: Maine Governor's Office for Policy, Innovation, and the Future - Maine Won't Wait Equity Metrics. Beech Hill Research contracted with GOPIF in 2022 to help prioritize and establish equity metrics for Maine Won't Wait. This work came after the Equity Subcommittee (ESC) developed 57 - sector-specific and procedural recommendations.</p>
Any other listed projects	<p>4. ME GOPIF – Federal Justice40 Requirements (Beech Hill)</p> <p>5. ME DOT - MaineDOT Climate Change Vulnerability Assessment. (Climate Advisory)</p> <p>6. New York State Energy Research and Development Authority</p>

# STATE OF MAINE INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** VEIC

**DATE:** 2/14/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

	(NYSERDA - Statewide Disadvantaged Communities Investments and Co-Benefits Reporting (Climate Advisory) 7. Massachusetts Executive Office of Energy and Environmental Affairs – Mass. Climate Change Assessment (IEc)
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	Climate Advisory, LLC is a Maine-based, certified WBE firm with expertise in climate change and resilience. The company was founded in 2020 by Lisa Churchill.  Beech Hill Research provides energy and climate equity research and advisory services to state agencies, utilities, NGOs, and energy service firms. Sole Proprietor Amanda Dwelley works on local, state and federal scales to understand and measure barriers to people and communities accessing climate and energy funding.  Industrial Economics (IEc) is an environmental consulting firm in Cambridge, MA, founded in 1981 to provide expert support to government decision makers and regulators, non-governmental organizations, and private enterprises.
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes – broken out by tasks and includes subcontractors
Each position identifies title	yes
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	“VEIC is not currently party to any pending, threatened, or active litigation, claim, or complaint filed before any court or governmental agency. As with most organizations, from time to time VEIC is, and has been, party to disputes and/or litigation in the ordinary course of business. However, VEIC can confirm that there are no past, present, or anticipated lawsuits, claims or disputes that would affect VEIC's ability to render the services outlined in its proposal”
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Acord form provided

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** VEIC

**DATE:** 2/14/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

II. Proposed Services

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	yes
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<p>Task 1: To create economy-wide emissions projections, VEIC will build on the work done for the 2020 models using the LEAP (Low Emissions Analysis Platform) software from the Stockholm Environmental Institute's Boston office.</p> <p>VEIC recommends creating between 1-4 initial modeling scenarios and between 1-3 revised or final scenarios.</p> <p>Documentation of inputs, assumptions, and sources will be included with the report and the model.</p> <p>Task 2: The team will conduct a preliminary analysis of geographically-defined LIDAC and non-geographically-defined priority populations. To align with the CEJST tool, geographically-defined LIDAC communities will be identified at the census tract level and we will use CEJST indicators to characterize burdens and vulnerabilities for Maine census tracts</p> <p>Subject matter experts will identify appropriate models or calculators to convert the assumptions or outputs of Task 1 into GHG emissions reduction benefits and allocate expected benefits to the county or census tract level.</p> <p>Task 3: Will use EPA's COBRA. COBRA takes as an input the pollutant emissions results that will be developed in LEAP for each GHG reduction measure to be analyzed by IEc analysts, and outputs county level air quality estimates</p> <p>To estimate state-level direct employment impacts associated with changes (positive and negative) in the design, manufacture, and installation of large-scale wind, solar, transmission lines, gas-fired</p>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** VEIC

**DATE:** 2/14/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

	<p>generation, and coal-fired generation, VEIC will apply expenditure profiles and economic multipliers from the Jobs and Economic Development Impact (JEDI) suite of models developed by the National Renewable Energy Laboratory (NREL). The multipliers within JEDI are derived from IMPLAN.</p> <p>Task 4: The team's approach to analyzing the technical feasibility and costs and benefits of potential adaptation and resilience strategies will involve both quantitative and qualitative analyses.</p> <p>will evaluate the quantitative measures by modeling the impacts of the risk using methods from similar past work (IEC has completed similar work for the Massachusetts Climate Assessment and ResilientMass Plan.)</p> <p>Task 5: VEIC anticipates approximately five to eight meetings to support this work, using a combination of virtual and in-person meetings. These meetings will be dedicated to items that require discussion, extensive explanation, and input.</p>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	yes
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Yes – more details included about specific tasks and person responsible below in work plan discussion
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	yes

