

State of Maine
Master Score Sheet

RFP# 202311231					
Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat					
Bidder Name:		Hamlin's Marine	Lyman Morse	Zodiac of North America	Novielli Boat Builders
Proposed Cost:		\$200,394.00	\$351,506.20	\$360,000.00	\$344,758.00
Scoring Sections	Points Available				
Section I: Preliminary Information	Pass/Fail	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	15	10	15	15	5
Section III: Proposed Services	50	43	48	35	10
Section IV: Cost Proposal	35	35	19.95	19.48	20.34
TOTAL	<u>100</u>	<u>88</u>	<u>82.95</u>	<u>69.48</u>	<u>35.34</u>
Bidder Name:					
Proposed Cost:					
Scoring Sections	Points Available				
Section I: Preliminary Information					
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience					
Section III: Proposed Services					
Section IV: Cost Proposal					
TOTAL	<u>100</u>				

Award Justification Statement
RFP# 202311231 Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat

I. Summary

The Department of Marine Resources is seeking proposals to provide a new aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat to support dive operations and law enforcement missions in Maine coastal waters. The vessel should have a hull length of between 23-26 Feet and a 29' maximum length-over-all; be powered by a minimum of two 150 HP outboard motors; be constructed with a forward positioned full cabin enclosure; be fitted with an outboard motor platform and diver access; and provide a safe, effective, and comfortable platform for officers/divers.

II. Evaluation Process

An evaluation team will judge the merits of the proposals received in accordance with the criteria defined in the RFP. Evaluators conducted their individual review of the proposals, then met as a team to score the Qualifications & Experience and Proposed Services using the consensus method. Cost was scored using a mathematical formula.

All three evaluators each have 18+ years of experience working as law enforcement officers. Two evaluators have experience and training as tactical boat operators and are USCG licensed captains with experience aboard a variety of patrol vessel platforms, as well as experience operating, maintaining, and coordinating service of similarly sized and equipped patrol vessels. Two evaluators have experience and training in underwater recovery as law enforcement divers.

III. Qualifications & Experience

- Hamlin's Marine has been an established boat dealer of professionally manufactured boats for 39 years.
- Hamlin's Marine is a well-established boat dealer maintaining relationships with numerous well-known boat manufacturers and provides in-house service.
- Hamlin's Marine appears to be able to provide a recognized high quality brand boat, built to industry standards, incorporating similar construction materials and building practices.
- Hamlin's Marine has certified outboard engine technicians available for service.

IV. Proposed Services

- Hamlin's Marine provided a vessel proposal that the evaluation team feels is of a style that both fits DMR's needs and with the DMR's current fleet.
- The Hamlin's Marine proposal identified a vessel produced by a manufacturer that meets the required vessel warranty term.

- Hamlin’s Marine provided a vessel proposal that incorporated design characteristics specified in the RFP and required for this project.
- Hamlin’s Marine proposed a vessel that is already built and indicated it was immediately available.
- Hamlin’s Marine indicated their proposed vessel meet virtually all technical specifications.

V. Cost Proposal

The four bidders were ranked using the cost formula outlined in the RFP resulting in Hamlin’s Marine being awarded full points for cost, Novielli Boat Builders being awarded the second highest points, Lyman Morse being awarded the third highest points, and Zodiac of North America being awarded the lowest number of points for cost. The Hamlin’s Marine proposal was nearest to the anticipated project cost.

VI. Conclusion

The conditionally awarded bidder, Hamlin’s Marine, scored the highest due to the fact they met the requirements outlined in Qualifications and Experience, met or exceeded the majority of requirements outlined in Proposed Services, and provided the lowest cost proposal of all the submissions. Primary factors in the award included meeting the desired design configuration, quality build materials and techniques, delivery timeline, warranty, and price.

MacDonald, Colin

From: MacDonald, Colin
Sent: Friday, May 3, 2024 10:04 AM
To: Kyle Ross
Subject: Maine Marine Patrol Dive Vessel Award Notification
Attachments: Award_Notification_Letter_Hamlin.pdf

Good Morning,

I have attached the official letter, but wanted to let you know that the Department has chosen to conditionally award the bid to you, Hamlin's Marine, for the Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat RFP. I appreciate your time, effort, and consideration towards this project. I look forward to working with you.