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** VEIC

**DATE:** February 14, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• VEIC has expertise in energy efficiency, building decarbonization, transportation, electrification, and demand management</li><li>• The VEIC Team has been doing jurisdictional energy and decarbonization planning for 10 years</li></ul>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. The Tennessee Valley Authority (TVA): created a baseline for the 171-county multistate region, a reference scenario, and several low emissions scenarios</li><li>2. Energy Action Network: Analyzed barriers facing communities of color, renters, and non-native speakers of English to accessing energy efficiency programs; implemented new approaches to program design and stakeholder engagement</li><li>3. Beech Hill Research - Maine Governor's Office for Policy, Innovation, and the Future: Prioritize and establish equity metrics for Maine Won't Wait</li></ol>
Any other listed projects	Four additional projects listed for subcontractors, including benefits analysis and statewide infrastructure vulnerability assessment (Maine)
<b>Subcontractors</b>	



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** VEIC

**DATE:** February 14, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Yes, included for all</li> <li>• Beech Hill Research: provides energy and climate equity research and advisory services to state agencies, utilities, NGOs, and energy service firms</li> <li>• Climate Advisory: Maine-based, certified WBE firm with deep expertise in climate change and resilience.</li> <li>• Industrial Economics: Consulting firm with expertise in climate impact and adaptation assessments, environmental policy and regulatory analysis, economic analysis, program evaluation, health and ecological risk assessment, habitat restoration, natural resource damage assessment, and information management</li> </ul>
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes
Each position identifies title	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Yes</li> <li>• Team includes expertise in transportation, biofuels &amp; waste, forestry, and agriculture &amp; working waterfront</li> <li>• Adam Sherman and Christine White have experience with state-level GHG modeling</li> </ul>
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	Statement about litigation included; states that "VEIC can confirm that there are no past, present, or anticipated lawsuits, claims or disputes that would affect

# STATE OF MAINE INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** VEIC

**DATE:** February 14, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

	VEIC's ability to render the services outlined in its proposal"
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Included

## II. Proposed Services

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	Included for all tasks
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>For each task, we will explain the methods used to produce the results and provide all assumptions, equations and formulas, spreadsheets, and GIS files</li> </ul> <p>Task 1:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>VEIC will review the 2020 model and inputs with the intention of reusing inputs and assumptions that are still valid</li> <li>Will use LEAP, a free and transparent software developed by the Stockholm Environmental Institute</li> <li>Will model a reference case, 1-3 initial scenarios, and 1-4 final scenarios</li> <li>Deliverables include a slide deck and a full report, with an executive summary for policy makers, explanation of methods (verbatim from RFP)</li> </ul> <p>Task 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Will create a "benefits taxonomy" for each proposed measure,</li> </ul>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** VEIC

**DATE:** February 14, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

	<p>identify potential benefits, beneficiaries, and indicators that describe beneficiaries</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Provide a rationale for considering data beyond the overall CEJST score to represent LIDACs in Maine</li> </ul> <p>Task 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Analysis includes Direct costs to implement each measure, Direct GHG reduction benefits of each measure, and Co-benefits of GHG reduction measures</li> <li>• Will use EPA COBRA tool to assess air quality co-benefits</li> </ul> <p>Task 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Proposes several possible approaches to quantitative modeling of resilience measures depending on the sector that is of most interest to MCC</li> </ul> <p>Task 5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Working with GOPIF and the MCC, VEIC will design an engagement process for stakeholders to review and provide input on the analysis in each Task as needed to support the priorities of the MCC, equity best practices, data inputs, and timeline feasibility</li> <li>• Anticipate 5-8 meetings to support this work</li> </ul>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	No, but identified in work plan
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Yes