Thank you,
Colin MacDonald



Captain Colin MacDonald
Maine Marine Patrol
Cell: 207-592-2967
Email: colin.macdonald@maine.gov
21 State House Station, Augusta, ME 04333



**STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF MARINE RESOURCES**

**Janet T. Mills
Governor**

**Patrick Keliher
Commissioner**

May 3, 2024

Hamlin's Marine
581 Main Road N
Hampden, ME 04444
kross@hamlinsmarine.com

**SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202311231,
Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat**

Dear Kyle Ross:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Marine Resources for Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Hamlin's Marine

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Colin MacDonald". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a long horizontal stroke at the end.

Captain Colin MacDonald
Maine Marine Patrol
Department of Marine Resources
207-592-2967
Colin.macdonald@maine.gov

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).

MacDonald, Colin

From: MacDonald, Colin
Sent: Friday, May 3, 2024 9:59 AM
To: Egan, Jonathan
Subject: Maine Marine Patrol Dive Vessel Award Notification
Attachments: Award_Notification_Letter_Lyman Morse.pdf

Good Morning,

I have attached the official letter, but wanted to let you know that the Department has chosen to conditionally award the bid to Hamlin's Marine for the Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat RFP. I appreciate your time, effort, and consideration towards this project.

Thank you,
Colin MacDonald



Captain Colin MacDonald
Maine Marine Patrol
Cell: 207-592-2967
Email: colin.macdonald@maine.gov
21 State House Station, Augusta, ME 04333



**STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF MARINE RESOURCES**

**Janet T. Mills
Governor**

**Patrick Keliher
Commissioner**

May 3, 2024

Lyman Morse Boatbuilding, Inc.
84 Knox St
Thomaston, ME 04861
jegan@lymanmorse.com

**SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202311231,
Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat**

Dear Jonathan Egan:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Marine Resources for Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Hamlin's Marine

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Colin MacDonald". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a prominent initial "C" and "M".

Captain Colin MacDonald
Maine Marine Patrol
Department of Marine Resources
207-592-2967
Colin.macdonald@maine.gov

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).

MacDonald, Colin

From: MacDonald, Colin
Sent: Friday, May 3, 2024 10:01 AM
To: Benjamin.staub@novielliboats.com
Subject: Maine Marine Patrol Dive Vessel Award Notification
Attachments: Award_Notification_Novielli.pdf

Good Morning,

I have attached the official letter, but wanted to let you know that the Department has chosen to conditionally award the bid to Hamlin's Marine for the Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat RFP. I appreciate your time, effort, and consideration towards this project.

Thank you,
Colin MacDonald



Captain Colin MacDonald
Maine Marine Patrol
Cell: 207-592-2967
Email: colin.macdonald@maine.gov
21 State House Station, Augusta, ME 04333



**STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF MARINE RESOURCES**

**Janet T. Mills
Governor**

**Patrick Keliher
Commissioner**

May 3, 2024

Novielli Boat Builders INC
501 NE 31st ST
Miami, FL 33137
Benjamin.staub@novielliboats.com

**SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202311231,
Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat**

Dear Benjamin Staubs:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Marine Resources for Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Hamlin's Marine

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Colin MacDonald". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name "Colin" being more prominent than the last name "MacDonald".

Captain Colin MacDonald
Maine Marine Patrol
Department of Marine Resources
207-592-2967
Colin.macdonald@maine.gov

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).

MacDonald, Colin

From: MacDonald, Colin
Sent: Friday, May 3, 2024 9:57 AM
To: Justin Antolini
Subject: Maine Marine Patrol Dive Vessel Award Notification
Attachments: Award_Notification_Zodiac.pdf

Good Morning,

I have attached the official letter, but wanted to let you know that the Department has chosen to conditionally award the bid to Hamlin's Marine for the Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat RFP. I appreciate your time, effort, and consideration towards this project.

Thank you,
Colin MacDonald



Captain Colin MacDonald
Maine Marine Patrol
Cell: 207-592-2967
Email: colin.macdonald@maine.gov
21 State House Station, Augusta, ME 04333



**STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF MARINE RESOURCES**

**Janet T. Mills
Governor**

**Patrick Keliher
Commissioner**

May 3, 2024

Zodiac of North America Inc.
540 Thompson Creek Road
Stevensville, Maryland 21666
justin.antolini@zodiacmilpro.com

**SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202311231,
Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat**

Dear Justin Antolini:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Marine Resources for Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Hamlin's Marine

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Colin MacDonald". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name "Colin" being more prominent than the last name "MacDonald".

Captain Colin MacDonald
Maine Marine Patrol
Department of Marine Resources
207-592-2967
Colin.macdonald@maine.gov

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Division of Purchases, Chapter 120, § (2) (2).

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231
RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat
BIDDER NAME: Hamlin's Marine
DATE: 3/27/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Marine Resources
Name of RFP Coordinator: Colin MacDonald
Names of Evaluators: Colin MacDonald, Matt Talbot, Jarod Stedman

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	X	
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	15	10
Section III. Proposed Services	50	43
Section IV. Cost Proposal	35	35
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>88</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231
RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat
BIDDER NAME: Hamlin's Marine
DATE: 3/27/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

Appendix A and B completed

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231
RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat
BIDDER NAME: Hamlin's Marine
DATE: 3/27/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	15	10

Evaluation Team Comments:

- I. Overview of the Organization
 - *Bidder has been a boat dealer located in Maine for 39 years*
 - *Boat dealer not manufacturer; dealer for numerous well-known boat manufacturers and able to work directly with many manufacturers to order boats with specific specifications if needed.*
 - *Comprehensive service department in Maine; including Yamaha certified technicians.*
 - *Did not list any past vessel sales*
 - *Indicates vessels on site immediately available*
 - *Team members are familiar with the bidder and their business*

- II. Subcontractors
 - *None listed, but none necessarily applicable whereas vendor is a boat dealer not a manufacturer.*

- III. Organizational Chart
 - *Not provided*

- IV. Litigation
 - *Not provided*

- V. Licensure/Certification
 - *Not provided; certain licenses or certifications (i.e. welding, naval architecture) may not be applicable whereas vendor is a boat dealer not a builder.*
 - *If the pre-built boat provided required additional equipment installation or modification certain certifications may be required.*

- VI. Certificate of Insurances
 - *Not provided*

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231
RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat
BIDDER NAME: Hamlin’s Marine
DATE: 3/27/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	50	43

Evaluation Team Comments:

- *No specific line drawings or schematics provided, however proposed make and model number provided.*
- *Bidder marked “no” to the following technical specifications:*
 - *lifting strakes and spray rails (2.25),*
 - *canvas enclosure (6.10),*
 - *radar mast (6.14 & 6.15),*
 - *ceiling fan (7.04),*
 - *Zipwake (7.09),*
 - *spotlight (9.04)*
- *Above specifications not considered critical to award*
- *Proposed a production make/model Weldcraft 240.*
- *Weldcraft appears similar construction to RFP specifications*
- *Design meets the cabin requirements – forward enclosed cabin*
- *Indicated bidder would add and install additional equipment*
- *Proposal is a production vessel and is immediately available.*
- *Work plan not provided*
- *Timeline for work and delivery not provided, bidder has vessel on-hand*
- *Although not fully customizable since already built, vessel meets most critical specifications*
- *Although not customizable, team generally approves of design and layout*

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231
RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat
BIDDER NAME: Hamlin's Marine
DATE: 3/27/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
\$200,394.00	,	\$200,394.00	x	35 points	=	35

Evaluation Team Comments:

- *Lowest cost proposal*
- *Fits the anticipated cost range for this vessel.*

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231
RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat
BIDDER NAME: Lyman Morse
DATE: 3/27/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Marine Resources
Name of RFP Coordinator: Colin MacDonald
Names of Evaluators: Colin MacDonald, Matt Talbot, Jarod Stedman