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** VEIC

**DATE:** February 14, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	Yes
---	-----

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** VEIC

**DATE:** 2/13/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Ethan Tremblay

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Energy Office

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

*I. Organization Qualifications and Experience*

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
<i>Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services</i>	<i>VEIC brings to the team extensive experience in greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions projections and accounting. We have tracked project-related greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions for nearly a decade and reported GHG data to government clients in Vermont and the District of Columbia. VEIC has expertise in energy efficiency, building decarbonization, transportation electrification, and demand management. In addition to our full-service consulting business, VEIC administers three large-scale sustainable energy programs</i>
<i>Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services</i>	<i>1. Tennessee Valley Authority – economy-wide GHG emissions reduction pathways 2. Energy Action Network – equity-informed program design for Efficiency Vermont programming 3. Maine GOPIF – Beech Hill Research project, MWW equity metric establishment and prioritization</i>
<i>Any other listed projects</i>	<i>Four more examples including two more Maine projects</i>
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
<i>Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included</i>	<i>Beech Hill Research – all required information provided  Climate Advisory – all required information provided</i>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** VEIC

**DATE:** 2/13/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Ethan Tremblay

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Energy Office

	<i>Industrial Economics – all required information provided</i>
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
<i>Specifies project being proposed</i>	Yes
<i>Each position identifies title</i>	Yes by task lead
<b>Litigation</b>	
<i>Any listed litigation</i>	Statement provided
<i>Additional details</i>	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
<i>ACORD form or similar</i>	Provided

**II. Proposed Services**

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
<i>Describes scope of services to be provided</i>	<i>Task 1 – propose Low Emissions Analysis Platform (LEAP), open source software from Stockholm Environmental Institute</i> <i>Task 2 – robust CCAP methodology with taxonomy and rationale</i> <i>Task 3 – COBRA tool, leverage cost of doing nothing report</i> <i>Task 4 – quantitative and qualitative analysis approaches</i> <i>Task 5 – 5-8 meetings, supporting GOPIF</i>
<i>Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks</i>	See above
<i>(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform</i>	Yes
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
<i>Work plan included in timeline form</i>	Yes
<i>Describes each task, month, and person responsible</i>	Yes, in gantt and subsequent descriptions
<i>(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors</i>	Yes

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** VHB

**DATE:** 2/14/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Sarah Curran

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** GOPIF

\*\*\*\*\*

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

**I. Organization Qualifications and Experience**

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Infrastructure consultant including vulnerability assessments and adaptation plans</li><li>• Projects in over 250 Maine municipalities Strong relationship with MaineDOT</li></ul>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Massport Net Zero Greenhouse Gas Emissions Roadmap</li><li>• MassCEC Production Tracking System</li><li>• Maine Energy Infrastructure Redevelopment Program</li></ul>
Any other listed projects	
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• HR&amp;A: real estate, economic development, and public infrastructure</li></ul>
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes
Each position identifies title	Yes
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	Provided
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Included

**II. Proposed Services**

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	Yes

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** VHB

**DATE:** 2/14/24

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Sarah Curran

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** GOPIF

Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<p>Task 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• either leverage existing MWW models or build new models</li> <li>• Business as usual and planning scenario</li> <li>• leverage the EPA's State Inventory and Projection Tool</li> </ul> <p>Task 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• EJ screen, CJEST, ESC where and who</li> <li>• Worker benefits, household benefits, community resiliency benefits</li> <li>• IMPLAN</li> </ul> <p>Task 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Evaluate strategies against benefit criteria</li> </ul> <p>Task 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Technical feasibility, cost-effectiveness, and the equitable distribution of impacts</li> </ul> <p>Task 5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Optional Engagement Strategy</li> </ul>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	No
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Does not include lead
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	No