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	X	
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	15	15
Section III. Proposed Services	50	48
Section IV. Cost Proposal	35	19.95
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>82.95</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231
RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat
BIDDER NAME: Lyman Morse
DATE: 3/27/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

Appendix A and B completed

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231
RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat
BIDDER NAME: Lyman Morse
DATE: 3/27/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	15	15

Evaluation Team Comments:

- I. Overview of the Organization
 - Bidder has been a boat builder located in Maine for 45 years
 - Fabrication occurs in Maine
 - In-house departments covering all aspects of boatbuilding; including but not limited to carpentry, design, electronics, electrical, hydraulics, paint, machining, metal fabrication, composites, rigging, and mechanical installations.
 - Listed multiple past vessel builds in aluminum, including one identical to proposal
 - Exceeded the experience requirements with an extensive portfolio
 - Substantial information provided on qualifications and experience
 - Team members are familiar with the bidder and their business
- II. Subcontractors
 - None listed
- III. Organizational Chart
 - Provided
- IV. Litigation
 - Not provided
- V. Licensure/Certification
 - Provided documentation of ABYC and welding
- VI. Certificate of Insurances
 - Provided

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231
RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat
BIDDER NAME: Lyman Morse
DATE: 3/27/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	50	48

Evaluation Team Comments:

- *Line drawings and vessel schematics provided*
- *Bidder marked "N/A" to (6.09 and 6.10) ref to forward deck seat; all other technical specs marked as met.*
- *Above specification not considered critical to award*
- *Proposed a previously designed and manufactured vessel meeting RFP design intent.*
- *Proposal is a custom production vessel and is built to order*
- *Unknown aluminum thickness*
- *Bidder provided price breakdown indicating a Wing collar that is not specified*
- *Detailed work plan provided*
- *Design meets the cabin requirements – forward enclosed cabin*
- *Timeline for delivery February 2025*
- *Team approves of design and layout*

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231
RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat
BIDDER NAME: Lyman Morse
DATE: 3/27/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
\$200,394.00	,	\$351,506.20	x	35 points	=	19.95

Evaluation Team Comments:

- *Second highest cost proposal*
- *Exceeds the anticipated cost range for this vessel*

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231
RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat
BIDDER NAME: Novielli Boat Builders
DATE: 3/27/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Marine Resources
Name of RFP Coordinator: Colin MacDonald
Names of Evaluators: Colin MacDonald, Matt Talbot, Jarod Stedman

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	X	
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	15	5
Section III. Proposed Services	50	10
Section IV. Cost Proposal	35	20.34
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>35.34</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231
RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat
BIDDER NAME: Novielli Boat Builders
DATE: 3/27/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

Appendix A and B completed

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231
RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat
BIDDER NAME: Novielli Boat Builders
DATE: 3/27/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	15	5

Evaluation Team Comments:

- I. Overview of the Organization
 - *Vessel production location unclear; company address shown as Florida*
 - *Documentation states bidder is a leader in the aluminum watercraft manufacturer industry, but team cannot substantiate this claim*
 - *No information provided on qualifications and experience*
 - *Lists four past projects for agencies such as the US Air Force and the New York Dept of Conservation; no details provided on projects*
 - *Team members have no independent knowledge of the bidder.*

- II. Subcontractors
 - *None listed*

- III. Organizational Chart
 - *Not provided, just name of company president and manager*

- IV. Litigation
 - *None provided*

- V. Licensure/Certification
 - *None provided*

- VI. Certificate of Insurances
 - *Not provided*

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231
RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat
BIDDER NAME: Novielli Boat Builders
DATE: 3/27/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	50	10

Evaluation Team Comments:

- *Novielli not clear on details of proposed vessel, just indicated that they are capable of meeting the required specifications.*
- *Line drawings and vessel schematics not provided*
- *Bidder marked "yes" to all the technical specifications:*
- *No evidence of bidder meeting scope of services B.2 reference to producing 10 similarly designed vessels*
- *Proposal seems to be a custom built vessel built to order, possible prototype based on lack of supporting information that these are production boats*
- *Detailed work plan not provided*
- *Timeline for work and delivery not provided*
- *Team disapproves of proposal whereas no proposed design and layout provided and all images appear to be graphics of high-end yacht-type vessels.*
- *Team also disapproves of futuristic design of vessel images provided; not in keeping with agency watercraft fleet.*

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231
RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat
BIDDER NAME: Novielli Boat Builders
DATE: 3/27/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
\$200,394.00	,	\$344,758.00	x	35 points	=	20.34

Evaluation Team Comments:

- *Third highest cost proposal*
- *Exceeds the anticipated cost range for this vessel.*

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231
RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat
BIDDER NAME: Zodiac of North America
DATE: 3/27/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Marine Resources
Name of RFP Coordinator: Colin MacDonald
Names of Evaluators: Colin MacDonald, Matt Talbot, Jarod Stedman

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	X	
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	15	15
Section III. Proposed Services	50	35
Section IV. Cost Proposal	35	19.48
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>69.48</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231
RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat
BIDDER NAME: Zodiac of North America
DATE: 3/27/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

Appendix A and B completed

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231
RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat
BIDDER NAME: Zodiac of North America
DATE: 3/27/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	15	15

Evaluation Team Comments:

- I. Overview of the Organization
 - *Vessel production location in Maryland*
 - *Well known in industry; established in 1970*
 - *Substantial information provided on qualifications and experience*
 - *Three past projects listed for LE agencies; all appear to be the same style center console boat*
 - *Exceeded the experience requirements with an extensive portfolio*
 - *Tema members are familiar with the bidder and their products*
- II. Subcontractors
 - *None listed*
- III. Organizational Chart
 - *Provided*
- IV. Litigation
 - *None provided*
- V. Licensure/Certification
 - *Provided documentation of ABYC, welding, engineering*
- VI. Certificate of Insurances
 - *Provided*

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231
RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat
BIDDER NAME: Zodiac of North America
DATE: 3/27/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	50	35

Evaluation Team Comments:

- *Zodiac proposed a production vessel - SRA-900*
- *Line drawings and vessel schematics provided*
- *Bidder marked “no” to the following technical specifications:*
 - *two watertight bulkheads (2.11),*
 - *integrated outboard bracket, no outboard platform (2.18)*
 - *fuel fill on gunwale, not at transom (4.04)*
 - *integrated transom ladder (7.15)*
 - *5-year structural warranty (11.02)*
- *Not a forward cabin design as specified in 1.11*
- *Center console vessel w/o full forward cabin enclosure. Proposal is a 4-person “storm console”.*
- *Vessel is a RHIB built with an inflatable D-collar – not specified in RFP*
- *Integrated outboard bracket appears to cause loss of open deck space*
- *Specifies twin 300 HP outboards. This is acceptable per specs.*
- *Proposal is a custom production vessel and is built to order*
- *Detailed work plan provided*
- *Timeline for work and delivery provided, estimated delivery in Feb 2025*
- *Vessel does not meet two critical specifications including forward enclosed cabin and is an RHIB.*
- *Team disapproves of center console design and layout*

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231
RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat
BIDDER NAME: Zodiac of North America
DATE: 3/27/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
\$200,394.00	,	\$360,000.00	x	35 points	=	19.48

Evaluation Team Comments:

- *Highest cost proposal*
- *Exceeds the anticipated cost range for this vessel.*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231
RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat
BIDDER NAME: Hamlin's Marine
DATE: 3/24/2024
EVALUATOR NAME: Colin MacDonald
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Marine Patrol

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Preliminary Information
 - 1. Appendix A completed **Pass** / Fail
 - 2. Appendix B completed **Pass** / Fail

II. Organization Qualifications and Experience

Hamlin's has been involved in the marine industry, specifically baot sales, in Maine for the past 39 years

Comprehensive service department in Maine.

III. Proposed Services

Indicated that they are able to meet nearly all aspects of the required specifications.

Design meets the cabin requirements

They have the vessel in-stock able to be delivered almost immediately.