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** VHB

**DATE:** 2/14/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<p>VHB is a multidisciplinary engineering/consulting firm. They offer a wide range of sustainability consulting services, including municipal energy planning, project design support, and certification with respect to green rating systems and programs such as Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design (LEED®) and the Envision sustainable infrastructure rating system</p> <p>Partnering with HR&amp;A for this proposal</p>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<p>Project 1: Massachusetts Port Authority (Massport) - Massport Net Zero Greenhouse Gas Emissions Roadmap VHB developed the Authority-wide Net Zero Roadmap by 2031 for the Massport</p> <p>Project 2: MassCEC – Production Tracking System VHB was hired to evaluate, rewrite, and manage the hosting environment, as well as provide five years of maintenance and operational support for their Production Tracking System (PTS). The PTS is a database and a web application used by MassCEC to track the production of renewable energy systems that are installed throughout the Commonwealth.</p> <p>Project 3: Maine Governor's Energy Office and Department of Economic and Community Development - Maine Energy Infrastructure Redevelopment Program (subcontractor project)</p> <p>The State of Maine's Governor's Energy Office (GEO) and the Department of Economic and Community Development (DECD) is collaborating with HR&amp;A to launch and manage a \$1.25 million ARPA-funded statewide program that provides technical assistance to communities looking to</p>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** VHB

**DATE:** 2/14/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

	foster new economic activity by implementing development projects in areas with underutilized energy infrastructure.
Any other listed projects	
<b>Subcontractors</b>	HR&A has experience developing comprehensive climate and resilience and LIDAC economic analyses. HR&A's Climate & Urban Resilience practice works with city/state government agencies to confront mounting pressures of climate change while realizing commitments to equity and environmental justice. They design, launch, and administer decarbonization, climate adaptation, and green economic development plans and programs that can protect community assets, unlock workforce opportunities, and foster economic resiliency
Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	Contact info not included but description and qualifications are
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	yes
Each position identifies title	yes
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	2 pending, others listed
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Acord certification provided

**II. Proposed Services**

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	yes
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	Task 1: VHB relies on industry standard guidance documents and toolsets provided by various third-parties, such as ICLEI (i.e., ClearPath), the Climate Registry, i Tree, Climate Positive Design, and EPA. They will use EPA's state inventory and projection tool for ghg modeling

# STATE OF MAINE INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** VHB

**DATE:** 2/14/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Allison Montgomery

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Department of Environmental Protection

	<p>Task 2: HR&amp;A will identify LIDAC using CEJEST</p> <p>They will quantify the net new jobs and worker income attributable to the implementation of the priority list of GHG reduction measures and will use the industry standard IMPLAN for input/output (IO) modeling to calculate job outputs at the state level.</p> <p>Task 3: The team will assess the full benefits (and disbenefits) of the updated and newly identified mitigation measures for each of the State's focus areas, including future-forward transportation solutions, the modernization of buildings, reduction of emissions in the energy and industrial sectors, growth in a green economy, increased carbon sequestration through the protection of natural resources, resiliency measures, and engagement needs.</p> <p>Limited details about how</p> <p>Task 4: will leverage the methodologies and outputs in the 2020 Economic Benefit Analysis to assess existing resilience measures and to inform the economic benefits evaluation of newly identified measures, where feasible.</p> <p>Limited details</p> <p>Task 5: the VHB team will be available to provide technical on-call assistance throughout the duration of the project schedule</p>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	yes
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	yes
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Yes, people responsible not included in timeline but were discussed in other sections
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	Yes, not in timeline, but in other sections

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** VHB

**DATE:** February 14, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• VHB has worked with communities across Maine and New England to secure grants, lead stakeholder engagement workshops, prepare vulnerability assessments, and develop resiliency and adaptation plans</li><li>• Have completed transportation plans for MaineDOT and Northern New England Passenger Rail Authority</li></ul>
Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services	<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. Massachusetts Port Authority: developed Authority-wide Net Zero Roadmap by 2031</li><li>2. MassCEC: Evaluate, rewrite, and manage the hosting environment, as well as provide five years of maintenance and operational support for their Production Tracking System (PTS).</li><li>3. Maine Governor's Energy Office and Department of Economic and Community Development: launch and manage a \$1.25 million ARPA-funded statewide program that provides technical assistance to communities looking to foster new economic activity by implementing development projects in areas with underutilized energy infrastructure (HR&amp;A)</li></ol>
Any other listed projects	
<b>Subcontractors</b>	