The design is a "production" type vessel

IV. Cost Proposal

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231

RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat

BIDDER NAME: Hamlin's Marine

DATE: 3/24/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Colin MacDonald

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Marine Patrol

The total cost indicated in the bid was \$200,394 which fit the anticipated cost range for this vessel.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231

RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat

BIDDER NAME: Lyman and Morse Boat Building Inc.

DATE: 3/24/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Colin MacDonald

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Marine Patrol

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Preliminary Information
 - 1. Appendix A completed **Pass** / Fail
 - 2. Appendix B completed **Pass** / Fail

II. Organization Qualifications and Experience

Lyman Morse is a privately owned company which has been in business for more than 45 years and has built over 130 boats.

The company has around 150 employees with in-house departments covering all aspects of boatbuilding; including but not limited to carpentry, design, electronics, electrical, hydraulics, paint, machining, metal fabrication, composites, rigging, and mechanical installations.

The company provided documentation of certifications in:
ISO9001 Quality Management System
ABYC certified marine technicians
AWS and ABS certified welding programs
AWS In-house certified welding inspector

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231

RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat

BIDDER NAME: Lyman and Morse Boat Building Inc.

DATE: 3/24/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Colin MacDonald

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Marine Patrol

III. Proposed Services

26' 7" Overall Length

8' 6" Beam

Unknown Aluminum Thickness

Twin Mercury Seapro 150HP Engines

Forward House with "west coast" design

Garmin Electronics

IV. Cost Proposal

The overall cost is \$351,506.20, which is much higher than the anticipated building cost for this vessel.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231
RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat
BIDDER NAME: Novielli Boat Builders
DATE: 3/24/2024
EVALUATOR NAME: Colin MacDonald
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Marine Patrol

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Preliminary Information
 - 1. Appendix A completed **Pass** / Fail
 - 2. Appendix B completed **Pass** / Fail

- II. Organization Qualifications and Experience
Very little information was provided on qualifications and experience.

Did indicate that they have obtained contracts for the NY Department of Conservation and the United States Air Force.

They showed previous builds, but the builds were not comparable to the specifications on the vessel we are requiring.

- III. Proposed Services

Novelli indicated that they are capable of meeting the required specifications.

The design of the proposed vessel does not meet the cabin requirements.

The comparison vessels in no way represented a "production" type vessel.

Bidder did not set a build schedule.

- IV. Cost Proposal

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231

RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat

BIDDER NAME: Novielli Boat Builders

DATE: 3/24/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Colin MacDonald

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Marine Patrol

The total cost indicated in the bid was \$344,758, which was higher than the anticipated cost.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231
RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat
BIDDER NAME: Zodiac of North America
DATE: 3/24/2024
EVALUATOR NAME: Colin MacDonald
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Marine Patrol

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department’s RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Preliminary Information
 - 1. Appendix A completed **Pass** / Fail
 - 2. Appendix B completed **Pass** / Fail

II. Organization Qualifications and Experience

Zodiac exceeded the experience requirements with an extensive portfolio that includes like builds.

Zodiac provided extensive certification documentation in a number of disciplines that exceeded qualifications. This included welding, electrical, structural, etc.

III. Proposed Services

Zodiac proposed a production vessel (SRA-900).

The structural proposal is a 4-person “storm console”, which does not meet the specifications of a forward enclosed cabin.

Proposal was to begin construction in April of 2024 and complete construction by February of 2025.

A detailed list of services was provided to include a build schedule all the way through agency training on the vessel.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231

RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat

BIDDER NAME: Zodiac of North America

DATE: 3/24/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Colin MacDonald

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Marine Patrol

IV. Cost Proposal

Cost proposal was provided.