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** VHB

**DATE:** February 14, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Address, phone number, and contact person not included</li> <li>HR&amp;A: Planning firm that helps clients create more equitable, resilient, and dynamic communities</li> </ul>
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
Specifies project being proposed	Yes
Each position identifies title	Yes but does not describe role in project for all team members
<b>Litigation</b>	
Any listed litigation	Lists 5 current cases and 8 that are settled or resolved
Additional details	
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
ACORD form or similar	Included

**II. Proposed Services**

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
Describes scope of services to be provided	
Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks	<p>Task 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>For newly identified mitigation measures, VHB will either leverage the existing MWW models (refined as needed) or build new models (as needed) to quantify their GHG emissions benefits</li> <li>Will develop a "business as usual" scenario and a "planning" scenario</li> <li>Will leverage the EPA's State Inventory and Projection Tool</li> <li>Deliverables include summary report, slide deck, and explanation of methods (verbatim from RFP)</li> </ul> <p>Task 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Will use CEJST to identify LIDACs</li> </ul>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** VHB

**DATE:** February 14, 2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Amalia Siegel

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Use IMPLAN to assess job impacts; generally describes approach to assessing other benefits such as impact of enhanced EV rebates on low income households</li> </ul> <p>Task 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Limited detail provided</li> </ul> <p>Task 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Will leverage the methodology used in the 2020 economic benefits analysis</li> </ul> <p>Task 5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The VHB team will be available to provide technical on-call assistance throughout the duration of the project schedule</li> </ul>
(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform	Yes
<b>Implementation – Work Plan</b>	
Work plan included in timeline form	Yes
Describes each task, month, and person responsible	Does not list person responsible for each task
(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors	Yes

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** VHB

**DATE:** 2/14/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Ethan Tremblay

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Energy Office

**Individual Evaluator Comments:**

*I. Organization Qualifications and Experience*

<b>Overview of Organization (Appendix C)</b>	
<i>Describes qualifications and skills to provide the requested services</i>	<i>VHB has worked with communities across Maine and New England to secure grants, lead stakeholder engagement workshops, prepare vulnerability assessments, and develop resiliency and adaptation plans. Offer a wide range of sustainability consulting services, including municipal energy planning, project design support, and certification with respect to green rating systems and programs (eg LEED)</i>
<i>Three examples of projects demonstrating experience and expertise performing these services</i>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li><i>1. Massachusetts Port Authority - VHB developed the Authority-wide Net Zero Roadmap by 2031 for the Massport. Our team consisted of specialists highly skilled in GHG emissions accounting, mechanical and electrical engineering, building energy efficiency, renewable energy, biofuels, economics, architecture, waste minimization, and water use reduction.</i></li><li><i>2. MassCEC - MassCEC selected VHB evaluate, rewrite, and manage the hosting environment, as well as provide five years of maintenance and operational support for their Production Tracking System (PTS). The PTS is a database and a web application used by MassCEC to track the production of renewable energy systems that are installed throughout the Commonwealth</i></li></ol>

**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** VHB

**DATE:** 2/14/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Ethan Tremblay

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Energy Office

	3. <i>HR&amp;A project - Maine GEO and DECD - The State of Maine's Governor's Energy Office (GEO) and the Department of Economic and Community Development (DECD) is collaborating with HR&amp;A to launch and manage a \$1.25 million ARPA-funded statewide program that provides technical assistance to communities looking to foster new economic activity by implementing development projects in areas with underutilized energy infrastructure</i>
<i>Any other listed projects</i>	<i>No</i>
<b>Subcontractors</b>	
<i>Name, address, phone number, contact person, and description of organization capacity and qualifications is included</i>	<i>HR&amp;A Advisors, Inc. – real estate, economic development, and public infrastructure Contact information not provided</i>
<b>Organizational Chart</b>	
<i>Specifies project being proposed</i>	<i>Yes</i>
<i>Each position identifies title</i>	<i>Functional roles and VHB/HR&amp;A Resumes provided</i>
<b>Litigation</b>	
<i>Any listed litigation</i>	<i>List provided</i>
<i>Additional details</i>	<i>Yes</i>
<b>Certificate of Insurance</b>	
<i>ACORD form or similar</i>	<i>Yes</i>

**II. Proposed Services**

<b>Services to be Provided</b>	
<i>Describes scope of services to be provided</i>	<i>Task 1 – propose to review modeling for MWW, leverage existing MWW models for new measures, or build new models as needed</i>



**STATE OF MAINE  
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

**RFP #:** 202311233

**RFP TITLE:** EMISSIONS PROJECTIONS AND BENEFITS ANALYSIS FOR THE MAINE CLIMATE COUNCIL

**BIDDER NAME:** VHB

**DATE:** 2/14/2024

**EVALUATOR NAME:** Ethan Tremblay

**EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT:** Governor's Energy Office

	<i>Leverage EPA State Inventory and Projection Tool</i> <i>Task 2 – comprehensive list of LIDAC census tracts. Quantify net new jobs and worker income, household energy benefits and health benefits, community resilience benefits</i> <i>Task 3 – air quality, other benefits</i> <i>Task 4 – current state assessment; financial costs of inaction</i> <i>Task 5 – consultant liaison for each working group</i>
<i>Describes methods and resources used to accomplish tasks</i>	Yes, as above
<i>(If applicable) identifies work each subcontractor will perform</i>	Yes
<b><i>Implementation – Work Plan</i></b>	
<i>Work plan included in timeline form</i>	Yes
<i>Describes each task, month, and person responsible</i>	Task by month only
<i>(If applicable) notes tasks delegated to subcontractors</i>	In text, not table



**STATE OF MAINE**  
**Governor's Office of Policy Innovation &**  
**the Future**

Janet T. Mills  
Governor

Hannah Pingree  
Director

**AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT**  
**RFP #: 202311233**  
**RFP TITLE: Emissions Projections and Benefits Analysis**  
**for the Maine Climate Council**

I, Sarah Curran \_\_\_\_\_  
accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Governor's Office of Policy Innovation & the Future. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

**I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.**

*Sarah Curran*

1/26/24

\_\_\_\_\_  
Signature

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date



**STATE OF MAINE**  
**Governor's Office of Policy Innovation &**  
**the Future**

Janet T. Mills  
Governor

Hannah Pingree  
Director

**AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT**  
**RFP #: 202311233**  
**RFP TITLE: Emissions Projections and Benefits Analysis**  
**for the Maine Climate Council**

I, Amalia Siegel  
accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Governor's Office of Policy Innovation & the Future. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

**I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.**

\_\_\_\_\_  
Signature

2/1/24\_\_\_\_\_  
Date



STATE OF MAINE  
Governor's Office of Policy Innovation &  
the Future

Janet T. Mills  
Governor

Hannah Pingree  
Director

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT  
RFP #: 202311233  
RFP TITLE: Emissions Projections and Benefits Analysis  
for the Maine Climate Council

I, (print name at right)

Allison Montgomery accept the offer  
to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of  
Maine Governor's Office of Policy Innovation & the Future. I do hereby accept the terms set  
forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in  
connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or  
indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not  
limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board  
membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal  
contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former  
relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of  
interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal  
submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar  
endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner  
without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there  
are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further  
understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide  
whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for  
Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department  
formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

Allison Montgomery  
Signature

1/30/24  
Date



**STATE OF MAINE**  
**Governor's Office of Policy Innovation &  
the Future**

**Janet T. Mills**  
Governor

**Hannah Pingree**  
Director

**AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT**  
**RFP #: 202311233**  
**RFP TITLE: Emissions Projections and Benefits Analysis**  
**for the Maine Climate Council**

I, Ethan Tremblay, accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Governor's Office of Policy Innovation & the Future. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

**I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.**

January 30, 2024

---

**Signature**

---

**Date**