The cost proposal was \$360,000, which exceeded the estimated cost of the project.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231
RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat
BIDDER NAME: Hamlin's Marine
DATE: 03/25/2024
EVALUATOR NAME: Jarod I. Stedman
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine State Police

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Preliminary Information

- 1. Appendix A completed **Pass** / Fail*
- 2. Appendix B completed **Pass** / Fail*

II. Organization Qualifications and Experience

- Company has been in the marine boat sales business 39 years locally in the State of Maine.*
- Company has provided a Weldcraft platform that meets almost all of the specifications provided in the RFP.*
- Company has provided a platform that has been production built for more than 5 years.*

III. Proposed Services

- Company has provided specifications for a 26' aluminum boat meeting all of the required details in the RFP.*
- Company has indicated that they have a boat that can be delivered upon purchase agreement.*

IV. Cost Proposal

- Company has provided a cost that is in the range that was budgeted for this project.*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231
RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat
BIDDER NAME: Lyman Morse
DATE: 03/25/2024
EVALUATOR NAME: Jarod I. Stedman
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine State Police

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Preliminary Information

- 1. Appendix A completed **Pass** / Fail*
- 2. Appendix B completed **Pass** / Fail*

II. Organization Qualifications and Experience

- Company is a local boat builder here in Maine that appears to build high quality boats.*
- Company appears to have all of the qualifications needed to complete this project.*

III. Proposed Services

- Company provided a boat design that appeared to meet specifications in the listed RFP.*
- Company does not show that they have built several boats or similar models in the past 5 years.*

IV. Cost Proposal

- Company provided a cost that exceeded what has been budgeted for this project.*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231
RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat
BIDDER NAME: Novielli
DATE: 03/25/2024
EVALUATOR NAME: Jarod I. Stedman
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine State Police

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Preliminary Information

- 1. Appendix A completed Pass / Fail*
- 2. Appendix B completed Pass / Fail*

II. Organization Qualifications and Experience

- Company could not show similar platforms that have been built by them in the past 5 years.*
- Company provided only prototype designs.*

III. Proposed Services

- Company did not provide photographs of boat designs close to specifications described in the RFP.*

IV. Cost Proposal

- Cost was not comparable to other models presented.*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231
RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat
BIDDER NAME: Zodiac
DATE: 03/25/2024
EVALUATOR NAME: Jarod I. Stedman
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine State Police

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Preliminary Information

- 1. Appendix A completed **Pass / Fail***
- 2. Appendix B completed **Pass / Fail***

II. Organization Qualifications and Experience

- Company showed similar platforms built by them in the past 5 years, but not with the cabin specified.*
- Company appears to have qualifications needed to complete this project.*

III. Proposed Services

- Company did not provide designs of boat with specifications described in the RFP.*

IV. Cost Proposal

- Cost was not comparable to other models presented.*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231
RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat
BIDDER NAME: Hamlin's Marine
DATE: 3/22/2024
EVALUATOR NAME: Matt Talbot
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Marine Resources

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. *Preliminary Information*
 - 1. *Appendix A completed* **Pass / ~~Fail~~**
 - 2. *Appendix B completed* **Pass / ~~Fail~~**

- II. *Organization Qualifications and Experience*
 - *Information provided indicates bidder has been a boat dealer located in Maine for 39 years*
 - *Did not list any past vessel builds*

- III. *Proposed Services*
 - *Bidder marked "no" to some of the technical specifications, including lifting strakes and spray rails (2.25), canvas enclosure (6.10), radar mast (6.14 & 6.15), ceiling fan (7.04), Zipwake (7.09), spotlight (9.04).*
 - *Indicated a Weldcraft 240 model as proposal, Weldcraft appears similar construction to RFP specifications; bidder indicates ability to add and install additional requirements.*
 - *Proposed vessel does appear to be a "production" vessel and is immediately available.*
 - *Proposal appears as it is a "off the lot" production built vessel capable of being rigged with specified equipment.*
 - *Work plan and timeline information not provided, but indicates bidder has vessel on-hand and would meet the delivery requirement specified.*

- IV. *Cost Proposal*
 - *Cost proposal provided, cost as shown is within the targeted range and is the lowest cost proposal.*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231
RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat
BIDDER NAME: Lyman Morse
DATE: 3/22/2024
EVALUATOR NAME: Matt Talbot
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Marine Resources

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department’s RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. *Preliminary Information*
 - 1. *Appendix A completed* **Pass / ~~Fail~~**
 - 2. *Appendix B completed* **Pass / ~~Fail~~**

- II. *Organization Qualifications and Experience*
 - *Information provided on qualifications and experience.*
 - *Information provided on vessel production location in Maine.*
 - *Listed four past builds of similar construction to RFP specifications, one of which was virtually identical to RFP specs.*

- III. *Proposed Services*
 - *Bidder marked “yes” to all the technical specifications*
 - *Proposed vessel does not appear to be a “production” vessel in the sense that the bidder is constructing numerous identical vessels as the one specified, however the construction materials and design of their vessels does appear to utilize production methodology given the similar nature of materials and design.*
 - *Proposal appears as it is a customized build so all requirements are specified as met.*
 - *Proposal indicates design includes a Wing collar – not specified in RFP*
 - *Work plan and timeline information provided, indicates bidder would not meet the delivery requirement specified.*

- IV. *Cost Proposal*
 - *Cost proposal provided, but cost as shown is significantly greater than expected for project.*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231
RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat
BIDDER NAME: Novielli Boat Builders
DATE: 3/22/2024
EVALUATOR NAME: Matt Talbot
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Marine Resources

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Preliminary Information
 - 1. Appendix A completed **Pass / ~~Fail~~**
 - 2. Appendix B completed **Pass / ~~Fail~~**

- II. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - Very little information provided on qualifications and experience.
 - All images in submission were graphic designs, not pictures of actual boats
 - No info on factory location or vessel production location
 - Listed four past builds, but gave no details on vessels in comparison to what was specified in RFP

- III. Proposed Services
 - Bidder marked "yes" to all the technical specifications
 - Proposal does not appear to be a "production" vessel as requested in Part II Section B.2
 - Proposal likely a prototype based on information provided
 - No work plan information provided, no indication bidder would meet the delivery requirement specified.

- IV. Cost Proposal
 - Cost proposal provided, but cost as shown is significantly greater than expected.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231
RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat
BIDDER NAME: Zodiac of North America
DATE: 3/22/2024
EVALUATOR NAME: Matt Talbot
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Marine Resources

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department’s RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Preliminary Information
 - 1. Appendix A completed **Pass / ~~Fail~~**
 - 2. Appendix B completed **Pass / ~~Fail~~**

- II. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - Information provided on qualifications and experience.
 - Information provided on vessel production location in Maryland.

- III. Proposed Services
 - Bidder marked “no” to some of the technical specifications; including two watertight bulkheads (2.11), 5-year structural warranty (11.02), other items as listed below.
 - Proposed vessel appears to be a center console vessel w/o full cabin enclosure – not forward cabin as specified in 1.11
 - Proposal indicates vessel has integrated outboard bracket (2.18) – appears to cause loss of deck space
 - Proposal indicates vessel has fuel fill on gunwale (4.04)
 - Proposal specifies twin 300 HP outboards - acceptable
 - Proposal indicates vessel is a RHIB constructed with an inflatable D-collar.
 - Proposal does appear to be a “production” vessel as requested in Part II Section B.2
 - Bidder provided detailed work plan information, estimation of delivery was March 2025 as of December 2022 – this is outside of the designated delivery window.

- IV. Cost Proposal

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202311231

RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat

BIDDER NAME: Zodiac of North America

DATE: 3/22/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Matt Talbot

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Marine Resources

- *Cost proposal provided, but cost as shown is significantly greater than expected.*
- *Highest cost proposal*



STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF MARINE RESOURCES

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Patrick Keliher
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT

RFP #: 202311231

RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat

I, *Robert MacDonald* accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Marine Resources. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

Signature

3-27-2024

Date



STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF MARINE RESOURCES

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Patrick Keliher
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: 202311231
RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat

I, JAROD I. SPEDMAN accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Marine Resources. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

Signature Jarod I. Spedman Date 3/27/24



STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF MARINE RESOURCES

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Patrick Keliher
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: 202311231
RFP TITLE: Aluminum Law Enforcement Dive Boat

I, MATT TAUBOT accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Marine Resources. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

[Signature]
Signature

3/27/2024
Date